Thesis- Recipe of Crucible

“The major antecedents that contributes in shaping the crucibles of Pakistani women to become a successful leader”
Abstract

Successful leadership is the dream of all the students of leadership for which various elements including personality, skills, vision etc. are mentioned by various scholars and researchers, but what is interesting to acknowledge is that all these elements are a manifest of the moment that alter the identity of an ordinary person into a successful leader. These moments are known to be called crucible of leadership.

Crucible has a strong connection to the leadership but the mystery of what shapes these crucibles is an ever going process of research and narration. The fascination with studying the recipe of crucible is built on the foundation of my own crucible of leadership that shaped my skills and vision. Considering that, I decided to explore the recipe of crucible for what is close to me and for which I have the most knowledge about, I was ascertain to produce an informative piece of document for the readers with good authenticity and reality in my work. For this purpose I chose to explore the recipe of crucible for Pakistani female leaders.

In the crucible of leadership, one of the most important element that plays role is the antecedents of a life story that builds a way to crucible and successful leadership. Thus, my focus of this study was to explore and narrate such antecedents that are the prime source of crucible of leadership for successful Pakistani female leaders. In order to do so, I had to get deep knowledge of the personal life of Pakistani female leaders, which I did by studying their biographies and testimonial accounts building a theory of antecedents as recipe of crucible through the approach of grounded theory.

My qualitative analysis and sound coding, suggested a theory that, the most essential antecedents that hasn't change in generation for Pakistani female leadership are the family antecedents (education, gender equality and a strong belief on principles) and social antecedents (lack of social acceptance), participating highest in shaping the crucible. Whereas, religion is a supportive antecedent but is not significantly impacting the crucible of leadership, as is widely perceived in the world. Furthermore, I concluded my study with highlighting the factor of patriarchy and role expectancy as the major hindrance in the successful female leadership in Pakistan.

Keywords: antecedents, crucibles, leadership, patriarchy, glass ceiling, female of Pakistan, gender role differentiation, religious dogma, family, society, education, principles.
Acknowledgement

In the name of Allah, the Almighty, all praise belongs to him.

Successful completion of this thesis is a true blessing and mercy of Allah, without wish of whom, I couldn’t write a single word.

This thesis would have not been possible without some bright names of the people that were part of this process. First and foremost, my humble gratitude and acknowledgment is for my tutor Professor Philippe Daudi, whose continuous guidance and mentoring from selecting the topic to the structure and elements of thesis, showed me the right way to complete this thesis. Professor Philippe Daudi motivated me to write this thesis with strong personal conviction as he says “one writes best when he/she writes from the heart”. I would like to thank him for his cooperation and valuable lessons at every mistake of mine, which enabled me to explore the ways of writing this thesis which was not possible otherwise. Along with my tutor Professor Philippe Daudi, the whole panel of this thesis has given me a very precise and constructive guidance at every stage of my writing. My special thanks to Professor Bjorn Bjerke for his immense guidance of methodology and bringing my attention to the lacking in the methodology chapter of my thesis.

This acknowledgment will go unfulfilled without thanking my family who supported me all along during the writing of this thesis. My mom for staying up late nights with me in support and without much knowledge of the topic finding a pool of data for my research work. My father for giving me a good and precise information about the religious rules and Quranic quotes. My sister for hearing my cries and concerns all the time regarding my arguments of the thesis.

The one person that holds a great share in this thesis is my brother Ali Raza, who worked on this thesis along with me like it’s his own. As I started an aim to cook the recipe of crucible, the boils of criticism from my brother enabled me to save this thesis from burning at various occasions. If he wouldn’t have own my work and task like his own and wouldn’t have helped me at every stage of thesis, it was impossible for me to carry this thesis own in such systematic manner along with managing my health and medical treatments.

Last but not the least, I want to thank Terese Nilsson for always helping me in submitting my progress reports while I was away in Pakistan working on my thesis and health.
List of Tables

Table 1-Methodological Research Paper Summary .......................................................... 29
Table 2-Antecedents for Crucible of Successful Leadership............................................. 50
Table 3-Shared Antecedents for Crucible of Successful Female Leadership....................... 51
Table 4-Common Patterns of Crucible for Female Leadership............................................ 52
# CONTENTS

## TOPIC

1-INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................... 1

1.1-Greetings to Crucibles: Bennis & Thomas’s Approach ............................................ 1

1.1.1-The Recipe of Crucibles: Spice of Antecedents: .................................................. 3

1.2-The Unbreakable Bond of Leadership and Antecedents ......................................... 3

1.3-An Inspirational Approach to the Recipe of Crucible ............................................. 4

1.4-The Rage of South Asian Antecedents on World Leadership................................. 6

1.5-Funneling the Research Issue .................................................................................. 9

2-LITERATURE REVIEW ................................................................................................ 11

2.1-Evolution of Leadership ......................................................................................... 11

2.1.1-Emergence of Male and Female Leadership: ....................................................... 12

2.2-The Beauty of Female Leadership .......................................................................... 14

2.3-The Determinants of Women In Challenging The Leadership Position .................. 15

2.3.1-Breaking the Glass Ceiling: ............................................................................... 16

2.4-Pakistan and Female Leadership ............................................................................ 19

2.4.1-Mirroring the Pakistani Culture: ......................................................................... 20

2.4.2-Female Leadership as an Antecedent Taboo: ...................................................... 22

2.4.3-The Religious Dogma of Female Leadership in Pakistan: ................................ 24

3-RESEARCH METHODOLOGY .................................................................................... 27

3.1-Search for Methodological Ground ......................................................................... 27

3.2-Research Design- A Qualitative Approach ............................................................. 27

3.2.1- Rationalization to the Biographical Method ......................................................... 28

3.3-Essentiality of Grounded Theory .......................................................................... 29

3.4-Theoretical Sampling ............................................................................................... 30

3.4.1-Data Collection: .................................................................................................. 31

3.4.1.1-Primary data: .................................................................................................... 31

3.4.1.2-Secondary data: ............................................................................................... 35

3.4.1.3-Justification ...................................................................................................... 35

3.5-Coding: ...................................................................................................................... 36

3.5.1-Primary coding: .................................................................................................... 36

3.5.1.1-Open coding ..................................................................................................... 36

3.5.1.2-Axial coding ..................................................................................................... 36
3.5.1.3-Selective coding .................................................................................................................. 37
4-HISTORICAL DIARY FOR ANTECEDEENTS OF PAKISTANI FEMALE LEADERSHIP ........38
  4.1-Generation 1 .......................................................................................................................... 38
    4.1.1-FATIMA JINNAH- The Mother of Nation: ........................................................................... 38
      4.1.1.1- The Boil of Crucible to the Successful Leadership .................................................... 39
  4.2-Generation 2 .......................................................................................................................... 40
    4.2.1-TEHMINA DURRANI- The Ugly Duckling: ...................................................................... 40
      4.2.1.1 The Boil of Crucible to the Successful Leadership .................................................... 41
    4.2.2-BENAZIR BHUTTO- Daughter of the East: ....................................................................... 42
      4.2.2.1 The Boil of Crucible to the Successful Leadership .................................................... 43
  4.3-Generation 3 .......................................................................................................................... 44
    4.3.1-NAMIRA SALIM- The Sky Rider: ..................................................................................... 44
      4.3.1.1- The Boil of Crucible to the Successful Leadership .................................................... 45
    4.3.2-MALALA YOUSAFZAI- The Noble Prize Winner: ............................................................ 46
      4.3.2.1- The Boil of Crucible to the Successful Leadership .................................................... 47
5-ANALYSIS .................................................................................................................................. 48
  5.1-Open Coding ......................................................................................................................... 48
  5.2-Axial Coding .......................................................................................................................... 50
  5.3-Selective Coding .................................................................................................................... 52
    5.3.1-Family and Society: Salt and Pepper of the Crucibles: ....................................................... 52
    5.3.2-Ingredient 1: Family Antecedent: ..................................................................................... 53
      5.3.2.1-Highly principled: ...................................................................................................... 54
    5.3.2.2-Gender equality: .......................................................................................................... 55
    5.3.2.3-Highly educative environment: ..................................................................................... 56
    5.3.2.4-Highly influential family: ............................................................................................ 56
    5.3.3-Ingredient 2: Society as an Antecedent Taboo: ................................................................. 57
    5.3.4-Balancing the Spices: ....................................................................................................... 58
6-RAISING THE ANTECEDEENT FLAG .................................................................................... 59
7-AREAS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH ...................................................................................... 61
8-APPENDIX ................................................................................................................................. VI
  8.1-SAMPLE QUESTIONNAIRE .................................................................................................... VI
9-REFERENCES ............................................................................................................................... X

Tazeen Zehra Naqvi
TOPIC

RECIPE OF CRUCIBLE:

“The major antecedents that contributes in shaping the crucibles of Pakistani women to become a successful leader.”

1-INTRODUCTION

1.1-Greetings to Crucibles: Bennis & Thomas’s Approach

Crucible in a literal meaning is the word used to refer as “a container of metal or refractory material employed for heating substances to high temperature” (Dictionary.com, 2015) and when we see the meaning of using “crucible” metaphorically it is “a transformative experience through which an individual comes to a new or an altered sense of identity.” (Bennis & Thomas, 2011, p. 63). Now if we compare the two terms presented here, the metaphorical explanation of crucible makes good sense with the literal definition of crucible. The infamous “crucible” thereby, in large is heating the person putting through extreme trials in order to shape them (transform) in a definite structure.

My analysis of this explanation of crucible presented by great Bennis and Thomas has 3 highlights to consider i.e. transformative, experience, and identity. Transformative is to change something. This term in itself holds great depth and mystery in the sense that, it implies, that the person or thing in transformation is not the final yet. For a person to transform means that the person has not yet reached his destination, he/she is not in his/her real identity yet and is in a need of “change” which might come from anything or everything. My understanding to this suggests that transformation can only occur when the person in question is not in the satisfactory state and needs something more out of life or himself/herself, which might come from something that is not planned to change his/her identity for good. Thus, change plays a significance role in transformation without which transformation will be fake and meaningless, though, the need to change might not always be evident and comes as an obligatory which pushes the person to behave or react in a certain way of changing his/her perception, reaction or personality.

Furthermore, change can occur from a major something as big as, a death of a loved one, bankruptcy, failure in a lifelong goal or as small as, meeting an inspirational person or hearing a motivational speech etc. But we can never estimate the impact of small or big change on transformation. So the key is not to underestimate anything that we go through or experience be it small or big experience, you just never know which door destiny knocks.

This brings us to the second highlight of the Bennis and Thomas’s explanation of crucible i.e. experience. Experience is a complex phenomenon in itself, as anything related to human feelings or mind is difficult to capture and present in a word, but despite its complexity, the
Thesis- Recipe of Crucible

dictionary definition of an experience that can be found is “An event or occurrence which leaves an impression on someone” (Experience, 2015). This definition in its literal sense implies that any event that come across us or any occurrence that we witness directly, leaves an impact on us is experience, which means that our consciousness is crucial for an event to be labelled as an experience because without an attentive consciousness we might not get impact from the event leaving it to be just a passing by occurrence rather than experience. Here it is very crucial to understand the importance of impact while talking about experience, because it is this impact that creates a fine distinctive line between experience and occurrence.

Throughout our life cycle stages we go through various experiences both negative and positive that impact our personality, character and frame of reference. These experiences may vary from being voluntary to involuntary i.e. some experiences are that we choose to be part of, for instance education is a voluntary experience, whereas, an accident, death of a loved one is an involuntary experience. All the experiences that we are part of (voluntarily or involuntarily) leaves an impact (consciously or subconsciously) on us that subsequently influences our identity and behavior.

The conscious and subconscious impact of experience on our mind and personality can be more correctly categorized as learning. Any experience that leaves an impact on us is a learning experience and other experiences which fails to leave an impact on us are mere occurrence. Kolb has very well explained the relationship of learning and experience by defining, learning as a change in behavior occurring through experience (Kolb, 1984). This clearly signifies the essentiality of a transformative experience in altering a behavior through a clear sense making of knowledge gained.

As we have discussed in consulting change with Philippe Daudi¹, the primitive brain of a person is a stubborn subconscious that doesn’t let us alter our identity, it always try to contradict the factual impact of the experience, resisting to learn and adapt. The idea behind this primitive brain is that it is strict with the frame of reference that a person uses to extract cues and sense making according to the identity of the person (Weick, 1995). Primitive brain is in love with the concept of “old me” thus, it refuses to accept the “new me” through experiences by giving reasoning that is comfortable with our current identity and frame of reference.

In this manner to justify the term “experience” used by the Bennis and Thomas, it is very essential to conceptualize that an experience is a learning process which leaves an impact that alters the frame of reference to see from a new focal point and allows sense making with a logical reasoning to convince the primitive brain. Thus, it can be said that for a transformative identity, experience needs to break the strong relationship of identity and primitive brain which is not very easily possible without a strong strike of a crucible, that if not destroys, at least

¹ Lecture on Introduction Consultancy and Leading Change

Tazeen Zehra Naqvi 2
weakens the relationship of primitive brain and identity to give the person’s identity a new shape, a better shape to be more precise.

1.1.1-The Recipe of Crucibles: Spice of Antecedents:

The “experience” mentioned by Bennis and Thomas is already proved to be very essential for a fair transformation of identity. In this scenario, what is most intriguing is the recipe that shape these experiences of an altered identity. I believe and observed that even being on the same platform, same situation and despite of having the same biological determinants, we all have a unique life story that shapes our experiences bringing us to an emerged personality, thus, my point is that a person does not inherit any personality right from the birth but there are some ingredients that cooks a strong personality with the right amount of spices bringing boils of crucibles that shape us as a human. Such an antecedents need to be analyzed and brought in the light to examine the crucibles and their impact on personality development.

Imagine the impact of an incredible incident of the disappearance of the Malaysian airline in 2014. Though this tragic incident brought everyone at the same platform seeing an amazing unity from all over the world which was a true example of citizen of world. The crucible of adversity shared by the families of 200 passengers are same but the antecedents behind them shaped a different impact of changing identity in terms of some people going emotionally vulnerable in the shadow of darkness while others becoming more strong and fighting legally for the search of missing airplane.

Therefore, this example implies that even sharing the same crucible might have a different impact on number of people depending on their varying antecedents and the extent to which those antecedents are holding a strong ground in the life of people. The antecedents considered in such situations are mostly related to the psychological and demographical dynamics of human nature. The demographical antecedents are related to the factors inherited by birth which includes family, gender, culture and some of them may or may not vary with the passage of time like age, social status, income, education etc. Culture in this matter is a very debatable phenomena with people having varying opinions about whether a person can change her culture with time or not. Whereas, the psychological antecedents are the spiritual and perceptional antecedents which includes religion, likes/dislikes and intrinsic motivations. A good combination of demographical and psychological spices of antecedents cooks a perfect recipe of transformational experiences.

1.2-The Unbreakable Bond of Leadership and Antecedents

According to Shamir and Eilam (2005) experiences (crucibles) that shapes leadership is a facet of their life determinants i.e. the antecedents built on the life story of people. Affirming this concept George, Sims and other (2007) puts forward an idea of authentic leadership best established and well explained on the basis of life story as it gives the perspective to the
experiences, allowing the impact necessary for an effective leadership. Life story is a series of experiences encountered by an individual as per the allowed leverage of antecedents he/she carries throughout the course of life. The importance of life story in my believe suggests that it’s not human who choose to be evil or good, ordinary or unique, talented or inept, it’s the antecedents, shaping the life story in a way to throw several opportunities in the way of person to do something extraordinary and be someone extraordinary.

Leadership is a phenomena well discussed in course of time with no particular way of determining what makes person “a good leader”. My answer to such questions is that the recipe of a good leader is the close relationship of leadership, crucibles and antecedents. According to Golman’s (2011) analysis, a good leader is the one with a true gifted emotional intelligence, self-awareness, empathy, self-regulation, motivation and social skill but can these qualities be learned in an institution through teaching?. Well that’s a debatable issue of “teaching leadership” with a wide research suggesting an acceptance of 70:20:10 model i.e. learning 70 through experience of leadership, 20 through social learning and 10 through educational program (Kotter International, 2014). Even if the leadership skills can be learned through teaching, learning in educational institution itself is an experience that can transform the human identity based on the baggage of antecedents everyone carries around, hence, every aspect of becoming a good leader involves the leverage of antecedents.

This uniquely strong bond between successful leadership and antecedents is very well explained by the great duo of Bennis and Thomas (2002) in their experimental interview of a group of leaders which proves that one of the major factor of successful leadership is the crucible which as previously explained is made perfect with the spice of antecedents. Therefore, the understanding of antecedents shaping the life story, is very essential to understand the psychological dynamic of becoming a leader.

1.3-An Inspirational Approach to the Recipe of Crucible

“The love of God for me is not dependent of the approval from men, there is no one who can decide what will make my God love me, his (Allah) love for me is beyond conditions.”

Belonging to the patriarchal culture of Pakistan where men are the destiny deciders for women, this personal statement of mine has always been the guiding light to find the way out of the societal barriers. Though with some traces of the same culture, my story is different than the rest which motivated me to pursue this narrative study of antecedent’s impact and generational leadership.

Fortunately, I belong to the 20% population of Pakistan which has access to a considerable luxurious life than the rest. Adding to it, I belong to the city of lights “Karachi” which is the hub for business and internationalization in Pakistan with a liberated culture and comparative gender
equality than smaller cities of Pakistan. Despite of all these favorable facts about Karachi, it is also not safe from the wrath of patriarchal culture backed by the twisted Taliban sharia law.

My family is considered to be liberal Islamic, mainly because the Shiite Islam is very flexible with teachings in consideration to human nature. Moreover, I belong to a Muhajir community which is considered to be one of the most liberal and internationalized community. Despite of this, I have witnessed male domination in my family but to the very bearable extent, only applicable in the minor life decisions and a little hesitation when the decision is against the submission to the societal taboos.

