NGO-state cooperation in the Republic of Moldova

– A study of the cooperation between environmental NGOs and the Moldovan state

Av: Bodil Nordin
Handledare: Madeleine Bonow
Abstract

Non-governmental organisations (NGO) have been recognised as important actors when it comes to achieving a sustainable development. Cooperation between the state and NGOs is desirable and this thesis is a contribution to the knowledge about the cooperation between NGOs and the state. The objective is to provide a deeper understanding of the cooperation between environmental NGOs and the Moldovan state. The environmental NGOs that are chosen are based in Chisinau and have worked with waste management and recycling. Further the thesis also aims to suggest factors that can affect the nature of the relationship between the chosen actors. To achieve this I carried out a case study of four environmental NGOs that are based in Chisinau. A representative from each NGO was interviewed about the organisation and its relationship to the state. Theories about clientelism and synergy were then used to analyse the results. I have come to the conclusion that there is a positive attitude towards cooperation with the state but at the same time the NGOs strive to maintain their independence from the state. In addition to this there are certain factors such as trust, availability of resources, and the characteristics of the NGOs can influence the nature of the relationship. This study is a contribution to the knowledge regarding NGO-state relationships and can be used as a base for further studies on this subject. This subject is important to study as NGOs have been identified as important actors in achieving a sustainable development and governments are encouraged to cooperate with them.

Key words

Non-governmental organisations, clientelism, synergy, sustainable development
Acknowledgements

This thesis has been carried out in Chisinau, the Republic of Moldova, and it would not have been possible without the valuable help provided by Ronny Amberg, Borlänge Energy. He provided his own network of contacts which made it possible to carry out this study. Further I would like to thank Tatiana Cusnir, Cristina Garaba, Diana Guritenco, and Mihaela Zop at Chisinau City Hall for their help during my time in Chisinau. Finally I would also like to acknowledge the organisations that participated in the study; Eco-Tiras, EcoVisio, Gutta-Club, and Hai Moldova.
Abbreviations

ANPED – Northern Alliance for Sustainability
CAN – Climate Action Netowrk Eastern Europa, Caucasus and Central Asia
CDN – Cooperation and Development network Eastern Europe
GIZ – Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit
GYG – Global Young Greens
IPEN – a Toxic Free Future
NGO – non-governmental organisation
OSCE – Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
REC – Regional Environment Centre
UN – United Nations
UNCED – United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
UNDP – United Nations Development Program
UNECE – United Nations Economic Commission for Europe
WCED – World Commission on Environment and Development
WECF – Women in Europe for a Common Future
YEE – Youth and Environment Europe network
# Table of Contents

Table of Contents ............................................................................................................. iv  

1. Introduction .................................................................................................................. 1  
   1.1. Purpose .................................................................................................................. 2  

2. Theoretical Framework ............................................................................................... 4  
   2.1. Non-governmental organisations ............................................................................ 4  
   2.3. Clientelism .............................................................................................................. 5  
   2.4. Synergy .................................................................................................................... 7  

3. Method ......................................................................................................................... 9  
   3.1. Case study ............................................................................................................... 9  
   3.2. Sample ................................................................................................................... 9  
   3.3. Interviews .............................................................................................................. 10  
   3.4. Limitations ............................................................................................................. 10  

4. Result ............................................................................................................................ 12  
   4.1. Characteristics of the NGOs .................................................................................. 12  
   4.2. Activities ............................................................................................................... 14  
   4.3. Funding .................................................................................................................. 16  
   4.4. Cooperation with the state ..................................................................................... 18  
   4.5. Cooperation with other actors .............................................................................. 21  

5. Analysis ......................................................................................................................... 23  

6. Discussion .................................................................................................................... 27  

7. Conclusion .................................................................................................................... 29  

8. References .................................................................................................................... 30
1. Introduction

A “development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs” (WCED 1987, p. 43) is how a sustainable development was defined in the report Our Common Future, 1987. To date this is one of the most common definitions for a sustainable development, its ambiguity being its strength as well as its weakness. It allows for interpretation and hence can be accepted by many but also interpreted very differently. The report stresses the importance of incorporating environmental, economic and social aspects when dealing with environmental issues. It is also acknowledged that non-governmental organisations (NGOs) can play a central role in informing and securing support from the public regarding the different policies needed to achieve a more sustainable development (WCED 1987). The importance of NGOs is also evident in the action plan Agenda 21 that was adopted at the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development (UNCED) in Rio de Janeiro, 1992. The responsibilities of the government are stressed in the action plan but it is also evident that environmental NGOs are deemed to be important actors regarding sustainability. It is required by the governments to cooperate with civil society and NGOs. The notion that NGOs are important is further emphasised by Kofi Annan who has said that the 21st century will be an “era of NGOs” (Lang 2013, p. 5). During this century it was believed that NGOs would change from their traditional role as opposing the state to legitimate partners of the government. They were expected to help shape the public agenda and simultaneously be the voice of the civil society. This change of attitudes and the expectation of a partnership mean that it is anticipated of the government to create modes of engagement with the NGOs. It is also supposed that NGOs will adapt themselves to the norms and rules of institutional politics (Lang 2013). Regarding cooperation between state and NGOs, as suggested in Agenda 21, the relationship between the NGOs and the state is of importance. How these two actors behave in relation to each other can be determined by factors such as issue area, the characteristics of the NGO, and the characteristics of the state. An NGO can choose to cooperate with the state, oppose it or collect resources from it and the state can influence the NGOs’ manoeuvre room (Tropp 1998). Within their given manoeuvre room NGOs can have an impact by either working at a grassroots level facilitating cooperation and participation or by influencing the formulation and implementation of environmental programmes and policies as well as cooperating with the state. Most NGOs apply a combination of these strategies (Tropp 1998).

Within the issue area of sustainable development there is a belief that NGOs are important actors (Lang 2013), and they are hence often targeted by donors seeking to promote democracy and develop the civil society. One example of this is that after the fall of communism the number of NGOs increased dramatically in Central and Eastern Europe (Lang 2013) partly due to the availability of international funding (Lewis 2010). The Republic of Moldova was one of the countries where there was a large growth in the NGO-sector (Lewis 2010). Moldova is situated at the border of the former Soviet Union as well as the border of Europe. The nation is torn between the European Union’s attempts to keep Moldova on a path towards European integration and Russia’s attempts to keep the country partially dependent on her. During the Soviet years Moldova was largely rural and agricultural and today it is still an agrarian economy. In these years there were few environmental organisations within Moldova although there were environmental movements within the Soviet Union. The explanation for this is that the movements were located near environmental hazards e.g. a nuclear plant (Samuelson 2013). After the fall of communism the number of environmental NGOs, and NGOs in general, increased dramatically as they
were targeted by Western donors in their efforts to promote democracy and develop the civil society (Lewis 2010). In Moldova NGOs are still targeted by international donors and today many environmental NGOs base themselves in the capital Chisinau as this can improve the access to international funding. There are several different groups of environmental NGOs that are active within Moldova today. The largest are led by middle-aged men but there are also organisations run by younger persons. The goals of the larger NGOs tend to focus on projects that are important to international donors, since this is the largest source of funding. The smaller groups have more diverse goals and usually seek their own funding directly from international donors. There are organisations that focus on more urban projects such as recycling and transportation and others that have a more rural focus and since Moldova is still an agrarian economy there are many projects concerning agriculture (Samuelson 2013).

Samuelson has found in her study of environmentalism in Moldova that in spite of the corruption and lack of resources in Moldova’s post-soviet context the environmental NGOs show a creativity and determination to achieve a change in the environmental field. Since there is a lack of faith in the government many NGOs focus on educational activities and raising awareness about environmental issues (Samuelson 2013). Waste management and recycling is one issue and the handling of the waste in Moldova has a chaotic character. This issue area is important for the government since it is one area that needs to be improved in order to meet EU regulations (Bacal 2011). Generally the Moldovan NGOs also work towards meeting the EU regulations and adapting Western narratives regarding development. This is partly done with the goal to obtain funding for their organisations form abroad. It is also common for NGOs to look abroad for environmental models that can be applied on their problems (Samuelson 2013). In this sense many projects are seen as part of the modernisation and development of the country (Samuelson 2013).

1.1. Purpose

The purpose of this thesis is to describe and examine the cooperation between the state and environmental NGOs that are based in Chisinau, Moldova, and working with the issue of waste management and recycling. The studied NGOs are limited to those that are based in Chisinau and have worked with waste management and recycling. This does not need to be the only issue addressed by the organisations and the main focus might be on something different. Waste management and recycling is chosen since it is an important issue within the environmental aspect of sustainable development. The different actors that can represent the state in the relationship can be the government, different ministries, municipalities, or other local authorities.

Hence, the objective is to provide a comprehensive understanding of the Moldovan NGOs’ relationship with the state regarding issues of waste management. The ambition is to gain a better understanding of the nature of the cooperation between the environmental NGOs and the state in Moldova. Further I wish to suggest possible factors that can influence the nature of the cooperation within the given context. This is achieved by studying the cooperation between the state and four different environmental NGOs that have worked with questions regarding waste management and are based in Chisinau, Moldova. To achieve the purpose I will first describe the cooperation and then attempt to answer the following research questions.
• What is the nature of the relationship between the Chisinau-based environmental NGOs working with waste management and the Moldovan state?
• What are the possible factors that can influence the nature of the cooperation between the Chisinau-based environmental NGOs working with waste management and the Moldovan state?
2. Theoretical Framework

In this section I will outline the theoretical framework in which the study was conducted. Firstly, I will consider the definition of an NGO and typical traits for such organisations. Secondly, I will address the concept of clientelism and finally, theories regarding synergy between the state and NGOs will be outlined.

