In-service Training Programs for Schools Teachers in Afghanistan

Teachers’ Views about effectiveness of the In-service training

Sayedwali Safi
ABSTRACT
Like other fields of life also the education system has affected in Afghanistan by long lasting war and the whole system face with lack of professional cadre. For addressing the deficit in teaching cadre Ministry of Education beside other long term programs has designed short term courses for training of in-service teachers; these courses are called INSETs and it has been delivered through a unified modality of District Teacher Training Team (DT3) and covers all teachers nationwide.

In this research I tried to study views of teachers about effectiveness of In-Service Trainings (INSET), since the INSET training program has important role in professional development and capacity building of teachers, but its effectiveness depends on the effectiveness of its composing elements such as teachers’ interest, time and duration, trainers’ ability, subjects covered in each training and follow-on support; to this end I collected the data through questionnaire.

The findings show that generally teachers feel the need to their professional development, so they are interested to participate in INSET programs. The respondents believed that scheduling and planning for the INSET shall be made in close coordination to school management. The study findings also illustrate that both male and female respondents have same perception about trainers’ qualification, but female and BA holders have more critics about the trainers’ qualification. Majority of the respondents are satisfied about follow-up activities and they said they received follow-up support to practice the knowledge and skills in their daily class room activities. Majority of the respondents believed that the subjects or topics which are covered in the INSET courses are useful, but during developing of any study materials for INSET courses, more attention shall be paid for avoiding of ambiguity in the course materials, also those materials which are translated from foreign languages shall be adopted in Afghan context; and shall be translated professionally.

Based on the teachers’ views the INSET program is effective, but still there are some problems to be solved to make the programs more functional and effective for teachers. Prior to designing of any training, need assessment of teachers through scientific methods is highly recommended. Lack of professional trainers is another issue toward effective implementation of the program.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to express my gratitude to Ministry of Education, Swedish Committee for Afghanistan, Swedish International Development Agency (SIDA) and Karlstad University for launching and supporting Teacher Education Master Program.

I would also like to express my gratitude to Dr. Pia Karlsson and Dr. Amir Mansory for their hard working and support that they provided to each individual student during the program. I also want to express my gratefulness to my professors at Karlstad University particularly to my supervisor Dr. Anders Broman for their sustainable support and kind comments.

I am deeply thankful to my Office colleagues in Teacher Education Department, who gave real support and didn’t let the work to be loaded on me in office during the program.
# Table of Contents

ABSTRACT ................................................................................................................................. I

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT .................................................................................................................. II

INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................................ 1

  Background ............................................................................................................................... 1

  Problem Area ........................................................................................................................... 2

  Aim ........................................................................................................................................... 2

  Research Questions .................................................................................................................. 2

LITERATURE REVIEW ................................................................................................................ 3

  What is In-Service Training? ..................................................................................................... 3

  Why Should teachers participate in INSET Training program? .................................................. 4

  Effectiveness of INSET programs or Role of In-service Training programs in professional development 4

    Summary .................................................................................................................................. 6

METHOD ....................................................................................................................................... 6

  Data collection and Analysis .................................................................................................... 7

  Limitation .................................................................................................................................. 7

FINDINGS ..................................................................................................................................... 8

  Interest of teachers .................................................................................................................. 8

  Materials and contents of the INSET training programs ............................................................ 11

  Time and duration .................................................................................................................... 11

  Trainers’ qualification and skills ............................................................................................... 12

  Feedback and follow on activities ............................................................................................ 15

  End of Course Evaluation .......................................................................................................... 15

  Incentives / Motivational Factors ............................................................................................. 15

    Summary of findings .............................................................................................................. 17

Discussion .................................................................................................................................. 18

Need assessment / Teacher Interest .......................................................................................... 18

Time and duration of the course ................................................................................................. 18

Trainers’ qualification and skills ................................................................................................. 19

End of course evaluation ............................................................................................................ 19

Follow-up activities/ supporting activities .................................................................................. 19

Conclusion ................................................................................................................................... 20
INTRODUCTION

Background
In Afghanistan the term In-Service refers to two types of programs: a) a two years consecutive program for 12 grade graduate teachers; The Ministry of Education designed this program to enroll and train all of the existing 12 grade graduated teachers in In-Service training programs of Teacher Training Collages (TTCs) to obtain graduation certificate of the grade 14. The Teacher Education Department (TED) supervising more precisely implementation process of In-Service programs, in order to ensure teachers’ and students’ attendance in classes, provision of quality education, implementation of standard assessment tests at the end of each In –Service training program and certification of the trained teachers only in the case of success. Also, this program identify a group of 12 grade graduates who are interested in teaching profession and have basics required qualifications for teaching, in insecure and remote areas which are facing lack of qualified teachers. The identified group of graduates will be employed as teachers after passing a short term training course on teaching methods, simultaneously; these teachers will be enrolled in In-Service programs to obtain graduate certification of grade 14 of the TTCs. This strategy will enhance the effectiveness and productivity of teacher education system and will help to utilize limited resources of education sector more efficiently and effectively. (Ministry of Education, 2013)

The second type of In-Service is a series of short courses which cover all teachers nationwide and it is known as INSET training programs.

The quality of education in Afghanistan is quite low and is affected by multiple factors which include the lack of teachers with a thorough content-based knowledge and an understanding of effective teaching methods; the lack of safe, conducive learning spaces; and the lack of quality teaching and learning materials (including textbooks). The classroom environment and the quality of education are particularly affected by the quality of teaching. Although there has not been a comprehensive study on violence in classrooms, there are anecdotal reports of physical punishment of students as a classroom management technique. (Ministry of Education, 2007)

For addressing the deficits in teaching cadre the In-Service teacher training modality has developed by Teacher Education Department (TED) as a unified approach of teacher training which is applicable nation-wide. The modality is implemented by national and international NGO partners and these NGOs are responsible for providing all facilities required for training deliveries (ibid).

The objective of INSET is to create sustainable systems which will increase the level of professional knowledge and skills of educators throughout Afghanistan. This component will provide much needed training to teachers and principals, and institutionalize a system of professional development amongst the teacher cadre in Afghanistan. Teacher and principal training and follow-on sessions are delivered at the district level by a newly established group of trainers known as the District Teacher Training Teams (DT3s). These DT3 teams facilitate crucial follow-on activities and tasks that will contribute to the development of professional teacher and principals’ networks, which will allow educators to share ideas, problems, and solutions with their peers. The DT3 modality provides essential follow-on and in-school activities to reinforce training and lays the foundation for the establishment of professional teacher and principal networks. Also these Follow-on activities will link directly with training through in-school activities. These activities include: instructional modeling, individual teacher coaching and observation, peer
observation and support activities, teacher-trainees feedback on utility of training, and classroom visits and feedback sessions.

