Bronisława Zielonka

The Role of Linguistic Context in the Acquisition of the Pluperfect

Polish Learners of Swedish as a Foreign Language

Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Gdańskiego
Gdańsk 2005
Abstract


This work consists of two parts: a theoretical section and an experimental one. In the theoretical part, some general and some language-specific theories of tense, aspect and aktionsart are presented, and the temporal systems of Swedish and Polish are compared.

The theoretical part is not a mere review of the literature on the subject. The comparison of the descriptions of aspect and aktionsart by Slavic researchers with the universal theory of Smith (1991, 1997) and with the description of aktionsart in Swedish in Teleman et al. (1999) has resulted in some important observations as to the nature of the long-lasting dispute about the differences between aspect and aktionsart.

The experimental part is a cross-sectional study on the role of the linguistic context on the acquisition of the pluperfect by Polish learners of Swedish as a foreign language. The informants were university students studying Swedish as a foreign language. The language samples were collected by means of two types of tests: gap-filling and translation from Polish.

Twelve linguistic factors, each divided into two subgroups, were hypothesised to have affected the correct use of the pluperfect. The hypotheses as to which of the subgroups may inhibit and which may facilitate the correct use of the pluperfect are all grounded in linguistic theories, i.e. presented in the form of linguistically-based discussions as to what kind of effect (facilitative or inhibiting) each of the linguistic factors may have had, and why.

The effect of those factors upon the correct use of the pluperfect has been tested by means of a stepwise multiple regression which measured the simultaneous effect of each factor upon the correct use of the pluperfect. This method has confirmed the facilitative effect of the following six linguistic factors: intrasentential indication of topic time (subordinate clause), unbounded verb indicating topic time, agentive meaning of the target verb, specifying subordinate clause, statal pluperfect and location of the time of action of the pluperfect clause outside the temporal frame of the narrative plot.

Keywords: aspect, aktionsart, tense, topic time, pluperfect, time of action, linguistic context, linguistic factors inhibiting/facilitating acquisition, sequence of acquisition, statal pluperfect, actional pluperfect

© 2005 Bronisława Zielonka
ISBN 83-7326-296-6
Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Gdańskiego, Gdańsk 2005
Contents

Abstract ......................................................... 3
Acknowledgements ................................................. 9
1 Introduction ..................................................... 11
2 Theory .......................................................... 17
  2.1 Tense and aspect .............................................. 17
    2.1.1 General theories of tense .............................. 18
      2.1.1.1 The perfect in general theories of tense ........ 22
      2.1.1.2 The pluperfect in general theories of tense ..... 27
    2.1.2 General theories of aspect ............................ 30
    2.1.3 Tense and aspect in Swedish ......................... 31
    2.1.4 Tense and aspect in Polish ......................... 38
  2.2 Aktionsart .................................................. 44
    2.2.1 General theories of aktionsart ....................... 44
    2.2.2 Aktionsart in Swedish ................................ 47
    2.2.3 Aktionsart in Polish ................................ 50
    2.2.4 Aktionsart or aspect? ................................. 51
  2.3 The source of difficulty .................................... 61
    2.3.1 Comparison of Swedish and Polish tense systems ..... 61
    2.3.2 Some general observations on the acquisition of the Swedish tense system .......................... 67
    2.3.3 The main source of difficulty ....................... 68
3 Review of previous research on acquisition of temporality in L1 and L2 .................. 72
  3.1 Acquisition of temporality in L1 ........................ 72
  3.2 Acquisition of temporality in L2 ........................ 76
4 The design of the study ........................................ 86
  4.1 General theoretical background and research questions .......................... 86
  4.2 Informants .................................................. 88
  4.3 Linguistic material ......................................... 90
  4.4 Statistical methods ........................................ 99
    4.4.1 The method of scoring ................................ 100
    4.4.2 Rank order list ........................................ 102
    4.4.3 Stepwise multiple regression ....................... 103
5 Results of stepwise multiple regression .......................... 109
6 Analysis of the effect of non-linguistic factors ........................................ 113
   6.1 The factor type of task: (V3) .............................................................. 113
       6.1.1 Hypothesis ............................................................................... 114
       6.1.2 Results and discussion ......................................................... 115
   6.2 The factor type of response: (V4), (V5), (V6) .................................. 115
       6.2.1 Hypothesis ............................................................................... 116
       6.2.2 Results and discussion ......................................................... 118
   6.3 The effect of non-linguistic factors: summary of results .................. 120

7 Analysis of the effect of linguistic factors upon variable use of the pluperfect ......................................................... 121
   7.1 Factors connected with the type of verbal indication of topic time ......................................................... 122
       7.1.1 Location of the verb indicating topic time with reference to the target verb: (V8) and (V15) .................. 122
           7.1.1.1 Hypothesis ................................................................. 125
           7.1.1.2 Results and discussion ................................................. 129
       7.1.2 Bounded vs. unbounded meaning of the verb indicating topic time: (V13) .............................................. 130
           7.1.2.1 Hypothesis ................................................................. 131
           7.1.2.2 Classification problems ............................................. 135
           7.1.2.3 Results ................................................................. 137
       7.1.3 Multiple vs. single indication of topic time: (V11) .................. 137
           7.1.3.1 Hypothesis ................................................................. 140
           7.1.3.2 Results and discussion ............................................. 141
       7.1.4 Non-reported speech vs. reported speech: (V7) ..................... 141
           7.1.4.1 Hypothesis ................................................................. 142
           7.1.4.2 Results and discussion ............................................. 145
   7.2 Factors referring to the semantics of the target verb ..................... 145
       7.2.1 Bounded vs. unbounded and resultative vs. non-resultative meaning of the target verb: (V12), (V18) .............. 146
           7.2.1.1 Hypothesis ................................................................. 147
           7.2.1.2 Classification problems ............................................. 150
           7.2.1.3 Results and discussion ............................................. 151
       7.2.2 Agentive vs. non-agentive meaning of the target verb: (V16) .................. 153
           7.2.2.1 Hypothesis ................................................................. 153
           7.2.2.2 Results ................................................................. 154
   7.3 Miscellaneous factors ................................................................. 154
       7.3.1 Function of the subordinate clauses in the text: specifying vs. constituting: (V9) .................. 155
           7.3.1.1 Hypothesis ................................................................. 156
           7.3.1.2 Results ................................................................. 158
       7.3.2 Location of the time of action of pluperfect clauses: outside vs. within the temporal frame of the narrative plot (V10) .................. 158
## Contents

7.3.2.1 Hypothesis ............................................. 159  
7.3.2.2 Results .............................................. 161  
7.3.3 Type of semantic relation between the clause  
containing the target verb and the clause containing  
the verb indicating topic time (or some other clause):  
causal vs. non-causal (V14) .......................... 161  
7.3.3.1 Hypothesis ........................................... 162  
7.3.3.2 Results and discussion ............................ 163  
7.3.4 Type of pluperfect: actional vs. statal: (V17) ........ 164  
7.3.4.1 Hypothesis ........................................... 169  
7.3.4.2 The method of classification and classification  
problems ...................................................... 170  
7.3.4.3 Results and discussion ............................ 171  
7.3.5 The effect of linguistic factors upon the correct use  
of the pluperfect: summary of results .................. 174  
8 Final discussion .............................................. 177  
8.1 Answers to the research questions ....................... 177  
8.1.1 Is the correct use of the pluperfect affected  
by the linguistic context? .............................. 177  
8.1.2 Which linguistic factors may account for variable  
application of the pluperfect? ......................... 178  
8.1.3 Why may particular linguistic factors account  
for different degrees of difficulty in the application  
of the pluperfect rule? ................................. 182  
8.2 Interpretation of the results in terms of theories  
of language acquisition .................................. 186  
8.3 Assessment of the study .................................. 189  
8.3.1 Linguistic material ..................................... 189  
8.3.2 Method of scoring ...................................... 191  
8.4 Guidelines for future research ........................... 192  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bibliography</th>
<th>195</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Appendix 1. Texts read to the informants before  
each of the tasks | 202 |
| Appendix 2. Gap filling tests | 206 |
| Appendix 3. Translation task | 212 |
| Appendix 4. Rank order list | 216 |
| Rola kontekstu językowego w akwizji czasu pluperfect  
(streszczenie) | 224 |
| Content of Figures and Tables | 225 |
Acknowledgements

Financial and institutional support for this study, for which I am very grateful, has been supplied by the Department of Scandinavian Languages at the University of Stockholm, who financed my doctoral studies at the University of Stockholm and the expensive statistical analysis used in this investigation, stepwise multiple regression.