2.1. Non-governmental organisations

To discuss NGOs cooperation with the state it is important to define what an NGO is. The definition gives information regarding what is common for all NGOs. Such common traits or roles that NGOs have had throughout history can be of importance when attempting to identify factors that may influence how NGOs cooperate with the state.

An NGO can be defined in numerous ways but most definitions include four common traits: the organisations are not related to the government but they are non-profit, voluntary and pursue activities for the common good (Lang 2013). As can be expected from something that is defined by what it is not, there are numerous variations of NGOs. An NGO can be anything from a rather small informal group to larger formal agencies. Some of the organisations rely solely on volunteers while others have professionalized staffs (Lewis 2010).

Despite all the differences within the group NGOs it is possible to add a few more specific traits to the definition. Although NGOs are not related to government or specific political parties, they do still engage in a form of politics. They usually operate were the institutional politics intersects the civil society and do engage in political questions while staying at the edge of the institutional politics (Lang 2013). What counts as being independent from government and charitable differs from country to country. One example from the United Kingdom clearly shows how NGOs operate at the border of politics. On one hand the humanitarian organisation Oxfam is formally registered as a charity and hence gets all the benefits associated with this status. On the other hand Amnesty International’s work is deemed to be too directly political and a formal status as a charity is denied (Lewis 2010). This illustrates how NGOs with a humanitarian purpose can be viewed differently due to their involvement in politics. Lang (2013) writes that the purposes of NGOs are usually of a moral nature. This moral purpose leads the organisation to focus its activities on the common good and hence on problems and persons outside their own organisation. Further the territorial limits of an NGO do not have to correspond with national borders. They are in a sense non-territorial since they can work simultaneously on different levels, geographically and socially, to achieve their purpose. Finally NGOs are seen as public experts in the sense that they are knowledgeable within their own area but they lend their expertise to a greater public good and not only for their own profit (Lang 2013).

Historically, the term NGO was first used in 1945 by the United Nations and at that time it included every organisation that fulfilled the following four criteria: independent from the government, not seeking public office, non-profit, and not criminal. It was by no means a new group of organisations that had been discovered but a group of civic actors that were categorised under a common name (Lang 2013). These kinds of organisations have been active in Western countries since the eighteenth century. At that time they were mostly active on a national level working with issues that were deemed
important. The issues were of a moral character and included peace and the abolition of slavery. By the beginning of the twentieth century there were several NGOs active on a national and international level. So in 1945 when the organisations were called NGOs they were already numerous. At the same time as the term was coined the UN also defined that NGOs should be involved in UN processes and activities. During the following years the influence of the NGOs stagnated but with their involvement in the environmental issue from the 70s and onwards their influence increased and at the UNCED conference in Rio de Janeiro, 1992, NGOs were involved in both the preparations and the conference (Lewis 2010). This is also the time when Agenda 21 was adopted, in which NGOs are seen as important actors in the field of sustainability and development (UNCED 1992). This is because the development programs at the time were ineffective. NGOs were seen as an alternative way to achieve development and were targeted by donors (Lewis 2010).

The challenge with NGOs role in development is that NGOs are not governmental. Hence, it is assumed that they provide opportunities for people to participate in development and social change in an alternative way than what the government offers (Lewis 2010). It has been discussed in what ways NGOs do actually offer an alternative. The alternatives can be other ways of arranging service deliveries or the micro finances. This is the alternatives that fit into the notion of donors wishing to aid developing countries with their development. This would be a rather specific alternative way, in comparison to the government, and can be seen as partial and reformist. These kinds of alternatives can be labelled as development alternatives. There is a second view of more radical and structure changing alternatives that NGOs can offer. These alternatives concern the politics, economy and social relationships and how these are organised in society. These alternatives would then be labelled as alternatives to development (Mitlin et al. 2007). This means that NGOs can pursue change in different forms. They may work within an existing system or they may wish to change the entire system itself. To radical persons many NGOs today may represent a domesticated from of social movement that has lost all of the former political edge (Lewis 2010).

Regardless of if the NGO wants to change society completely or just parts of it, it has to be viewed in the context in which it is operating. This is because the characteristics of the state influence the NGOs’ manoeuvre room. NGOs can choose to treat the government in three different ways: they can oppose it, complement it or reform it. It is however impossible for an NGO to ignore the state (Lewis 2010). Within their given manoeuvre room NGOs can have an impact in two different ways. First, they can work at a grassroots level by facilitating cooperation and participation. Second, they can attempt to influence the political life regarding environmental questions. Their impact on politics can be achieved through influencing the formulation and implementation of environmental programmes and policies as well as cooperating with the state. It is however unusual for an NGO to just work with one of these strategies. Organisations can lean more towards using one or the other strategy but the most common approach is to apply a combination of the two (Tropp 1998).

2.3. Clientelism

The concept of clientelism can be applied to the relationship between the NGOs and the state to offer another dimension to understanding their interactions. Clientelism is an asymmetric relationship between actors of unequal status that is based on its asymmetry, trust and reciprocity. It describes a
patron-client relationship and although neither NGOs nor the state fit perfectly into those roles it is still a useful concept for understanding the complex relationship between them (Tropp 1998).

There is no generally accepted definition of clientelism available but several key elements can be identified. According to Muno (2010) a clientelist relationship is always:

- Dyadic
- Asymmetrical
- Personal and enduring
- Reciprocal
- Voluntary

The core for clientelism is the dyadic relationship between the patron and the client (Muno 2010; Hicken 2011). The patron is the person in the relationship who controls resources desired by the client. These resources can be made available for the client under certain circumstances. Today the clientelist relationships have become slightly more complex and there are in many cases a broker between the patron and the client. This means that the client do not always have any personal contact with the patron at all. However it can still be said that the dyadic relationship between patron and client is the core of the relationship. This is because the broker himself can be the client of the patron and simultaneously have the role of the patron for the clients. Although it is important to note that the broker has no control over the resources, but merely distributes them to the clients. There may be several brokers between the patron and the client in this kind of hierarchical network system (Muno 2010) but it is still the personal contact that is of importance (Hicken 2011).

The asymmetric nature of the relationship is caused by an unequal distribution of resources between the patron and the client. The patron either possesses or controls resources e.g. power, money, goods, information or prestige that the client does not have. This asymmetry shows that the client is dependent on the patron. But if there is an oligopoly regarding the resource in question, the client is not dependent on a single patron (Muno 2010). The important point regarding this hierarchical symmetry is that both parts find it useful to cooperate with someone who is superior or inferior to himself (Hicken 2011).

For a relationship to be classified as clientelism it needs to be personal and enduring. The time required for the relationship to be enduring is not defined and may vary (Muno 2010). It is important that it has an ongoing nature and is not simply a one-off interaction. This is because the relationship usually requires either the client or the patron to trust the other part to deliver on their promises. Such an interaction means that each side will be anticipating future interactions. Due to the ongoing nature the promises made by the different parties gain more credibility (Hicken 2011).

The reciprocal exchange in the relationship is essential to clientelism and it can be either material or immaterial goods that are being exchanged. The benefit of either the patron or the client is a response to the delivery of good service of the other part, but the exchange must not be immediate. There is mostly a time lag which further emphasizes the need for trust between the actors (Muno 2010).

Finally, the relationship is voluntary to a certain extent. There has been much debate regarding this but generally there is some voluntariness involved in a clientelist relationship. The degree to which a relationship is voluntary depends on the specific situations. Basically it is a debate about what it is that keeps the clientelist relationship together. Some claim that it is the expectation of future exchanges,
others stress the asymmetry of power and hence that a patron can force a client, while others focus on feelings of loyalty and obligation. However there is always a cost for exiting a relationship, but the cost varies with circumstances. The needs for material necessities or inherited obligations are among the things that can limit the voluntariness of the relationship (Muno 2010).

2.4. Synergy

As it is suggested by several sources that NGOs play an important role in sustainable development and that cooperation between the state and NGOs is encouraged it would be interesting to see if any forms of synergetic effects can be identified. When studying the cooperation between the environmental NGOs and the state theories regarding synergy could be useful since it can shed light upon motivations for cooperation.

It has been suggested that in regards to sustainability it is not a zero-sum relationship and that synergetic effects can arise if there is cooperation between state and NGO (Evans 1996). It should, according to Evans, always be a priority to learn how cooperation between the public and private can flourish. When such a synergetic effect between the public and the private arises it is usually the result of a combination of complementarity and embeddedness (Evans 1996).

Complementarity is a synergy that is based upon the complementary actions taken by the government and citizens. In this case of synergy there is still a clear division between the public and the private. The synergetic effect can be described as each actor delivering the goods they are best suited to deliver and the sum of the two inputs will then be greater than the output could be from only one of the actors (Evans 1996). An important by-product of this kind of cooperation is the increasing of social capital. This can be done by simply providing transportation so people from different areas can meet. Complementarity is the support of the day-to-day interaction between public officials and communities and hence also promotes embeddedness (Evans 1996).

The idea of embeddedness is based on relationships between citizens and public officials. In this case there is not a clear division of public and private since the relationships cross this division. The possibility for such relationships to form shows that the permeability of the boundary between the public and private spheres is of importance for synergy through embeddedness (Evans 1996). Similarly to complementarity, embeddedness promotes the forming of social capital. This is done by creating networks of trust and collaboration across the border between the public and the private. Such a network binds state and civil society together and supports complementarity (Evans 1996).