By targeting teachers and principals at the district level and supporting them to meet with their peers to tackle challenges as a group, the component will meet urgent training needs and simultaneously contribute to the growth of professional networks that are both local and sustainable (Ministry of Education, 2012).

**Problem Area**

District Teacher Training Team (DT3) is a National Program with the goal of teachers' professional development which is delivered through a cascade model by Non Governmental Organizations (NGOs). The program delivers short-term courses in pedagogy and subject-content to teachers across the country. However, there is lack of evidence whether teachers who participate in the In-Service trainings find the training effective and immediately useful for their day to day practice in the class. Although a lot of resources are allocated and spent for In-Service teacher training since 2007 in Afghanistan, but its effectiveness is still questionable. This can be seen as an example of the general problem regarding how teachers continuously can develop their teaching skills. Teachers all over the world are trying, with or without special resources, to improve and develop their teaching.

On the other hand, some reports said that the level of teachers’ enthusiasm for participation in these programs is very low and they are not willing to participate in these programs. According the monitoring reports provided by the implementing agencies of DT3 program, in some provinces the teachers' poor attendance is a challenge in delivery of INSET training. There have been cases that the implementing agency has forced teachers to participate seeking help from district and provincial education authorities. This has not been explored what factors contribute to or reduce teachers' motivation with regard their participation in Inset training.

This study will try to investigate about teachers’ views on content and processes of the In-Service teacher training programs designed and supported by TED and delivered by NGOs. Additionally the study will try put light on effectiveness of the program from teachers’ perspectives.

**Aim**

To explore views of Afghan teachers regarding the effectiveness of INSET courses conducted by Teacher Education Department, contents of INSETs trainings, implementation of program and to find out what factors have contributed to enhancing or reducing teachers' participation.

**Research Questions**

- What are teachers’ perceptions about the INSET course materials? What are teachers’ experiences and views with regards to the usefulness and application of the content of INSET in classroom?
- What are teachers’ views about the factors contributing to the motivation of teachers in terms of participation in the Inset trainings and what factors reduce teachers' motivation and contribute to poor attendance in Inset training?
LITERATURE REVIEW

What is In-Service Training?

In-service teacher training is defined as all activities and set of trainings that is required for quality improvement and professional development of teachers (Saiti and Saiti, 2006 cited in Bayrakci 2009). It is a set of organized efforts for performance improvement of the teachers or for building of their capacity to implement any new program in already set environment. In-service training is
an important strategy in influencing the professional development of teachers and it can play a positive role in enhancement of their knowledge and teaching quality improvement (ibid).

According to Akhter et al (2011), in-service training includes all those activities which are designed for professional development and skill building of school teachers. It is essential for professional improvement of teachers and keep the teachers abreast of latest information.

In introduction and facilitation of changes and innovations to teachers INSET programs play a crucial role, (Fullan 1991; Ayas 1993; Baki 2000; Cimer 2004; Yasar et al. 2005; Ayas et al. 2007 cited in Cimer et al. 2013). On the other hand, new demands in teaching profession and changes in society are other factors which fuel the need for INSET programs “changes in education and society place new demands on teaching profession, so it is responsibility of INSET providing body in any education system to provide efficient and effective In-Service training that enable teaching and non teaching staff to meet new demands” (Gabrscek and Roeders, 2013, p 11).

As there is no pre service training or education program for sustainable support of teachers in different education context, therefore, the INSET programs provide unique opportunity for keeping the teachers up to date about new changes in the field of education. Teaching and non teaching employees of education systems need to enhance their knowledge through practical and reflective engagement in continuous professional development (Gabrscek and Roeders, 2013).

At the end of an INSET course teachers are expected to fully obtain and acquire intended knowledge, skills and attitude; apply them into practice: through their application shall influence students learning and achievement; and finally positively influence other teachers in their school in bringing required changes. (Day 1999 cited in Cimer et al. 2013)

**Why should teachers participate in INSET Training program**

The changing need of society is main reason for in-service training, but many other factors such as changes in curriculum, continuous need for qualified teachers, acquisition of new knowledge, and development of skills which is essential for inclusion of learning increase significance of in-service training (Akhter et al, 2011).

Having of qualified and skilled teachers are essential and it is one of the priorities in any education system, to this end it is necessary to provide classes of training, retraining, internship and in-service training (Sultan-ol-gharaie, 1994 cited in Ahmadi and Keshavarzi, 2013).

**Effectiveness of INSET programs or Role of In-service Training programs in professional development**

In the process of teaching in all types of schools teacher is key elements, teachers’ education should be available for all school teachers regardless of their school type. (Pashiardis and Pashiardis, 2000; Theophilidis and Styliandis, 2000, cited in Day 2006). In the entire spectrum of educational activities teacher occupies most crucial position, and the role of teacher is vital for bringing of effective changes (Akhter et al, 2011).

In related literature of In-Service trainings, there are different indicators for effectiveness measurement of the programs. According to Ahmadi & Keshavarzi (2012), “effectiveness means to study In-Service training programs in respect to their objectives, contents, performances, time, place and motivation”. (p, 921). While, according to Cimer et al (2010), the following five indicators demonstrate main characteristics of an effective In-service training program. The first indicator is careful planning of the training programs based on accurate need assessment. It is very
important to match what the course offer with the need of teachers. Do teachers feel necessity to In-service trainings for their professional development? According to Ozer (2004) the needs, interests and attitudes of teachers about professional development and In-service training is the most important factor of effective In-service training. Bunker (1977), cited in Ahmadi & Keshavarzi (2012), the studies which are performed on teachers’ in-service training, show some evidence of their weaknesses. These programs have been planned by people who are not teachers, and it is said these people ignore teachers’ requirements and emotions in the plan.