In the course of my work a number of people helped me in various ways. Many stages of this work, e.g. collecting of the linguistic material for the study, preparation of the material for the statistical analysis, a preliminary interpretation of the statistical results and the work on some theoretical issues were guided by Prof. Staffan Hellberg. Although in many cases I did not follow his advice, I would like to thank him for his patience in frequently heated discussions concerning various issues, e.g. the difference between aktionsart and aspect, the meaning of Polish past tense form, the function of the pluperfect in narrative texts, the interpretation of the results of stepwise multiple regression etc. Those sharp controversies have considerably delayed my work, but have prevented me from committing numerous errors, some of which may be found in the studies of other researchers, e.g. making use in an empirical study of a linguistic category the autonomy of which is highly controversial and whose relationship to the category of aspect is not quite clear, i.e. aktionsart.

I am particularly indebted to three people who helped me in critical moments of time. One of them is Doc. Karin Dahmström. The help with the interpretation of the statistical results which I received from her at the final stage of my work, when a lot of complications arose, was invaluable. The other two are Doc. Inger Larsson and Dr Danuta Stanulewicz. Without their support and encouragement this work would not have been concluded.

Any errors and omissions which remain in this work are, of course, my responsibility alone.

Bronisława Zielonka
1 Introduction

It seems to be common knowledge among teachers of Swedish and English that the acquisition of the pluperfect tense by Polish learners of these languages is a long and laborious process. Even the learners with almost native-like competence in Swedish or English, and in many cases in both languages, English (the first foreign language) and Swedish (the second foreign language), seem to avoid this tense in spontaneous language production, or use it very infrequently. When confronted with grammatical tasks involving obligatory contexts for the pluperfect, those learners often erroneously supply other tense forms, primarily the preterit or the perfect.

These observations have inspired me to a closer theoretical study concerning the meaning of the pluperfect and to an empirical study concerning the acquisition of this tense. The result has been several publications. Some of the publications, Zielonka (2000) and Zielonka (2002), presented various less well-known aspects of the meaning of this tense form, i.e. a subtle distinction between statal and actional pluperfect. Another publication, Zielonka (1995), contained my observations on the acquisition of this tense by Polish learners of Swedish as a foreign language, i.e. variable use of the pluperfect in various types of grammatical tasks as well as an attempt to explain the nature of this phenomenon. Finally, my long-lasting interest resulted in the present, more comprehensive work with the title The Role of Linguistic Context in the Acquisition of the Pluperfect. Polish Learners of Swedish as a Foreign Language, presented below.

The work consists of two parts: the theoretical section (Chapters 2–3) and the experimental one (Chapters 4–8). The theoretical part discusses tense, aspect and the semantic category called aktionsart. Tense and aspect are presented in one subsection because according to Laskowski (1998:157) Polish aspect
is functionally related to tense. Another reason for taking this approach is the fact that some grammarians, e.g. Comrie (1985) and Klein (1994), regard some tenses, e.g. present continuous or present perfect, as (a kind of) aspect or as having an aspectual component. Aktionsart is presented in a separate section, because this category is not directly related to tense.

The following approach is taken in the description of these categories: First some general theories for each of the categories are presented: tense (2.1.1), aspect (2.1.2) and aktionsart (2.2.1). These descriptions are followed by the presentations of each of the categories: tense, aspect, aktionsart in Swedish (2.1.3 and 2.2.2) and in Polish (2.1.4 and 2.2.3). The descriptions of those categories in these two languages are based mainly on the latest comprehensive grammars of the respective language, Teleman et al. (1999) for Swedish and Grzegorczykowa et al. (1998) for Polish.

Many statements in Chapter 2 concern the temporal system of English. There are several reasons for this approach. One very important reason is that general theories of tense are frequently illustrated with examples taken from English. Another reason is the fact that in my description of the temporal system of Swedish special attention is paid to the meanings of the tenses relevant to my research: the perfect and the pluperfect. Those two tenses, especially the pluperfect, have been extensively described in general linguistic literature. In Swedish linguistic literature those two tenses, especially the pluperfect, have received relatively less attention. Since, apart from some minor exceptions involving language-specific uses, the function of the preterit, the perfect and the pluperfect in Swedish is the same as in English (Svartvik and Sager 1977/86:88), or in other words, since what is said about English is to a high degree also valid for Swedish, this approach would seem to be justified. Yet another reason for frequent references to the English tense system is the possibility of drawing on the contrastive study of English and Polish grammars by Fisiak et al. (1978). No such contrastive study was available for Swedish when this study was being prepared.

The aim of the theoretical part of this work is twofold. Firstly, the review of some general and some language-specific (Swedish

---

1 My project started in 1996, i.e. before Christensen (1997) and Teleman et al. (1999) were published.
and Polish) theories of temporality (tense, aspect and aktionsart) allows for the presentation of the pluperfect tense, or the lack of it, in a context, i.e. as part of the temporal system of the respective language, or a gap in the system. Since it is assumed that some of the difficulties in the acquisition of the pluperfect experienced by Polish learners of Swedish stem from some important differences (the lack of the perfect and the pluperfect form) and some seeming similarities between the temporal systems of Swedish and Polish (both languages have the past tense form, but the range of its use in the two languages is somewhat different), the presentation and the comparison of the temporal systems of these two languages allow for a better understanding of the nature of the difficulties involved.

Secondly, and perhaps most importantly, the theoretical descriptions of temporal systems in the respective languages, each of them capturing some important aspects of the meaning of the relevant temporal categories, have supplied some fine-grained analytical tools used in the empirical part of this work. Or more exactly, the different elements of the theoretical descriptions have been a rich source of inspiration in the selection of the linguistic factors which may affect the use of the pluperfect and in the forming of the hypotheses as to what kind of effect, facilitative or inhibiting, can be attributed to each of these factors.

Generally, more attention is devoted to those elements of the description of tense and aspect which are directly relevant to the empirical part of this work, i.e. those elements that may account for some acquisitional difficulties frequently experienced by Polish learners of Swedish. Thus, much more space is devoted to the description of the perfect and the pluperfect in Swedish and to the meaning of the past tense form in Polish than to the descriptions of other tenses.

Since the tense system in Polish is relatively simple, i.e. Polish encodes fewer of the universal possibilities of locating events in time, more space is devoted to the description of aspect than to the description of tense. Quite the opposite approach, more focus on tense than on aspect, is taken in the description of Swedish. Swedish is not an aspectual language, so very little attention has been devoted to the issue of aspect in Swedish linguistic literature.²

² Teleman et al. (1999) do not make any reference to grammatical category aspect in the main body of Svenska Akademiens grammatik.
Consequently, the issue of aspect in Swedish is in my work mentioned only in passing. The discussion of formal exponents of tense and aspect is greatly constrained, references to form being made where absolutely necessary, i.e. as elements of definitions or explanations of differences in meaning.

