Text Analysis
Culture, Framework & Teaching

Högskolan Kristianstad
Text Analysis
Culture, Framework & Teaching

Conference proceedings from the Text Analysis Symposium at Kristianstad University, April 2014

Edited by Jane Mattisson and Maria Bäcke
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foreword</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bianca Foghel's “Through the Maze of the Unconscious in John Fowles’s</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>The Magus</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alena Rudenka &amp; Michael Zukosky’s “Traditional Culture as a Discourse”</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erliza Lopez Pedersen’s “Representations of the Filipino Identities in Blogs”</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maria Freij &amp; Lena Ahlin’s “Going Forward with Feedback: On Autonomy and Teacher Feedback”</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jane Mattisson’s “The Two Stories of Detective Fiction”</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alla Kozhinova &amp; Alena Sourkova’s “Montage as a Method of One Ancient Text Organization: On text structure of the Book of Daniel from the Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium”</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Larisa Suarez’ “Figures of Speech in Somerset Maugham’s Short Story ‘Louise’”</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharon Ahlquist’s “Appreciating Literature: A Focus on Lexis in Second Language Reading”</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sven Kristersson’s “Singing as a Means of Text Analysis”</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maria Bäcke’s “The Framework for University Level Text Analysis”</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johan Landgren’s “The Medium and the Vandal: A study of English translations of Tomas Tranströmer's poetry”</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ulrica Skagert’s “Things within Things: Possible Readings of Alice Munro’s ‘The Love of a Good Woman’”</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yelena Makarova’s “Text Analysis as the Basis for Teaching Academic Writing”</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Svensson’s “Barn- och ungdomsutredningar ur ett språkligt perspektiv”</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lubomir Vladimirov Vouchev’s ” Frequently Occurring Mistakes and Linguistic Interference at High-School Level”</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The articles included in these proceedings were presented at a text analysis symposium on 14 and 15 April 2014. The presenters represented a range of educational institutions: Belarusian State University, Belarus; Kristianstad University, Sweden; Linnaeus University, Sweden; Lund University, Sweden; Malmö Academy of Music, Sweden; Malmö Borgarskola, Sweden; Minsk Academy of Public Administration, Belarus; St Petersburg State University, Russia; University of Latvia, Latvia; and West University of Timișoara, Romania.

The six sessions covered a range of subjects related to text and discourse analysis. The first session, “Text Analysis and Literature”, included papers on Tomas Tranströmer, John Fowles and Alice Munro. The second session, “Discourse Analysis”, discussed topics as diverse as traditional culture as a discourse, categories of text and discourse and their role in collecting, organising and interpreting data, and analysing song lyrics. Session three, “Text Analysis in Teaching and Literature”, considered the appreciation of literature in second language reading, how to teach literary theory through detective stories, and stylistic devices in Somerset Maugham’s short story “Louise”. The fourth session, “Text Analysis in Teaching and Writing” considered issues as diverse as text analysis and teaching writing, plagiarism detection systems in higher education, and teacher feedback and autonomy. The fifth session, “Text and Discourse Analysis for Change”, discussed a range of issues including a linguistic perspective on Swedish official documentation on children, linguistic interference and commonly occurring mistakes in Swedish secondary schools, and text analysis at university-level. The final session, “Text analysis and ICT” included papers on Filipino transnational identities in blogs, text analysis in the age of technology, and the contextualisation, organisation, and textualisation of IT operational documentation.

The symposium also saw the launching of a new journal, *Contemporary Society and its Discourse Representations*. Further information may be obtained from Professor Irina Oukhvanova-Shmyrova, Belarusian State University, at ioukhvanova@gmail.com.

All articles have been peer reviewed and contributors have been invited to edit their papers in accordance with the reviewers’ instructions. The final version is the sole responsibility of the contributor.

Special thanks go to the participants and contributors to this volume; we hope that you will visit us again. Our grateful thanks also go to Kristianstad University for the use of the university premises and for subsidising the publication of the conference programme and the conference visit to Naturum Nature Centre, as well as for providing refreshments during the breaks. We also wish to thank Anders Håkansson for assisting with the publication of this volume.

Jane Mattisson and Maria Bäcke
December 2014
Through the Maze of the Unconscious in John Fowles’s The Magus

Foghel Bianca
West University of Timișoara, Romania

This work was cofinanced from the European Social Fund through Sectoral Operational Programme Human Resources Development 2007-2013, project number POSDRU/159/1.5/S/140863, Competitive Researchers in Europe in the Field of Humanities and Socio-Economic Sciences. A Multi-regional Research Network

Abstract: John Fowles's acknowledgement of the influence of Jung at the time The Magus was being written, and Nicholas Urfe’s search for self-awareness triggered the hypothesis according to which the novel, apart from its being widely read as an existentialist Bildungsroman, could be better grasped in the light of a Jungian reading. My thesis focuses upon analysing Nicholas’s evolution in parallel to the archetypal quest for the self, which Jung equated with individuation. The labyrinth of individuation, i.e. of “becoming whole” is none other than that of self-discovery, which has been reasserted since the beginnings of human thought. Similarly, the protagonist has to face and overcome his own illusions that revolve around defining concepts such as love, freedom and responsibility and become authentic towards his own self. According to the Jungian tenets, this can only be achieved by undergoing an excruciating process of harmonizing the conscious with the unconscious. The fictional landscapes of the novel will also be explored in terms of their symbolic weight, laying particular emphasis on Jungian parallels. I shall attempt to prove that these loci function as keys offered to the neophyte embarked on the quest of initiation by relating to the evident psychological correspondences between the topographical coordinates presented in the novel and their semiotic functions.

Keywords: archetypal quest, initiation, unconscious, ego-consciousness

1. Acknowledging Jung’s Influence

In The Magus, John Fowles fictionalises his own experience on the Greek island of Spetsai and it seems that what he hopes to attain through his semi-autobiographical fiction is to enwrap personal experiences and perceptions into a certain degree of universality. In several interviews, Fowles admitted to his being strongly influenced by Jungian psychoanalysis “For me Jung has always been the most fruitful psychologist, that is, most fertile in his effects on any subsequent fiction” (Fowles, quoted in Vipond 185);
From the process of individuation, around which Jung crystallised several of his findings, to the stages implied by such a process and to their corresponding alchemical stages, and from the individual and archetypal structures that build up the self, to archeaic components that accompany the development of the self, such as the ego, the persona, the shadow, the anima/animus, all of these features can be traced in the Fowlesian oeuvre. However, the overarching Jungian concept traceable in Fowles’s fiction is clearly that of individuation, alongside the archetypal stages.

2. The Process of Individuation in The Magus

Borrowed from Schopenhauer, the Jungian concept of individuation should not be confused with individualism; on the contrary, the former is a gradual process that seeks to unite the self with an unconscious collective, as opposed to the latter, which means setting oneself into conflict with the collective: “Individuation is an at-one-ment with oneself and at the same time with humanity” (Jung, CW vol. 16: par. 227). This intricate path of self-discovery has been symbolically embodied by the ancient and occult depictions of initiation such as Tarot, alchemy and astrology, which asserted the necessity of self-discovery as a fundamental principle of the earthly life.

In general terms, individuation can be said to comprise the entire life of an individual, and, despite its teleological character, it is a process that may cover one’s entire life spam, from infancy to death. It is a natural attempt of the consciousness to learn to relate to the unconscious contents of the psyche, a titanic undertaking, since it entails uniting two apparently irreconcilable parts into a whole. However, even though individuation is a lifelong process, Jung considers the development of the conscious personality in the form of social adaptation to be the natural prerequisite of the attempt to confront unconscious contents. After the completion of the first stage comes the inward confrontation of the archetypal foundation. Individuation is therefore the expression of humanity’s innate drive towards the development of congenital potentialities, being both the production of something new as well as the ongoing development of something already existent: Up to a point we create the self by making ourselves conscious of our unconscious contents [...] (Jung, CW vol. 11: par. 400).

It is clearly Nicholas Urfe who embodies the structural forces of the psyche undergoing individuation. From the onset he has to face and overcome his own illusions that revolve around defining concepts such as love, freedom and responsibility and can only do so by undergoing an excruciating process of disillusionment. Nicholas’s quest is indeed heroic and tragic at the same time: “the empirical man” undergoes archetypal stages of the quest, whose goal is materialised in “losing oneself”. Individuation is understood as a teleological process, whose completion is equalled with the sacred marriage, the hieros gamos of the contraries that one is inevitably made of. The hero would have acknowledged and integrated his “darker” side, just as the alchemist would have
managed to transmute “impure” metals. Since the self is made of contraries and all the archetypes it consists of feature a positive and celestial as well as a negative and chthonic side, one of the specific characteristics of individuation is the tendency to erase these contraries within the self.

The reader witnesses the character-narrator throughout the process of ego-construction, which goes hand in hand with that of consolidating and acknowledging the persona, through the ordeals of integrating the shadow and the anima. In tandem with the desire of social integration, Nicholas’s personality results in an accretion of repressions and unfulfilled impulses, which naturally converge within the Shadow. In fact, the novel begins with the blunt intimation of these two archetypes:

I was born in 1927, the only child of middle-class parents, both English, and themselves born in the grotesquely elongated shadow, which they never rose sufficiently above history to leave, of that monstrous dwarf Queen Victoria. I was sent to a public school, I wasted two years doing my national service, I went to Oxford; and there I began to discover I was not the person I wanted to be. (Fowles, “Magus” 15).

Through this brief self-representation, Nicholas Urfe’s portrait seems to correspond to the cliché-ridden image of a mediocre aesthete and nihilist, one who evinces both “transcendental and descendental qualities” (Wolfe 96). He acknowledges the “elongated shadow” of society, of his own Persona, which elevates him, but instead of abandoning it altogether, he assumes different masks, among which that of the cynical aesthete, the existentialist and the solitary heart. After having acknowledged the pressure of the social impulses that contribute to the cleavage of the self, Nicholas, instead of renouncing them, rebels against them by using the same weapons, which only deepens the precipice: “I had got away from what I hated, but I hadn’t found where I loved, and so I pretended there was nowhere to love” (Fowles, “Magus” 17). Nicholas becomes the shallow cynic who fosters no ideals and holds no principles, bored with life and reticent towards depth of feeling. Fowles himself states that “he was meant to be the typical inauthentic man of the 1945-50 period” (Fowles, quoted in Vipond 43), a man that has not yet acknowledged personal priorities such as authenticity and self-realisation. Nicholas, “though innocent”, represents the “destructive, irresponsible cosmopolite” (Wolfe 84). Furthermore, “like the child archetype, the hero archetype or the ‘epiphany of the hero’ is characterized by opposing convictions” (Kimball 52), which Nicholas only so explicitly exhibits. He is the inauthentic existentialist, the poet bored with life, the one who seeks but rejects love at the same time, the “cynic by revolt”, the aesthete that cannot tell reality from metaphor. Nicholas embodies “the contradictory nature of Jung’s view of the hero archetype, that ‘dangerous’ stage of individuation” (Kimball 56), when the compensatory engine is first started.
What Nicholas does not accept is the fact that everything he so vehemently condemns is nothing but the projection of his own shadow onto outside scapegoats. Since the individuation process cannot take place without the subject becoming aware of the Shadow, the compensatory function of the psyche stirs in him the need for “a new mystery” (Fowles, “Magus” 17), since “the life that has been suppressed forces its way into the open through all the cracks” (Jung, CW vol. 10: par. 751). In consonance with the idea of symbolic initiation, Fowles points out that “The primary function of all the great human activities – art, science, philosophy, religion – is to bring man nearer the truth” (Fowles, “Aristos” 152). However, this is no easy task; it involves a cognitive reconfiguration of the self, which invariably implies self-sacrifice and loss, just the way totality can only be formed by uniting fragments:

The goal of psychological, as of biological, development is self-realization, or individuation […]. And because individuation is a heroic and often tragic task, the most difficult of all, it involves suffering, a passion of the ego: the ordinary, empirical man we once were is burdened with the fate of losing himself in a greater dimension and being robbed of his fancied freedom of will. He suffers, so to speak, from the violence done to him by the self (Jung, CW vol. 11: par. 233).

This tantalising process cannot occur overnight, it needs years of incubation and its development is gradual, since integrating unconscious elements into the conscious structure may come down as a shock to the subject, despite the fact that the ultimate goal is actually expanding the consciousness with the aid of the unconscious material, i.e. becoming whole.

3. The Semantic Topography of the Psyche: the Sea, Phraxos and Bourani

This subchapter focuses on analysing the fictional landscapes of the novel in terms of their symbolic weight, laying particular emphasis on Jungian parallels. We shall attempt to prove that these loci function as keys offered to the neophyte embarked on the quest of initiation by relating to the evident psychological correspondences between the topographical coordinates presented in the novel and their semiotic functions.

Since, as noted by Palmer (98), in each of Fowles’s novels “the existential journey into self finds objective correlation in spatial imagery”, Nicholas’s symbolic quest is first and foremost defined in terms of its circularity: from England to Greece and back to England, whereby a stark contrast emerges between the two landscapes. The brightness and vividness of the Greek scenery is balanced against a tepid, reserved English landscape: “In The Magus, Greece, the ametri, is the Heraclitean heartland of contradictory, immoderate emotions and enchanting, violent summer lights and England, the metria, the brain-land of
temperance and autumnal pastel colours” (Ikonomakis 56-57). Visiting these two opposite landscapes echoes the Jungian reconciliation between the Apollonian and Dionysian.

Greece becomes the paragon of the mystery and is the ultimate incorporation of his inexplicable nostalgia for the unknown, for a place where presence and absence coexist, a place that will teach him precious lessons of life, freeing him from prejudicial conventions and the limitations of the conscious. The seductive power of the unconscious, of the unknown, is highlighted throughout the novel, as is the fact that the encounter with the mystery and with various facets of the unknown is a painful, if not downright threatening experience, since the fascination exerted by the incomprehensible may prove as unrelenting as Calypso. Salami (95) observes here that “this desire to know the unknown is what relates the act of reading to the thematic structure of the novel as a whole”; it seems that the reader embarks with Nicholas on this journey of self-discovery, just as the writer had done, and Greece is described as a paradoxical locus that entails both distance and nearness, but is essentially undefinable; this characteristic of being undefinable echoes the intricate construction of the self, while the quest for the self represents the prototypical journey described in archetypal terms in all existing cultures and civilisations. In fact, Eliade describes how a deeper archetypal longing underlies the nostalgia for the unknown, namely that for the Garden of Eden:

The most abject "nostalgia" discloses the "nostalgia for Paradise". The images of the "oceanic paradise" that we have mentioned haunt our novels as well as our films. [...] we should find that these images express the nostalgia for a mythicised past transformed into an archetype, and that this "past" signifies not only regrets for a vanished time but countless other meanings; it expresses all that might have been but was not, the sadness of all existence, which is only by ceasing to be something else; [...] in short, the longing for something altogether different from the present instant; something in fact inaccessible or irretrievably lost: "Paradise" itself. (Eliade 188-189).

In opposition to Freud’s theory, according to which the consciousness encloses the unconscious, Jung put forth the idea that it is actually the unconscious that is the primordial mental structure, which, in turn, encloses the consciousness. He defined the consciousness as a unilateral, intermittent structure, since our lives unfold mostly in an unconscious state. It is as if saying there are only sporadic islands of consciousness on the vast territory of the psyche. The island Fowles fictionalises in the The Magus could be read as a genuine symbol for the consciousness, whose limitation is emphasised by the name of the island, which translates into “fenced”. Fowles himself remarks in his essay Islands that “in
terms of consciousness, and self-consciousness, every individual human is an island” (Fowles quoted in Relf 282). This limited locus corresponds to the Jungian conception according to which the island represents the shelter from the threatening “sea” of the unconscious, since what is unknown is perceived as deeply menacing. And not without reason, since total immersion into the unknown, into the depths of the unconscious could only have disastrous effects upon the subject, who would completely lose contact with the outer reality. In connection to this idea lies the fact that seawater is not drinkable, on the contrary, a high intake of salty water may lead to hallucinations and most certainly to death, just as allowing the unconscious to encroach entirely upon the self would. The key to self-knowledge resides in quite the opposite: one needs to acknowledge the presence of a deeper psychic structure, which, by all means, does not want to be neglected, and to come to terms with it. There is a constant struggle for supremacy between consciousness and unconsciousness, symbolised by the landscape of the island, which is only partly visible, its greater part being hidden underwater:

Even to ourselves we are the same, half superficial and obvious, and half concealed, labyrinthine, fascinating to explore. Then there is the enisling sea, our evolutionary amniotic fluid, the element in which we too were once enwombed [...]. There is the marked individuality of islands, which we should like to think corresponds with our own; their obstinate separatedness of character, even when they lie in the archipelagos (Fowles, quoted in Relf 282).

With regard to the mythology of the sea, as the key symbol for the unknown, the elusive, it is worth noting that both the Christian Genesis and in Middle Eastern mythology, water is the fundamental, life-bearing matter. As mentioned above, Jung is adamant about the unconscious being the primordial mental structure, preceding the conscious: “The unconsciousness has always pre-existed the consciousness, as it is the hereditary functional predisposition. The consciousness is a late sprout of the unconscious soul” (Jung, “L'homme” 42). One reaches through this protean, ever-changing mass towards islands of solid ground, anchoring one’s consciousness into the “lost Eden”. When Fowles reaches the island of Spetsai, he is taken aback by “the sense of timelessness and incipient myth” (Fowles, “Magus” 8), since every island of consciousness inherently entails an element just as dynamic and fluid as the one surrounding it: the personal unconscious. The island is described in the Foreword to the revision version of The Magus as being inexpressibly “haunted”; perhaps just like the unconscious haunts the consciousness with archetypal or personal representations. Cirlot (160) emphasises the symbolic power of the island in terms of isolation and death: “Most island-deities have something funeral about them – Calypso, for instance. One could perhaps postulate an equation …
between island and woman on the one hand, and monster and hero on the other”. The association of water and island with death could hint at the fact that the character-narrator is undergoing a symbolic death by embarking on this journey into the unconscious, a descent into the underworld, which is the prerequisite for any psychological resurrection.

Conchis explains to Nicholas that “Bourani” was a name given to the cape by Albanian pirates, meaning “gourd” or “skull”, symbolising “death and water” (Fowles, “Magus” 83). Again, the heavy symbolism of the sea is overtly connected to death. However, in an opposite line of interpretation, which sees water as a life-generating and life-supporting element, the skull unites the two opposite symbols of life and death, functioning as an integrating symbol, just as the unconscious entails absolutely no antagonisms. In this line of thought, the death associated with the skull may be considered a threshold, a non-finite transition, whose symbolic is reinforced by Mitford’s encrypted warning in connection to Bourani: “Beware of the waiting-room” (Fowles, “Magus” 45).

Apart from the obvious association with mortality and human transience, as seen in *Hamlet*, Cirlot (299), compares the skull to a crustaceous shell, since it outlives the body: “it therefore comes to acquire significance as a receptacle for life and for thought, it is with this symbolic meaning that it figures in books on alchemy, where it is represented as a receptacle used in the process of transmutation”. The phonetic resemblance between shell, conch and Conchis is self-explanatory. A Jungian reading of this association would imply that the “vessel” of the personal unconscious is necessary for the process of individuation, just as for Nicholas the tantalising experiences underwent at Bourani are necessary in revealing his true self, shifting the symbolism of the skull from death to human potentiality.

*The Magus* is therefore rightfully described by its writer as being “a notebook of an exploration, often erring and misconceived, into an unknown land” (Fowles, 2004: 5), a land that topographically and symbolically echoes the Jungian construction of the psyche. All narrative instances are involved in the fictional world: the novel portrays the unwinding paths of (self-)exploration as undertaken by writer, character-narrator and reader.

This work was cofinanced from the European Social Fund through Sectoral Operational Programme Human Resources Development 2007-2013, project number POSDRU/159/1.5/S/140863, Competitive Researchers in Europe in the Field of Humanities and Socio-Economic Sciences. A Multi-regional Research Network
References


Abstract: Discourse analysis is applicable not only to texts that are written in natural languages, but to texts of culture. A field of science that studies language in its relationship to culture is ethnolinguistics. There are several Slavic ethnolinguistic schools and one of them is the school of Nikita Tolstoy.

According to Nikita Tolstoy’s school, Slavic ethnolinguists interpret folk culture as a particular type of discourse. The element of traditional culture is a rite. A rite is a text that has its own grammar and semantics. Ritual signs can be of different nature: verbal, actional, substantive ones. Signs of identical codes as well as signs of different codes can be polysemantic, synonymous, antonymous, homonymous, etc.

Since traditional culture is regarded as a discourse, the ritual is not only a text, but also a speech act. As every speech act, the rite has the explicit and implicit illocution. The ritual is the message of previous generations to their descendants, and traditional culture is the discourse that is implemented not in space but in time and intended to convey the experience of society.

Discourse analysis and Slavic ethnolinguistics

Methodology of discourse analysis is applicable not only to language, but to culture, too. Ethnolinguistics is a science which subject is the relationship between language and culture. There are several ethnolinguistic schools in Slavic countries: the ethnolinguistic school of Nikita Tolstoy, the Polish (Lublin) ethnolinguistic school, ethnosophiologistics, etc. We will discuss briefly the history of the Slavic ethnolinguistics and its schools.

Various cognitive, communicative, sociolinguistic and folkloric themes can be distinguished in Slavic ethnolinguistics. Additionally, Alexander Gerd, a researcher from St. Petersburg, distinguishes between synchronic and diachronic approaches. Gerd says:

[within diachronic ethnolinguistics a researcher uses language and linguistic methods as a means to study the past, ethnic history of a people, as well as the history of its material and spiritual culture. Synchronic ethnolinguistics examines language and linguistic methods as a tool of exploring the national, social and cultural problems of our time. (7)
So generally speaking, differences in theory and method begin with these different emphases on the cognitive, sociolinguistic, and folkloric aspects of language and culture.

The following areas dominate in modern Slavic ethnolinguistics: cognitive (synchronous and — more rarely — diachronic), folklore and dialect (both synchronous and diachronic), and sociolinguistic (synchronous) ones. Classical Slavic ethnolinguistics is diachronic and synchronic research on folklore and dialect material. It actively develops in the South (Serbia) and East Slavic countries (Russia, Belarus, Ukraine), as well as in Poland. Cognitive and sociolinguistic areas have been typical research areas for all Slavic countries, especially since the end of the twentieth century.

**Beginnings of ethnolinguistics**

Slavic ethnolinguistics has a historical origin in the early modern period. As of the 16th century, European societies, France and Prussia in particular, were undergoing rapid social and cultural transformation with the rise of Protestantism, the decline of feudalism and the Holy Roman empire, and the beginning of the modern nation-state system. French Enlightenment thinking about equality regardless of birth and religion as well as its embodiment in the Napoleonic Code were important components of intellectual discussions up to the 18th century. Many German-speaking intellectuals saw threats to German intellectual life and sought to develop a new vision of social life, the one where individuals and community were bonded in a true German culture.

Slavic ethnolinguistics has an origin in the reaction to the French Enlightenment’s ideas about the universality of humanity and human reason. German Romanticists such as Johann Gottfried Herder (1744-1803) argued that each human group could only be understood as a product of its own history and their distinctive forms of reason were linked to specific historical formations including language; his translation and interpretation of Biblical texts in Hebrew discussed how the language, habits, thought, and cosmology of the Hebrews were strange and alien to his contemporaries. In Herder’s view, to truly understand their texts, understanding their world and worldview was required (Herder 1971 [1783]).

The foundational scholarship of Wilhelm von Humboldt, who was deeply influenced by Herder, explored the role of language in the distinctive ways of thinking of different communities throughout the world. Humboldt believed that the relationship between language and thought was deep and natural. He wrote:

> [t]he intellectual peculiarity and the linguistic conformation of a people are related by such an intimate fusion, that, given the one, the other could be entirely derived from it. For intellectuality and language permit and promote only mutually agreeable formations. Language is, as it were, the external manifestation of the minds of peoples. Their language is their soul, and their soul is their language. (Humboldt 24)
Following Humboldt, ethnolinguistics developed a thematic and theoretical connection between different ways of thinking, language and culture.

Wilhelm von Humboldt was, in turn, influenced by his brother Alexander, a traveler and explorer. Studying languages such as Basque, Kawi, Chinese, and others, he came to the idea that different languages are not just different shells for universal consciousness, but embody different world views. In fact, Humboldt is responsible for developing the concept of world view (Germ. *Weltbild* and *Weltansicht*). He used the concept “world view” as a synonym for the “mentality of the people” and “ethnic conceptual and axiological system.”

In Europe Humboldt's followers established Neo-Humboldtism, which was developed mainly in Germany (where it was not called ethnolinguistics). Its representatives were Walter Porzig (1895–1961), Jost Trier (1894–1970), Johann Leo Weisgerber (1899–1985), Günther Ipsen (1899–1984), and others. The main idea of the German representatives of Neo-Humboldtism is that language determines a person's worldview and cognition on the whole; through a worldview language determines culture and social behaviour. People who speak different languages have different world views, therefore, they belong to different types of culture and social behaviour. Language not only determines, but also restricts human cognitive capabilities. In this view, the difference in the content of thought and in the logic of thinking depends on how different languages are.

The ideas of Wilhelm von Humboldt and Humboldtism were very important for the development of Slavic ethnolinguistics and North American linguistic anthropology. They were the impetus for the study of language not as an end in and of itself, but as part of an ethno-cultural context.

In Europe, especially in Germany, Humboldt's followers developed first of all his views on language and thought, whereas Russian researchers were also guided by his achievements in diachronic linguistics. In Germany great experience of comparative studies and collecting folklore by philologists-romantics were not connected with the ethnolinguistic research. In Russia the same experience was used by the founders of a powerful and diverse Russian ethnolinguistics.

**Slavic ethnolinguistics**

Slavic ethnolinguistics originates in the Russian Imperial academic tradition. In the 19th century, Russia had entered the European nation-state system and began a process of modernisation.

In Russia the study of ethnolinguistic problems goes back to the folkloric and mythological tradition (the works by Fiodor Buslajev (1818–1897), Vladimir Dahl (1801–1872), Alexander Afanasjev (1826–1871), etc.). These scientists were representatives of comparative linguistics and at the same time collectors and researchers in the fields of folklore and mythology, as well as their German colleagues Franz Bopp (1791–1867), Jacob (1785–1863), and Grimm (1786–1859), etc. So, the dominant influence on Russian scholarship in the 19th century was German romanticism.
and the works of people like Humboldt, which radically altered the direction of Slavic research.

In Russia the study of ethnolinguistic problems begins with the intersection of the scholarly documentation and analysis of Slavic folkloric and mythological traditions with the Humboldtian idea that such traditions represent a Slavic mentality. For example, the ideas of Humboldt were utilized by Alexander Potebnia (1835–1891), a Ukrainian professor of Kharkov University (especially “Thought and Language,” 1862). Alexander Potebnia is known as the founder of the Kharkov linguistic school. He was involved in linguistic theory, worked out theoretical questions of grammar, in particular morphology; in lexicology he examined problems of word motivation. Potebnia wrote seminal works on poetics. The material of his research was East Slavic languages such as Belarusian, Russian, and Ukrainian, and his main method was a descriptive one. The principal works of Potebnia, except for “Thought and Language,” are “Notes on the Little Russian (Ukrainian – A.R.) dialect” (1870), “Notes on Russian grammar” (habilitate doctoral thesis, 1874), “From the history of Russian language sounds” (1880-1886), “Notes on the theory of literature. Fable. Proverb. Adage” (1905, posthumously). The book “Aesthetics and Poetics” was published later (1976). In these works, Potebnia used a structural understanding of language as well as applied a structural understanding to levels of language above the sentence in ways that influenced future scholars.

Another important scholar in the Slavic ethnolinguistic tradition was Jan Baudouin de Courtenay (1845–1929), a French-Polish linguist. Baudouin de Courtenay developed the ethnolinguistic as well as “psycholinguistic” tradition (today we would say “cognitive” tradition). He noted that language taken without an individual person is not a real system, and that we should study the individual and her/his linguistic thought. In Baudouin de Courtenay’s view, we do not need to classify whole languages, but only to give contrastive characteristics of individuals based on their manner of linguistic thinking (Baudouin de Courtenay 1963 (1909), 2, 182). Moreover, Baudouin de Courtenay paid attention to mixed languages, which linked his ideas to linguistic characterology, areal linguistics and — through these branches — to sociolinguistics. These interests might be attributed, at least partially, to the fact that he lived and worked within multilingual settings such as the Imperial Russian university in Kazan, a Russian and Turkic-speaking area. Also, he supported autonomy for Russia’s linguistic minorities.

Finally, Baudouin de Courtenay is known for his work on comparative studies. He is most famous as the founder of structural linguistics in Slavic countries. In this way, J. Baudouin de Courtenay can be called a “Slavic Saussure.” He studied language as a system of signs conditioned by both psychological and social phenomenon. In the framework of modern ethnolinguistics we would call Baudouin the representative of an early sociolinguistic school. His works are collected and published in two volumes: Baudouin de Courtenay J. Izbrannye trudy po obshhemu jazykoznaniju (Selected papers on general linguistics) (T. I-II. Moscow, 1963).

In the early Stalinist regime of the Soviet Union during the 1930-1960s, most linguistic research fell within descriptive and structural approaches and focused on
the textual and genre level. This was the period known as Russian Formalism which produced research by people like Vladimir Propp, Roman Jakobson, and the Moscow Linguistic Circle. Under the Soviet centralised scientific programs, large amounts of dialect and folklore material were collected for analysis. The research tradition that drew on these approaches and which preceded mature ethnolinguistics can be found in the works of Olga Freindenberg (1980-1955) and Dmitrij Zelenin (1878-1954). Zelenin worked hard as a folklorist, dialectologist, ethnographer, however, his works were published much later (see, for example, “Vostochnoslavjanskaja etnografija” — “East Slavic Ethnography,” 1991). Freidenberg conducted much structural/semiotic research into theoretical poetics, combining structural views on folkloric material with the analysis of political, and economic contexts. For her, linguistics was part of theory of culture, and by default, ethnolinguistics.

While the name ethnolinguistics was first mentioned in Russian in 1952 in a review of American works, ethnolinguistics finally formed only in the late 1960s. Works of Boris Uspensky (b. 1937), Viacheslav Ivanov (b. 1929), Vladimir Toporov (1928–2005) employed the term ethnolinguistics and greatly contributed to the formation of the field. These researchers continued to apply the achievements of semiotics and structural linguistics to the Indo-European languages (see, for example, such famous books as: Ivanov V.V., Gamkrelidze T. V. Indo-European and Indo-Europeans. Berlin/New York: Mouton de Gruyter, in 2 volumes, 1995. Previously published in Russian: Indoeropeikij iazyk i indoevropeitsy. Tbilisi, 1984; Ivanov V. V., Toporov V. N. Sanskrit. Moscow, 1960. Expanded English translation: Sanskrit. Moscow, 1968, etc). Together with Ju. Lotman, these scholars founded Moscow-Tartu semiotic school. In their co-authored publications, Ivanov and Toporov developed a formal language and principles of a structural analysis of fairy tales and mythological texts on the basis of binary semantic features (see Ivanov V. V., Toporov V. N. Slavianskie modelirujushchije semioticheskije sistemy (The Proto-Slav Religious Systems as Semiotic Models of the Universe, Moscow, 1965). The authors presented the typology of these features and showed their effectiveness reconstructing ancient texts.

These achievements were further developed in the contemporary ethnolinguistic school of Nikita Tolstoy (1923-1996). His works have not yet been translated into English. Folkloric and dialectological studies of this school are mostly diachronic, that is, they are based on etymological and historical data. This school investigates the mentality and culture of an ethnic group on the basis of a lexicon or language system.

**The ethnolinguistic school of Nikita Tolstoy**

Nikita Tolstoy is considered the founder of Slavic ethnolinguistics. The scientist gave a definition for ethnolinguistics and founded Moscow ethnolinguistic school, that later spread its influence to other Slavic countries. Therefore, it is called the ethnolinguistic school of Nikita Tolstoy. Tolstoy's ethnolinguistics was formed as a complex discipline that combined linguistics, mythology, folklore and ethnography.
Its research object is folk culture in all its genres and forms: verbal (vocabulary, phraseology and paremiology, folklore texts), actional (rituals), mental (beliefs). Its purpose is semantic reconstruction of traditional (archaic, pre-Christian) worldview and system of values.

According to Tolstoy, the first part of the word ethnolinguistics (ethnic) means that traditional culture is studied in its ethnic, regional and dialect forms. The Proto-Slavic language and culture are reconstructed on the basis of such research. The second part (linguistics) has three meanings:

1) language is the main source of the study of traditional culture;
2) culture as well as natural language are semiotic systems;
3) ethnolinguistics uses many linguistic terms and methods.

**Key names and achievements of Nikita Tolstoy’s school**

Academician of the USSR and a foreign member of many Slavic academies Nikita Tolstoy created his scientific school relying on a huge field work in Belarusian and Ukrainian Polesye and South Slavic countries in the 1960s-80s of the twentieth century. Starting from the very beginning of his research Tolstoy had many adherents, their works are collected in the book “Slavic and Balkan folklore” (Moscow, 1997-2006, 10 issues). These works are listed in Slavianskaja etnolingvistica 2008 and subsequent editions of Slavic ethnolinguistics bibliography.


**Key concepts of Nikita Tolstoy’s school**

Language and culture are understood as different semiotic systems in Slavic ethnolinguistics. Language and cultural semantics differ, too. The same phenomenon can be represented both by linguistic and cultural signs but their semantics will be different. Here is an example: The meaning of the word tree is given in the dictionary: tree is a plant with a trunk, branches, leaves, etc. In culture (in our case — traditional Slavic culture) the tree has such symbolic meanings: 1) vertical line connecting the earth and the upper world, and 2) the growth and fertility, and 3) human metaphor (cf. prohibition to chop certain types of trees), 4) a sacral or demonic place, etc. (Tolstaya). This symbolic meaning is called cultural code in Slavic ethnolinguistics.

The concept of cultural code is connected with the concepts of language of culture and cultural semantics. Tolstoy’s well-known article “On ‘Grammar’ of Slavic Rites” shows coexistence of different codes — verbal, actional and subject ones — in culture, particularly in rites (Tolstoy 63-77). All three types of codes are examined in the article of Nikolaj Antropov “Kodovaja struktura belorusskih obrisadov i ritualov, sviazannyh s vyzyvaniem dozhdia (Code structure of Belarusian ritual of rainmaking)” (Antropov 241-256). Sanctification of the well is the actional
code, guys (the actors) represent the subject code, the spell is the verbal code. In modern ethnolinguistics other cultural codes are distinguished, too.

**Methods of Nikita Tolstoy’s school**

The method of oppositions introduced in ethnolinguistics by Ivanov and Toporov is widely used by the school of Tolstoy (Ivanov, Toporov 1965). The following oppositions are presented in the culture of the Slavs: right — left, up — down, sky — earth, earth — underworld, midnight — noon, east — west, north — south, day — night, spring — winter, sun — moon, light — dark, white — black/red — black, fire — water, house — forest, dry — wet, wet — boiled, earth — water, ours — another, close — far, male — female, senior — junior, ancestor — descendant, sacral — secular, internal — external, happiness — unhappiness, life — death, even — odd. (Mify narodov mira 2: 162). One of the most significant works is Tsivyan T. A. Model mira i jejo lingvisticheskije osnovy (Model of the World and its Linguistic Basis), Moscow, 2005.

The key method used within Tolstoy’s ethnolinguistic school is the transfer of linguistic concepts to the culture. The rite and cultural tradition are understood as texts with their own semantics and pragmatics, grammar and syntax. This approach involves linguistic methods in the analysis of cultural phenomena. The same action or object can have different meanings: homonymy and polysemy of cultural codes are described. For example, fabulous animals and fictional creatures are ambivalent: they can help the protagonist or they can harm him. Synonymy of codes is possible, too (see the above example on the ritual of rainmaking).

Such linguistic concepts as translatability (from the language of one culture to another), dialect, reconstruction, mapping are applied to culture. Methods of different linguistic fields are used as well, e.g. linguistic geography, linguistic reconstruction, semantics, syntax, linguistic pragmatics, speech act theory, cognitive linguistics, conceptual analysis.

An approximate algorithm of articles of Tolstoy’s school is as follows:

1) history of the rite;
2) names of the rite/concept in the literary language in diachrony and synchrony;
3) dialect names of the rite/concept, map of dialect names;
4) semantic analysis; maps showing the different meanings of each name in different dialects;
5) folk etymology, myths and legends associated with the rite/concept; maps;
6) scientific etymology;
7) mythological semantics — reconstructed original myth.

**The Polish (Lublin) ethnolinguistic school**

Jerzy Bartminski, the creator of the Polish ethnolinguistic school, calls his school cognitive ethnolinguistics. Polish cognitive ethnolinguistics is very close in spirit (but
not in methods) to American cognitive anthropology and is connected to the ethnolinguistic school of Nikita Tolstoy.

**Key names and achievements of the Polish ethnolinguistic school**

The predecessor of Polish ethnolinguistics is Anna Wierzbicka. She writes not only in Polish but also in Russian and in English, therefore she is known to Anglo-American linguistic anthropologists. The founder of the modern Polish ethnolinguistic school is professor Jerzy Bartminski. The book by J. Bartminski “Aspects of Cognitive Ethnolinguistics” was published in English. The fact that their texts are available in English means that cognitive ethnolinguistics is known to the English-speaking scientific community.

Unlike the ethnolinguistic school of Tolstoy, cognitive ethnolinguistics explores not only traditional but also contemporary culture and worldviews. E. Bartminskij wrote: “[e]thnolinguistics is not limited to the dialect and folk tradition, it covers all kinds of language, including literary language in all its historical and contemporary variety of styles, genres, etc.” (Bartminskij 33-34).