As stated above, complementarity and embeddedness are mutually supportive and both are common. The resulting synergy can be a combination of the government providing such things as dams or the rule of law, while citizens can provide local knowledge, experience and commitment. These are all good conditions for synergy but in most cases a relationship between people working within the state and the civil society is needed. Close interaction over time can build trust which is not limited to civil society but also covers relationships between the civil society and the state. Thus social capital that spans the public-private divide can be created (Evans 1996). According to Ostrom (1996) there have been several disappointing attempts to improve the welfare in poor countries by improving training and capacity of the public officials. However there has also been efforts to improve the welfare by increasing the
complementarities between the officials and the citizens and this has yielded better effects. Possibly synergetic effects are at times analysed as different and separate parts because of the artificial wall between the public and private. The potential for a synergetic effect is different for every project but in essence it can be viewed as a coproduction of goods or services. This means that the citizens can take part in the production of services or goods that are important to them. One example of a project with great potential is sanitation systems. It is generally a rather large system and could be handled by a combination of larger and smaller groups. The large groups lack the relevant information on a local level while the small units lack the efficiency to plan the backbone of a large network. However both units do complement each other. It is also argued that successful projects encourage citizens to get involved in other horizontal relationships and develop a social capital. The problem with synergetic effects is that as long as the public officials and the citizens experience that there is a great division between the two spheres all potential synergetic effects will remain just potential (Ostrom 1996).

There are certain conditions in which the emergence of synergy is more likely. In competitive political systems constrained by mutually recognized rules, egalitarian social structures and strong bureaucracies the emergency of synergy is facilitated. However, even in states with disorganised governments and class-divisions some institutional tactics can lead to the emergence of a synergetic effect on a more limited scale (Evans 1996).

The presented theoretical framework will be used to analyse and discuss the results from the interviews with the environmental organisations. The definition and historical information regarding NGOs will be used simultaneously with the other two theories to incorporate how history and common traits may influence the possibility of cooperation between NGOs and the state. The different aspects of clientelism will be used to gain a greater understanding of the different aspects that can affect the complex relationship between the NGOs and the state, and hence also the cooperation between the two. The theory about synergy will be used in a similar way as evidence of possible synergetic effects can explain the motivation behind choosing to cooperate or not to cooperate.
3. Method

In this section I will outline the different methods used in the research and the considerations regarding the choice of methods. In the first part of the section I will address the choice of a qualitative case study as an appropriate approach for this research. Secondly, the reasoning behind the sample group will be explained and the key features that were important in choosing the sample group will be outlined. Thirdly, I will address the interviews and outline the implementation. Fourthly I will describe and discuss the limitations.

3.1. Case study

A case study is mostly associated with a qualitative research approach due to its focus on an in-depth study of one or a few specific examples. It focuses on the depth of study and the details regarding relationships and processes. The emphasis is on studying the nature of these rather than on the results generated. When choosing a case study approach the aim is often to describe a case in a holistic view rather than just focusing on isolated factors (Denscombe 2010). Hence, the case study approach is suitable for studying the NGO-state cooperation between the state and environmental NGOs that are active within the field of waste management and recycling in Chisinau. The focus of the study is on the cooperation and to study this, a few environmental NGOs will be chosen as examples. By studying the relationship these NGOs have with the state it will be possible to capture the complexity of the cooperation rather than focusing on individual factors regarding it.

3.2. Sample

The choice of NGOs serving as examples is of great importance for the outcome of a case study and it is hence important to define certain key features. To choose organisations for this case study, the following key features have been used:

- Type of organisation – The first key feature is that the organisation must be an NGO. This means that it must be non-profit, voluntary, pursue activities for the common good, and not be related to the government.
- Focus – The second key feature is that the organisations focus is on environmental questions.
- Geographic location – The third key feature is that the organisation must be based in the capital Chisinau. It may be active in other areas as well.
- Specific issue area – The fourth key feature is that the organisation is active within the issue area of waste management and recycling. It does not have to be its primary focus, but there should be some activities regarding these questions.

The selection of examples based on the above features is a conscious and deliberate choice. The choice of examples was also influenced by a consideration of convenience but this was subordinate to the key features. All NGOs that were chosen as examples in this study fulfil the requirements and were then chosen based on matters regarding convenience. The sample group contains of one person from each of the four chosen NGOs. When the NGOs were approached I informed them that the interview would concern their organisation and its activities, funding, and cooperation. Based on this the NGOs could suggest respondents that would be able to answer the questions and have good knowledge about the NGO they are active in.
**3.3. Interviews**

The chosen NGOs were asked to participate in semi-structured interviews regarding their organisation and its cooperation with the state. Since cooperation and the relationship between the two parts is a rather complex phenomenon and involves opinions, feelings, and different experiences it is a suitable choice to use interviews (Denscombe 2010). Further the semi-structured interview focuses on the respondent and is flexible and provides an opportunity to let the respondent elaborate more widely about subjects raised by the interviewer. An interview guide compiled by the student who is carrying out the study ensures that the interview covers topics of importance for the study (Denscombe 2010). Before each interview the respondents were informed on the subject of the study and that all participation is voluntary and that they may withdraw their permission at any time. The respondent signed an informed consent form and received a full copy of the form. The interviews were taped and a transcript of the interview was sent to the respondent to validate that the data is correct and clarify certain points. This possibility for the respondent to review their answers after the interview can give them the confidence to speak more freely. All respondents were also granted anonymity in that their names will not be cited in the thesis, however the names of the organisations will be.

The themes in the interview guide were chosen to make sure that the information gathered in the interviews would enable the answering of the research questions. Firstly, it was important to find out about information about the organisation such as its size, scope, and focus. Therefore, the respondents were first asked to describe their own organisation. Secondly, the respondents were asked to give examples of activities carried out by their organisations. Thirdly, the respondents were asked about how the organisation was funded. Fourthly, they described how they cooperate with the state in the form of e.g. ministries or municipalities. Finally, the respondents were also asked to name elaborate on other partners with whom they cooperate such as other NGOs, foreign states, embassies, or businesses. These were the basic themes that were covered in all interviews and then additional questions were asked based on the answers given by the respondents.

Since this case study was carried out in Chisinau, Moldova by a Swede there might have been some issues related to the language barrier. The Moldovans speak Romanian and/or Russian and parts of the population also speak English. Fortunately all contacted NGOs had some knowledge in English and it was possible to carry out the interviews in this language. A back-up plan would have been to use an interpreter. To reduce the risks of misunderstandings associated with the language barrier it was a good choice to do interviews. In an interview the respondent always has the opportunity to ask if there are some questions they do not understand. Likewise I have the opportunity to confirm the respondent’s answers during the interview. The possibility for the respondent to review the transcript of the interview and make additional comments is one further opportunity to verify that there are no misunderstandings.

**3.4. Limitations**

The limitations of the study will be discussed in terms of internal validity, reliability, and external validity. These three are widely used to assess the limitations of a study. The question that needs to be answered regarding a qualitative study is whether or not it is trustworthy. When assessing a study it is of
importance to do so from the paradigm in which the study has been conducted and hence a qualitative study should be addressed based on the underlying worldview of qualitative research (Merriam 1995).

The internal validity is about whether the findings are consistent with reality or not (Merriam 1995). Since this study concerns cooperation between environmental NGOs and the state the main concern regarding internal validity is whether or not the interviews were designed and conducted in a way that resulted in accurate answers from the respondents. Certain steps were taken to ensure that the respondents were comfortable with voicing their views during the interviews. Firstly, the informed consent form is designed to ensure the respondents that their participation is voluntary and that their rights to withdraw their consent at any time will be respected. Secondly, the opportunity to review their answers and comment on any misunderstandings may allow them to speak more freely during the interview. Thirdly, they were granted anonymity although this might not have had a large impact since the organisations name will be used. Fourthly, the interviews were conducted in Chisinau were I spent a significant amount of time to thoroughly understand the situation and promote a more accurate interpretation of the data collected. Finally, the four different respondents provide four different interpretations of reality and this will give a more complete picture of this complex cooperation. The picture given by the study will however be angled from the point of view of the NGOs. Since only NGO actors are interviewed about the cooperation it might be possible to give an accurate picture of their views on the cooperation with the state. However it can be said that several steps have been taken to ensure the internal validity of the study and as far as one is conscious about that it is only the point of view of the NGO that is represented the internal validity can be deemed to be relatively high.

The reliability of a study concerns to what extent the findings of the study will be found again (Merriam 1995). As the names of the respondents are being withheld an exact replication of the study would not be possible. It would however be possible to follow the interview guide and interview the same organisations but since the relationship between NGOs and the state may change with time this is not a guarantee for similar results. Another issue with replication of a study within social sciences is that human behaviour and feelings are never static (Merriam 1995). I have therefore chosen to focus more on the study’s consistency and dependability. To achieve this I have chosen to describe in detail how the data was collected and interpreted.