Time and duration of any In-service training program is second indicator for its effectiveness. Courses which are conducted during school period or those conducted in the evening are not favored by teachers. The third indicator is administration of the training, comprising methods of teaching, facilities and skills of course instructor. According to Joyce and Showers (1980) cited in Cimer et al (2010), the combination of different methods such as presentation, modeling, practice, feedback and coaching enhance the effectiveness of In-service training programs. Instructor or trainer’s quality and knowledge of the topic and effective teaching ability has significant impact on the effectiveness of the program (Ayes et al 2007, cited in Cimer et al 2010).

End of course evaluation and follow on or supporting activities are fourth and fifth indicators. Post test or end of course evaluation is carried out to see if the participants learned what had been delivered to them. Providing of Follow- on or supporting activities after the course is very important to ensure transformation of the learning in to practice, which is the ultimate goal of INSET programs (Cimer et al, 2010). End of the course evaluation has two objectives. First, it is necessary to know if the participants learned what is taught; second, it motivates participants to learn the knowledge and skills delivered (ibid)

It is also indicated that lack of sufficient support system which can ensure continuity, follow-up and feedback for professional development activities and interventions is a common problem in all countries. Having completed a workshop, seminar or other event designed for capacity building, teachers too often return to their school and classroom without real and effective follow up system that collaborate in adapting of innovation and practices in the education context. (Schwille and Dembele, 2007)

It is also said that the connecting of subject matter content and pedagogical or education content in teacher education program play significant role in effectiveness of any teacher teaching program. Traditionally these two components are separated from each other, and different instructors were assigned to different departments. This separation is more obvious in the literature on pedagogical content knowledge and other aspects of knowledge for teaching since Shulman first introduced the term Pedagogical Content Knowledge (PCK) in 1986 and 1987. (ibid)

The PCK refers to special kind of knowledge that distinguishes teachers from other experts in the same subject matter domain. PCK includes “for the most regularly taught topics in one’s subject areas, the most useful forms of representations of those ideas, the most powerful analogies, illustrations, examples, explanations and demonstrations - in a word, ways of representing and formulating the subject that make it comprehensible to others” (Shulman, 1986,p. 9).

On the other hand there are some research findings which emphasized on critical need for improvement of the INSET system, and recommends development of new strategies, Plans and programs through which all teachers may gain required skill and knowledge (Gaberscek and Roeders 2013). Also some research findings show that in-service training play little role in professional development of teachers. For professional development research tells us that the
training shall be extended beyond the immediate needs of school and classroom practices (Day, 2006).

On the other hand, the effective delivery of In-Service training does not guarantee implementation of introduced ideas and theories in classroom. “After the INSET, even though teachers seem to understand the ideas well, they may not implement them in their classrooms. Therefore, follow-up work to provide information on implementation of the ideas or approaches introduced in the INSET in schools, could be an important component” (Cimer et al, 2010: P 39)

According to Sapp(1996) cited in Bayrakci (2009), teachers think that during planning of in-service training activities the relevance to the classroom practices are ignored. Also the follow-up communication and guidance is inadequate to foster the integration of the new ideas and methods into daily instructions. This is one of the reasons that many courses fall short of the expectation of course participants and it develop gaps between expectation and outcomes. (Yan, 2005 cited in Bayrakci 2009).

**Summary**

To sum up, all previous literature emphasized that In-Service teacher training is needed in any education system and it plays a positive role in professional development.

Changes in society and curriculum and continuous need for qualified teachers foster the need of In-Service training programs for school teachers; and it provides unique opportunities for continuous professional development of teachers and keeps them up to date.

Beside the continuous need, the effectiveness of the In-service implementation is a major concern and most of the literatures focuses on the process of implementation and provide some indicators for assessment of its effectiveness. Also in all literature it is pointed out in all literatures that the participants of In-Service training programs are expected to fully apply the obtained knowledge and skills and attitudes into practice.

**METHOD**

The study was designed to find views and perceptions of teachers about effectiveness of INSET programs, which have been implementing for capacity building and professional development of teachers.

The study mostly relied on quantitative method through the use of questionnaire which facilitates exploring of large number of respondents in short period of time (Bryman, 2012). The questionnaire made it possible to give a plenty of time to respondents and provide the information in questionnaire without any hesitation. In developing of questionnaire I tried to avoid dichotomous question, but in some places where it is necessary for avoiding of leading question I used some dichotomous question followed by multiple option question. Also I used some Likert scale to gauge level of satisfaction or agreement of respondents to the sentence written in the
For expressing the intensity of respondents’ feelings Liker scale is an important technique (ibid). For some questions blank space provided for respondents to include their views that were not addressed by the questionnaire. The questionnaire was composed of 26 questions about different indicators of effectiveness and respondents were provided instructions about how to answer each question individually. The questionnaire was translated to both national languages (Dari and Pashto) to make it understandable to all respondents.

Data collection and Analysis
In September 2014, a total of 181 teachers filled out questionnaire in 20 different training sites, where, the INSET training was taken place. I used Convenience type of non-probability sampling for collection of data, and distributed questionnaires in training sites which were easily accessible. According to Bryman (2012), in convenience sampling the researcher will receive all or almost all questionnaires back, so that there will be a good rate of responses. The group of respondents was very diverse with their experience, level of education and age which ranged from 21 years up to 66 years with an average of 36.5 years, most of the respondents are 35 years old (mode of age is 35 years. In addition 27% of the respondents were male and 63% were female. In addition 56% of the respondents were TTC graduates and 31% and 10% were BA holders and 12th grade graduates respectively. The classes they teach are covered from grade 1 to 12 but, majority taught in grade 12. The level of experience is ranged from 1 to 45 years with most of the respondents having 7 years of experience.

According to Denscombe, (2010) validity of a research is depended to whether the research method can gauge what it intends to gauge. Also integrity of finding and conclusion of a research is main factors of validity (Bryman, 2012). For validity of the study, I piloted the questionnaire and had involved colleagues in education and research to comment on the tool. Reliability is another key concept which is mainly concern with issues of consistency of research and research tools, to ensure whether the research tools produce the same results repeatedly under similar conditions (Denscombe, 2010). Before launching of the real research, I conduct a pilot study to ensure reliability of the tools, I test the tools and did research in two training sites and distributed Pashto and Dari version of the questionnaire, and results in both sites were almost similar.

After data collection, I developed a database in excel spread sheet for processing the responses. I entered the questions in to the database. Then the data were analyzed mainly by variable of gender, but in some answers the education level of the respondents also taken into account.