According to Y. Zinken, the editor of Bartminskij’s book, “the work on the folk variety of language has, over time, developed into an ambitious project: the reconstruction of the ‘linguistic worldview’ of rural speakers of Polish in the Dictionary of Folk Symbols and Stereotypes,” which has been published since 1996. Also, in the 1980s, Polish ethnolinguists developed the second focus of empirical research: “the study of terms referring to culturally important (embraced, contested) values … The major project in this area has been the comparison of the concept of homeland (fatherland) in twelve European languages” (Zinken 2). Now this project continues: the concepts of freedom, home, honor, Europe, labor are explored.

**Key concepts of the Polish ethnolinguistic school**

Language worldview and linguistic stereotype (= concept) are central ideas of the Polish ethnolinguistic school. A language worldview is “language interpretation of the reality, the system of judgments about the world. These judgments are fixed in the language itself, in its grammatical forms, vocabulary, etc. or they are encoded in texts” (Bartminski 88). A stereotype is an “idea about the subject in the collective experience; what this thing is, what it looks like; how it acts; how it is perceived by the person, etc. This view is embodied in the language and is available through the language” (Bartminski 68). Key concepts of the Polish ethnolinguistics are cognitive definition and profiling. The explication of stereotype meaning should take into account the speakers’ socio-cultural context. The cognitive definition aims to reconstruct the point of view and perspective of the envisaged subject by examining the main facets, or aspects, through which the object is conceptualised resulting in a subject-bound conceptual profile.

As an example of profiling may serve the ethnic stereotype of a German in the Polish culture: 1) a simple man’s profile (a model of the German as a "stranger"), 2) a nobleman’s profile (a model of the German as “plyudrak”), 3) a Polish patriot’s
profile (a model of the German as the conqueror and enemy), 4) a victim’s of military violence profile (a model of the German as Hitler’s offender), 5) a young intellectual’s profile (a model of the German as a hardworking, rich and cultured European) (Bartminski 252-278).

**Methods of the Polish ethnolinguistic school**

In the study of stereotypes within cognitive ethnolinguistics the following parameters are taken into account:

1. data of the language system (1.1. dictionary definition; 1.2. derivatives; 1.3. collocations; 1.4. etymological data);
2. Questionnaire data (2.1. meaning of the word; public functions; 2.2. attributes; 2.3. word associations; 2.4. but-test; 2.5. lexical compatibility);
3. Text data (3.1. contexts, clichés; 3.2. proverbs; 3.3. texts of different styles and genres).

As the result, a cognitive definition of the stereotype is formulated. According to this procedure, I explored the concept of “freedom” in Belarusian, Russian, Ukrainian, and American English (Rudenka 2011; Rudenka 2013).

**Cognitive studies of ethnic specificity**

The Polish ethnolinguistic school is close to cognitive linguistics. On the other hand, in the Slavic world today there are a lot of cognitive studies, the purpose of which is to reveal the ethnic and cultural specificity of speakers of a particular language. These studies include many works by the Moscow semantic school representatives (Yurij Apresian, Yurij Stepanov, Tatjana Bulygina, Aleksej Shmeljov etc.) or representatives of the group “Logical Analysis of Language” headed by Nina Arutyunova that investigates the Russian worldview. Such studies are common in all Slavic countries. Many of these works are comparative (see, for example, Rudenka 2001). The authors examine linguistic lacunae (Rus. intelligentnost’, Eng. neckware), speech behaviour, semantic differences of similar concepts in different languages (Rus. schastje ‘happiness’ and Eng. happiness), pragmatically loaded concepts (Rus. bread, Eng. challenge). The key terms of these studies are the worldview and the concept, discussed above. In the analysis of ethnically specific concepts all methods of structural and interpretive semantics can be used. They include the research of conceptual features, etymology, modern associations, evaluations and connotations.

**Ethnosociolinguistics**

Another contemporary Slavic School — ethnosociolinguistics (the term coined by Alexander Gerd) (Gerd 5) — develops apart from the above-mentioned schools. Gerd, a representative of the Russian sociolinguistic branch of ethnolinguistics, emphasises that ethnolinguistics and sociolinguistics can be considered two major components of a broader discipline. The difference between these sciences lies in the fact that the former takes into account specific ethnic features of society, whe-
rears the latter studies the structure of a particular society or society in general (Gerd 6-7). Aleksey Shakhmatov (1864-1920), Jefim Karskiy (1860-1931), Boris Larin (1893-1964) and many other outstanding Russian scientists formed this ethnolinguistic area in Russia. The theory of language unions, namely the works of Nikolaj Trubeckoy, was of great importance for the development of ethnosociolinguistics. Today this area is developed primarily in Saint Petersburg.

In general, such studies are considered to belong to sociolinguistics in the Slavic countries. The objectives of this research area are as follows: 1) the study of all kinds of relationships between language and society (language and culture, language and history, language and ethnicity, the church, school, politics, mass media, etc.); 2) a situational choice of a particular language, or language variant, or language element; 3) the study of language features of different social and age groups. In fact, this field studies the social structure of society taking into account not only sociological but also language options. The spheres of interest of ethnosociolinguistics (as well as sociolinguistics) are a linguistic situation, language socialisation, communicative competence, language code, code switching, bilingualism, language policy, verbal behaviour, language contact, mixed language, etc. The methods of this science are a synthesis of linguistic and sociological procedures. The methods used for gathering material are observation, inclusive observation, interviews, quizzes, tests, analysis of written sources. A correlation analysis as well as the modelling of languages and linguistic situations are used for the field data processing.

The above-mentioned Slavic ethnolinguistic schools (the ethnolinguistic school of Nikita Tolstoy, the Polish ethnolinguistic school, cognitive studies for ethnic specificities, ethnosociolinguistics) are linked, primarily, in their origin. The founder of the Moscow ethnolinguistic school Nikita Tolstoy, and the precursor of the Polish ethnolinguistic school Anna Wierzbicka shared the ideas with those that were typical of the Moscow semantic school. Today these schools also closely contact. Furthermore, Tolstoy was the author of the theory of Slavic language situation, his ideas underlies ethnosociolinguistics.

**Folk culture as a discourse**

According to a tradition of Nikita Tolstoy’s school, Slavic ethnolinguists interpret folk culture as a particular type of discourse. Traditional culture, seen as a discourse, has appropriate characteristics. Communication within this discourse presumes that participants have background knowledge, implicitly represented in the semantics of culture and its elements. This implicit semantics of traditional culture is called within Slavic ethnolinguistics a cultural code. The cultural code differs from the knowledge encoded in natural language. For example, the meaning of the word *well* in everyday speech is ‘a place to set water,’ while in the Slavic cultural code it is ‘the boundary between the normal life and the afterlife’.

The element of traditional culture is a rite, and a rite is interpreted in Slavic ethnolinguistics as a text. A rite or a ritual is a text that has its own grammar and semantics. An example of ritual syntax is a structure of the Belarusian traditional
wedding ceremony, which consists of the following stages. The pre-wedding part includes vygledzini (time to look for), daviedkini (time to find out, to get information), svatannie (matchmaking), zapoiny (time to drink), abledzini (time to eyei, to consider), zmovini (time to make a decision). The wedding part consists of subornaja subota (Saturday to meet), zaprosiny (invitation), viaszel'naje dreva (wedding tree), karavaj (wedding loaf, wedding pie), pasad (virginity test and fertility ritual), vykup (ransom), zluchennie (time to join), vianchannie (religious or civil ceremony itself), viaszel'naje zastole (time for a wedding tableful), perajezd da maladobha (time to move to a groom’s house), zawivannie (time to have a new hairstyle), padziel karavaja (time to share the wedding loaf), darennie maladym (time to bestow newlyweds). The after-wedding phase includes cygany (the Gypsies — post-wedding theater) and piarezvy (parents’ exchange visits).

It is obvious that a wedding ceremony is a narrative. This narrative has a plot which includes the exposition, intrigue, culmination, plot development and so on. It is a coherent text, nothing can be removed, added or rearranged without changing the sense.

I have been studying modern weddings according to the Internet data. Only some steps remain in use from the original ceremony: vykup (ransom), vianchannie (a wedding ceremony itself, church or civil), viaszel'naje zastolle (time for a wedding tableful), padziel karavaja (time to share the wedding loaf), darennie maladym (time to bestow newlyweds). As a result, the ritual has become more mundane and commercialized. Such a step as pasad has disappeared, including the virginity test and the idea of fertility as an obligatory duty for future spouses. The integrity, cohesion, of the rite is destroyed now. Zluchennie (joining, coupling of bride and groom) has disappeared, too. The idea of joining (zluchemhnie) was expressed at different stages of the wedding: vyhledzini (time to look for), daviedkini (time to find out, to get information), svatannie (matchmaking), zapoiny (time to drink), abledzini (time to eyei, to consider), zmovini (time to make a decision); subornaja subota (Saturday to meet), zaprosiny (invitation), zluchemhnie itself (time to join). By the way, these cross-cutting themes additionally provide the coherence of text.

The cohesion and coherence of the rite is supported by the polyphony of different characters. Each of them has a role and is involved in one common dialogue, or rather polylogue, not only through words, but through actions, too. Exactly such a polylogue can be observed during the post-wedding show (Cygany — the Gypsies), which is attended by the newlyweds, their parents and all the guests.

All means of text coherence are used in a ritual: repetitions, parallelism, synonyms, substitutions, etc. For example, during the wedding ceremony the bride’s and groom’s hands are joined together many times in different ways.

Similarly to a text, a ritual is composed of signs. Ritual signs can be different in their nature: verbal, actional, substantive ones. For example, the verbal code of the bride in the text of a wedding ceremony is a special song, the substantive code is a rowan branch, the actional code is symbolic unwinding of a braid. Signs of both identical and different codes can be polysemantic, synonymous, antonymous, homonymous, etc. Grain and cheese are symbols of fertility, they are synonymous
substantive codes (see the above example of the ritual of rainmaking). A ritual as a

text has not only syntax, but semantics, too. Semantics of traditional culture is
described by key concepts and/or by a set of key oppositions (see above).

Key concepts of Slavic traditional culture are presented in Slavianskije drevnosti

Key concepts of the Belarusian traditional wedding are:

- joining,
- change of the status of bride and groom,
- protection of bride and groom during this change,
- idea of fertility,
- wishes of goodness.

The idea of protecting the bride and groom (it was the role of wedding squad)
and the idea of fertility have absolutely disappeared from the wedding tradition.
The concept of joining has also changed, for instance, the component “joining with
forefathers, ancestors” has been lost.

Since the traditional culture is regarded as a discourse, the ritual is not only a text,
but also a speech act. As every speech act, the rite has the explicit and implicit il-
locution. Explicit illocution of the whole wedding means good wishes for the new
couple, and an implicit one means illocution to continue the human race, to renew
life.

The main message of a wedding rite at all times is that marriage is a good survival
strategy. This message was fully preserved in the past, and is broadcast by the mo-
dern wedding ceremony, too. Aspiring to get married and starting a rite, the bride
and groom accept the message and transfer it to external spectators (in space), and
to future generations (in time) as a part of mentality. This idea is not localised within
the rite, among its members, but is addressed outwards to external recipients, of
a wedding.

In conclusion of the article, the following facts and can be highlighted:

- Traditional culture is the discourse that is transmitted more in time, than
  in space.
- The ritual is the message of previous generations to their descendants.
- This message is intended to convey the experience of procreation, of
  continuation of a given kin.

Works Cited
Antropov, N. P. Kodovaya struktura belorusskih obriadov i ritualov, sviazannyh s vzyvanijem dozhdia.
Baudouin de Courtenay, J. Zameñki na poljab sochinenija V. V. Radlova // J. A. Baudouin de Cour-
access date: 09.08.2013.


Abstract: With a long tradition of migration, the Philippines is considered to be one of the biggest sending countries in terms of labour, and it is estimated that ten million (10%) of the country’s population is scattered to as many as 239 countries. The Filipino migrants are active as online producers and consumers of social media, as a result of such keen interest, many blogs or online magazines are created to compress the communication distances between those who are abroad and in the homeland. From the contributions provided by several Filipino immigrants in three online magazines, six blog entries have been examined with the purpose of identifying whether the Filipino identity is strengthened or re-defined. By using semiotic analysis, it is concluded that the analysed texts provide a clear hybrid identity formation among Filipino immigrants.

Introduction
Can identities be found in blogs? For this paper, I have analysed six blogs from three different online magazines to examine the case of Filipino identities. My aim is to explore if the Filipino identities are strengthened or redefined. The Oxford Dictionaries (2014) define strengthen as “becoming stronger,” while to redefine means to “define again or differently”. Why blogs and Filipino identities? The motivation behind this paper is anchored in my research interest, which is primarily focused on transnational Filipinos and our media use and practice. There is a big Filipino community outside our national territory, and in the age of social media it is common and popular to use such tools to communicate, share stories and experiences, or to simply connect with other people. By analysing texts in blogs, one can look for traces of identities that are put forward by the authors. However, it is not always easy to find these traces if one does not have the necessary cultural competencies.

As a Filipino transmigrant myself, I see and look for culturally anchored clues, that might be describing whether or not a blog is advocating transnational identities. Some examples of these are cultural traits and attributes that are inherent among Filipinos, which have been put into words either straightforwardly or hidden in the message.

The Philippine Labour Migration
The Philippines has been sending out Filipinos as labour migrants since the early 1900s. Tulud Cruz (17-18) explained that the Philippine labour migration could be
characterised into four waves. The first one happened when farm workers were needed on Hawaii; Filipino men were recruited as cheap labourers in pineapple plantations and later on as apple pickers in the US mainland. The second wave transpired between the 1940s and 1960s, when migration policies in the US, Canada, and Europe were more friendly and open. Most of the emigrants who migrated to these places were professionals and highly skilled, thus marking this era as the start of the brain drain in the country. The third wave happened when Ferdinand Marcos saw the positive effects of getting remittances from migrant workers, prompting him to launch a campaign encouraging more Filipinos to work abroad. As a result, the brains and brawn of the Philippine society in the 1980s emigrated to find greener pastures. The last wave came in during the 1990s when women, primarily, left to work as domestic workers, nurses, and entertainers, hence it was tagged as the feminisation of Philippine labour migration. Currently, it is estimated that ten percent of the Philippine population or ten million Filipinos are living and working abroad, ranging from permanent residents to undocumented individuals. It is even indicated that there is a Filipino in almost every country:

There are 239 countries identified to have Filipinos. Some 209 of these countries are members of the United Nations, while 30 others are non-members (including islands and territories unfamiliar to many of us). Filipinos go to these countries as temporary migrants (or more renowned as “overseas Filipino workers”), permanent migrants, and undocumented or irregular migrants. (Opiniano Foreword)

Framing the strong migration culture of the Philippines is necessary to establish a structure of identity constructions overseas; it has been widely noted that identity formation among migrant groups is inevitable and “learning to live simultaneously in two social worlds is a requisite of “successful” immigrant adaptation” (Portes and Rumbaut 214). When people migrate, they bring with them their culture that defines their identity. In migration studies, identity has been an important and prolific subject especially when understanding the interplay between various groups.

*Identity Culture, and Representation*

But what is the Filipino identity? What makes a Filipino, Filipino? Nakpil Zialcita (6) pointed out that the Filipino identity is relatively difficult to assess by reason of our diversified culture. Although one can look at divergent elements, then one will perceive that religion plays a big role especially when making distinctions between the peoples of the north and the south. With almost four centuries of strong Hispanic influence, Catholicism has great domination on how Filipinos discern themselves; however, this is also the same with Islam that is widely practiced in the southernmost part of the country. This is a relatively distinct and common way of understanding how people define themselves, as “human beings do need belonging” (Stråth 21).
Hall and Du Gay (3-4) construed identity as the “collective or true self hiding inside the many other, more superficial or artificially imposed selves which a people with shared history and ancestry hold in common.” What Hall and Du Gay want to explain is that identity has to be seen as a representation of a group of people who share commonalities that sets them apart from other groups. Hall and Du Gay further explained that identity is never stable, and in fact it is “fragmented and structured” as well as it is “never singular” (4). In an online Filipino magazine, Kalayaan Literary Circle (“What Makes A Filipino A Filipino”), several people shared with their readers their understanding of the Filipino identity. Their perceptions of the Filipino identity reveal that there is no single Filipino identity, hence it varies from individual to individual and their own experiences in relation to their exposure to the Filipino culture; hence the Filipino identities can be categorised by the choice of food or by how a house is decorated.

If identity must be understood in the plural, which is ideal and relevant in the case of the Filipinos, how can we then explain what happens when these identities are confronted with other identities? Stuart Hall offered an extensive understanding of the concept of identity carrying the notion of diaspora, and provided a different but undeniably popular term called hybridity:

Diaspora does not refer us to those scattered tribes whose identity can only be secured in relation to some sacred homeland to which they must at all costs to return, even if it means pushing other peoples into the sea. This is the old, imperializing, the hegemonizing form of ‘ethnicity’… The diaspora experience as I intend it here is defined not by essence of purity, but by the recognition of a necessary heterogeneity and diversity; by a conception of identity which lives with and through, not despite, difference; by hybridity. Diaspora identities are those which are constantly producing and reproducing themselves anew, through transformation and difference. (Hall as cited in Vertovec and Cohen)

By hybridity, Hall has made it clear when pointing out that there is some negotiation going on when two cultures stand face-to-face each other and that this results into having both cultures present. One thing that should be emphasised here is that people, specifically those who migrate, do not necessarily shed their culture; instead they join the cultural interaction and generate a new or hybrid form that has the features of both.

According to Hall, “culture is about ‘shared meanings’… and language is the privileged medium in which we ‘make sense’ of things, in which meaning is produced and exchanged… one of the ‘media’ though which thoughts, ideas and feelings are represented in a culture” (1). Thus, representation is “the production of meaning through language” (16). When we understand culture from this perspective, we then can see its connection with identity as has been stated above. Hence, culture and identity carry a certain notion of collective understanding, and that culture and identity, to a great extent, can be discerned with the help of a common language. It
is therefore vital that people share and comprehend the linguistic codes embedded in culture to be able to communicate these meanings. “Primarily, culture is concerned with the production and the exchange of meanings. The ‘giving and taking of meaning’ between the members of a society or group” (2). Having this framework, a reader will understand a text that either promotes the strengthening of the Filipino culture or the re-definition of it as long as they belong to the same culture. Hall further explained that,

two people belong to the same culture is to say that they interpret the world in roughly the same ways and can express themselves, their thoughts and feelings about the world, in ways which will be understood by each other. Thus culture depends on its participants interpreting meaningfully what is happening around them, and “making sense” of the world, in broadly similar ways. (Hall 2)

However, with great consideration to the production of texts of migrant communities in the blogs that I have analysed, it is assumed that the host country culture has been incorporated in the texts (hybridity). For example, a blogger in the US would have adopted some American culture in their blogs; the same goes with the bloggers in the Middle East or Europe as well as by “complex technologies, which circulate meanings between different cultures on a scale and with a speed hitherto unknown in history” (Hall 3).

**Blogs**

Blog is a shortened word for web log. Drezner and Farrel (5) explained that blogs are web pages that operate as a source of information and periodicals. Its functions are mainly related to how the author wants it communicated; this means that it can be about politics, fashion, or personal documentation of one’s life. From being a small community in 1999 it grew to several millions in the early 2000s.

For a period, people argued that there were more blogs or bloggers than audience. This also explains why personal blogs are slowly dying out, if not dead (Kottke “The Blog is Dead, Long Live the Blog”). However, Kottke pointed out that the blog’s DNA is entrenched in many social media platforms; hence many online newspapers or magazines adopt the feature, giving rise to the term multi-authored blogs (MABs).
Methodology

I have chosen Saussure’s semiotic analysis to look into the representations of Filipino identities in blogs. My motivation behind this is related to what Hall has mentioned about understanding culture and identity through language. Being a Filipino gives me the edge of seeing and knowing the linguistic codes that are reflected in the texts.

Saussure disclosed, “language is a system of signs” (Hall 36). Signs have two important elements, namely: signifier also known as the “idea or concept in your head with which the form was associated, and the signified, which is the corresponding concept it triggered off in your head” (36). The blogs were analysed using the signifier-signified components of signs.

Blog entries from three online magazines were used for the empirical data. I have initially chosen and analysed three blogs from each online magazine, however, due to the page limitations of this paper, I have decided to cut it down to two blog entries from each of the magazines. I opted to look for MABs, mainly because I realised that it was difficult to look for personal blogs that were still in activity. In addition, it was quite a challenge to just search for keywords such as: ‘Filipino blogs in Sweden’ or ‘Pinoy blogs’.

The online magazines that were chosen for this paper are: Positively Filipino1, The Filipino Expat2, and Illustrado Life3. I knew about the Europe based Filipino Expat online magazine from Facebook, so I thought that I would look for other Filipino online magazines outside Europe, thus, in my search, I found Positively Filipino that is based in America and Illustrado Life, a Dubai based online magazine. Before selecting the blogs from each of these magazines, I wrote to the people responsible, the editors, and asked for permission if I could analyse the texts of some of the blogs they have. All three online publications gave their consent and permission.

I made a simple selection strategy; At first, I wanted to only focus on the current submissions, that is, from 2014, however, this proved to be difficult, since I started looking for the empirical data between late March-early April, which meant that there were very few submissions at that time, so I expanded my criterion to 2013. I read most of the blogs that were available from 2013 to 2014, and as I was reading them, I could tell that many blog entries did not necessarily carry the concepts of migration and Filipino identity. Although it might sound subjective, the blogs that I have analysed have been selected according to what I thought would give an overview of Filipino identities.
Semiotic Analysis of Blog Entries

Blog 1 (Positively Filipino)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Signifiers</th>
<th>Signified</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Filipinos in Germany have established more than 100 civic organisations</td>
<td>Establishment of civic organisations present an image of safeguarding the Filipino culture; It can be argued that the Filipino family values are echoed through the formation of civic organisations, that is, civic organisations as representations of home, family, and belonging.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karaoke contests are a particularly popular form of social gathering.</td>
<td>Practices of culture and religion signify that the Filipinos in Germany do not want to forget their culture. The samples also state that women play a big role in terms of maintaining the Filipino culture.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church-based volunteer work is also widespread</td>
<td>A transnational connection is also shown in this sample. The Filipinos do not forget their roots and perform the values of sharing to the Filipinos in the home country.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karaoke contests are a particularly popular form of social gathering.</td>
<td>The activities are aimed at assisting the local Filipino community as well as raising money for charity projects in the Philippines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church-based volunteer work is also widespread</td>
<td>The Filipinos capitalized on the constructive cultural traits that have eventually been appreciated by the German society. They want the Filipino identities to be seen in their host country; proud to show the good cultural qualities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filipinos are well integrated into German society, viewed by their neighbors as hardworking, skillful and peaceful</td>
<td>75 percent of Filipinos in Germany feel they have no problems with cultural or linguistic adjustment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75 percent of Filipinos in Germany feel they have no problems with cultural or linguistic adjustment</td>
<td>Flexibility to integrate in another society and culture.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Blog 2 (Positively Filipino)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Signifiers</th>
<th>Signified</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In Rome, do as the Filipinos do</td>
<td>An allusion to “when in Rome, do as the Romans do,” however the phrase deliberately refers to the obvious practices of the Filipino community in a foreign city. Be a Filipino wherever you are. Familiarity of culture as performed by immigrants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We smile knowingly at each other</td>
<td>Recognition of physical traits and perhaps even the way we move, affirmation of each other’s existence without knowing one another. Being friendly. Hello, my fellow Filipino!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My countrymen are dispersed all over the city and by late morning I’ve walked passed a delivery man lugging trays of bread; a maid walking a frisky poodle, reining it in Ilonggo; a gardener with shears entering a house and a shop clerk opening a store.</td>
<td>The high tendency of Filipinos working in the service sector (locals’ homes or private companies). The Filipinos as labour migrants. The Filipinos run the city.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For the most part when they avert their eyes from their work or charge and see me, there is recognition and a smile.</td>
<td>Friendliness and acknowledgement of one another’s existence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>many greeting each other in the various languages after a week of not seeing one another</td>
<td>Belongingness to certain groups. Instead of using the national language, local languages are used to mark one’s affiliation and culture. Exclusion/Inclusion. A good example how diversified the Philippines is.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some have their children along, speaking Italian</td>
<td>The children of the Filipino immigrants bear the culture of the host country. The children most likely consider Rome as their home. There is an apparent practice of foreign language at home in this sample.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>arroz caldo</em> (rice porridge), <em>pancit</em> (stir-fried noodles), <em>cuchinta</em> and <em>puto</em> (variety of rice cakes)</td>
<td>Familiar taste, smell. Home in food.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We have a way with smiles and showing genuine affection</td>
<td>Repetition of smiles all through out the text provides the repeated simple action given by one to another irrespective of one’s affiliation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In their church, every Filipino Mass is packed.</td>
<td>Strong religious devotion. The dispersed community becomes a big family, the church their home.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>our countrymen still seek a sacred space to get some bearing amid the harshness they go through and find peace.</td>
<td>The church provides the space for spiritual healing. Strong connection of Filipinos to Catholicism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the irony of loving our country and its people much more when we’re far away from them</td>
<td>Nationalism is stronger when one is abroad. Camaraderie among fellow immigrants as extended family or only family outside the homeland.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Blog 3 (The Filipino Expat)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Signifier</th>
<th>Signified</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Discovering your new home, experiencing an entirely different world</td>
<td>The usual first meeting with the host country. Discovering the unfamiliar and the distance to the past. Cultural shocks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nourishing new relationships, becoming a jaded resident in your new country</td>
<td>Process of finding one’s self and eventually adopting new culture.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Settled in</td>
<td>Knowing the language, has a job, practicing a foreign culture.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Absence of friends and family</td>
<td>Aloneness. Family and friends are special to every Filipino; one is a member of a collective.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acculturation eventually leads to changes- in behaviour, culture, customs</td>
<td>The Filipinos as migrants are also like chameleons. They know how to adapt to the present environment, however one wonders which Filipino culture is left out during the acculturation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and values… second culture.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feel a slight derision towards your own culture and countrymen</td>
<td>One sees the bad side of the past and the good side of the new culture. Starts to find balance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Send money back home</td>
<td>Collective responsibility as a common practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Best Chinese restaurant, sari-sari store (a Filipino variety store/small</td>
<td>Finding home in another familiar culture (The Filipino culture has influences from the Chinese culture); the store represents a haven, it sells culture.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>supermarket)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filipinos will always welcome a kababayan</td>
<td>A Filipino home is open for a fellowman as part of a family, belongingness.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
We are all crusaders, those of us who leave the Philippines. The word ‘crusader’ is a rather strong concept. Here, the writer is explicit that Filipino émigrés are reformers or those who want to change something.

We naturally kept our many Filipino traits, like being faithful Catholics, hard-working, frugal, friendly and helpful, and always smiling, and many (traits) were ditched- no more bahala na, may bukas pa naman, Diyos na ang bahala, pikon, sige-sige, happy-go-lucky (come what may, there is still tomorrow, God will make a way, short-tempered, taking unnecessary risks). The positive traits are usually the ones that are kept in order to have space for improvement. This also reflects the use of the word crusader.

We did not merely adapt to our new home country, we integrated and blended with it. The writer explains that they have undergone several levels of embracing their host country and its culture.

We spoke only Norwegian with our children- it is our family language wherever we are. We are Norwegian citizens. We instilled hardwork and diligence in our children. Language is a strong representation of culture, and in this sample, it is rather clear that the family identifies themselves with the Norwegian culture. Although both parents are Filipinos, they raise their children as Norwegians and define themselves as Norwegians, non-Filipino. The last sentence reflects the previous sample of keeping the positive Filipino traits.
**Blog 5 (Illustrado Life)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Signifier</th>
<th>Signified</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maria Clara or Gabriela Silang</td>
<td>Maria Clara represents the ideal Filipina woman: religious, quiet, innocent, and beautiful. Gabriela embodies the strong-minded Filipina. This dichotomy represents well the image of a Filipina. However, one is based on fiction, while the other is based on a real person. From this perspective, Gabriela Silang represents a more realistic identity of Filipinas, while Maria Clara can be seen more as a representation of the author’s ideal woman.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The virgin or the whore? The maid or the madam?</td>
<td>Another dichotomies; one that has biblical roots and the other on power relations. The virgin also resonates the image of Maria Clara in this case. The whore can be understood as a transformation of a Filipina from being good to bad. The maid and madam binary relates to power in terms of social status. To be a maid is a typical job for many Filipina migrants. The madam can represent empowerment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You are loyal, compassionate, and helpful. But you tend to be meek, overly complacent, and incredibly easy to please.</td>
<td>Another gender-related binary descriptions that carry the notion of universality. From this argument, these descriptions can be applied to any woman across cultures. Hence, the identities of a Filipina show resemblances with other women, that is, a Filipina has equal qualities with other women with different cultural backgrounds.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Be assertive at the workplace, know how to demand of what you are worth</td>
<td>This sample draws upon hierarchy. The Philippines has a strong vertical culture, and in this case, the Filipina woman is asked to break away from this thinking and adopt another view on how she sees herself. However, the sample can also be attributed to going back to memory, particularly, in relation to Gabriela Silang.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Be wise; be very, very, wise. Filipinas are sometimes weak when it comes to matters of intimacy and romance. The use of ‘very’ to emphasize the repeated word ‘wise’ gives a strong warning for deceit. It also implies that Filipinas are more emotional rather than being rational.

Your remittances help your family, stimulates your home country’s economy. Remittances represent the connection or ties of the migrant Filipina to the Philippines. The sample also reflects that Filipinas contribute to household expenses and income as well as being professionals or skilled workers.

You are not just an ATM machine, invest in yourself and future. A warning about the problems that many migrant Filipinos face. The sample also implies to not just concentrate on the collective mind-set that we have in our culture, but also to welcome the idea of the importance of being an individual.

Integrate your belief system with the customs and traditions. Learn to be mindful of their values. An advice to be wary of her host country’s culture. The sample also suggests hybridity.

The west is not your moral compass; your common sense is. However, in this sample, it is strongly proposed not to forget one’s own values, and in this case, to make use of the Filipino cultural traits when necessary.

Be proud to be a Filipina. Wear it like a badge of honor, or perhaps more appropriately, a crown. Yours is the blood of the survivor. Your people have overcome tyranny, discrimination, dictatorship, and classism. To put it simply, the writer advises to not forget the Filipino identity.
Blog 6 (Illustrado Life)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Signifier</th>
<th>Signified</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pinoy life</td>
<td>Practice of the Filipino culture in a foreign land</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>we still observe Filipino customs and traditions and instill Filipino values in our children</td>
<td>Strengthened nationalism are transferred to the offsprings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>we make sure our children do not to forget Catholicism.</td>
<td>Religion plays a big role in maintaining one’s culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filipino value of family and the importance of close family ties. Lastly, the value of hospitality and helpfulness, we extend support or offer help to others</td>
<td>Bayanihan and the concept of family as a group. With the practice of bayanihan, one sees the value of caring.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>communities are quite active; they celebrate Independence Day, Halloween, and the Christmas holidays. They also conduct outreach programs that help the poor and orphans of Tanzania.</td>
<td>Clear mixture of influences on the Filipino culture. The Independence Day provides a more nostalgic and nationalistic celebration, while the other 2 are from Western cultures. Adaption to a new culture and adoption of other practices show how flexible the Filipinos are both abroad and in the homeland.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>but this is home</td>
<td>Integration in to the new culture. Acceptance that one is no longer within the familiar territory.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>teach your children the culture of the Filipinos, especially the language. Don’t let them forget their origin so that they will grow up with sense of Filipino identity.</td>
<td>Transfer of culture to the next generation to keep it alive and flourishing. Maintain one’s identity is important, to be able to belong, connection to the roots.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Discussions

Blog 1 provides an encompassing overview on how the Filipino community in Germany safeguards their identity. The concept of home and family, can be argued, is reflected in the establishment of many organisations; it implicitly states that organisations serve as the extended families of Filipino immigrants. Religious belonging is also a clear component of continuously practicing one’s culture; family and friends import even the karaoke-culture to cater to the entertainment tradition. Women seem to perform gender roles as protectors of culture. Helping the less fortunate is also a common Filipino trait, and we even have a particular Filipino word that describes this, bayanihan. It also seems clear-cut that hybridity is very much pre-
sent among the Filipino community in Germany. This could be because that we have a long history of migration that we acknowledge the importance of taking some culture from the new place.

Blog 2 is very familiar to me, since I have experienced what the writer has experienced. There is a big Filipino community in Rome, which is why it is almost effort-free to identify a Filipino even from a distance. This blog is from a perspective of an outsider; hence it can be argued that he is only looking for the Filipino culture around him. However, just like blog 1, there are many apparent cultural practices performed by the Filipino immigrants and one of them is religion that occupies a good amount of space as well as in Rome. The children of the Filipino immigrants who speak Italian are a representation of a multi-cultural home. Again, there are traces of hybridity even in blog 2.

Blog 3 features the cultural interactions or negotiations that one is confronted with; a cultural transformation that Hall pointed out in the previous section. It is a process that one has to go through, especially when the immigrant begins to realise the differences in both cultures, and which ones are necessary to take into consideration to learn and appreciate.

Blog 4 is very much different from the first blogs. Here it is very explicit that the writer made a strong choice of embracing the Norwegian culture that it is even passed on to the children. However, they have selectively kept some Filipino values and traits and have harmonised it with the Norwegian culture. The interesting point in this blog is the conscious decision of welcoming another culture; understanding that there is a necessity to do something radical in order to, perhaps, survive in another culture and integrate in it. Can one argue hybridity in this case? I would say yes, and this is even a clear process of transformation as compared to gradual acceptance of another culture.

Blog 5 focuses on Filipina women in Dubai. Basically, the blog starts with many binaries and stereotypes of women in general and famous Filipino women, both fictional and real. The blog advocates the importance of not losing one's self, culture, and identity; however the writer strongly suggests that Filipino women must also learn to validate the presence of another culture and make use of it for their own good. There is a distinct support from the writer to welcome another culture and find the balance, so the Filipino women do not lose their sense of identity.

Blog 6 is another example of hybridity wherein the writer is very open about his choice of recognising his place, his home in a new land. However, it is very much noted that the Filipino identities, the good ones, are practiced and transferred and instilled upon the children. The writer has pointed out that it is important for the children of Filipinos residing abroad to know their roots, their culture, and identity.

Conclusions and Recommendations

It is evident in the blogs that the Filipino values, tradition, culture, and identities are strongly upheld and practice, however it is also very clear that the Filipinos embrace the culture of their host country. The Philippines is a very diversified country, this could be one important reason why it is easy for us Filipino immigrants to welcome
change, transformation and become hybrid. To answer the question if the Filipino identities are strengthened or re-defined, the answer to this is both. The Filipinos seem to make use of the positive traits inherent in the culture to maintain a good portion of one's identity. The Filipino identity is also gallantly maintained and practiced for survival and integration in the host country, hence I will argue that this way, the Filipino identities are strengthened. However The Filipino identities are also redefined in the sense of acknowledging that being in a foreign land, one must learn to be conscious of the other culture that exists. The redefinition happens during the process of cultural interactions, hybridity, and when they see themselves transforming, either by radical choice or adjustment.

Hence, one can argue that the Filipino identities vary from place to place. A good example of this is reflected in the blogs on Dubai and Rome, which is mainly because of the strong cultural differences in these two countries. A hybrid Filipino identity in Dubai might not necessarily appreciate the hybrid identity of a Filipino in Rome. Nevertheless, since there is a strong advocacy in the blogs to hold on to one’s Filipino identities, then it would be quite straightforward for Filipinos both in Dubai and Rome to accede and see the qualities and traits of the Filipino identities.

Blogs play the role of mediating stories and experiences between groups; they act as bridges between scattered communities. Thus blogs can be tools for communicating the Filipino identities both on how to hold on to it and to acquire and welcome new identities.

The empirical data for this paper is very little; therefore it cannot be assumed that the paper is representative of the whole Filipino global community. Hence it is highly recommended that a more extensive study on the role of blogs or other social media tools in representing identities as a whole and in particular cultures. The importance of such a study lies in the argument that globalisation is a strong force that affects our identities. Are we moving towards a single identity or are we becoming better at transforming our culture into a more hybrid feature?

Notes
1. Positively Filipino fills a need not only in cyberspace, but also in our own consciousness. As Filipinos become more visible and acknowledged worldwide, we need to let each other and other people hear our stories and ideas. We need to share our dreams and aspirations and be part of the global community. We need a site where people can find anything Filipino, good stories and good writing, one with a Filipino voice and perspective that will make us proud to be Filipino. (http://www.positivelyfilipino.com/magazine/2012/12/01/welcome-to-positively-filipino)

2. Apart from the cover story, our sections include travel, fashion, health and wellness, relationships, diplomats, recipes, expat interviews, expat issues, legal advice, readers’ corner, events and other topics relevant to our life in Europe. We also have features on business and investments. We also highlight the achievements of Pinoy in Europe in different fields. At the same time, we are promoting the Philippines to Filipino expats as well as their counterparts through our stories on tourism, business and investment. We aim to be the number one source of expat information for almost one million Filipinos in Europe. Through our magazine, we hope to inspire, engage, inform and guide our kababayan here in Europe. (http://thefilipinoexpat.com/about-us/)
3. Living the progressive Pinoy life around the world. From the Middle East to the rest of the world, IllustradoLife shares the different stories of Filipinos working and living outside the Philippines. With the many facets in the lives of international Filipinos, IllustradoLife creates an interesting read and builds an interactive global venue on the worldwide web. It also allows readers to follow the up-to-date reports and features about fashion, travel, lifestyle, issues, events and Filipino community gatherings from its mother publication, Illustrado Magazine. Illustrado is a unique lifestyle-community magazine published out of Dubai, United Arab Emirates devoted to uplift the morale and the image of Filipinos around the world. The slogan ‘Taas Noo, Filipino’ and the vision of ‘Helping the Filipino flourish – global vision, native soul’ define the substance, style and corporate ethos that has helped Illustrado gain respect and recognition in the Gulf region as a wholesome, positive, highly engaging and richly visual medium that has accorded due respect and recognition to the Filipino community. (http://www.illustradolife.com/?page_id=2)
Going Forward with Feedback: 
On Autonomy and Teacher Feedback

Maria Freij & Lena Ahlin
Kristianstad University

Abstract: Language teachers often complain that they are becoming “composition slaves” (Hairston 1986) spending an inordinate amount of work on giving feedback on students’ texts. This might be particularly true of L2 teachers as several studies indicate that students prefer teacher feedback to peer feedback, particularly in L2 learning (Zhang; Hyland). While the ultimate goal of teacher-written feedback is an independent and self-regulating, the risk of “over-dependence on teacher feedback lower[ing] the students’ initiative” (Miao, Badger, and Zhen) looms large. This paper probes the limits and implications of teacher feedback focusing on the question of whether teacher feedback generates dependent students. Through a discussion of three cases, we ask: when does feedback go from being constructive to impeding development of independence? This idea of dependence is further considered in relation to current debates about the rise of “therapeutic education” in which students are discussed in terms of “vulnerability” (Füredi; Ecclestone and Hayes). We conclude by suggesting that the challenge for teachers is not to assume the role of therapists but to encourage reflective education through clarity about academic goals, and making explicit the crucial role of autonomy for successful student progression — in and beyond the university setting.