A great amount of attention is devoted to the semantic category aktionsart presented in section 2.2. This is due to the fact that in the initial conception of the study aktionsart was to be of great importance, i.e. one of the two linguistic factors whose effect upon the correct use of the pluperfect was to be investigated. Upon closer analysis, this category turned out to have strong affinity (but not complete overlap) with the category aspect. Having an aspect language as my native language, i.e. being sensitive to aspactual meanings, I found the issue very interesting and I did an extensive study of the literature on the subject. This allowed me to find some misconceptions and inconsistencies in some descriptions of this category, e.g. Smith (1991) and (1977) and for Swedish, Teleman et.al. (1999). Those misconceptions and inconsistencies are pointed out and a suggestion for making a clear distinction between the category aspect and the category aktionsart is made in section 2.2.4.

In the final section of Chapter 2, section 2.3, the temporal systems of Swedish and Polish are compared. The comparison is made with a view to pinpointing some of the difficulties in the correct use of the pluperfect and a somewhat related tense, the perfect (the pluperfect is backshifted perfect and backshifted preterit), which may have their origin in the differences and seeming similarities between the temporal systems of the languages concerned. Considerable attention is devoted to the the double function of the past tense form in Polish and to the intricate relationships of form and meaning within and between these languages.

Although the theoretical part of my work is very extensive and is not a mere review of relevant linguistic literature (in some cases it includes my critical remarks or suggestions for re-definition), it does not constitute the main section of this work. The bulk of this work consists of the experimental part, a cross-sectional study of the use of the pluperfect by Polish university learners of Swedish as a foreign language. The investigation seeks to answer the research questions of whether the correct use of the
pluperfect is affected by the linguistic context, which linguistic factors may affect the correct use of the pluperfect and why, and what kind of effect, inhibitive or facilitative, those factors may have. Or in other words, the investigation seeks to supply an answer to the questions of whether some linguistic contexts for the pluperfect are relatively easy and some relatively difficult, which contexts are relatively easy and which are relatively difficult and why particular linguistic factors may account for different degrees of difficulty in the application of the pluperfect rule.

The term *linguistic context* is used in this study with a broader meaning than in some other studies, where this term refers to the immediately preceding or the immediately following linguistic environment (Ellis 1994:135). In the present study, the term *linguistic context* covers a whole range of factors referring to different linguistic levels: the word level, e.g. the semantics of the target verb, the sentence level, e.g. main vs. subordinate clause, and the level of the text, e.g. location of the time of action of the pluperfect clauses outside vs. inside the temporal frame of the narrative plot.

In Chapter 3 a review of literature on the acquisition of temporality is presented. This review is selective, i.e. it is primarily those studies which had some bearing upon the present work which are reviewed. Since many researchers in the field of language acquisition claim that there are some similarities in the acquisition of L1 and L2, not only literature concerning the acquisition of L2 (section 3.2), but also literature concerning the acquisition of L1 (section 3.1) is reviewed. As with the review of the theories of tense, aspect and aktionsart, this selective review has been a source of inspiration in the forming of the hypotheses and in the interpretation of the results of this study.

The design of the study, i.e. the theoretical background, the presentation of the informants, the information about the way in which the linguistic material for this study was collected, and about the statistical method used in this study, stepwise multiple regression, as well as the list of non-linguistic and linguistic factors hypothesised to affect the correct use of the pluperfect, is presented in Chapter 4. The results of the statistical analysis via *stepwise multiple regression* are presented and commented in Chapter 5.

In the next two chapters the non-linguistic factors (Chapter 6) and linguistic factors (Chapter 7) are described and interpreted
with reference to the results of the stepwise multiple regression. Each of the linguistic factors (the independent variables in the stepwise multiple regression) is illustrated with examples. One of the non-linguistic factors and all the linguistic factors are binary, i.e. they have two values (two subgroups) of which one is assumed to facilitate and one is assumed to inhibit the correct use of the pluperfect. All the hypotheses as to the kind of effect, facilitative or inhibitive, that particular subgroups of the linguistic factors may have, are grounded in linguistic literature. Since the results of the stepwise multiple regression are not quite reliable, the main value of this work lies in the choice of factors, many of which have never been taken into consideration by other researchers in the field of acquisition of temporality, and in my linguistically-grounded discussions as to why respective subgroups of linguistic factors may affect the correct use of the pluperfect. Thus, Chapter 7 constitutes the major contribution of this work.

In the final chapter, Chapter 8, an attempt is made to answer the research questions and some general tendencies observed in this study are outlined. Apart from this, Chapter 8 contains an assessment of the methodological framework of this study and some guidelines for future research.
2 Theory

This chapter consists of three sections. Section 2.1 discusses tense and aspect. As mentioned in the previous chapter, tense and aspect are presented in a single section because according to Laskowski (1998:157) aspect in Polish is functionally related to tense. Another reason for taking this approach is the fact that some grammarians, e.g. Comrie (1985) and Klein (1994), regard some tenses, e.g. present continuous or present perfect as (a kind of) aspect or as having an aspectual component. Section 2.2 contains some information about the semantic category called aktionsart. Aktionsart is presented in a separate section because this category is not directly related to tense and generally does not have any systematic formal markers. In the final subsection, 2.2.4, some inconsistencies in the general theory of aktionsart (Smith 1991) and in the language-specific theory of this semantic category (Teleman et al. 1999) are pointed out and a suggestion is made for how to make a clear distinction between aspect and aktionsart. In Section 2.3 the temporal systems of Swedish and Polish are compared. The comparison is made with the view to establishing on theoretical grounds whether the differences and the seeming similarities between the temporal systems of these languages may affect the acquisition of the pluperfect (and a related tense, the perfect).

2.1 Tense and aspect

Section 2.1 consists of four subsections. The first subsection, 2.1.1, discusses the notion of tense and its relation to time, i.e. some basic logical possibilities for locating situations in time. The theoretical point of departure for this discussion consists of three general theories of tense proposed by Reichenbach (1947), Comrie (1985) and Klein (1994). Since the perfect and the pluperfect are most relevant for the present study, some other theories of the perfect and the pluperfect, both older and recent, are also reviewed. In the second subsection, 2.1.2, some general theories of aspect are considered,
the most important being Comrie (1976), Smith (1991) and Klein (1994). In the two remaining subsections some elements of the temporal systems of both of the languages involved in the study, Swedish (subsection 2.1.3) and Polish (subsection 2.1.4), are described. These descriptions are primarily based on the latest and most comprehensive grammars of each of the languages, Teleman et al. (1999) for Swedish, and Grzegorczykowa et al. (1998) for Polish.

Generally, more attention is devoted to those categories which are of importance for the languages involved and those which are directly relevant to the empirical part of this work, i.e. those elements which may account for some acquisitional difficulties frequently experienced by Polish learners of Swedish. Thus, much space is devoted to the description of tense in Swedish, particularly, the perfect and the pluperfect, and to the aspect and consequently to the past tense form in Polish.

2.1.1 General theories of tense

The two commonly known general theories of tense, Reichenbach (1947) and Comrie (1985), which are used as the basis for the presentation of the systems of tenses in Swedish and Polish, are similar in many respects. There is, however, a very important difference between these two theories, namely, the way in which the perfect is viewed. Since, as mentioned above, the perfect is of great importance in the contrastive description of Swedish and Polish tense systems and of some importance for my empirical research, both theories are referred to in this work. They are not reviewed in any particular order but some elements of both are intertwined.

An adequate way to discuss time is, according to Comrie (1985:2), a diagram in which the present moment is marked with 0, the past being situated to the left and the future to the right of this point. Comrie (1985:2) illustrates his statement as in Figure 1.

```
past 0 future
```

Figure 1. Representation of time

According to Comrie (1985:9), the function of tense in human languages is to locate events denoted by verbs on this time line.
Thus, tense may be defined as “grammaticalised expression of location in time”. Described in this way, tense constitutes a deictic system in which the present moment (the time of utterance) is taken as a deictic centre. The three basic tenses present, past and future, called by Comrie (1985:36) absolute tenses, are described by him in the following way: “present tense means coincidence of the time of the situation and the present moment; past tense means location of the situation prior to the present moment; future tense means location of the situation after the present moment”.