The external validity of a study is concerned with its generalizability (Merriam 1995). Due to the small sample group and the selection of it not being random this study cannot be used to extrapolate from my sample to an entire population. This is because I chose to focus on an in-depth study of the NGO-state cooperation and hence the question of statistical generalizability became subordinate. In this case it was not possible to conduct a study that was in-depth and also had a high external validity. I made a conscious choice to conduct my study this way because the purpose of the study is to describe a phenomenon in a specific geographic setting. Hence, the internal validity and reliability are more important for achieving the purpose than the external validity. Though the study cannot be used for statistical generalisations, it can be used for analytical generalisations. Analytical generalisation means that the results from the study are tested against the theoretical framework. From there it is then possible to conclude that the results of the study can be applicable to similar situations (Marschan-Piekkari et al. 2004).
4. Result

In this section I will outline the results from the interviews with the four chosen environmental NGOs: EcoVisio, Eco-Tiras, Gutta-Club, and Hai Moldova. The respondents’ answers will be presented according to the different themes that were discussed during the interviews. Firstly, I will introduce the organisations and give a brief description of their characteristics. Secondly, some of the activities of the NGOs will be described in order to provide a better understanding of their work. Thirdly, it will be described how the organisations are funding their activities. Fourthly, I will outline how the respondents described their cooperation with the government and local authorities. Finally, some of the organisations other partners and collaborations will be introduced.

4.1. Characteristics of the NGOs

Table 1. This table lists some of the characteristics of the four interviewed NGOs (interview 1-4).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of the NGOs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Focus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EcoVisio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eco-Tiras</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gutta-Club</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hai Moldova</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

EcoVisio is a small NGO located in Chisinau that has been active almost 15 years. In the beginning it was called Children and Youth Environmental Association of Moldova and was primarily working with schools. They educated in the environmental field and the participating children got to go on research trips, participate in competitions, and learn about the environment. At one point the persons running the organisation were starting to feel overwhelmed by all administrative work and were moving to close down the organisation. However, the younger members of the organisation took over the responsibilities
of running the NGO. After this there were several changes to the organisation and both the target group and the volunteer base changed. As their activities were no longer limited to children and youth and they were trying to reach the larger public the name became a limitation. The new name became EcoVisio to reflect the vision of sustainability that is the core of the organisation. The activities focus on empowerment, environmental education, and action within the environmental field and a part of this is the flow of resources. Today EcoVisio constitutes of a core of enthusiastic volunteers. This core consists of the board as well as a few other active members and they are about 10-12 persons. In addition to this there is an extended circle of supporters who participate less frequently and these are about 30-40 persons. At the moment there is no need for a structured membership, but this is something that might be considered in the future as the organisation grows (interview 1).

Eco-Tiras is an umbrella organisation with 50 NGOs as members. It was funded in 1999 during the Dniester River Conference by the NGO BIOTICA ecological Society, which was one of the first environmental NGOs in Moldova. During this conference a professor of environmental law from the Oregon State University, USA spoke about river basins and introduced the concept of River Keepers, an NGO working to protect the environment around a specific river. This was what inspired the founding of Eco-Tiras. The organisation focuses on Dniester River and environmental problems that affect the river basin. Its member organisations are distributed along the river which runs through Ukraine, Moldova, and Transnistria. The organisation has a legislative body which is the board and an executive body. The executive body consists of the executive director, the accountant, and the project coordinator. These three all work in the office in Chisinau and are paid for their work. In addition to this the organisation has eight resource centres distributed along the river and one person at each resource centre gets a small salary for their work. There are different working group working with different themes along the river e.g. biodiversity, monitoring, GIS (interview 2).

Gutta-Club is an NGO based in Chisinau that has been active for 17 years. Although it is based in Chisinau its activities are not limited to the city but are carried out all over Moldova. The name of the organisation originates from the Latin word gutta which means drop. The name Gutta-Club hence resonates well with the organisations motto Gutta cavat lapidem which means a drop can break a stone. The organisation is an umbrella organisation and includes children and youth groups all over Moldova and the focus of the organisation is eco-education of the youth, development of the third sector, and social protection of children and youth. They have a big network of teachers all over Moldova that have created local clubs and have activities in over 200 schools. They try to not limit themselves to one theme but to focus on different aspects that are important at the time e.g. 2013 the focus was on energy efficiency. The organisation has a council consisting of 7 members that are elected every third year. The members of the council have different responsibilities like actions and campaigns, publications, webpage, and international relationships. The members of the council as well as the others in Gutta-Club are volunteers and the only person paid is an expert who does the financial reports each year. Today Gutta-Club is taking part in a project run by the Regional Environment Centre (REC). It is a project for organisation viability and Gutta-Club has started to evaluate itself with the help of facilitator. This project has helped them realise the strengths and weaknesses of their organisation and they now have a plan for improving the organisation. One example of a change brought on by this viability project is that on the last annual meeting it was decided that all members need to sign a document and that the membership will be more structured than it has been in the past (interview 4).
Hai Moldova is a relatively young NGO. It was started in 2010 by a group of enthusiasts who were inspired and wanted to be a part of the *let’s do it world* initiative. The name Hai Moldova actually means Let’s do it Moldova and the idea was to organise a national clean-up during one day. At the start the organisation consisted of a team of 5-10 persons who were working on the project. The NGO does not really have a lot of official members. It is mainly based on volunteering and is a grassroots initiative that is quite unstructured. Two of the founders are official members and deal with legal requirements such as paperwork while the other active persons are volunteering. While the organisation has few official members it has had over 100 000 participants in its events. This might be explained by the focus of the organisation which is on doing something about the waste and clean it up instead of just talking about it. The waste problems magnitude is also the reason for the founding of the organisation, since an initiative like this can only exist when there is a large problem to deal with (interview 3).

### 4.2. Activities

Table 2. This table lists examples of activities that are carried out by the four interviewed NGOs (interview 1-4).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Examples of activities carried out by the NGOs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>EcoVisio</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>promotion of fabric bags and reduced packaging to reduce waste</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Eco-Tiras</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>promotion of integrated river basin management, promotion of a river basin agreement, support of transboundary cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gutta-Club</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Project for Application of Resources and Energy (SPARE) project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hai Moldova</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National clean-up</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

EcoVisio finds that on the topic of waste management the reduction of waste is important since the amount of waste is a rather large problem and there is already a lot of focus on handling the existing waste. This sentiment is visible in some of EcoVisio’s projects such as the promotion of the use of fabric bags instead of plastic bags. In the same project they also promote low packaging and the reduced use of one-use items like paper cups and plates. The promotion of fabric bags is a project that they have been working on since 2010 and it is still ongoing. During the time of the study EcoVisio also organised
an ecological fair: IARMAReco. With this project they want to promote the cooperation between different NGOs and other actors in the environmental field. There were many other participating organisations, among others the Gutta-Club, and EcoVisio also promoted their fabric bags and another of their projects; the activEco program. This program is an educational opportunity for young people and the participants receive a series of trainings that enables them to plan and carry out an environmental project of their own (interview 1).

Eco-Tiras carries out different kind of activities such as the promotion of integrated river basin management, support of transboundary cooperation between Moldova, Transnistria, and Ukraine, and the promotion of a river basin agreement. The river basin agreement is suggested by the organisation and is still awaiting ratification from Ukraine. The organisation´s work has also promoted cooperation between Moldova and Transnistria and contributed to the creation of an NGO culture in Transnistria. Another type of project is the monitoring of legislation, drafts of laws, and governmental regulations in Moldova. Eco-Tiras comments on all of these in accordance with the Transparency of Decision-making in Moldova law from 2008 and the organisation is also represented as public consultants in the parliamentary commission. Furthermore Eco-Tiras monitors the progress in harmonisation with European legislation. In addition to these projects Eco-Tiras works to spread information through numerous publications, books, folders, articles, and conferences. In Chisinau the organisation opposed the construction of a waste incineration plant. It was taken up in court and Eco-Tiras lost the case. The reason they opposed the incineration plant was that it is a demanding technology and the organisation does not believe that it will be handled correctly in Moldova and tried to propose alternative options (interview 2).

Gutta-club focuses on educational activities and has a large network of teachers all over Moldova. At the moment they have two large long-term projects; SPARE (School Project for Application of Resources and Energy) and the Energy and Biomass project. The SPARE project is a project that is run by the Norwegian Association of conservation and exists in 17 countries. Gutta-Club is the national coordinator in Moldova. The purpose of the project is to teach children how to use natural resources in a sustainable way. The education of the children is thought to be one of the most efficient ways to bring knowledge about these themes into the households and at this time about 200 schools are participating in the project. One part of the SPARE project is a competition where children can submit their own projects. Another part is the summer camps that are organised by Gutta-Club were the children participate in practical workshops and activities and thus learn about the use of resources and energy efficiency. An example of a project that was carried out within the frames of SPARE was a greenhouse made entirely from plastic bottles. It is now operating and it is used in the education. The Energy and Biomass Project is aimed at increasing the level of renewable energy use in Moldova. Gutta-Club is working with the educational component regarding energy and biomass. Next year there will be an educational camp during the summer and they have also created educational material. In addition to this the Gutta-Club also has its own newspaper. It started out as a small paper but during one year it grew thanks to funding from Scandinavia. At that time they had 3500 subscribers and it was printed on green materials. Today the numbers have decreased because it was only a one year project they received funding for and the prize the paper is sold for does not cover the printing costs. In addition to these activities Gutta-Club arranges a lot of smaller activities and participates in and arranges competitions (Interview 4).
The main project of Hai Moldova has been the national clean-ups that were carried out in 2011 and 2012. In addition to these larger projects there were several smaller activities that were carried out in order to promote the clean-up. The entire project was organised by a team consisting of three coordinators and they managed a network of local coordinators throughout Moldova. The organisation of the events were inspired by let’s do it Romania and the coordinators’ knowledge about how the event was organised in Romania was applied in Moldova. Before the day of the big national clean-up Hai Moldova carried out several smaller activities such as different kinds of flash mobs and promotion with the help of singers and local stars. In 2012 they also had an eco-fashion event to raise awareness of the waste issue. Both years more than 100 000 participants cleaned public areas during the clean-up. The organisation had planned to organise a clean-up for 2013 as well but one of the key persons moved abroad and also they felt that they needed renewal. They had repeated the same action twice and felt that a new idea was needed either something entirely new or a new version of the clean-up. Today the organisation is working on a plan for future projects. Further the respondent adds that one important aspect of participating in NGO activities and volunteering is individuals can develop themselves and are allowed to perform in unique situations that would not have been possible in other situations. The work carried out by the three coordinators during the clean-up is a unique experience for them and it would have taken many years before they would have been allowed to do something similar in a business setting (Interview 3).