Introduction

This paper probes the limits and implications of teacher feedback focusing on the question of how teacher feedback can generate independent self-regulating students, and what type of feedback is desirable in a tertiary-education framework. The idea of independence is further considered in relation to current debates about the rise of a generation culturally unaccustomed to overcoming obstacles, and one with different expectations of the responsibilities that being a student entail and thus, in turn, what the role of the university lecturer entails. As Yang Miao, Richard Badger and Yu Zhen suggest, an “over-dependence on teacher feedback [will] lower the students’ initiative and lead to fewer self-initiated corrections” (192), a risk that threatens the ultimate goal of teacher-written feedback: a student who is able to assess her own work critically and successfully edit her own text. This paper thus problematises the feedback process and through three brief cases, we discuss the gap between teacher- and student expectations on the academic writing process.
One of many possible starting points for a problematisation of feedback effects is Etienne Wenger’s “Components of a social theory of learning,” which acknowledges that learning is in turn linked to practice (learning as doing), identity (learning as becoming), community (learning as belonging), and meaning (learning as experience). In acknowledging that writing skills are the key that opens many an academic door, it is a useful exercise to discuss Wenger’s diagram from a writing perspective.

In exchanging “Learning” for “Writing,” in the particular context of our discussion, we aim to establish a framework in which writing is discussed from a variety of perspectives: writing to belong in the academic community; writing and scholarly identity; writing as meaning-making; and writing as a scholarly practice. All these aspects are crucial in the quest for the autonomous student: for the student herself and for her lecturer. Particularly, then, we are interested in how feedback — especially teacher-written feedback — functions in terms of building self-regulating autonomous students.

**Figure 1: Components of a social theory of writing**

![Diagram of components](image)

Adapted from Wenger 1998

We thus propose to approach writing in a manner that makes explicit the connection between *practising* and *practice* through this holistic lens; that is to envision writing as:

1. Belonging in the academic community;
2. Becoming — a writer with a scholarly identity;
3. Experience — by understanding writing as meaning-making practice; 
4. Doing — whereby writing is performing scholarly practice and -identity 
   (adapted from Wenger).

If autonomy and independence are the goal, it is necessary first to gain an un-
derstanding of the cohort. Amongst the many articles published in newspapers and 
other popular media, it is not hard to discern a trend in how today’s generation is 
depicted. Are we in fact facing a generational cultural turn?

**Meet the “Me Generation”**

Our adaptation of Wenger’s framework presupposes an active participation on be-
half of both student and lecturer (or apprentice and ‘master’) whereby the student’s 
drive as well as the lecturer’s external scaffolding are necessary parts; however, this 
balance, or rather, the lack thereof, is becoming increasingly visible in today’s aca-
demic climate and in popular media.

In her two books, *Generation Me: Why Today’s Young Americans Are More Confident, Assertive, Entitled — and More Miserable than Ever Before* and *“The Narcissism Epidemic: Living in the Age of Entitlement* (with W. Keith Campbell), psychologist Jean M. Twenge focuses on young Americans born roughly between 1980 and 2000, clai-
ming that they are characterised by a much greater degree of self-focus and entitle-
ment than previous generations. Some reasons for this development are, according 
to Twenge, parenting, the Internet, and the celebrity culture in media (Interview 
with Lynne Malcolm 2014). Today’s parents tend to focus more on building self-
esteeem in their offspring than previous generations, wanting to make their children 
feel special and unique in the misguided (according to Twenge) belief that this will 
foster future success. The same ideas are reinforced by an influential entertainment 
industry and social media, which promote a view of the individual as a brand name 
to be marketed. The great importance placed on the self in social media plays a 
great role in the behavior of this generation and, says Twenge, “reality TV-stars make narcissism seem normal” (Interview with Lynne Malcolm 2014).

This development is not unique to the United States. A recent book by Ana Udovic, *Generation Ego: Att fostras i en narcissistisk kultur*, identifies a similar trend here in 
Sweden. Issues of parenting are addressed by Udovic too, as the behaviour of the 
present generation is considered to be produced by anxious so-called “helicopter 
parents” always hovering over their children, ready to save them not only from 
danger, but from boredom and hard work. In Sweden, they are known as “curling 
parents” — a term coined by Danish psychologist Bent Hougaard to describe pa-
rents who sweep away any difficulties that their young ones might encounter (Hou-
gaard). These parents, it is claimed, have over-protected their children and taught 
them that self-centeredness pays. In other words, it is the previous generation that 
responsible for over-protecting these children and for failing to teach them to act 
independently and to persevere in the face of difficulties. In *The Dangerous Rise of 
Therapeutic Education*, Kathryn Ecclestone and Dennis Hayes talk about the “thera-
peutic” turn in education, which they trace from preschool to the university (as school and workplace). As a result, students’ feelings of inadequacy, stress and inability to cope, responses that were previously considered ‘normal’ challenges for anyone beginning a university education, are now being pathologised. For example, “school exams have been criticized on the grounds that they create stress and other illnesses among children” (Füredi 8). In short, to these scholars, the university, which was once the stronghold of reason and the pursuit of knowledge, is now becoming preoccupied with feelings; what Frank Füredi refers to as a “culture of vulnerability” in which individuals learn to interpret the world through the prism of emotion.

It is thus reasonable to conclude that the students who enter university today do so with different expectations and competencies than previous generations. Furthermore, Swedish primary and secondary education have recently undergone changes that have an effect on tertiary education as well. According to the Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) 2012, Swedish 15-year-olds score lower than the OECD average in mathematics, science, and reading. One of the reasons for this is that the Swedish schools fail to fulfill the goal of equality3 (Skolverket 2012). According to the political opposition, it is the rise of charter schools since the 1990s that has led to increased segregation and schools focusing on profit rather than education (Sveriges Radio 2013).

Here at Kristianstad University, the students we meet often come from a non-academic background and some may, in fact, have chosen to study because the alternative would be unemployment. Jobs are scarce and competition is fierce, and many young people are ill prepared to meet the demands of the job market. This is a very bleak picture and no doubt it is reductive and stereotypical; the point is, though, to suggest that many of them (luckily, there are also many exceptions) have been let down by the previous generation and that we as teachers need to keep this in mind in order to support them in the best possible way, and that we need to identify the tools by which they can regain their autonomy and agency. In Ungdomsbarometern 13/14 (Simonsson and Horn af Rantzien 2013), respondents were asked a series of questions regarding their abilities; the selection of responses below paints a grim picture:

### Table 1: Selected responses from Ungdomsbarometern 13/14

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How good would you say you are at:</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Understanding complex concepts and relationships</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working independently</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning and organisation</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting a deadline</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(5 = very good; 1 = not at all good; answers in %). Source: Ungdomsbarometern 13/14, p. 54
Notably, we are looking here at between 19 and 43 per cent of respondents who self-report being average or below at performing tasks that are key in the academic environment, and which are key in writing within the academic environment. The evidence for students being ill-prepared for the task at hand is worrying on many levels, not least in terms of the assessment that they will undertake during the course of their studies.

A note on assessment

The Structure of the Observed Learning Outcomes, or SOLO taxonomy, first described by John Biggs and Kevin Collis in 1982 (Biggs N.D.) famously classifies learning outcomes in terms of complexity and is an assessment tool in terms of evaluating the quality of student work, but also helpful terms of course design when it comes to the implementation of structural alignment.

If we envision first the level at which the student is intended to be at the completion of a course (or task or program), we must take into account all the required sub-skills they need first be able to master. Our reason for referring to the scheme here is to highlight that what are considered to be higher-order skills belonging to the relational and extended abstract abilities, are in fact where our pass grade begins: it is not sufficient to name and identify, nor to describe — our learning outcomes concern analysis and application, comparing and contrasting, explaining and justifying as well as the ability to create different types of text. In order for the most basic assessment criteria to be met, higher-order skills are necessary, yet we see student work that is purely descriptive in focus, with a glaring lack of analysis and justification. Arguably, the extended abstract skills are especially applicable to the assessment criteria for a pass with distinction grade (VG), where the ability to hypothesise and theorise are key aspects. For students nearing the completion of their degree, the essay absolutely requires extended abstract skills also at the pass level.

Guiding students to becoming life-long learners, critical thinkers, and independent agents in their pursuit of knowledge and understanding and giving them the tools to continue this journey once the scaffolding of the learning institution is removed, ought then to be our primary goal. Meeting criteria such as “The student is able with independence to construct original arguments, to contextualise, and to provide discussions of intellectual depth,” which is lifted from our assessment criteria for the essays that our first-year English students are to produce, require that the students take responsibility for their learning process and that we as lecturers do not settle for lower-level skills in lieu of the required ability critically to analyse.

A further point is that we view critical writing skills as the effect of critical thinking skills. If we are truly interested in shaping autonomous life-long learners, we must acknowledge that what we are providing them with is not the end result, but the ability with independence to tackle the world outside academia: we are not simply shaping a scholarly practice within the walls of the university, but merely laying the foundation for their future endeavours.
In light of the evidence in favour of a changing cohort, it is worthwhile to consider the influences on teachers in their meeting with students. Richard James highlights that “the higher education process not only shapes student expectations, the education process itself is influenced by the character of student expectations” (4); he further stresses that “massification and related trends have partially eroded the traditional reference point for standards” (4). What we see, and which we shall soon turn to with explicit examples, is a gap in the feedback that students want and expect and the type of feedback that encourages autonomy. The feedback that students request, in our experience, largely related to the lower levels of understanding in the SOLO taxonomy, and though these levels may perhaps lend themselves more easily to direct feedback than the higher levels, the problem lies in that students who do not master the lower levels of understanding, as our cases will show, continue to expect and demand direct feedback.

Feedback as an arena for the teaching — learning dialogue

Feedback is a crucial arena for the teaching–learning dialogue, in which issues of dependence/independence, scholarly practice, and the assumption of a scholarly identity are played out. We provide here a brief review of the research on teacher-written feedback in order to reach some conclusions about the implications this has for our work in the classroom.

In 1996, Professor John Truscott’s review essay in the journal Language Learning called “The Case against Grammar Correction in L2 Writing Classes” argued that error correction is harmful and should be abolished. This article sparked a debate about the role of teacher feedback (corrective feedback) in language learning that is still ongoing. The majority of writers in response to Truscott’s provocative statement, have by contrast found that written correction of errors can help learners improve both their drafts and their longer-term writing ability (e.g. Ferris 1999, 2004, 2010; Chandler 2004, 2009; Ellis et al. 2006; Bitchener 2008; Bitchener and Knoch 2009, to mention just a few).

During the past decade there have been many attempts to broaden this research base with studies seeking to answer the question of what type of (written) feedback is most helpful for students, and is likely to enhance not only the text at hand, but also lead to greater accuracy in future work (so-called ‘incremental’ learning). In fact, an article on Scholarship on L2 writing in 2011 (Silva et al.), named feedback as one of the year’s most significant trends.

Below, we provide a brief summary of the differences between direct and indirect feedback, problematising some of its aspects.
Table 2: Feedback: how and why?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Direct: Sentences are recast</th>
<th>Indirect: Coded feedback</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student is provided with corrected text.</td>
<td>“Subject-verb agreement,” “Word choice,” “Refer to the referencing style guide,” etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May lead to the student’s work meeting assessment criteria, albeit superficially as the question of autonomous production has been compromised and the student cannot demonstrate that s/he masters the ability individually to meet assessment criteria.</td>
<td>May not lead to the student’s work meeting the assessment criteria as the student may or may not be able to 1) decode the feedback and 2) self-edit and self-regulate to an acceptable standard. Making explicit the feedback process can be a remedy to aspect 1. Autonomy is not compromised in this model.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We note here that though the feedback given when an assignment is submitted may be summative in that it does provide an evaluation of where the student stands, it should function formatively by providing the tools for the student independently to raise the text to a level that meets the goals: as self-regulating learners, which is our goal, “actively interpret external feedback, for example, from teachers and other students, in relation to their internal goals” (Nicol and Macfarlane-Dick 200). We thus aim to increase autonomy by providing external feedback that in conjunction with students’ internal goals creates a platform for their socialisation into the academic environment whereby they are able to negotiate meaning as well as their academic identity through the process. As such, through writing as doing — as the means of the negotiation of meaning — they increasingly find their place in the academic community.

Current research does not offer conclusive evidence on feedback practices, but it points slightly in favour of indirect over direct feedback (Bitchener & Knoch). Those who suggest that indirect—or coded—feedback is more effective than direct feedback—when the teacher provides actual recasts of sentences—argue that it requires students to engage in guided learning and problem-solving and, as a result, promotes the type of reflection, noticing, and attention that is more likely to foster long-term acquisition (Ferris & Roberts).

On the other hand, one of the main arguments presented in support of more direct types of feedback (by, for example, Chandler) is that direct feedback is more helpful to students because it reduces the type of confusion that can occur if learners fail to understand or remember what the feedback is saying. For example, in situations where error codes are provided, it is argued that students may not always understand or remember to what they refer.

Crucially, feedback ought to be framed as a dialogue—as a way for teachers and students to communicate about their mutual interest: that of improving the text, which also decreases the risk of teachers becoming “composition slaves” (Hairston). As David Nicol and Debra Macfarlane-Dick argue:
One way of increasing the effectiveness of external feedback, and the likelihood that the information provided is understood by students, is to conceptualise feedback more as dialogue rather than as information transmission. Feedback as dialogue means that the student not only receives initial feedback information, but also has the opportunity to engage the teacher in discussion about that feedback. (209)

The success of feedback does not, then, depend solely on intention—even the best-constructed feedback is pointless if the student is unable to understand it—but crucially on the success on behalf of the student to conceptualise it, which itself requires independent effort. This effort can nevertheless be facilitated through discussion and dialogue. In order to make sure that the external feedback becomes internalised, and builds on students’ “own internal constructions of goals, criteria and standards” (Nicol and Macfarlane-Dick 208), which is exactly the practice we aim to cultivate, we encourage feedback to be regarded as a crucial arena for the teaching–learning dialogue.

The three cases to which we now turn problematise the teaching–learning dialogue: the cases demonstrate less-successful feedback scenarios. Our discussion then turns to possible causes and consequences, and to future directions needed to remedy issues such as these.

**Three feedback scenarios**

**Case A**

A was a student at the Master’s program in English at Kristianstad University. The students in this course were offered eight group seminars on writing followed by individual tutorials in which feedback was given both orally and in writing. The feedback offered began with idea development, and continued with argument cohesion and editing (cf. Ferris); comments were both ‘global’ (about the text as a whole) and ‘local’ (about specific instances of text).

In this case, teacher feedback did indeed lead to quite a few revisions, indicating a high degree of dependence on teacher feedback. Feedback on global issues, for example concerning the presentation of results and factors to include in the analysis worked better than the feedback on language. To exemplify, the plural form of nouns was consistently incorrect and indirect feedback — in the form of electronic margin notes — were made highlighting the noun in question and stating that ‘plural form’ should be used. Student A treated the feedback not as indirect requiring critical engagement with the language, but instead as direct (recasts) and replaced all nouns with the words ‘plural form’ or ‘plural’ where this was provided in the margin note. The essay submitted for examination thus contained sentences where the words ‘plural form’ replaced key concepts in the text.

**Comment on Case A:**

There are several implications of this behaviour that need further scrutiny. To begin with, a student who is used to receiving direct, corrective feedback may be used to working with text in such a manner. Rather than rephrasing and editing the text, a stu-
dent who has previously received corrective feedback may continue to do so even in situations where it is not appropriate, which ultimately means there is no critical thinking underpinning the critical writing.

Throughout the writing process, response from the teacher was given in indirect form, and/or as suggestions and questions, rather than the more directive imperative form, in order to encourage independent work and invite the student to make decisions about the text and to encourage the student's ownership of the text. The open-ended nature of the feedback given in the questions made it impossible for the student to incorporate them into the text without reflection and active decision-making. Evidently this practice entails the risk that the student misunderstands or simply ignores the feedback at hand. While direct feedback may work for students at a very low level of proficiency, who may not be able to self-edit successfully (Hyland), it is reasonable to expect a student at this level (and arguably at any tertiary level) to be able to deal with the kind of indirect comments provided. Giving direct feedback entails other risks, as the issue that “teacher response may appropriate student text if it is too directive” (Bates, Lane and Lane in Shin 363). In an article the role of grammar correction in a writing class, Sang-Keun Shin states that there has to be “a process of negotiation of meaning” to avoid text appropriation (Shin 363). This negotiation of meaning is best achieved by indirect forms of feedback and is key within the framework we adopt here.

In this context, we also need to consider peer-reviewing, which has been the focus of a great deal of attention in recent years. Language teachers and researchers often stress that peer reviewing offers a more equal learning situation than the hierarchical one of teacher and student, and that it can take place in a less formal and more supportive milieu. Furthermore, it may stimulate the engagement, cognitive conflict, and social activity that Agneta Svalberg claims are significant aspects of language learning, though it is has also been noted that “teachers are much more effective in identifying errors or misconceptions in students’ work than peers or the students themselves” (Nicol and Macfarlane-Dick 208).

Clearly, peer reviewing may have an important role to play in language learning and it fits very well into the process-writing paradigm; however, the problem of dependence occurs in connection with peer reviewing as well and the case of Student B indicates potential risks involved.

Case B

B was a student in an English literature course with a focus on writing at Kristianstad University. The students were asked to read four novels in English and produce a short paper on each of the novels. They were asked to work in pairs and provide comments on one another’s work according a peer review sheet asking them to focus on an introduction providing a brief background to the research question and its relevance; a clear formulation of and development of the argument; a coherent structure; and a conclusion creating a sense of completion by referring back to questions raised in the introduction. They were also asked to give comments on grammar and style. Student B had submitted two versions of her paper and had received comments from both teacher and peer reviewer. When she submitted the final version of her paper for examination, she accidentally submitted a draft version on which a person outside of the boundaries of the course had provided extensive electronic edits using tracked changes as well as comments in the form of margin suggestions. When queried about the submission, the
student said that her draft had been corrected by a friend who was claimed to be “very good at English” and appeared surprised that there was any issue at hand as the corrections had “only related to language”.

**Comment on Case B:**

This example points to a number of problematic issues. There are researchers, such as Fiona Hyland (2000), who see asking for help from, for example, spouses, or friends who might be native speakers or at least more proficient than the writer in question, as something positive as it shows that the student is actively seeking to expand her/his knowledge and that receiving constructive criticism in a relaxed and friendly setting is potentially beneficial; however, the example of Case B raises again the question of text appropriation. This is slippery ground: just when does a text cease to be the student’s own? The question is further complicated by the grading criteria’s requirement of independence, or, the level of student independence may be used to distinguish between a pass grade and a pass with distinction. These aspects are thus necessary to problematise in the interest of legal certainty required from Swedish university teachers as our employment is as public servants.

We have no conclusive answer to the question of how to avoid situations like this, but what we see here seems to suggest that direct feedback is also potentially problematic if we teach this as a practice as it may then be seen as an acceptable form of help to receive even outside of the course. As a step in clarifying to students that help in completing any writing assignment is not allowed outside of what is offered within the explicit framework of the course, we composed a handout that is now distributed to students at all levels. It may be that case that making explicit these boundaries is crucial in terms of aiding students’ enculturation into the academic environment.

In addition to Cases A and B, which deal with linguistic aspects specifically, we now turn to a case in which we highlight the demands of a student for direct feedback, but direct feedback arguably related to the independent critical thinking underpinning the critical writing.

**Case C**

Student C was writing a final-year essay in linguistics. The essay was not passed due to a number of fundamental flaws on which as much feedback as possible was given — as some sections were in initial draft form or missing entirely, the examiner could not always provide comments. A series of over thirty emails followed between the examiner and the student, in which the student requested feedback lying outside of what the examiner can provide. The student asked a variety of questions, all showing a lack of independent engagement with the text, and with the research project as a whole. The feedback had stated that the results and analysis were descriptive rather than analytical; the student here asked for an example of what it should look like, a question that is simultaneously large and vague.

A subsequent email showed that the student was neither deconstructing nor attempting to deconstruct the feedback. The student claimed to be aware that the essay structure was not good, but asked what was meant by “lack of internal logic,” a term that is part of the grading criteria. The student fails to connect this terminology to the further feedback regarding structural problems.

Further, the student asked about how old the literature in the theoretical background should be, suggesting 1980 as a reasonable cut-off year. The further feedback provided explained that the age of the literature is content- and context-dependent, in
an attempt to clarify to the student that the topic of investigation dictates the reading that must be undertaken. The student’s reply showed no critical engagement with the feedback, instead providing thanks for the information that it is the context that matters, not if the literature is recent or not.

Following this response, clarification was given regarding context dictating what material is used in a theoretical background since the question of whether the research is relevant is directly related to the topic. The student again responded by asking for an example.

**Comment on Case C:**

Student C is a highly dependent student who does not embrace the components of a social theory of writing. The case highlights specifically a gap relating to the components of writing as meaning-making and as a scholarly practice as the student wants “the key,” but is unable to recognise what lock it opens: the questions essentially ask for direct feedback, when the task demands independent thought and any feedback thus has to be indirect, taking into account scope and context especially.

It is also relevant to consider that purely formative feedback has been provided to this student—in the form of supervision—but that the examination process is seen by the student as merely another opportunity for formative feedback when by definition it has also to be summative as it evaluates the student’s performance to be graded. Asking for examples at this stage is indicative of a highly dependent student, who is unable to engage with the construction of not just the essay, but of research material read for the theoretical background, which would presumably make helpful examples. Further focus on the difference between “results,” “analysis,” and “discussion” is necessary in cases like this where the lack of understanding of terminology translates into a lack of practical application and vice versa.

We have identified possible approaches to make explicit the stages of the process to students and are developing an extensive course compendium, which, in addition to standard information about requirements, deadlines, and assessment criteria, will clarify the rights and responsibilities of students, supervisors, and examiners, including a discussion of the aspects of independence involved in a final-year essay.

**Discussion of cases**

The issues discussed here have many facets, but we reduce them for the purpose of this discussion to being twofold: these students are, firstly, unable to assess the level of their own knowledge; that is, to distinguish between lower and higher levels of understanding; hence, they are unable to identify the gap between their current level and the level at which they will meet the pass criteria. Secondly, and perhaps as a consequence, they do not understand that direct feedback may not be possible. Since these higher levels demand independent critical work, and since they are aspects related to context, producing an assignment that meets the criteria may perhaps not even be possible without the teacher interfering with the text at a level that de-autonomises the student. Alternatively, there are risks of the feedback focusing on lower-level skills as higher-level skills may be entirely absent, echoing the risks that feedback “might focus on low-level learning goals or might be overwhelming in quantity” (Nicol and Macfarlane-Dick 208), the latter aspect being a risk when the gap to be bridged is large. The students may not be able, in the sea of feedback, to navigate and to find the reference point necessary for development. This suggests
that students that are far from meeting the goals may not realise the amount of work required to meet criteria, and rather see the feedback as items to tick off rather than as a process requiring critical reading, thinking, and writing.

Another gap appears to as a notable in the context of this discussion. The paradigm shift from teacher-centered to student-centered, or from teaching-centered to learner-centered approaches, means a shift of power from teacher to student, and hence a shift of ownership as well as an increased level of demands of activeness on part of the student (O’Neill & McMahon). Arguably, a student-centered approach is irreconcilable with practices that de-autonomise the student. It seems what the three cases have in common is the passivity displayed, whereby direct feedback is expected, indirect feedback is read as direct, and the students attempt to relinquish power and ownership of their work. This is reminiscent of a traditional structural framework in which the teacher primarily holds the power and the student has a low level of choice. Communicative teaching and student-centred learning demand, arguably, more of both teacher and student, but the cases here do not reflect a sense of ownership on behalf of the students. In terms of life-long learning, in the recognition that what we are aiming to provide our students with is not the ability to complete an assignment that requires critical reading, thinking, and writing skills, but a mindset that makes them critical thinkers and learners in the long term, it seems these students are unable to recognise that giving them what they demand would actually be a disservice and would mean that they have not met the learning goals even if the text itself would meet the requirements due to a too-large level of external assistance. A key argument of Nicol and Macfarlane-Dick’s is that students are already assessing their own work and generating their own feedback, and that higher education should build on this ability. … This shift in focus, whereby students are seen as having a proactive rather than a reactive role in generating and using feedback, has profound implications for the way in which teachers organise assessments and support learning.

(199)

The proactive role of students is one that we have not seen in the cases described here, and leads us to the following questions, which we will be exploring in future work:

1. How do we support students’ proactive engagement with their texts?
2. How does feedback move from monologue to dialogue?
3. How do we build on students’ existing ability to generate their own feedback?

An in-depth understanding of the cohort is key here and we acknowledge that feedback works both ways—improving the dialogue with the student body is imperative to increasing our understanding of these complex matters.
Conclusion
A discussion of feedback requires a holistic perspective taking into account a multitude of aspects; here, we have focused on notions of dependence and vulnerability in the student cohort and have argued that the former is partly a product of the latter: the discourse of vulnerability victimises the student and has negative consequences on student agency as the power balance is shifted. Ecclestone stresses that “[t]he rise in vulnerability claims is leading academics to become more lenient. Some withdraw assessment demands or soften their feedback;” in this vein, we argue that framing education in a discourse of vulnerability will be counterproductive for both students and their teachers. Such a discourse can thus not only have dire consequences for assessment, but beyond: if students are not given the tools to become life-long critical thinkers, academia, too, has let them down.

What students want, then, is not necessarily what they need, as these cases of a desire for direct feedback have shown: if we want our student to meet the learning goals, we have to demand autonomous engagement, and the way forward here can only be via indirect feedback. Below, we visualise how feedback is integrated into the process as a crucial component of the schema proposed.

Figure 3: The feedback cycle

The framework we propose here, we thus visualise as a circular process, in which all components are equally important: if one component is missing, the circular flow is interrupted and progress is not possible. Feedback affects not just one of the components but all — for example, feedback on the practice of writing will impact not only on creating meaning at the text level, but also on the students’ sen-
se of belonging in the academic community and equally their scholarly identity as part of this community. We stress that the cognitive conflict underpins this model: critical engagement is necessary for the students’ development of these skills. Without it, the parts of the whole will no longer be interconnected.

To put it provocatively, we suggest that students not be given what they want. Research points us slightly in favour of indirect feedback, but what we have identified here is the impossibility of direct feedback in relation to the learning goals that are to ensure students are not simply capable of performing isolated tasks, but that they become life-long learners equipped with transferable knowledge. We see indirect feedback as an activity that engenders reflective learning and independence, and encourages students to assume responsibility for their own work. All of these are vital components of a scholarly identity and a scholarly practice.

What we mean is this: do not let this generation down once again by sweeping all the obstacles in their way, but encourage them to seek knowledge independently. Clear instructions through the teaching of feedback will give students a feeling of empowerment and accomplishment. With systematic scaffolding in the form of indirect feedback, even a ‘vulnerable,’ dependent student could take on the challenges of academic life. Indirect feedback is constructive as it requires the students to work actively with their own texts. There are other values at stake here than simply language correctness, and which relate to good scholarly practice, namely actively to seek knowledge and assume responsibility for one’s own learning process. What is perhaps most important about giving indirect feedback is thus the practice it engenders.

As teachers, we might need to start considering teaching more explicitly the feedback process, so that students know what to expect from it and have a clear sense of what we expect from them. Furthermore, not only do we need to remember the proactive focus on form, achieved through the teaching of grammar, but make sure that there is cohesion between the various modules offered as part of a full-term course, and progression throughout the various stages of education.

Additionally, in order to be able to self-assess and benefit from the feedback given, the learner needs to understand the goal, where they stand in relation to the goal, and how to get there. This can be made clear if we bring teaching and assessment closer together and familiarise the students with the assessment criteria; this can be done through reading-writing activities, text deconstruction and analysis, text improvement activities, and so forth (Icy Lee).

Liberal arts subjects are often criticised for lack of connection to actual working life, for their lack of ‘usefulness’, but we would like to suggest that teaching our students good scholarly practice, such as taking responsibility for their own work, setting realistic goals, and being able to assess their own strengths and weaknesses, are valuable skills that might promote empowerment as well as career opportunities. Just as we must continually assess and reassess our approaches, methods, and practices, so too must our students in order that a genuinely reflective and autonomous practice be engendered.
Notes
2. Also referred to as “lawnmower parents”.
3. Swedish “likvärdighet”.
4. Ungdomsbarometern 13/14 (The Youth Barometer 13/14) is a survey of Swedish school-leavers’ attitudes regarding tertiary education, future careers, and life paths. While we find many of the report’s statements and values highly problematic, some of its data is, nevertheless, useful for the understanding of today’s cohort.
5. $0 =$ do not know, and has not been included in this table.
6. A further step would be to engage in a problematisation of whether respondents’ views on what constitutes ‘working independently’ corresponds to the expectations of and in the tertiary-education framework.
7. We recognise that students may not be able without explicit explanation to distinguish the different roles of the supervisor and the examiner; what we argue here is rather a mismatch between what students are able to recognise as their independent contribution and the feedback that can be provided is the underlying issue; some students have a tendency to hand back ownership to the supervisor and the examiner alike, as exemplified here in the demand for explicit “examples” of “what analysis looks like”.
8. This student knows to ask for examples, and that we need to exemplify as part of our teaching responsibilities. What she fails to see is that the examples have been provided and that direct feedback would remove the independent component.
9. This is arguably less the case for Student B, who may have realised that the level of English is not of a sufficiently high standard to meet the criteria; however, rather than engaging with the text and individually raising the standard to meet the criteria, this student seeks external help to bridge the gap. As such, the criteria of independence is not met.

Works Cited


Skolverket. “Kraftig försämring i PISA.” PISA 2012.


Truscott, John. “The Case against Grammar Correction in L2 Writing Classes.” 


—. “The effect of error correction on learners’ ability to write accurately.” 


Abstract: My paper discusses the double narrative of modern detective fiction: the crime and the investigation and how this can be utilised in the literary theory classroom at undergraduate level. It argues that there are strong similarities between the process of detection and the reading process. As the reader joins the detective in assessing clues and false trails and in making connections between seemingly unrelated facts and evidence, he makes the story his own. Based on Jacqueline Winspear’s first novel in the ‘Maisie Dobbs’ series (set in the aftermath of World War One), I explore the relationship between the story of the crime and the story of the investigation and how the reader connects the two. Because the crimes in modern detective novels about World War One are almost invariably connected to events that took place during the War, the reader also gains valuable insights into one of the most cataclysmic events of the twentieth century.

The double narrative of detective fiction, the crime and the investigation, makes the detective novel an excellent tool in the undergraduate literary theory classroom. The strong similarities between the detection procedure and the reading process provide a fruitful ground for students to practise literary criticism. With the aid of a historical detective novel set in England in the aftermath of World War One, namely Jacqueline Winspear’s award-winning Maisie Dobbs (2005), I demonstrate how three literary theories, text-, context- and reader-based, enable students to gain new insights into both the nature of literature and the reading process itself. For the text-based theory, New Criticism has been chosen, for the context-based, Historicism, and for the reader-based, Reader Response. Students at Kristianstad University, who have limited experience of detailed literary analysis, use Steven Lynn’s excellent introductory work, Texts and Contexts: Writing About Literature with Critical Theory (2010). Literary analysis is similar to detective work: close attention must be paid to detail, the evidence must be analysed, and conclusions drawn. Where the novel focuses on a particular period — in this case, World War One, students can also gain valuable insights into major historical events.

The popularity of detective novels has steadily increased from the 1920s, the so-called “Golden Age” of detective fiction, and currently accounts for nearly 60 per cent of popular fiction sales. Historical detective fiction is particularly popular. As Jim Huang, editor of The Drood Review and owner of the Deadly Passions Bookstore in Kalamazoo, Michigan argues, historical detective fiction, “is the strongest sub-genre
within the mystery field I’ve seen in the last five years, and it shows no sign of wa-
ning. It’s stronger than ever.”6

The two stories of detective fiction have been described by Tzvetan Todorov as follows: “the first — the story of the crime — tells ‘what really happened,’ whereas the second — the story of the investigation — explains ‘how the reader (or the narrator) has come to know about it.’”7 The detective is the central figure. As Most and Stowe argue, the detective is “the figure for the reader within the text, the one character whose activities most closely parallel the reader’s own, in object (both reader and detective seek to unravel the mystery of the crime), in duration (both are engaged in the story from the beginning, and when the detective reveals his solution the reader can no longer evade it himself and the novel can end), and in method (a tissue of guesswork and memory, of suspicion and logic)”8

The focus in the following discussion is on the private investigator Maisie Dobbs in the novel of the same name. The action takes place in 1929. Maisie Dobbs is the first in a series of nine books in which Maisie is the protagonist. What does Maisie discover about the crime, and what methods does she use? These questions will be explored with the aid of the three literary theories, New Criticism, Historicism, and Reader Response. The basic principles of the theories will be briefly outlined before studying two extracts from the novel. The focus here, as indeed in detective novels in general, is on the investigation because this is where the parallel activities of the detective and the reader are seen most clearly. It should be noted that while this article focus on just two extracts, students would be required to read the whole novel as part of their course. They would also be encouraged to select passage of their own for analysis and to bring these up in class for discussion.

The three theories: a brief outline

New Criticism

One of the most important features of New Criticism is “close reading,” in which special attention is paid to images, symbols, repetitions, opposites, contradictions, and other stylistic devices as a means of identifying and understanding both the message of the text and its unified structure. New Critics’ basic assumption is that there is a clear meaning in the text, which can only be identified by close reading. In the case of Maisie Dobbs, what is the main message? What special skills has Maisie honed both during and after the War? What textual clues demonstrate how she uses her knowledge of the War to understand the criminal? Throughout the series, the crimes investigated are invariably related to the War.

Historicism

Historicists emphasise that the message of the literary work is best understood by careful examination of the historical context of the work itself and of the plot/action. In the case of Maisie Dobbs, close attention must be paid to the state of England in the aftermath of World War One. How were people thinking? What did they fear? How had England changed as a consequence of the War?
Reader Response

For the Reader Response critic, meaning is created by the reader and not the author. It is our environment, education, interests and experience that determine how we understand a literary text. There is no definitive meaning in a text; all readings are, in fact, “misreadings” to a greater or lesser degree. What do students know about World War One? How do they perceive war in general? To what extent and in what ways can their experience influence their perception of Maisie Dobbs, her character and methods?

The above three literary theories require different skills, presenting students with very specific problems. New Criticism, for example, necessitates a good knowledge of linguistic and stylistic devices; Historicism entails painstaking research and an ability to use sources of different kinds: history books, memoirs, diaries, letters, historical records etc.; and Reader Response requires that students can utilise personal experiences to understand the text while at the same time bearing in mind that it is the text itself that is paramount. Their analysis must maintain an objective critical style even when it is based on personal experience. I hope to show in the following that detective fiction provides rich opportunities to practise all three theoretical approaches.

Maisie Dobbs Extract One: The Crime

As with all the Maisie Dobbs novels, the crime originates in the War. Maisie is commissioned by Christopher Davenham to investigate if Celia Davenham, Christopher’s wife, is conducting an affair. Maisie soon discovers that Celia spends her time not with a lover but in visiting a cemetery. The latter contains mysterious graves, the occupants of which have two things in common: they have only a Christian name, and they all once lived at a home known as “The Retreat,” a refuge for soldiers who were severely disfigured during the War. Maisie is suspicious and decides to investigate the home. Placing her assistant, Billy Beale, as a spy, she learns that the manager of the home, Major Jenkins, abuses the situation of the inmates by charging them excessively high fees; he also basically holds them as prisoners. If they try to escape, they are executed for what Jenkins describes as “desertion”. Buried in the cemetery with only a Christian name, they are hard to trace.

The passage below describes the scene at the end of the novel when Billy is caught trying to escape from The Retreat. He is about to be executed. The court martial, described in just a few pages, is a replica of earlier bogus courts martial conducted by Major Jenkins over the years. Billy is on a platform, close to a wooden structure that turns out to be a gallows.
Maisie gasped as she scanned the tableau before her. A sea of men were seated on chairs, facing a raised platform with a wooden structure placed upon it. With their damaged faces, once so very dear to a mother, father or sweetheart, they were now reduced to gargoyles by a war that, for them, had never ended. There were men without noses or jaws, men who searched for light with empty eye sockets, men with only half a face where once a full formed smile had beamed. She choked back tears, her blue eyes searching for Billy Beale.

As the rising sun struggled against the remains of night, Maisie realized that the wooden structure was a rough gallows. Suddenly, the men’s faces moved. Maisie followed their gaze. Jenkins walked towards the platform from another direction. He took centre stage, and raised his hand. At his signal Archie and another man came towards the platform, half guiding, half dragging, a blindfolded man between them. It was Billy. As she watched, Billy – jovial, willing Billy Beale – who surely would have given his life for her, was placed on his knees in front of the gallows and held captive in the taut hangman’s noose. It would need only one sharp tug from the two men working in unison to do its terrible work (262-3).