Limitation
During the study, although I made it clear to every respondent the aim of the study is collecting of data and completing my research thesis about the INSET program, and introduced myself to them as a student of Karlstad University, but as far as I am an employee of Teacher Education Department, so I feel that my position and authority may have effects on the respondents
answers. I tried hard to overcome and tackle this challenges, but I am not sure either I overcame this problem or not.

Also it would be better to use observation along with questionnaire and track the respondents in the training and after training, and observe their classroom activities to reveal more factual data. But, I couldn’t track and observe even a small sample of them, as tracking and observing of the training participants during the training and beyond the training is more time consuming and need to additional resources.

FINDINGS

In the following line major findings are presented through charts and tables. Mostly charts are used as means of presentation of findings. Mainly relatives frequencies and cross tabulation of data are used as analysis when seem relevant. At the end of this chapter a summary of the findings is provided, in the next chapter interpretation of findings are discussed

Interest of teachers
As seen in the following chart, majority (71%) of the teachers believe that the inset trainings are important for all teachers. While, a small proportion (about 2% i.e. 3 out of all 181 respondents) responded that it is not necessary for any teachers. Seven-teen percent (17 %) believed that it is necessary and important for new teachers, but more than one tenth (11 %) of teachers were of the
view that it is necessary for old fashion teachers who are not familiar to the modern methods of teaching.

![Chart: views of teachers about need to INSET trainings](chart.png)

Figure 1: views of teachers about need to INSET trainings

When analyzing the answers gender wise we can see similarities between male and female respondents perception; majority of both male (73%) and female (69%) are of the view that INSET trainings are necessary for all teachers. Also about one fifth (19%) of female teachers said it is necessary only for newly hired teachers; while, this perception is slightly lower (12%) in male respondents.

On the other hand (14%) of male teachers believed that INSET is necessary for those old fashion teachers who are not familiar with modern methods of teaching, but less than one in ten (9%) of female teachers believed so, it shows that there is no big difference between male and female respondents. Although, of male teachers no one has said the program is not necessary at all, but a very small proportion of female teachers (3 out of 132) said this program is not necessary at all.
When the teachers are asked “what is your perception about usefulness of INSET program in teachers’ professional development?” half of all respondents (50%) said it is completely useful, while another thirty eight percent (38%) said it is up to some extent useful. A small percentage of respondents (3%) and (6%) accordingly believed that it is useless or completely useless. As seen in the chart below another small proportion (4%) of respondents tick “I don’t know” to the mentioned question.
Materials and contents of the INSET training programs

When the respondents were asked what kind of materials or training manuals shall be developed, an extra whelming majority (94%) of teachers said that the materials of INSET program shall be developed in compliance to professional needs of teachers. While the rest (6%) of the respondents believed that the materials shall not have ambiguity and shall be translated professionally.

Figure 4: perception of teachers about material of INSET program

Time and duration
When the participants are asked about appropriateness of planned time, about 3 quarters (73.5%) of the respondents were satisfied about the time and more than one quarter (26.5%) were unsatisfied.
Than those satisfied were asked about the reason, more than half (51%) of them mentioned that the time was planned with close coordination to school and teachers concern regarding time was taken in to account in training scheduling. Exactly one fifth (20%) of the respondents said the training in the annual vacation was more convenient for them. Planning of INSET as part time was mentioned as the reason of appropriate time by a quarter (25%) of the respondents. Only a small proportion of the respondents believed that the early time of the morning was comfortable for them.

Table 1: reason for appropriateness of planned time

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The time schedule was not appropriate because:</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Reasons for appropriateness of planned time</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The course time was planned without any prior coordination to school time table</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>The time was planned in close coordination with our school, and the teachers concern was taken in account during scheduling of the INSET course.</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The program was planned during our annual vacation, so it disturbed our vacation time</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Program planned during annual vacation</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>As part time course it was boring for me to attained the course consecutively after teaching hours</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>The program was planned as part time course, so it was convenient for me to participate The training time was in the early morning, and it was difficult for me to get on time</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The course time was planned without any prior coordination to school time table</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>It was scheduled in the early morning prior to time of school</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Than those whose answer to Question 5 was No (27% all respondents), were asked about the reason; as seen in the table 2 their dominant answer is that it was too boring for them to attend the course for several hours consecutively after teaching.

Trainers’ qualification and skills
The trainers qualification is another indicator for effectiveness of the INSET, when the teachers were asked about the trainers’ qualification more than half (57%) of the respondents said that the trainers were qualified enough to help the participants. More than a quarter (27%) of teachers responded that the trainers were qualified, but they weren’t able to describe some topics appropriately and satisfy the participants, while another (16%) of the respondents said that the trainers were fresh graduates and they weren’t qualified enough, in comparison to them the trainees were more qualified and experienced.

The following chart shows views of teachers about trainers’ qualification

![Bar chart showing teachers' views about the qualification of trainers]

**Figure 6: teachers’ views about the qualification of trainers**

Male and female teachers’ views regarding the trainers’ qualification categories are varied. More men (65%) than women (53%) said that the trainers were qualified. About same proportion (27%) of male and female respondents said the trainers were qualified, but in some topics they weren’t able to satisfy the participants. Six percent (6%) of men respondents said the trainers were fresh graduates, while this percentage is higher than three times (19%) in female respondents and it shows that the female are more critical than male respondents.
According to education level of the respondents perception is quite different as well. As the chart below illustrates that an absolute majority (89%) of 12th grade graduated teachers believed that the trainers were qualified enough, while a small proportion (6%) of them believes that the trainers were fresh graduates and/or were not qualified enough, as in some topics they weren’t able to satisfy the participants. About two third (63%) of the 14th grade or TTC graduates said the trainers were qualified enough, but about same proportion (8%) and (9%) of TTC graduated teachers said the trainers couldn’t satisfy the participants in some topics and they were fresh graduates respectively. In comparison to 12th grade and TTC graduated teachers the BA holders are not happier with the qualification and skills of trainers. More than two third (37%) of them said the trainers were qualified, but exactly three in every ten (30%) of BA holders believed that in some topics they weren’t able to satisfy the participants. Also about two third of them believed that the trainers were fresh graduated and the participants were more qualified than the trainers. It is obviously seen that the more qualified teachers are more critical to trainers.

Figure 7: comparison of male and female teachers’ views about trainers’ qualification

Figure 8: comparison of teachers views about qualification of trainers in accordance to their level of education
Feedback and follow-up activities
Regarding the usefulness of the method, applicability of the learned skills and provision of feedback by trainers, respondents were asked to mark their level of agreement about each of the statements. Majority of the respondents have expressed their agreements and they seem to be very satisfied. While, a small proportion of them are not satisfied or said “I don’t know”.