Moreover, being the youngest of all, has always given me a special perk over my other siblings and on the top of it being my brother’s apple of an eye, made my life no less than a princess. I have had a good education as my family always put great emphasis on education and for that purpose, despite of financial turmoil in the initial year, I was still admitted to an army school considered to be one of the most prestigious of all. There is no gender discrimination on the surface level in my family but my brother has always been included in the family decision making circle along with my parents which has always been in my favor as my brother played the role of China wall between my desires/wishes and my parent’s restrictions.

My parents equal treatment among siblings and a healthy family environment made me a confident person who knew what she wants but the unstable marriage of my parents forced me to stop believing in marriage or any such relations. I lost the trust in relations especially the romantic love relations which made me a self-reliant and self-independent person. It seems like a sad philosophy but it actually made me clear on my way of life and career aspirations in an early age. I believed in doing something that will apart me from a regular Pakistani life which is education, marriage and children. I wanted to do something that brings me peace and happiness and that fulfills my motto of life to be a good human being as suggested by the teachings of Islam. Along with this motto, resistance to marriage, and patriotism towards my homeland Pakistan, provoked me to dream of becoming an army doctor. It was a perfect dream with perfect practical preparations of pre-medical studies in school and high school but everything changed in a moment.

My life was turned upside down when my eldest sister chose to marry a boy out of our community which is a societal taboo. It caused a great trauma in the family, forcing my sister to leave home and get disowned by my parents. It came to me as a great shock causing me to go in chronic depression leading to anxiety attacks and heart problem due to which I was unable to join Pakistan army.

I was treated by several doctors including psychotherapist but the pain and suffering I had to go through was unimaginable to others. I was broken and shattered, I had nothing in front of me, my future was dark but then one day I realized that all this agony is only mine, of course my parents are hurt and worried but the long term effect of this situation will only be mine. Therefore, that was the moment when I decided to change my life, I took admission in Business Administration
and started aiming to go abroad for masters and settling there. I wanted to be free, I wanted to prove that I am myself, I cannot be compared to anyone in what I will do and I wanted to prove that I am much more capable than anyone think I am. I wanted to be the pride for my parents, my country and an example for all Pakistani females who suffer trauma of some kind.

With passage of time, as I started to achieve my goals my family felt proud of me and they started to connect with my dreams to study in Sweden and live the life I have always dreamt of. Today I am the pride of my family, I am a girl of my principles and I am as lively as I could ever be with a great acknowledgement received by the Sweden for all my hard work and misery in the form of Global Swede Award all thanks to my professor Philippe Daudi who saw the talent in me beyond my health issues and nominated me for the award.

My dream of becoming an army doctor was shattered and it will always ache me but it also allowed me to be a self-confident, self-aware, courageous person who has a vision of living a free life breaking the patriarchal barrier of the society. This antecedent story of my crucible inspired me to go deeper in the study of other female leaders of Pakistan to narrate the kind of antecedents that shaped their crucible and generate a conclusive theory about the antecedents that are common in Pakistan for those who broke the barriers and became a prominent leaders.

1.4-The Rage of South Asian Antecedents on World Leadership

“Globalization is the new reality”

- (John B. Larson)

There is a deep understanding and rationale hiding in the “reality” of globalization. Globalization as defined by Thomas Larsson (2001, p. 9) is “the process of world shrinkage, of distances getting shorter, things moving closer. It pertains to the increasing ease with which somebody on one side of the world can interact, to mutual benefit, with somebody on the other side of the world “, which has two major dimensions in it i.e. world shrinkage and mutually benefited interaction with somebody on the other side of the world. This implies that we are acting and behaving as one, we are no more citizens of country rather we are citizens of the world where actions of one nation impacts the balance of the whole world, thus, the need is to understand the various dynamics that might impact the world economy and balance.

Leadership is no different in such manner, that the impact of leadership style and the extent of cherishing the leadership in one part of the world impacts the whole world. My argument suggests that world is a talent hub where we want all the talent available to gather and expand the working of the world, making it a better place to live and work for the coming generations. In saying that it is essential to understand and cherish the dynamics that people from every corner brings to the development of leadership.
As briefly discussed previously, leadership is made up of a perfect crucibles as a result of favorable antecedents to open the way for an effective leadership. These antecedents differ from country to country and culture to culture, building a right mix of these antecedents from all across the different parts of the world to develop a best leader and follower relationship is the true delivery of globalization. Thus, global leaders is a concept offering to establish leadership beyond the cross border limitations.

Understanding the intercultural differences and their impact on the world operations is what a true internationalization means. During one of my courses in the master’s program I learned that when we meet new cultures we observe their action, interpret it and react based on the interpretation which decides the future of our relationship. This concept proves the importance of understanding the new culture and understanding the “authentic” leadership of the culture in consideration which might differ from the authenticity of our own culture, as described by George, Sims and other (2007) authenticity differs from person to person and context to context but what makes up this authenticity as a general acceptable leadership style in any culture is the share antecedents of leaders who emerged from that country.

Asia is no different in leadership development i.e. our core antecedents are the key to leadership we develop and demonstrate which ultimately impact the leadership of whole world. A Chinese leader will be very formal yet humble while leading, which may conflict with the working environment of the followers in America who works in casual and competitive environment. Thus, the leadership style of Asia has a strong impact on the whole world. Asia is comprised of 49 sovereign states (Wikipedia, List of sovereign states and dependent territories in Asia, 2015) with a set of few shared antecedents as a continent as well as a different set of antecedents as a nation which further goes deep to the personal antecedents that ultimately with the combination of all three antecedents with individual crucible, makes up a leadership style.

Asian organizational and personal antecedents are defined by various writers through various analysis and observations. One such experimental analysis conducted by Hofstede (2003) categorized Asians as “family or tribe” with prominent antecedents of collectivism, shared feelings and emotions, working as a family with strong hierarchy based on the seniority which suggests that age is a very dominating antecedent in the organizational leadership of Asia. Furthermore, Asian antecedents are more prone to social interactions and personal relationships, thus, Asians put great value to the personal antecedents such as family reputation, status, social circle along with personality traits of extroversion, communication, which sometimes extends to the level of manipulation of sugar coated words. Same in this manner the authenticity of leadership in Asian context is defined in terms of educational level i.e. the more a person is educated the more he is considered to be authentic. Thus, overall Asian leadership is very straight with a clear communication of “I’m the boss” through nonverbal communication of actions and the way to approach things.
Narrowing down the Asian antecedents every region in the Asia has its own set of antecedents that contributes in the development of leadership. Such regional antecedents are what impacts the personal development as well as the leadership of the whole world. The region I belong to is South Asia which includes Pakistan, Bangladesh, India, Afghanistan, Bhutan, Burma, Maldives, Nepal, and Sri Lanka (Wikipedia, 2015). The culture of South Asia is built on the strong grounds of hierarchy based on the age which is an idea prevailed from the cultural teachings which suggests that an old man is always wiser. The leadership of Asia is based on age, experience and education and not on the talent much. A person can be a master of functional stupidity but if he has the due experience he is considered to be the authentic leader.

Another focus of South Asian leadership is the “rhetoric”. There is a high value attached to the charisma and the delivery of words which sometime proves to be a cause of destruction leading to the toxic leadership because the motive of the leader is not favorable for the society but due to the high influence of rhetoric and charisma the message goes in background while the messenger becomes the one who is being followed rather than the vision communicated by the leader. On the other hand due to the increased illiteracy, rhetoric and charisma do play a positive influence if used for the right purpose but the impact of these two main focuses of leadership on the world usually comes out unanticipated because the world of leadership puts less value to the rhetoric and charisma making it hard for the leader community to understand the Asian tactics of leadership.

The South Asian leadership and its impact on the world leadership will go uncountable without mentioning the two great leaders of South Asian history i.e. Gandhi and Jinnah who shared the same leadership style but for the different causes which brought different results within South Asia and the world. The leadership of Gandhi and Jinnah is remembered with the freedom fight from the British rule in India followed by the freedom fight of Muslim for a separate nation from India which emerged in the form of Pakistan as we know it now. This freedom fight is generally known as “Indo-Pak Partition”.

Jinnah and Gandhi both had remarkable rhetoric and charisma along with a brilliant vision of freedom which makes them the heroic leaders of the South Asian society. Their vision was to end the British rule from the India and gain the lost sovereignty of India, whereas, the British leadership was individualistic based on the “divide and rule” of Hindu and Muslim which for them seemed to work out because with this leadership motive British did create the differences due to which, Jinnah emerged as leader of Muslim but to the amaze of British, Jinnah and Gandhi worked together representing the collectivism antecedent of South Asia to first gain the freedom from British, alongside, Jinnah emerged as a leader of Muslim with a vision of separate identity of Muslim and Hindu famously known as “Two Nation Theory”.

The impact of Jinnah and Gandhi’s rhetoric allowed them to build a strong followership in their respective communities singling out the British, leaving no choice for them but to leave India. But because the leadership style of Jinnah and Gandhi was based on the same antecedents it was
impossible to submit to one’s leadership which resulted in both reaching to the win-win situation in which Jinnah succeeded in establishing a new country for Muslim and India succeeded a clearance from British rule as well as winning the Hindu majority cities to be part of India. This little description of Gandhi and Jinnah’s leadership is written to prove that sharing the same Asian leadership allowed the win-win situation, whereas, for the rest of the world the leadership style of Asia is so unique causing an inability to handle the situation by British resulting in win lose situation. Thus, understanding and promoting South Asian leadership has a great impact on the world leadership for the development of a win-win situation and an authentic followership.

In such case it is essential to understand the South Asian concept of female leadership, as it is an in negligible facet of globalization. We need more of strong South Asian female leadership which can only be done by understanding and exploring the elements of the moments and experiences that shapes their leadership and allowed them to emerge as a successful leaders.

1.5-Funneling the Research Issue

World is a global village today with continuous changing needs and evolving perspectives about gender equality and role expectancy. From past decade’s world has witnessed an increasing amount of females in mainstream. Not only the women has specialized and entered the mainstream but they have shown a remarkable leadership qualities in every walk of life. There are many women who have pursued a leadership in a better manner than men, questioning the general concept of leadership from a masculinity framework. There have been many discussions since then if leadership is a masculine thing or if women are proved to be a better leader than men (Jurczak, 2011).

Though this debate is still going on with varying conclusion by various researchers, another mode of question is “why is there less number of female leaders emerging from one part of the world than another?” There are various dimensions to study in this matter but considering the etiquettes of research I have narrowed down my study to investigate “why is there less number of leaders emerged from Asia than from the American or European continent?” In order to make it more researchable considering the time constraint I further narrowed it down to “Investigate why there are less number of female leaders from Pakistan emerging on the mainstream?”.

When I found the way to this research issue, my initial research suggested various dynamics that contributes to the ratio of successful Pakistani female leadership. But my interest is to study the psychological dynamics of the research issue and while researching what caught my interest was “What were the specific crucibles of the successful Pakistani female leaders that made them what they are today?”

Because the culture of Pakistan has high implementation of role expectancy which seems to make build a culture for girls to refrain from going mainstream, thus, it is more often seen that Pakistani female leaders are emerged leaders out of the situational causes but as a researcher it’s
my task to know the reality of this claim which is why I have become a knowledge creator of exploring the "the major antecedents that contributes in shaping the crucibles of Pakistani women to become a successful leader" which is my basic research issue.

To explore such an issue my tool is to study the antecedents of female leaders who have made it through to the mainstream and to be called a “Successful female leader”. To study such leaders I have conducted a narrative research through exploring various autobiographies and testimonials available for the leader in consideration. Furthermore, an authentic knowledge creator needs to see the bigger picture of the issue due to which I have not restricted myself to just reading describing and the antecedents of these leaders but have further involved myself in making a theory regarding. "The future of female Pakistani leaders” based on the pattern of antecedents
2-LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1-Evolution of Leadership

Leadership is an old phenomena prevailing in the society since the emergence of life on the earth. It does not only exist in the humans but is evident in all the systematic operations carried out by all the living things. Animals are one of such sources to acknowledge leadership and to elaborate the kind of leaderships that exists in the world, as they also follow the basic qualities that makes up a successful leadership i.e. a vision, influence, communication and a strong followership. They communicate through, body movements, smell, eyes, nose and their own languages. One of the best thing about the animal leadership is the team work based on the voting (Prykucki, 2013). Thus, it implies that leadership is not the inheritance of humankind only but wherever there is a goal to achieve with group of people required to work together in a systematic manner with shared responsibility and resources, leadership will either be chosen or emerged by animals as well (Bass, The Bass Handbook of Leadership: Theory, Research, and Managerial Applications, 2008).

This existence of leadership in animals and humans has influenced many researchers and scholars to study this phenomena to form a conclusive definition of human behavior. It is due to the complexity of leadership that it is described as part of human behavior and psychology, scientific management, sociology, conflict management etc. making it one of the most dynamic issues to research. Due to these various influences it has been a hurdle full journey to reach to a conclusion on what leadership is, though researchers have failed to explain it but its diverse nature of dynamics has given leadership an status of “Art” also because there is no one proper means to conclude what are the attributes of successful leadership or what makes up a good leader\(^2\). This ambiguity is the basis of my research to find a common pattern of antecedents that is part of Pakistani female leadership.

Despite not sharing a common definition of leadership by all the researchers and scholars, with all the efforts and research in the field of leadership there has been a good consensus as to what are the basic leadership skills and attributes. Among these attributes, the most important and the most inspiring one for myself is the attribute of leader described by the great Bennis as knowing oneself followed by expressing oneself (Bennis W. , 2009) which are the basis of defining leadership and is one of the most important elaboration of leadership gifted by the historical scholars and researchers.

Evolution of leadership is not complete without descripting one of the most debatable development of the leadership i.e. the evolution of female leadership.

---

\(^2\) Lecture on Leadership is an Art by Philippe Daudi
2.1.1-Emergence of Male and Female Leadership:

As discussed before, leadership is not an inheritance of only humankind; it exists in animals and all living things with the goal and a team. In the same manner, successful leadership is not restricted to males only. Though the researchers who introduced the concept of leadership and transformed it throughout the time, did not designate leadership status to only male and denoted leadership in general manner but somehow, the leadership implicitly got attached to the male gender. Implicitly associating leadership to the male gender is another form of our patriarchal mindset, a notion of primitive brain which forces us to think only in the direction we want to.

I say this because the history has another side of this coin. History reveals the age of female leadership as old as the existence of leadership and civilization. The Bible proves Mother Mary as a chosen leader who stood up alone for her belief and duty. She was the women who took the leadership role to spread the message of God. With the vision of God’s duty, she guided and kept the twelve apostles together, which was the best leadership evident in the beginning of humankind (Connolly). The life of Mary is an example of iconic leadership with a great servant- hood who did not put her self-interest above what is needed to be done and despite of the reluctance in her followership, she stood steady to communicate and articulate the vision of God (Kalas, 2011), thus, her selfless leadership with high self-awareness and strong personality, makes her one of the most successful leaders among the earliest leadership existence.

As the time progressed, another brilliant leader of Muslim society came into the highlight. This woman was named “Khadija” and was the wife of Prophet Muhammad (P.B.U.H). She was one of the most innovative and efficient entrepreneurs of her time. She was the sole manager of her business and was very much appreciated in Islam as an authentic leader who took over not only the vision of business development and women entrepreneurship but also demonstrated leadership qualities in the progression and expansion of Islamic laws and lifestyles. She broke a vast range of societal taboos and cultural restrictions to promote the liberal religious views which showed her authentic followership to the messenger of Allah i.e. Muhammad (P.B.U.H) as well as an authentic leadership with strong vision, self-awareness and consistency.

In the modern world, women involvement in the workforce can be directed in the documentation form back to the mid of 19th century with the hiring of young women as the labor in textile mills of New England. The concept behind opting women as labor was that they are more likely to stay in the job and are agreeable to work on low wages, though it was assumed that women who were employed as labor would leave after their marriages (Leckie). This concept is an early traces of role expectancy or gender role differentiation which shows the strongly rooted presumption or judgment that women are supposed to prioritize family over work and are supposed to leave working as soon as they get married. This approach reportedly is said to be the employer’s approach which explains the widely prevailed culture of women as family oriented.
more than career oriented. Furthermore, the idea of employing women in workforce was not based on the intellectual capabilities of women, rather it was based on the cost effectiveness and labor security for the employer. This approach is a result of closed mindset in the prevailing male dominated world of 19th century.

Feeling the humiliation of such mindset women labor force in 1844 reformed themselves in union to help fight against the work discrimination, building the early account of shared leadership in 19th century. One of the most prominent female leader of this union was Sarah Bagley who fearlessly and with great rhetoric, communicated the concern of women workforce with great emphasis on the increased risk of physical well-being and other discriminations (Leckie ).

The massive increase of women leadership was evident after the end of civil war when around 800,000 men were killed and the women were required to enter the leadership position and other work areas in large number (Leckie ). It proves that the inclusion of women in leadership positions was not a matter of choice but matter of necessity. This is a directing pointer that women were never a first choice to be part of leadership.

The start of 20th century marks the establishment of first league dedicated to women formed with the name of “Women’s Trade Union League” in 1903 (Leckie ). Despite of all these efforts women stayed in the same situation of gender imbalance in working environment with vast majority of women serving as domestic servants or low level labors in textile and clothing industries with very few working in the nursing and school teaching areas (Dawood, 2014).

The beginning of World War-I, also demonstrated the employment of women in male dominated occupations as the result of necessity due to the requirement of men to fight the battle leaving the women behind to fill in their shoes. The major female leadership development was witnessed during WWI with the admission of thousands of women in British Army nurses, air forces and navy but without the concept of equal payment which is one of the major manifest of gender equality. Though after war many women had to quit their jobs as the men came back but it marked the perception building of women capabilities and leadership (Dawood, 2014).