**Student tasks: New Criticism**

Students should be encouraged to note the stylistic devices in the above passage, including the metaphor “a sea of men” in l.1., which emphasises the large number of men present and the fact that they are a “fluid” mass rather than individuals. Students should also consider the order in which “mother, father or sweetheart” (l. 3) appear: the first mentioned often being the most important. What implications does the ranking of the three people have for our understanding of the nature of the crime?

What is a “gargoyle” (l. 3) and how does it suggest ugliness?

Why does the narrator choose “searching” (l. 6) rather than “looking for”? The extra intensity of “searching” is subtle but also very important as it highlights the degree of Maisie’s desperation.

The contrast between the “sun” and “night” in l. 7 is also significant. Maisie brings sun with her to dispel the darkness of the court-martial and the agony of its witnesses. Again, the order here is important: sun comes before night, suggesting that it will be victorious. The reader understands that the ending will be a happy one.

The repetition of “half” in l. 10 underlines the urgency of Billy’s situation.

The adjective “jovial” in l. 11 is in sharp contrast with the scene on the platform. Two worlds are being juxtaposed as well as two different time periods: past and present. Why?

The adjective “taut” in l. 13 serves to emphasise the urgency of Billy’s position. He is already close to choking. Maisie Dobbs knows that she has only a few precious minutes in which to save her assistant’s life.

Punctuation is also important in New Criticism. There is, for example, no need for questions or exclamation marks in the passage: the nature and urgency of the
situation are abundantly clear. Students should be encouraged to consider how urgency is heightened in this scene. One of the chief means is the length of the sentences. As Jenkins approaches, for example, they become shorter (ll. 7-9), matching Billy’s laboured breathing and emphasising the imminence of death.

**Student tasks: Historicism**

When applying Historical Criticism to the above passage, students might focus on ll. 2-6, which can act as a starting point for investigating how the medical services coped with mutilated soldiers at the end of the War, how World War One marked the beginning of plastic surgery, and how the English public perceived mutilated soldiers (a common sight on the streets of most British cities and towns). It would also be useful to consider the function of courts-martial during World War One. How does such knowledge heighten the reader’s understanding of the scene? What were the proper routines at courts-martial during the War? How does the scene in the novel deviate from a “normal” court martial in 1914-1918?

To gain a proper understanding of the historical context, students should be encouraged to consult the works of such well-known historians as Gordon Corrigan (*Mud, Blood and Poppymock*, 2004), Richard Holmes (*Tommy. The British Soldier on the Western Front 1914-1918*, 2004), Samuel Hynes (*A War Imagined. The First World War and English Culture*, 1990), Gary Sheffield (*Forgotten Victory. The First World War: Myths and Realities*, 2002), and Jay Winter (*The Great War in History. Debates and Controversies, 1914 to the Present*, 2005; and *The Legacy of the Great War Ninety Years On*, 2009). Memoirs such as Harry Patch’s *The Last Fighting Tommy. The Life of Harry Patch, The Only Surviving Veteran of the Trenches* (2008) can also provide useful contextual information. Where students consult the internet, guidance should be given in how to select reliable sites, i.e. those produced by academics or other experts within the field. The Imperial War Museum’s centenary site (*iwm.org.uk*) and the British Broadcasting Corporation’s centenary site (*bbc.co.uk*) are cases in point.

**Student tasks: Reader Response**

In terms of Reader Response, l.3 in the above extract is particularly important. To what extent can students empathise with the reference to “mother, father or sweetheart”? Have they seen what a hangman’s noose looks like, or read stories about it? How calm would they be if they knew someone dear to them was choking to death and dependent on their making the correct decision? Have they read similar stories that might influence their perception of the scene, and if so, which ones and how might these influence their interpretation?

Having completed the above tasks, I would encourage students to identify which theoretical approach gave them the deepest insights into the crime and Maisie’s ability to solve it without loss of life. I would ask them to explain their answers and to consider the possibility of using more than one theory at the same time. What are the advantages and disadvantages of combining two or perhaps even three theories?
The value of such discussions can be enhanced by reference to other passages taken from the novel.

By applying all three theoretical approaches to the above extract, students are able to identify different features of the text and recognise the particular contributions that each theory makes to their understanding. It is important to emphasise, particularly for undergraduate students, that one’s response to the text should always take precedence over the theory itself; theory is a tool and not an end in itself.

Having discussed and analysed the crime itself, the student is better able to understand the second story of detective fiction, the investigation. The above three literary theories can be used with equally good effect to identify the nature and significance of different steps in the investigation process.

**Maisie Dobbs Extract Two: The Investigation**

The extract below describes Maisie’s first visit to The Retreat. She is interviewing Major Jenkins prior to planting Billy Beale in the home as a spy. She has already noted that the guests are known by first name only, is curious why this is the case, and asks the Major for an explanation.

"Ah yes. Reminds them of better times, before they became pawns in the game of war. Millions of khaki ants clambering over the hill and into oblivion. The familiarity of using Christian names only is in stark contrast to the discipline of the battlefield, of this terrible experience. Relinquishing the surname reminds them of what's really important. Which is who they are inside, here." He held his hand to the place just below the rib cage to indicate the centre of the body. "Inside, who they are inside. The war took so much away."

Maisie nodded her accord and sipped her tea. Maurice had always encouraged judicious use of both words and silence.

/. . . /

She left The Retreat thirty minutes later /. . . /

Maisie questioned Jenkins’s approach. True, it seemed a benevolent idea, and she knew how successful the “holiday camps” had been in France, providing a resting place for wounded men struggling to return to peacetime life. But the fine glaze used on tin moulded to fit a face ten years younger now provided little respite from the mirror’s reflection (228-230).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>“Ah yes. Reminds them of better times, before they became pawns in the game of war. Millions of khaki ants clambering over the hill and into oblivion. The familiarity of using Christian names only is in stark contrast to the discipline of the battlefield, of this terrible experience. Relinquishing the surname reminds them of what’s really important. Which is who they are inside, here.” He held his hand to the place just below the rib cage to indicate the centre of the body. &quot;Inside, who they are inside. The war took so much away.&quot;</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maisie nodded her accord and sipped her tea. Maurice had always encouraged judicious use of both words and silence.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/. . . /</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>She left The Retreat thirty minutes later /. . . /</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maisie questioned Jenkins’s approach. True, it seemed a benevolent idea, and she knew how successful the “holiday camps” had been in France, providing a resting place for wounded men struggling to return to peacetime life. But the fine glaze used on tin moulded to fit a face ten years younger now provided little respite from the mirror’s reflection (228-230).</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Student tasks: New Criticism**

Students could be asked to consider word choice in the selected passage: what does the word “pawns” in l.1 signify, for example? What is the purpose of contrasting “game and War” (l.1)? It should be noted that “game” comes first, highlighting its special importance. Students could comment on the metaphor of the “ants” l.2, which suggests large numbers engaged in a thoughtless and arduous task. It is significant that Major Jones uses the verb “relinquishing” in l. 4, which is so much more powerful than merely “abandoning” because it denotes a deliberate giving up. Why does Major Jones repeat “who they are inside” in ll. 5 and 6? Does it suggest that he knows and sees more than others, for example? What is the purpose of the adjective
“judicious” before “words and silence” in l. 7? Having read the entire novel, students will know that silence is a very important strategy for Maisie. This passage makes it clear that Maisie has drawn important conclusions during her period of silence.

**Student tasks: Historicism**

Students might consider how people were thinking in the 1920s. What did they fear? How had England changed as a consequence of the War?

They could look up the numbers of soldiers who died both in major attacks such as the Battle of the Somme in 1916 (nearly 60,000 died or were wounded on the first day alone) and in the War as a whole (over 60 million dead or wounded) — in this way, they can better understand the full significance of the reference to “millions” clambering into “oblivion” (l.2). By looking up the number of soldiers buried in France or Belgium and subtracting the total from the number of graves, students will understand that many either disappeared or were blown to pieces. Mourning was difficult and particularly painful when there was no body to bury.

Major Jenkins knows that Maisie will understand the suffering to which he is referring thanks to her period of service as a Voluntary Aid Detachment (VAD) nurse during the War. A number of useful historical sources about VADs and women’s contribution to the War are available, including Nigel Fountain’s *Women at War* (which also contains a CD, 2002), Ann Kramer’s *Women and War* (2004) and Lyn Macdonald’s *The Roses of No Man’s Land*, 1993). Official internet sites such as firstworldwar.com and iwm.org.uk archive may also be consulted, both of which contain useful archival material.

**Student tasks: Reader Response**

Given that war is an integral part of modern life, students applying Reader Response theory might be encouraged to consider the differences between warfare in 1914-18 and today.

Some students, and certainly many British ones, will have read World War One poetry by Robert Graves, Wilfred Owen, Siegfried Sassoon and Edmund Blunden: how does the picture of the War given in *Maisie Dobbs* compare with that given in the War poems?

The reference to the ageing process in l.14 might also interest the students: the soldiers who returned from the War were approximately the same age as that of many university students. How important is appearance in your twenties? What does it mean for building relationships? How might it feel not to be able to face yourself in the mirror (l.14)?

***
In applying the above three theories — text-, context-, and reader-based, students are encouraged to pay attention to the details of the text, and apply their critical faculties to understanding the features of the crime and its perpetrator while at the same time following each stage of the process of investigation. They learn not only to identify the salient features of both stories but also to appreciate their mutual reliance. The second story (the investigation), invariably takes precedence over the first, the crime itself. Throughout Maisie Dobbs, the narrator emphasises Maisie’s different techniques: her use of silence, meditation, her mirroring of the posture of witnesses in order to understand their thoughts, and her methodical categorisation of clues and evidence. Attentive readers make attentive detectives as they pit their wits against the fictional detective — sometimes, indeed, even solving the crime before the detective does. Such painstaking attention to detail gives both pleasure and satisfaction. It produces knowledge about how to read and understand literature while at the same time giving the reader a deeper understanding of the subject itself — in this case, World War One. Detective fiction is one of our most popular genres. It deserves a more prominent position in our university syllabi not just because it gives pleasure but because it has such tremendous potential for teaching students how to develop their reading and analytical skills.

Notes
2. See my An Introduction to Literary Theory and the English Canon. This was originally designed for Master's students of English at Ningbo University, China, but has subsequently been revised for use on the undergraduate course in literary theory at Kristianstad University: http://webshare.hkr.se/maj/ningbo/LiteraryTheory and Writing an academic essay on literature.pdf (accessed 5 April 2014).
Works Cited


Montage as a Method of One Ancient Text Organization

On text structure of the Book of Daniel from the Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium

Alla Kozhinova & Alena Sourkova
Belarusian State University

Abstract: Modern text linguistics focuses on the problem of a mixed text, its inhomogeneity, heterogeneity that is traceable on the levels of both content and form. One of the effective methods of a mixed text creation is a montage of text types, when the various models of the text organisation come into mutual contact.

This phenomenon is traditionally considered as an example of the texts generating within the culture of postmodernism and digital literature. However, the history of the Bible translations into the East Slavic vernaculars (in late 15th – early 16th centuries) demonstrates a unique case of the montage usage for more adequate transference of the canonical text original structure. It is the Book of Daniel translation from Hebrew into so called prosta(ja) mova, presented in the handwritten Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium (F 19–262).

Textual analysis of this monument gives us the opportunity of assuming that the translator used a previously made Church Slavonic translation that has been incorporated into the structure of the text in prosta(ja) mova. As the result, some new text types, different in grammar, lexicon, and status, appeared inside the new composed text that can be thus qualified as heterogeneous.

Montage as an interaction of the text types: a modern approach to the problem

Contemporary text linguistics is actively developing the theoretical aspects of text typology. Specification of the typological units of textual analysis presupposes empirical research of specific speech works, their systematisation, and classification. Mentioned typological units are designated as Textsorte, Textgenre, Texttyp, Textklasse, etc. (in German text linguistics, where this terminology appeared due to the comprehensive studies of E. Gülich, W. Raible, F. Lux, influenced by P. Hartmann, M. Bense), or text types or modes, text classes, text forms, field-related genres, etc. (in English speaking linguists, see: E. Werlich, E. L. Smith, J. M. Swales, S. Eggins, J. R. Martin, D. Y. Lee).

In this study, text type is a conventional, historically established pattern for the texts with similar structural and functional features. Each text type has its own system of special attributes. Specific text work exists as a representative of the appro-
priate text type. Relations between a specific text work and its generating model are described by the category of prototypical/typological intertextuality (Sandig 105-109). This kind of intertextuality implies the openness of the text types to each other and creates typologically motivated relationships between the texts. These relationships assume that a specific text work is intertextually correlated with the certain text type and with other texts of the same typological belonging. In the first case, references occur within the system of similar texts as a result of the invariant attributes actualisation. In the second case, intertextual references, motivated by the certain text canons, appear.

Projection of such references into projection of intersection and interaction of the different text invariants actualises research of the text types’ heterogeneity. Description of the heterogeneous text formations is one of the leading trends of modern text linguistics.

One of the most effective methods of the text types’ heterogeneity creation is their montage. Due to montage, the attributes of several text models are detected in a text structure. Thus, montage is a connection of different text works that belong to different text types. Connected into one text structure, these text works express the unified function. A new text work appears, and by its functional and formal qualities it can be attributed to the multiple text models.

Now this text may take a privileged place among the other texts of the same text type, and its addressee (a reader/listener) will focus all cognitive and communicative efforts on allocation of this text among the others, on its identification and understanding. Creation of the typological intertextuality becomes a special strategy that helps to exert influence upon a recipient, who must “guess the signals of certain dominant qualities of a text and — increasingly — the individual style of the author” (Goncharova 29). Introduced into the heterogeneous text due to montage of the different text works, information will be interpreted depending on the addressee’s cognitive and communicative competence. It is a factor that has an influence on the heterogeneous text’s efficiency and duration of exposure upon a recipient.

At the same time, the choice of the diverse text types, their modifications and integration into a coherent integrity, analysis of the attendant effects gives the possibility to reveal a phenomenon of creativity of the author. Thus, projection of psycholinguistic and cognitive vector to the intralinguistic elements allows to establish the adequate text typologies. And the notion of discursive personality is placed in the forefront. It is both author and recipient, who correlate a text work with a wide cognitive, cultural, social and historical space.

Mobility of the text frames in the communicative sphere, the ability to transform the text canon is a relevant condition for successful communication, including the process of migration of significant texts from one culture to another in the time continuum. One case of such migration seems to be of a special interest, because it is a unique example of the Biblical text reception, including reflection on its text structure.
The Book of Daniel as a heterogeneous text: basic dichotomies

It's notorious that the Book of Daniel contains two well observable but difficult to explain dichotomies. The first one reveals itself in literary forms (narratives and visions), the second one — in languages (Hebrew and Aramaic).

Specificity of the text structure is determined that the Book of Daniel is a mosaic text — ten episodes with varying languages, styles, and genres. It is divided into two parts: the first part (Dan 1–6) contains six stories about Daniel and his friends, written in narrative folk style in a specific chronological sequence; the second part (Dan 7–12) includes four apocalyptic visions revealed to Daniel and grammatically expressed in the first person.

Linguistic feature makes the Book of Daniel notable in relation to other books of the Old Testament: this book contains parts in two different languages: Dan 1.1–2.4a is in Hebrew (until the word אֲרָמי, ‘in Aramaic’), Dan 2.4b–7.28 is in Aramaic and chapters 8–12 are once again in Hebrew). The presence of Aramaic text in the Book of Daniel is defined by the scholars as the most remarkable and inexplicable phenomenon.

In the late 19th century, Fr. Lenormant theorised that originally the entire Book of Daniel was written in Hebrew. Later its Aramaic version (Targum) appeared and its fragments were subsequently used to replace the lost original chapters. As the argument the proponents of this theory cite the example of an anachronism, recorded in Dan 2.4: Then spake the Chaldeans to the king in Syriack, O king, live for ever. Asserting that the Chaldeans in those days did not speak Aramaic (Syriack) but Assyrian, interpreters of this verse in Daniel supposed that the form in Syriack (ארמי) is functioning as a parenthesis indicating that the text in the appropriate language follows further. This verse should be structured as: Then spake the Chaldeans to the king [then the Aramaic text]: O king, live for ever.

The version that bilingualism of Daniel was the result of compilation of two books — in Hebrew and in Aramaic — has the followers in the contemporary Bible studies (see Miller 1991). Conclusion about the compilation character of Daniel is made on the basis of analysis of Dan 7.1-2a that was identified as an editorial insertion, anticipating text of visions (see Dan 7.1-2a: In the first year of Belshazzar king of Babylon Daniel had a dream and visions of his head upon his bed: then he wrote the dream, and told the sum of the matters. Daniel spake and said… As the arguments, scholars considered the fact of the grammatical 3rd person using before the subsequent narrative in the 1st person, as well as different terminology in comparison with the text of the seventh chapter (a dream and visions of his head upon his bedعم לי Vânית, עלי משכבת ארשбан, וחי) but vision by night (עלה משכבת ארשбан תנו, but vision by night) hereinafter (Dan 7.2, Dan 7.7, Dan 7.13)).

Textual and linguistic idiosyncrasy of Daniel was discussed in the concepts of "code-switching" in socio-linguistic approach (Rouillard-Bonraisin; Portier-Young), in its intertextual connection with the bilingual Book of Ezra (Arnold; Wesselius), in its pragmatic (primarily, rhetoric) strategy (Valeta). We are not going to review the problems of highly irregular state of the language and text of original Daniel. Our topic of interest is the text inhomogeneity in Daniel in the context of its reflection...
in the process of translation activity. The aim of the present article is to specify, if the translators of some novel translations of Daniel were able to understand the linguistic nature of their original and what elements of narrative structure, both formal and semantic, were lost, transposed, or transformed in these translations.

As known, both ancient and modern translations of Daniel into the major European languages don't retain bilingual character of the original. But in one case of translation into the East Slavic vernacular, this linguistic dichotomy has been represented. We are talking about a Cyrillic manuscript, known as the *Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium* (F 19–262) (approx. 1517–1533) — a copy of nine biblical books, translated directly from Hebrew.

Here, the Hebrew chapters are translated into so-called *prostafja mova* (lit. *simple language*), that was a writing and literary language of the Grand Duchy of Lithuania (1219–1795). The Aramaic text is in Church Slavonic.

**Text structure of the Book of Daniel from the Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium**

The *Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium* is a part of the manuscript from the Monastery of Suprasl, known as the *Vilnius Codex* (Vilnius, Wróblewskie Library of the Lithuanian Academy of Sciences, F 19–262).

Currently, some questions concerning the manuscript's dating, attribution, and historic significance seem to have some alternative solutions. The manuscript has been described variously as written in Belarusian, Ukrainian, and Russian in language (Wexler 1987). It was written down approximately in 1517–1533 by anonymous Orthodox scribes, but copied Old Testament books had been translated already in the second half of the 15th century. The manuscript was intended for a Christian audience in the Grand Duchy of Lithuania.

The translator had a clear idea about the bilingual composition of the *Book of Daniel* and tried to reproduce it demonstrating a thorough familiarity with several classical and new languages. He knew Hebrew and Aramaic (but he perceived the second one through the prism of his active knowledge of the first language (Archipov)), Church Slavonic and East Slavic vernacular (*prostafja mova*), Latin and Old French (Taube; Temchin), and some Yiddish (Altbauer). His well-developed language skills helped him to create a unique polyglottic translation, which has no analogues in the East Slavic literature.

As noted above, the original of Daniel is bilingual. This bilingualism was specially interpreted by a translator who used East Slavic vernacular for the text in Hebrew and Church Slavonic for the Aramaic parts (Evseev 130).

It is confirmed that translation into *prostafja mova* was made by translator on his own, while the Church Slavonic text corresponding to the Aramaic fragments was borrowed from one of the Slavic editions of the *Book of Daniel*, namely from so-called Methodius’ translation made before 885 (Evseev). That was done due to pretty utilitarian reasons: translator was going to speed up the translation process, or he was afraid not to cope with the language that was not familiar to him (interpreters of Daniel from the *Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium* accept that translator had a
command of Aramaic worse than of Hebrew (Archipov). A similar idea about pragmatic reasons of using Church Slavonic translation has been submitted in the 19th century by I. Evseev, but it was later rejected by M. Altbauer (4), and then by A. Archipov (170). It has been suggested that for transmission of the original Hebrew and Aramaic parts the translator used two written languages of the Grand Duchy of Lithuania — Church Slavonic and *prostaja mova*. But he understood their diglossia peculiarly: Church Slavonic was considered as more prestigious in comparison with *prostaja mova*, but it is correlated to that part of the original text, written in less prestigious Aramaic, while the text translated from prestigious Hebrew is in *prostaja mova*. Without disproving this proposition, we can suggest another version of the parts correlation.

If we are going to support with confidence the idea of the conscious use of Church Slavonic for translation of the Aramaic parts of Daniel and *prostaja mova* for translation of those in Hebrew, it is necessary to establish that these fragments should be completely identical. However, Dan. 1.1–2.4a and 8–12 is in Hebrew, Dan 2.4b–7.28 is in Aramaic, whereas the distribution of the Slavic parts is rather different: *prostaja mova* is a language of the chapters 1, 3, 8–12, and Church Slavonic covers the chapters 2, 4–7 (see Temchin).

One of the reasons of this disparity is in the fact that the Church Slavonic translation could not be used for the most of fragments translated into *prostaja mova*. In two extant manuscript copies of Methodius’ translation, verses 1.1–2, 9.5–19, 12.5–13 are missing (Evseev XV). Exactly these verses are translated into *prostaja mova* without using the Church Slavonic text.

Further, despite the fact that scholars implicitly refer chapter 8 to the fragments, translated into *prostaja mova* and not borrowed from the Church Slavonic translation, it is impossible to say that it was created disregarding this translation. So, in Dan 8.4 in the *Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium* one can read the following:

(1) **Vil.** – и видъхъ оного овена бодъишъ на морѣ и на сѣвѣрѣ и на оугѣ.

Similar fragment is found in Methodius’ translation:

(2) **Meth.** – и видѣхъ вѣчнѣ бодѣйнымъ на морѣ и на сѣверѣ и на оугѣ.

This identity is supported by the fact that the translation version на морѣ is not quite accurate. Hebrew יָם has the following meanings: ‘sea’, ‘the Red Sea, the Mediterranean (Sea), the Dead Sea’, but also ‘the West’ as the Mediterranean Sea lies to the West of Palestine (Brown 410-411). The assumption that the Jewish translator of this verse, who translated from Hebrew by his own, could make the same mistake as the Slavic translator, who translated from Greek (cf. ἡ θάλασσα ‘sea’ in this position), is not convincing.

Then, in Dan 8.5 translator of the *Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium* corrected the form Ⱡ ливы that is actual for Methodius’ translation:

(3) **Vil.** – и се козѣлъ кози градѣнѣ отъ запада на лице всѣхъ землѣ;

(4) **Meth.** – и се козѣлъ кози градѣнѣ Ⱡ ливы на лице всѣхъ землѣ.
In Meth., this form appeared in error as transliterated Greek λίβός from λίψ ‘Lieb, southwestern, south-west’ (Veisman 765) and it was naturally corrected by our translator. However, later in Dan 8.9 the same erroneous form was unnoticed by him and translation of the Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium followed the Church Slavonic text almost exactly:

(5) Vil. – възвелічися ізлиха на въстокъ и на ливъ;
(6) Meth. – възвелічися ізлиха и оугъ и на въстокъ и на ливъ.

It is also possible to confirm the fact of presence of the Church Slavonic (Methodius’) translation in the inner structure of the East Slavic Book of Daniel by means of analysis of the grammatical forms.

In particular, from the beginning of chapter 8 and up to Dan 9.5 (where Methodius’ translation ends off) the East Slavic unified forms in -л-, which were used for signifying of the past tense, are found only in those cases, where translator corrected Methodius’ translation by reason of its inaccurate reflecting (following the LXX) of the Masoretic text. Here are some of these cases:

(7) Vil. – Dan 8.8 а козелъ козлии возвеличилсѧ зѣло;
(8) Meth. – Dan 8.8 а козелъ козїи възвеселисѧ зѣло.

In this case, one can see the result of correction of Hebrew גָּדַל ‘to grow up, become great’ (Brown 152).

(9) Vil. – Dan 8.10 скинѣлъ на землѣ отъ силы и отъ звѣздъ и попра их;
(10) Meth. – Dan 8.10 и паде на землѣ сило и щвѣздъ и попра и.

Here the translator corrected rather delicately: the root נָפַל denotes ‘to fall’, but also has the meaning ‘to cause to fall’ (Brown 658).

From Dan 9.5 Church Slavonic aorist is used in the forms of 1 pl only (послѣшахомъ (9.6, 14), сокрѣшихомъ (9.8, 11, 15), оунечивихомѧ (9.15), etc.). Other verbal forms in this paradigm are the forms in -лгъ (говорили (9.6, 10), простѣпили (9.7), далъ (9.10), вѣдѣли (9.12), пришло (9.13), вчинилъ (9.14), etc.). Sometimes a link-verb быти ‘to be’ is retained in these constructions, but in modified form: сѣкрѣшили есмо, скирѣшили есмо, оучинили есмо, осомѣнилицы есмо (9.5), простѣпили есмо (9.9), просилъ есмо (9.13).

Up to Dan 9.5 participles are met in Church Slavonic form: хранишъ, любѣшъ, храниющимъ (9.4). From Dan 9.5 one can find the participles with East Slavic suffixes: овстѣпѣлачъ (9.5, 9.11), сѣдѣшымъ (9.7), etc.

This watershed is clearly visible when comparing Dan 9.4 and Dan 9.5:

73
Thus, the translator of Daniel from the Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium used a ready-made text up to the moment until Methodius’ translation ended. Further he translated by his own.

Using a ready-made Church Slavonic text, the translator amended it according to the Masoretic original.

In Dan 6.2, an obvious mistake was corrected:

(13) Meth. – да была ёры агави не вълалы;
(14) Vil. – да была царю шкоды не вълалы.

Really, in the original text we read Aram. נְזַק here with the meaning ‘to suffer injury’ (Brown 634).

Dan 6.18 (6.19 in the Masoretic original) was corrected as well:

(15) Meth. – и брашна не внесоша емоу;
(16) Vil. – игрици не внидоша передъ него.

Lexeme игрици corresponds here to Aram. דַּחֲוָה that denotes ‘diversions, musical instruments?, dancing girls, concubines, music’ (Brown 1087). In Theodotion’s translation of Daniel into Greek, this word has been interpreted as ‘meal’ (see Gesenius. Electronic resource) and appeared in this meaning in Lucian Recension that was a basis for Methodius’ translation. Compare: ἐδεσματα < ἐδεσμα ‘meal, food’.

Aram. עֲצַב – a participle with the meaning ‘pained’ (Brown 1107) – was corrected in Dan 6.18:

(17) Meth. – къ данилю гласомъ къткышъ въпн;
(18) Vil. – данила гласомъ смутнымъ закликал.

In this passage, a predicate verb in -л is used without a link-verb быти, that is a regular feature of prosta(ja) товъ and an indirect indication that, at least, this correction was a result of creativity of translator of the Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium.

In Dan 5.25, translator changed the words of the inscribed message according to the Masoretic original:

(19) Meth. – мани текъл фарес;
(20) Vil. – мишне тькел 8фирсинь.
Thus, the translator of Daniel from the Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium used a ready-made text up to the moment until Methodius' translation ended. Further he translated by his own.

Using a ready-made Church Slavonic text, the translator amended it according to the Masoretic original.

Chapter 3 in the Book of Daniel is very peculiar from the point of view of the nature of translation. At first sight, this chapter denies noted above proposition that our translator found difficulty in translating the Aramaic text, so he used the ready-made translation to speed up his work. Although chapter 3 is in that part of the Book of Daniel, which was written in Aramaic, its text differs from Methodius’ translation. However, its linguistic characteristics differ essentially from the idiolect of those parts that are written in prostaja mova. For example, in chapter 1 the name of the Babylonian king has a form of навхаддонисоръ (Dan 1.1) and новхадненанъ (Dan 1.18), whereas in chapter 3 (up to Dan 3.31) the king is called нъвъхадненанъ (compare: Newuchad-necar in the Nesvizh Bible by Symon Budny (Bud.)). The name of one of the Jewish children in chapter 3 is presented as мѣшах, whereas in chapter 1 it is recorded as мяшах (Dan 1.7).

Chapter 3 comprises Polish lexical forms: не дбаєм (Dan 3.16) (compare: Polish dbać ‘to take care’ (Mayenowa 1969, 4: 561); see niedbany oto собячыны тобіе адповядзялі (Bud. 3.16)), в каптърех (Dan 3.21) (Polish kaptur ‘headwear’ (Mayenowa 1976, 10: 104); Slovar’ russkogo iazyka XI–XVII vv. recorded this lexeme in the meaning ‘warm hat’ from the 16th century only (Barkhudarov 1980, 7: 67)); пилью (Dan 3.22) (compare: Polish pilny in one of the meanings ‘important, obligatory’ (Mayenowa 1996, 24: 218), жадномъ бод (Dan 3.28) (Polish żaden ‘none, no one’).

Polish lexeme is found in a list of Nebuchadnezzar’s grandees.

It is a word моршалекъ (compare: marszałek ‘a person who manages a court of a grandee or a church leader; in Western Europe – one of the top military commanders’ (Mayenowa 1981, 13: 172).

We can also find some words here that can be classified as traces of the influence of Yiddish, for example, ферштъ – пишът (Dan 3.2) (Polish Fürst ‘prince’).

Apparentlty, lexeme края – misrepresented Polish hrabia ‘earl’ – was motivated by Yiddish as well. Its phonetic form assumes the original version, which might look like крѣвѧ. In that historical epoch, voiced fricative consonant [γ] was articulated in the initial position of the Polish word. It could be identified with the sound designated by the letter ג, which graphic equivalent is digraph קג. The authors of Histarychny slošnik belaruskaj movy define the word края as бапах legomenon and mention it only
with reference to our text (Zhurański 16: 79). Other examples of the words with
digraph кг are in Dan 10.5: кгимом плавленым, where кгим (Yiddish גים) corre-
sponds to original גים ‘gold’; in Dan 9.21 in the structure of the proper name мвже кибрыел, where кг represents the letter ג (compare הלאים).

It is important to note that this text continues up to Dan 3.31. In this verse, trans-
lator returns to Methodius’ translation, as indicated by the proper name of the king
of Babylon in its Church Slavonic version (compare Dan 3.30 and 3.31):

(22) Vil. – Dan 3.30 тогда царь повысил шадраха, мьшаха и аведного в земли вавилонской. Dan 3.31 и рече находиась всѣм людьем, коляном, газийкьм, живущим на земли: миръ вамъ оумножися.

(23) Meth. – Dan 3.97 (30) тогда царь исправи седраха. и мисаха. и аведаго въ странѣ вавилонства. и възрасти всѣя оныхъ въ земли во Онего сътвори всѣя земли въ странѣ вавилонской. и до стоны всѣя оныхъ въ земли всѣ многихъ монахъ въ странѣ вавилонской. и рече находиась всѣм людьем, коляном, газийкьм, живущим на земли. миръ вамъ оумножися.

Insertions in the structure of Daniel from the Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium

We can assume that this chapter was created by a different translator and in a diffe-
rent territory. Why is there such a need? It is in chapter 3 where one of the non-
canonical passages of the Old Testament, retained in the LXX, the Vulgate and the
Church Slavonic Bible, can be found: it is the Prayer of Azariah and the Song of Three
Children in the furnace of Babylon (Dan 3.24-90). Undoubtedly, Methodius’ transla-
tion comprised this fragment. Because of this, as we know, there is a different number
of verses in the chapter. In addition, as I. Evseev pointed out, “Dan 3.98 is separa-
ted from Dan 3.99 with insertion from Chronograph about creation of Babylon in
three-quarters of the page” (Evseev 68).

We can gently assume that in its original version this chapter comprised those
insertions. Later, probably, during the formation of the Vilnius Old Testament Florile-
gium, it has been rewritten and brought into line with the Masoretic text. And if we
agree with B. Uspenskii, who distinguished between two versions of prosata (ja) mora –
Ukrainian (more Slavized) and Belarusian (more Polonized) (Uspenskii 68-69), –
this would explain the fact that the language of the manuscript points to the Belar-
sian-Ukrainian frontier (Peretts 25) and to the western borders of the Grand Duchy
of Lithuania (Wexler 99-112; Temchin 297). Really, from Dan 9.4 in the text, written
in prosata (ja) mora, there are no more Polish words.

One of the arguments formulated by A. Archipov in favor of version that the
translator had no need to use the ready-made text for the fragments, written in a
little-known to him Aramaic, is that he corrected the Church Slavonic text according
to the Masoretic original: “for example, in Dan 4:1, he writes ‘в полац свое(м)’ instead of Church Slavonic ‘в люде(м) моих’, that corresponds exactly to Aramaic
’во двориц моем’” (Archipov 169). It is interesting to note, however, that in
this verse, not only this one word was corrected: text at the beginning of chapter 4 does not correspond neither to Methodius’, nor to Simeon’s translation:

(24) **Vil.** – Dan 4:1 ας υπαναποσοφην παρ τη μιρην εβη σε δομου μοιμεν, избкешень в полацъ своемъ;
(25) **Meth.** – Dan 4:1 ας υπαναποσοφην παρ τη μιρην εβη σε δομου μοιμεν, и веселда на стылъб, и сило въ людь(с) моихъ;
(26) **Sim.** – Dan 4:1 аς υπαναποσοφην обилила аς въ домоу своемъ, и благочевтыи на пр(с)тель мойемъ.

We can find two Polish forms here (that is quite a lot for such a small fragment): lexeme палацъ (поляцъ) is classified as a Polish word in Slovar’ russkogo iazyka XI–XVII vv. (Barkhudarov 1988, 14: 131); ибквименъ is not recorded in this dictionary, but this root is specified in Słownik polszczyzny XVI w. (Mayenowa 1990, 19: 197), compare: obkwitość, obkwity.

As for the last word, we have an interesting example of folk etymology here. Based on the analysis of this lexeme, I. Evseev tried to establish correlation between our translation and the Polish Protestant Radziwill (or Brest) Bible (Evseev L), where one can read:

(27) **Radz.** – Dan 4:1 Ia Nabuchodonozor, бдяц на покоju w domu moim а prawie kwitnýcy w пáцu moim.

This case represents an attempt to reproduce semantics of Aramaic רַעֲנַן ‘blossoming’ by means of semantics and internal form of the Polish lexeme. Using the Masoretic text, translators of the Radziwill Bible selected an appropriate in all respects participle kwitnýcy ‘blossoming’ (see Pietkiewicz 236), whereas in the Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium translator chose the word ибквименъ. This lexeme comprises an element -квит- that coincides with the root kwiet-/kwit- ‘blossom’ only formally. An adjective obkwity is a phonetic variant of lexeme obfity ‘abundant’ (Mayenowa 1990, 19: 197) that goes back to the word opłwy with the same meaning (from opły-wać ‘to have in abundance’ < ‘to outflow (about water)’ (Electronic resource http://etymologia.org). Therefore, we cannot talk about the influence of the Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium on the Radziwill Bible, as Ivan Evseev asserted. Here are just attempts of two translators to convey the meaning of the original text in the best way.

As for the insertion as the whole, the problem, apparently, was in the following. Methodius’ translation based on Lucian Recension of the Greek text comprised a widened version of the verse that differed from the Masoretic text. This disparity was corrected, perhaps, by the same translator who translated chapter 3, prior to this verse.

In chapter 8, the Church Slavonic translations contain a variance, resulting from the inheritance of the Greek text. Because of a common noun denoting a river (יָבַן [יָבַן]) was taken as a proper name (this word is a hapax legomenon to be
found in the *Book of Daniel* only (Brown 385), and the river itself was graphically and phonetically denoted by similar paronym לָיְלָה [ְיָלָה], a lexeme אוּבַל appeared in the Greek text. Then it was accordingly reproduced in the Church Slavonic translation: אוּבַל. In Dan 8.2, our Jewish translator corrected this mistake interpreting Hebrew לָיְלָה as на рец оулаи. But then in Dan 8.3 and Dan 8.6, he, like his Greek and Slavic predecessors, interprets אוּבַל as a proper name and reproduced it as прѣд оулаем (although he should use a word with the meaning ‘a river, stream’ in this context). Corrections are to be found at marginalia, but again the common name is replaced by a proper name, seemed to be more correct according to the editor: прѣд оулаем.

One more correction testifies that sometimes the translator (or editor) did not see the true meaning of lexeme. Thus, he successively corrects lexeme вленє / оленє into вліви in Dan 11.16 and Dan 11.45:

(28) *Vil.* – Dan 11.16 и станет в земли вленє;

In this case, however, both creators of the text misunderstood Hebrew צְבִי which developed polysemy up to forming of two homonyms: the first one with the meaning ‘glory’ and the second one denoting gazelle as a beautiful and noble animal (Brown 840). The original text meant ‘glorious land’, ‘glorious mountain’. The translator preferred the last meaning (‘deer land’, ‘mount of deer’) and the editor focused not on the original text, but on the form of the Slavic word, perhaps, under the influence of association with Mount of Olives in Jerusalem.

In general, it should be noted that in those fragments, where our translator worked on his own, he translated the text accurately, with good feeling for language. Thus, in Dan 1.5 he translated Hebrew דָּבָר as вброкъ:

(30) *Vil.* – и оуголоваль имъ имъ царь вброкъ по вси олібя ква царьского.

In the Church Slavonic text, there is no noun in this position, what reduces significantly the intelligibility of this fragment in comparison with the text of the *Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium*:

(31) *Meth.* – и оучини имъ ърь дневное на вси дни вѣ тррапезы црсцкы.