The model of tenses presented above suffices to describe the Polish system of tenses but it is not adequate for the description of the Swedish system of tenses. For this purpose, the use of the third time parameter, Reichenbach’s (1947:288) notion of the point of reference, seems necessary. Although heavily criticised in Klein (1994:26) for being vacuous and inadequately defined, Reichenbach’s notion of the point of reference seems to be useful for my purpose – accounting for similarities and differences between the Swedish and the Polish tense systems.

Reichenbach (1947:289–290) says that three points in time should be taken into consideration even in the description of those tenses which, “in superficial consideration, seem to concern only two time points”. The three time points considered by Reichenbach are:

- S – the point of speech
- E – the point of event
- R – the point of reference

Reichenbach (1944:290) presents and exemplifies the simple tenses as in Figure 2.

```
Simple past          Simple present          Simple future

R,E   S
I saw John.

S,R,E
I see John.

S,R   E
I shall see John.
```

Figure 2. The position of S, E and R for the simple past, the simple present and the simple future

---

3 Comrie (1985) also uses the notion of the point of reference but mainly for the pluperfect and the future perfect.
In the case of the simple tenses (the simple past, the simple present and the simple future), the point of reference (R) seems unnecessary because in each case it coincides with some other point. However, the concept of the point of reference is of great importance in the description of the pluperfect and the future perfect. Those two tenses are presented and exemplified by Reichenbach (1944:290) as in Figure 3 and Figure 4.

```
I had seen John.
```

Figure 3. The position of E, R and S for the pluperfect

```
I shall have seen John.
```

Figure 4. The position of E, R and S for the future perfect

Part of the meaning of the pluperfect and the future perfect is similar – both tenses locate events before a point of reference different from the present moment. The difference between the two tenses lies in the position of the point of reference. For the pluperfect the point of reference is located in the past, for the future perfect the point of reference is located in the future.

A similar approach in the description of the pluperfect and the future perfect is taken by Comrie (1985). Those two tenses, the pluperfect and the future perfect, are called by Comrie (1985:65) absolute-relative tenses. The reason for this is that their meaning combines two kinds of time reference, absolute time location of the reference point with relative time location of the situation.

As mentioned before, the main difference between those two theories concerns the description of the perfect. According to Comrie (1985:78), the English perfect does not fit in the system of tenses. It cannot be placed among absolute-relative tenses because in spite of formal similarity, the perfect is “conceptually different” from the pluperfect and future perfect. The
difference consists in the fact that for the perfect the point of reference is simultaneous with the present moment and thus it gives absolute and not absolute-relative time reference. Nor can the perfect be placed among absolute tenses. In terms of locating events in time there would be no difference between the perfect and the preterit, as both tenses locate events prior to the present moment (time of speech). In agreement with his claims, Comrie (1985) does not deal with the perfect in his book on tense, but includes the discussion of the perfect in his book on aspect.

In Reichenbach’s (1947) theory, the difference between the perfect and the preterit is accounted for by means of the third parameter – the point of reference, used not only in the description of the perfect, the pluperfect and the future perfect but also for the present tense and the preterit. For the perfect, the point of reference is situated at the moment of speech, i.e. it is situated in the present. For the preterit, the point of reference is simultaneous with the time of event, i.e. it is situated in the past. Thus, Reichenbach (1947) makes a clear distinction between the preterit and the perfect and treats the perfect on a par with the pluperfect and the future perfect, the difference being the position of the point of reference. For the perfect, the reference point is neither prior nor subsequent to the present moment, as is the case with the pluperfect and the future perfect, but it coincides with the present moment. Diagramatically, it may be presented as in Figure 5 (Reichenbach 1947:290).

These differences in the ways of classifying and describing the perfect illustrate a long-lasting controversy surrounding this form. More information about different approaches in the description of the meaning of the perfect can be found in the following section.
2.1.1.1 The perfect in general theories of tense

As illustrated in the differences in Reichenbach’s (1947) and Comrie’s (1985) approach to the perfect, there seems to be a controversy about the classification of this tense. The suggestion that the perfect cannot be included in the tense system because it carries some other meaning than purely temporal goes back to Jespersen (1926). According to Jespersen (1926:269), the English perfect “contains the semantic component of result” and is a “retrospective variety of the present”, i.e. it presents the present state as “the outcome of past events”. The proof for the English perfect being a variety of the present tense and not a variety of the past tense is the fact that perfect clauses are compatible with the adverb now as in Now I have eaten enough but are not compatible with a definite point in the past, e.g. the adverb yesterday.4

Many scholars, undoubtedly because of some affinity of the perfect to the perfective aspect, traditionally ascribe to the perfect some elements of aspectual meaning. Summarizing earlier descriptions of the meaning of the perfect, Brinton (1988:12) states that aspectual meanings most commonly attributed to the perfect are completion and current relevance of the effects of an earlier situation. According to Curme (1931), the primary meaning of the perfect is that of completion rather than result or current relevance. Curme (1931:358) illustrates his statement with an example, presented here as (1), in which stress upon the auxiliary emphasises “the idea of the reality of attainment”:

(1) Why don’t you ’finish your work? I ’have finished it.

According to Charleston (1941:24), the perfect indicates that an act fully completed by the moment of enunciation has given rise to a present condition, result or effect, and that the attention is directed towards the result rather than to the act itself.

4 Jespersen (1926:270) claims that the general tendency is that the perfect is evolving into the preterit. This tendency is not equally strong in all languages. English is more strict than most languages in this respect and does not allow for an occurrence of adverbs of definite past time with the perfect. Comrie’s (1985:32) claim about compatibility of the perfect with adverbs of definite past time is slightly weaker. According to him, the perfect is in general incompatible with a specific moment in the past.
to Joos (1964:134), whereas verbs in the preterit refer to an event and its effects together, verbs in the perfect are presented as the effects of an earlier event, i.e. the effects are delayed. This means that the event is mentioned for the sake of its consequences rather than for the sake of the act itself. According to Hirtle (1975:143), the perfect “intercepts an event after rather than during its coming into being”. The event is thus in the “aftermath” or in its “result phase”.

An interesting view of the perfect is presented by Comrie (1976). Stating that the English perfect does not fit in the system of tense, Comrie calls the perfect aspect, however, with the following reservation:

[…] given the traditional terminology in which the perfect is listed as an aspect, it is most convenient to deal with the perfect in a book on aspect, while bearing in mind continually that it is an aspect in a rather different sense from the other aspects treated so far. (Comrie 1976:52)

Thus, for Comrie, the perfect is neither tense nor aspect, but a category in its own right. The perfect, which according to Comrie (1976:58–60), expresses a continuing relevance of a past situation, exhibits some specific manifestations of this property, namely four types of meaning: perfect of result (indicating that a present state is the result of some past situation), experiential perfect (indicating that a given situation has held at least once during some time in the past leading up to the present), perfect of persistent situation (describing a situation that started in the past but continues into the present) and perfect of recent past (the present relevance of the past situation referred to is simply one of temporal closeness).