It was World War II that showed a greater trust in women capabilities and leadership, allowing them to join complex public service work. It also marked the end of the marriage bar which previously restricted women to employ for white color occupation after their marriage (Dawood, 2014).

Since then it was never looking back for the development of women leadership in male dominated areas. Today, the women are working shoulder by shoulder with men in every walk of life and are undoubtedly proving to be the best choice for leadership. It has been a very debatable question on who is proved to be a better leader among male and female but the researcher supporting female leadership have concluded some common leadership qualities that makes women of today a great leader and a global leader.
2.2-The Beauty of Female Leadership

“Beauty lies in the eyes of the beholder”

-Unknown

The above mentioned world known quote hold lots of truth for the beauty of female leadership as well in explaining that, those who wants to see female leadership as a necessary development for the world leadership will find uncountable components to mesmerize the mind but all those who still sees the leadership as male designated position will only see the elements of female leadership to sink the ship of leadership.

The true essence of female leadership is in the leadership style that is genuinely female’s rather than adapting a male leadership style. To support this idea I will present various leadership styles of female described by the great scholars and researchers of all time. According to a very interesting article on effect of sex and gender on perceptions of leader, Violanti and Jurczak (2011) explains the communication styles of female leadership. They write that female leaders uses feminine style for communication, said to be a tentative style which encompasses that women speak in a lower voice with high pitch and indirect manner of communicating. Furthermore, his hypothesis suggested that such communication style is not appropriate for the leadership style and female are required to adapt more assertive or direct style like male leaders. To prove this hypothesis, Violanti and Jurczak conducted a survey which suggested a greater impact of feminine style of communication in task-focus situation and it was concluded that female does not need to use masculine communication style to be successful (2011) which seems to be a very comforting yet logical explanation as leadership is all about originality and being oneself, opting someone else’s way of communication is the first step towards inauthentic leadership

Moreover, female are said to have more democratic and participative style of leadership (Eagly & Johnson, Gender and leadership style: A meta-analysis, 1990) with high importance given to the involvement and shared understanding along with being more culturally feminine where their role is not under influence of male dominated leadership (Eagly, 2013) because they are tend to be more participative and communicative where they feel connected. In situations where female feel that what they are doing is meant to be for them, they are tend to bring more capabilities to the situation. Adding to it, women are more emotionally involved in their work as compared to men and are more risk averse (Hymowitz, 2010). All these leadership styles cannot be generalized to every situation, therefore, the use of these leadership styles are based on the context. Sometimes it is good to reduce the risk but sometimes it is essential for the growth of leader, follower and the vision to cater the uncertainty and opt for calculated risk, moreover, being emotionally attached to ones work is not always beneficial because it might turn the whole working system into a personal interest of the leader but being emotionally attached to the vision is a symbol of commitment as well.
To summarize it all female leadership style can be described as transformative leadership style which is categorized as the style of influential role model, focus towards building an interpersonal relationship, allowing the followers to develop and transform into leaders by motivating them to conceptualize beyond their own dimension (Eagly, 2013). The use of reward power as a motivational tool with great rhetoric is the abilities of transformational leader which is the kind of leader most of the female are proved to be.

Despite of the ideal leadership style that female leaders opt, there is a wide gap in the proportionality of female to the male in leadership position. The survey of business insider reveals that half of the female in lower level positions are female while moving up the hierarchy female contribution decreases bringing to only 3-4% women working on a leadership position (Sherwin, 2014). My thesis deals with the same issue highlighted in this observation, concerning me to narrate the possibilities of female antecedents that may or may not contribute in the success of reaching to the leadership position despite the observational data suggesting that women on the leadership position are more effective than men (Sherwin, 2014).

It is not only the leadership style that is essential for an effective leadership, but a true combination and balance of leadership style, leadership qualities and leader’s personality is the recipe of successful leadership, and researches prove that female are the master chef of leadership recipe. Despite of the incredible beauty of female leadership qualities and a right mix of success recipe, there are many qualities of women leadership that goes unrecognized which is a form of female oppression and what we need in the world is a due recognition of the gift of leadership qualities that female leaders in majority holds. Among such qualities the one quality most recognizable of female leaders is their optimism. Female leaders are said to be usually the one who sees the glass half full and find the opportunities to fill the remaining half glass within themselves. Their optimism is not their over confidence but a trust on themselves and result of their self-awareness. The logic researchers provide for female leaders quality of opportunity driven is a manifest of another leadership quality of them i.e, enthusiasm. Female leaders are said to be enthusiastic and highly committed to their work which makes their mind running towards the unseen opportunity (Llopis, 2014).

Though female leadership has a unique beauty that glorifies the whole world especially the concept of globalization but it is not a very easy journey to go through. The emergence and progress of female leadership has given a new life to the globalization but bringing the life to female leadership itself demands a large transformation by the females.

2.3-The Determinants of Women In Challenging The Leadership Position

“Being a woman is a terribly difficult task, since it consists principally in dealing with men.”

(Conrad)
The above stated quote is very near to my heart because it summarizes the whole battle that a woman has to go through in one sentence, especially for the third world countries like Pakistan. We, the women, fight on various fields throughout our life because the world in large is considered to be male dominated, therefore, everywhere we go, in every walk of life we have to prove ourselves worthy enough to break the idols of male dominancy and change the system of superiority/inferiority to gender equality. The debate of what women can do better and what men can do better is as old as Adam and Eve and it will go till the end of the world but in large, the picture suggests that neither men nor women are better than each other but instead both have different set of qualities like men have more physical power and female have more emotional intelligence which is needed in synchronization to balance the system of the world.

To deal with this imbalance and gender inequality, a phenomena has taken birth in past decades, referred to as “feminism” which is about fighting for the women rights, done by group of people who falls in the title of “feminist”. One of the major misconception that runs about the concept of feminism is that it demands to make women live more like men, instead, the only agenda of feminism is to liberate women to behave in feminine way which should be acceptable in every walk of life regardless of any preconceived notions about the appropriate gender for the work in question (Warrell, What Will It Take To Make Gender Equality The Norm, Not The Exception?, 2015). This is just one instance but there are various challenges that a women has to face to be liberalized.

Leadership is a field widely perceived to be male dominated since the term “leadership” was coined. The history of women working in a vast majority on leadership positions is not old enough, thus, demanding a great effort by women to make their place among the male dominated field of leadership with the ideology of feminism but in order to do so women has to go through many challenges and speed breaker throughout their leadership journey.

2.3.1-Breaking the Glass Ceiling:

“Women have been the focus lately of lots of political talk. Let's stand up, build off of this momentum, and finally break the glass ceiling so we can ensure all that talk leads to action that benefits women.”

(Chelsea Canada)

The above mentioned statement is a powerful account of the president of external affairs for the University of Colorado, a prominent leader Chelsea Canada. Her antecedent accounts for a life full of glass ceiling effect. Raised by a single mother, built her into a feminist leader who fought against the male dominancy, rising above the notion of “women are less capable than men” (Chelsea Canada, 2014).

This fight of Chelsea Canada is a result of prevailing Glass Ceiling. Glass Ceiling in its literal meaning is defined as “the unseen barrier that keeps minorities and women from rising to the upper rungs of the corporate ladder, regardless of their qualifications or achievements” (Cotter,
Glass Ceiling effect is a tool of massive destruction for any society that dreams to be liberal and anti-gender different. Though there has been many accounts of initiatives taken to promote the gender equality and eliminate the effect of glass ceiling but still every country is contaminated with the disease of glass ceiling effect with the variation of the extent which depends on the social and gender policies of the country. A Sri Lankan study reveals that there is a significant impact of glass ceiling effect on the women career development in private sector especially on the executive level (Bombuwela & Chamaru, 2013). Though glass ceiling is not the sole reason for entry and progress barrier for women development, it still holds a strong ground with shared responsibility on the personal antecedents of the leader.

This one study builds the ground for the existence and deterioration of glass ceiling effect prevailing in the societies. The situation is not very different worldwide. On the global level, glass ceiling effect has the same amount of deterioration and resistance for women to enter leadership position. According to survey of fortune 500, women on the CEO leadership position only accounts to 4.8% with 24 female leading the organization which is still a rise from 1998 list of only 1 woman on the CEO position to 2014 with 24 female leaders (Fairchild, 2014). The situation of female leader’s participation is even worst in Scandinavia with only 3% women leading the top organizations. As leadership position is not limited to the organizational dimension it is essential to notice the contribution of female leadership to the world. The account of female leadership in the world from every walk of life is not very comforting as well, with the contribution of just 38% among the top 50 world leaders i.e. 19 out of 50, making the world leadership still a male dominated field (Fortune Editors, 2014).

The metaphor of glass ceiling effect is a manifest of patriarchal culture which influences an implicit set of barriers to stop female from the liberation to be the part of mainstream. The statistics around the world shows that it’s not only the labelled women oppressed countries which suffer from the glass ceiling effect but every country at large is the victim of it with around 7 in 10 of the women facing different kind of violence (Ki-moon). During past decades many researchers, scholars and feminists have worked to pin point the reason for the prevailing glass ceiling effect. According to Weyer the reason for this prevailing transparent barriers to women progression in mainstream is due to the gender differentiation and discrimination (2007).

Such explanation of glass ceiling implies that the capabilities of women are not in question, they have all the talent and knowledge to excel and progress in every field along with the willingness to achieve their desires but what stops them from being on equal position as men are the transparent barriers implanted by the twisted mindset of male superiority in the societies. Even the most educated and modern societies like Europe and USA are victimized by this mindset
with 73% women believing that barriers to advancement still exists for them (Snowdon, 2011). Hence, one can predict the fate of less developed societies like South Asia where women are even sometimes deprived of their basic rights. The societies where rape, honor killings, dowry, lack of education and every other kind of domestic violence is common in daily routine (Kimoon), the wrath of glass ceiling and its subcategories are bound to go unnoticed.

The glass ceiling effect implies that there are discriminating measures around the world that defines what women should or should not be doing. This suggests that glass ceiling effect is the birth of role expectancy which defines the role of male and female in the society. Female role expectancy is a form of stereotyping against women that defines the different roles of women and men in the workplace as well as in society which has an insidious effect on the culture of the country, shaping the attitude of who should do what (Snowdon, 2011).

Gender stereotyping is a common problem of all the societies in the world regardless of the literacy or any other demographic antecedents. Though the logical societies are initiating programs and policies to eliminate such gender stereotyping like Sweden’s new policy of paternal leaves which allows both husband and wife to up bring the kid which previously was considered to be solely role of female, still the gender stereotyping exists and it is a long fight of the feminists and liberals to end this mindset (Martinez, 2015). Thus, the three major concepts hurdling the women empowerment in leadership position i.e. glass ceiling, gender stereotyping and role expectancy are closely related to each other giving an air of deprived women rights. The end of these three sickening mindsets are the key to the gender equality and a way of talent management, as it cannot be denied that loosing entrance of female in the leadership position is a great loss of talent around the world where talent is the most needed asset right now.

In such regard to end the glass ceiling and its sub effects, the solution can be emphasized on three grounds. First and foremost, governments should take the initiatives to launch programs and policies that can help reduce the glass ceiling effect such as Sweden’s paternal leave initiative which demonstrates that the role expectancy and gender stereotyping needs to end. This initiative promotes the equal responsibility shared by husband and wife which is much appreciated by the citizens proving that there is a room for change and is accepted by both the genders, though it may be a different case in more conservative societies that Scandinavia.

Second, the companies are required to play their role in reducing the glass ceiling effect by implementing voluntarily targets for female representation at leadership position by the employees and board. The existing leaders should build talent pipeline regardless of the gender, solely based on the talent and achievement. The major antecedents that prevents female from progressing to the leadership position is work-family balancing responsibilities which if taken care by companies through flexible working hours (Snowdon, 2011) and other initiatives, can reduce the glass ceiling effect as this antecedent itself is the element of glass ceiling.

Third and the most important remedy for glass ceiling is the female themselves. It is not feasible for female to wait for the world to allow them an equal opportunity without these unseen yet
strong barriers. Females need to stand for their rights and make the world realize the importance of female leadership breaking this centuries old glass ceiling. It takes great effort for female to fight this underpinned assumptions of female roles and abilities which needs to be rectified on the level of female leader. The famous notion of dream big and live larger than life applies as the first stone to the glass ceiling which in this context emphasize that a female should unleash her ambition, step out of the roles and psychological antecedents fed in the mind to build a castle of their own dream. Female needs to step out of the dream of prince charming and be the one that a prince charming will dream of which can only be done if the female know their own value (Warrell, 2013). As Bennis (2009) describes in his book, knowing oneself is the key to be a good leader, if only females would know their value no glass ceiling can stop them being a much needed global leaders of the world.

Furthermore, in breaking the idol of male dominancy and destroying the glass ceiling female needs to stop seeking the support from the patriarchal culture instead they need to stand out, as the great Margret Thatcher once said “You can’t lead from the crowd” (Margaret Thatcher Quotes). Those who lead from the crowd, are forced to be pushed back and remain in the crowd, instead the need for female leadership is to rock the boat with risk taking and believe in one’s own capabilities. This means that the biggest quality of female leaders i.e. their relationship building should not become their reason for failure implying that they should voice out what is against their vision and leadership rather than taking the hide or exit. Thus, a female leader should advocate her capabilities and talent to lead in her own way. Originality is the key to enforce the need of female leadership for the world progress and a successful leadership (Warrell, 2015).

Thus the social and psychological/demographic antecedents of female role and reputation born as the facet of patriarchy are one of the main areas that hurdles the making of female leader which is the manifest of glass ceiling that has strong roots in our societies on personal as well as national level. The elimination of such contaminated antecedent are the future of successful female leadership which is not as easy to implement as it seems unless we all educate ourselves to be tolerable towards the intellectual abilities of female. Though my literature and observational analysis signifies a long battle of years to eliminate the gender differentiation, gender stereotyping, role expectancy and glass ceiling, this fight is worth fighting for if we want the world to come out of war to peaceful global village

2.4-Pakistan and Female Leadership

Pakistan is a country which has been in news and debate since the 9/11 incident, though not in a good manner but for terrorism. With the rise in terrorism tension around the world, the war on terrorism was initiated by the US government to hunt down the leader of Al Qaeda⁴, Osama Bin Laden. Al Qaeda is a terrorist organization who fights with the infidels on the ideology of Islam made by themselves.

---

⁴ Al Qaeda is a terrorist organization who fights with the infidels on the ideology of Islam made by themselves.
Laden who was believed to be hiding in the north of Pakistan. Since then the northern areas of Pakistan are in continuous war to eliminate terrorism and Pakistan is in continuous talk about its sovereignty and terrorism within the land. As a Pakistani, my heart bleeds to see this condition of Pakistan which was forced upon it by the neighboring country Afghanistan and the strong patriarchal culture backed by twisted sharia law of Tehreek-e-Taliban\(^5\) in the northern areas of the country.

Pakistan came into being on the ideology of a peaceful land for the minorities where they can practice their religious activities which was previously difficult to do in India. Based on this ideology Pakistan was demanded on the name of Islam to enable the practice of Islamic rituals and rules that were losing its charm in the submergence of Hindu culture. Unfortunately, the culture of Hinduism had such a strong hold on the life of people that even today the lifestyle, the mindset and the practices are that of Hinduism rather than Islamic. Today what we see in Pakistan is by large a patriarchal culture with more impact on rural areas than the larger cities like Karachi and Islamabad, which are more internationalized.

### 2.4.1-Mirroring the Pakistani Culture:

Pakistani culture is same as Pakistani language *Urdu* i.e. a mixture of other countries. Same as Urdu is derived from various other languages, Pakistani culture is mix of other cultures as well. Pakistan, no doubt was formed on the name of Islam with the majority population being Muslim but the culture that we adopted is a mix of Hinduism, British and Islamic culture. Thus, the prevailing culture and lifestyle of Pakistan is hard to explain and even harder to understand by all those who have not lived or experienced the Pakistani culture first hand.

Pakistan is a country with 220 cities and 5 provinces with each province having its own language and culture which mixes up on the national language and makes up the culture of Pakistan. To better understand the culture of Pakistan one needs to first have a sound knowledge of provincial cultures of Pakistan which further bifurcates into the religious cultures. The four major cultures prevailing in Pakistan are the Sindhi culture, Punjabi culture, Muhajir culture and a Pakhtoon culture.

Sindhi culture is associated with family landlords with high status and several servants working for them. This culture is based on the concept that those who have money are the master of all those who are beneath them, thus, a servant-master relationship. The antecedents of Sindhi culture have various traces of Hindu culture where there is a ritual to touch feet of the elders or those in power, giving respect on the basis of title and money, assuming that boys can be the only heir of their wealth and property, whereas, the birth of a girl is celebrated and respected but still their patriarchal mindset forces them to believe that a daughter is a matter of responsibility which should be taken care of as soon as possible in the form of early marriages.

\(^5\) A sub organization of terrorist group Al Qaeda
Furthermore, the concept of dowry is also common in this culture which is completely against the Islamic culture where dowry is referred to as “a curse” (Dowry and Mahr in Islam Part 1/2). Moreover, Sindhi culture is strictly patriarchal where the elder male members of the village emerges as a leader and decides the fate of the whole village and often its seen that all the decisions made by the Jirga for a crime are inflicted to disgrace women because in Sindhi culture the concept of women honor is very high so to punish the whole family women are being punished like honor killing, gang rape and a gift of compensation to the victim’s family (Khuawar, 2004). Though the conservative remains in the core of Sindhi culture they do have a tradition in urban cities to allow their women to study and work but the priority remains to get married which restrict their enrollment in the mainstream and career development.