Table 3: teachers perception about methods, follow on activities and feedback

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mark your level of agreement to the following sentences</th>
<th>Strongly disagree (%)</th>
<th>Disagree (%)</th>
<th>I don't know (%)</th>
<th>Agree (%)</th>
<th>Strongly agree (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The method used by the trainers were useful</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The skills and knowledge you learned in training program is applicable in the classrooms</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback were provided by the trainers to the participants</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

End of Course Evaluation
An overwhelming majority of respondents said that end of course evaluation, and assessment of learning occurred through the questioning; at the end of each course and post test was given to each of the participants, than the marks of both pre and post were compared in order to evaluate progress of each individual.

Figure 9: Views of teachers about end of course evaluation

Incentives / Motivational Factors
Majority of the teachers believed that providing of material incentives, such as transportation allowance and refreshment during the trainings, and academic incentives, such as allocating certain credits for the In-service training and validation these credits in teachers’ promotion and salary increment have positive role n participants’ attendance rate improvement. About two third (65%)
of the respondents are strongly agree or agree with the statement that “participation in INSET has no role in pay and grade system, or participation in in-service training does not have any role in salary increment and it is one of the main reason for low enthusiasm of teacher in In-service training. About one in each ten (9%) of the respondents were strongly disagree, while proportions of those who are disagree, or said “I don’t know” are the same (13%) of all respondents.

![Bar graph showing teachers' perception about incentives](image)

**Figure 10: teachers’ perception about incentives**

About three quarters (72%) of the respondents are agree or strongly agree that lack of incentives such as transportation and refreshment allowances is one of the negative aspects of INSET program, while about fifth (19%) of all respondents disagree or strongly disagree with the statement.

**Table 4: teachers’ feelings about lack of incentives**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lack of incentives is one of negative points of the INSET programs</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I don’t know</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

At the end the respondents were asked what activities they propose for more improvement of the INSET programs, more than half (52%) of the respondents proposed the provision of per diem and transportation cost for trainees. While, about two third (31%) of respondent said the time and
duration shall be scheduled in coordination to participants. Employment of qualified trainers is mentioned by nearly a fifth (18%) of all respondents.

Figure 11: teachers’ perception about improvement of INSET program

Summary of findings
The research findings show that the INSET training materials shall be developed in full compliance to teachers professional development requirements. It is necessary for the materials developing committee to find out about need assessment of teachers and develop the materials in compliance to findings of need assessment. The research findings also emphasized on professional translation of training materials; according to teachers’ view point using of professional language is another significant issue which shall be considered during the materials development or during the translation of materials from other languages.

According to research findings the methods used by trainers are useful in classroom daily practices; and the skills and knowledge learned in INSET training are applicable and useful in the classroom as well. It shows the effectiveness of methods and skills learned during the trainings.

The research findings show that the material and academic incentives and motivational factors play important role in teachers’ encouragement to attend INSET programs. According to teachers’ views participation of teachers does not affect their grading and other rewards like increase in salaries and certification; it is the main reason for low rate of teachers’ participation. Furthermore, the teachers believed that providing of per diem and transportation allowances during the training can positively affect the attendance rate of teachers and motivate them to be punctual in the training.

The findings also shows that planning of training time in coordination with teachers is another major issue to be taken into account; during scheduling of training time addressing the teachers concern about the time is crucial.

According to teachers’ views employment of qualified trainers is another significant topic which can directly improve the quality of program.
Discussion
This part presents data on the teachers’ views of the effectiveness of the INSET trainings under the following sub headings

Need assessment / Teacher Interest
Teachers’ interest is one of the factors which can bring expected benefits from In-service training. Also need assessment of the teachers is required before conducting any training course. Majority of the teachers feel need to In-service trainings and they said that INSET trainings are necessary for professional development of all teachers. These finding shows that teachers by themselves feel this need and they are willing to participate in the INSET program to develop their capacities and skills. Analyzing the views of teachers we can find similarity in the views of male and female teachers in regards to the need of In-service training.

This finding is similar to the study done in Turkey in which majority of the teacher said that they feel need to in-service training (Ozer, 2004). According to Akhter et al (2011) this is the case also in Pakistan, where majority of teachers were interested toward In-Service training and they linked the effective teaching to In-service training. On the other hand teachers in Turkey are not satisfied with the current method of need assessment and they said the need assessment of the program is not carried out by professional staff (Cimer et al, 2010).

Time and duration of the course
About three quarters of the respondents are satisfied with the current trend of time planning as more than half of them mentioned that the time was planned in coordination to school administration; and teachers’ concerns were taken in to account. It means that before planning of the training the implementing body in close coordination to school administration tried to assess the availability of teachers in the specified time. For a quarter of those who are satisfied main reason of satisfaction is planning of training after school time in the same school where they teach.

On the other hand a quarter of total respondents are not satisfied with the time which was planned for their participation in the INSET training. More than half of these respondents said that the training for their participation was planned in part time; it was not convenient for them as they come to the course tired because of course during the day.

These two contradictory perceptions about part time training show that any pre-prepared plan or schedule is not applicable all over or for all school teachers similarly, but the training implementing body shall provide separate training schedule for each school.

In addition there is similarity between primary and secondary teachers and male and female teachers’ views as similar proportion in all mentioned categories of teachers were satisfied from the time which was planned for their participation.

Previous researches’ findings about this indicator are different. There is a significant difference between views of primary and secondary teachers. According to Cimer et al (2010) the primary teachers in Turkey preferred to attend the training during the school term on the days they did not have classes. Secondary teachers, on the other hand, wanted to attend courses in the morning from 9 AM to 12.
Trainers’ qualification and skills
Trainers’ ability to teach and train effectively and to satisfy the participants is another important indicator raised by the respondents. Trainers shall be qualified and had the ability to use different methods and skills in order to facilitate or deliver the planned subjects effectively to participants. More than half of the respondents indicated the trainers were qualified, while another large proportion of the respondents were either partly or completely unsatisfied with the trainers’ quality. These teachers said that the trainers were fresh graduates and not knowledgeable enough to deliver the training properly. Some of these respondents also said that the trainers were university graduates and BA holders, but they didn’t have any experience and background either in trainings or teaching. The respondents added that in comparison to them the participants were more experienced.