Even in one of the latest general theories of tense the perfect is treated on a par with the other perfectual tenses, and ascribed an element of aspeсtual meaning. Klein (1994) presents the perfect as a combination of tense and aspect, i.e. as having a tense component and an aspect component. As in Reichenbach (1947), Klein introduces three parameters in his description of the temporal system: the time of utterance (TU), the time of situation (TSit) and the topic time (TT). The time of utterance and the time of situation seem to be identical with Reichenbach’s (1947) point
of speech and point of event, respectively. The topic time is slightly different. It is defined by Klein (1994:4) as the time span to which the speaker’s claim is confined. Tense marks the relation between the topic time (TT) and the time of utterance (TU). The basic tenses (present, past and future) involve different types of relations between TU and TT, as the time of utterance may be included in the topic time, or it may fall after or before the topic time. Klein (1994:124) presents the three simple tenses in the following way:

- **Present tense**: \( \text{TU} \subseteq \text{TT} \)
- **Past tense**: \( \text{TU} \text{ AFTER } \text{TT} \)
- **Future tense**: \( \text{TU} \text{ BEFORE } \text{TT} \)

Aspect relates the topic time (TT) to the time of situation (TSit). Since the perfect has a dual nature, i.e. a tense component and an aspect component, two separate relations must be taken into consideration in the description of this tense. The tense component of the perfect says that similarly to the present tense, the time of utterance (TU) includes the topic time (TT). This explains why the topic time cannot be specified by adverbials of definite time in English, e.g. *I have seen him yesterday*. The aspect component of the perfect concerns the relation between the topic time (TT) and the time of situation (TSit). The perfect is described by Klein (1994:131) as the following relation:

\[ \text{TU} \subseteq \text{TT} \text{ AND } \text{TT} \text{ AFTER } \text{TSit} \]

The frequency and the duration of TSit as well as the distance of TSit to TT are left open and allow for different readings of the perfect. Klein (1994:111) makes an attempt to account for Comrie’s (1976:56–61) classifications of the perfect in terms of the distance between TT and TSit. For perfect of result, indicating a present state as the result of some past situation, TSit is usually close to TT. For experiential perfect, indicating that a given situation has occurred at least once during some time in the past leading to the present, the distance between TSit and TT may be longer. The perfect of recent past, indicating that the past situation referred to is very recent, seems to have the meaning similar to that of the past tense. In this use of the perfect, the constraint of non-compatibility of perfect clauses with specification
of time is suspended and the temporal adverb recently or its synonyms may co-occur. This usage is, according to Klein (1994:113), the beginning of the process whereby the perfect becomes a past tense, similar to the process already accomplished in German.

Klein (1994:112) claims that continuative perfect, i.e. the perfect which indicates that the situation started in the past and continues up to the present moment, is only seemingly in contradiction with the component TT after TSit. This use of the perfect can be explained in terms of differences in the lexical content. According to Klein (1994:112), two different types of lexical content describing two different situations are involved in: <Chris shop there> and <Chris shop there for ten years>. In the latter case, the lexical content describes a situation the duration of which is lexically specified by the time adverbial ten years, and the post-time of the situation starts with the eleventh year.

In some other descriptions of the perfect, e.g. Morrisey (1973), the dual nature of the perfect is not accounted for by a component of aspectual meaning, but by two times of reference involved in its meaning, the primary time of reference, i.e. the present, and the secondary time of reference, i.e. the past. Morrisey (1973:67) illustrates his claim with clauses modified by the adverbials still/any- more. The meaning of the clause The door has been open, and it still is, is that the door was open at the secondary time of reference, and it is open at the primary time of reference. The meaning of the clause The door has been open, but it isn’t anymore is that the door was open at the secondary time of reference but it is not open at the primary time of reference. Morrisey (1973:69) concludes that if two times of reference are involved, “the predication involving the perfect can be evaluated bifocally, that is with respect to either time”.

The last theory to be reviewed seems to pursue a similar line of thought. Maslov (1988:64) gives the following typological description of the perfect:

The term “perfect” may only be applied to those verb forms whose meanings, to one degree or another, include two temporal planes: that of precedence and that of sequence. The situations corresponding to these planes are in one way or another related as cause and effect. Usually one of the two situations seems to be semantically more important, while the other serves, as it were, as a background, often barely suggested.
Maslov (1988:64–65) distinguishes two types of perfect: the actional and the statal. In the actional perfect, the role of action is highlighted and thus the temporal plane precedence is in focus. In the statal perfect, the resultative state following from the change produced by the action is highlighted and thus the temporal plane sequence is in focus. Maslov’s typological notion of the perfect is purely semantic. Thus, in the languages that do not possess the perfect form, like Russian, those meanings may be conveyed with some other temporal forms, e.g. the past tense form, called the past participle. Since the opposition statal vs. actional is functional, one and the same verbal form may be used in one case with the statal and in another case with the actional meaning. Statal (resultative) perfect in Russian is exemplified by Maslov (1988:66) with i.e. Pismo napisano karandašom ‘The letter was written in pencil’ (past participle, perfective aspect). Actional perfect is exemplified with Pismo napisano včera ‘The letter was written yesterday’ (past participle, perfective aspect).

The amount of linguistic literature on the perfect is so great that an overview must necessarily be fragmentary and greatly selective. Summing up, the most important ways of presenting the perfect in linguistic literature are:
1. The perfect as a category in its own right.
2. The perfect as aspect.
3. The perfect as a combination of tense and aspect.
4. The perfect as a tense involving two time points or as a notion involving two temporal planes.

Each of these theories captures some part of the meaning of the perfect. Some of the elements of the theories and descriptions presented above, particularly the theories presenting the perfect as a tense involving two time points, or as a notion involving two temporal planes, have been an invaluable source of inspiration, since they have supplied some fine-grained analytical tools for the experimental part of my work. In this work, the perfect is regarded as a tense (not aspect) which involves two or three time points, i.e. in agreement with the theories of Reichenbach (1944), Morrisay (1977) and Maslov (1988) and thus generally, but not in every respect, in agreement with the syntactico-semantic theory of tense presented in the most recent and most comprehensive description of the Swedish temporal system, Teleman et al. (1999).
2.1.1.2 The pluperfect in general theories of tense

As mentioned in section 2.1.1, the meaning ascribed to the pluperfect by both Reichenbach (1947) and Comrie (1985) is that of locating a situation prior to a point of reference in the past. According to Comrie (1985:67), any additional meaning beyond this, i.e. any more fine-grained temporal interpretations of the meaning of the pluperfect, will depend entirely on the context in which the pluperfect occurs.

The point of reference in the past to which pluperfect clauses are related may be indicated in different ways. According to Reichenbach (1944:288) and Comrie (1985:65–66), it may be indicated by a time adverbial, as in Comrie’s example presented as (2):

(2) John had arrived by six o’clock yesterday evening.

or by a main clause with the verb in the preterit to which the clause containing the pluperfect is subordinate, as in Comrie’s example presented as (3):

(3) When John had left, Mary emerged from the cupboard.

or it may be given by the context, i.e. in a sequence of independent main clauses, the first clause establishing the point of reference in the past to which the situation denoted by the verb in the pluperfect in the second clause is temporally related, as in Comrie’s example presented as (4):

(4) The clock struck ten; John had already left.

Jespersen (1931) observed that the pluperfect is a combination of two categories, the perfect and the preterit. According to Jespersen (1931:81), “the pluperfect primarily serves to denote before past time or a retrospective past – two things which stand in the same relation to each other as the preterit and the perfect, but cannot easily be kept apart”. This means that the meanings conveyed by two separate tense forms, the perfect and the preterit, i.e. relating situations to the present moment, when backshifted, i.e. relating situations to a reference point in the past, are amalgamated in one form, the pluperfect.

In view of the fact that part of the meaning of the pluperfect is that of the backshifted perfect, all the theories of the perfect
described in an earlier part of this work are also applicable to the pluperfect, the difference being the position of the point of reference. This means that apart from denoting before past time, the pluperfect may express completion of an action taking place before the time of the point of reference in the past, current relevance of earlier events at the time of the point of reference in the past, i.e. a new state of affairs, or consequences of an earlier action (results) obtaining at the time of the point of reference in the past, and continuation of an earlier action beyond the time of the reference point in the past etc.