From the holistic view, Punjabi culture has the same traces as Sindhi culture with strong family orientation, bureaucratic approach, strong dowry system and strong patriarchal culture. Though the language is different and the rituals vary from other cultures. In Punjabi culture the birth of girl is celebrated equally as the birth of the male and both are perceived to be the future bread earner of the family because in this culture wealth is not usually inherited in the form of lands. In fact it is more often seen that In the rural areas of Punjab women are the sole bread earner of the family through working as maids in the metropolitan cities and farms in the villages, whereas, male are more than happy to stay home and spend the money earned by their female counterpart. Even in the metropolitan cities Punjabi women are more prone to earn (29.8%, highest percentage for the whole country) but their status remains inferior to the men (ILO Country Office for Pakistan, 2013). The concept of Jirga is same in this culture as well, with women being the target of the punishments. For the urban areas of Punjab like Lahore, Islamabad, Faisalabad and some other urban cities the story is different. They are more liberals where Punjabi women are allowed to join mainstream. There are number of Punjabi women enrolled in Armed forced, number of women in the field of medicine and a good amount of female in business studies.

Pakhtoon culture on the other hand is the most conservative culture where even the literate people have the same mindset as the illiterate ones. Pakhtoon culture believes that women are fragile who needs to be taken care of by male members of the family and for that reason women are most safe in the premises of their homes. There is no concept of “Want” for women and even if they “need” to go out of their home they are to be accompanied by the male member of the family. Very few of the Pakhtoon families are liberal enough to allow their women to progress in the mainstream whereas, the rest even with the favorable demographic antecedents do not believe in women empowerment and are in favor of early marriages to save themselves from any disgrace which is here said to be in a context of women seeking freedom especially the fear of

---

6 Dowry system in Pakistan is the amount of money and other gifts given to the family of groom in order to marry and ensure a good future of the girl.
7 Jirga is an informal judicial system, developed by the seniors of the village to promote justice.
8 The data is restricted to rural areas as in urban areas the strict metropolitan laws does not permit Jirga establishment.
love marriage. More often it is observed that Pakhtoon are the ones who follow the strict religious laws mostly the ones twisted by the Taliban version. The most interesting phenomena in Pakhtoon culture is that as the financial and social status of Pakhtoon gets higher, the conservativeness increases in the family with the name of female pride and honor (Pashtun Customs Regarding Birth, Marriage and Death).

Muhajirs of Pakistan are the Urdu speaking citizens who migrated from India at the time of Indo-Pak partition in 1947 (Haq, 2014). They inherit the culture of Hindu, Arabic, along with traces of Sindhi and Punjabi culture. Muhajir are considered to be the most liberal ones with modern ideologies of gender equality but they fail to completely adapt the gender equality because of the influence of all the mixed cultures prevailing in Pakistan. Though Muhajir does not comply with the Jirga system still the social matters are generally settled, out of court by interference of the elders of the family. The dowry system is very high in this culture but girl’s early marriage concept is diminishing from these particular group of people. They are said to be the most westernize group of people which is not considered to be a very appreciable way of living in Pakistan. Being the liberal ones Muhajir are always in favor of female education and progress though as a Pakistani culture their priority remains to get the women of their home married but by large this is done after seeking at least a graduation degree, whereas, considerable amount of female are allowed to work and join leadership position after marriage as well, though the priority remains to the family (Ziring, 2015).

Thus, the culture of Pakistan cannot be described as one thing, it is a complex phenomenon which needs to be experienced to understand, otherwise what happens is what we see today in the world i.e. generalization that whole of the Pakistan has same women oppression approach though it is not the case. In large, there is women oppression in the form of psychological oppression but it cannot be implied to 100% population of Pakistan. Again, the Pakistani society is becoming a victim of generalization for women oppression, whereas, the above description of cultural diversity clearly explains the differences of culture in women treatment.

2.4.2-Female Leadership as an Antecedent Taboo:

South Asia is among the patriarchal society which by definition is the culture in which “men by force, direct pressure, or through ritual, tradition, law and language, customs, etiquette, education, and the division of labor define the part that women shall (or shall not) play” (Mirkin, 1984, p. 42). Such society is commonly known as “male dominated society” where men has the ultimate power to define what is right and what is acceptable for women. Usually as part of human psychology we tend to put more caging barriers for the person over whom we have the power, in the same way in South Asia men have built a definite set of rules for women that are supposed to be followed by a women to be acceptable in the society.

One of such rule is the role expectancy of what a woman’s role should be in the society and what the appropriate code of conduct is for her that will make her a respectable citizen of the
society. This is a very wide topic for a culture like South Asia which has a whole rule book for women having a strong ground since centuries but to be on the point of leadership a women in South Asia is seen as the one responsible for the matter of inside home which includes child care, house care, cooking, pleasing the male etc. which are beyond any compromise, a good woman should excel in all these areas and anything that comes in between performing these so called roles and responsibilities of the woman is considered to be a taboo (Ejaz & Ara, 2011).

Leadership and female progression in mainstream considered to be male field or area where male should be prominent which has always been debatable and in large there has been some reluctance evident by male mindset against women empowerment in such scenarios. Despite of various measurements and policies established for gender equality rights and women empowerment the oppression against women rights and empowerment continues to persist in South Asian societies because of the culture created and existed with strong ground holds that exerts a strong influence on the behavior of women and this influence is most strong in India, Bangladesh and Pakistan (Crossette, 2000).

Pakistan among these countries is said to face the most reluctance in gender equality and women empowerment ranking second lowest in gender equality in the world according to World Economic Forum (2014). There has been many debates and investigations since decades to understand the reason behind this gender inequality in Pakistan. One of the major challenges faced by Pakistan for the promotion and acceptance of female leadership can be very well explained in one word i.e. “Taboo”. This concept of taboo for female leadership starts from the social taboos and extends to the misguided religious taboos constructed and obligated by the so called Mullahs9 of the society promoting conservatism, illiteracy, and lack of female facilitating institutions like women chambers (Siddiqui, 2008).

The wrong interpretation of Sharia10 by the believers of patriarchal culture imposed a great deal of taboo factor to the female leadership exclaiming the female’s role in mainstream as a disgraceful condition for the country. Unfortunately this perception of female leaving the home and working with men on the equal basis is seen as a disgraceful act on the individual level by the educated population of Pakistan as well, which has forced the females to develop a mindset supporting the twisted sharia ideology created due to male dominancy and perceiving female voice and leadership as a taboo though being a female themselves. This creates a great hurdle for the young ambitious girls who wants to break this patriarchal culture and rise above as an independent successful entrepreneurs.

This conflict of ideas has created two counter visions prevailing in Pakistan, one being the twisted male dominated interpretation of the sharia law and constitutional law that goes against women rights and the other being the liberal and tolerant face of Pakistan based on the ideology

---

9 Mullahs are the religious scholars of Islam who signifies the rules and Islamic laws.
10 Sharia is the Islamic constitution that was compiled by the Prophet (P.B.U.H)
of equality and rights to all on which the Pakistan was created by Muhammad Ali Jinnah and in recent years women of Pakistan are breaking the barriers of closed mindset to fight for the radical and liberal Pakistan that will ensure their rights and development as an equal citizen (International Civil Society Action Network, 2014).

“I have always maintained that no nation can ever be worthy of its existence that cannot take its women along with the men. No struggle can ever succeed without women participating side by side with men. There are two powers in the world; one is the sword and the other is the pen... There is a third power stronger than both, that of the women.”

-Muhammad Ali Jinnah

2.4.3- The Religious Dogma of Female Leadership in Pakistan:

The need here is to eliminate the religious dogma of perceived religious obligations as the barrier for progress of female leadership.

The generalization implies that, female of Pakistan are restricted to enter mainstream due to the religious laws that goes against them, but a thorough study of religion suggests that this is not the case. Female leadership is much appreciated in Islam but it’s the patriarchal culture that influences the mindset of female leadership as a taboo and to ensure a strong step towards successful female leadership of the world we need to get the facts right and reach to the conclusion on what’s actually stopping the female to progress.

Men in Pakistan are often given superiority over women which allows them to dominate the society and relegate women as their property, whereas, Quran clearly states that “Let there be no compulsion in religion” (Holy Qur’an Chapter 2, verse 256) (Egbeyemi & Salami, 2015) which proves that no human being is property of another human being. Islam is a religion of gender equality which promotes women empowerment and women rights which due to the ignorance of the society, has gone in the darkness and the rights of women that religion gave them, has taken away from them (Bugaje, 2015). Therefore, we need to separate patriarchal mindset as the manifest of Islam. The family and cultural antecedents of Pakistan forces male to dominate the female of their family as well as society. These antecedents has so widely penetrated in the society that even the women of Pakistan has developed a mindset of male superiority. A very famous saying in Urdu explains the male superiority perceived in Pakistan with a sentence “مرد کہر کے کرنا دھرنا بوتجہ بنن” which translates to that men are the ruler/master of the home. To contradict this prevailing ideology, Quran\textsuperscript{11} states that “The believers, men and women, are protectors, one of another” (Quran: Verse 9:71) (Bugaje, 2015).

The education of female has always been a questionable act. Many male in the Pakistani society are not very enthusiastic about female education. The approach behind this is that, women are

\textsuperscript{11} Quran is considered to be the book of rules and guidance which was has exact words of Allah sent by an angel to the Prophet Muhammad (P.B.U.H) and is unaltered and will remain unaltered
supposed to be the home care taker for which their duty is to do the home chores and get married in early age as to avoid any dishonor\textsuperscript{12} to the family but Islam has a completely different teaching about it. Prophet Muhammad (P.B.U.H)\textsuperscript{13} said “whoever educates a male educates an individual and whoever educates a female educates a nation” (Bugaje, 2015). Here Prophet (P.B.U.H) does not only prioritize the education of female but he also claims that education of female is education for the whole nation because female is the one who aggressively participate in the upbringing of her children. Not only it is preferable for women to get education but is made compulsory in Islam for women to seek knowledge and educate themselves explained with the words of Prophet Muhammad (P.B.U.H) as “‘Searching for knowledge is compulsory on every Muslim male and female” (Ibn Majah, 224) (Zain, 2014).

Moreover, working of women is considered to be a great taboo in Pakistan in the disguise of religious laws but the reality has something totally different to offer. Islam is a religion of human nature and it has no law or rules against human nature which includes the desire and strive of progress and personal development. Hazrat Khadija, the wife of Prophet Muhammad (P.B.U.H) was the best women entrepreneur of her time. She was a renowned trader of her time and the sole owner of her business who was considered to be the most intelligent leader of that time. Her leadership is demonstrated with the fact that Prophet Muhammad (P.B.U.H) used to consult her regarding the Islamic movements and her wealth was also utilized (with her permission) in the development of Islam (Status of Woman in Islam). Thus, this proves that working of women is appreciable in Islam and her wealth is also considered to be pure enough to be utilized in the household.

In the same manner the leadership which is considered to be such a big taboo in Pakistan because of the believe that women’s role is to take care of the household and they are not intelligent or wise enough to be able to handle leadership, was proved by the Islam as just an illiterate ideology of patriarchal society. To highlight the Islamic liberty regarding women leadership, the best example we can find is that of Prophet Muhammad’s (P.B.U.H) daughter, Hazrat Fatima and granddaughter Hazrat Zainab.

Hazrat Fatima was considered to be the best leader of all time who stood for her rights that were denied by the rulers of her time. She was known as the lady of wisdom and knowledge who was referred to as ”The leader of all the ladies of Paradise.” by Prophet (P.B.U.H) (Sahih al-Bukhari, vol. 4, p.819.). Quran also refers her as “infallibles” i.e. the part of prophetic mission, thus, considered to be one of the best role model of all times (Status of Woman in Islam).

\textsuperscript{12} Dishonor in Pakistani society is referred to as love marriage
\textsuperscript{13} Abbreviation for Peace Be Upon Him, used for the prophets of Islam as a respect symbol

Tazeen Zehra Naqvi
Hazrat Zainab followed the footsteps of her mother Hazrat Fatima in leadership based on bravery and wisdom. Her leadership in the war of Karbala\textsuperscript{14} made her a prominent leader and role model of Islamic world with her incomparable leadership qualities of rhetoric, vision, self-awareness and large followership. Her leadership is a supportive to the concept that female does have leadership qualities and are able to lead beyond emotions as she led the whole tribe of Shia’s despite of losing all her family in the killing by the cunt ruler (Yazeed) of that time.

This proves that Islam acknowledges the wisdom of female and does promote the female leadership, but what stops us today to follow it, is the misunderstood interpretations of the words of Allah and a strongly prevailed patriarchal culture adopted by the influence of other cultures.

Thus, it can be said that overall the lifestyle of Pakistan is more based on each group’s set of perspectives backed by religious and other countries influence making it a patriarchal culture with decision making power often in the hands of male members of the society which builds a tremendously strong glass ceiling effect. Despite of the strong glass ceiling effect women of Pakistan are progressing towards the leadership position as much as possible in their hands with the help and support of their antecedents that shapes the crucibles of their leadership.

\textsuperscript{14}Karbala was the war for Islam between the family of prophet Muhammad (P.B.U.H) and the Yazeed who wanted to manipulate the teachings of Islam which resulted in the martyr of Prophet’s (P.B.U.H) male family members leaving Hazrat Zainab the leader of the tribe.
3-RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The nature of my study is rather complex as it deals with a social/cultural phenomenon explained by a theory development through the study of individual’s life story. For this reason, I justify my study as the shared use of narrative and ethnographic approach which later on branches out to the thematic approach for analysis and theory development. Moreover, the incorporation of narrative and ethnographic approach in grounded theory have been a challenging task for me due to the aim of substantial theory development. This section of the thesis deals with the justification of choosing grounded theory as methodological approach for my thesis as well as the fashion I am using it to enlighten the topic in study.

3.1-Search for Methodological Ground

Methodological approach to the research holds great importance as it is a true meaning of creating knowledge. Anyone who seeks to explore a certain phenomenon or issue is said to be a creator of knowledge but unless until the way of approaching to the knowledge is not clear, the creation of knowledge is incomplete and irrelevant. As a sole writer of this thesis, it has not been an easy task to find the right methodological approach to justify with the topic in hand but with great thorough study of available literature on methodological approaches and a series of workshops conducted by the immensely intellectual Philippe Daudi and Bjorn Bjerke, I was able to finally reach to the approach that best fits to my shared narrative and ethnographic study which Strauss and Corbin (1990) coined to be known as “grounded theory”.

3.2-Research Design- A Qualitative Approach

“Not everything that can be counted counts, and not everything that counts can be counted“

(Albert Einstein)

Qualitative approach is a unique method essential for exploring a phenomena that cannot be well justified by the statistical numbers and data collection. Qualitative research aims at “understanding some aspect of social life, and its methods which (in general) generate words, rather than numbers, as data for analysis” (Patton & Cochran, p. 2). Qualitative approach deals with the exploration or investigation of a social phenomenon that cannot be established or explained through numbers but needs a thorough and concrete narration for the purpose of sense making. Most prominently qualitative approach deals with the culturally specific phenomena, likes beliefs, values, customs, norms and cultural behavior etc. (Family Health International) which cannot not be data collected in quantitative manner and requires a scripted framework of explanation.

Due to the narrative nature of my study I have chosen qualitative analysis in which I worked to find out the antecedents that shape the leading qualities of women of different era’s and how
these changing patterns going to help for further studies, done through a detailed narrative study on the life of female leaders of Pakistan based on their biographical and testimonial accounts.

3.2.1- Rationalization to the Biographical Method

The approach to optimize on the biographical and testimonial accounts of the chosen leaders, was rather a critical phase of my thesis. The nature of my study is social and ethnographical with great emphasis on the personal life of the research sample (leaders) and the relationship of my personal experiences and theoretical knowledge developed through the literature review. Therefore, the impersonating nature of my study demanded me to put extra caution on being rationally neutral and unbiased on my analytical interpretation.

While searching for various methodologies for my qualitative research, I came across a very well written book: “Using Biographical Methods in Social Research” in which the authors Barbara Merill and Linden West explains the rationalization of using biographical method for the research of social issues. They describe use of biographies as “connecting disparate social phenomena and personal experience and weaving understanding between them in new and sometimes surprising ways” (Merill & West, 2009, p. 2).

The book highlights the importance of using biographical methods in investigating the complex social phenomena which will not be very easily and appropriately explained without the inclusion of personal life stories and personal conviction in the topic. Though this book served as the basis for my initial inclination towards the use of biographical method for my study, I further got the knowledge of using biographical method by studying various writings on the topic. Another source enlightened the varying methods of encompassing biographical data by explaining that “Biographical researchers work with a range of different types of data including diaries, notebooks, interactive websites, videos, weblogs and written personal narratives” (Joanna, 2008, p. 344). This explanation allowed me to search for the biographical data beyond autobiographies, therefore, I also took the opportunity to utilize testimonial (past interviews) account for one of the chosen leaders for this study.

Furthermore, while gaining the deep insight on the use of biographical method in qualitative approach, I was also able to satisfy my fear of impersonating the research with an increased amount of personal insight in the study, by studying the words of Ellis in explaining the usage of autobiographical and testimonial accounts in an ethnographical studies. Ellis contradicts the old method of qualitative method where the researcher were supposed to keep a neutral view while researching the ethnographic issue and imply that the researcher should not “go native” (Patton M. Q., p. 84) by quoting that “including the subjective and emotional reflections of the researcher adds context and layers to the stories being told about participants” (Ellis, p. 62), thus, allowing me to include my personal reflection throughout the theory development.
A personal approach to use the qualitative approach of biographical and testimonial study, including the previously conducted interviews of the selected leaders gave me a sea of data to analyze and theorize.