Lexeme вброкъ corresponds here to Hebrew דָּבָר with the main meaning ‘speech, word’. And in this context, according to the dictionary, it nominates ‘the task or portion of a day in its day, daily duty or due’ (Brown 183). Displaying of this figurative meaning is evidence of his thorough familiarity with a language. Here, our interpreter was in line with other translation solutions. We can find the similar translation in the Vulgate, compare: *annonam* from *annona* that means ‘natural dues’ besides
the meaning ‘harvest, grain price’ (Irmscher, Johne 34). In the 16th century, translators of the Radziwill Bible and Symon Bydny, who used the Masoretic text, interpreted this word in the same way:

(32) Radz. – I ustawil im król obrak na każdy dzień z potraw swych królewskich;
(33) Bud. – Y poftanowil ty król obrak ná každy dzień z iedlá potrany krolevskiej
with a note: literally rzecz dnia jego / albo iey.

Further, in Dan 9.2, our translator translates exactly Hebrew סלַם as сполнитисѧ, compare:

(34) Vil. – сполнитисѧ побытня федьслымъкіон семдесѧтѧ Льть.

Whereas in Methodius’ translation we read:

(35) Meth. – w кончинѣ запустѣвшла ер(с)ѧмьска(с) 5. Льть.

Here, translating Greek συμπλήρωσεν, the Slavic translator was guided by the meanings of the verb πλήρωσε ‘to fill, satiate, satisfy, perform’, but also ‘to finish’ (Veisman 1012) and used the last, not appropriate, meaning.

Conclusion

The basis of the montage’s mechanism is in the arrangement of the text works that creates a significant relationship to the elements. Semantics of these elements cannot be reduced to a mechanical sum of their meanings. Distinguishing these text segments together with modi that connect them, we can get the characteristics of those text parts that are the most loaded with meaning. This correlates with the idea of the textual competence of personality as a gradual phenomenon: knowledge of the texts is corrected by communicative, cultural, and social experience.

The unique example of such textual competence is represented in translation of the Book of Daniel into the East Slavic vernacular (prostaja mova) in late 15th century.

The internal structure of the original text determined the choice of some specific translation strategies. The translator was able to translate the Hebrew parts of Daniel into prostaja mova by his own. In order to speed up the process of translating the chapters in Aramaic (that was not properly familiar to him), the translator did not translate this part of the Bible book anew, but used a previously made Church Slavonic translation, namely Methodius’ translation. He corrected this translation according to the structure and semantics of the original Masoretic text. This correction included some text insertions in prostaja mova that appeared in the Church Slavonic parts of Daniel.

As the result, the Book of Daniel from the Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium is a kind of a heterogeneous text assembled from several text types: (a) texts in two languages: parts in prostaja mova and in Church Slavonic; (b) texts of different status in comparison with the Masoretic original: canon (narratives and visions) and
apocryphal (the Prayer of Azariah and the Song of Three Children in the furnace of Babylon (Dan 3.24-90)). Non-canonic texts appeared here due to their presence in Methodius’ translation.

Analysis of some structural elements (formal and semantic), transformed or lost in the process of translation of the original text, demonstrates that the translator(s) sought to convey the original adequately, activating the potential of their own language systems. If their “own” language system was in its infancy (as in case of prostafija moza of the Vilnius Old Testament Florilegium), translator filled the gaps with the elements of other familiar languages (and with the fragments of previously made translations).

Notes
1. The term montage has been extended due to the theoretical manifesto Montage of attractions (1922) by Sergey Eisenstein. The term was used for an effect in arrangement of the show elements that attract viewers’ attention. As an artistic method in cinematograph, montage became “an universal element of new imagery”.

Abbreviations


Bud. – Biblia, to iest księgi Starego y Nowego zakonu w nowe z języka ebrejskiego, greckiego, łacińskiego prełowana z predmową S. Budnego, jako tłumacza. Nieświez, 1570; Zaslav, 1570-72.


Radź. – Biblia Święta, to jest księgi Starego y Nowego Zakonu wąscie z żydowskiego, greckiego i łacińskiego na polski język z pilnością i wiernie wyłożono. Brześc Litewski, 1563.

Works Cited


**References**


Gülich, Elisabeth, Rable, Wolfgang, eds. (1972). *Textsorten*, Frankfurt/M.


Abstract: “Louise” is a short story by the famous English writer Somerset Maugham, one of the most perceptive writers in English twentieth century literature. In clear prose he accurately describes some details of human motives and actions. A life of a woman with ‘weak’ heart is shown. Focusing on her behaviour the author tells the story of a cool egotistic person who manipulates people in order to reach her goals. Under the pretence of “weak” heart she lets herself to be loved and taken care of. She seeks one thing only — her whims to be satisfied. In Maugham’s hands the heroine becomes a woman of unquenchable lust for acting that she is willing to take to the end of her life. Louise is depicted as cruel, selfish and uncompromising in the quest for compassion, consideration and care. Her aim is to create and support the appearance of a serious heart disease, she does her best to demonstrate that it is true.

Key words: weak heart, delicate health, sacrifice, stupendous bluff, heart attacks.

Somerset Maugham succeeded in writing although at first he was not going to go for literature. His literary career was a distinguished one, however. The author’s first book Liza of Lambeth was published in 1897, his last autobiographic sketch Looking back, was issued in 1962. 65 years separate these literary works, during which time Maugham also devoted himself to writing essays, plays and critical notes. The positive reviews of his first novel reinforced Maugham’s decision to choose a literary career and not a medical one (he studied medicine at St. Thomas Hospital in London). His plays were popular with the general public, to say nothing of novels and short stories, where his ability to examine the depths of the human soul, explore the effects of human bondage and look with a discerning eye on life were particularly appreciated.

Having been acclaimed for his ability to describe sanctity, humility, cruelty, vanity and sacrifice, he pictured his heroes with all their contradictions in character, strengths and weaknesses as honestly as possible and without prejudice. Maugham believed that a literary work could only be understood if the writer describes all characters and events thoroughly, if his writing is comprehensible to the reader throughout the reading process. He argued against deliberately complicating language, poverty of style that make texts ambiguous. He neither used obscure images,
nor cultivated a verbose style. His prose is uncomplicated and lucid, his language is
elegant and accessible, his insights are profound.

His short stories are deceptively easy to read: behind the lightness a painstaking
labor lies. His original style and depth of thought have always impressed and en-
chanted readers of all ages. He depicted only what he knew perfectly and used all
his literary abilities to make his stories vivid, memorable and fascinating. He was a
real virtuoso in using stylistic devices that helped him picture heroes with psycholo-
gical exactness and richness. Written with wit, irony and scrupulous observation of
life, Maugham's short stories, “Louise” in particular have what is called ‘flavour’ and
accomplished with a dot, not with elision marks. The element of the unexpected
expressed relativity of human values, psychological attitudes, moral guides of a
middle-class decent person. He did not invent his stories, but pecked them in life.
He understood the complexity of human soul. A great variety of figures of speech
provide new levels of meaning and feeling in the depiction of heroes and their in-
ner thoughts. The expressive means not only make heroes colourful, but enable the
reader to understand the narrator’s perception of the main characters, to penetrate
into their souls and minds.

Somerset Maugham deserves to be given greater attention among undergraduate
students of English, who need to be exposed to well-crafted written texts in Eng-
lish. His short stories are a treasury that deserves more careful attention.

Maugham’s “Louise,” published in 1936, is written vividly and told with unction.
Simple in form and concise, it holds the harmony of veracity and is an excellent
example of his extraordinary ability to delineate the inner world of his characters by
skilful usage of figures of speech.

It begins with the personal pronoun “I:” “I could never understand why Louise
bothered with me” (35). As it is seen, the author is the narrator and one of the main
characters (the antagonist). This stylistic device makes the narration more dynamic
and attractive thanks to appealing to the feelings and emotions of the reader. The
narrator creates the effect of presence “here and now,” all events are given from his
perspective. He acts as if he is having a conversation with the reader just at this
concrete moment. The storyteller masterly describes Louise (the protagonist) — a
good-looking woman, delicate and fragile — who uses her 'weak heart' to do what
she wants to do. The author introduces her to the reader as a frail, delicate creature
with “large blue melancholy eyes, pale cheeks, a plaintive smile” (35). While the rea-
der is supposed to feel sorry for her, this is not always possible, as indicated in the
following remarks: “I knew that behind my back, in that gentle way of hers, she
seldom lost the opportunity of saying a disagreeable thing about me” (35). “She had
too much delicacy ever to make a direct statement, but with a hint and a sign and a
little flutter of her beautiful hands she was able to make her meaning plain” (35).

The contrast between ‘gentle’ and ‘disagreeable, and between ‘beautiful and
plain’) indicates the narrator’s doubts about the true nature of Louise. He also calls
her “a mistress of cold praise” (35) — strong words indeed. The narrator is om-
niscient, describing all different sides of Louise’s nature. He notes, for example, that
she is not ill but only “carries out a stupendous bluff” (39). She manages to conceal
her real attitude towards the storyteller. Indeed, the lady constantly invites him to lunch or to spend a weekend in her house in the country although she thinks him “a coarse, brutal, cynical and vulgar fellow” (35). Later he explains her motives: She “had an uneasy suspicion that I didn’t believe in her” and had an inkling... “that I saw the face behind the mask and was determined sooner or later to take the mask for the face” (35) (the antithesis highlights a contradiction between appearance and reality). Louise tries to demonstrate to everybody how seriously ill she is. She wants people to believe that she is almost at death’s door and that her days are numbered but at the same time she dances till five in the morning and walks eight miles when she chooses. The best heart specialists say that she must be prepared for the worst; she has, however, outlived both her husbands.

The narrator wonders whether she ‘fooled herself as thoroughly as she fooled the world’ (35) and he describes her behaviour with great precision. Louise destroyed the lives of her two husbands, who loved her sincerely, took care of her and sacrificed their careers for her sake. She is going to ruin the happiness of her daughter, Iris, in the service of personal gain and intends to use the girl as much as she wants to and to give nothing in return. This contrasts starkly with her parents’ care for her. They “worshipped her with an anxious adoration” (36) the combination emphasises their care and concern). “They entrusted her as a sacred figure,” “They tried to do everything in the world for Louise” (36), the absolute ‘everything’ emphasises their complete adoration and willingness to make sacrifices. The figures of speech (simile, hyperbole, comparison) attract the reader’s attention, help the storyteller describe Louise vividly.

Louise’s first husband, Tom Maitland — “big, husky fellow, very good-looking, and a fine athlete,” — doted on his wife and did everything he could to make ”her few years on earth happy” (35). He gave up the games he excelled in, not because she wished him to, but because ‘she had a heart attack whenever he proposed to leave her for a day’ (36). When the narrator hints to Tom, that his wife is “stronger, that one would have thought,” (here there is an ironical hint at her appearance) Tom does not agree and answers that she is “dreadfully delicate and her life hangs on a thread.” The use of hyperbole and oxymoron is significant here. They both create a certain mood and evoke various feelings (those of surprise and compassion in Tom’s person and ironical — from the author’s part). The reader is emotionally stirred and clearly comprehends the message conveyed to him by the storyteller.

The oxymoron — “dreadfully delicate” (36) — produces a special effect and makes Tom’s speech more colloquial. Besides, the epithets, irony, hyperbole, simile and oxymoron used enable the reader to ponder over the meaning of the contradictory idea presented by the author and give a distinctive colouring to the characters.

Louise, whose short life was to come to the end soon caused her husband’s death — he caught a severe cold one day when they were sailing and his wife needed all the rugs to keep her warm.

The delicate woman was inconsolable and her friends redoubled their attentions towards her, would not let her “stir a finger.” But only one year later, she allowed
George Hobhouse to lead her to the altar. He was an ambitious soldier, but he re-
signed his commission, as his wife’s health forced her to spend the winter in Monte
Carlo and the summer at Deauville. He was not at all badly off and tried to please
her as much as he could. He hesitated at throwing up his career, and Louise at first
would not hear of it, but at last yielded as she always did (36). The narrator per-
forms as a masterful stylist whose observations are ironical. He uses irony as a
complex concept here. The peculiar feature of irony in this case is covert sneer. The
storyteller shows that Louise only pretends to encourage her husband not to resign
his commission. In fact she wants him to stay with her and to please her every now
and then.

For the next years in spite if weak heart “she managed, notwithstanding her weak
heart, to go beautifully dressed to all the most lively parties, to dance, to gamble
heavily and even to flirt with tall young men” (36). The description emphasises a
real state of things and creates an evident contrast — the narrator speaks ironically
about that period of Louise’s life and does not conceal his negative feelings towards
her. The author adds ironically that George did not have the stamina of her first
husband and had to brace himself now and then with a stiff drink “for his day’s
work as Louise’s second husband” and “very fortunately (for her) the war broke
out,” he rejoined his regiment and three months later was killed (36). He feels a
liking for George and emphasises that the woman he loved has ruined his life easily.

A clear irony lies in the fact that while Louise is pleading ill health, she outlives
two husbands. When George dies, she continues to enjoy life as if nothing has hap-
pened. She converts her villa into a hospital for convalescent officers. It does not
escape the reader’s notice that the narrator observes that the wounded all looked
after her “as though they were all her husbands” (37).

When the narrator and Louise met in Paris she told him “[t]he specialist said I
must be prepared for the worst’”(37). The author’s reaction was sarcastic “[y]ou’ve
been preparing for the worst for 20 years now, haven’t you?” (37). He uses sarcasm
brilliantly, stimulating the reader’s imagination and comprehension of the true natu-
re of Louise’s character.

When the war comes to an end, Louise settles in London. Now over 40, she looks
no more than 25. Iris joins her, still believing that her mother’s health is precarious
and that she must not be upset. When Iris wants to go to parties or come to see
friends, Louise has one of her heart attacks and the girl prefers to stay with her.
Soon she falls in love and her young man proposes to her. She agrees. One day, ho-
wever, the young man comes to the author in great distress and says that his marria-
ge is indefinitely postponed because Iris cannot desert her mother. The storyteller
goes to see Louise, as he feels a deep sympathy for her daughter. He asks her about
Iris’s wedding. Louise says that she “had begged her on her bended knees” (38) to
get married and not to think about “such a great invalid.” Again Louise pretends to
be a kind and loving mother, but in reality she is egotistic and “the most monstrous
woman” in the narrator’s opinion, who cannot stand hypocrisy and considers it the
most difficult and nerve-racking vice that needs an unceasing vigilance and a rare
detachment in spirit. For Louise it is a full-time job. Louise is shocked by these
words. She uses repetition for the dramatic effect “Oh, I know, know what you think of me.” She is still smiling, but “her eyes were hard and angry” (39). The author adds that he will not be surprised if she has one of her heart attacks and “fully expected her to fly into a passion” (38).

The reader cannot predict how the events will develop and is promised the ineffable. He expects the end of the story, and it comes, original and unexpected.

Louise “was as good as her word” (39). A date was fixed, invitations were issued. Iris and her fiancé were radiant. On the wedding day, at ten o’clock in the morning that “devilish woman,” had one of her heart attacks and died. She died “gently forgiving Iris for having killed her” (39).

A rich palette of stylistic devices (epithets, ironies, hyperboles, oxymorons, similes, repetitions, metaphors, antitheses) ‘dethrone’ the heroine, her selfishness and sanctimony. Irony dominates over other figures of speech. A special emphasis is given to metaphor (ancestor of irony), and antithesis. All Louise’s life is one great contrast of reality and appearance, which are closely connected with one another.

Figures of speech also demonstrate what a good actress Louise was, how well she used people in her selfish interests, how she masterly fooled those devoted to her. The storyteller who acts on behalf of the author uses a couple of words, a comparison or the only detail — and it is enough to depict the character thoroughly, fully, with wit. His imaginative style and emotional colouring unquestionably help describe endeavours and motives of the heroine. The figures of speech provide the freshness of expression, clarity and perfection of the narration. They also, beyond doubt, develop a certain ability to understand fiction, to enjoy immaculacy of language, to discuss of what constitutes ‘good English.’

The story has a happy end — Iris marries her beloved one. Nevertheless, it is difficult to say whether she is that content. The reader has a possibility to continue the story to his liking.

Somerset Maugham’s “Louise” is an excellent story for undergraduate students of English. Besides an acute power of observation, he sees a great many things that other people miss. He puts down in clear terms what he sees. He aims at lucidity, simplicity and euphony. The rich usage of stylistic devices, the beauty and elegance of the language, and the conflict between the external and visible, and the overt and the covert constitute powerful examples of some of the most important features of ‘quality’ English literature.

The story provides ample practice in analysing texts at different levels.
Abstract: The appreciation of literature depends on the reader’s ability to understand the author’s use of words — how they are used individually to express explicit and indirect meaning, how they are used in partnership with others to make up set phrases, and how meaning can be distorted for literary purposes by changing a phrase or the order of words in a phrase, all within a specific cultural context. The educated first language reader, familiar with the context, is equipped to read between the lines and achieve a fuller understanding of the text in question. However, for second language readers, lacking that lexical and cultural knowledge, the situation is different and they are at a disadvantage in terms of being able to understand a work of literature. Teachers of English can help their pupils by drawing their attention to words — which words are used and how they are used. Support for this assertion can be found in the research into second language vocabulary acquisition. This tells us that readers need to know at least 95% of words in a text in order to understand that text, and that words must be encountered many times if they are to be learnt. The point of actively working with words over a period of time is twofold: firstly, to increase the reader’s lexical resource in terms of both number of words known and depth of knowledge about them, and secondly, by so doing, to increase the reader’s ability to understand, and therefore appreciate, literary texts. With reference to The Great Gatsby, I will illustrate how teachers of English to university students can extend their learners’ lexical knowledge and appreciation of literature.

Introduction
The question regarding what it means to 'know' a word has no simple answer. The journey from knowing nothing — recognising neither a word’s orthography nor phonology — to possessing knowledge about its spelling, pronunciation, register, frequency, collocations and meanings in a range of contexts, which Schmitt refers to as “full collocational competence” (117), on the one hand, and being able to use the word accurately and appropriately oneself, is a long one.

The nature of this journey is described in the literature in various ways. Birgit Henriksen considers it to be a continuum, with word knowledge ranging from zero, to partial, to precise. Norbert Schmitt notes that frequency and register constraints tend to be acquired late, while spelling is one of the earliest features to be learnt about a word. What is agreed on is that many exposures to a word are required
usual estimates range from 15 to 22) before receptive mastery of a word is acquired and before a word can be used actively. The number of exposures needed for acquisition to take place will inevitably vary from learner to learner and be dependent on a number of factors: individual aptitude, frequency of exposure and the nature of the word. A word met frequently, a cognate, or a word with a more transparent lexical patterning in a subject in which the learner is interested will involve less effort than words which are less common, have no cognate or hold little intrinsic interest for the learner.

Research by Alan D. Baddely has shown motivation to be a significant factor in a learner’s ability to remember. This is recognised to some extent in English teaching in Swedish schools, where children are sometimes allowed to choose individually for themselves at least some of the words which they will learn for homework. Adult learners usually come with in-built motivation, provided they have chosen to take a particular course or have a specific reason for needing to do so. In the case of student teachers, in the context of which I am going to discuss a technique for lexical development through the reading of literature, motivation is generally strong. Their literature course provides opportunity for reading and discussing literature which they may not otherwise read. The desire to extend their vocabulary in order to become ever better readers is a powerful one, and the students do believe that by reading literature their lexical knowledge will increase.

This is where difficulties arise. All research, indeed common sense, tells us that extensive reading develops lexical knowledge. According to Krashen’s Comprehensible Input Hypothesis, extensive reading is in itself sufficient for language acquisition to take place, provided the text is at an appropriate level, considered to be just one step above the learner’s current level, enough to provide a challenge (expressed with the formula i + 1). At the same time, however, the process of acquiring vocabulary simply by reading is slow and prone to error (Nation and Waring), requiring much exposure to words in a variety of contexts in order to accumulate all the word knowledge which a reader who has the language as his or her first language is presumed to possess.

Extensive reading in one’s free time is beneficial, but not enough on its own. In a literature class the main aim is comprehension of the writer’s message and this relies on the reader knowing a large number of words and being in possession of much information about them. For example, where words are used idiomatically or metaphorically the learners must be able to recognise to what extent and with what effect deviation has occurred (Low). For literature students therefore, the learning of vocabulary cannot be left to chance. The current view among researchers is that a combination of implicit learning and direct teaching best provides the means for students to acquire vocabulary (for example, Sökmen, Waring and Nation, Sonbul and Schmitt), with the caveat that recycling of the words is necessary if words are to remain in the long term memory from which they can be accessed.

This paper will consider an extract from The Great Gatsby and discuss how teachers might work with lexis in order to increase their students’ lexical knowledge, at the same time as they provide these students with a useful technique for working
with lexis in their study time. If these students are also teachers in training, they will be able to make use of the technique to facilitate lexical development in their own future pupils. While teachers of literature may baulk at the idea of a classic work of literature being used mechanically for such a purpose, I would argue that by developing learners’ understanding of words in context, we facilitate a deeper understanding of the text in question, which must surely be the purpose of literary study. Thus, literature is used to expand lexis at the same time as possession of a wider, and deeper, lexical resource permits a greater depth of understanding, which will often otherwise be limited to the superficial and transparent, rather than what is subtle, cryptic, figurative and so on, and from which the text derives its greatness. As learners sometimes say in relation to texts such as *The Great Gatsby* and *The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie*, “I know I’m missing something but I don’t know what it is.”

**Learning from context**

According to Laufer, 95% of words in a text need to be known if the text is to be understood and to enable lexis to be acquired. If the text is a technical one, where the specialised lexis is used in greater density, the percentage is even higher (98%). It follows that learners *may* be able to ignore an unknown word which they consider unimportant; they may even fail to notice it entirely, provided they understand the great majority of words used. However, sometimes the understanding of a particular word is crucial to an understanding of the sentence in which it stands and sometimes the meaning of a word cannot be deduced from its context. In such cases, the reader must try to infer meaning using a combination of bottom up and top down reading skills. Thus, on the one hand, the reader might try to discover the meaning of the word by examining its constituent parts, such as a negative prefix, whether the suffix indicates a particular word class, or whether the word contains or resembles a word already known to the reader. This method is helpful, though not infallible. The word *invaluable*, for example, suggests through its prefix that something is lacking in value; *inflammable* is a word which invites danger for the same reason — its prefix suggests negation of *flammable*. On the other hand, the reader might use the immediate context of the sentence, and of the sentence within the paragraph to try to deduce the meaning of the word. Knowledge of syntax might assist the reader in determining to which word class the word belongs. For example, if preceded by a definite or indefinite article, the word is a noun. An *–ed* ending on a word would suggest the past tense of a regular verb, as in *infiltrated*, for instance. The presence of a noun phrase or pronoun immediately preceding this word would confirm the reader’s supposition (as in *the undercover officer infiltrated the criminal gang*), but would only help with the meaning if both the subject and object noun phrases either side of the verb were understood by the reader. Even then, successful deduction remains a matter of chance. Factors affecting the reader’s ability to infer include the richness of the context and also the reader’s background knowledge in the subject.

An interesting point, and a logical one, is that the more effort required to decode a word, the greater the likelihood of its being remembered. Even so, the evidence is that learners rarely guess correctly, with between five and 10% of new words
correctly guessed and partially learnt, though even where a guess is correct, the
word may not be learnt at all. Within either of these scenarios, the learner may re-
cognise the word the next time they meet it — or possibly not — but at this stage
the word will most likely not be in their active mental lexicon, available for use. For
the teacher of literature, the message is clear: in order for students to achieve the
same level of understanding as an educated reader who has the language as their
first language, a focus on lexis is not only desirable, but essential for continued de-
velopment in the second language, where this development includes the ability to
read with greater understanding a range of literature, both modern and canonical.
This is the situation on university courses of English and on higher level courses
within upper secondary education.

The benefits of direct teaching
According to Peter Howarth, the greatest challenge for learners is understanding the
restrictions on collocations and consequently being able to recognise when devia-
tion occurs. For a student of literature this knowledge is particularly valuable since
deivation, intentional or otherwise, adds to what is known about a character either
as a result of what he says himself or narratorial comment. For instance, several
years ago in the middle of an enquiry concerning possible theft by a royal butler,
Prince Charles was quoted in the British press as saying that the royal family had
“fallen over backwards to help the police.” The combination of two phrasal verbs,
bend over backwards and fall over oneself, was probably unintentional, but it may
possibly have been intentional, stressing the eagerness of the Windsors to assist
police with their enquiries. Either way, the expression deviated from the norm and
stood out for this reason. This is precisely the knowledge which a first, but not se-
cond, language speaker possesses, but which the second language learner must ac-
quire if they are to read with the same depth of understanding.

The same point can be made about metaphor, which Low sees as playing “a central
role in human linguistic behaviour” (125). Collocation, idiom and metaphor are
components of a first language speaker’s linguistic repertoire in which cultural
knowledge is embedded. They are the tools with which a writer or speaker creates a
unique discourse. For example, to understand the depth of irritation conveyed by
the description he is a garden of thorns in my side, the listener or reader must first
be aware of the metaphor to be a thorn in someone’s side. The challenge for the
teacher lies not just in helping learners to acquire this knowledge, but in knowing
where to start. It therefore makes sense to focus attention on short passages where
the writer has chosen lexis to convey a particular image, and where understanding
of this use of lexis is necessary for a deeper appreciation of both the passage itself
and its contribution to the text as whole. It makes further sense to focus on a pas-
sage in which the words under consideration are linked in some way and which add
to the reader’s knowledge of setting or character, for instance. According to Badde-
ley, human memory functions best when language is organised. Therefore, the mea-
nings of not more than 10 words which have a common feature and which cumula-
tively create a certain effect fulfils the need for order and provides a meaningful task.

Beginning with a short extract has two advantages. Firstly, learners can be introduced to a way of working which they can then use independently. As Schmitt points out, “Students will eventually need to effectively control their own vocabulary learning” (137). Taking a short extract and exploiting it themselves in a similar way to how they have worked in class is one way in which they can control their learning more effectively. Extracts for exploitation might be suggested by the teacher or chosen by the student, based on the intrinsic interest of a passage or because it allows focus on a particular grammatical or semantic category. The second advantage in choosing a short extract is that it reduces the risk of overloading the learner’s memory and also makes recycling easier to control for the teacher. This is important since each time a learner encounters a word, its interpretation may change in line with the learner’s current knowledge about the word, and as we have said, each new encounter reinforces retention. For both these reasons, a systematic recycling of words is desirable and therefore the number in focus must be manageable.

Finally, it is true to say that students do sometimes ignore words, even though they realise these words are important, hoping that the meaning will become clear later on. They may also intend to look the word up, and they may then forget to do this. But at least these words have been noticed. In second language acquisition research the noticing hypothesis (Schmidt and Frota) holds that in order to learn, we need to notice — to notice a structure in the target language and the gap between that and our own knowledge. Although there is discussion over the extent to which noticing has to be conscious, from the perspective of lexis acquisition, it makes sense to say that if we want our learners to acquire both a broad and deep understanding of words and their contribution to literary discourse, then a first step has to be noticing, followed closely by focusing on the word and by recycling it. This is another argument for restricting the number of words we work with at any one time.

Techniques for direct teaching

Good language learners use a variety of vocabulary learning techniques. In order that all learners can become good learners, they must first be aware of their own preferred learning styles: do they learn words best by hearing them, seeing them, writing the words down, or a combination of methods? Since language learners do not learn in the same way as each other, the message for the teacher who wishes to broaden and deepen her students’ lexical knowledge in order that they may become better readers, must be to vary ways of working with vocabulary. This might start with the advice, if not requirement, that all students keep vocabulary notebooks, adding to what they know of a word with each fresh encounter.

Strategies for learning vocabulary are dealt with extensively in the literature (for example, Nation; Sökmen). Techniques range from learners identifying the odd word out in a small group, discussing the underlying meaning of polysemous words
An example of vocabulary development work based on componential analysis

The classroom task discussed here is based on componential analysis. The extract is taken from F. Scott Fitzgerald’s *The Great Gatsby*. The literal meanings of the italicised verbs are assumed to be already partially known to the students. The aim is to explore the meanings of these verbs in context. The cumulative effect of the verbs is to create an impression of transience and superficiality fuelled by alcohol.

The lights grow brighter as the earth *lurches* away from the sun, and now the orchestra is playing yellow cocktail music, and the opera of voices pitches a key higher. Laughter is easier by the minute, *spilled* with prodigality, *tipped* out at a cheerful word. The groups change more swiftly, *swell* with new arrivals, *dissolve* and *form* in the same breath; already there are wanderers, confident girls who weave here and there among the stouter and more stable, become for a sharp, joyous moment the centre of a group and then, excited with triumph, *glide* on through the sea-change of faces and voices and colour under the constantly changing light. (Bodly Head edition 50)

This task is carried out in groups of four, facilitating deeper processing by means of a discussion which considers the various components of the verbs in question. The seven words are first provided out of context for the students to find a common feature. What should quickly become apparent is that while some are associated with liquid (spill, tip), the one feature which they share is that all involve movement of some kind. Moving on from this preliminary focus on the decontextualised words, the students then carry out a componential analysis of the following pairs, where in each case the teacher provides a word which shares some similarities with the target word but differs from it in other respects: tip/pour; lurch/stumble; spill/drop; swell/increase; dissolve/melt; form/make; glide/walk. Let us, for example, take tip and pour. While the second verb refers to liquid, the first may do, but also non-liquid items may be tipped. In both cases there is movement involved but the movement in pour is smoother than in tip, which implies a sudden action, the result of which may be less neat than in pour because less care may have been taken in performing the action. If students work in groups, they can discuss their initial ideas before checking in a range of dictionaries for the definitions. The *Oxford English Dictionary* offers the following definition of tip: to cause (the contents of a container) to be emptied by holding it at an angle; when we look up pour, we find to cause (a liquid) to flow from a container in a steady stream by holding it at an angle. In the next example, lurch/stumble, the first movement is sudden and unsteady, the second involves falling or tripping. When students go on to compare spill and drop,
they find that the first refers to liquid and involves accident; drop may or may not be accidental, but the movement is vertical rather than horizontal as in spill.

Having plotted the features of each word in each pair, discussed their results and checked the dictionary definitions, the students then take each of the target verbs and write a sentence in which its meaning is made clear, though this should not be a definition. Since this is collaborative work, there is likely to be useful discussion here in the groups as to which scenarios best illustrate each verb in order to capture the components of the verb as plotted in the componential analysis. For example, I spilled my coffee when I knocked the mug over/The contents of the dustbin were tipped into the dustbin lorry. The verb swell may provoke discussion, being associated with disease and pain for some, whereas others may think of crowds increasing in size. Similarly, dissolve may cause some to think of aspirin, chemicals or less obviously, the breaking up of a group or onset of laughter. The discussion is a fruitful one, for in attempting to agree on a representative meaning, the students will be led to the conclusion that whatever their personal associations with the words, the basic meaning of the verb under consideration is the same. Thus, by now the students have begun to explore the parameters of meaning for each word in their task and encountered the fact that words may have both literal and non-literal meanings. They have also worked with aspects of word knowledge other than meaning: the written form of the word, its pronunciation (as they discuss in their group), and colligation — that is to say how the word relates syntactically to other words. For example, they may have discussed which prepositions can follow the verbs dissolve, tip and pour.

The students' next step is to take each of their sentences and below each now write the verb as it is used in the text, with adaptations to the syntax where necessary to keep the sentence simple and thereby highlight the relationship between subject and verb: for example, laughter is spilled at the party. The students' own sentence was I spilled my coffee when I knocked the mug over. By comparing the pairs of sentences — their own, and the example from the text, the students are now able to identify the underlying meaning of the verb common to both sentences. They will realise, if they have not before, that spill (also lurch and tip) are used metaphorically in the text. This poses the question as to what the author means by this. Spill is a careless action and involves liquid, so how can laughter be spilled? By comparing their own sentences written to illustrate these verbs, it will become clear that alcohol is flowing freely. The quick, sudden, perhaps careless movement implied in spill, and in tip but not pour, as established in the second stage, underlines this. The remaining verbs are seen to convey transience, motion and by association, superficiality. To round off the task the students might be asked to consider the word weave, for which we did not provide a partner: in what ways does this word fit into the group of words they have been working with, and what does Fitzgerald's choice of this specific word bring to the passage in question? Is it possible to replace the word with another and retain the same effect?
Discussion of the technique

In this section we will discuss the benefits of componential analysis to students of literature. Firstly, it can be said that they have explored features of the target verbs which distinguish these verbs from other words with which they are semantically linked. The students have written sentences demonstrating their understanding of these words, using a dictionary to confirm, adjust and expand on what they know. At this stage it will become clear to the students whether or not they are in full active control of the words: do they know, for instance, which prepositions colligate with spill, tip and lurch? Using a dictionary to check a word’s collocational behaviour will also reveal further meaning of the word. It can be said that the verb lurch is a good example of a word students tend to know partially. They have read it or heard it and may understand that it has something to do with walking, but cannot define or exemplify it, while for a first language reader there may be associations with too much drink, anger or the unsteadiness caused by attempting to walk while travelling on a rough sea. In fact, the Oxford English Dictionary makes no reference to alcohol or anger.

Since many dictionaries include examples of target words in sentences, it may be advisable to let the students not only plot the features of their words but even write a sentence to illustrate the meaning of the words before they check in their dictionaries. In this way they will not be distracted by the examples in the dictionaries. Another reason for letting the students get to this stage before they check their ideas in the dictionaries is that more discussion will be required, both in writing their own illustrative sentences and in comparing these to the examples in the dictionaries. The more the students work with the words, the more the words will become fixed in their mental lexicon, which is one of the aims of the task. Once the meaning of each target word is established, the students will be in a better position to consider the words in context and the author’s aim: to convey the impression of a large number of people who barely know one another, being affected to varying degrees by alcohol, coming together and moving apart again, each encounter easily forgotten as the individuals concerned are carried away into the next brief encounter.

Conclusion

Vocabulary work of the kind outlined here serves several purposes. It presents a limited number of words, in this case eight, which have a common feature. They are explored by comparison with words semantically linked with them, and a sentence is written to illustrate the meaning of each of the target words. These are then compared with the verbs as used in the passage and the common meanings discussed and related to the author’s intentions. Though the task can be done on an individual basis (and notebook work should be, partly because it provides a follow up to classroom work and the opportunity for reflection and assimilation), much is learnt by doing the work in groups. Suggestions are given and discussed, accepted, modified or discarded. All of this allows the knowledge which students are acquiring to be processed more thoroughly and it assists retention, which is also facilitated by re-
cycling. For instance, at the next meeting, the students could write a description of an imaginary event at which they were present, using the target words, literally or non-literally.

Componential analysis is a technique particularly suited to the literature class. The differences between words are discussed not just from general interest, but because these differences are vital in the text. The task has transparent validity: by focusing explicitly on vocabulary, students expand their word knowledge, which in turn facilitates reading with understanding. The ability to read with greater understanding allows the students to become better students of literature: possession of a broader and deeper lexical base permits access to a writer’s message which is otherwise constrained by the limits of the student’s mental lexicon.

Works Cited
Scott Fitzgerald, F. (1925). The Great Gatsby
Abstract: The character of song lyrics vary from the most simple rhymes to highly literary poems.

Therefore, being able to make a thorough text analysis is of utmost importance to a singer. If the performer does not know what the lyrics mean, how can he or she possibly convey a convincing message or articulate interesting questions?

A literary analysis of the song-text therefore must be a basic requirement for making the text a living part of scenic presence, which takes us a step further in the singer's working process.

Is it possible that the questions posed by the singer to the text may generate new knowledge about the text and its possible interpretations? Could this process in itself lead us to new research results on a literary level?

In my paper, I argue that this is highly possible. I will show how the singer's questions to the text may reveal new layers of historical and artistic contexts also in a very well known musical-literary material: some of the songs by the Swedish poet-musician Evert Taube. The lyrics of the two entertaining songs *Fritjof Anderssons paradmarsch* and *Fritjof i Arkadien* may seem pretty trivial. Both songs contain, however, unexpectedly advanced historical reflections on art and poetry.

*Fritjof Anderssons paradmarsch* tells us the story of how poetry and literary culture is communicated through the centuries and how it is spread, from Anatolia, via Egypt and Spain, to Sweden. *Fritjof i Arkadien* is an essay on verse on the pastoral genre and its development, from the early idyls of Theokritos, via Italian Renaissance to the "roaring twenties" of Europe and the USA.
interpretations? Could this process lead us to new research results on a scholarly level?

I believe so, proposing that the singer’s questions to the text may reveal new layers of historical and artistic contexts also in a very well known musical-literary material: one of the the songs the Swedish poet-musician Evert Taube (1890–1976).

**Evert Taube**

Taube was a Swedish author, drawer and troubadour, who still possesses a profound and lasting popularity among Swedes of all generations. His songs are still widely sung at social gatherings and used as dance music, especially his waltzes. His artistic persona is remembered as one of a rugged sailor or a South-American gaucho. Some may also recall him in sophisticated black tie, exposing himself as an elegant, artistic grand-seigneur on the public stage of bars and restaurants. In the eyes of his steadily growing audience, his appearance was about as far from the learned scholar as it could get.