According to Klein (1994), not only the perfect but also the pluperfect has a dual nature – a tense component and an aspect component – and must be described in terms of two different relations. The tense component of the pluperfect says that, as in the past tense, the time of utterance (TU) is after the topic time (TT), while the aspect component says that, as in the perfect, the topic time (TT) is after the time of situation (TSit). The pluperfect is described by Klein (1994:131) as the following relation:

\[TU \text{ AFTER } TT \text{ and } TT \text{ AFTER } TSit\]

In spite of many similarities, it is, however, necessary to notice an important difference between the perfect and the pluperfect. The difference involves a constraint on the collocation with adverbs of definite time, a constraint which is valid for the perfect, but does not apply to the pluperfect (Comrie 1985:79). The absence of this constraint can be explained in terms of the nature of the pluperfect and in the position of the point of reference. Since the pluperfect is the backshifted preterit there is no contradiction in occurrences of the pluperfect with the adverbs of definite past time. Since the point of reference (or topic time) is also situated in the past, there is no contradiction in occurrences of backshifted perfect with adverbs of definite past time.

A more penetrating observation concerning the interpretation of past time adverbials co-occurring with the pluperfect was made by Comrie (1985). According to him, an adverb of past time may either constitute the point of reference in the past or it may refer to the time at which the situation is located. The point of reference is, in the latter case, situated somewhere else in the context. As Comrie (1985:66) points out, the sentence *John had left at ten o’clock*, may have two different interpretations:
1. The adverb *ten o’clock* establishes a reference point prior to John’s departure.

2. The adverb *ten o’clock* specifies the time of John’s departure (the time of action.)

Using Thieroff’s (1994:109) notation system, the two different functions of adverbs of past time may be symbolically represented in the following way:

1. \( E \rightarrow R \rightarrow \text{adv} \rightarrow S \)
2. \( E \rightarrow \text{adv} \rightarrow R \rightarrow S \)

The difference in the constraints on collocations of the perfect and the pluperfect with adverbs of definite time has given rise to the claim that the perfect is conceptually different from the pluperfect, Comrie (1985), Dahl (1985) and Plungian (personal communication). Dahl (1985:144) claims that the pluperfect should be treated as a category “separate but not necessarily independent from the perfect.”\(^5\) This view of the pluperfect was supported by some findings of typological studies – the existence of languages with the perfect but with no pluperfect, e.g. Swahili, and with the pluperfect but no perfect, e.g. Maltese, modern spoken French and Southern dialects of German.

Another important observation made by Comrie (1983) refers to the justification of the existence of the pluperfect cross-linguistically. Comrie (1983:67) claims that being located in the past, the situation referred to by the pluperfect “can in principle be referred to by the past tense”. This is the case in many languages of the world, among others, Polish. The existence of the pluperfect is justified by its function in narrative texts. The chronology of events in a narrative may be indicated by the order of mention, following strictly the order of events in the real world. But, as Comrie (1983:67) states, “if for some reason it is desired to present events in other than chronological order, the pluperfect is an ideal mechanism for indicating this”.

The textual function of the pluperfect is far from being thoroughly investigated. Actually, very little attention has been devoted to it in the literature on the subject. Hopper (1979:40) claims that since an event encoded by the pluperfect can never be strictly sequential with respect to the previous narrative (foreground)

---

\(^5\) In his later work, Dahl (1987:496–9) changed his view of the pluperfect.
event, “the compound pluperfect tense of many Western European languages expressing the anteriority of an event to some previously mentioned event is an explicitly backgrounding device”. This view of the textual function of the pluperfect is shared by some other researchers, e.g. Reinhart (1984:786).

2.1.2 General theories of aspect

Many attempts at creating a general theory of aspect have been made, but there is still a great deal of controversy concerning its true nature and meaning. Linguists are far from agreement, not only as to whether aspect is a grammatical or lexical category, but also to what the definition of aspect should actually cover. The situation is made still more difficult by some terminological confusion.

One of the most well-known attempts at defining aspect cross-linguistically came from Comrie (1976). Comrie (1976:3) defines aspect as “different ways of viewing the internal temporal constituency of a situation”. Employing the terminology used in the description of Slavic languages, Comrie (1976) distinguishes three kinds of aspects: the perfective, the imperfective and the habitual. Since the habitual is not the object of this study, it will not be discussed any further in the present work.

The perfective is defined by Comrie (1976:3) as making reference to the totality of the situation, without reference to its internal temporal constituency. This means that the situation is presented as an unanalysable whole, the beginning, the middle and the end being rolled up into one. It is viewed from the outside. The imperfective is defined as making reference to the internal temporal constituency (the internal portion) of the situation. The situation is viewed from the inside.

A similar definition of the perfective and, the imperfective aspect, called viewpoint, is presented in Smith’s (1991:93) cross-linguistic theory of aspect. The perfective viewpoint is defined as including both endpoints of a situation, the initial and the final. The imperfective viewpoint is defined as focusing on stages that are neither initial nor final. The imperfective and perfective viewpoints are, according to Smith (1991:91), categories of Universal Grammar.
Klein (1994:28–30) finds most of the definitions of aspect intuitively appealing but not quite satisfactory. They capture some important intuitions about aspect, but they are not precise enough. The notions used in the description of aspect are, according to Klein (1991:28–29), metaphorical and do not account for the systematic difference between aktionsart and aspect.

Klein’s definition of aspect involves the relation of the time of situation (T Sit) and the topic time (TT). The imperfective means that the time of situation fully includes the topic time, TT_{\text{INCL}} T Sit, the perfective means that the time of situation partly includes the topic time, TT_{\text{AT}} T Sit. Klein (1994:28–30) differentiates two additional types of aspect, the perfect, TT_{\text{AFTER}} T Sit, and the prospective, TT_{\text{BEFORE}} T Sit. According to Klein (1994:108), his definitions reflect the intuitions behind “metaphorical characterizations” of the imperfective and perfective aspect such as viewing the situation from the inside vs. from the outside or non-completion vs. completion and may be seen as appropriate reconstructions of the traditional notions.

Different languages employ different formal markers of the category aspect. Slavic languages employ prefixes and suffixes. English makes use of the opposition of the simple and progressive forms and, according to some scholars, of the perfect form, (the latter with the reservation that it is different from the usual meaning of the term called aspect). Romance languages make use of the opposition of past and past imperfective tense. Ancient and Modern Greek make use of the opposition of the imperfect and the aorist etc. The meanings conveyed by the different formal markers, which are subsumed in general aspectology under the cover term aspect, are similar but not identical.

2.1.3 Tense and aspect in Swedish

Swedish encodes the tenses called by Comrie (1985) absolute tenses: the preterit, the present and the future, the tenses called by Comrie (1985) absolute-relative tenses: the future perfect and the pluperfect, and the perfect (Thorell 1973, Lindberg 1980, Christensen 1997, Teleman et al. 1999). Two recent and most comprehensive descriptions of tense system in Swedish, Christensen (1997) and Teleman et al. (1999), are presented below. Since the
two descriptions of the system of Swedish tenses are very similar, an eclectic approach is taken in reviewing them. References to particular authors are given only exceptionally.

In these two recent theories of tense, the three parameters used in the general theories of tense, the point of speech, the point of event and the point of reference or the topic time (see 2.1.1) are combined with morpho-lexical elements, i.e. the meaning of the suffixes of the present and the preterit for the absolute tenses and the relation between the time of the auxiliary verb and the time of the main verb for the perfectual tenses. Thus, as in the descriptions of the perfect by Morrisey (1973:69) and Maslov (1988:64–65), the Swedish perfectual tenses are described bifocally.

With respect to the time of speech, two temporal domains are distinguished: the present time domain and the past time domain. The present time domain comprises the moment of speech and the time later than the moment of speech. The past time domain stretches up to the moment of speech, but does not comprise it. The simple tenses, the present and the preterit, have inherent meaning indicated by their respective temporal suffixes. The present tense suffixes point to the temporal domain which includes the moment of speech and the time later than the moment of speech. The past tense suffixes point to the temporal domain situated before the point of speech.