To further rationalize and seek the appropriateness of my biographical method I read various past researches conducted through the same method that allowed me to better understand and implement this method in my research. Below is the table of the few researches that I came across in the search of my data collection method.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>TOPIC</th>
<th>AUTHOR(S), YEAR &amp; PUBLICATION</th>
<th>AIM OF THE STUDY</th>
<th>RESEARCH APPROACH</th>
<th>RESEARCH METHOD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Narrative Biographical Research on Teachers’ Professional Development</td>
<td>Geert Kelchtermans, 1999, American Educational Research</td>
<td>“To study the qualitative change in teacher’s behavior and personal development throughout their career”</td>
<td>Grounded theory, thematic approach</td>
<td>Stimulated autobiographical selfthematization15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>An autobiographical approach to understanding migration: the case of Hong Kong emigrants</td>
<td>A M Findlay and F L N Li, 1997, Area, Volume 1</td>
<td>“To identify the values underpinning the intentions of professional emigrants of Hong Kong.</td>
<td>Grounded theory, ethnographical approach</td>
<td>Narrative biographical approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Biography and the Assessment of Transformational Leadership at the World-Class Level</td>
<td>Bernard M. Bass, Bruce J. Avolio and Laurie Goodheim, 1987, Journal of Management</td>
<td>This study examined how world-class leaders differ on five transactional/transformational leadership factors.</td>
<td>Phenomenology</td>
<td>Narrative biographical approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The Impression Management Strategies Associated with Transformational Leadership at the World-Class Level A Psych historical Assessment</td>
<td>William L. Gardner &amp; Dean Cleavenger, 1998, Management Communication Quarterly</td>
<td>“The extent to which the five basic impression management strategies of ingratiation, self-promotion, intimidation, exemplification, and supplication were associated with transformational leadership at the world-class level.”</td>
<td>Interrogative, relational</td>
<td>Interpretative biographical method</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Table 1-Methodological Research Paper Summary |

3.3-Essentiality of Grounded Theory

On various stages it seemed like grounded theory is not the right approach for my thesis because the issue of Pakistani female leadership seems to have developed preconceived notions around the world, thus, forcing me to critically analyze the approach appropriate for my study. After thorough criticism, reading and discussions with several researchers, I reached to the conclusion

---

15 An approach to look back at one’s life (autobiography) and thematize the experiences
that grounded theory is the best way to carry forward this study and maintain the optimality derived from the study.

The concept of grounded theory was gifted to the researchers by Strauss and Corbin in 1967 with their book “Discovery of Grounded Theory”, which is a great blessing for researchers like me who wants to be clear and precise on the way they work and reach to the derivations of study. The grounded theory approach was needed to surface for the researcher to deal with the concept of objective reality to the phenomenon especially to the cultural and social phenomenon which has more subjectivity to it (Cohen & Crabtree, 2006). Grounded theory, in such cases, makes ground that not everything can be counted and not every reality has objectivity to it, thus, defining grounded reality as “An approach for developing theory that is grounded in data systematically gathered and analyzed” (Strauss & Corbin, p. 12).

The topic that I have chosen, is a debatable topic that have been raised every now and then on various world forums i.e. the female leadership. Moreover, being a feminist this topic appealed to my personal satisfaction where I want to generate and enlighten various aspects of the female leadership. I see female leadership as a dynamic phenomenon with incredible beauty in it that still needs to be brought forward in the eye of the world. With thorough pre research readings, I acknowledged that female leadership is a vast topic which cannot be explained in a justified manner in such short period of time and with such limited resources as I have, therefore, I focused on enlightening the generational development of female leadership with focus on antecedents and crucibles. In this regard what fascinated me to develop a theory of how antecedents have taken shape and its evolution in Pakistan since the independence along with the concluding theme for the antecedents that are essential to crucibles and are not changed in the course of time? For this I chose to read biographies of female leaders of Pakistan and extract the data out of rich readings to analyze it in such a manner as to provide a substantive theory that seems clear and can be used in future for further research and study. My highlight of the study is to generate a theory from the textual study of female leaders of Pakistan which allowed me to opt for grounded theory approach.

3.4-Theoretical Sampling

Theoretical sampling is one of the most crucial step of grounded theory approach. According to Glaser and Strauss (1967, p. 45), theoretical sampling is “The process of data collection for generating theory whereby the analyst jointly collects, codes, and analyses his data and decides what data to collect next and where to find them, in order to develop his theory as it emerges”. Hence, there are three main elements of the theoretical sampling i.e. data collection, coding and the need of further data collection. Theoretical sampling in grounded theory involves a continuous process of data collection and analysis till the new insight is available. As an amateur researcher, I don’t consider myself to be able to completely justify with the data I could excess
and analyze for the theory development and would be recommending various areas available for further development in the theory.

3.4.1-Data Collection:

Theoretical sampling in grounded theory approach puts great emphasize on data collection. The researcher in grounded theory acts as a discoverer of theory, hiding in the depth of the sea of textual data. This hold special importance when the study is extensively narrative and culturally obligated (ethnographic) as I have chosen because in such study, the researcher has an aim to explore as many dimensions of concepts as there are in the texts. As much as the data can be collected through exploration of text the more substantive theory can be generated. Thus, I opted for extensive data collection through as many sources I could excess, where I had to be more clear and precise over exploring the textual data as I didn’t opt for the face to face research to determine the facets of my theory that can as well, be seen as the limitation of this research.

Below is the explanation of the usage of primary and secondary data in this research.

3.4.1.1-Primary data:

Primary data is the most essential yet tricky part of my research. To conduct this study I opted for a non-conventional way of narration i.e. reading, conceptualizing and analyzing the biographical and testimonial account of the female leaders of Pakistan.

This approach of research is very new to me as previously I have only researched in qualitative approach of interview. Most commonly, the researchers opt for either interviews and observations to conduct grounded theory approach, which I see as black and white of the grounded theory but as there is always some gray in the picture, that gray came out to be the documented data collection approach for me.

As I see myself a creator of knowledge, I believe I should have enough courage to choose for a data collection method that is out of my comfort zone and which can enable me to expand my horizon of knowledge, therefore, I opted to go through the biographies and testimonials published on some of the most remarkable female leaders of Pakistan and extract their antecedents from their own narrations. As I wanted to cover the study of recipe of crucibles for Pakistani female leaders as extensively as I can, with the limitations in hand I chose to select the generational female leaders from Pakistan since the establishment till date.

In a systematic manner I came across the three generational decades of female leadership in Pakistan. First, the leadership of female at the time of partition for which I chose Fatima Jinnah, a prominent figure of independence movement. Second, was the era of democracy in Pakistan which symbolizes as the beginning of women empowerment in which I chose two prominent leaders Benazir Bhutto, the first female prime minister of Pakistan and Tehmina Durrani, the social activist for women rights. Third, is the current era of globalization and internationalization
which has provided the grounds for female to put their feet in the mainstream for which I chose, Malala Yousufzai, the first female Nobel peace prize winner of Pakistan and Namira Salim, the first astronaut of Pakistan.

Going through their biographies and testimonial account the aim was to explore the antecedents and crucibles that shaped their leadership and the generational study of shared antecedents which supports my theory of conceptualizing the importance of antecedents in shaping the leadership.

The description of primary data for this study will not be complete without shedding a light on the biographies and testimonial accounts incorporated in my study and the context of these accounts. This is essential to do so, because the idea of sense making demands the researcher to be able to relate and reflect on every research tool that has been incorporated in the study. It also helps the reader to associate meaning with the analysis of the study. Therefore, the section below, briefly introduces the biographies and testimonial accounts that I have incorporated to reach the perfect recipe of crucible.

3.4.1.1 Prelude to the Biographies and Testimonial Accounts

Fatima Jinnah


About the Author: The author of this book, M. A. Sufi is a famous novel writer of Pakistan who met Fatima Jinnah in 1952 in a college award ceremony. Leading to that, M. A. Sufi interviewed Fatima Jinnah on various occasions to develop a narrative account of her life. His direct contact and relations to the leader Fatima Jinnah, allows a comprehensive and authentic account of her life that has been portrayed in the book.

Context of the Book: The book is written by the author in a tribute to one of the greatest and first female leader of Pakistan. The book is published in Urdu and has not been translated yet but it has been one of the most prominent book for Pakistani’s to understand the leadership of Fatima Jinnah and the life story that sharped her leadership. This book thoroughly covers the personal, professional and social dimensions of Fatima Jinnah’s life, from her birth to her assassination. My inspiration to use this book for analyzing the antecedents of Fatima Jinnah is the credibility of the author and the detailed account of her personal life that has been covered in the writing of this book. Moreover, the direct quotations of Fatima Jinnah presented in the book served as an additional source for interpreting her life story and antecedents.

Tehmina Durrani

**About the Author:** This book is an autobiographical account written by Tehmina Durrani herself. Tehmina Durrani wrote this book in collaboration with two American authors, William Hoffer and Marilyn Hoffer, who has published various international best sellers such as “Midnight Express” and “Not without My Daughter” etc. This is the only biography published for Tehmina Durrani and thus, holds a great importance because of it being the only source to gain the knowledge of her life.

**Context of the Book:** This book is a self-narrated biography of Tehmina Durrani which encounters her life story from the childhood to the revolution of her life and the struggle she faced by retaliating from the general norms of the society. The book further explains her emergence as a leader and the miracles of her leadership for the human rights work. My inspiration to the use of this book is the in-depth narration of the personal life of Tehmina Durrani where her sole purpose to write this book was to introduce the world with the kind of caged life that she lived and how it impacted her self-development and leadership to voice against the injustice. Moreover, Tehmina Durrani is not a limelight person which restricts the availability of her interviews, therefore, this book is the prime source to indulge in the story of antecedents for the crucible of Tehmina Durrani.

**Benazir Bhutto**


**About the Author:** This book is an autobiographical account written by Benazir Bhutto herself. It is the latest addition of Benazir Bhutto’s biographical account which was written before her assassination and was compiled and published after her assassination which makes it a book of the summarization for her life story.

**Context of the Book:** The aim of Benazir Bhutto to write this book was to enlighten her journey of leadership as the first female prime minister of Pakistan. The book, as the title suggests, refer to the roots of Benazir Bhutto in Pakistan with her life as one of the most sought out successor of the famous democrat Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto to the most sought out target for the Taliban. This autobiography takes the reader by hand to the transition of Benazir Bhutto from a rich and modern teenager of ambitions to the most charismatic, authentic and steadfast prime minister of Pakistan. My inspiration for choosing this book is the detailed and complete account of Benazir Bhutto’s personal life that it encompasses along with the shine of her leadership qualities evident all over in the book. This book is a complete account of her life story from childhood to her assassination.

**Namira Salim**

The sources for data collection used in the analysis of Namira Salim’s antecedents are the testimonial accounts of her past interviews documented and published on various internet
Thesis- Recipe of Crucible

sources. The reason for using the documented texts and direct interviews published online is the
unavailability of a compiled biographical account of the leader. The detail of the sources used
and their context are as below;

Sources of the Testimonial Accounts:

1. Face to face interview conducted by Muhammad Omar Iftikhar, published on the website,
   SA Global Affairs on December 2012.
2. Face to face interview conducted by Saba Eitezaz, published on the website, The Friday
   Times on August 2012.
3. Face to Face interview conducted by the team of Fashion Central, published on the website,
   Fashion Central on February 2015.
4. Face to face interview conducted by Amy Dawson, published on the website, Metro on
   August 2012.
5. Face to face interview conducted by Waheed Khan, published on the website, Reuters on
   March 2007.

Context of the Testimonial Accounts: The testimonial account for the leader, Namira Salim is
based on her interviews conducted on various occasions in last 8 years. The interviews were
carefully selected in accordance to the year they were conducted and published in order to ensure
the vast biographical account. The selection of interviews from past 8 years implies the
transformation of Namira Salim’s leadership as well as her account of extensive description of
life story account. The interviews included for the biographical study are based on the structured
questions about her personal and professional life including her personal journey to the
leadership and future aspirations.

Malala Yousufzai


About the Author: This book is an autobiographical account written by Malala Yousufzai herself.
Malala Yousufzai wrote this book with the contribution of a British author Christina Lamb, who
has been known for her various best sellers such as “The Africa house” and “Small Wars
Permitting”. She and Malala Yousufzai came up with this autobiography with extensive
dialogues and reflection on Malala’s life.

Context of the Book: This book is a self-narrated biography of Malala Yousufzai which
encounters her life story from a peaceful life in a small tribe of Swat Valley in Northern Pakistan
to the terror stricken incidents that left the scars on her innocent childhood forever. The aim of
this book is to self-narrate the journey of Malala Yousufzai from an ordinary Pakistani school
girl to the brave soldier of education. This book is a very thorough account of Malala’s personal
life and antecedents leading to her most discussed Taliban attack that made the headlines in
international news and human right forums. My inspiration for choosing this book is the nature
of deep insight of Malala’s personal life that this book carries and the fact that this autobiography is an internationally acclaimed account of Malala’s life considered to be authentic in the eye of world. Moreover, this is the only autobiography available on the life of Malala which makes it far more important in conducting this study.

3.4.1.2-Secondary data:
In addition to the primary data, I have collected extensive amount of secondary data to explore conceptual themes presented by other researchers on the topic of my study. The secondary data has been a very crucial part of my study as the topic I have chosen has various preconceived notions around the world which needed to be enlighten by the studies of various scholars and researchers.

The main concern of my secondary data was to fulfill the initial stage of theoretical findings through assigning meaning to the observation, impressions and facts by interpreting the data that investigates the shape of female leadership around the world and the existence of female leadership in Pakistan. For this purpose, the data has been collected from the pedagogy of leadership and other areas of social sciences including religious studies and investigations.

The combination of primary and secondary data has enabled me to establish a clearer picture of facets related to antecedents and crucibles of female leaders of Pakistan. The combination has helped me to categorize and prioritize the antecedents in a clearer manner.

3.4.1.3-Justification
Due to the exploratory nature of this study and the ethnographical approach, it is required to analyze the antecedents of successful Pakistani leaders from their life story for which I needed to explore their personal lives as deeply as possible. In order to do so, I chose the few top most leaders of Pakistan but due to the few constraints related to the data/information availability, I had to optimize the option of biographical and testimonial accounts for my analysis. The constraints are as follows:

- The generational nature of this research required to study the leader from the movement of independence of Pakistan till date. Due to this very reason, it was impossible to interview such leader, as none of the leaders from independence movement is alive today.

- The reason for only being able to analyze 5 generational leaders is because there are less number of well acknowledged female leaders in Pakistan. Moreover, because of the lack of social acceptance, the extensive data/information of only few of the female leaders is available on the internet and books, rest are usually just listed without much information available.

16 Research methodology, philippe daudi and bjorn bjerke
• One of the leaders of second generation i.e. Benazir Bhutto has also been assassinated in 2007 thus, her interview was impossible as well.

• The leaders that I have chosen are among the top most leaders of Pakistan who are usually occupied with larger amount responsibility which refrains them to allow an interview by a master student and that too on such short period of time, thus, to the feasibility, taking interview was not possible.

• No leader can be completely open and cannot provide a thorough personal data in 10 minutes interview and the detailed way they have written about themselves in book is impossible to achieve by a stranger interviewing, thus, implying the ethical constraint of the qualitative research.

3.5.1-Coding:

Coding is the most critical part of the grounded theory approach mainly due to the constant comparative analysis concept of grounded theory which involves the researcher rotating between data collection and analysis which is in line with the idea presented by Strauss and Corbin (2008, p. 64) defining analysis as “the act of giving meaning to data”. The systematic approach of coding in grounded theory has helped me a lot in reaching to the substantive theory as the approach of narration using biographies and testimonial account provides a wide range of text which needs to be sort out in a very precise and concrete manner.

3.5.1.1-Open coding

Open coding is the initial stage of continuous analysis process of data collection which enables the researcher to divide the data collected in broad categories of information (Cohen & Crabtree, 2006). This was the most detailed part of my data analysis, going through each and every sentence of biographies and testimonies carefully extracting meaning out of it. The analysis for my research involves coding antecedents as well as crucibles of the female leaders of Pakistan. As antecedents is not something very clearly stated in the text, it needs to be extracted out of the life story of the leaders. Comparing both the crucibles and antecedents of female leaders I jotted down the antecedents and crucibles that were synonym into the preliminary categorical differentiations.

3.5.1.2-Axial coding

At the stage of axial coding the researcher analyze the data in such manner that the categories gets more sophisticated and themes starts to emerge out for the initial theoretical concept for theory development (Cohen & Crabtree, 2006). This is the concrete step of sculpturing the theory still in the stage where the researcher has the ability to mold and shape the data collection and analysis as per the theory requirements. The data collection of my study is of narrative nature with factual information incorporated in it, thus, it was very crucial for me to interpret and
analyze the data collected in such a way as to keep the authenticity of the data intact because the information collected is related to personal life of the leaders which cannot be manipulated in anyway concerning the ethical considerations of the qualitative research. In recognition to this, I carefully interpreted the antecedents based on the scenario explained and the direct quotes of the leaders into a rather broader but systematic categories, which on this stage started to take a shape of broad themes of the theory. This stage of analysis was rather relaxing for me because by now I could see the blurry image of my theory and the way to carry it.

3.5.1.3-Selective coding

Selective coding is the final stage of analysis where the researcher organizes the categories and themes into a concrete form that establishes the thematic of the research (Cohen & Crabtree, 2006). I believe that this stage in my narrative study, served as the final shaping of the thesis sculpture in a concrete definitive shape. At this stage I further polished the categories in fewer thematic points later building a single idea through refining of the analysis.
Pakistan is blessed with immensely talented and visionary leaders since its very existence. Unfortunately, most of the influential leaders manage to build a small followership and goes unnoticed by the mass. But there are some who broke all the barriers and emerged as the leaders of Pakistan, who managed to make their place in the mainstream despite of all the odds. I did a humble try to build a historical diary of few such leaders through their biographical and testimonial accounts which are my prime source of data collection and theory development. The accounts below are the extracted summarization of needed data by a thorough study of biographies and testimonial of the leaders in a generational sequence.