4.3. Funding

Table 3. This table lists the how the interviewed NGOs are funded. It states whether or not the NGO is funded by Moldova’s National Ecological Fund and also lists sources for international funding (interview 1-4).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Funding</th>
<th>National Ecological Fund</th>
<th>international funding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EcoVisio</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>• US embassy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• German Theodor-Heuss Kolleg program run by the Robert Bosch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Stiftung and the MitOst Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Global Youth Service Day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eco-Tiras</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>• American National Endowment for Democracy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Finland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Estonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Sweden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gutta-Club</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>• European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Norway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Sweden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Women in Europe for a Common Future (WECF)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Before EcoVisio’s name changed and it was still run by an older generation most of its funding came from local funds like Regional Environment Centre (REC), who manages grant money. At that time this was, according to the respondent, a typical source of money for NGOs. This was because the NGOs did not know English or have many connections outside Moldova and hence they were looking for Moldovan funding. In addition to this EcoVisio also had a very small fund from some German union for eco-ethics. Today EcoVisio receives funding for specific projects. For the activEco program they receive funds from the German Theodor-Heuss Kolleg program, which is a program run by the Robert Bosch Stiftung and the MitOst Association. Since the respondent has been an exchange student in USA, the organisation can also apply for different grants like the Flex alumni grant or US embassy resource centre alumni grant. In addition to this the organisation receives small grants from Global Youth Service Day. Because of the members connections outside Moldova the funding has been mostly international for the past years. This is because it is more convenient to apply to than local funding. All funds are always project related and the requirements from the funders are that the money may only be used for these specific projects. When applying for grants there is an issue that there is a lot of work involved in the application process and reports during and after the activities. In the long run EcoVisio would like to think of more sustainable funding opportunities, like selling their fabric bags and using the profit to carry out different activities. The respondent says the organisation is not so dependent on the foreign funding after all. It is good to have it and they would like to keep getting it but even if they were not granted any more funds they would make it work. The uncertainty of funding and sometimes lack of it makes people creative so the respondent is confident that the organisation would find a way to keep up their work even if the funding decreased (interview 1).

Eco-Tiras work is exclusively funded by foreign grants that are project specific and despite the possibility to receive money from national ecological fund the organisation has no intentions to apply for it. This is because there are disagreements with the government and Eco-Tiras do not wish to be dependent on the government for funding. The organisation has received funds from the American National Endowment for Democracy for several years and at the moment it also has two projects funded by the European Union within the frames of the Black Sea Regional Cooperation program. Sometimes they also receive funds from the World Bank and different governments such as the Finnish and Estonian who are supporting them at the moment. The organisation also has two programs that are funded by the Swedish government but the funds are distributed by REC (Interview 2).

Gutta-Club gets most of its funding from international sources and most of these are Norwegian, Swedish, and from the European Union. The SPARE project is run by the Norwegian association of conservation while the Energy and Biomass project is funded by EU and United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). In addition to their international grants Gutta-Club gets national funding for the Energy and Biomass project. There are also smaller financial contributions from the business sector and they are also sponsored in other ways e.g. Bucuria, a candy manufacturer, has sponsored them with candies while Moldcell, a phone company, has supplied transportation to the summer camps. A third company is Gas Natural Fenosa and the company is very cooperative and participates as experts talking to children about energy. The respondent informs that Gutta-Club would not accept financial help or
other items from companies that were trying to influence the work of the organisation. One issue with the funding is the amount of paperwork required and the specific requirements for achieving funds. One example is the *Youth in Action Program* which has very specific priorities and it can be hard to get the environmental aspect to fit within these priorities. A further issue with this particular funding is that Gutta-Club needs to apply to Brussels, since Moldova is a non-EU member, and there are thousands of applications to compete with. They try to apply to other EU countries to get around this but it is still hard (Interview 4).

In 2011 Hai Moldova got funding from the national ecological fund, US embassy and other embassies, and in small parts also from partnerships with different companies. In 2012 the funding generally came from the same donors but there was an increase in the partnerships with companies. One of the companies that contributed to the clean-up was Orange, a phone provider. Orange contributed by collecting old used mobile phones and handing up caps and t-shirts in return to promote recycling and continued to collect mobile phones after the campaign as well. The Ministry of Internal Affairs also contributed by donating 100 000 white hazardous waste suits that were worn for the clean-up. These were valuable for the project since it allowed the participants to stay clean and it also made a great impact when all participants were dressed in them. Although Hai Moldova has received enough funding to carry out their projects the respondent says that there are issues for NGOs regarding funding. After the fall of the Soviet Union there were many funds available for the new NGOs and some dishonest organisations collected funds without carrying out any work. As a result of this the procedures for accessing funding have become harder and more bureaucratic. This generally means that NGOs need to plan ahead in order to secure funding and also be prepared to fill in an amount of paperwork and write reports on their activities. There is also a practical issue since a lot of transactions in Moldova are still in cash, this can make it harder to keep track of and report the use of the funds. Luckily the clean-ups did not require a lot of funding to carry out and it was mostly based on enthusiasm which enabled the involved persons to focus on the actual project instead of fund applications (Interview 3).

### 4.4. Cooperation with the state

*Table 4.* This table shows the NGOs’ attitudes towards cooperation with the state and also lists examples of any cooperation (interview 1-4).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cooperation with the state</th>
<th>attitude to cooperation with the state</th>
<th>cooperation with the state</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EcoVisio</td>
<td>wishes to cooperate more</td>
<td>has occasionally gotten help from the municipality some contacts are also necessary to receive the right permit for activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eco-Tiras</td>
<td>wishes to stay independent and there is friction between the NGO and the government</td>
<td>consultants in the parliamentary commission member of the CNP cooperation between resource centres and local authorities unofficial cooperation with specialists</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Gutta-Club aims to cooperate with all sectors as far as possible

Ministry of Education
Ministry of Environment
municipal and regional administrations

Hai Moldova wants the government to be part of the campaign

Local authorities
Several ministries

EcoVisio always try to cooperate with others in their projects. The respondent explains it through the proverb “if you want to go fast you go alone and if you want to go far you go together” and states that working alone is plainly stupid since that does not build any capacity. This is also one of the reasons they organised the IARMAReco and are promoting cooperation. However there is not a lot of cooperation between EcoVisio and the state or municipality. EcoVisio are positive about cooperation and would like to cooperate more but it is an issue of time and luck. In the past some persons working for the municipality have helped the organisation in certain situations but that has been due to personal relationships. When dealing with the municipality or the different ministries the cooperation always depends on the person EcoVisio talks to and if that person is reluctant or willing to cooperate. Some contacts with ministries are necessary to receive the right permits for their activities and at times the ministries do take part in activities. The respondent from EcoVisio adds that regarding cooperation it is important to not point out what others are not doing and instead focus on what can be done (Interview 1).

Eco-Tiras actively tries to avoid being dependent on the government and strongly disagree with them on certain matters but there is still a small amount of cooperation. The organisation is represented as consultants in the parliamentary commission and there is also a new structure called the National Council for Participation (CNP). It is a national council of NGOs and works as an advisory body to the prime minister. Eco-Tiras is a member of the CNP and uses it to make an impact on legislation. The structure was created in 2010 and is working although the comments made by the council is not always taken into account and it happens that they are informed late so the time they have to react on a matter is too short. This particular structure is working somewhat but there is friction between the government and Eco-Tiras. The latter regularly uses mass media to critique the government and tries to pressure the government on environmental issues. In the beginning Eco-Tiras had good intentions and tried to maintain a good relationship but the authorities were not as forthcoming. One incident was when Eco-Tiras asked for copies of rent agreements for environmentally valuable forest areas and were denied. This disagreement was settled in court and although the court ruled in favour of Eco-Tiras the decision was not executed. The organisations next step was to apply to the compliance committee of the Aarhus convention, which also ruled in their favour. As a result it was recommended that the government should develop and approve a plan of actions to implement the Aarhus convention, on access to information. In this way Eco-Tiras uses different channels to pressure the government and a current disagreement is about the waste incineration plant and the fact that the government made that decision without properly informing the public. Incidents like these complicate the relationship and are one of the reasons for Eco-Tiras scepticism towards cooperation. One further issue is the corruption that exists in Moldova and this is another reason as to why Eco-Tiras prefers to cooperate with other actors. Although the organisation is working well with the specialists working for the government and have some
unofficial cooperation with them. There is also a larger amount of cooperation on a more local level between the resource centres and the local authorities (Interview 2).