This was somewhat misleading. Taube had a vast knowledge of art, history, architecture and literature, all of which he had acquired informally. He was brought up on the small island of Vinga outside Gothenburg, where his father was a lighthouse-keeper. This may have seemed a very modest position, but the Taube family was of ancient, lower nobility and Evert's home was in fact a small cultural centre.1

After having returned from being at sea and working in Argentina during the nineteenth-tenths, Taube rapidly became popular as a singer and performer of Argentinean songs and sailor-ballads.2 He soon became closely acquainted with one of Sweden’s most famous writers of the age, Albert Engström. This largely self-taught author and cartoonist had a profound interest in literary history, not the least in classical antiquity. Later in his life Taube also maintained friendships with two of Scandinavia’s most distinguished classicists, the translator Nils Östberg and the essayist and poet Emil Zilliacus.3

Taube’s self-image, therefore, was one of a self-taught, intellectual scholar and author, while his public appearance was one of a popular singer. Taube was never to overcome this dichotomy, and he could never quite understand why he was not accepted as a serious author by the academic establishment. Taube was known, however, for creating an extremely strong presence around his scenic persona. He played the “lute,” which was actually a guitar with bass-strings, manufactured by a contemporary Swedish instrument maker, and this visually striking instrument created an impression of Taube being connected to a glorious past; this “lute” connected him to Carl Michael Bellman, the late-eighteenth-century Swedish lute-player, singer and poet. Both in his own eyes and in the public view, Taube was a follower of this unique artist, displaying similar kinds of multifaceted versatility. Epistemologically, the complex kind of knowledge possessed by the singing poet-composer are still in these days not cultivated nor understood within the traditional frames of the Academy: literary scholars do not always quite understand the musical and the scenic parts of this craft, and many musicians do not come to grips with its historical and literary background. The lack of an academic discipline for this multifaceted know-
ledge has largely contributed to the misconception of the epistemological character of Taube's work. Additionally, Taube's enormous popularity and the "singability" of his songs also have overshadowed his poetical craftsmanship and his relation to literary tradition. Even if Taube's literary references are recognised among scholars of today, this is a side of Taube which is still largely unknown to his wider public.

**Point of departure: making a concert programme**

Thus, when I was offered to create a concert programme with Taube's songs, I wanted to present and to explore his poetical craftsmanship and his links to literary models and predecessors. I also realised that I could use Taube's own way of presenting my findings, by telling the audience about them in a "seemingly improvised" manner. I chose the song *Fritjof in Arcadia* and my analysis of it as the hub of my programme. At a first glance or hearing, this song may seem pretty trivial, but, as I will show, advanced historical reflections on art and poetry form the structural content of the song. I had never heard anybody speak of Taube's highly sophisticated way of constructing his lyrics, so I thought this would be an interesting point of departure. I also read nearly all of Taube's published poems that were not set to music. One of them, *The Poet Goes To the Mountains*, was about the poet's preparing of a walk in the Ligurian hills, so I used it as a "prelude" to *Fritjof in Arcadia*.

**Fritjof in Arcadia – an outline of the content**

The chain of events in the song *Fritjof in Arcadia* is simple. On the hill of Colla Bella, which actually exists outside of San Remo in Liguria, Italy, the poet comes walking in the nude. Sitting down in the grass to have some wine, he is suddenly taken by surprise when three nude young women appear, dancing and singing. They disappear, however, singing the American song *Happy Days Are Here Again*. In the evening, the poet meets them again. Now they are wearing white dresses, and they walk together with the poet, talking and singing. The song ends with one of the graces claiming that Americans are more healthy and not as "mundane" as Europeans. She also states that that does not matter since "we are all of the same descent, oh darling, happy days are here again!"

**The pastoral**

The song belongs to a certain genre, the pastoral. Arcadia in this context has more than just a double meaning: it both refers to the actual landscape in ancient Greece and to the literary landscapes of Theocritus and Virgil. *Fritjof* (this name might be borrowed from one of the works of the Swedish poet Esaias Tegnér, Frithiofs saga) is Taube's alter ego. Now, Taube places Fritjof in the hills above San Remo, thus incorporating both his alter ego and this contemporary landscape into the pastoral tradition, thus initiating a play with history already from the start of the song, and we will soon see that Arcadia has even more historical connotations. Fritjof's nudity, scarcely hidden by fig-leaves, brings up the Garden of Eden as an obvious reference, which immediately adds another time-layer to the song. As he wanders among the goats and sheep — ordinary stage-props in a bucolic setting — the poet
states that he feels like "the bird being let out of the cage." When we bear in mind that Evert Taube was extremely well acquainted with art history, it is not far-fetched to interpret this as an allusion to rococo painting-tradition, in which a bird peaking out of an open door traditionally symbolises male erotic preparedness.6 We also note, as many people do when singing this song, the quotation from Rosseau, who also wrote pastorals: "back to nature." Suddenly, a naked "Eve" appears, and she is soon joined by two other ladies, who, like the poet, are dressed the way they were created.

Two pastoral visions: Sandro Botticelli's Spring and Jefferson's Arcadia

When we imagine these three ladies dancing in a pastoral landscape drenched in the fragrance of honeysuckle, they may remind us of a well-known painting: The Spring, by Sandro Botticelli. If one considers this interpretation too contrived, one may just take a glance on the next stanza, where the ladies are called "as sweet the graces as a man could see." In Botticelli’s painting, it is exactly three graces that are portrayed, and, furthermore: in Botticelli’s painting the three graces are veiled in white.7

The three graces in Taube's song are from California, but I suggest that Taube not only draws on the traditionally liberal attitude of this state; I claim that Taube also alludes to Arcadia, president Thomas Jefferson’s utopian vision of a new America. In this vision, Jefferson was inspired by Virgil, and the president used to recite the pastorals of both this Roman poet and of Theocritus in Latin and in ancient Greek to his friends. In Arcadia, Jefferson articulated a bright and hopeful vision of America as an open and healthy contrast to Europe's cities with their dark alleys, de-humanising poverty and devastating diseases.8 Jefferson's vision also inspired one of Taube’s constant philosophical followers, Ralph Waldo Emerson.9 As the American historian Leo Marx puts it:

Combining a vivid, Jeffersonian sense of the land as an economic and political force with a transcendental theory of mind, he expands what may be called the philosophy of American pastoralism. No major writer has come closer to expressing the popular conception of man's relation to nature in nineteenth-century America.10

In Swedish (but not in the English translation), Taube ends by alluding once again to the "common ancestry" of Americans and Europeans — in fact, of all human beings — our provenience in the Garden of Eden, Paradise.

The Spenser stanza as historical reference

But what about the verse-measure? Does the rhythmical pattern of the text activate yet another historical layer? The measure is a modified ottava rima, called “Spenser stanza”. Did Taube read Spenser? The English poet's The Fairy Queen actually contains a bucolic scene with graces dancing to the pipe of “Colin Clouth,” another poet.11 More credible, however, is that Taube has borrowed the stanza from the
Swedish nineteenth-century poet Esaias Tegnér, who, in his turn, borrowed it from Spenser. A famous poem of Tegnér’s is one written in this measure to commemorate the fiftieth anniversary of the Swedish Academy. In this poem, which makes many comparisons between Italy and Sweden, Taube’s role model Carl Michael Bellman suddenly appears, surrounded by “nymphs”. Thus, Taube portrays himself, or his alter ego Fritjof, as his admired Bellman!

Singing as an analytical interpretative method

As we have seen, the singer’s questions to the text bring up unexpected historical references in this quite well-known song. But what characterises this particular analytical method? Since this analysis is done by the person who sings the lyrics, I would say that it is essential for the singer to first of all make a normal, basic literary analysis of the text by putting it in its historical, social and artistic context: when was it written? Under what circumstances? Does it belong to a particular genre? Were there any particular intentions behind the lyrics? In this fundamental literary analysis, other essential questions also have to be asked: who is singing? Why? To whom? Is there a clearly perceivable situation in which the song takes place? Further, the relation between the words and the music must be carefully considered: is the text deliberately written to be sung? Or to be read out loud? Are there any particular meanings of the text which have been emphasised by the composer?

In literary or musicological scholarly context, these are all very basic questions, but in musical — pedagogical and artistic — practice, they often seem neglected, at least according to my experience as a singer and singing teacher. When these basic questions are asked and satisfactorily answered — and the singer knows the song by heart — the real adventure may begin: by singing the song, the singer now can ask herself: “Do I really understand what I am singing?”, or: “Why does this sentence seem so strange?”, or: “Why is it so difficult to memorise this song?” or: “Could this sentence have a double meaning?”

By constantly challenging her understanding of the song as the sung words are passing through her mind and body, the singer may reveal meanings that are not apparent by a first reading or listening to the song. While continuing the artistic-pedagogical process, it is also possible to continuously return to the basic analytical questions. Thus, the type of analysis that I sketch on behalf of the singer, is not an alternative to traditional literary analysis, accomplished by a mere reading of the text, but rather a complement to it, organically connected with practical performing.

By stating this, I do not imply that a text has a meaning, determined by the intentions of its author, fixed once and for all, a definite message that the singer might “reveal”; on the contrary, the singer also may discover interpretative possibilities that, in the Ricœurian sense, can be found “in front of” the text.12 What I do imply is that the singing of a text can be used not only as an artistic means, but also as a tool for critical and creative analysis.
Further research: Taube's unification of Christian thought and Horace's literary universe

Having once observed Taube's subtle and sophisticated way of using history and tradition in Fritjof in Arcadia, this ingeniously constructed song, the singer naturally wants to investigate more of Taube's works, posing her questions to new songs, thus maybe discovering new meanings in the musical poet's oeuvre. A field which has not been sufficiently explored concerns the theological allusions in Taube's songs. This interesting area includes research on his use and modification of Christian thought and how he integrates this religious tradition with the literary universes of Horace and Shakespeare. Could this task be fulfilled through artistic practice, using a singer's analytical and critical approach?

Fritjof in Arcadia

On Colla Bella's heights, where goats are bounding
And pine-trees thinly shade the yellow sand,
There is a grassy glade, with palms surrounding
And gently sloping to the vine-clad strand.

There one sees Corsica in clearer weather
And distant provinces in azure rows:
There one can smell the clover and the heather,
And one can wander lightly as a feather
Up in the mountains, without any clothes.
I rambled nude and happy there one morning:
I'd come from Gothenburg across the seas.
A fig-leaf wreath my body was adorning,
And in a box I carried bread and cheese.
It was a lovely day: above me singing
I heard the little nightingale so rare:
Just like a bird set free from prison winging,
I gambolled gaily, back to Nature springing,
For I would lie upon Earth's bosom fair.

The goats and sheep were leaping all around me:
Like little clouds they looked, so white and small.
I felt the nightingale's sweet song surround me –
I was a part of all this pastoral!
But in a while, about my dinner thinking,
Upon the grass I sat to taste my fare:
My wine I opened and I soon was drinking,
But when my head I turned I started blinking –
I saw a naked maiden smiling there!
In all my life I'd seen such beauty never!
She came and stood quite near me on the green,
And then before I got my wits together
Two other lovely maids came on the scene.
They laughed and frolicked there without chemises
And sang: "Oh, happy days are here again!"
Then up I sprang, forgetting wine and cheeses!
I tossed my fig-leaf girdle to the breezes!
   The maidens ran while I pursued in vain.

But in the evening I was in the city,
   And there again I met the lovely three,
   And they were clad in dresses white and pretty,
   As sweet three graces as a man could see.
   But one so boldly took me by the hand then,
   And said "I'm leaving on an early train".
We walked beneath the palms along the strand, then:
   We talked and drew some pictures in the sand, then,
   And sang: "Oh, happy days are here again!"

"I come from San Francisco," said the maiden,
"That's why I like to climb about the hills.
   I like to frolic without clothing laden,
   For I love Nature without fuss or frills."
Yes, in America we're far more clever,  
While here in Europe you are more mondaine!
But you and I are much the same, however –
Oh let us wander side by side forever! 
Oh, darling, happy days are here again!"

English translation by Helen Asbury

Note
3. Leif Bergman: "Eko och återkomst", Evert Taubesällskapet, årsskrift 1992 is the most extensive analysis of Taube's affiliation with Antiquity and Renaissance.
4. From Himlajord, Stockholm 1938
5. For a detailed discussion of the pastoral see Paul Alpers: What is pastoral?, Chicago 1996.
Abstract: For several years there has been a huge emphasis on higher education’s role in shaping future employees to fit the requirements of potential employers and adapting education to the recruitment needs of the same. This is not the only goal of higher education, however. At the very beginning, in section eight of the first chapter of the *Swedish Higher Education Act*, it is written that "[f]irst-cycle courses and study programmes shall develop the ability of students to make independent and critical assessments." In addition, "students shall develop the ability to gather and interpret information at a scholarly level." Both quotes highlight the aspect of critical analysis, which is mandatory for university studies regardless of field. To help develop critical thinking and further independent analysis among the students are thus two of the most important goals for Swedish educators in higher education.

Academic disciplines follow the *Swedish Higher Education Act* in various ways depending on the traditions and customs in their respective fields. Within the field of English literature, text analysis is at the forefront and a huge amount of research has been made delving into its method. Authors often encountered by students are Lois Tyson, M. Keith Booker, Terry Eagleton, and Jonathan Culler as they have written often used introductions to literary theory and critical perspectives. My aim in this paper is to focus on the teaching of literary text analysis as a method and a means to adhere to the independent and critical assessment requirement as well as to gather and interpret information — which I will focus on primarily — in the *Swedish Higher Education Act*. What are the strengths of text analysis as a method and to what extent does it contribute to fulfil the aims of higher education as expressed by Swedish law?

Key words: legal framework, text analysis, humanities, teaching, critical thinking

Is it enough to educate for purely utilitarian purposes, i.e. to only teach what is necessary to meet the criteria of a certain type of job or to think about education as a commodity you buy, putting the student in the position of a customer who may or may not find the “service” s/he buys to their liking? Depending on your perspective, your answer might be “yes” or “no.” The above stance has indeed become more and more common in the last few decades, which has spurred a debate about what criteria higher education ought to fulfil in Sweden. A recent example is an editorial
for *Dagens Nyheter*, written by journalist Håkan Boström, who argues that the “bildungs” ideal ought to be brought back and knowledge ought to be valued for its own sake (Boström), and not for what it might potentially bring in terms of work or salary. On the opposite side, the organisation for entrepreneurs, Svenskt Näringsliv (Confederation of Swedish Enterprise), highlights the “crisis in the humanities” and urges the field to become more “useful” in order to make the students “easier to employ” (Axelsson). A common method of enquiry within the humanities is text analysis, which aims to discover the worldview of the author(s) of a text and facilitate independent and critical assessment. My aim in this paper is to study how the teaching of literary text analysis can be a method and a means to adhere to the independent and critical assessment as well as to gather and interpret information requirements in the *Swedish Higher Education Act*. What are the strengths of text analysis as a method and to what extent does it contribute to fulfil the aims of higher education as expressed by Swedish law?

On both sides of the debate, the humanities often become the focus and carrier of the traditional “bildungs” ideal and a symbol of that which is not considered “useful” or “necessary” in the current political climate, where the right-wing government has been in office for the last eight years. The following exemplifies their stance: “[i]n [the bill] the Government proposes changing the direction of the national quality assurance system for higher education institutions to meet the new demands that are based on the goals of *greater freedom, internationalisation* and *high quality*” (Regeringskansliet 2009/10:139). Greater freedom is mainly related to decreased governmental influence on the Swedish higher education system (Regeringskansliet 2009/10:149), internationalisation stresses the collaboration between universities and higher education systems primarily within the EU but also vis-à-vis the rest of the world (Programkontoret), and high quality, in itself a debated concept since few people agree on what high quality actually is and how it can be measured, which Universitetskanslerämbetet (the Swedish Higher Education Authority) translates into six general concepts: *knowledge and understanding, proficiency and ability, and evaluation and approach*. In general the Swedish government has favoured the usefulness and preparation for work life more than other aspects, and it is their wish that this aspect is stressed even further in future evaluations (Regeringskansliet, pressmeddelande).

According to Swedish law, however, neither the stance of the government nor that of Svenskt Näringsliv are adequate. On the topic of the knowledge and experience a student is supposed to gather in higher education, section eight in the *Swedish Higher Education Act* states (in full):

> First-cycle courses and study programmes shall develop:
> * the ability of students to make independent and critical assessments,
> * the ability of students to identify, formulate and solve problems autonomously, and
> * the preparedness of students to deal with changes in working life.
In addition to knowledge and skills in their field of study, students shall develop the ability to:

• gather and interpret information at a scholarly level,
• stay abreast of the development of knowledge, and
• communicate their knowledge to others, including those who lack specialist knowledge in the field. (Swedish Higher Education Act, 2009:1037, section 8, and Svensk Författningsamling, my italics)

The ordinance is thus very clear about the importance of independent and critical assessment and the interpretation of various types of information, tasks often associated with the humanities.

**Academic Traditions and Customs**

Along with many other theoreticians, former vice chancellor at Lund University, Göran Bexell, sketches three different views and influences on academic education, and outlines the positive and negative aspects of each:

• **Academic traditionalism** — This perspective is characterised by academic freedom, collegial leadership, and academic ”bildung” for life. Research and education are goals in themselves.

• **Academic instrumentalism** — The focus is on societal use and responsibility, economic growth, a utilitarian and entrepreneurial approach, and academic ”training” in a specific field for a specific purpose. Research and education are means to reach a (financial) goal.

• **Academic globalism** — This category focuses on the streamlining of courses all over the world. Student ought to get the ”same” education everywhere and the issue at hand regards centralised vs. locally rooted universities and educations. (Bexell 67-78)

The first two views/influences are of particular importance in the context of this paper, since, as I have indicated above, the discussion regarding the humanities often centres around “bildung” vs. direct applicability. Traditionally, the humanities have been closest to the ideas put forward by academic traditionalists with its “bildungs” ideal. The current Swedish government and organisations such as Svenskt Näringsliv favour academic instrumentalism and direct applicability, however, and they have done so to the extent that section eight in the Swedish Higher Education Act seems to have been forgotten or at least ignored.

**The Humanities in Higher Education**

The topic in focus within the humanities is, as the name indicates, human beings, human creation and the individual and collective creation of meaning. The humanities traditionally incorporate subjects such as languages, linguistics, literature, philosophy, ethics, religion and visual and performing arts. Subjects, that are sometimes classified as a part of the humanities although sometimes labelled as “social sciences,” include
history, anthropology, communication studies, cultural studies and law. All these disciplines address various methodological issues in different ways and although some of them — broadly speaking — use text analysis as a method, this is not always the case. In this paper, however, I will limit myself to text analysis as it is applied within the field of English.

In a recent newspaper article Associate Professor Thomas Karlsohn, Uppsala University, leans on Helen Small's *The Value of the Humanities* and lists what might be considered the strengths of the humanities (my translation and summary):

- The *individual and collective creation of meaning*, which the humanities explore to an extent many other disciplines do not.
- The humanities provide an *extended notion of what is useful*, pulling the idea of usefulness away from academic instrumentalism.
- "Humanistic pursuits enhance collective and individual happiness, provides opportunities to live more fully and develop one's intellect." (This argument is rarely used today.)
- "Democracy needs us." Shaping human perception, humanity and politics. (This is a common argument in the U.S.)
- The *inherent value of the humanities*. The humanities are important in and of themselves. (my italics)

The fact that pro-humanities articles such as these are perceived to be needed underlines the lack of appreciation for the humanities — and “bildung” — shown by the current government and entrepreneurial organisations.

**Bachelor's Programme in English: Language, Literature, Society**

The department of Human Sciences at Kristianstad University offers a three-year bachelor's programme "Language, Literature, and Society." The programme description provides an example which enables us to concretise how text analysis as a method is being used.

This programme gives the students increased proficiency in the English language together with theoretical knowledge about English. This comprises both oral and written proficiency, as well as a thorough introduction to English linguistics and literary theory, including *the ability to correctly apply this knowledge*. The focus throughout the programme is on communication, and the aim of the modules that do not explicitly focus on English is to strengthen the student's *communicative ability* in various ways, and to make the student aware of how the use of English is affected by historical, cultural, and social circumstances, as well as the subject area and the medium through which it is communicated.” (hkr.se, my italics)

As the italicised parts indicate, the students on this university programme are intended to move beyond the proficiency level of language learning and be able to
correctly apply theoretical perspectives within a historical, social and cultural English-speaking context. In other words, they are supposed to independently and critically assess and interpret matters — most commonly texts — at hand, which is very much in line with the requirements of the Swedish Higher Education Act.

So… How Do We Do It? — A Number of Questions

In further detail, how would a simple text analysis be performed? This is a basic model of questions I follow when teaching text analysis.

1. What is being said?
   - Basic communication theory (Shannon & Weaver) and rhetorics: Who is the sender, who is the intended recipient, who is the actual recipient, what is the message and how is it framed?
   - What are the underlying motives for the sender communicating this? How does the recipient interpret this message and why?

2. How is it being said?
   - How is the message framed? This deals with the aesthetics of the text, the style, the genre, the language et cetera.

3. What is not being said?
   - What is omitted and (potentially) why? What could be added to the picture the sender paints?

4. How does it fit together?
   - How can the message be interpreted and why?
   - What structures or patterns can be discerned?
   - What parallels can be drawn and what similarities or differences can be seen in or between texts?
   - What underlying worldview can be discerned?

Literary Theory

Literary theories have sometimes been described as lenses through which we interpret the world, or in this case works of literature, fictional or otherwise. Jonathan Culler, Professor of English at Cornell University describes theory in the following manner:

- Theory is interdisciplinary
- Theory is analytical and speculative
- Theory is a critique of common sense, of concepts taken as natural
- Theory is reflexive, thinking about thinking, enquiry into the categories we use in making sense of things (Culler 14-15)
Although we are primarily discussing literary theory here, Culler nevertheless emphasises the interdisciplinary character of theoretical approaches. In addition, he stresses the analytical, speculative, reflexive and enquiring aspects of theory, which, again, is closely linked to the independent and critical assessment requirement of the *Swedish Higher Education Act*.

Theories are valuable tools when attempting to see matters from differing viewpoints when analysing text. Lois Tyson, Professor of English at Grand Valley State University, gives the following perspective on the boundaries of each literary theory as she also brings the “one-eyedness” of theory into focus:

Think of each theory as a new pair of eye-glasses through which certain elements of our world are brought into focus while others, of course fade into the background … Why should some ideas have to fade into the background in order to focus on others? Doesn’t it suggest that each theory can offer only an incomplete picture of the world? (Tyson 3)

It is important to remember that the theories themselves usually reveal only one piece of the puzzle, and, as Lois Tyson suggests, the preference of one theory over another can also be political:

Indeed, because they are ways of seeing the world, critical theories compete with one another for dominance in educational and cultural communities. Each theory offers itself as the most (or the only) accurate means of understanding human experience. Thus, competition among theories has always had a strong political dimension. (Tyson 3)

In the field of English literature, critical theory/discussion/analysis — especially if more than one viewpoint is applied — provides the opportunity for students to analyse various texts and learn how to make independent and critical assessments, to gather and interpret information on human conditions and creations as well as the individual and collective creation of meaning — which is what the *Swedish Higher Education Act* requires from higher education within the humanities — or any other field — in Sweden.

**So… Why Is Text Analysis Relevant?**

On a general level, text analysis as a method inspires and requires students to think and assess independently and critically and to gather and interpret information from various points of view. This is at the very core of what we do as scholars and students of the humanities.

Depending on the current political tendencies, various aspects of the neutral criteria of the *Swedish Higher Education Act* can be highlighted more than others. The current Swedish government has empowered instrumental — entrepreneurial and utilitarian — aspects throughout the entire Swedish educational system, whereas the interpretational, critical and independent thinking/analysis/assessment have not
received as much attention. It does indeed permeate the current ideological framework so completely that it almost eclipses the value of the humanities and the intentions of the authors of section eight in the *Swedish Higher Education Act*.

The humanities “bildungs” ideal, focused on by Karlsohn as well as Small, points to the exploration of individual and collective creation of meaning, an extended notion of what is useful, the idea that democracy needs varying views on humanity and politics and that the humanities thereby is important in and of itself. This idea seems to be well supported by the *Swedish Higher Education Act*.

Apart from foregrounding the aspect of proficiency and communicative ability in language learning, the programme description for the bachelor’s programme *Language, Literature, Society* indicates, on the local level, that students are also to learn how to correctly apply linguistic and literary theories in a manner outlined previously, understand that the use of English is affected by historical, cultural, and social circumstances, as well as the subject area and the medium through which it is communicated. Analytical and critical approaches are thus found at the core of the programme description.

**Concluding words**

There is a clear difference between the criteria in the *Swedish Higher Education Act* and contemporary political attitudes and foci. Although the subject of English might be considered useful from an instrumental point of view also in the current political climate because of its proficiency and internationalisation components, the analytical and interpretative aspects have not been valued as highly.

In this paper, I have mainly discussed how the discrepancies between the legal framework, the political intentions and initiatives, and the local framework of our programmes and courses within the humanities influence our teaching as well as the situation of the students, but I would like to point to how these discrepancies also tend to influence funding and research focus.

I hope to have shown that the core ideas of the *Swedish Higher Education Act*, regardless of political agendas, are thus put into the concrete context of the humanities in general and the subject of English, and text analysis, in particular.

With its focus on analysis and critical thinking, the humanities have the potential to provide important knowledge about human beings, human creation and the individual and collective creation of meaning. No other academic field focuses on this, and the viewpoint(s) of the humanities with its pluralistic and multifaceted approach is therefore crucial.

**Works Cited**


The Medium and the Vandal
A study of English translations of Tomas Tranströmér’s poetry
Johan Landgren
Högskolan Kristianstad

Abstract: In relation to English translations of Tomas Tranströmér’s poetry this paper examines two positions of the translator — the medium and the vandal. The positions are rendered from a discussion, later called the “Transtromer squabbles”, that arose in 2007 in The Times Literary Supplement.

Through close readings of two Tranströmér poems, “Paret” and “Svarta vykort”, with focus on formalistic factors like syllable and word count, rhythm and the texts graphical appearance, the paper shows that the opposition between the medium and the vandal shields some severe problems concerning translation.

The paper suggests that this opposition is related to a highly biased focus on the relation between the original and the translation. As an alternative it proposes an approach to translating from a reader’s perspective, focusing less on the act of translation and more on the act of communication.

Keywords: Translation; Poetry; Formalism; Reader’s perspective.

Tomas Tranströmér is, and has been for a long time, one of the most, now living, translated poets in the world. When Niklas Schiöler counted the translations in the late 1990’s he found that Tranströmér had been translated to at least 46 languages. And counting English translations Schiöler found over 1500 poems, by 40 different translators (Schiöler 11). Since then the numbers of translators and translations have continued to grow.

To make the material manageable I will focus on just a few of these translators’ work. One of them being Robin Fulton, who has been translating Tranströmér in the U.K. since the early 1970’s, the second being Robin Robertson, whose Tranströmér “versions” (3) from 2006 started what has later been called the “Transtromer squabbles” (“Transtroemer squabbles”), and the third being Robert Bly, who has been translating Tranströmér in the U.S. for as long as Fulton has in the U.K.

The aim is twofold; first to give an insight in the various ways the Swedish poet Tomas Tranströmér has, and has not, been translated to English; secondly, to use the outcome of such an examination in a discussion about the role of the translator from a reader’s perspective.

The paper’s starting point is the mentioned “squabble” that took place in early 2007 in The Times Literary Supplement. The dispute started with a letter to the magazi-
ne, from Robin Fulton, replying Alan Brownjohn’s positive review of Robertson’s Tranströmer versions. In the letter Fulton accuses Robertson of showing “a cavalier disregard for Tranströmer’s texts” (Fulton “Tranströmer versions,” 9 Feb. 2007). Robertson’s versions are in the following weeks and months defended by W.S. Milne and John Burnside. They argue that Robertson has made Tranströmer’s poetry “come alive on the page for a British audience” (Burnside) and that his translations are “honourable, lyrically rich and deeply sympathetic” (Milne). A couple of weeks later Fulton answer Burnside that his argumentation is “testy and at times disingenuous” (Fulton “Tranströmer versions”, 27 May 2007) and continues his devaluation of Robertson in his answer to W.S. Milne by saying that Robertson “vandalized Tranströmer” and that he is making “translation[s] with hiccups” (Fulton “Approaches”).

These accusations, though very interesting in themselves, will not be further examined here. Instead I would like to put, what one might call, the concept of the vandal, as rendered from Fulton’s argumentation, against the concept of the medium. This later concept I find fairly common in reviews and discussions of poetry in translation. It is the idea of the translator as someone that is able to transfer the original text to a new language without the text losing its core, its essence. One example, in relation to Tranströmer, is Paul Bindings review of Fulton’s translations, *New collected poems*, in which Binding states that Fulton “mediumistically” renders Tranströmer’s “verbal music”. Another one is Ray Gonzalez review of *The Great Enigma: New collected poems*, where Gonzales argue that Fulton “recreates” Tranströmer. It is from this position as a “medium” Fulton makes his accusations against Robertson.

An interesting aspect is that in neither of the mentioned letters, articles or reviews there are any examples of where this vandalisation or mediation is supposed to be found. To examine this I have done comparative readings of two Tranströmer poems, “Paret” and “Svarta vykort”, with focus on close readings of the translations and the original texts. In the analysis I have been looking at translations from a wider perspective than from a essentialist point of view, thus focusing on factors like syllable and word count, rhythm and the texts graphical appearance, since I believe that these aspects are as important for the poem as the meaning of the words and the metaphors.

One important thing to point out is that this close reading is not done to argue against any of the translators. Rather it is done with the aim to pinpoint some problems with translating Tranströmer, problems, which in my opinion, are an integrated part of the act of translation.

“Paret” was first published in *Den halvfärdiga himlen* in 1962. The poem has been translated to “The couple” by all three translators in this study (Bly 11, Fulton, *New collected* 53, Robertson 15). If we start by looking at the poem as a whole entity, beginning with the graphical appearance, one can see that the original and the translations are fairly similar to each other, with one exception: All of the translations are
taking up more physical space than the original. In figure 1 I have accentuated this difference by adding 4 equally sized frames surrounding the different versions.

This disparity, on its own, might be explained by differences between the Swedish and English language, but if we go on to count words and syllables the divergence is even further articulated. The original poem consists of 87 words, the English translations of 98 to 100 words. Counting syllables we find that the original consists of 144 and the translations of 128 to 136. This tells us that Tranströmer uses about 10 percent fewer words than his translators, with about 10 percent more syllables. In relation to what Niklas Schiöler emphasizes in the title of his doctoral thesis, *Koncentrationens konst*, “The art of concentration” these numbers are striking. There is actually a larger discrepancy between the original and the translations than in between any of the translations. From the perspective of the vandal and the medium I would say that this makes them all vulnerable to the claim of vandalisation.

Another striking aspect is the numerical correlation between the different parts of the original. Counting words we find exactly 29 in each stanza, and looking at the syllables we find an almost fully implemented system, 13 10 13 13 / 13 10 13 13 / 13 10 11 12, diverging only in the last two lines. Considering Tranströmer’s deep interest in meter and rhythm, which many of Tranströmer’s interpreters point out (e.g. Bergsten 75-87, Coyle, Schiöler 40-41, 45-47), it is fair to say that this correlation is not a coincident. It is an integrated part of the poem. But if we look at the translator’s versions none of them tries to integrate this aspect. The reason for this is not discussed in any of the translations but it is likely that the argument is one that separates form and content. What I claim is that this separation is not easily done in the case of Tranströmer, and going from the poem as a whole entity to the smaller parts of it the problems with such a separation becomes even more visible.

If we for example look at the end of the first line we find that Tranströmer’s phrase, “dess vita kupa skimrar”, has 7 syllables (101). The translators choose words with 4 to 5 syllables: “its white shade / glimmers” (Fulton, *New collected* 53), “its white globe / glimmers” (Robertson 15) and “its white globe glows” (Bly 11). Let us also consider the rhythm: While Tranströmer’s choice is closing the line with a wave-like melody the translators’ choices are more like the sounds of someone going up a staircase.

Another example is the Tranströmer phrase “Kärlekens rörelser” (101), which is built up by two three-syllable words. The meaning of the phrase — motions of love — is in the original accompanied by the motion of the syllables in the phrase, which gives the reader an intense feeling of closeness to it. One might argue that Fulton comes fairly close to this understanding when he chooses to translate the phrase to “The movements of love” (*New collected* 53). When Robinson translates it to “Love’s drama” the phrase loses a lot of its tension (15). The same happens with Bly’s translation: “Their movements” (11).

Bly’s translation reveals another interesting aspect of the Tranströmer translations: The insertion of the possessive pronoun “their”. By adding this Bly reduces the phrase’s universality, by personalising it. But as Kjell Espmark shows in *Resans*...
formler this universality is one key aspect of Tranströmer’s poetry (25-35), and leaving it out reduces the reader’s possibility to see the full potential of the poems. One will find the same type of transformation in the following poem discussed, and in many of the other Tranströmer translations.

A final example from “Paret” is a home-made compilation of words, “Himmelsmörkret”, which contains four syllables in one word. Only Bly finds this an important phrase to translate and he translates it to “heaven’s darkness” (11). And though he doesn’t reach the full concentration of Tranströmer’s single word he emphasizes the great heights and depths of the phrase. In my opinion this might be the most important word in the poem. It lights up the first stanza with darkness, it concentrates it. From that perspective one can say that neither Fulton, who translates it to “the black sky” (New collected 53), or Robertson, who translates it to “the night sky” (15) fully addresses the poems central contradiction, the one between light and dark, day and night, dreams and thoughts, and all the space in between.

In “Svarta vykort” (311), first published in Det vilda torget 1983 and translated to “Black Postcards” (Bly 83, Robertson 39) and ”Black Picture-Postcards” (Fulton, “New collected” 139-40), the aspects of concentration is even more apparent than in “Paret”. On a graphical level this is exemplified in figure 2. Another aspect of the graphical appearance is the fact that the last line is further to the right in both Fulton’s and Bly’s translations. This affects not merely the graphical appearance but also how the poem is read. One could say that Fulton and Bly suggest a longer pause than Robertson does.

Counting words and syllables in “Svarta vykort” articulates the denseness of Tranströmer’s poetry, and his attention to rhythm and meter. When the translators need 54 to 57 words the original poem consists of 42. That is about 30 percent fewer words than any of the translators. Counting syllables we find about the same relation as in “Paret”. But in “Svarta vykort” I would say that the syllable count is of even greater importance for the understanding of the poem. Tranströmer’s 76 syllables are namely divided in 2 stanzas, with 4 lines each, forming a Sapphic stanza (11 11 11 5 / 11 11 11 5), commonly associated with the ancient Greek poet Sappho. This meter, the form in itself, is an important part of the poem. As Niklas Schöler points out, the Sapphic stanza leads the reader to the ancient world, which adds a certain connection to the metaphors in the poem (46).

One example is the last part of the first stanza, “Skuggor / brottas på kajen” (311). The translators’ choices of phrases are not diverging that much from Tranströmer’s, on a figurative scale. Fulton’s shadows “wrestle on the pier” (New collected 139-40), Robertson’s “scrabble on the pier” (39) and Bly’s “fight out on the dock” (83). But since neither of the translators tries to translate, or even mentions, the formal connection with the Sapphic stanza in their translations, the poem’s close connection with the ancient world is lost, and thereby the understanding, that Schöler argues, that these shadows are linked to the Greek and Roman myths. In his
reading these shadows are waiting on the pier for the ferryman, for Charon, who shall take them to the other side (46).

Other aspects that for this reason might not be fully communicated to the English reader is the poem's concern with death, as in the phrase “Kabeln nynnar folkvisan utan hemland” (Tranströmer 311). This phrase is an interesting example, since none of the translators have chosen to translate “hemland” to “homeland”. Robertson translates the phrase to “The wires hum the folk-tune of some forgotten land” (39), Fulton to “The cable hums the folk-song with no home” (New collected 139-40) and Bly to “The cable silently hums some folk song / but lacks a country” (83). The immanent opposition that exists in Tranströmer’s phrase has lost some of its explosive force in the translations, and I believe that one of the reasons for this is the absence of a connection to the antic world. If we analyse the poem from a Sapphic perspective we might see that the homeland Tranströmer is suggesting is not a home or some forgotten land or country. It actually is the place where Charon is taking us: The other side. In such an interpretation the humming cable is a telephone line with no one on the other end, the sound that resembles the straight line in an ECG monitor, the visit of death in the second stanza. Choosing words with different meanings than “homeland” makes this opposition vaguer. As with “himmelmörkret” in “The couple” the translators diminishes some of the great contradictions in Tranströmer’s poetry.

As these examples show the Tranströmer translations, when examined from a mostly formalistic perspective, with focus on appearance, word and syllable count, all show a similar disinterest in communicating such aspects of the original poem. The examination also shows that this disinterest affects the meaning of the words and metaphors in the original poem. In relation to these findings the discussion on vandalism, as initiated by Fulton, is more likely to shadow than it is to gain to the discussion of the dilemmas of translating poetry. As shown the problem is not so much to be found in between the translations as it is found in the relation between the translations and the original.

This is interesting to consider in the light of Françoise Wuilmart’s discussion about normalisation, in “Normalization and the Translation of Poetry”. Wuilmart defines the concept of normalisation as “the action of trimming off, smoothing out a text, making it more even, cutting off its edges, filling up its curves and blanks and ultimately, neutralizing its very effects” (31). Looking back at the Tranströmer translations we can see that this is happening over and over again, in some cases on a metaphorical level, but even more explicit concerning the formalistic level and the musicality of the poem.

If we continue to look at the effects of normalisation we will find more examples. One is when Tranströmer, to follow the chosen meter in “Black postcards,” leaves one word out: “Mitt i livet händer att döden kommer”. The correct sentence would be “Mitt i livet händer det att döden kommer” but Tranströmer cuts ”det” out of the sentence. This choice is not followed by the translators, who instead normalise the sentence. And yet another normalisation process is the way Bly per-
sonalised the love in “The couple”. This happens in “Black Postcards” too, where Tranströmer’s “mått på människan” — measures of man — is translated to “your measurements” by Robertson and to “your pertinent measurements” by Bly, thereby narrowing down Tranströmer’s will to speak in universal terms.

From the perspective of the medium and the vandal these choices can for sure be seen as acts of vandalisation. For some reason the translators choose to change a part of the poem, that from another view might be of intrinsic value. From that perspective the translations are bad. But what then is a good translation? As we have seen all of these translations are in some ways bad. From the translator’s perspective, one always has to choose; what to highlight; what to leave out. In the case of Tranströmer there has been a great loss concerning denseness, rhythm and meter, which in the end also has been shown to affect the words and metaphors of the original poem.