4.1-Generation 1

4.1.1-FATIMA JINNAH- The Mother of Nation:17

**INTRODUCTION:** Fatima Jinnah, known as the “mother of nation” was born in Karachi on 30 July 1893 in the Surat18 resided family of Jinnah Poonja. Sister of Muhammad Ali Jinnah (founder of Pakistan) was the youngest of 7 children and was an active participant of the independence movement of Pakistan. She is considered to be the first female Pakistan leader who was a well-educated dentist and the primary organizer of the All India Muslim Women Students Federation.

**DATA EXTRACTION**

Fatima Jinnah belonged to one of the most influential family of independence movement. She was a confident women with high principles and vision. In her time education was not a very common thing for women but her brother Muhammad Ali Jinnah built an educative environment around her, making her one of the few female dentist of her times despite of the poverty stricken condition. This was all possible because her family culture was modern liberal Islamic with strong religious values and ideologies. This liberal Islamic ideology and her visionary work for the independence movement made her an authentic leader but the society didn’t accept the leadership of a women for which she had to face wrath of extremism from her own people.

**QUOTATIONAL REFERENCES**

- “Fatima was strict to the discipline and righteous deeds.” Pg.23
- “Now madam (Fatima) started helping brother on political platform” pg.32
- “Jinnah wanted his sister Fatima to get education like the girls in London does”. Pg.29
- “Due to the loss in business, financial situation of the family declined drastically”. Pg.25
- “Jinnah kept his sister (Fatima) along with him in independence movement and took political as

---

17 Book Title: Madar-e-Millat: Muhatarma Fatima Jinnah, Author: Muhammad Ali Chiragh, Published: 1992 (Urdu version)
18 Surat is a city in the Indian state of Gujarat.
**Thesis- Recipe of Crucible**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Thesis- Recipe of Crucible</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Education for girls in this era was considered taboo but Muhammad Ali Jinnah did everything to convince Fatima to get education”. Pg.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Jinnah was one of the best and most famous barrister of his time and one of the few who educated from London.” Pg.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“At that time it was very difficult for women to come out of their homes and take part in political activities. Men did not want them to join politics.” Pg.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“She (Fatima) didn’t used to cover herself with veil but was careful in conversation with males”. Pg.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“She had great closeness with religious values and education”. Pg.40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**LEADERSHIP QUALITIES:** honest, courageous, conscious for self-respect, purpose driven, ambitious, family oriented, resilient, self-disciplined, charismatic, strong rhetoric and empathetic, strongly spiritual faith.

**CRUCIBLE:** Fatima Jinnah was a very beloved sister of Muhammad Ali Jinnah, thus, upon the death of Jinnah’s wife Fatima Jinnah winded up her own personal as well as professional life and stood by the side of her brother to take care of him and that is when she joined him in the political activities to support him on the ground of convincing Muslim female of India to unite on the two nation theory.

**CONCLUSION:** Fatima Jinnah is one of the best example of true leadership because of the extent to which she put her personal conviction for the development of Muslims of India. She did not only proved to be the leader of vision but also the leader of hearts with true authenticity.

**4.1.1.1- The Boil of Crucible to the Successful Leadership**

The crucible that shaped the leadership of Fatima Jinnah was based on a very personal and emotional stimuli. It will not be wrong to say that the leadership of Fatima Jinnah is a result of her immense and unconditional love for her brother, Muhammad Ali Jinnah. The moment that she emerged as a leader in support of her brother was the moment which built her leadership qualities, most importantly the authenticity that she carried. Moreover, she cultivated the vision that was the most noble in its form for Muslims of India and found the perfect rhetoric to communicate it to the Muslim females of India, which, without her crucible would not have been possible. The crucible of Fatima Jinnah, demanded her to take the leadership position to build a followership that will allow a strong freedom fight. As she was struck with the boil of crucible she emerged, leading her own self to the adaptation of the vision for India Pakistan partition which she later translated in a large followership of females of India but unfortunately she it was beyond the patriarchal mindset of the males of society to except her untiring efforts for the independence of Pakistan, thus, her leadership was seen as a taboo by the Pakistani society in large. Later in the coming generations her leadership efforts translated into success and she was honored with the title of Madar-e-Milat (Mother of the nation).
4.2-Generation 2

4.2.1-TEHMINA DURRANI- The Ugly Duckling:19

**INTRODUCTION:** Tehmina Durrani was born in 1953 in one of the most influential family of Pakistan. She was among one of the most high status individuals of Lahore and like all the marriageable girls of her society, she was socially required to marry a man from prestigious high ranked family and bear him children. In return she was eligible to get a comfortable, luxurious high end societal life in Pakistan.

**DATA EXTRACTION**

Tehmina Durrani belonged to a conventional Pakhtoon family with strict orders and discipline. The idea of personal leverage was not part of the authoritative ideology of her family which forced her to comply with whatever was ordered by her family along with marrying in an early age to a person who was high in status and influence like her family but didn’t love her. Tehmina never connected to the environment of gender discrimination and patriarchal family culture, back by strict Islamic ideologies. It motivated her to break free from this unseen cage. To her fortune, her work for women rights was not strongly opposed by the nation but her family remain unsupportive because they believed that their high influence in the society will turn to disgrace if women from their family will be in the eye of the world.

**QUOTATIONAL REFERENCES**

“*Our home was impeccable and always orderly*”. Pg23

“My mother took all the decision regarding our home”. Pg24

“A dark child was condemned to neglect”. Pg22-23

“An appearance of perfection was more important than genuine feelings”. Pg29

“She (grandmother) was convinced that artists are usually eccentric and end up being mad”. Pg27

“A man was the only future available”. Pg28

“Our marriages were supposed to add to our parent’s social standing”. Pg28

“A broken marriage was a reflection of a women’s failure”. Pg29

“My mother’s family has been actively involved in the politics”. Pg22

“I was a social and political outcast”.

“I shuddered at the realization of the position that a woman falls into after divorce-especially if her ex-husband is an important person”. Pg372

“The other charged me of adultery”. Pg381

“Men were alien creatures, and from my earliest moments I was trained to avoid them”. Pg28

19 Book Title: My Feudal Lord, Author: Tehmina Durrani with William Hoffer and Marilyn Hoffer, Published: 1995.
“Women were kept in strict purdah. My mother hardly saw her husband”. Pg29

**LEADERSHIP QUALITIES:** Low self-esteem, self-conscious, rebellious, approval seeker, image conscious, ambitious, individualistic, self-relied, shy, strive for betterment, resilience, and empathetic.

**CRUCIBLE:** Tehmina Durrani’s marriage to Mustafa Khar, served as the basis of her crucible. Mustafa Khar was one of the most prominent political figure of Pakistan with highly possessive and conservative patriarchal mindset. Being in a marriage with him for 14 years was a sheer nightmare for Tehmina Durrani as a long trial of domestic violence. After suffering in silence for 14 years, Tehmina Durrani decided to rebel which resulted in alienating and cutting her off from the society, family and her own children. Finding herself alone in the patriarchal society of Pakistan Tehmina Durrani stood up for her rights and advocated the women empowerment on the national and judicial level.

**CONCLUSION:** After so many years of struggle, Tehmina Durrani finally succeeded in regaining her faith in Islam and to the betterment of society for women. Tehmina Durrani is one of the best example of authentic leadership. She is a leader who became the voice of many and despite of her unsupportive family background she didn’t lose the sight of her mission for women empowerment and fight against domestic violence.

4.2.1.1 The Boil of Crucible to the Successful Leadership

There is no one way a crucible can take place in someone’s life but the impact it leaves on leadership is immense. The crucible that shaped the leadership of Tehmina Durrani is her traumatic account of years of domestic violence and the feeling of unworthy. The crucible of Tehmina Durrani is rather painful but the boil of it made her a successful leader. The moment that Tehmina Durrani built her vision of raising voice against domestic violence and in favor of women empowerment, translated her into an authentic, self-aware and resilient leader. Her leadership managed to enlist her in the top female leaders of Pakistan and one of the most visionary female leader for women empowerment. Moreover, her leadership gained a huge followership from Pakistan because of her personal involvement in the vision she carries, thus, her crucible made it possible for her followers to trust her vision and leadership efforts.
4.2.2-BENAZIR BHUTTO- Daughter of the East:20

**INTRODUCTION:** Benazir Bhutto was born in 1953 in Karachi, Bhutto was the first women ever to lead a Muslim state. She was the Prime minister of Pakistan from 1988 to 1990 and from 1993 to 1996, and the chairperson of the Pakistan People Party. Her family was the most prominent in politics and one of the richest family of Pakistan.

**DATA EXTRACTION**

Benazir Bhutto was the daughter of first democratic Prime Minister Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto who owned one of the most influential political party of Pakistan. Belonging to the Sindhi Culture, she gained great respect in the family and was treated without any discrimination with the boys of her family. She belonged to an immensely rich family and principles of loyalty and honor. Her father aimed to modernize and liberalize the whole country as he did in his family due to which there was a high emphasis on education in Benazir’s family. Benazir and her family believed in liberal Islamic ideologies but strong faith and values of Islam embedded in the lifestyle. She was chosen and trained by her father as his successor but the society did not accept a women leadership for such large vision and believe in gender equality due to which she had to face the wrath of extremism in forms of threats and attacks.

**QUOTATIONAL REFERENCES**

“The adversities faced by our ancestors formed our own moral code, Loyalty, Honor, Principle.” Pg31

“In our family, there was no discrimination, if anything, I received the most attention”. Pg32

“In our house education was the top priority”. Pg33

“My father brought back dresses every year from Saks Fifth Avenue in New York where the saleslady kept our measurements”. Pg37

“I pleaded my father to let me go to the Fletcher School but he was adamant that I go to oxford”. Pg67

“My father was determined to bring his country and children to the twentieth century”. Pg36

“She does not need to wear it (veil), let her be judged (by Allah) by her character and mind, not by her clothing”. Pg36

“I saw my father as much on the front pages of the newspapers as in person”. Pg33

“An arranged marriage was the price in personal choice I had to pay for the political path my life had taken”. Pg350

“Remaining single could work against me politically”. Pg353

“They wanted me permanently removed as an obstacle to their dream of caliphate”. Pg411-412

---


Tazeen Zehra Naqvi
“We learned at an early age that it was men’s interpretations of our religion that restricted women’s opportunities, not our religion itself”. Pg34

“Reciting the Holy Quran in Arabic and understanding its lessons was the most important subject of all”. Pg34

“My mother was shitte muslim, while the rest of the family was sunni, but that was never a problem”. Pg35

**LEADERSHIP QUALITIES:** lonely, responsible, brave, purpose driven, ambitious, family oriented, self-relied, resilient, charismatic, strong rhetoric and empathetic.

**CRUCIBLE:** The daughter of one of Pakistan’s most popular leaders, Benazir grew up in one of the country’s richest family. Having received an international education Benazir dreamt of a life free from all the limelight and political drama but was forced due to the father’s execution to join political leadership as a successor being the eldest of all the 4 children. The detainment of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto in 1977 forced Benazir to present her initial rhetorical speeches at the age of 24.

**CONCLUSION:** Benazir Bhutto is not only the first female prime minister of Pakistan but she also achieved the status of royal princess in Pakistan as well as in the world. After successfully completing two terms of her ministry she was stripped out of the position to a self-imposed exile for 9 years leading to her assassination on returning to Pakistan in 2007.

4.2.2.1 *The Boil of Crucible to the Successful Leadership*

Being the daughter of one of the most prominent democratic leader of Pakistan, it was perceived that the leadership of Benazir Bhutto will be smooth and hurdle free but this was not the case. Benazir Bhutto, despite of being in the limelight since childhood, did face the boilers of hard crucible which shaped her to be the leader that the coming generations will remember. Benazir Bhutto never wanted to be in the politics, she cherished her free of worry life but her father’s captivity as the result of martial law implied the responsibility of taking her father’s vision to the reality. She took the leadership role very earlier in her life because she grew up with the vision of democracy and people empowerment. She took the vision of democracy a step further by visioning women democracy and empowerment in Pakistan. Her crucible turned her from a care free youngster to a visionary and resilient servant leader which was evident in her never ending struggle for the empowerment of common people of Pakistan till the end of her life and leaving a legacy of “women can do anything” for all the females of Pakistan. She continued to step forward for the betterment of women and democracy despite of the social discouragement to her leadership and that is where the boil of her crucible did the magic to make her a legendary prime minister of Pakistan.
4.3-Generation 3

4.3.1-NAMIRA SALIM- The Sky Rider:

**INTRODUCTION:** Namira Salim, born 1975 in Karachi, Pakistan, is a Pakistani explorer who is the first Pakistani to have reached the North and South Poles. She will also become the first Pakistani to travel into space after she was shortlisted among 100 space tourists by the world's first commercial space liner Virgin Galactic in 2007 out of 44,000 candidates. She also runs a social campaign with the slogan of “peacemaking with nation souls”.21

**DATA EXTRACTION**

Namir Salim belongs to an entrepreneurial family with risk taking in her blood. Her childhood was not very luxurious but as her family moved to Dubai, her family became a well-known rich business family. The struggle of her father is the foundation of her principle of following the dreams and sticking to the core values. Her mother is a conventional Pakistani mindset with high emphasis on prioritizing family but the support of Namira’s father and the liberal religious ideologies of the whole family allowed her to dream different than the regular. Her dream of being an astronaut was never a matter of discussion for Pakistani society simply because they believe that she is not Pakistan resided, thus, not a Pakistani but she often faced gender stereotyping for her male dominated profession but it never took the form of opposition.

**QUOTATIONAL REFERENCES**

“Believe in yourself and follow your dreams but never give up on your values”22

“It does become hard sometimes, for my family to accept”23

“I had a simple childhood and was not born with a golden spoon in my mouth”.24

“My mother still thinks I should settle down and get married”25

“It does become hard sometimes, for my family to accept”.26

“People who have had a vision have helped me, but people who did not, have done everything in their capacity to create obstacles for me”.27

“My first adventure was successfully combating the cultural pressure to settle down very young and instead opt for higher education in the US.”28

---

“I’m hoping that when the flight happens I can break new ground for Muslim and Pakistani women to enter into fields considered out of bounds for them”.29

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PERSONAL ANTECEDENTS (PERSONALITY): courageous, purpose driven, ambitious, self-relieved, resilient, charismatic, strong rhetoric and empathetic, dynamic, visionary, self-aware, creative.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CRUCIBLE: She was the first Muslim and Pakistani women to visit both the North and the South poles in 2007 and 2008 respectively, and hoisted the Pakistani flag there on an expedition campaign funded by her father. Hence making her mark; as Pakistan’s ambassador to the two extremes of the world. She gained much acclaim when she was chosen out of 44,000 people by Richard Branson to be included in first 100 space tourists for flights that were offered by the firm Virgin Galactic. Hence became the first Pakistani let alone, the first Pakistani woman to travel in space.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSION: Namira Salim is an inspirational role model for women not only in Pakistan but in South Asia and even the world. She was able to carry the Pakistani flag and her passion into space because of her determination and will. She has set a benchmark for women not only in Pakistan but everywhere for those who want to follow their dreams and the message that success would follow suit.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.3.1.1- The Boil of Crucible to the Successful Leadership

Namira Salim is a true dreamer. Her journey of leadership started when she was as young as 5, with the dream to travel in space. Her dream never took a back seat despite of having conventional Pakistani background, but her crucible of leadership took place when she was chosen as first Pakistani female to raise the national flag on the South and North Pole, following by being the first Pakistani to travel in space. Her expedition to the South and North Pole translated her into a leader of vision, a vision to defy the normal role expectancy norms of the society. The leadership of Namira Salim is resilient and ambitious to build a road for Pakistani females to dare to dream different and follow the heart rather than the cultural norms. Like most of the female leaders of Pakistan, the crucible of Namira Salim helped her becoming a leader of vision with strong followership without much being of a matter of discussion for Pakistani society because she is considered to be a foreigner (living in Dubai). |

---

4.3.2-MALALA YOUSAFZAI- The Noble Prize Winner:30

**INTRODUCTION:** Malala Yousafzai was born in July 12, 1997, in Mingora, Pakistan, located in the country's Swat Valley. As a child, she became an advocate for girls' education, which resulted in the Taliban issuing a death threat against her. On October 9, 2012, a gunman shot Malala when she was traveling home from school. She survived, and has continued to speak out on the importance of education. She was nominated for a Nobel Peace Prize in 2013. In 2014, she was nominated again and won, becoming the youngest person to receive the Nobel Peace Prize.

**DATA EXTRACTION**

Malala Yousafzai belongs to a middle class Pakhtoon family from a small valley in northern Pakistan known as Swat (valley of Taliban regime). She belongs to a community level influential family (owner of Khushal School) of conservative patriarchal culture of Yousafzai tribe, but despite of that her family holds great liberalization for Islamic and cultural ideologies. Her parents strongly believes in education for all and does not allow any gender discrimination in the family. Malala’s family holds strong principles of honor and dignity but the concept of shame for her family is different than the rest of Pakhtoon community who believes that educating and liberating females is disgrace for the family. Despite of liberal Islamic ideologies the rules of her home are strictly religious. Belonging to an area of Taliban regime and gender discriminating Pakhtoon culture, Malala faced a great wrath of extremism and social unacceptance which alienated her from her own people and country. Till date Pakistani society thinks of her as a western agent and does not accept her leadership or vision.

**QUOTATIONAL REFERENCES**

“Shame is a very terrible thing for a Pashtun man.” Pg10

“My father, Ziadduin, is different from most Pashtun men. He asked his friends to throw dried fruits and coins into my cradle, something we usually only do for boys.” Pg9

“He (father) believed schooling should be available for all, rich and poor, boys and girls”.

Pg33

“When I was born we were very poor”. Pg14

“My father never laying a hand on her (wife), unlike many of our men.” Pg15

“My father shares everything with her. Many Pashtuns never do this. Pg17

“When I was born nobody congratulated my father”. Pg9.

“I was a girl in a land where rifles are fired in celebration of a son while daughter are hidden away behind the curtain”. Pg9

“I arrived at dawn as the last star blinked out, we Pashtun see this as an auspicious sign”.