Gutta-Club’s intention is to cooperate with all different sectors as far as possible. The SPARE project is supported by the Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Environment, and municipal and regional administrations. Although there is cooperation and collaboration it is not always easy. One example is a book that Gutta-Club is working towards implementing in the curriculum as a part of their SPARE project. It has not happened yet, but since relations with the government have improved as the organisations understanding of the bureaucracy has increased and they hope that it might be achieved next year. Overall the cooperation with the state, on different levels, works if their goals coincide with the goals Gutta-Club is working towards and it also helps that Gutta-Club is a relatively old environmental NGO in Moldova. One example of a collaborative effort was a project that was part of the Support of Confidence-building Measures program. It was financed by UNDP and the Development Program of the UN in Moldova. The project meant that solar collectors were built in rural areas and the participants were educated in renewable sources of energy. This project was carried out as a partnership between the state and public organisations. When authorities are invited to events organised by Gutta-Club they do usually show up (Interview 4).

From the beginning Hai Moldova wanted the state to be involved in their activities. This is because the organisation needed a couple of things from the government in order to be able to carry out their activities. But people in general expect many things from the government so the coordinators also wanted the government to be a part of the campaign for this reason. To be able to do a clean-up nationwide Hai Moldova had a strategy to achieve the cooperation of local authorities. To do this they contacted the prime minister, who then spoke to the ministries who then passes the message onwards until it reaches the mayors of local villages. Then a local representative from Hai Moldova would contact the mayor and talk about the coming clean-up. The respondent believes that this approach highly increases the probability of cooperation on a local level since the message comes from above and from the organisation. Because the goal was to get as many as possible to participate it was also necessary to get in touch with public institutions and gain their support. The challenge when cooperating with the government and accepting funds from the national ecological fund is to stay independent from the state. Hai Moldova took care not to be coloured by any particular party. They made it their mission to cooperate with representatives from all different parties to maintain as much of their independence as possible. This is mainly an issue of how the NGO is portrayed and its image but that is important for the promotion of the activity and the NGOs further existence. There was only one party who was not willing to communicate with Hai Moldova and the organisation managed to cooperate with the government and maintain its independence. Such cooperation is possible when there is a common goal but the environmental NGOs do not have the same possibilities when it comes to influencing the state as NGOs in the health field. This is because the NGOs working with health are large and have a lot of funding which makes them about as important as the government. This opens up for the possibility of discussion in a way that is not possible regarding the environment (Interview 3).
4.5. Cooperation with other actors

Table 5. This table lists actors, aside from the state, that the four NGOs cooperates or has cooperated with (interview 1-4).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cooperation with other actors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EcoVisio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Moldovan NGOs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• foreign NGOs e.g. MitOst Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• different institutions and universities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eco-Tiras</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• OSCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• UNECE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• GIZ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Academy of Science in Moldova and Ukraine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• foreign states</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• foreign NGOs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gutta-Club</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• businesses e.g. Moldcell, Bucuria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Moldovan NGOs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Academy of Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• international networks e.g. Youth and Environment Europe network (YEE) and Cooperation and Development network Eastern Europe (CDN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• foreign NGOs e.g. Norges Naturvernforbund and Keep Sweden Tidy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hai Moldova</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• businesses e.g. Orange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• singers and local stars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• University of Art</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

EcoVisio is an organisation that is positive to cooperating with other. They do cooperate with Moldovan NGOs and NGOs from other countries. One of these forms of cooperation is about the activEco program. The Theodor-Heuss-Kolleg program is what inspired the activEco program in the first place and the NGO MitOst Association is not only funding the program in Moldova but they are also contributing in other ways. They send international trainers to the seminars and keep in touch with EcoVisio to evaluate the program. In addition to cooperation with NGOs they do also cooperate with different institutions and universities (interview 1).

As Eco-Tiras are working exclusively with foreign grant money it also cooperates with international actors such as the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE) and the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe (UNECE). Together with these bodies the organisation has carried out the transboundary diagnostic study of the river basin, created a program for working with the river basin, and created an agreement on how this transboundary work. The OSCE also manages a website were progress reports on the work with the Dniester River basin are published. There has also been a project in collaboration with Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) which is a German organisation that is promoting international cooperation for a sustainable development. In addition to these collaborations Eco-Tiras works with the Academy of Science in Moldova and Ukraine.
There is an intention to work more with foreign states and NGOs because there is more respect and confidence involved in such collaborations but generally they will attempt to cooperate with all agencies willing to work with them (Interview 2).

Gutta-Club has a positive attitude towards cooperation. They wish to cooperate with businesses, NGOs, and the government and try to achieve this. They have some cooperation with companies like Moldcell, Gas Natural Fenosa and Bucuria and they are also cooperating with other NGOs in Moldova. Gutta-Club has an agreement with the academy of science which allows them to use their locals to hold their meetings. In addition to this the organisation cooperates with NGOs outside Moldova. One example of this is the SPARE project which is organised together with Norges Naturvernforbund. Another example is Keep Sweden Tidy that together with Gutta-Club implemented a program, funded by SIDA, where a network of teachers was educated in environmental questions. Gutta-Club is also a member of several international networks: Youth and Environment Europe network (YEE), Cooperation and Development network Eastern Europe (CDN), Women in Europe for a Common Future (WECF), Climate Action Network Eastern Europe, Caucasus and Central Asia (CAN), Northern Alliance for Sustainability (ANPED), Global Young Greens (GYG), a Toxic Free Future (IPEN), and International Alliance of Ecological Society (Interview 4).

Other than the cooperation with the Moldovan government Hai Moldova also had partnerships with businesses e.g. Orange. In addition to this they also achieved the support of singers and local stars and the eco-fashion event was organised together with the University of Art. When it comes to other NGOs a lot of the participants were members of the NGOs but Hai Moldova did not organise their events together with other NGOs. This was because it was their wish to keep the campaign simple. Environmental NGOs have a tendency to want to delve deeper into the problem and focus on the reasons behind the waste. But as the respondent puts it “if you want to make it big you must make it simple” (Interview 3).
5. Analysis

In this section I will use the theories about clientelism and synergy to analyse the results presented in the previous section. Information regarding the definition and brief history of NGOs will be used simultaneously with the other two theories. First I will analyse the different NGOs and their cooperation with the state using the different features of a clientelist relationship. Then I will analyse the different NGOs in relation to synergy and see if there are any indications of possible synergetic effects described in the interviews.

A clientelist relationship is an asymmetrical relationship between a patron and a client. Where the patron controls resources desired by the client (Muno 2010). In this case the patron would be the state and the client would be the NGO. The five key characteristics for clientelism are that the relationship is dyadic, asymmetrical, personal and enduring, reciprocal, and voluntary (Muno 2010). The first aspect in a clientelist relationship is the dyadic relationship between the patron and the client. This does not mean that the client needs to have a personal contact with the actual patron since it can also be a network of brokers between the patron and the client. But even if there is a broker network the dyadic relationship is still important (Muno 2010). The respondents all agree that when they are contacting any public official it is the attitude of the contacted individual that influences whether or not there will be any cooperation (interview 1-4). This underscores the importance of personal contact between the two actors. Eco-Tiras experiences that the cooperation between local authorities and the different resource centres works smoothly while there are issues at higher levels. Both Gutta-Club and EcoVisio states that cooperation works well, as long as there is a common goal (interview 1; interview 4). Hai Moldova believes that the probability of cooperation increases if there is a combination of information from the prime minister to the local authorities and a personal contact between the local authorities and the NGO (interview 3). This means that the information from higher officials might influence the individual’s willingness to engage in cooperation with the NGO. This particular aspect can explain why the respondent from EcoVisio talks about luck regarding contact with public authorities (interview 1). This shows how important the interaction between the individual from the NGO and the individual representing the state is.

The second aspect of the clientelist relationship is its asymmetric nature. This is caused by an unequal distribution of resources where the patron controls resources e.g. power, money, goods, information or prestige that the client does not have. This means that if there is a monopoly on a certain resource the client can be dependent on a single patron (Hicken 2011). This is an important aspect for NGOs since they are defined as non-governmental (Lang 2013) and hence do not wish to be dependent on the state. It is also of importance that NGOs have had a traditional role as counterparts and alternatives to the state rather than being its partner in collaborations (Lewis 2010). One of the resources that are necessary for the NGOs is funding and this is offered by the state through the National Environmental Fund but there are many other actors offering funding. In this case there is an oligopoly and the NGOs can choose to apply for funding from the state or from other actors such as other states, other NGOs, the European Union, or the business sector. Eco-Tiras states clearly that it does not wish to accept any national funding and is exclusively funded by international sources to maintain its independence from the state (interview 2). Hai Moldova has a different approach and does apply for funds from the national environmental fund. It does however try to maintain its independence by ensuring that it cooperates with all political parties to not get connected to a particular party and it also
gets funding from different embassies and the business sector (interview 3). EcoVisio works mostly with international funding because of convenience (interview 1) while Gutta-Club gets national funding for some projects but the majority comes from international sources (interview 4). In this sense there are differences but the majority of the interviewed NGOs prefer to apply for international funding. Since the state is not the only patron available and the desired resource can be attained from other sources the NGOs are not dependent on the state for funding. There are other resources than funding that are desired by NGOs and one example is that some activities may require permissions from different ministries. One example of this is that Gutta-Club often needs permission to do their educational work within the schools and cooperation with the Educational Ministry is a necessity (interview 4). Other resources may be different kinds of information such as copies of rent agreements on valuable forests or plans regarding a new waste incineration plants. Both are examples of information that was desired by Eco-Tiras and could be provided by the state (interview 2). There are reasons for the NGOs to wish to cooperate with the state but there must also be reasons for the state to value cooperation with the NGOs. From the point of view of the interviewed NGOs some suggestions of their value for the state has arisen. The respondent from Hai Moldova mentions that the participants in their projects develop themselves in ways that are unique for the NGO movement (interview 3). This can also be seen in Gutta-Club’s educational activities (interview 4) and EcoVisio’s activEco program were the participants learn skills that can be applied later (interview 1). Eco-Tiras highlights that the organisation possesses a vast amount of knowledge and expertise within their field and are hence consulted by the specialists working for the government (interview 2).