Previous researches in other countries also indicated that the teachers have remarks about the trainers’ ability, for example in Turkey all teachers in the research said that the trainers were not knowledgeable enough to deliver the courses properly. Also they said in some cases during answering the questions the trainers were hesitating, as they seemed unconfident about their knowledge (Cimer et al, 2010). On the other hand, other research findings also indicated that lack of professional staff is a major problem in effective implementation of professional development programs in Turkey (Bayrakci, 2009). We can see a similarity between findings of this study and finding of study that was launched in Turkey.

These findings implicate that more emphasis or more attention shall be paid in staffing of trainers; the employment policy shall be updated to tackle the current problems regarding the trainers’ qualification.

End of course evaluation
Through an effective questioning strategy a teacher/trainer can identify and correct misunderstanding and gap in knowledge of students. The questions shall be framed in ways which explore issues that are critical for understanding. Also feedback is an essential part of formative assessment, and it shall provide clear information to students about his/her strengths and weaknesses and what shall be done for improvement (Black et al, 1998).

As seen in the findings that the majority of respondents said that the final test or post test used in manner through which their learning gap is specified to them and this questioning help them for more improvement.

Finding of previous researches is something different to finding of this study for example in Turkey all teachers said either there was no end of course evaluation of learning or it had not been done effectively. Also teachers indicated the use of questionnaire to evaluate course effectiveness based on participants’ perceptions was a common practice. All teachers in the study said that the evaluation is vital to measure how much of the covered contents are learned by the participants and could be carried out properly (Cimer et al 2010).

Follow-up activities/supporting activities
As shown in the findings that majority of the respondents said that they have received follow on support or follow-up activities and these activities were very useful. It means that after training period the training implementing body provides different kind of supporting activities such as Teacher Learning Circles, Class Observation, Sample teaching and Mentoring and Coaching to
follow the course participants in school for some time to see if and how teachers transfer what they learned from INSET in to class practices which is the ultimate aim if the program.

On the other hand, follow-up activities ensure long term effectiveness and sustainability of the programs and also provide a chance to support teachers in overcoming difficulties they might experience during the implementation of new approaches.

Teacher learning circle of the follow on activities helps the teachers to gather regularly and learn from each other and share experiences. “Communication among teachers is a major vehicle for fostering teacher professional development and teachers learn more from each other than from an authorized person such as a content expert or an education specialist” (Park et al, 2007, cited in Bayrakci 2009, P19).

Previous research findings show that there were no support or follow-up system after courses, or in other word none of the course participants received follow-up support after the INSET course they have attended (Cimer et al, 2010). According to research finding by (Ayes et al, 2007) support after training is an important factor for effectiveness of INSET which is absent in Turkey.

Conclusion
This study aimed to investigate views of teachers regarding the effectiveness of INSET courses conducted by local NGOs and sponsored by Teacher Education Department of Education Ministry to improve quality of education through enhancement of teachers’ skills and capacity. In Afghanistan the INSET training of teachers has received and continues to receive high resources. Since 2007 it has been part of education quality improvement program (EQUIP), but still there are some problems to be solved about teacher training to make the training more functional and effective for the teachers.

Based on the research findings need assessment of teachers are highly recommended prior to developing any kind of training materials. In order to plan and implement effective programs scientific methods shall be used for need assessment, selecting the materials and evaluating of training. For this purpose TED / MoE shall hire specialist in In-Service training unit and enforce the NGOs to hire specialists as well.

Also according to teachers’ views lack of professional trainers is another constrain toward effective implementation of INSET programs in Afghanistan and it directly affect quality of training delivery. It is recommended that the trainers shall be more qualified, experienced and equipped with different skills which can address and tackle teachers’ problem in relevant field.

In order to increase and improve level of teachers’ attendance and persuade them in continuous professional development some motivational elements/incentives shall be added to the program. Possibly, allocating certain credits for the In-Service training and these credits could help in teachers’ promotion; as this is the case in countries where INSET training is not compulsory for teachers, participation in training programs is linked to career development and increase in salary (Saiti and Saiti, 2006).

Beside this, it is possible to include In-service training in teachers’ daily schedule as part of their working activities. In other words, instead of teaching the students, teachers shall spend certain hours in a week on In-service training.
As it is clear all the financial resources for INSET training in Afghanistan is provided by foreign aids and World Bank, it is difficult for the government of Afghanistan to provide sufficient financial resources without foreign aids, so it is necessary to increase the channels for INSET programs. For this purpose distance learning approach could be used as an alternative.
References


Ozer, B. (2004). In-service Training of Teachers in Turkey at the beginning of the 2000s. *Journal of In-service education*, 30 (1), 89-100.


Annexes
Annex: 1

Questionnaire

Background information
Gender: Male ☐ Female ☐
Age: --------- years
Education: less than 12 ☐ 12 grade ☐ TTC graduate/14 grade ☐ BA ☐
          MA ☐ PHD ☐
Experience: --------- years
Classes you teach:  ---------,  ---------,  ---------,  ---------

Main Questions

1. The last INSET course you participated in:
   INSET- 1 ☐ INSET-2 ☐ INSET-3 ☐ INSET-4 ☐ INSET-5 ☐

2. What is your overall idea regarding the need of In-Service training for teachers
   a. It is very necessary for all teachers
   b. Only for new teachers
   c. Necessary for old fashion teachers
   d. Not necessary at all

3. The materials of INSET program is developed
   a. In full compliance to teachers’ need
   b. Till some extent it address teachers need
   c. These materials had developed without taking the teachers concern in to account

4. In respect to understanding the study material is:
   a. Completely understandable
   b. Till some extent understandable
   c. Has ambiguity in some places
   d. Completely ambiguous
   e. The material is useful, but translated un professionally
   f. Other (please specify)

   ________________________________________________________________

   ________________________________________________________________

5. The time planned for your participation in INSET program was perfect?
   Yes ☐ No ☐
6. If your answer to question 4 is yes, then specify the reason
   a. The time was planned in close coordination with our school, and the teachers concern was taken in account during scheduling of the INSET course.
   b. The INSET Program was during our summer vacation, and we get more advantage from our free time
   c. The program was planned as part time course, so it was convenient for me to participate
   d. It was scheduled in the early morning prior to time of school