Pg9

“Their (girls) role in life simply to prepare food and give birth to children.” Pg9

---

30 Book Title: I Am Malala: The Girl Who Stood up for Education and was Shot by the Taliban, Author: Malala Yousafzai and Christiana Lamb, Published: 2013.
“Sharing problem with women is seen as weak.” Pg17
“My mother and I could not go out without a male relative to accompany us.” Pg20
“Only learn what God says. His words are divine messages, which you are free and independent to interpret”. (Malala’s father) Pg111
“My grandfather was a religious scholar and an imam of a masjid”. Pg10
“We used to have Qari sahibs31 who come to our home to teach the Quran”. Pg111

LEADERSHIP QUALITIES: responsible, courageous, purpose driven, ambitious, family oriented, clever, resilient, charismatic, strong rhetoric self-aware.

CRUCIBLE: Malala Yousafzai came to public attention by writing for BBC Urdu about life under Taliban, using the pen name Gul Makai. Malala got an international recognition after she was targeted by the Taliban and shot in the head but miraculously recover which took her from a remote valley in northern Pakistan to the halls of the United Nations.

CONCLUSION: In recognition of her courage and advocacy, Malala has been awarded several prestigious awards including the National Peace Prize in Pakistan in 2011. Malala continuous to champion universal access to education through Malala Fund, a non-profit organization investing in community-led education programs and supporting education advocated around the world.

4.3.2.1 - The Boil of Crucible to the Successful Leadership

Malala Yousufzai is a legend of humanity. At the age of playing and making mistakes she has taken the charge to correct the mistakes of patriarchal mindset. Her crucible of leadership is considered to be one of the worst which would have made her taken a step back from her vision of girls education but rather she emerged as a more resilient and steady leader with the vision and determination stronger than ever. Her crucible gave her the platform to be the leader representing a very crucial issue of Pakistan especially north Pakistan. After her shooting incident, Malala gained a great followership around the world as a fighter girl who stood up against the injustice but despite of her large followership around the world she failed to gain the status of acceptance by many people in Pakistan (though gained the acknowledgement as a leader in Pakistan). Malala is usually claimed to be a western agent by Pakistani people and is also accused of generalizing the Taliban terror on whole of the Pakistan. Despite of all the negativity around her, the crucible of Malala’s leadership made her a leader with great rhetoric and strong vision.

31 Qari is the person who recites and teaches Quran in Arabic.
5-ANALYSIS

5.1-Open Coding

The open coding of a textual data is a very difficult task, therefore, I started with highlighting the antecedents in relation to their leadership qualities and crucible that I found while thoroughly reading the biographies and testimonials of the chosen leaders in comparison to their crucibles.

Under this heading, I have broadly categorized the antecedents evident from the life of some of the most successful leaders of Pakistan. Moreover, the coding has been done in a generational manner to explore the antecedents that contributed in an impactful crucible for successful leadership for these leaders. In the era that these leaders were participating in an active leadership has allowed me to distinguish 3 prominent generations that Pakistan has seen in the leadership since its establishment.

GENERATION 1: generation 1 signifies the time from the movement of independence that is 19—till the partition of Bangladesh from Pakistan in 1971. The leadership in this era has been demonstrated by the biographical analysis of a politician and founding member of Pakistan, Fatima Jinnah. The leadership of this time was more focused on the political establishment and freedom fights.

GENERATION 2: Generation 2 signifies the time from 1970’ to 1990’s. The leadership of this era has been demonstrated by the biographical analysis of a famous politician, Benazir Bhutto and a social women rights activist, Tehmina Durrani. The leadership of this era was focused on the establishment of democracy and liberalization for women, minorities and social status differences. This was the time when the vision of equal education for male and female took surface.

GENERATION 3: Generation 3 signifies the time from 2000’s till date. The leadership of this era has been demonstrated by the biographical and testimonial analysis of the first astronaut and a brave explorer of Pakistan, Namira Salim along with a young peace and education activist, Nobel peace prize winner, Malala Yousufzai. The leadership of this era has a great focus on women empowerment and gender equality with the vision of progressive female leadership and education.

Furthermore, in support to my literature review I have also labelled the community of the leader to make it easier for the readers to understand how the antecedents differ among the communities of Sindhi, Punjabi, Muhajir and Pakhtoon.

The figure below illustrates the categorization of antecedents in a generational manner of the leaders.
## Antecedents

### Generation 1

**Fatima Jinnah** *(Belonged to the Muhajir community)*
- Highly principled family
- Gender equality in the family
- Highly educative family environment
- Poverty stricken
- Family Culture - modern liberal Islamic
- Highly influential and famous family
- Faced the wrath of extremism / Lack of social acceptance
- Liberal Islamic ideologies
- Strong religious values

### Generation 2

**Tehmina Durrani** *(Belonged to the Pakhtoon community)*
- Highly principled family
- Authoritative family environment
- Unsupportive family environment
- Conservative family approach
- Gender inequality in family
- Family culture-conservative patriarchal (Indian)
- Highly influential family
- Faced the wrath of extremism
- Lack of liberal Islamic ideologies
- Strictly religious

**Benazir Bhutto** *(Belonged to the Sindhi Community)*
- Highly principled family
- No discrimination in the family
- Highly educative family environment
- Immensely rich
- Less leverage to the eldest child
- Family culture- modern westernize
- Highly influential and famous family
- Politics as a way of life
- Low career acceptance for a single girl by the society
- Faced the wrath of extremism

### Generation 3

**Namira Salim** *(Belonged to the Punjabi Community)*
- Highly principled family
- Highly educative environment
- Conventional family opposition
- Rich and influential business
- Family Culture- conventional Pakistani (family over work)
- Victim of gender stereotype by the society
- Liberal Islamic ideologies

**Malala Yousufzai** *(Belonged to the Pakhtoon community)*
- Highly principled family
- No discrimination in the family
- Highly educative family environment
- Highly influential in the community
- Poverty stricken.
Against the patriarchal approach (family)  
Family Culture- strict Islamic  
Gender role differentiation in the community  
Highly principled community  
Gender inequality in the community  
Faced the wrath of extremism  
Liberal Islamic ideologies  
Strong religious values  
Strong religious rituals and traditions

Table 2-Antecedents for Crucible of Successful Leadership

5.2-Axial Coding

The labelling in open coding symbolizes the antecedents of each leader by generation, which shaped their crucible. Thus, by now we know a wide range of antecedents that contributes in shaping the crucible but as everyone cannot have the same life, the antecedents cannot be generalized as well. Given this, in axial coding, my aim is to highlight the antecedents that have been common in the crucibles of all the leaders that I have analyzed, regardless of their generation which explains the few firm and strict antecedents that are the essential ingredient of crucible for Pakistani female leadership.

These shared antecedents by all the leaders of every generations are explained below with their interpretations in accordance to the Pakistani culture. It is to be noted that crucible is shaped by both positive as well as negative antecedents and the analysis below signifies the antecedents crucial for the crucible of leadership in Pakistani context of female life.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SHARED ANTECEDENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>HIGHLY PRINCIPLED:</strong> The leaders studied and analyzed had a very firm principles and disciplines which made them resilient and stand strong to receive the moment of leadership with such dignity and conviction as to build out an authentic, visionary, purpose driven leader out of them. The roots of principles and discipline for leaders are strongly embedded in the family and their upbringing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>GENDER EQUALITY:</strong> Gender equality in the family, supported a progressive environment for the leaders in my study. Gender equality narrated in the biographies is in the context of son and daughter equal rights and duties. Pakistan is country where culturally sons are given more privileged over daughters which profoundly forces the dreams of the daughters to hold back and gain a second standard treatment but it is analyzed by the study of leaders that the antecedent of gender equality allows a more positively impactful crucible as it give the wings to dream and fly high.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>HIGHLY EDUCATIVE ENVIRONMENT:</strong> All the leaders I have studied in this research made to the heights of successful leadership because of a great family emphasis on gaining the best and highest possible educational level. Study of crucible in comparison to antecedents</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
suggests that highly educative environment allowed these readers to interpret their crucible in a productive manner allowing them to emerge as a self-aware and courageous leaders.

**HIGHLY INFLUENTIAL FAMILY:** It is highlighted in the readings of these leaders that they all belonged to an influential family either on the state level or the community level which shaped their crucible to support successful leadership. Influential here represent the popularity and strong references which, in Pakistan is considered to be a very crucial factor for “getting things done”. In case of leadership development, reading of these leaders suggests that, influential status made it easy for the leaders to break the barrier of glass ceiling.

**SOCIAL DISCRIMINATION/LACK OF SOCIAL ACCEPTANCE:** Negativity of the world brings the positivity to fight and be resilient which is highly evident in the analysis of the leadership of these leaders. They all faced a social rejection of leadership from their own society i.e. Pakistan. This is a very interesting phenomena which will be elaborated in detail in my theoretical representation.

**LIBERAL ISLAMIC IDEOLOGIES:** The leaders I have analyzed are all Muslim with different approach towards practicing the religion but a mindset with liberal Islamic ideology shows a neutral impact in shaping the crucibles suggesting that regardless of the strictness to follow the religion crucible has no impact of it.

---

**Table 3-Shared Antecedents for Crucible of Successful Female Leadership**

My study deals with theorizing the impact of antecedents on the crucibles that leads to successful leadership for which I have axial coded the major favorable antecedents. Moreover, the analysis would be incomplete without comparing the impact of antecedents in shaping the crucibles, for which I have labelled the main outcomes of crucibles based on the analysis of the moment that made these females a leader and a pin pointing reason behind it which will support my theory of antecedents as a recipe of crucibles.

**THE HIGHLIGHTS OF CRUCIBLES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FATIMA JINNAH</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Emerged leader</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Situational leadership</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TEHMINA DURRANI</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Emerged leader</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Situational leadership</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BENAZIR BHUTTO</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Emerged leadership</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Situational leadership</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MALALA YOUSUFZAI</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Cultivated leadership</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Situational leadership</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAMIRA SALIM</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Cultivated leadership</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.3-Selective Coding

Selective coding of this analysis has many facets and interesting outcomes. It is based on a clear and systematic narrowing of the common antecedents to a one prominent theme. It has been a very precise and careful job not to miss any crucial aspect for the recipe of crucible, but open and axial coding has made it particularly easy and satisfying for me to reach to a substantive theory for recipe of crucible.

The selective coding done in this study is by analyzing the most appearing common antecedents in the life story of these leaders. In doing so, I have evaluated that the antecedents that are most impactful in the making of crucible falls in the category of demographic antecedents with second highlight to the societal antecedents. As the main purpose of my usage of grounded approach is to build a theory on a themes, I have narrowed down the selective coding of demographic antecedents and societal antecedents into more specific selection of the most recurring antecedents of these two categories done as below:

5.3.1-Family and Society: Salt and Pepper of the Crucibles:

Like any dish is incomplete and tasteless without the right balance of all the ingredients, in the same way an impactful crucible is also inconsiderable without the combination of right antecedents, personality and timings. But in this mix of crucible recipe, the most important ingredient for Pakistani female leadership, according to my research are the antecedents of family and society.

A life of an individual is comprised of various phases from the birth till the death and in this course of life there is no such guarantee that life will be smooth and predictable. Life is a bumpy ride with several troughs and crest throughout the course of life. Among these trough and crest,

---

32 It should also be noted that the antecedents categorized may overlap in one or more category but their impact remains the same.

Tazeen Zehra Naqvi
Thesis- Recipe of Crucible

there are some people who seek the opportunities to stand out from the crowd and be someone unique for a purpose close to their heart, such people are called the leaders in making. But as every big event of life occurs in “that one moment”, the leadership also shines by that one moment called the crucible that put the leader on the chair of leadership. These crucibles are tricky and very particular to whom they will come. As I see it, crucibles are the true representation of “where there is a will there is a way” (Pauline Kael). The “way” in this quote (in context of leadership), is the crucible which comes only with the struggle and will of the leader. Along with strive to be a leader for vision, there are many other factors that shapes the crucible that turns an ordinary person into an authentic leader.

My study on Pakistani female leadership and their crucibles suggests that antecedents play a vital role in the making of crucible. Every leader has different antecedents depending upon their lifestyle and personality but my aim was to study the antecedents that are common to the shaping of crucibles for Pakistani female, be it the antecedents that hurdles the successful leadership or favors it. With the thorough analysis of biographical and testimonial account of successful female leaders that made to the eye of recognition in Pakistan and worldwide (except for Tehmina Durrani), I have analyzed that there is a less generational change in the antecedents of Pakistani female leadership but in present time there are more opportunities available to the females to pursue leadership, which in the generation 1 was a matter of fight in itself. Moreover, the common pattern of leadership explains that most of the leaders are emerged leaders out of situational factor, mainly because Pakistani females enlarge are preoccupied by the notion of family first, for which the cultivated leadership is less evident, thus, 3 out of 5 leaders that I have studied are proved to be an emerged leader and only 2 have been a cultivated leader out of which Malala Yousufzai was put to the leadership front by her father and Namira Salim shaped her personality since the early adulthood in a way to become a visionary leader. But even then they had a life changing moment (crucible) that made them a prominent leader of all times.

The analysis of the life story of these leaders signifies a very simple recipe of crucible with two highlighting ingredients that brings the best taste into the tough crucible for shaping a remarkable female leadership in Pakistani context. There are many antecedents that were being highlighted in the open coding but funneling them have brought me to two main antecedents i.e. family of the leaders in study and the society of Pakistan. In the section below I will explain the role of these two antecedents separately on shaping the crucible and adding value to it.

5.3.2-Ingredient 1: Family Antecedent:

Families are the center of our life and an unbreakable bond that builds a protective bridge between us and the world. In family the most important role is of parents who build the ground for success and progress for their children who dare them to dream big and achieve big (Perry, 2003). A family needs to protect its members from every kind of harm, even a small incident unattended can bring in a lot of negativity in the life.

Tazeen Zehra Naqvi
Islam has put great importance to the family life and on various occasions Quran has announced blessing for the one who keeps his family matter in accordance and disgrace who avoids the family rights (Kuftaro, 1991). Thus, it is essential for a follower of Islamic ideology to keep close ties in the family due to which family antecedents has emerged as one of the leading antecedent category in the analysis for crucibles of Pakistani female leaders. Moreover, being a collectivist country, Pakistan has a culture of sharing is caring, which also applies to the antecedents that contributes to the leadership.

My thorough analysis of the life story account of the female Pakistani leaders shows that all the crucible that shaped them to be the leaders they are, has a major share of their family antecedents categorized into 4 specific antecedents, pinch of which makes a perfect spice for the crucible.

5.3.2.1-Highly principled:

Principles and disciplines is a wide concept which holds many elements to it. In general, principles are “a personal or specific basis of conduct or management” (Dictionary). In my analysis, all the leaders I have studied, holds a defined set of principles and morality prevailing in the family that made a way to their crucible. In common the principle they inherited from their families are the honesty, loyalty and a humanly purpose, which motivated them to believe in the phenomena of leadership. For clearance of the understanding purpose, Malala Yousufzai held a family principle of protecting the personal and national dignity for which she voiced out to the world against female oppression through participating in the diary of BBC against Taliban regime. This made her a cultivated leader but her leadership touched the sky by her crucible of the shooting incident that allowed the world to witness her tremendous leadership and Nobel vision. Even today the leadership of Malala has traces of her principle evident in every speech and vision of hers. Her whole fight is to earn the due dignity for the young girls of Pakistan (specifically to the affected area of war on terror) that has been lost somewhere in Taliban regime. Though her fight against Taliban Regime in Pakistan and female oppression from education due to Taliban made sharia law is not applicable to most part of the Pakistan which is Taliban free, but her fight for educating girls holds a generalize vision for Pakistan because female education in Pakistan is not preferred due to the patriarchal mindset.

For other leaders in study, the vision of leadership might differ but the antecedent of principle, values and discipline remains the same that worked towards their crucible. To be noted here, though the various sub cultures of Pakistan may differ in the mindsets and rituals, the commonality of principles remain the same in each culture but the essence of it changes with the culture. Malala and Tehmina, belonging to a Pakhtoon culture has a great emphasis on dignity and honor, which is in relation to my explanation of Pakhtoon culture in the literature review but for Namira Salim and Benazir Bhutto, belonging to Punjabi and Sindhi community respectively, believing in one self and sticking to the values is the most weighted principle.
Thus, while it seems like that Pakistan is operating only on the principle of terrorism and corruption, the family upbringing to a firm believe on principle of loyalty, dignity, honor and humanity, shapes the leadership crucible for female leadership and resilient personality.

5.3.2.2-Gender equality:

Gender equality in a country like Pakistan seems like a dream to the outer world but in reality it is actually a myth prevailing in the world for which even us Pakistani doesn’t have a definite answer. The only logical explanation to this gender differentiation is to eliminate generalization i.e. the gender differentiation in Pakistan does exist on a national level but the intensity of it varies from city to city and community to community, it cannot be generalized equally to a large country like Pakistan.

We should live in the world but should not let the world live in us which means that, it is good to be a part of a tribe or a culture but it’s a mistake to adapt the illogical cultural norms. This is where the concept of functional stupidity take its stance i.e. to learn and share the right knowledge be it in any context and such avoidance of functional stupidity brings a very vital quality of leadership which is “originality” of the leader. Nevertheless, as “charity begins at home” a good deed and a good tradition begins at home as well. Gender equality is one of such good tradition that should prevail in the family because gender equality brings confidence to be different and it carries the personality of treating other with fairness. In a country like Pakistan where gender inequality prevails on the national level, gender equality at home brings the dare to shape the crucible of leadership.