The third aspect of clientelism is that the relationship should be personal and enduring. The time required for a relationship to be considered as enduring is not specified but the importance is that it is ongoing and not something that occurs only once. This is important because trust between the patron and client is necessary (Hicken 2011). The respondent from Gutta-Club mentioned that when cooperating with the state it is an advantage that the NGO is relatively old (interview 4). This implies that an older organisation that has proven itself trustworthy in the past might also have better chances to be trusted again. It might also be a contributing factor that the SPARE project is an ongoing project and it might be easier to accomplish an enduring relationship with an ongoing project that lasts for a longer period of time However Gutta-Club experiences some issues with active members emigrating (interview 4). This means that even though there might be a rather enduring relationship between the NGO and e.g. the Ministry of Education the persons involved may change. Eco-Tiras has an advantage in the sense that the organisation has paid employees (interview 2). Hence, it is possible to create this enduring and personal relationship. It is not the case with all officials from the state, due to disagreements, but there are certain parts of the relationship that works well like the contact between resource centres and local authorities (interview 2). The resource centres also have an ongoing character in the sense that there is no end date. Hai Moldova and EcoVisio work more with projects with a specific time frame (interview 3; interview 1). However the projects may be repeated and this can give cooperative efforts a certain enduring component. The organisations can learn whom they should contact to achieve their goals and the contacted authorities may remember them from the last project.

The fourth aspect of clientelism is the reciprocal exchange in the relationship. When one part delivers a good service the other part will provide a benefit. The goods that are exchanged can be material or immaterial and since the exchange is not necessarily immediate there is a need for trust
between the actors (Muno 2010). The respondent from Hai Moldova expresses that in Moldova the different actors who supply funding are less trusting than they were right after the Moldovan independence in 1991. This is because many NGOs emerged during this time and many of them accepted funding without doing any activities. In this sense there is a lack of trust (interview 3). This is acknowledged in different wordings from the other NGOs as well. They all state that there is a relatively large amount of documentation and reports necessary to receive any funding (interview 1-4). This is a way for the funders to ensure that the funds are used for the intended purpose but it can also prevent NGOs from applying for funding if the paperwork required is too extensive. On the other hand not all NGOs trust the state. This is explained by the respondent from Eco-Tiras by the fact that there are problems with corruption in the country (interview 2). If there is corruption within the state the NGOs will be less inclined to trust it. These issues with trust can be one reason as to why the cooperation in some cases is limited.

Finally, a clientelist relationship is voluntary to a certain extent. To what degree it is voluntary depends on the specific situations (Muno 2010). For example the presence of different sources for funding means that accepting funding from the state is voluntary. In certain projects it might be a necessity to involve authorities to some extent depending on the nature of the project. Projects involving children such as the educational work carried out by Gutta-Club sometimes requires permission (interview 4). In cases when it is necessary to get permission from public officials to carry out a project the contact with them is hardly voluntary but inevitable. This means that there is a voluntary aspect to the relationship but there are also some interactions that are not voluntary if the organisation wishes to carry out certain activities. This is in line with clientelism where a clientelist relationship is voluntary but there is always a cost for exiting the relationship (Muno 2010). A degree of voluntariness in the relationship can be seen as Eco-Tiras actively chooses to not cooperate with the state on several activities (interview 2).

Regarding synergy it has been suggested that in regards to sustainability it is not a zero-sum relationship and that synergetic effects can arise if there is cooperation between state and NGO (Evans 1996). In the interview with the respondent from Hai Moldova it was clear that it was necessary to involve many actors to achieve a nationwide impact (interview 3). The clean-ups could be a case that benefits from cooperation and creates a synergetic effect. As is stated by the respondent, it was a necessity to get in touch with and supported by public institutions to achieve their goal and get as many people as possible involved (interview 3). This kind of collaboration was possible because there was a shared goal. The other respondents do also agree that collaboration is usually possible when there is a common goal (interview 1; interview 2; interview 4). However, as the respondent form Hai Moldova said, the NGOs do have a limited possibility to influence the state (interview 3). When NGOs plan and carry out a project that fits into the goals of the state there are certain possibilities of a limited synergetic effect. When synergetic effects arise as a result of cooperation between the public and the private it is usually the result of a combination of mutually supportive complementarity and embeddedness (Evans 1996). One example of embeddedness can be that when EcoVisio has had successful collaborations it has been due to personal relationships. The respondent from EcoVisio states that it is not effective to work alone because it is cooperation that builds capacity (interview 1). Such personal relationships can facilitate the collaboration and lead to the formation of networks of trust, which are important to achieve synergy (Evans 1996). These kinds of relationships can also be a possible reason for the well working
cooperation between local authorities and Eco-Tiras resource centres. The resource centres work on issues that are relevant for those living in the area and this might mean that the local authorities have a personal interest in the matters (interview 2). The state and the NGOs can also complement each other to achieve a synergetic effect. In this complementarity the state can provide the necessary structures while the citizens can provide local knowledge, experience and commitment. Usually some kind of personal relationships across the public-private border is also necessary (Evans 1996). It should also be noted that since NGOs are previously known to offer either alternatives to development or development alternatives (Mitlin et al. 2007) the possibility for synergetic effects may vary depending on the characteristics of the NGO. The interviewed NGOs mostly work within the system and try to influence it rather than completely change it (interviews 1-4). Since this is the case, it can be claimed that they offer development alternatives. One example of working for change within the system is how Eco-Tiras is monitoring environmental law and participates in the CNP (interview 2). The CNP can be seen as an attempt by the state to provide a structure that makes it possible to make the best use of the knowledge and experience that exists in the NGOs (interview 2). But this is one of the few examples that have been mentioned were the initiative to the cooperation comes from the state. In most cases the NGO needs to contact whomever they wish to cooperate with. It is in many cases challenging to know whom to contact to achieve the goal. Both complementarity and embeddedness result in the forming of social capital (Evans 1996) and this has in some ways also been mentioned by the respondents. The respondent from Hai Moldova specifies that within an NGO it is possible for an individual to develop themselves and perform in unique situations. The involvement in an NGO teaches the individual about themselves and also how to perform and deal with stress. It was also added by the respondent from Hai Moldova that while working for an NGO one becomes creative regarding problem solving (interview 3). EcoVisio agrees that being active in an NGO makes one think more creatively (interview 1).
6. Discussion

The NGOs and their relationship to the state is not a perfect match with the concept of clientelism but it is possible to gain a greater understanding of the complex relationship and possible reasons for its nature by analysing it using clientelism. During the interviews all of the respondents agree that the dyadic relationship described in clientelism is crucial for the possibilities of cooperation (interview 1-4). Regardless of the state’s attitude towards a certain project or cooperation with NGOs in general, it is the attitude of the individual approached that is of importance. This means that there is a certain amount of luck involved when contacting public officials and this might be one reason as to why the cooperation between NGOs and the state are irregular. It is also possible to use this knowledge to increase the possibilities of cooperation. Hai Moldova made sure that there was a positive message regarding their clean-up coming from above and this made the approached individuals more inclined to cooperate (interview 3). The contact with the state through public officials can be less dependent on luck if there is a personal relationship with the NGO. Other factor such as the age of the NGO and earlier cooperation can also influence the relationship. As can the amount of trust between the NGO and the state. If the NGO does not trust the state, or vice versa, this could result in less cooperation.

In a developing country, such as Moldova, there can be many sources of funding available as NGOs are targeted by Western donors wishing to contribute to the development of the country (Samuelson 2013). This is important because the presence of other donors allows the NGOs to remain independent from the state to a certain extent. All of the NGOs have expressed in the interviews that in many cases it is simply more convenient and easier to access international funding of different kinds. Which international funder that is preferred depends on the amount of paperwork required (interviews 1-4). The independence of the NGOs is an important factor that influences the cooperation. Already by its definition as non-governmental an NGO cannot be too closely connected to the state or government (Lang 2013). Historically NGOs are also known for providing alternatives to the state (Mitlin et al. 2007) and hence too close cooperation with the same can drastically change the role of the NGO. How problematic this is also depends on the issue area the NGO is focusing on. I have found that when the message is simple it is easier for all actors and citizens to agree upon it and work together. Hai Moldovas clean-ups has a simple message (interview 3) and most can agree that there is a need for a clean-up but if one delves deeper into the subject of waste management and recycling there will be different opinions. The disagreement between Eco-Tiras and the state regarding the waste incineration plant is one such example because even if most can agree that waste is an important issue it is harder to agree upon a solution (interview 2). The focus and scope of the NGOs also affects the cooperation in other ways. Since Gutta-Club focuses on the education of children it has a relationship with the Ministry of Education (interview 4). EcoVisio is active primarily in Chisinau and so there might be more contact with the municipality of the city (interview 1). Lack of time can also influence how much time an NGO is prepared to invest into trying to contact the right public official to achieve cooperation (interview 1) when their time could be better spent organising projects. Since many NGOs operate on a voluntary basis there is a limited time that the members can dedicate to their work for the NGOs and this will also affect the projects they carry out and the funds they are able to seek. This is different for NGOs such as Eco-Tiras that have paid employees (interview 2) but there are only a few employees and most members are volunteering.
The advantages with cooperation can be seen in the example of Hai Moldova and its national clean-ups (interview 3) that seem to create an effect that fits the theory of synergy. Similarly there seems to be successful cooperation between Eco-Tiras resource centres and the local authorities as well as Eco-Tiras and the specialists working for the government (interview 2). Also Gutta-Club has a successful cooperation with different ministries regarding their educational activities although there are also certain differences (interview 4). EcoVisio is the smallest of the interviewed organisations and also has the most limited cooperation with any authorities (interview 1). As all interviewed organisations rather lean towards working within the concept of development alternatives (Mitlin et al. 2007) it might be easier to achieve the synergetic effect. This is because synergy requires a certain amount of cooperation and that is unlikely if the NGOs would offer a completely different alternative to the state. Hence, the way the NGOs choose to work within their focus area might be of importance. Based on the interviews it can be argued that there are certain advantages to be gained from NGO and state cooperation. But it is also important to keep in mind that it is a constant balancing act for the NGOs to keep the cooperation at the right level to maintain their independence.
7. Conclusion