The compound perfectual and futural tenses take temporal auxiliary verbs: ha ‘have’, skola ‘shall’, komma ‘come’. The lexical meaning of the auxiliary verbs denotes the way in which the time of the subordinate verb (the supine) is related to the time of the superordinate verb (the auxiliary). The auxiliary verb ha indicates that the situation denoted by the subordinate verb is located before the time of the superordinate verb. The auxiliary verb skola indicates that the time of situation denoted by the subordinate verb, the infinitive, is located after the time of the superordinate verb. The two theories differ with respect to the function of the futural verb komma. Since the future tense is not relevant for my investigation, this issue will not be discussed here.

---

6 Accounting for the differences between the two descriptions is beyond the scope of my research.
7 Future meaning is expressed in Swedish by the language-specific construction komma + att infinitiv ‘come + to infinitive’.
The third parameter used in the description of Swedish tenses has the label *the topic time* (TT) (Teleman et al. 1999) or *FIX* (Christensen 1997). TT is defined as the time which is referred to in a given clause. FIX is defined as a sort of action involving a (philosophic) subject who is observing a referential situation, perceives it and structures it linguistically as the action encoded by the finite verb. Christensen (1997:86) admits that the meaning of FIX is slightly vague. Since the actual act of observation can be placed in time, FIX may either refer to the observation itself or it may refer to the time of observation. Most often it is used by Christensen with the meaning *time of observation of a referential situation*. FIX is regarded by Christensen (1997) as a mediating element between the moment of speech and the referential situation encoded by the finite verb. As there seems to be some affinity between TT and FIX – both denote time – the third parameter is henceforth called TT/FIX.

TT/FIX may be specific or non-specific, punctual or drawn-out (lengthy). TT/FIX always falls within the temporal domain indicated by the tense of the finite verb, i.e. it is established by the respective temporal suffixes of the finite verbs or by the tense of the auxiliary verbs. Past temporal suffixes indicate that TT/FIX falls within the past time domain. Present temporal suffixes indicate that TT/FIX falls within the present time domain.

Being established by the present and the past temporal suffixes of the verb, TT/FIX may be specified by temporal adverbs or by some other elements of the context. According to Christensen (1997), there are two types of context specification – TT/FIX can be either SP-specified or narration-specified. In the former case, TT/FIX is specified by the speech point (SP). Only single clauses in the present tense can have this type of TT/FIX specification. In the latter case, TT/FIX is specified by the time of situation in the preceding clause. TT/FIX can also be associated with the time of existence of the thematic actant (subject, object, adverbial) of a sentence. In (5), taken from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:207), the topic time is established by Darwin’s life-time:

(5) Darwin besökte Galapagosöarna flera gånger. ‘Darwin visited the Galapagos Islands several times.’

As far as the perfect is concerned, its status has been a controversial subject in Swedish discussions as well. Similarly to Klein
(1994), some Swedish scholars, e.g. Pipping (1964), Thorell (1973), claim that the perfect has a dual nature, temporal and aspectual. According to Thorell (1973:120,124), the temporal part of the meaning of the perfect involves locating situations at the time before-now and the aspectual part of the meaning of the perfect involves the notion of *completeness*. Focus in perfect clauses may be placed either on the event as being terminated before a certain point of time or on the situation as the result of the terminated event. In the former case, the temporal meaning of the perfect dominates. In the latter case, most often with resultative verbs, the aspectual meaning of the perfect dominates.

One of the opponents of the aspectual theory of the perfect, Schubert (1986:204), claims that the only meaning encoded by the perfect is that of indicating whether a situation has taken place or not. All the other interpretations of the meaning of the perfect depend on actional meaning of verbs. In combination with telic verbs, i.e. the verbs encoding situations which have natural final points, the perfect indicates that the event has been completed. In combination with atelic verbs, i.e. the verbs encoding situations which do not have natural final points, cessation, completion or continuation of the event at the point of reference or beyond the point of reference is unspecified.

Another opponent of the aspectual theory of the perfect is Andersson (1984). Andersson (1984:203) claims that there is no reason for regarding the perfect as a combined tense and aspect marker since both the perfect and the preterit clauses can exhibit aspectual vagueness in Swedish, aspectual meaning being dependent on the context.

A non-aspectual view is also taken in the recent theory of the perfect and the pluperfect (Christensen 1997 and Teleman et al. 1999). Like Morrisay (1973) and Maslov (1988), Teleman et al. (1999:IV:229–233) describe the perfect as involving two time points. The perfect is a compound construction consisting of the present form of the auxiliary verb *ha* ‘have’ and the supine. The auxiliary verb indicates that TT/FIX overlaps with the present moment or with a time later than the present moment (future perfect). Related to each other, the two verbs indicate that the time of action of the supine falls before the time of the auxiliary verb. The auxiliary verb denotes a state ensuing from the completion
of the action encoded by the subordinate verb. In other words, it indicates that the very fact that the action has taken place is, in one way or another, relevant at the time of the auxiliary verb, i.e. at the present moment or later than at the present moment.

According to Teleman et al. (1999:IV:232), actions denoted by the supine are usually completed by the time of speech. In the cases when the action overlaps with the topic time indicated by the auxiliary verb, it is more natural to use the present as in example (6) taken from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:232):

(6) Jag studerar (sedan länge) i Umeå. “I study in Umeå since a long time.” ‘I have studied in Umeå for a long time [and am still doing so], i.e. I have been studying in Umeå for a long time.’

The uses of the perfect to describe a situation that continues into the present are accounted for by Teleman et al. (1999:IV:232) in the following way:

Men ibland är det motiverat att omtala en aktion som förfluten, trots att den forfarande kan pågå. För att denna tolkning ska vara möjlig kräver de flesta språkbrukare att aktionen specificeras av ett varaktighetsadverbial som länge eller i tre år. But sometimes it is appropriate to present an action as past in spite of the fact that it may still be going on. To make this interpretation possible, most of the speakers will demand that the action is specified by adverbs of duration such as for a long time or for three years. (my translation)

Teleman et al. (1999 IV:232) illustrate this statement with the example presented as (7) below:

(7) Han har arbetat i Västerås i fjorton år. ‘He has worked in Västerås for fourteen years.’ (He is still working or has finished his work in Västerås).

One way of marking that an action specified by the above mentioned adverbs of duration is still going on at the topic time may be in, some cases, the use of the temporal adverbs nu ‘now’, alltid

---

8 In my opinion, this definition has very little explanatory power and thus cannot be used in the research on the acquisition of this tense. Whatever the motivation, if one presents an ongoing action as past (finished), one is simply distorting the truth.
'always', (allt)sedan 'since', specifying the topic time. This is the case, according to Teleman et al. (1999:IV:232), in the sentence given as (8) below:

(8) Han har arbetat i Västerås i fjorton år nu. 'He has worked in Västerås for fourteen years now.' (In all probability he is still working in Västerås).

As in English and unlike German, the Swedish perfect generally does not co-occur with adverbs of past definite time, i.e. adverbs referring to the time of action. Teleman et al. (1999:IV:238) say that adverbs of definite past time may co-occur with the perfect when TT/FIX is specified with an adverb of time (e.g. today) in which the adverb of definite time specifying the time of action is contained (e.g. six o’clock). This is the case in example (9), taken from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:238):

(9) Idag har jag stigit upp kl. 6. *'Today I have got up at six o’clock, i.e. Today I got up at six o’clock.'

Adverbs of definite time may also co-occur with the perfect when the adverb is rhematic, i.e. an element of minor importance organised around the most important element in the sentence, the theme, and the fact that the action took place at some definite time implies its current relevance. This is the case in (10) taken from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:239):

(10) Jag har tagit examen år 1977, så jag har fortfarande en examen av gammal typ. *'I have received my degree in 1977, so I still have the degree of the old type, i.e. I received my degree in 1977, so I still have the degree of the old type.'

With some types of temporal adverbs, namely those of recent past time, e.g. nyss ‘just’, nyligen 'lately', the perfect can be used interchangeably with the preterit.