This type of examination might be used to criticise the translators, but that is not my intention. As I see it the problem is not so much with the translations themselves. By that I don’t mean to oppose to the idea that there are differences between translations, and that some translators are better at transferring the sense, form, idea and so on, of the original to the target culture. What I do oppose against is the focus on right and wrong which lies behind the dispute in The Times Literary Supplement. This focus, the opposition in itself, undermines the possibilities of translating. And even more important — it undermines the possibilities of understanding.

Until now I have mainly discussed the relation between the original and the different translations, and this is also how most translations are being judged. It is the questions of fidelity, of equivalence. What I would like to discuss now is another way at looking at translations, from the relation between the reader and the original.

What then is the reader’s perspective? What does the reader want? The obvious answer: The original, in the reader’s native language. But this, as many translators and scholars have demonstrated, is not possible. But there is also another way at looking at the reader, another answer to the question “what does the reader want?” To communicate. With other worlds. Other times. With “the other” (Kapuściński).

Instead of focusing on the object of translation I would now like to look at the reasons for translating.

As shown all of the translations in this study have their problems. I would say that none of them is showing the true potential of Tranströmer’s poetry. But read together, like done here, they come a bit closer. From the reader’s perspective these translations are actually better together than any of them are on their own. But the reason for this is not primarily additive. The reason is that they differ from each other: the variation in itself reveals what Lawrence Venuti in The Translator’s Invisibility – A History of Translation calls the “conditions under which the translation is made” (1).

According to Venuti the translations in what he calls the “Anglo-American culture” is, and has been for a long time, “judged acceptable by most publishers, reviewers, and readers when it reads fluently” (The Translator’s 1). The aim has been to
make the translations as transparent as possible, which leads to the illusion that there has not been any translating going on, that the text in front of the reader actually is the original. Just in another language. But what actually happens is that this transparency, the illusion in itself, conceals “the other” by making him or her to familiar. It is plausible to say that this transparency is what lies behind the concept of the translator as a medium.

To avoid the problems of transparency Venuti argues that the translator should be lifted from the shadow of the author and be seen more of a poet than a translator (Translation 173-192). Similar ideas is suggested by Wuilmart (37) and other translators and translation theorists like Susan Bassnett. Bassnett’s “counter-poems” of poems by the Argentinian poet Alejandra Pizarnik is one interesting example of how this can be done (180):

Alejandra   alejandra
debajo estoy yo   lying below
alejandra   susanna

Venuti’s argument offers a way to get around the transparency issues, but from a reader’s perspective it raises certain questions. The most important being: if one wants to get as close to the original as possible, which is the main assumption in this paper, is this really the optimal way to go? I believe that there is another way of looking at translations, where the problems of transparency and normalisation are dealt with at the same time as the relation between the reader and the original is kept in focus. To accept this perspective one has to abandon the idea of the translator as someone who has a special connection with the original poem; the translator as a medium. His or her role would instead, in my suggestion, be the one of a critical link between the original and the reader. This of course threatens the definition of the word “translation,” and also the role of the translator. But at the same it opens up a wide range of opportunities concerning the act of translation.

One of the basics for such an understanding is something Clive Scott mentions in “The translation of reading — a phenomenological approach.” that the usual way of translating seems to assume that the reader has no interest in the source language (215). From the reader’s perspective this statement is of great importance. What if we instead would assume the opposite? We would definitely have to redefine what a translation could be. If we believe that the reader’s desire is to communicate with “the other,” we cannot dismiss the original poem, or the language it is written in. Instead we have to find ways of closing the gap between the reader and the original. And this, I believe, is not done by magic. Instead we have to expand our idea of the act of translation. One such suggestion is considering a phonological version a translation:
From the reader’s perspective this actually offers a better understanding of some aspects of “Svarta vykort” than any of the examined translations. It would perhaps not work on its own, but together with a prosaic English crib version, or with any of the translations studied here, I would say that it definitely would help the reader to get closer to the original.

Scott’s phenomenological approach is also interesting in this aspect, and in his paper he offers some challenging translations of poems by Rainer Maria Rilke and Edward Thomas. What Scott is suggesting is a “multilingual” and multi-sensory translation, rather than a bilingual and linguistic one,” that shifts the focus from the text to the act of reading (216-7). And though I am not going to argue for his specific translations I believe that his examples show how one, if released from the burdens of fidelity and equivalence, and from the opposition between the vandal and the medium, can experience the act of translation in a new light.

One not as extreme aspect as Scott’s versions, that I believe should be a minimum standard for all translations, is the bilingual edition. Discussing Tranströmer this comes with a certain twist, since that is one of the accusations Fulton has against Robertson, who is the only translator discussed publishing bilingual. Fulton’s argument is that Robertson, by publishing bilingual, is “inviting comparison,” and that this is ok only if he would have been a good translator, in Fulton’s eyes (“Tranströmer Versions,” 25 May 2007). But seen from the reader’s perspective this inviting can be nothing but good. The comparison itself sends an impulse to the reader — this translation is not the original, it’s just a version, a suggestion, an act of communication. My phonological example, and Scott’s Rilke and Thomas versions, are a couple of other impulses, but we could think of others.

One is the use of footnotes. We do not have to go as far as Vladimir Nabokov who claims that he wants “footnotes reaching up like skyscrapers … so as to leave only the gleam of one textual line between commentary and eternity” (512), but in the case of Tranströmer it sure would have been of great value for the reader to know that “Svarta vykort” was written in Sapphic meter, or that certain words, like “himmelsmörkret” in “The Couple”, is two words combined for a reason. The footnotes would add meaning at the same time as they would point back to what...
Venuti calls “the conditions under which the translation is made” ([The Translator’s](https://doi.org/10.1353/ttr.2005.0012) 1), thus making the act of translation visible and improving the original poem’s connection with the reader.

Another way of doing this is for example found in a book with the translations of Adonis to Swedish, which came with a CD with the poems read by the author. This combination in itself is a form of translation. And if we consider tablets, computers and mobile phones as valid artefacts for reading these sorts of possibilities manifests.

From the reader’s perspective one can say that the “Transtromer squabbles” sure is a squabble. This since the opposition it is drawn upon is a false one. When Fulton is criticising Robertson he does it more or less from the position of a medium, but as I have tried to show, this position is not valid. By that I have not meant to criticise Fulton on behalf of Robertson. Instead I have been trying to reconsider what the act of translation is, and can be. If we look at translating from the reader’s perspective instead of arguing on which translation is the finest, I believe that a wider understanding and a greater connection to Tranströmer’s poetry is possible. And this is, in the end, what the reader’s perspective is all about.

**Works Cited**


Abstract: Alice Munro’s “The Love of a Good Woman” is perhaps one of the most important stories in her œuvre in terms of how it accentuates the motivation for the Nobel Prize of Literature: “master of the contemporary short story.” The story was first published in The New Yorker in December 1996, and over 70 pages long it pushes every rule of what it means to be categorised as short fiction. Early critic of the genre, Edgar Allan Poe distinguished short fiction as an extremely focused attention to plot, properly defined as that to which “no part can be displaced without ruin to the whole”. Part of Munro’s art is that of stitching seemingly disparate narrative threads together and still leaving the reader with a sense of completeness.

The story’s publication in The New Yorker included a subtitle that is not part of its appearing in the two-year-later collection. The subtitle, “a murder, a mystery, a romance,” is interesting in how it is suggestive for possible interpretations and the story’s play with genres. In a discussion of critical readings of Munro’s story, I propose that the story’s resonation of significance lies in its daring composition of narrative threads where depths of meaning keep occurring depending on what aspects one is focusing on for the moment. Further, I suggest that a sense of completion is created in tone and paralleling of imagery. Meaning emerges in what I have called a story’s “possibility-space.” This term has affinities with what others have named “sideshadowing,” where rather than resisting closure, the story turns back into itself, and compels the reader to further reflect on the difficult issues of human behaviour raised in the story.

Keywords: Alice Munro, Possibility-space, Sideshadowing, Text analysis, “The Love of a Good Woman”

The Story and its Interpretations
“The Love of a Good Woman” occupies a central space in Alice Munro’s writing, both in terms of publication chronology — it is the title story of one of her middle collections — and in terms of its importance to her particular writing of short stories. It is one of her most complex stories, it has a layered narrative structure, and it is in this story that she excels in the skill of “keeping it all together” that has be-
come one of the characteristics of her art. Critics have grappled with this story since its publication, and it is especially the ending that continues to puzzle and amaze readers. From more than a dozen critical readings of this story I will in this paper highlight four interpretations that will serve as examples for how one might grasp different levels of its narrative. The reason for making a selection of four interpretations is of course spatial, but more importantly it is because some of the interpretations can be clustered in groups as they reveal similar ideas and conclusions. The ones that I will discuss in this paper are either the most recent or the most influential in terms of how creative their conclusions have shown to be. To start out I would like to mention Teresa M. Dobson who teaches at University of British Colombia. She has used "The Love of a Good Woman" in her classes to develop students’ writing and facilitate their engagement with complex narratives. She concludes that working with this story in a computer-based “wiki” environment is rewarding for students’ understanding of short fiction. I will not delve further into her study here because she does not offer an interpretation of Munro’s story that is of importance to how we might conclude a reading, but her study is interesting from a teaching perspective. She argues that engaging creatively with a work of fiction in writing assignments pushes the students further in their interpretative understandings, and it sharpens their critical skills. “The Love of a Good Woman” offers a rich detailed narrative open to possible readings that serves well to these kinds of assignments.

Before entering into the in-depth discussion of different interpretations of “The Love of a Good Woman,” I will briefly recapitulate the plot since it is crucial to know the story in order to grasp how meaning is woven into the intricately structured narrative. "The Love of a Good Woman," is a complex treatment of secrets in a small Canadian town. In this respect it is typically Munro. This has been her topic in collection after collection. What is not so typical about this story, though, is that it is divided into four sections, starting out with a brief introduction with an odd description of the town museum and some articles in the museum described in mysterious detail. A red box is particularly interesting. It contains instruments that belonged to the optometrist (eye doctor), Mr. Willens who drowned in the river in 1951, and the box is donated to the museum by an anonymous person (we can hear how the plot thickens already from the first paragraph). The story then continues with a remarkable find in section I. Three teenage boys who go for their first spring swim in the river find the body of Mr. Willens in his submerged car. They do not report their discovery to anyone immediately but instead wait until later to tell the local constable, who is too deaf to hear them, and the revelation is postponed in odd ways. Much later, one of the boys undramatically tells his mother, and the police can pick up the body.

As we go into the second section of the story, it shifts to a period some time after the death of Mr. Willens. A young woman and mother, Mrs. Quinn, is dying of kidney failure. She is cared for by a home nurse named Enid. Mrs. Quinn is portrayed as cranky and demanding, and Enid is described as a middle-aged spinster tormented by erotic dreams and occupied with doing good.
The third section links the first two sections together by recounting the story of Mr. Willens’s death, as Mrs. Quinn reveals it to Enid. Mrs. Quinn is having an eye examination in her house by Mr. Willens. He has a reputation for taking advantage of women. When Mrs. Quinn’s husband, Rupert, comes home and sees his wife with her skirt up her thighs and Mr. Willens’s hands on her leg, he knocks him down and beats his head on the floor until he dies. Mrs. Quinn comes up with the idea to push Mr. Willens and his car in the river, and she helps her husband carry out the plan.

In the fourth section Mrs. Quinn dies, and Enid, who has feelings for Rupert, believes he should go to the police and confess to killing Mr. Willens. Convinced that he cannot live in the world with such a secret, she tells herself that she will go to the trial every day and then wait for him while he is in prison. But she is not sure whether the story that Mrs. Quinn told her is true, and therefore she devises a scheme to test Rupert. She plans to have him row her out in the middle of the river, reveal that she cannot swim, and then tell him what she knows. This will give him the opportunity to kill her or regret his deed if the story is true. “The Love of a Good Woman” ends with Rupert getting the oars while Enid waits for him on the riverbank. The reader never knows whether Rupert killed Mr. Willens or whether he will kill Enid or whether they will become lovers.

Early interpretations of this story seemed to focus on one genre specific reading. A few focus on the romance and highlight genre expectations to bring together seemingly disparate elements into a coherent pattern. These critics read the story as being about a woman, Enid who has missed out on love until she reestablishes a connection with a man from her past, Rupert. No matter if he turns out to be a murderer and will eventually kill her too. The possibility of violence and murder is what other critics have paid close attention to arguing that “The Love of a Good Woman” is a Gothic horror story, a woman with a fatal attraction for self-sacrifice falls in love with a murderer and might become his next victim. And, of course we do pay attention to all the genre cues in the story, but at the same time we need to acknowledge that Munro’s use of them is off centre, and that at the end there is never a resolution of either of these genre plots. There simply are too many question marks at the end of the story to leave a satisfactory conclusion of that kind, and any sort of tracing of evidence in details of the story to find answers to the mysterious death of Mr. Willens will eventually lead to an impasse. Catherine Sheldrick Ross demonstrates this in a close reading of the different sections of the story. She concludes that any “interpretation of the story’s events is radically unstable, as readers are invited to consider incompatible possibilities for the provenance of the red box” (791). The story will turn out to be much more than a detective puzzle or a love drama. It raises far reaching questions about, human communication (guilt and penitence), what can be told, what must be told, and what is better to be kept hidden? What secrets are hidden, comes to the surface, are hidden again and resurfaces? What Munro gives account to, is also that events are not that easily described, when you try to tell them, but that they turn out to be a complex layer of facts, visible details, and human beings’ hidden and open feelings and moti-
ves. Instead of emphasising either the romance or the murder-story, we need to keep closer attention to “the mystery” as this genre encircles the other two.

Catherine Sheldrick Ross, a Munro Scholar since the 80s (she has written one book and several articles on Munro’s fiction), constructs a thematic reading of “The Love of a Good Woman” based on echoes from other stories. She argues that previous “experience with earlier Munro stories, where the patterns are clearer” and perhaps plainer, “provides a sort of scaffolding helpful in making sense of” later and more complex works (786). And, I believe that with a writer such as Munro who perpetually returns to the same themes, places, characters and even plots it is inevitable to make such connections. These connections is usually rewarding in terms of how they give an array of interpretative layers to events and stories. They give meaningful variations to the one story just read. Now that Munro has published her last story, at least this is what she has claimed in several interviews, and I think we will have to take her on her words considering her age and her health, it has shown that “The Love of a Good Woman” occupies a central place in her œuvre. By her biographer Robert Thacker, as well as by the Canadian literary scholar Dennis Duffy, “The Love of a Good Woman” is argued to be “a central Munro text” and a “capstone” and “pivotal work in the structure of her fiction.” As such it is a garden of forking paths into many other of Munro’s collections of stories. Ross envisions how this story can turn “into an encyclopaedic reservoir of stories, the particular one realized by any single reading depending on which echo of previous Munro (sic.) stories the reader hears, which detail the reader chooses to foreground, and which patterns the reader is prepared to see” (806). For example, Ross sees a connection to earlier stories in how a trait of wanting to include too many things and too many narrative threads is thematised in these earlier stories. Characters who are wannabe writers refuse to simplify or streamline their narratives. They include “too many things, too many things going on at the same time; also too many people” as do the protagonist in “Differently” (216). She receives the advice to concentrate on “the important thing” (216). However, this protagonist makes “a long list of all the things that had been left out and handed it in as an appendix to the story” (216). This gives us an idea of how important things and details are to Munro, also things that might seem off to the side. This is part of Munro’s creative eye, to see the connections between seemingly disparate things. The feeling then when reading “The Love of a Good Woman” is that every detail leads to a possible meaning. The red box for example that resurfaces in several sections, and that could have been donated by one of the boys, by Rupert or by Enid, but every wish to find out the concluding story about the red box leads to an impasse, and gives us a fuller understanding of the full importance of the thing in itself. It turns out that its meaning points in every direction, but it finally signifies nothing beyond itself and its alluring possibility to mean something.

Ross creates a fascinating pattern of connections with different Munro stories, and notes how differences in representations of the practical nurse over a series of stories reveal how the view of them are in part a function of who is doing the looking. Since most of the story proper of “The Love of a Good Woman” is seen
through the eyes of Enid herself, the events are constructed in a light sympathetic to her. What we get in Ross’s reading of the story is an introduction to a Munro world, how it is populated, how it is arranged and how it functions. What Ross does not give, however, is an interpretative clue to the conclusion of the total of the story.

We turn to, John Gerlach, the American short fiction scholar, who focuses on closure and ending as a particularly important feature for understanding short fiction. He starts off with the notion that “The Love of a Good Woman’ poses unusual problems for the reader at its conclusion—which is virtually no conclusion at all” (146) The problem with the story is that it offers no closure, no conclusion and practically no ending at all and this clashes with the reader’s desire for closure in any narrative. We will never know if Enid gets the prince, who is the murderer, or if there is a murder case at all. The story ends in a frustrating mystery, and Gerlach continues to grapple with this: “Stories often do end ambiguously, and we already have the serviceable term ‘open ending’ for such cases, but generally the choices for an open ending are primarily binary, rather than continuously indeterminate,” as is the case with this and several of Munro’s stories (148).

Gerlach concludes that Enid, as well as the readers, have “reached the limit of what we can know,” but that readers accept this since the eager to know is replaced by something else, namely the thrill of this unknown potent future. Gerlach borrows an analytical tool from Gary Saul Morson who in Narrative and Freedom: the Shadows of Time invents the term “sideshadowing” to capture narrative strategies that keep time and choice open. Sideshadowing is described as relying “on a concept of time as a field of possibilities” (151). Munro’s ending then, Gerlach continues to claim, is particularly interesting in how it refuses to give us a simplified satisfactory answer. Instead it gives us “a sense of presentness, of continuing uncertainty,” and reveals the complexity of the issues at stake that really matter, good and evil, confession and repression, and how these might be irresolvable (151). “Narrative, especially developed narrative,” Gerlach argues, “stories that approach novella length, or shorter stories with a dense texture, do have that tension for us: they give the illusion of the inevitable, the wrapped, the apocalyptica, one of our deepest needs, but we also don’t really want it to be so, we want just as deeply to experience the world alive at the brink of a new moment” (156). And this is what “The Love of a Good Woman” masterfully makes us experience. However, as I will show later there is a sense of the inevitable, of the dissolution of choice that is central to Munro’s writing, and as I will show later this can be recognised in the stories “possibility-space.”

The British scholar, Isla Duncan, makes a narratological reading of the story focusing on literary linguistics by examining “disarrangements,” and describing their purposes and effects. She displays Munro’s narrative strategies, the headings for each section and how these ambiguously refer to events that take place. Duncan explains how Munro’s manipulation of time, indicated by different verb-tenses and narrative perspectives builds expectation and dispense. She goes on to ask herself the question why Enid dislikes her patient so much. To my mind this is not the
most interesting question. I see much more at stake in the questions that appear around the mysteries of human behaviour, the human mind and how we make the choices we make. Munro seems to be ultimately fascinated by how people act and react, the consequences of their acts, not just in terms of what happens but how her characters react to what happens, and also to what happens in dreams and fantasies. Sometimes answers or echoes of an answer to what we meet in one story are to be found partly in another story. In the story “Circle of Prayer” from Munro’s sixth collection, *The Progress of Love*, two girlfriends discuss their taste for soap operas.

Trudy can’t stand to watch those old reruns of *Dallas*, to see the characters, with their younger, plumper faces, going through tribulations and bound up in romantic complications they and the audience have now forgotten all about. That’s what’s so hilarious, Janet says; it’s so unbelievable it’s wonderful. All that happens and they just forget about it and go on. But to Trudy it doesn’t seem so unbelievable that the characters would go from one thing to the next thing—forgetful, hopeful, photogenic, forever changing their clothes. That it’s not so unbelievable is the thing she really can’t stand. (259)

I believe that this passage gives a clue to what Munro is after in her stories, namely the amazing stuff of human behaviour, not on a surface level, but on an existential level. In his long-term study of the short story as genre, Charles E. May maintains that the short story is different in epistemology and ontology from its sibling, the novel. He claims that it is immanent to the short story that there exists some other reality that evades us. “The short story is the most adequate form to confront us with reality as we perceive it in our most profound moments” (The Nature of Knowledge 142). His arguments give a clue to what levels of meaning that are at stake in “The Love of a Good Woman.”

In terms of objects and their importance to the narrative, Duncan suggests that one need to refrain from reading them literally. “Ordinary harmless objects are transformed in the search for deeper meaning” (100), but they keep transforming in this search and create a pattern that emphasizes secrecy. This pattern of objects, Duncan connects to her reading of the ending of the story where the linguistic sign “if” plays an important part. This is the part where Enid visits Rupert with the intention of letting him know that she knows about Mr. Willens, but she has second thoughts and Rupert offers her a boat ride.

And the boat waiting, riding in the shadows, just the same. “The oars are hid,” said Rupert. He went into the willows to locate them. In a moment she lost sight of him. She went closer to the water’s edge, where her boots sank into the mud a little and held her. If she tried to, she could still hear Rupert’s movements in the bushes. But if she concentrated on the motion of the boat, a slight and secretive motion, she could feel as if everything for a long way around had gone quiet. (78, emphasis added)
In Duncan’s convincing reading, the conditional is a reminder to the readers that Enid’s benefits with marrying Rupert come with a price: the retention of a secret. Duncan demonstrates fascinating traits of Munro’s narrative, however her conclusion that the character Enid is far from hapless or vulnerable, but rather, single minded and determined, someone who grasps the opportunity presented to her; callous and cool blooded, without conscience is a simplified reading. Dennis Duffy sees Enid as “the clueless Gothic heroine” about to embrace a demon lover, but there are images that complicate the matter. What Munro comes close to doing is presenting her as being both or neither, of being more than what the narrative can possibly disclose. Consider how Munro describes another character in one of her earliest stories, “Walker Brothers Cowboy.” The protagonist is a young girl who is on an outing with her brother and father. In a moment of silent understanding between daughter and father, the protagonist has a vision of the depths of a person.

So my father drives and my brother watches the road for rabbits and I feel my father’s life flowing back from our car in the last of the afternoon, darkening and turning strange, like a landscape that has an enchantment on it, making it kindly, ordinary and familiar while you are looking at it, but changing it, once your back is turned, into something you will never know, with all kinds of weathers, and distances you cannot imagine. (18)

The father’s life is revealed in its full potential of being known and being other, slipping out of our wish to determine a character.

I see Munro’s stories as opening up and closing in into something I have called “possibility-space.” A possibility-space is characteristically seen or revealed in decisive moments and “is somehow connected to the necessary or inevitable” (Skagert, 18). At the moment when Enid is determined to make Rupert confess and mark him a murderer, disparate thoughts enter Enid’s mind, and what she has felt must be known is no longer of importance. “She hadn’t asked him yet, she hadn’t spoken” (75). Enid’s dissolution of decision is juxtaposed with an imagery of insects with a narrative intensity and a bearing on the conception of choice, but that “lacks explanatory moorings” (Skagert, 121). “Bugs no bigger than specks of dust that were constantly in motion yet kept themselves together in the shape of a pillar or a cloud. How did they manage to do that? And how did they choose one spot over another to do it in?” (78). The bugs are in perpetual motion just like characters’ lives through the narrative will open and close, reveal and obscure.

Catherine Sheldrick Ross suggests that the polarities of the good woman/bad woman are not fixed and Enid’s life and the events in the story are far more unsettled than for us to be able to fixate them into categories of good and bad, and as Ross has suggested echoes from previous stories help us see this. However, whereas Ross wants to place Enid among the variants of invading practical nurses, Mary McQuade in “Images” and Audrey Atkinson in “Friend of My Youth,” I see...
stronger parallels to protagonists of more evasive character. She is “stubborn” and “secretive,” and she can try a “joke where it had hardly a hope of working” (42, 33). She is a character who is allowed to keep her integrity, but as all the characters in this story she is immersed in the games of the mind, dreams, actions and thoughts that she has no control off. As I have argued in my dissertation on Munro’s short stories, “The Love of a Good Woman” is deeply concerned with the justification of choices and matters of good and evil. The question of guilt and penance looms large. There is a theological framework that is put in place by a seemingly causal reference to the Reformation, to the Edict of Nantes, to the phenomenon of prayers, to blessings, to penitence, to Catholicism, to depravity, and to the devil. In Enid’s rational and self-reassuring dismissal of these notions, their possibilities and implications accentuate their poignancy. On the one hand the Edict of Nantes materialises as a mere unit of useless information in a book. On the other hand, the Edict signals controversy over theological issues that have a bearing on the relation between conscience, depravity, guilt, and confession—things that concern Enid. These are the question that she poses: Is the attention to God, to depravity, to an attitude of evil and to filth to be answered by a human effort to be good? And, if a person does something very bad, do they have to be punished? Or ought there be surrender to the awareness that life “can get turned on its head in an instant” in a world where evil simply “grabs us,” where “pain and disintegration lie in wait” as “horrors” pushing every “lovely life” to “disaster,” and where “pretending it wasn’t so” only aggravates the “end” (52). Enid’s uncertainty and the stories’ ambivalence is accentuated by the two words “Surely not” (51).

Charles E. May rightly claims that “The Love of a Good Woman” is ambiguously open-ended and that the reader does not know “whether Enid confronts Rupert and, if she does, whether he pushes her in the river or rows them back to the shore” (Why Short Stories Are Essential 17). Of course we cannot disagree. However, I want to argue that the story does not primarily rely on the workings of ambiguity but on the phenomenon of possibility. The resolution of the story is the regeneration of Enid’s wish to do right, and her decision to confront Rupert. When she returns to the house all dressed up to meet with her destiny, her indecisiveness is key.

She hadn’t asked him yet, she hadn’t spoken. Nothing yet committed her to asking. It was still before. Mr. Willens had still driven himself into Jutland Pond, on purpose or by accident. Everybody still believed it, too. And as long as that was so, this room and this house and her life held a different possibility, an entirely different possibility from the one she had been living with (or glorying in—however you wanted to put it) for the last few days. The different possibility was coming closer to her, and all she needed to do was to keep quiet and let it come. (75-76)

It is not only for Enid that the events hold possibilities. The possibility-space works on a story-level as well and includes all the events in the story as they reveal their
complex layers, details, twists and turns, along the narrative flow, and as readers we revisit them continuously concerned with their meanings and interpretations. To illustrate this predicament, I borrow a description from a Swedish sculptor who explains his work *Room Without Appendix*.

What I want to stress by this title is that the sculpture is closed in itself. It certainly points in many directions, but it always suddenly returns and embraces its own earlier movements. Such compositions are often called ‘space-time’ as they are linked to the idea that by following an eternal coil with the eyes, one experiences a happening in time at the same time as the coil builds up a restricted space. The volume which we always demand in a sculptor is in this case more the air embraced by the coil than the material from which the coil is made. (Hesselgren, 324)

Applying this ‘space-time’ idea to literature we can see how a story is both unified and completed by its own structure, but by its layering it offers or points to interpretations in many directions. The different readings I have discussed here illustrate one thing that is also clear in Munro’s narratives, that while one aspect or area of the story or of a phenomenon is illuminated, other aspects will remain obscure. Things seem to be perpetually undulating between clarity and obscurity. These are the open secrets that Munro is after, and that she captures in story after story. The stories resonate significance but refuse to be pinpointed in one determinate interpretation. The potent image from the prologue of “The Love of a Good Woman” comes to mind—of the hole one looks through in the instrument found in the river—it has “various lenses” that can be moved, and underneath “the round forehead clamp is something like an elf’s head, with a round flat face and a pointed metal cap. This is tilted at a forty-five-degree angle to a slim column, and out of the top of the column a tiny light is supposed to shine. The flat face is made of glass and is a dark sort of mirror” (4). It is not farfetched to view this object as a metaphor for how the narrative work, as double-edged instrument that sometimes blurs and distorts, but that also clarifies. Munro’s stories clarify through patterns and connections.

Charles E. May, one of the most ardent spokesmen for the short story as a particular genre, argues persuasively in an article on Munro’s story “Passion,” that the novel and the short story present different interpretations of what reality is. Further, he concludes that the problem with criticism of the short story has always been the assumption that since the short story tells a story it must therefore be read by following the rules of reading long narratives, i.e. focus on plot, character, and ideology. However, the short story as practiced by Munro and all other great short story writers, does not depend on plot or character, but rather on some unspeakable significance by means of reiteration through pattern. If the short story does not hold together by plot or action, but rather reitera-
When reading short stories then, one needs to pay closer attention to repetitive rhythms in language and imagery. It is in Munro’s daring composition that something is achieved and understood. Loose ends are precisely what make the conclusion seem so large, enigmatic and brimming with possibility. In a CBC interview by Peter Gzowski on the publication of her collection *Open Secrets*, Munro reveals that what she is more and more set to do in her stories is to move away from what happened, to the possibility of this happening, or that happening, and a kind of idea that life is not just made up of the facts, the things that happened… But all the things that happen in fantasy, the things that might have happened, the kind of alternate life that can almost seem to be accompanying what we call our real lives.

She wants to get all those levels of life working together, and this is part of the complex reality that she captures, the strange and marvellous, flexible richness of the human mind.

**Works Cited**


Ross, Catherine Sheldrick. “‘Too Many Things’: Reading Alice Munro’s ‘The Love of a Good Woman.’” *University of Toronto Quarterly* 71.3 (2002): 786-810.

Text Analysis as the Basis for Teaching Academic Writing

Yelena Makarova
Belarusian State University, Minsk

Abstract: This article discusses the effectiveness of textual analysis for teaching students of sociology and psychology of the Belarusian State University to write research papers that conform to the expectations of the English speaking academic community.

Thorough analysis of the published texts in fields of students’ professional interests allows them to become familiar with the standard formats of research reports, to collect valuable data about the organisation of a typical experimental paper, of information and language conventions and to become aware of cultural constraints. Besides, it helps students to derive additional information on the subject they are interested in and to deepen their professional knowledge.

We proceed from the statement supported by many specialists that the English language of a research report is highly conventionalised and the organisational format for most experimental research papers is mainly the same.

Suggested four-step approach to the analysis of authentic texts and didactic outcomes of this analysis realised in the series of tasks for students’ independent work contribute greatly to the process of writing.

The technique of textual analysis outlined in this article proves to be optimal under the conditions of limited class time as it allows implementing four-skill approach to teaching English.

Introduction

The need for mastering academic English, both written and spoken, is becoming more obvious than ever before. Today’s students of higher educational establishments of Belarus are in a very different academic environment as compared to those who studied at universities just a few years ago. The rapid emergence of international exchange programs, the widespread adoption of Internet technologies are providing them with easy access to a far wider range of information sources than could possibly have been envisaged even 10 years ago. Additionally, university graduates are entering job markets where a good command of English gives them evident advantages and increases their career prospects. Therefore, understanding complex issues in their respective fields of study and communicating their ideas effectively are crucial skills both in reading and in writing and the development of these skills are to be integrated in the day-to-day teaching more intensively.
Unfortunately, today these skills are not being given the due attention. Significant curricula changes have reduced hours provided for the course of English. At present, the University course of English is designed for only 150 hours of class work and the Module on Academic Writing is limited to 20 hours. This limited time does not allow using standard textbooks on academic writing as they are intended for continuous long-term work. Besides, most publications on academic writing for undergraduate students focus mainly on the structure of sentences, paragraphs, essays, and their components, which is clearly important, but does not give holistic view of the structure of a research paper (Oshima; Bailey).

The present article offers an approach to teaching writing skills for research purposes based on textual analysis of original publications in the field of students’ professional interests.

Such approach could not only provide a model for writing a research report in English but also could help students to improve their vocabulary, grammar and reading skills.

Research and Second Language Writing

A research paper is not simply a summary of a topic by means of primary and secondary sources. This genre requires a student to spend time investigating and evaluating sources with the intent to offer interpretations of the texts in order to offer [repetition] a unique perspective on the issue. Writing research papers is an obligatory part of the curriculum of undergraduate course: students write term (course) papers annually and a diploma paper at the final course. Besides these main forms of academic writing, the students often write projects on professional topics, research reports, essays and other kinds of papers.

Some departments have short courses on Academic Writing in the Russian or Belarusian languages introducing the first year students to research work and forms of presenting the results of it. However, academic writing skills are mainly acquired in the process of writing annual research papers (course or term papers) and critical analysis of them by research supervisors. As the result of such practice, the first year students have basic knowledge on the general requirements of form and academic style in their native language, but skills of writing are being formed during the whole process of study.

Although research is an integral part of the academic career of a university student and each student at University is bound to do research work, for most students writing up the results of their own research in the form of reports or journal articles is a challenging task even in their native languages. Writing a successful academic paper in English presents an additional challenge, as it requires sufficient knowledge of English and, apart from that, pragmatic competence of a specific type. It involves both receptive and productive use of language: reading, evaluating sources, summarising, composing, expressing complex ideas appropriately, and respecting cultural constraints.

The module on Academic Writing as part of English for Professional Purposes concentrates on writing a research report and has been taught to the students of the
second year of the Faculty of Philosophy at two departments: Department of Psychology and Department of Sociology. Students come to the course on academic writing when they have already chosen the topic of their research, have discussed it with their research supervisors, have outlined the general pattern of the work and have already acquainted with some literature on the subject, and probably, what is more important, the students are interested in getting some new information on this subject. In spite of the fact that this preliminary work has been done in the native language of students, it could serve as the basis for writing in English. Thus, the aim of the module on Academic Writing is not to teach the students the research process itself, but to show how to translate the students’ research activity into written reports that conform to the expectations of the English-speaking scientific/academic community.

A text-centered approach to teaching academic writing
Writing has traditionally been taught in connection with reading activities as the link between writing and reading is apparent. However, the process of learning should not be limited to presenting students with ‘models of good writing’ and asking them to imitate these examples. The emphasis should be made on various rhetorical aspects of the text and social contexts the texts function. The notion of the structure of a research text is important and learners should be exposed to samples of different types of texts if they are to produce coherent texts of their own.

A large number of studies have shown that the English language of research papers is highly conventionalised (a fact that represents a great advantage for non-native speakers) and the organisational format for most experimental research reports is essentially the same (Weissberg & Buker; Blicq). Based on this premise, we can claim that if one can master the conventions, one can replicate the genre in an acceptable form.

Working with undergraduate students, it is important to make things simple and concentrate textual analysis, primarily, on the ways that other researchers organise the text: what comes first, what comes after, how parts are connected, what arguments are used in the text to convince the reader, what language means are used and other details. It allows the students to see how similar or how different the research papers are constructed in Russian and in English and to understand better cultural constraints. It is only natural that students bring with them a set of conventions characteristic of native academic tradition that are at odds with those of the academic world of English speaking community.

Analysing general organisation of the text of the published work
The first step of textual analysis is the analysis of the organisational format of a journal article as a whole.

Obviously, there is a considerable variation in the format of the published texts and organisation of the information in texts is different to a certain extent. In order to facilitate text analysis students are offered some articles in sociology or psychology of the same basic pattern of organisation, written according to IMRAD format.
It is one of the widely used organisational formats for most experimental research reports in social and behavioural sciences. As it is known, information in a typical experimental research report is organised into several parts with other optional elements merged into major stages. Typical sections of the experimental research report are Introduction, Method, Results and Discussion, which served to form acronym IMRAD.

Our teaching approach tends to follow the usual academic cycle of introducing, explaining, discussing at class, and reading articles and doing writing assignments mainly at home. So after working together at class, students are asked to find samples of published texts in the area of their interests (usually related to their term (course) papers and compare these original publications with the given standard format, analyse the differences and try to explain them.

Students’ attention is drawn to the fact that sections and subsections of the research reports are typically labeled, which is not characteristic for articles written in Russian. It is recommended while reading the text, to make notes on the sections and subsections of the text and report back at the next lesson.

**Writing a good Introduction**

The second step of textual analysis is the analysis of the organisational conventions of the Introduction. The introduction is the most important part of the paper not just for what it says about the topic, but for what it tells the reader about the writer's style and approach. The introduction to a research paper is one of the most challenging parts of the paper to write, it is therefore common for the Introduction to be one of the last parts of the paper to be completed in its final version.

Introductions are generally half a page in length, though they can run longer if the topic requires additional information. They usually begin with giving background information, demonstrate that the author is familiar with the important research that has been carried out in the area and end with the description of the aim and hypothesis. The authors usually offer a theoretical context to a paper, allowing readers to understand the reasoning behind their work. Well-written introductions set the tone for the paper, catch the reader’s interest, and communicate the hypothesis or thesis statement.

At class, students are offered one rhetorical model of an Introduction, which is often used in an IMRAD paper. The first major section or communicative block of the Introduction in this format is the setting for the problem, usually followed by the review of literature, which summarises, paraphrases and quotes the previous works read by the author of the current study. A well-written literature review gives support to the current study and identifies the gap between previous research works and the need for further investigation. After that, the purpose is formulated as the answer to the need expressed in the gap and the value, significance of the current research is claimed. Each communicative block of Introduction is analysed in terms of the use of information conventions and language conventions. The samples of introductions illustrating these typical blocks of information and their logical sequence are discussed at class. Obviously, writers do not always arrange the text of
the introductory section in this exact order. However, the given order of information is very common and may be recommended to the novice researchers for writing the introduction to their report in English based on their course papers or topic related to it.

Students are given the task: to analyse the Introduction of the original papers from their own fields, to compare it with the given pattern, to reveal the listed blocks of information and discuss the sequence in which they are given, to find other optional elements, if any, and report at class.

**Analysing language conventions**
The third step of textual analysis is the analysis of language conventions of each section of the Introduction. This includes:

- the use of typical word combinations and collocations for each stage of the Introduction,
- the use of sentence structure (fixed word order in English is one of the main stumbling blocks in communication, oral and written; the use of passive forms),
- the formal word choice,
- the use of transitional words and expressions,
- and other language conventions (the use of personal pronouns; the use of tenses, the structure of a paragraph etc.).

We believe that analysis of linguistic elements is important and useful as they affect the wider rhetorical objectives.