In my analysis, the leaders with impactful crucibles had a common antecedents of gender equality on the family level. Only one such leader in my analysis had a gender inequality in the family which made her to suffer the oppression for years in silence, that leader is Tehmina Durrani. As soon as she recognized the importance of gender equality she began to voice herself. This is a trace of prevailing conservativeness in Pakhtoon community, where boys are considered more superior than girls but to defy the fact, Malala Yousufzai belonging to the Pakhtoon community as well had a very strong gender equality in her family antecedents which pushed her forward to pursue the leadership leading to the crucible of her shooting and then a world recognition of her undeniable efforts for nationwide gender equality. The logical explanation of this difference in antecedent among Tehmina Durrani and Malala Yousufzai is in consistent with the literature review where it is mentioned that as the Pakhtoon family becomes influential in the society, their consciousness of false dignity and honor against women increases forcing them to impose unjustified restrictions on the female of the family. In such view, it can be observed that the family of Tehmina Durrani was highly influential in the society due to which she was imposed with greater gender inequality while the family of Malala Yousufzai was only influential within their tribe which allowed the chance of better gender equality.
Thus, gender equality allows an impactful crucible in the Pakistani context as it breaks the barrier of patriarchy. Being a collectivist country one cannot choose any path without the consensus of the whole family for which gender equality plays a vital role in the consensus of leadership development.

5.3.2.3-Highly educative environment:

Education is one of the primary source of success for any nation as well as for an individual to progress. As said by the Oscar winner prominent leader of Pakistan, Sharmeen Obaid Chinoy “education liberates a woman” (Sharmeen Obaid-Chinoy Quotes), it clearly is evident in the biographical analysis of the leaders I have chosen that their highly educative environment in the family has given them the awareness of leadership existence and liberalization to break the shield of false traditions. The statistics of literacy rate in Pakistan has increased from 35% in 1990 to 60% in 2013 which seems low overall but is still a good progress for a country in great turmoil like Pakistan. Though on national level literacy rate is 60% but unfortunately, the female literacy rate is only 48% in comparison to 71% of male literacy rate (Ministry of Finance, 2014), which proves that female education is still a worrying signal for the development of Pakistan as well as leadership which needs to be given a due attention and resources.

It seems to be one of the major reasons for lack of crucibles in life of female Pakistani which prohibits a large number of them to reach to the leadership position. My analysis suggests that having a highly educative environment in family with combination of gender equality serves as one aspect for the perfect recipe of crucible for Pakistani leaders. According to the Pakistan Economic Survey (Ministry of Finance, 2014), the highest rate of female education is in the province of Punjab with 54% and second highest in Sindh with rate of 47% female education in the year of 2013-2014. My analysis and literature review is in consistent with this data of economic survey, which suggests that because of the higher female education level in Sindh (which resides most Muhajir population along with Sindhi population) the crucibles are shaped more impactful, as in case of Benazir Bhutto and Fatima Jinnah, whose family supported and provided them with educational environment in academic sense as well as in the area of intellectual and social awareness. The rate of only 35% female education in Pakhtoon shows the lack of educational development in the province which is in consistent with the crucible of Tehmina Durrani who suffered in silence because of lack of education and then faced great oppression against her leadership initiative. It can also be seen in the crucible of Malala Yousufzai, who is still considered to be the agent of west and enemy of Pakistan because her belongingness to the tribe of Yousufzai Pathan does not support her leadership for female rights which turned out to be the reason of her shooting incident.

5.3.2.4-Highly influential family:

Pakistan is a country where sources of high status people works more than the talent. From the matter of schooling to obtaining a respectful job, everyone needs a strong reference and by
reference I do not mean recommendation but a forceful obligatory order from someone in power. This is the major reason of corruption and lack of talent management in Pakistan. The concept of transparency in Pakistan died long ago with the death of the founder of Pakistan Muhammad Ali Jinnah.

Though it seems like a negative antecedent and which it really is, but to my surprise as well, it is one of the major antecedent in shaping the crucible of Pakistani female leaders. Fatima Jinnah, Benazir Bhutto, Namira Salim all belong to the highly influential family of Pakistan due to which it was possible for them to find the path of leadership and followership and get them to the crucible of leadership that build them in the remarkable leader that they are. This antecedent supported them to easily climb the ladder of leadership and to gain a good amount of followership, moreover, positively it helped building a leadership personality since early upbringing. But as it seems like, this antecedent helps in building the crucible positively and make things easy, in case of Tehmina Durrani, this antecedent played an unsupportive role by being forced to stay quiet and act as a puppet to avoid a bad media eye. This suggests that this antecedent is a tricky ingredient of crucible which if applied positively to build the leadership personality and ease the struggle, plays a very essential role especially for the female leadership as it allows less resentment in society but if the same antecedent is seen as a matter of fake honor, oppresses the talent of female leadership.

5.3.3-Ingredient 2: Society as an Antecedent Taboo:

In the literature review, I have mentioned leadership as an antecedent taboo for the female leadership in Pakistan. Through analysis my theory development suggests that leadership indeed is a social taboo because of the role expectancy and twisted Sharia Law. To be more precise in explaining the societal antecedent in Pakistani context, it is right to say that there is a lack of social acceptance for the female leadership in Pakistan which was faced by all females that I have studied. This doesn’t suggest that Pakistan has not progressed since the independence but it does suggest to some extent that the mindset of antecedent taboo and women role expectancy has not been changed much. Though, it might also suggest that it is a hindrance in an impactful crucible of leadership for Pakistani female, the case in real is actually opposite. This antecedent serves as a positive ingredient to the recipe of crucible in a very surreal manner which is complicated to explain but in simplest version it can be said that Pakistan is a country which ignores its own heroes but recognizes (not necessarily appreciate) the heroes acknowledged by the world. For Pakistani females the key to leadership fame and recognition is to get noticed by the world rather than Pakistan.

All the leaders that I have studied were unaccepted in Pakistan and were not even considered to be a leader at all, hence, having a low level of social acceptance but this antecedent of low level of acceptance by their own people, shaped their crucible to be more rigorous in leadership, thus, getting recognized by the other part of the world like Malala Yousufzai (still facing unacceptance by some in the Pakistan), Benazir Bhutto and Namira Salim. As soon as they were recognized as
a leader by the world they were being started to consider a leader in Pakistan as well. Thus, their low level of social acceptance in Pakistan allowed them to be more prominent leader in the world by gaining the support group of followers from outside the country but leaders like Tehmina Durrani who didn’t face much opposition from the society and didn’t get a world acknowledgement, is still unknown by most of the Pakistani. People have forgotten the voice and leadership of Tehmina Durrani but they remember her controversial personal life and present marriage with the minister.

Thus, the leader of the world, is an enemy in Pakistan but this antecedent builds a more strong and impactful crucible for the female leadership of Pakistan.

5.3.4-Balancing the Spices:

Successful leadership is a complex phenomenon and the relationship of antecedents and crucibles of leadership is even more complex yet strong. The analysis of these leaders and my personal experience of Pakistani antecedents have made me state that for a successful Pakistani leadership, there is a need for right balance between the family antecedents and society. Family antecedents are the most important one in shaping the crucible because family acts as a shield to its members and if the shield is strong enough no outer storm can freeze the steps towards leadership and progress, but if the storm is within, no matter how favorable the outer antecedents will be, the crucible will not be able to make its place in a successful leadership. Moreover, the analysis suggests that lack of social acceptance shapes a positive crucible of female leadership in Pakistan but it still is a very limiting factor for the female of Pakistan as it creates a sense of fear of alienation and alienation among your own people is the biggest curse no matter how accepting the world is and how successful the leadership is.
A perfect recipe of crucible is to acknowledge the antecedents that shapes the crucible as well as to clear the dilemmas from the antecedents creating hype but are not supportive to the crucible of Pakistani female leadership. A thorough narrative analysis of the biographical accounts of Pakistani female leaders has allowed me to unleash a historical measure of the silent player of sociological and demographic antecedents gone unheard that has somehow shaped the crucible of the female leaders of Pakistan who managed to hold their ground in male dominated mainstream of leadership but along with unleashing these antecedents, this research has allowed me to enlighten the wrongly perceived religious dogma attached to the crucible of leadership.

In clear manner, my study suggests that religion and religious values or practices has no influence in shaping the crucible of leadership. This ingredient is overrated and manipulated to conclude an easy rejection of Pakistani female leadership. The analysis suggests that leader who had strict religious antecedents had the same impactful crucible with those who had liberal religious antecedents, thus, nullifying the impact of religious antecedent on shaping the crucible. This is the reason why I have not included it in my theory but I do feel the need to highlight this issue in a suggestive manner, as there is a widely prevailing misconception in the world that the Islamic laws are against the shaping of female leadership or is not a favorable/positive antecedent for the crucible of leadership. On the contrary, it is observed in the antecedent study that religion did not stop the development of female leadership rather it built a courage, hope, faith and guidance on the path for these leaders. At present, what is required for the crucible of Pakistani female leadership is the constructive emphasis on antecedents of education, personal development and most prominently, freedom from patriarchal mindset.

A great amount of efforts, leadership knowledge and negotiations should be put forward to make the Pakistani male and female realize the worth of Allah’s word i.e. “I shall not lose sight of the labor of any of you who labors in My way, be it man or woman; each of you is equal to the other (3:195)” (Muslim Women's League, 1995) which signifies how gender equality is an essential part of Islam and it’s not the religion that is stopping female from progress but it’s the twisted man made sharia laws which interprets the word of Allah in a wrong manner.

That was the matter of world forum and what world should do to promote leadership and talent management in Pakistan. But as for the national level we need to learn to cherish the three golden rules given to us by the founder of Pakistan, Muhammad Ali Jinnah which is “unity, faith, discipline”. Unfortunately, we are lacking all these three pillars of Pakistan’s foundation. We have no unity over any matter, we don’t recognize, promote and appreciate our own leaders, and we follow the wrong vision of inauthentic leaders, based on the community and gender preferences. We have adopted the wrong values from neighboring countries and some middle eastern countries, on the basis of which we have restricted the development of women in
Pakistan and their talent on the name of religion, though my analysis and literature review clearly explains that religion has nothing to do in hindering the leadership, it is our culture which is infected to the roots with patriarchy and lack of faith.

Moreover, this study has increased my learning about the female leadership in Pakistan through highlighting the role of social acceptance and family influence as a positive antecedent for the crucible. These antecedents were a shocking and surprised learning for me as before this study, I was not very well aware with the role of these two antecedents in the society and female leadership in Pakistan.

As mentioned previously, the two highlights of the crucible are social and demographic antecedents out of which social antecedent, for lack of acceptance of national female leadership plays a vital role in shaping the crucible. It builds courage and ability to fight against the odds and allows the female leaders to acknowledge themselves in the outer world, making them the leader of the world, but they are always seen as unacceptable leader in Pakistan which ultimately demoralize and demotivates the upcoming female leaders, thus, this antecedent requires great attention to be rectified. We should first accept our own leaders and then promote them in the world, not the vice versa. In order to do so, the need is to change the mindset of patriarchy, gender inequality and societal taboos through education and liberalization.

Hence, social and demographic antecedents are the perfect recipe of crucible which shapes the impactful leadership but the religious dogma has negligible significance. Despite of all the odds and negativity, female leadership in Pakistan has a great potential and it is progressing, breaking all the glass ceiling which predicts a bright and strong future of Pakistani female leadership. This progression will not only bring prosperity and fame to the Pakistan but it will also contribute to the bucket of talent worldwide.

“We can lead the home, we can lead the country, we can lead the world and most certainly we can lead the fight against parasitic patriarchy.”

-Tazeen Naqvi
7-AREAS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

This research serves as a threshold to the acknowledgment of leadership of Pakistani females with an emphasis on the elements that are contributing in the development of crucible that shapes the leadership. This narrative study investigates the positive and negative antecedents with some consideration to breaking the myth of religious dogma.

As the world is in the high pace globalization, it is highly recommendable and essential to acknowledge and manage the talent around the world. On this aim, my study dealt with establishing a theory for female antecedents that contributes in the successful leadership. This is a wide topic and my theory is just a beginning which raises various further questions, thus, it is required to build an empirical study taking this theory in consideration.

I would recommend and appreciate researchers to use this theory to investigate the possibility to further strengthen these antecedents, to study an interesting but complicated impact of lack of social acceptance in female leadership in relation to successful leadership development and to further explore the elements for crucible of leadership.

Furthermore, my study did not investigate the mindset of males of Pakistan about the acceptance of female leadership and the penetrated patriarchy in the society as well as it does not investigate the mindset of present females who are on the journey of leadership. For this purpose, I am proposing a sample questionnaire (appendix-8.1) which can be used in the further research of investigation and exploration and with that I am proposing three hypothesis to investigate in an empirical research regarding female leadership in Pakistan, which will help the world to put their effort in the right direction for the love of diversity and intercultural knowledge sharing.

**Hypothesis 1:**
H₀: religion has a significant impact on the lack of acceptance of female leadership in Pakistan.
H₁: religion has no significant impact on the lack of acceptance of female leadership in Pakistan.

**Hypothesis 2:**
H₀: there is significant impact of patriarchy on female leadership in Pakistan.
H₁: there is no significant impact of patriarchy on female leadership in Pakistan.

**Hypothesis 3:**
H₀: education is the primary antecedent in the development of female leadership.
H₁: education is not the primary antecedent in the development of female leadership.

The three hypothesis above are an investigative strive to establish the significance of social acceptance, patriarchy and education for the development of female leadership. The ideal situation suggests that by understanding the extent to which patriarchal mindset effect leadership
we can establish the understanding, if patriarchal mindset is the element for lack of social acceptance through suggestive test such as correlation. Furthermore, the third hypothesis deals with building the understanding of positive element for Pakistani female leadership. The empirical testing for investigating the significance of education for female leadership in Pakistan can provide a concrete platform for further efforts in the field of building female leadership. In combination these three hypothesis can serve a holistic view on the development and barrier of female leadership in Pakistan.
8-APPENDIX

8.1-SAMPLE QUESTIONNAIRE

This questionnaire is a guide to the research on “The role of antecedents (past experience) in shaping the female leadership” i.e. how the role of family that shapes the society, plays a vital role in shaping the leadership opportunities for women. The questions asked here are very simple and related to what we see and observe in our culture.

Q1. Please specify your gender
   A. Male
   B. Female

Q2. Please specify your city/province of residence
   A. Sindh
   B. Punjab
   C. Khyber Pakhtoon Khawa
   D. Baluchistan
   E. Gilgit Baltistan

Q2. Please specify your place of birth?
   Ans.__________________________________________________

Q3. What is your educational level?
   A. Secondary school
   B. Higher Secondary
   C. Graduate
   D. Post Graduate
   E. Other__________________

Q4. Please specify your profession?
   Ans.__________________________________________________

Q5. Marital Status
   A. Single
   B. Married

Q6. In case of male respondent, How many spouses do you have? (If you are married or else move to next question i.e 7th)
   Ans.__________________________________________________

Q7. Number of women’s that are dependent at your home? (Please specify the relation as well)
Ans.

Q8. Who is the bread earner at your home? (You can select more than one option)
   A. You
   B. Wife/Husband
   C. Son
   D. Daughter
   E. Other__________________

Q9. Who is the decision maker at your home?
   A. You
   B. Wife/ Husband
   C. Mutual
   D. Son
   E. Daughter
   F. Other__________________

Q10. How would you define Pakistani culture?
    A. Male dominant
    B. Female dominant
    C. Gender equality

Q11. Do you think man should be given an upper hand than women?
    A. Yes, why__________________________________________________
    B. No, why___________________________________________________

Q12. List any 5 influential leaders
    A. ________________
    B. ________________
    C. ________________
    D. ________________
    E. ________________

Q13. Why did you choose female leaders more? If you have written any or else move to next question
    A. They are influential
    B. They are in the current affairs
    C. They came to mind first
    D. They are the leaders you didn’t want to see on the position

Q14. Why did you choose male leaders more?
A. They are influential
B. They are in the current affairs
C. They came to mind first
D. They are the leaders you didn’t want to see on the position
E. Was there any other choice than male leaders?

Q15. Which statement about female studying abroad or working a 9-5 job hold truth according to you also explain your choice in few words?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OPTIONS</th>
<th>EXPLANATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Non-existent</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Culturally wrong</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Religiously wrong</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Progressive</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. More talent more profit</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. A doom for the organization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Q16. What does your first instinct says about female leadership (at home, in offices, in politics) also explain your choice in few words?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OPTIONS</th>
<th>EXPLANATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Non-existent</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Overrated</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Underrated</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Leadership is for men</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Doom for the home</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Doom for the followers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Less acknowledged</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Q17. Do you see the future of female leadership in male leadership dominated areas?
   A. Yes
   B. No

Q18. Do you want to see the females in the mainstream?
   A. Yes
   A. No
Q19. Below are 2 scenarios regarding your decision making, please respond to the scenarios according to your cultural, religious and psychological believes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCENARIO</th>
<th>EXPLANATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Scenario 1:**  
Suppose you are the decision maker of your home and there comes a time when your daughter or sister is at the age of marriage. She has received an opportunity of going abroad on study scholarship or she has received an appointment letter from a very prestigious organization waiting for the response and at the same time she has received a marriage proposal which you have always desired for her, a perfect match that is hard to find. In such situation what will you choose for her? | A. Job or study scholarship,  
B. Marriage.  
C. Is there any other way you would like to resolve this decision dilemma if yes, explain it in few words:__________________________  
__________________________________  
__________________________________  
__________________________________  
__________________________________ |
| **Scenario 2:**  
You are working in a very prestigious organization where you have recently been given an assignment to work on in a team, you have choice of selecting one from the two teams  
1: A team of 10 members under the female leadership with good talent and expertise.  
2: A team of 8 members under the male leadership with comparatively lower expertise. | Which of the above team will you choose and why? (Explain in few words)  
__________________________________  
__________________________________  
__________________________________  
__________________________________ |
9-REFERENCES


Thesis- Recipe of Crucible


Prykucki, B. (2013). Humans can learn about leadership from animals. *Michigan State University*.