7. If your answer to question 5 is No, the reason is:
   a. The course time was planned without any prior coordination to school time table
   b. The program was planned during our annual vacation, so it disturbed our vacation time
   c. As part time course it was boring for me to attained the course consecutively after teaching hours
   d. The training time was in the early morning, and it was difficult for me to get on time
   e. Any other (please specify) 

8. The course you participated was planned for:
   a. 12 days  b. 16 days  c. 20 days  d. 8 days

9. The training was planned for how many hours daily (60min/hour)
   a. 3 hours  b. 4 hours  c. 5 hours  d. 6 hours

10. Was the daily period convenient for you?

    ☐ Yes  ☐ No

11. If your answer to Q. 10 is No, than what is your favorite period
    a. 3 hours  b. 4 hours  c. 5 hours  d. 6 hours

12. In comparison to size of the materials the course duration was:
    a. Perfect to cover the all the topics properly
    b. Too short; it was impossible to cover the contents in that time properly
    c. The duration was too long

13. How you can assess the trainers’ ability for the INSET trainings?
a. They were qualified enough and had full control over the contents of book.  
b. They were qualified, but in some topics they can’t describe the topic to satisfy the participants  
c. They were fresh graduates and the participants were more experienced and qualified than the trainers

Please rate your level of Agreement to the following:

14. The method used by the trainers were useful  
   □ Strongly Disagree  □ Disagree  □ I do not know □ Agree  □ Strongly Agree

15. The training site was selected in accessible area  
   □ Strongly Disagree  □ Disagree  □ I do not know □ Agree  □ Strongly Agree

16. Feedback were provided by the trainers to the participants  
   □ Strongly Disagree  □ Disagree  □ I do not know □ Agree  □ Strongly Agree

17. Did you give any evaluation test at the end of training course  
   Yes  No

18. If your answer to Q.17 is yes, then evaluation performed in manner that specified the gap in learners education  
   □ Strongly Disagree  □ Disagree  □ I do not know □ Agree  □ Strongly Agree

19. After the completion of training which type of follow on support provided you by the training implementing body (you can choose more than one option)?  
   □ Class Observation  
   □ Mentoring/coaching  
   □ Teacher Learning Circles  
   □ Sample teaching at schools  
   □ No Follow on activities provided

20. How useful were the follow on activities?  
   Completely useful □ partly useful □ I don’t know □  
   Partly un-useful □ not useful at all □

21. The skills and knowledge you learned in training program is applicable in the classrooms  
   □ Strongly Disagree  □ Disagree  □ I do not know □ Agree  □ Strongly Agree

22. Participation in INSET programs had no role in teacher grading system, and it is one of the main reason for low rate of enthusiasm for participation  
   □ Strongly Disagree  □ Disagree  □ I do not know □ Agree  □ Strongly Agree
23. Lack of incentives is one of negative points of the INSET programs
   □ Strongly Disagree  □ Disagree  □ I do not know □ Agree  □ Strongly Agree

24. The INSET program implementation by government will be more effective than its implementation by the NGOs
   □ Strongly Disagree  □ Disagree  □ I do not know □ Agree  □ Strongly Agree

25. How much useful is the INSET trainings for your professional development?
   Completely useful □  partly useful□  I don’t know □
   Partly un-useful □  not useful at all □

26. Which activity you propose for quality improvement to INSET program?
   __________________________________________________________
   _________________________________________________________
   _________________________________________________________
   _________________________________________________________
   _________________________________________________________
   _________________________________________________________
محتویات شخصی

جنسیت: □ مرد □ زن
سویه تحصیلی: □ بهترین از □ صنف 12 □ صنف 14 □ لیسانس □ ماستر □
تجربه معلمی: □ سال

صنفهای که در آن تدریس می‌کنید:

سوالات مربوط به پروگرام

1. اخیرین ترین‌نگ داخل خدمت (انسیت) که در آن اشتراک کرده‌اید عبارت است از (لطفاً یک گزینه را انتخاب کنید):
   □ انسیت - ۱ □ انسیت - ۲ □ انسیت - ۳ □ انسیت - ۴ □ انسیت - ۵

2. نظر شما در مورد نیاز معلمان به ترین‌نگ داخل خدمت چیست؟ (لطفاً یک گزینه را انتخاب کنید):
   a. همه معلمان به این ترین‌نگ‌ها نیاز دارند
   b. فقط معلمان‌های جدید آموزش دیده به این ترین‌نگ داخل خدمت دارند
   c. برای استادانی لازم است چه با شیوه‌های معاصر و جدید تدریس آشنا نیستند
   d. هیچ معلمی به این ترین‌نگ‌ها نیاز ندارد

3. مواد و محتویات کتاب کورس انسیت که شما در آن اشتراک کرده‌اید (لطفاً یک گزینه را انتخاب کنید):
   a. با در نظر داشت ضرورت‌های معلمان به خدمت و ترتیب شده
   b. محتویات کتاب کورس، همراه با ضرورت‌های معلمان را همراهی می‌کند
   c. بدون در نظر داشت قاب‌های ضرورت‌های معلمان، همراهی می‌کند

4. از نگاه فهم مواد و محتویات کتاب کورس انسیت (لطفاً یک گزینه را انتخاب کنید):
   a. بطور کلی قابل استفاده است
   b. بهترین قابل استفاده است
   c. مواد و محتویات کتاب مفید نیستند، اما ترجمه به زبان فارسی مشابه است
   d. موضوعات و محتویات کتاب مفید است، اما ترجمه به زبان فارسی نشانگر نشود
   e. یا نظر دیگر (لطفاً نوشته نمایید)

5. وقت بلان شده برای اشتراک شما در کورس انسیت برایتان مناسب بود؟
   □ بله □ نه
کورس تریننگ به همراه کامل به اداره مکتب پلان شده بود و در تقسیم اوقات کورس ملاحظات

a. استنداد کاملا در نظر گرفته شده بود.

b. کورس انسیست در جریان رخصتی های سالانه پلان شده بود و ما به سبب داشتن وقت از این کورس استفاده نمودیم.

c. کورس انسیست بعد از وقت یا بعد از مکتب پلان شده بود، و شرکت در آن برای ما سهلتر بود.

d. قبل از وقت مکتب پلان شده بود.