In conclusion the cooperation between NGOs and the state in Moldova is complex and there are several different factors that influence it. My first research question was about the nature of the cooperation between the NGOs and the state. The nature of the cooperation differs between the different NGOs but what is common for all the interviewed NGOs is that they do see advantages with cooperation when there is a common goal. My second research question was about finding factors that could influence the nature of the cooperation between the two actors. I have found that there are several different factors that can influence the amount of cooperation. The factors that can influence cooperation negatively are mainly corruption, distrust, lack of time and not getting in touch with the correct person. A common goal, contacting the correct person, an old and well-known organisation, trust and earlier cooperation can influence the cooperation in a positive way. The scope and size of the NGOs can influence on what level the cooperation will happen and it will be easier to agree and cooperate if the message is simple.

The interviewed NGOs share a desire to maintain their independence from the state and have to achieve a balance between the cooperation and the independence. The amount of cooperation differs between the organisations but also within the larger organisations. A large organisation may not wish to cooperate on some levels while cooperation might work well on other levels. An example of this would be Eco-Tiras. A smaller organisation like EcoVisio, that has no employees, may have less interaction with the state due to its size and lack of time. The NGOs agree that when there is cooperation it is usually on their initiative although there is proof that the state is positive towards cooperation and the CNP is one way to make the best of the expertise and knowledge available in the NGO sector. To conclude all organisations do cooperate with the state when there is a common goal and they have succeeded in contacting the correct public official and then there are several factors that can affect the scope of the cooperation.

The findings in this study depict the NGO-state cooperation in Moldova from the point of view of NGOs that are active within the issue area of waste management and recycling. Although the study is limited geographically and due to its sample size and nature it is an important contribution to the research within this area and can be used as a basis for further studies. It might also be applicable to NGO-state relationships in situations similar to the Moldovan.
8. References


Interview 1. EcoVisio. Interviewed by Bodil Nordin, 2013-09-18

Interview 2. Eco-Tiras. Interviewed by Bodil Nordin, 2013-09-30

Interview 3. Hai Moldova. Interviewed by Bodil Nordin. 2013-10-01

Interview 4. Gutta-Club. Interviewed by Bodil Nordin. 2013-10-03


Informed Consent Form for Participation in an Interview Concerning Non-governmental Organisations (NGOs)

This informed consent form is for key persons with knowledge about NGOs working within the issue are of waste management and recycling in Moldova. The consent form is for participating in an interview about how NGOs cooperate with local authorities and other actors, their funding, and advocacy. The interview will be used in the writing of a bachelor thesis in environmental science, titled "NGOs and Waste Management: a study of the NGO-state relationship regarding waste management in Chisinau, Moldova". The principle investigator for the research is Bodil Nordin, a student at Södertörn University in Stockholm, Sweden.

This informed consent form has two parts:
- Information Sheet (to share information about the study with you)
- Certificate of Consent (for signatures if you choose to participate)

You will be given a copy of the full Informed Consent Form

Part I: Information Sheet

Introduction

I am Bodil Nordin, studying environmental science at Södertörn University. I am researching how NGOs cooperate with the state and local authorities in Chisinau, Moldova. This consent form includes information about the study and you are invited to participate in an interview as part of this research. It is voluntary to participate in the study and you should not feel obliged to do so if you do not feel comfortable with it. If this form contains any words you do not understand or you want something clarified, do not hesitate to ask questions at any time. If you have questions later you can contact me by using the contact information given.

Purpose of the research

Since Moldova is working towards a membership of the European Union there an improved waste management and recycling system is needed. This is also a part in working towards sustainability and NGOs have been recognized as important actors in the work towards a sustainable development. I wish to investigate whether or not NGOs play an important role in this work in Chisinau and how they cooperate with local authorities and the state. It will be
interesting to interview members in NGOs working with this issue area whether or not they cooperate with the state. Either result will give me information on the relationship between the state and the NGOs.

**Type of Research and Participant Selection**

Your participation in this research will involve the participation in an interview that will last approximately 35-50 minutes. You are being invited to participate in an interview because I feel that information about your work in an NGO can contribute to my knowledge about NGOs in Chisinau.

**Voluntary Participation**

Your participation in the interview is entirely voluntary. You may choose whether or not to participate and can withdraw your consent at any time throughout the projects duration. You are not obliged to answer any questions that you feel uncomfortable about.

**Procedures**

If you choose to participate in the study you will be asked to participate in an interview with myself. You will be asked questions about NGOs in Moldova, their work, and funding. During the interview Diana Wong from Södertörn University and I will be present. She is currently investigating NGOs but is more focused on how NGOs communicate with the public. If you do not wish to answer any of the questions you may say so and I will move on to the next question instead. You can also stop the interview at any time if you wish to. The interview will be recorded digitally and the data obtained through the interviews will be subject to standard data use which protects the anonymity of individuals. I will provide you with a transcript of the interview to get your approval and make sure that the information is correct. The interview will be approximately 35-50 minutes long.

**Risks and Benefits**

If you happen to share some information you do not wish to be used in the study, please say so. You do not have to discuss or answer questions about topics that you do not feel comfortable about. There will be no direct benefit to you, but your participation will be valuable for the study.

**Confidentiality**

To ensure your anonymity the student carrying out the interview will not identify you by name in the thesis. Any data obtained through the interviews will be subject to standard data use which protects the anonymity of individuals.

**Sharing the Results**

The results will be shared in the bachelor thesis. When receiving the transcript of your interview you may decide that there is information you do not wish to be used and this decision will be respected. If you share your contact information you will be notified when the thesis is done.

**Right to Refuse or Withdraw**
Your participation in this research is completely voluntary and you may withdraw your consent at any time throughout the projects duration. You will be given the opportunity to review your answers and can ask to remove or modify information.

**Contact Information**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student:</th>
<th>Bodil Nordin</th>
<th>Supervisor:</th>
<th>Madeleine Bonow</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Email:</td>
<td><a href="mailto:bodil.nordin@gmail.com">bodil.nordin@gmail.com</a></td>
<td>Email:</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Madeleine.bonow@sh.se">Madeleine.bonow@sh.se</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phone:</td>
<td>+373 (78) 442861</td>
<td>Phone:</td>
<td>+46 (0)8 6084708</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>+46 70 321 4627</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This study proposal has been reviewed and approved by The School of Natural Sciences, Technology and Environmental Studies at Södertörn University, Stockholm, Sweden. The supervisor for the thesis is Madeleine Bonow who has a PhD in human geography and is part of the teaching staff at above mentioned school.
Part II: Certificate of Consent

I have been invited to participate in an interview concerning NGOs working with waste management and recycling in Chisinau, Moldova. I have read the foregoing information, or it has been read to me. I have had the opportunity to ask questions about it and any questions I have been asked have been answered to my satisfaction. I consent voluntarily to be a participant in this study.

Print Name of Participant_____________________________

Signature of Participant _______________________________

Date _________________________________

Day/month/year

If the participant is younger than 18, the guardians consent is required for participation of the study.

I have been informed about the study and my questions have been answered to my satisfaction. I consent to the voluntary participation in this study.

Print name of guardian___________________________

Signature of guardian___________________________

Date ________________________

Day/month/year

Statement by the student
I have accurately informed the potential participant, and to the best of my ability made sure that the participant understands that the following will be done:

1. The participation is voluntary and consent may be withdrawn at any time throughout the duration of the project.
2. An interview lasting for approximately 35-50 minutes will take place
3. The interview will be recorded
4. A transcript of the interview will be provided to the participant

I confirm that the participant was given an opportunity to ask questions about the study, and all the questions asked by the participant have been answered correctly and to the best of my ability. I confirm that the individual has not been coerced into giving consent, and the consent has been given freely and voluntarily.

A copy of this Informed Consent Form has been provided to the participant.
Print Name of Student____________________________________
Signature of Student____________________________________
Date ___________________________
    Day/month/year
Appendix B

Interview guide

- Could you describe your organisation and you role in it?
- Could you give examples of some recent projects? Environment, waste management, recycling…
- Were there any local authorities involved in those projects?
- What was the local authorities’ response to the projects?
- Could you give some examples of interactions with local authorities? Cooperation, funding, disagreements…
- If there has been any cooperation, on whose initiative?
- Do you have interactions with others, such as political parties, media, academics or other NGOs?
- How is your NGO funded? Do you receive any foreign aid? Contact with embassies? Are there any requirements that you have to fulfil in order to receive the funds?
- What are your feelings about cooperating with local authorities, the state, foreign states?
- Are there any difficulties for your NGOs?