Before giving the next task: to find and write out of the text of their articles word combinations or collocations typical for each section of the Introduction, students analyse some samples, submitted by the teacher. For example, words denoting a certain period of time, which set the time frame for the research, are typical for the beginning of the report, for the setting. It is worth reminding students that these phrases form a typical context for the use of Present Perfect forms. The following samples from original papers may illustrate this statement:

- During the past 10-15 years Belarus has experienced lots of changes in social relations, politics, economy that have led to worsening of people’s living conditions.
- Recent years have seen a growing interest in the use of laser cutting technology for manufacturing processes.
- The past two decades have brought enormous changes in the environment for public service.
- In the relatively short span of sixty years, there has been an incredible evolution in the size and capabilities of computers.
- In the past sixty years, developments in the field of electronics have revolutionised the computer industry.
Since the middle of the 20th century, women around the world have been seeking independence and recognition.
In recent years, the privatisation of state owned businesses has become widespread in both in developed and developing nations.
Research on epistemological beliefs has been an active research topic in education psychology for less than 15 years.

Pointing out a gap — that is, an important research area not investigated by other authors, it is typical to use signal words but, however, although, etc. and modifiers such as few, little, or no. The authors try to underline the contrast between available knowledge and the need for further development, using the following patterns:

However, few studies...
But very little is known about...
Despite this flurry attention to the topic of… still little is known about
Although many studies have been done on..., little information is available on...
While much research has been devoted to..., little information is available on....

The following samples from published papers may illustrate this block:

… Many authors have raised concerns associated with the validity of inferences drawn from such test conditions. However, the role of self-regulation and test-taking motivation have been largely ignored. The scope of the present study is ...
…Although the Thomas-Kilmann Conflict Mode Instrument is being used extensively in American academic research, few studies have linked the intentions measured by these instruments with actual behaviours. Those studies that do exist have produced mixed results.
…Although much work has been done to date, more studies need to be conducted to ascertain the effects of microcomputer-assisted instruction in teaching various subjects. The purpose of this study was ...

In the statement of value the author justifies his/her research on the basis of some possible value or benefits the work may have to other researchers in the field or to people working in practical situations. This communicative block is not included in every Introduction. In reports written up as journal articles, this stage is often omitted. It is important for students to know that the statement of value is usually written in a way that suggests an attitude of tentativeness or modesty on the part of the author. It is conventional not to sound too sure of the benefits, but be more cautious. This is accomplished by using modal auxiliaries: may, can, could, should. The following samples from published papers may be easily paraphrased by students and used in their own papers:
The system described here could serve as the basis for further research into the relationship between gender and communication. The application of the strategies described here should increase the proportion of drug abusers who can be identified. This study may lead to a better understanding of correlation between language use and ethnic identity. The psychology of the examinee is a crucial factor in all assessment results and may assist in explaining discrepancies in performances emanating from test conditions.

Analysing the text of the published papers related to the subjects of their research students try to reveal typical phrases, signal words and other means and structural patterns. Students are much more likely to spot features and build a personal glossary if teachers have already introduced some of typical phrases and expressions and discussed their usage. The ability to identify and analyse the text structure helps students to comprehend the text more effectively and to organise their own writing.

Differences in documenting sources
The fourth step of textual analysis is comparing ways of documenting sources in the text itself and in the list of references. The methods of documenting sources in Russian research papers and papers published in English are different. APA editorial style, for example, looks very specific as compared to the standard, accepted in research papers in Belarus. When writing a research report in English and describing sources in the Reference section, students should be aware of these differences. Students are introduced to specific features of APA editorial style, analyse the samples and then are given the task to practice in documenting sources in APA style and explain the differences between the standards used in research papers in Russian and in English.

The final task is to write an Introduction, using the authentic papers as a model for the writing and observing the organisational format, information and language conventions, discussed in the process of study. Given the complexity of the task, some students need teacher’s help at this stage, others easily follow the recommendations of the format and proceed from controlled use of offered language patterns to free individual English writing. The second year students because of limited time and their capabilities write in English only the Introduction to their papers, master’s students write the whole paper according to IMRAD format.

Conclusion
The given approach to teaching academic writing based on textual analysis of authentic published works in the field of students’ professional interests proves to be optimal under the conditions of limited class time as it allows implementing four-skill approach to teaching English. Through reading, students have the oppor-
tunity of being exposed to well-organised and well-written pieces of academic writing, which helps them to improve their language capabilities and to reveal common schemes for writing reports. Through writing, students acquire the habit of expressing their ideas in a clear and culturally acceptable way. Through discussing activities, students improve their communication skills.

The approach outlined here proves to be effective as it gives students the opportunity not only to develop their language skills but also to derive valuable data about the subject they are interested in and to deepen their professional knowledge.

The given approach may become the basis for successful academic writing courses. The suggested stages of textual analysis of the authentic texts in fields of students’ professional interests allow them to become familiar with the standard formats of research reports and to become aware of information and language conventions and cultural constraints when writing in English. Teaching students to recognise the underlying structure of the text can help them organise their thinking in a manner similar to that used by the author and to develop their skills of reading and writing.

**Works Cited**


Abstract: In this chapter I present my doctoral project and an example analysis of a small part of the research data. The purpose of my doctoral project is to study the construction of professional identity in social authorities’ documents concerning children and to highlight in which ways the professionals handle institutional requirements for the documents. In Sweden these documents are known as Barn- och ungdomsutredningar, and it is estimated that 15–20 per cent of all children in Sweden are the target of these kinds of investigations at some point in their childhood.

I conduct a pilot study which can be described as a content analysis of the documents, and the most central concepts for the analysis are macro and micro themes. Two different investigation documents have been included in this pilot analysis and it should not in any way be seen as representative for the data of the whole study. I see the content analysis as a way to give insight into what kind of documents my study deals with. If the content of several documents of the same genre is analysed, this can demonstrate what kind of content is typically included and what information could have been included but is left out in some cases. For my study it can be interesting to see what selection of information social workers, as main participants in a professional discourse, make in different cases and thereby gain insight into what information they consider crucial. I regard this as one aspect of the social workers’ professional identity. The results indicate that investigation documents of this kind can focus on persons of different roles in different cases. In one of the investigations the focus is entirely on the child and the other investigation focuses more on parent. The overall theoretical framework of the study is Critical Discourse Analysis.

Introduktion
Socialarbetares förmåga att kommunicera med klienter och kolleger har uppmärksammat tidigare (se exempelvis Hall, Gunnarsson m.fl.), och barn- och ungdomsutredningar utgör en betydande del av socialarbetares skriftliga kommunikation. Jag ser dessa texter som en arena där socialt arbete äger rum, realiseras och konstitueras (jfr Hall 3–4). Syftet med det här kapitlet är att presentera mitt avhandlingsprojekt och en exempelanalys av en mindre del av studiens material.
Avhandlingen syftar på språket i socialtjänstens barn- och ungdomsutredningar, även kallade barnavårdsutredningar. Avhandlingen syftar på att studera handläggares konstruktion av professionell identitet i socialtjänstens barn- och ungdomsutredningar och att belysa på vilka sätt som de professionella hanterar institutionella krav som ställs på de aktuella texterna. Med min studie vill jag uppmärksamma de professionellas användning av språket och belysa språkets roll för det dagliga arbetet. Jag menar att studien kan tjäna som en hjälp för skribenter av utredningar att få syn på sin språkanvändning och bli medvetna om på vilka sätt deras språkliga val bidrar till att konstruera deras roller som professionella. En ökad medvetenhet om texternas struktur och språk kan leda till att skribenterna kan ta större kontroll över både sitt yrkesskrivande och sin profession och utveckla båda i önskad riktning.

Barn- och ungdomsutredningarna är texter som aktualiserar enskildas barns situation. Syftet med en barn- och ungdomsutredning är att utreda om ett barns situation är sådan att insatser från socialtjänsten är nödvändiga för att barnets behov ska tillgodoses (Clevesköld m.fl. 215). Barn- och ungdomsutredningar görs i regel för personer under 18 år, men det finns undantag som medger att även äldre unga vuxna kan utredas inom ramarna för den här typen av utredning (Sundell och Egelund 46). Av alla barn i Sverige beräknas 15–20 procent bli föremål för en barn- och ungdomsutredning någon gång under sin uppväxt (Sundell m.fl. 184).


En barn- och ungdomsutredning kan inledas genom en ansökan, en anmälan eller genom myndighetens eget initiativ (SFS 2001:453, kap. 11, § 1). Ansökningar till socialtjänsten kan göras av exempelvis föräldrar för att få hjälp att tillgodose barns behov, och anmälningar kan göras av exempelvis skolan om att barns behov inte tillgodoses (Friis 2003:16). Därutöver kan socialtjänsten inleda utredningar på eget initiativ om de ser någon anledning till det. Utredningar inleds först efter att socialtjänsten i en förhandsbedömning bedömer att ärendet kan generera insatser (Socialstyrelsen 2006a:31), och när det sker ska i regel ett särskilt dokument, kallat utredning, upprättas (Clevesköld m.fl. 215). Socialtjänstens handläggare som utreder ärendet formulerar en eller flera frågor om barnets situation och samlar därefter in information som värderas och analyseras, varefter ett förslag till beslut formuleras av handlägaren (Sundell m.fl. 29). Barn som har nått 15 års ålder har juridisk rätt att föra sin egen talan i utredningar som rör dem själva, medan föräldrar och social-
arbete förväntas se till yngre barns rättigheter i utredningsprocessen (Sundell m.fl. 111–112; SFS 2001:453, kap. 11, § 10). Även barn under 15 år kan lyssnas till om det ses som en fördel i ärendet. En utredning kan leda till insatser från Socialtjänsten: barnet kan till exempel ges samtalsstöd, missbruksbehandling eller bli omplacerat till ett familjehem eller en institution. Andra insatser kan vara att hela familjen ges en kontaktfamilj eller ett strukturerat behandlingsprogram (Sundell m.fl. 18).

Mottagare av barn- och ungdomsutredningar är de personer som utredningen berör men också tjänstemän på andra myndigheter och juridiska ombud. Vikten av att dokumenten anpassas till de berörda betonas, till exempel i Klarspråk i socialtjänsten (Lundin och Wedin 2009).


På barn- och ungdomsutredningar finns formella krav på textutformning och på hur innehåll behandlas. Dokumentationen ska:
- vara tillräcklig, väsentlig och ändamålsenlig
- vara tydligt skriven
- ange källa för uppgifterna
- skilja på faktiska omständigheter och bedömningar
- ange vem som har upprättat handlingen
- visa respekt för den enskildes integritet
(Socialstyrelsen 2006b:43–46)


Trots de formella kraven som finns på barn- och ungdomsutredningar så har texterna stor potential att utöva makt. Ett skäl till det är att texterna utgör beslutsunderlag i ärenden som inkluderar en enskild part och en myndighetspart. Därmed

Sammantaget framstår det okontroversiellt att påstå att texternas konstruktion av verklighet, individer och deras roller har stor betydelse för enskilda personer. Dokumenten påverkar och formar verkligheten. Skribenten av en utredning, tillika myndighetsrepresentanten, har alltid kontroll över konstruktionen av texten, och ”[a]s a narrator-actor, the social worker has control over the story” (Hall m.fl. 1997:280).

**Teoretiska utgångspunkter**

Studier av identitet manifesterad i talat språk är talrika. Exempelvis har dialekt med språkbrukares identitet att göra, liksom sättet att förhålla sig i ett samtal. Däremot har identitet manifesterad i skriftspråk inte studerats i lika stor utsträckning, kanske på grund av att uppenbara identitetsdrag försvinner i skriftliga kanaler. De senaste två decennierna har dock bland annat Roz Ivanič argumenterat för att språkbrukares identitet även kan studeras i skriftspråklig kommunikation. Lexikala, textkompositionella och syntaktiska val bidrar till att konstruera skribenters identitet. Att navigera bland dessa textuella kategorier innebär att skribenter positionerar sig mot både texters innehåll och texters mottagare. Ivanič och Camps menar att sådan positionering kan vara av tre olika slag: ideationell, interpersonell och textuell (Ivanič och Camps 4). De tar ett kliv ur den traditionella tolkningen inom Systemisk-funktionell lingvistik (SFL) som säger att interpersonella förhållanden förhandlas inom språkets interpersonella metafunktion, men även om positionering görs genom val inom
flera olika metafunktioner så begränsas skribenter i sina val av kulturella ramar och diskurser:

*W*riters positioning themselves by the discourse types they draw upon. They are constrained in this by the limited array of discourse types to which they have access, and by the patterns of privileging among discourse types in the context in which they are writing. (Ivanič 55)

En utgångspunkt för mig är alltså att texter – utöver att förmedla ett specifikt textinnehåll – bär på information som säger något om skribentens identitet och om hur skribenter positionerar sig i texter genom både ordval och grammatiska konstruktioner (textuell metafunktion) och genom det valda textinnehållet (ideationell metafunktion). Sammantaget ser jag skribenters innehållsanknutna och formanknutna val som resurser för att konstruera och manifesteras olika aspekter av skribenternas identitet, och i varje text blir någon aspekt av skribentens identitet synlig.

Min studie kan beskrivas som en text- och diskursanalys av socialtjänsten barn- och ungdomsutredningar. Det medför att jag ansluter mig till ett socialkonstruktivistiskt synsätt på text. En socialkonstruktionistiskt utgångspunkt innebär att både textproducerer och textmottagare skapar mening i texter enligt tidigare erfarenheter och sociala konventioner. Med det följer att språkanvändning påverkas av sociala förhållanden samtidigt som sociala förhållanden påverkas av språkanvändning (Fairclough 2010a:92). För meningsskapande av språk är kontexter avgörande. Språket är relativt i meningen att det kan bära på olika innebörd i olika kontexter (fr Blommaert 8), och i olika kontexter genereras olika diskurser, det vill säga olika sätt att använda språk som kommunikativ och meningsskapande resurs. Kontexter och språkbrukares sociokulturella bakgrund har en begränsande inverkan på meningsskapandet av text.


Texter, diskursiva praktiker och sociala praktiker är alla bärare av ideologi, och inom alla dessa nivåer av en diskurs förhandlas makrelationer mellan individer som är närvarande i diskursen. Ideologier som är närvarande i diskursen reflekteras i alla tre nivåerna. Dock finns det alltid möjlighet att förändra dessa ideologier, och det kan enligt Fairclough göras genom systematisk kritisk granskning och blottläggning av de rådande ideologierna i de olika nivåerna (Fairclough 2010b:67–68). Det bör påpekas att när Fairclough och andra teoretiker som han hämtat inspiration ifrån, som Louise Althusser och Antonio Gramsci, talar om ideologi avser de inte de klas-
siska ideologiska forumen som liberalism och socialism, utan syftar istället på en mer abstrakt betydelse av begreppet ideologi. I denna mening av begreppet båddas ideologi in i språk och kultur och blir därmed de naturliga sätten för människor i en viss diskurs att tolka sin omgivning. Ideologin i den här meningen upprätthåller de strukturer som ses som självklarheter och som förknippas med sunt förnuft i ett visst kulturellt och historiskt förankrat sammanhang. De blir därför i någon mening dolda. "Ideology work […] by disguising its ideological nature" (Fairclough 2010b: 67).

Figur 1: Dimensioner i diskurser

![Diagram](image)

Hämtad från (Fairclough 1992: 73)

I min studie utgör Barn- och ungdomsutredningarna texten i Faircloughs modell, och socialtjänsten utgör den diskursiva praktiken. Inom den är många diskurser närvarande, och en diskurs som är speciellt intressant för min studie kan beskrivas som en professionell diskurs. Enligt Gunnarsson (5) är det omöjligt att definitionsmässigt dra någon exakt skiljelinje mellan professionella diskurser och andra diskurser, men hon lyfter fram följande sex punkter som särskilt viktiga i professionella diskurser: (1) expertdiskurs inom ett visst område, (2) målorienterad diskurs, (3) konventionaliserad diskurs, (4) diskurs i en socialt organiserad grupp, (5) diskurs som är beroende av samhälleliga system, (6) dynamiskt föränderlig diskurs. På samma sätt som inom alla diskurser kan språkets betydelse i professionella diskurser inte underskattas:

"We use language to construct professional knowledge. And if we consider a professional group as a whole, we see that its professional language has developed as a means of expressing this professional view of reality.” (Gunnarsson 18)
Material

Mitt avhandlingsprojekt ingår i projektet Texter med tyngd som syftar till att studera myndighetsstexter inom polisväsendet, skolväsendet och socialtjänsten. I mitt avhandlingsprojekt aktualiseras socialtjänstens dokument barn- och ungdomsutredningar. Det är dokument som är belagda med sekretessskydd (2009:400, kap. 21 § 1, kap. 26, § 1). En etikprövning (Dnr 102-09) vid Regionala etikprövningsnämnden i Linköping är genomförd och projektet har givits tillstånd att samla in maximalt 100 barn- och ungdomsutredningar. Det slutliga antalet utredning som ingår i projektet är i skrivande stund inte fastställt, men det beräknas till 20 stycken jämt fördelat på två kommuner.


Temaanalys

Dokumenten som studeras är föremål för sekretess för att skydda identiteterna hos personerna som nämns i utredningarna. Det innebär att många personer aldrig kommer i kontakt med den här typen av texter. För att skapa en bild av innehållet och strukturen i dokument som studien berör gör jag en innehållsanalyse. För socialt och kulturellt orienterad forskning är kommunicerat textinnehåll centralt, eftersom det är textinnehållet som är betydelsebärande och förmedlas till mottagaren. Innehållsanalys av texter kan också visa vilka föreställningar som skribenterna omfattas av. I det här kapitlet analyseras textinnehåll i utredningarna genom en temaanalys.

Temaanalyserna åskådliggör både skribenternas informationsurval, det vill säga vad handläggarna väljer att fokusera på, och exempel på vilken typ av ärenden och problem som socialtjänsten handlägger. I denna studie blir därmed temaanalyserna ett sätt att komma fram till vad socialarbetarna, som huvudsakliga deltagare i en professionell diskurs, ser som angeläget att aktualisera i utredningarna och inom vilka ämnesområden de rör sig i utredningsprocesserna. Temaanalyser av hela mitt
material kan också visa vilken typ av information som typiskt sett inkluderas i utredningar, och vilken typ av information som kunde varit med men som uteslutits. Enligt SFL:s beskrivning förhandlas identitet och relationer i den interpersonal metafunktionen (Halliday och Matthiessen). I kontrast härtill föreslår Ivanič and Camps att skribenter positionerar sig, och därmed konstruerar identitet, i den interpersonal, den ideationella och den textuella metafunktionen. De använder begreppet ideationell positionering för att beskriva hur textständande konstruerar identitet genom att “talking and writing about something” (11). Även om innehållsanalyserna som presenteras här inte kan ge någon detaljerad bild av allt som ryms i utredningarna så fungerar dessa temaanalyser som ett sätt att hjälpa läsaren att skapa sig en uppfattning om innehållet i texterna.

Utöver lagar har skribenter av utredningarna formella mallar och föreskrifter samt informella traditioner och ideologiska utgångspunkter att förhålla sig till i skrivprocessen. Sammantaget konstituerar dessa riktlinjer textgenten barn- och ungdomsutredningar, och de har en begränsande inverkan på skribenternas val av innehåll. Eftersom texterna ingår i handläggarnas yrkesdiskurs kommer varje barn- och ungdomsutredning som skrivs inom socialtjänsten att reproduera och rekonstruera den professionella identiteten hos handläggarna.


mulerar sitt beslut i ärendet eller sitt förslag till beslut, i de fall handläggaren inte har delegation att fatta beslutet. Resultaten av indelningen av dokumenten i fyra delar gör det möjligt att lokaliserera teman till dokumentens övergripande struktur.


Fastställandet av makroteman har i vissa fall föregåtts av identifiering av teman på en lägre nivå – mikroteman. Detta har varit ett sätt för mig att avgöra makroteman i mer komplicerade fall, och i vissa fall grundar sig slutsatser som dras av analyserna på information som bara blir synlig genom att segmentera texterna i mikroteman. I likhet med makroteman så avgörs mikroteman med utgångspunkt i textinnehållet. Exempel på mikroteman är: Positiv förändring för barnet och Förutsättningar för barnets positiva utveckling (vilka båda ingår i makrotemat Utredares bedömning av positiv förändring för barnet). På grund av tvära kast i textinnehållet, vilket får konsekvenser för textkompositionen, så varierar i vissa fall (speciellt i utredning Ä1E1) ordomfånget i makro- och mikroteman kraftigt. Makro- och mikroteman ska dock inte förstås i förhållande ordomfång utan som semantiska kategorier, vars innehåll kan samlas under en och samma beteckning för textinnehållet eller för vad en text handlar om.

**Resultat av temaanalyserna**

I det följande redovisas resultaten av temaanalyser av två utredningar. Tabellerna visar vilka delar som tillsammans bildar utredningarna, vilka makroteman som ingår i utredningarna samt vilka mikroteman som har stor betydelse för förståelsen av vad utredningarna handlar om. Det är också möjligt att utläsa i vilken ordning som teman tas upp, och även ordmassan för olika teman. För att tabellerna inte ska bli för omfattande så redovisas mikroteman enbart i urval. De mikroteman som tas med i tabellerna är sådana som har stor betydelse för förståelsen av vad utredningen handlar om.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Utredningsdelar</th>
<th>Makrotema</th>
<th>Mikrotema i urval</th>
<th>Ord</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Inledning</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Anledning till utredning</td>
<td></td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inkommet fax</td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mammans alkoholproblem</td>
<td></td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tidigare kontakt ang. barnet</td>
<td></td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Utredningens frågeställningar</td>
<td></td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets skolgång</td>
<td></td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mammans missbruk</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Förändring av barnets situationen</td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Utredningens genomförande</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bedömningsunderlag</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Händelser under utredningstiden</td>
<td></td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mammans allmäntillstånd</td>
<td></td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mammans alkoholanv. och LOB</td>
<td></td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets skolgång</td>
<td></td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mammans alkoholanv.</td>
<td></td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mammans behov av stöd</td>
<td></td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets sysselsättning</td>
<td></td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bedömning</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Händelser under utredningstiden</td>
<td></td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mammans allmäntillstånd</td>
<td></td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mammans alkoholanv. och LOB</td>
<td></td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Utr. bedömn. av pos. förändr. för barnet</td>
<td></td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Utr. bedömn. av pos. förändr. för mamma</td>
<td></td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Utr. bedömn. av mammans behov av stöd</td>
<td></td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Avslutning</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mål för utveckling</td>
<td></td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Att säkra barnets skolnärvaro</td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Att säkra mammans självförtr. och mående</td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Att säkra att mamman är drogfri</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Insatser för mamman</td>
<td></td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Förslag till beslut</td>
<td></td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Utredningsavs. med insats för mamman</td>
<td></td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Tabell 2: Tema på olika nivåer i utredning B

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Utredningsdelar</th>
<th>Makrotema</th>
<th>Mikrotema</th>
<th>Ord</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inledning</td>
<td>Anledning till utredning</td>
<td></td>
<td>1514</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Telefonkontakt med soc.</td>
<td></td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets drogmissbruk</td>
<td></td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tidigare kontakt med soc.</td>
<td></td>
<td>510</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Händelser under utredningstiden</td>
<td></td>
<td>762</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Utredningens genomförande</td>
<td></td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bedömningsunderlag</td>
<td>Barnets hälsotillstånd</td>
<td></td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets drogproblem</td>
<td></td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets självmordsförsök</td>
<td></td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets drogproblem</td>
<td></td>
<td>1373</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets skolgång</td>
<td></td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets boende</td>
<td></td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets skolgång</td>
<td></td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets fritid</td>
<td></td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets boende</td>
<td></td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets familj</td>
<td></td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Insatser under utredningstiden</td>
<td></td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bedömning</td>
<td>Barnets personliga egenskaper</td>
<td></td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets skolgång</td>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets drogproblem</td>
<td></td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets sysselsättning</td>
<td></td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets drogproblem</td>
<td></td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barnets bedömning</td>
<td></td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Utredarnas bedömning</td>
<td></td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Diskussion av temaanalyser

I utredning B behandlas ett ärende om en tonårsflickas drogmissbruk. Temaanalysern visar att handläggaren fokuserar utredning på att beskriva olika aspekter av barnets drogproblem. Vid en närmare granskning av det återkommande makrotemat Barnets drogproblem blir det synligt att det framför allt är flickans försök att på olika sätt avsluta sitt missbruk, antingen på egen hand eller genom olika former av avgiftningsprogram, som lyfts fram, men också beskrivningar av hennes missbruk görs. Mikroteman som handlar om avgiftning omfattar totalt 1 391 ord, medan mikroteman som rör drogmissbruket uppgår till 818 ord. Dessa mikroteman rymms båda inom makrotemat Barnets drogproblem. Ett tydligt resultat är att de avsnitt
vari någon annan person tematiseras ges förhållandevis litet textutrymme. Att det nästan enbart är barnet som tematiseras i utredningen kan ses som ett uttryck för att handläggarna lokalisera problemet till barnets egna handlingar: missbruket. En tolkning av det är att ett drogproblem ses som ett individuellt problem som lokaliseras till en enskild person, och att faktorer i en enskilds omgivning har sekundär betydelse för problemet. I utredningen framgår det också att barnet lider av ”en underliggande depression som bör behandlas såväl med medicin som med samtaltre- rapi” (i makrotema Tidigare kontakt med soc.). Ett alternativ för de professionella hade varit att ge barnets psykiska ohälsa större utrymme i utredningen och eventuellt fokusera insatser även mot denna, istället för att bara fokusera på drogproble- met. Utredarnas prioriteringar ger intryck av att de anser att drogmissbruk är ett mer angeläget problem än psykisk ohälsa.

En skillnad mellan utredningarna som belyses av temaanalyserna är att personer med olika roller aktualiseras i utredningarna. Denna skillnad mellan utredningarna bör betraktas mot bakgrund av ärendenas olika art. Barnet i den ena utredningen (B) är äldre än barnet i den andra (19 respektive 7 år); dessutom är ärendetyperna olika. Barnet i B har ett eget drogmissbruk, medan det är mamman i den andra utredningen som missbrukar alkohol. Detta innebär en skillnad med avseende på vari- från hoten mot de två barnen lokaliseras. Det äldre barnet befinner sig i en situation där barnets egna handlingar utgör en risk mot barnet, medan det yngre barnet befinner sig i en situation där mamman handlingar utgör en risk mot barnet. Att hoten mot de två barnen lokaliseras till olika källor framgår tydligast i de föreslagna insatserna respektive besluten om insatser.


Temaanalyserna har belyst vad som sägs i utredningarna men inte hur innehåll komuniceras och framställs. Som nästa steg i studien planerar jag att undersöka hur skribenterna med hjälp av språkliga resurser positionerar sig själva gentemot textinnehåll och andra textdeltagare. Sådana analyser kan skapa en bild hur skribenterna använder språket som resurs i konstruktioner av en professionell identitet, och för dessa analyser ser jag Faircloughs och Ivanics teoretiska ramverken som lämpliga förklaringsmodeller.

Det här kapitlet är tänkt att fungera som en presentation och ett sätt att väcka intresse för och reaktioner på mitt forskningsprojekt. Kontakta mig gärna angående synpunkter på projektets vidare inriktning. Jag nås enklast via e-post: peter.svensson@lnu.se

**Summary**

In this chapter I have given a presentation of my doctoral project and a pilot analy- sis of a small part of the research data. The purpose of my doctoral project is to study the construction of professional identity in social authorities’ documents con-
cerning children and to highlight in which ways the professionals handle the institutional requirements for the documents. In Sweden these documents are known as Barn- och ungdomsutredningar, and it is estimated that 15–20 per cent of all children in Sweden are the target of these kinds of investigations at some point in their childhood (Sundell et al. 184). By doing the study I want to draw attention to the professional’s use of language and the role of language in their everyday work-related activity.

The purpose of Barn- och ungdomsutredningar is to investigate whether the child’s social situation is of such a kind that the social authorities’ intervention is necessary to meet the needs of the child (Clevesköld et al. 215). Every document also serves as the basis for decisions in this matter, and the documents can result in different kinds of actions taken by the authorities. An investigation is written if the social authorities have doubts about the child’s welfare, and most investigations are initiated either because of an application – for example made by the child’s parents, or because a problem has been reported – for example by school. Typically the document concerns children under the age of 18 but there are exceptions.

The writing process can be described as a collective activity (Lundström 125) because some parts of the texts can have been copied and pasted from previous investigations of different kinds. The writers of the document are professionals in the municipal social welfare authorities, and most often they have a degree in the academic field of social work. For them, the investigations functions, among other things, as an arena from where the profession can manifest its knowledge and competence of the field. The texts become a tool for the profession to claim a field of knowledge, a work domain and a discourse where the social workers can establish a professional domain. Professions are constantly struggling in an inter-professional competition (Abbott 36) to enclose a certain discourse and mark it off against other closely related professions, which constantly tries to expand their professional territories.

The pilot study in this chapter can be described as a content analysis of the documents, and the most central concepts for the analysis are macro and micro theme. In the pilot analysis two different investigation documents have been included and the small portion of data that has been analysed should not in any way be seen as representative for the whole study’s data.

I see the content analysis as a way to give insight into what kind of documents my study deals with. If content analysis is performed on several documents of the same genre, for example Barn- och ungdomsutredningar, the analysis can demonstrate what kind of content is typically included and what information could have been included but is left out in some cases. Drawing on Ivanič and Camps, ideational aspects of texts, e.g. content, can demonstrate aspects of writers’ identity. For my study, the social workers’ selection of content is therefore interesting. Analyses of the content give insight into what kind of information the social workers consider crucial. The result of the pilot study indicates that investigation documents of this kind can focus on persons of different roles in different cases. In one of the inve-
stigations the focus is entirely on the child and the other investigation focuses more on the parent.

Works Cited


The present text, in terms of thematic composition, in a considerable measure replicates my presentation at the Text Analysis Symposium, held in April at Kristianstad University. It is primarily concerned with a linguistically-oriented analysis of written texts, produced by high school pupils studying at three different state-owned schools, with two of them located in Malmö and the third in Lund. The particular names of the educational establishments are not mentioned, due to their irrelevance with respect to the nature of the themes discussed, as well as the results obtained. Another reason for not including names is related to the perceived confidentiality of the information henceforth presented. In light of a subsequent substantial increase in my employment as a teacher of English, the present text should justifiably be perceived as an expanded version of the original presentation. What constitutes a both quantitative and qualitative addition is the thematically relevant data - obtained during the period succeeding my participation in the April symposium - pertaining to the specific linguistic phenomena under discussion: systematic violation of subject-verb agreement; inaccurate indication of the grammatical category of possession.

The present section serves to briefly acquaint the reader with contextualised background information pertaining to my professional involvement in the Swedish educational system at a high-school level.

My engagement in the Swedish high-school system commenced in October 2013. Having obtained internship as a teacher of English as a second language at one of the most prominent high-schools in Malmö, I assumed responsibility for four groups, which involved teaching them English until January, 2014. Two of the groups in question are enrolled in the internationally recognised International Baccalaureate programme; one group are enrolled in the natural sciences programme, whereas the fourth group are studying the social sciences programme, as established by the relevant curricula. That the pupils are enrolled in different programmes illustrates that, regardless of the thematic composition of each programme and the specific requirements accompanying it, the vast majority of pupils have been discovered to be prone to producing incorrect grammatical constructions, particularly as regards subject-verb agreement. Possible causes underlying this phenomenon are given consideration in the following section. What is of relevance is that all of the four groups study English at level 7 – the highest level taught at high-school level.
In addition to working with works of literature, my tasks as an intern included the administration, as well as the checking, of such writing tasks as the production of a formal letter of complaint and an argumentative essay.

During the period February – April, 2014, I obtained temporary employment as a teacher at the educational establishment where I had completed my internship, as well as at a high-school in Lund. My professional involvement entailed teaching English to groups studying the language at different levels: 5, 6 and 7, respectively, as established by the relevant educational body (Skolverket). My temporary involvement in the English teaching process at the school in Lund involved the administration and subsequent checking of an in-class written assignment: discussion essay.

Subsequently, from April till June 2014, I obtained 60% employment at another high-school located in Malmö, which included teaching English at levels 5 and 6 to three different groups. Amongst the traditionally established responsibilities attached to the position of a teacher of English, during the above specified period I was responsible for checking and marking the argumentative essays that my pupils produced as part of the national examinations.

As already mentioned, my experience as a teacher of English at three different schools involved the administration and checking of written assignments. This provided me with an opportunity to identify the following problematic linguistic phenomena: systematic violation of subject-verb agreement; incorrect indication of the grammatical category of possession. What justifies organising the thematic composition of my contribution around the above highlighted linguistic occurrences is the fact that they have been discovered to exist, to a varying degree, in approximately two-thirds of all the texts I have checked.

As highlighted in the previous section, the discussion in this article focuses on: violation of subject-verb agreement: 2) incorrect indication of the grammatical category of possession. These problematic linguistic patterns have been discovered to exist in approximately two-thirds of all the written texts I have checked. Several examples pertaining to subject-verb agreement are presented below, exemplifying the problematic patterns most frequently encountered:

1) “…many people has problems with…”
2) “…the person I am talking to are chatting…”
3) “…no matter what they thinks…”
4) “…what I likes is that…”

Since linguistic interference can reasonably be regarded as a major factor influence pupils’ choice of grammatical constructions that involve verb conjugation, it would be relevant to provide the corresponding equivalents in the Swedish language:

1) “…många människor har problem med…”
2) ”…den som jag pratar med chattar…”
3) ”...ovasett av vad som de tror…”
4) ”...vad som jag gillar är att…”
The above examples demonstrate that irrespective of whether the subject function is performed by a single unit or a complex construction the verb in Swedish remains does not change. This fact can therefore be considered as influencing, probably at a sub-conscious level, Swedish-speaking pupils when it comes conjugating the verb in the English language.

A considerable number of high-school pupils are prone to produce incorrect patterns that include both plural and singular forms of the grammatical subject in first and second person. This can serve to substantiate the assumption that the form of the subject has little or no influence over the choice that pupils make when conjugating the verb following it. The extent to which this can be attributable to interference from the respective structural characteristics of the grammatical system of the Swedish language is beyond the scope of the current discussion. This could constitute the object of a separate investigation within the field of contrastive linguistics.

What should receive attention is whether the above patterns exemplify an error, which would involve the acquisition of grammatically incorrect knowledge (Krashen 1981), or a mistake – which could be attributable to different factors influencing text-production. Such factors may potentially include: unconscious interference from the grammatical system of Swedish, momentary distraction or content assuming priority over form (Richards & Rodgers 2001). The latter could partially be attributable to a marginalisation of grammar in foreign language teaching, which could constitute an independent object of investigation.

One of the potential influencing factors mentioned above is content assuming priority over form. This deserves some attention because it is one of the distinguishing features of the communicative approach in foreign language teaching, which primarily focuses on the development of communicative competence, and which is to a large extent applied by teachers in Sweden (Björk 2002: 39). This method advocates that the main responsibility of the teacher is to encourage and facilitate communication in the foreign language (Richards & Rodgers 2001: 78). The focus on verbal fluency and comprehensibility of the communicative approach has caused anxiety among some teachers because it marginalises the role of grammar (Richards & Rodgers 2001: 79). What is prioritised during practice is verbal communication in a variety of situations, and the teacher should not interrupt the communicative activities to correct grammar mistakes. The teacher assumes the role of a participant in the communicative activities (Björk 2002: 7). Grammar receives attention at the end of the instructional session, which does not necessarily include contrastive analysis between the foreign language and the pupils’ mother language. Thus systematic focus on communicative fluency and partial marginalisation of grammatical particularities can possibly lead to pupils neglecting grammatical correctness.

By means of interviews it has been established that in the majority of cases the constructions involving violation of subject-verb agreement exemplify a mistake, generated by a combination of factors such as those enumerated in the above paragraph. The scope of the present article makes it impossible to arrive at scientifically based conclusions: the nature of the factor(s) affecting pupils’ choice when
conjugating verbs in English, as well as the degree of their influence, remains an object of a separate inter-disciplinary investigation.

Approximately one-third of all the pupils who have produced incorrect subject-verb constructions have been discovered – through an interview – to have made an error. This demonstrates unawareness of the rules governing subject-verb agreement in English. The extent to which this can be attributable to a teaching trend involving the marginalisation of grammar can be determined by an independent investigation.

By contrast, the cause(s) underlying the incorrect indication of possession, as exemplified by the examples presented below, can easily be discovered. It should be highlighted that incorrect indication of grammatical possession has been discovered in approximately 90% of all written texts.

1) “…my boyfriends parents…”
2) “…peoples wishes…”

As can be observed in the corresponding equivalents in Swedish, provided below, the grammatical category of possession is indicated only through the “s” marker, without an apostrophe:

1) “…min pojkväns föräldrar…”
2) “…människors önskningar…”

These examples illustrate that, irrespective of the form of the noun, pupils systematically fail to insert the apostrophe indicating possession in English. This can reasonably be attributed to interference from Swedish, where possession is similarly indicated by means of the ‘s’ marker, but where no apostrophe is required.

In conclusion, it can reasonably be stated that the above discussed problematic occurrences illustrate the following phenomenon: grammatical incorrectness is a feature of a significant number of texts produced by pupils at Swedish high schools. This situation necessitates systematic attention to grammar when teaching English as a second/foreign language.

A possible solution to the above problem may involve frequent practice of grammatical structures that involve subject-verb agreement as well as comparison to the respective constructions in the Swedish language. This would make pupils aware of the grammatical differences that exist between the two languages. Conscious focus on grammar and grammar-related exercises can become boring. This is why it should be combined with activities that the pupils consider as interesting and stimulating. One such activity can be the reading of classical English literature. This would be very beneficial because classical literary works include a variety of complex verbal constructions, which would help pupils assimilate grammatical patterns and enrich their linguistic and vocabulary repertoire. The reading of classical literature, or excerpts of literary works, would depend on how the teacher presents the
relevant texts. Interesting and stimulating presentation of English literature would generate interest and contribute to the learning process.

**Works Cited**