کو. اگر جواب تان به سوال ۵ بود، لطفاً علت آن را در گزینه های ذیل انتخاب نمایید: (لطفا یک گزینه را انتخاب کنید)

a. تریننگ بدون همراهی کامل به اداره مکتب و بدون نظرداشت تکمیل اوقات مکتب پلان شده بود.

b. پروگرام تریننگ در جریان رخصتی سالانه پلان شده بود و سبب اخلال رخصتی سالانه مان شد.

c. تریننگ پروگرام متصل وقت مکتب پلان شده بود و این برای من خیلی خسته کن بود که برای چندین ساعت پی در پی در تریننگ اشتراک نمایم.

d. وقت تریننگ از طرف صبحی و وقت پلان شده بود و رسیدگی به آن وقت برای من خیلی مشکل بود.

e. علت دیگر (لطفا مشخص سازید).

کو. اگر جواب تان به سوال ۶ بود، بیشترین گزینه را انتخاب کنید.

8. تریننگ که شما در آن اشتراک کردید برای چند روز پلان شده بود؟ (لطفا یک گزینه را انتخاب کنید)

a. ۸ روز
b. ۱۲ روز
ت. ۱۶ روز
d. ۲۰ روز

9. پروگرام تریننگ روزانه برای چند ساعت پلان شده بود؟ (لطفا یک گزینه را انتخاب کنید)

a. ۳ ساعت
b. ۴ ساعت
c. ۵ ساعت
d. ۶ ساعت

10. آیا این مدت پلان شده روزانه از نظر شما مناسب بود؟ (لطفا یک گزینه را انتخاب کنید)

a. نخیر
b. بله

11. اگر جواب تان به سوال ۱۰ بود، بیشترین گزینه را انتخاب کنید.

a. ۳ ساعت
b. ۴ ساعت
c. ۵ ساعت
d. ۶ ساعت
12. در مقایسه به حجم کتاب و موضوعات مربوطه، مدت پلان شده ترینگ (اطفا یک گزینه را انتخاب کنید) برای پوشش تمام موضوعات مربوطه مناسب و کافی بود.
   a. مدت پلان شده خیلی مجرد، و پوشش تمام موضوعات در آن ممکن نبود.
   b. مدت پلان شده خیلی طولانی و خسته کن بود.
   c. ب. مدت پلان شده خیلی خوش و خسته کن بود.

13. مقایسه و استعداد ترینران در عرصه ترینگ و حاکمیت بر موضوعات ترینگ چگونه ارزیابی می‌کنید؟ (اطفا یک گزینه را انتخاب کنید)
   a. برای پوشش تمام موضوعات مربوطه مناسب و کافی بود.
   b. مدت پلان شده خیلی مجرد، و پوشش تمام موضوعات در آن ممکن نبود.
   c. مدت پلان شده خیلی طولانی و خسته کن بود.

14. میتود های که ترینران از آن استفاده می‌نمودند خیلی مفید بود
   a. کاملاً غیر موافق □ غیر موافق □ نمی دانم □ موافق □ کاملا موافق □
   b. کاملاً موافق □ غیر موافق □ نمی دانم □ موافق □ کاملا موافق □
   c. کاملاً موافق □ غیر موافق □ نمی دانم □ موافق □ کاملا موافق □

15. ترینگ در جای دایر گردیده بود که برای شما قابل دسترسی بود
   a. کاملاً غیر موافق □ غیر موافق □ نمی دانم □ موافق □ کاملا موافق □
   b. کاملاً موافق □ غیر موافق □ نمی دانم □ موافق □ کاملا موافق □
   c. کاملاً موافق □ غیر موافق □ نمی دانم □ موافق □ کاملا موافق □

16. آیا در اخر ترینگ ارزیابی نهایی مشمولین صورت می‌گرفت؟
   a. نخیر □ بلی □
   b. کاملاً غیر موافق □ غیر موافق □ نمی دانم □ موافق □ کاملا موافق □
   c. کاملاً موافق □ غیر موافق □ نمی دانم □ موافق □ کاملا موافق □

17. آیا در آخر ترینگ ارزیابی نهایی مشمولین صورت می‌گرفت؟
   a. نخیر □ بلی □
   b. کاملاً غیر موافق □ غیر موافق □ نمی دانم □ موافق □ کاملا موافق □
   c. کاملاً موافق □ غیر موافق □ نمی دانم □ موافق □ کاملا موافق □

18. اگر جوابتان به سوال ۱۷ بله باشد، پس از ارزیابی نهایی طوری صورت می‌گرفت که خلاصه آموزشی را به مشمولان شناخته می‌کرد.
   a. کاملاً غیر موافق □ غیر موافق □ نمی دانم □ موافق □ کاملا موافق □
   b. کاملاً موافق □ غیر موافق □ نمی دانم □ موافق □ کاملا موافق □
   c. کاملاً موافق □ غیر موافق □ نمی دانم □ موافق □ کاملا موافق □

19. بعد از ترینگ کدام نویز از فعالیت‌های تعقیبی توسط موسسه تطابق کننده پروگرام برای شما تهیه گردیده‌یا شاهد آن در مکتب خود بوده‌اید (پیشتر از یک گزینه را انتخاب کرده می‌توانید)
   □ مشاهده تدریس در صنف
   □ رهنمایی فردی توسط ترینران
   □ حلقات آموزشی معلم
   □ درس نمونه
   □ هیچ نوع فعالیت تعقیبی

20. فعالیت‌های تعقیبی برای تان چه قدر مفید بود.
21. مهارت ها و تئوری های را که در جریان تریننگ های انجام داده اید در صنف قبل تطبیق است
   کاملا موافق □ غیر موافق □ نمی دانم □ موافق □

22. اعتنایی عملکرد معلمین در نهایت این پروگرام می باشد
   کاملا موافق □ غیر موافق □ نمی دانم □ موافق □

23. نبود مشوقات یکی از نقاط های منفی پروگرام های داخل خدمت یا انسيت محسوب می گردد
   کاملا موافق □ غیر موافق □ نمی دانم □ موافق □

24. تطبیق پروگرام انسيت ها بطور توسط وزارت معارف نمی رسد بنابراین تطبیق آن توسط مؤسسات مؤثرتر واقع می گردد
   کاملا موافق □ غیر موافق □ نمی دانم □ موافق □

25. تریننگ های داخل خدمت (انسيت) برای رشد مسلکی شما چه قدر مفید است؟
   کاملا موافق □ قسمت مفید □ نمی دانم □ قسمت غیر مفید □ کاملا غیر مفید □