Until recently, the pluperfect had been a kind of Cinderella in the Swedish linguistic literature – very little attention had been devoted to this tense. This has been remedied by the three-parameter morpho-lexical theory of tense presented by Christensen (1997) and Teleman et al. (1999). Like the perfect, the pluperfect is described as a construction involving two verbs – the auxiliary verb hava 'have' in the preterit and the supine. When the two
verbs are related to each other, the meaning of the pluperfect is that the action encoded by the supine took place before the time of the auxiliary verb, which is the same as TT/FIX. The past form of the auxiliary verb denotes that TT/FIX is placed in the past time domain. Adverbs of duration and temporal adverbs indicating topic time allow for the interpretation that the action encoded by the supine was still going on at topic time.

As in English, the Swedish pluperfect may take adverbs of definite time. Adverbs of definite time may refer to either of the two times involved in the meaning of the pluperfect, whether to the time of action denoted by the supine or to the time of the auxiliary verb. In a text, either of the two times may sometimes be highlighted by some elements of the context other than adverbs (see 7.3.4).

The function of the pluperfect in narrative texts is described by Teleman et al. (1999:225) in terms of the notion of topic time. In a sequence of two main clauses, TT/FIX for the following clause is most often established by the time of action of the preceding clause. In narration, the topic time of the preceding clause may either be moved forward or retained. The pluperfect often retains the topic time of the preceding clause. This is the case in (11), taken from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:225):

(11) Karl bodde i Kenya. Några år tidigare hade Anna arbetat i Tanzania. ‘Carl lived in Kenya. Some years before Anna had worked in Tanzania.’

The use of the preterit instead of the pluperfect indicates that the speaker has chosen a new topic time, established by the adverb of time, which is earlier than the topic time of the preceding clause. This is the case in (12), taken from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:225):

(12) Karl bodde i Kenya. Några år tidigare arbetade Anna i Tanzania. ‘Carl lived in Kenya. Some years before, Anna worked in Tanzania.’

Even the action in the following clause can be chosen as indicating the topic time. In such cases, an earlier action giving incidental information is expressed with the pluperfect. This is the case in (13), taken from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:243):

(13) Karl bodde i Kenya. Några år tidigare hade Anna arbetat i Tanzania. ‘Carl lived in Kenya. Some years before Anna had worked in Tanzania’.
År 1939 hade kriget brutit ut. Sex år senare var det åter fred. ‘In 1939 the war had broken out. Six years later there was peace again.’

Aspect is not an obligatory category in Swedish. According to Thorell (1973:120), only one of the two aspeccual meanings, namely, the imperfective aspect, has non-obligatory formal markers, e.g. hålla på (med), vara i färd med, the particle på added to the verb etc. As mentioned in the section on the Swedish tense systems, certain scholars, e.g. Thorell (1973:120), regard some uses of the perfect as an expression of perfective aspeccual meaning in Swedish. Aspect does not seem to be a grammatical category of importance in Swedish and it is sometimes discussed under the cover term aktionsarter, e.g. Lindberg (1976:49) and Teleman et al. (1999:IV:323–358). Thus, there is no section on aspect in the latest grammar of Swedish, Teleman et al. (1999). A few lines are devoted to the explanation of the term aspect in the register, Teleman et al. (1999:I:155), where this term is defined as just another cover term for aktionsart, especially bounded as against unbounded. More information about this issue may be found in 2.2.4.

2.1.4 Tense and aspect in Polish

Polish has only three tense forms, namely, the past, the present and the future (Fisiak 1978, Bałk 1979, Laskowski 1998). The past form is constructed on the past tense base, which is obtained when the ending -ć of the infinitive, e.g. dać ‘give’ or the past tense suffix of the third person singular -l, e.g. dat ‘gave’ is dropped, leaving the form da-. The present and the future forms are constructed on the present tense base which is obtained when the present participle ending -ący, is dropped, e.g. as in piszący ‘writing’, leaving the form pisz- when the ending is dropped. The future tense is a periphrastic construction, consisting of the auxiliary verb być ‘to be’ and either the past participle, ending in -l with the endings for person and gender (the same as in the past tense), or the infinitive form of the main verb, e.g. On będzie
pisal/On będzie pisać ‘He will be writing’. Apart from their primary (deictic) function of relating events to the time of speech, the temporal morphemes may, according to Laskowski (1998), have a secondary function, i.e. be indicators of relative tenses, i.e. indicate simultaneity, anteriority and sequence. In those cases, not the present moment (the time of speech) but the time of some other event which is related to the present moment is taken as the time of reference.

The meanings expressed in Swedish by the perfect and the pluperfect are not encoded by special temporal morphology in modern Polish. The compound perfect tense consisting of the verb być ‘to be’, preposed or postposed, and the past participle, e.g. jesteśmy poszli or poszli jesteśmy ‘we are gone’ existed in 14th century Polish. In the course of time, the forms of the auxiliary verb merged with the past participle, giving the past tense form, e.g. poszliśmy (Bąk 1979:303). Thus, as in other Slavic languages, e.g. Russian, described by Lubensky (1985:85), the Polish past tense form incorporates the meaning and the range of use of the perfect. The context resolves whether the past form has the past meaning or the meaning of the English and Swedish perfect if not identical to it than at least very similar (for details see 2.3.1).

Another form once in use, the pluperfect consisting of the past form of the verb to be and the past participle, e.g. Autobus był odjechał ‘The bus had gone’ is almost non-existent in modern Polish.\(^{10}\) It occurs only sporadically, mainly with an archaising function, or in some Easter dialects (Bąba 1991:312).

According to Fisiak et al. (1978:35) and Laskowski (1998:175), one of the means used to express anteriority of one past situation in relation to another is temporal conjunctions, e.g. zanim ‘before’ and modifying phrases, e.g. już ‘already’. Other means of marking anteriority of a past action in relation to another past action are two kinds of participles, e.g. Stał worek postawiony przez pasterzy ‘There stood a sack which some shepherds had put (there)’, Ujrzałmy Jana usiadł. ‘Having noticed John, he sat down’.

As mentioned earlier, in some cases the past tense form in its secondary function may be an indicator of anteriority. In (14), taken from Laskowski (1998:175), the time of the second event is established in relation to the first event:

\(^{10}\) This example comes from Prof. Kalisz, personal communication.
(14) Ala wiedziała, że Olek odbył studia. 'Ala knew that Olek had completed his studies.'

Using the system of notation: $M =$ Time of speech, $O_1 =$ point of reference of the first event, $O_2 =$ point of reference of the second event, $Z_1 =$ time of the first event, $Z_2 =$ time of the second event, Laskowski (1998:175) presents the use of the past form to convey anteriority of one past situation in relation to another in the following way:

$$M = O_1 ← Z_1 = O_2 → Z_2$$

Aspect, which, according to Laskowski (1998:157) is functionally related to tense, is an obligatory category in Polish. This means that with the exception of the verbs which have the same form in both aspects, imperfectiva tantum and perfectiva tantum, most Polish verbs must obligatorily take one of the aspectual forms. Only imperfective verbs occur in all the three tense distinctions: present, past and future. Perfective verbs are not used in the present tense form since the meaning of the perfective form, completion, final point reached, is in contradiction with the meaning of the present tense simultaneity of a situation with the moment of speech (Fisiak 1978:106). The perfective morphological counterparts of imperfective present forms have future meaning, e.g. On napisze 'He will write'. Laskowski (1998:177) calls this form the non-past tense. The distribution of the two aspectual forms imperfective and perfective across tenses is presented in Table 1.

Table 1. The system of Polish tenses and the distribution of aspectual forms across tenses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tense: past</th>
<th>Tense: present</th>
<th>Tense: future</th>
<th>Tense: non-past (future meaning)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IMPERFECTIVE</td>
<td>IMPERFECTIVE</td>
<td>IMPERFECTIVE</td>
<td>PERFECTIVE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>He was writing.</td>
<td>He writes/is writing.</td>
<td>He will be writing.</td>
<td>He will write.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PERFECTIVE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On napisał.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>He wrote/has written.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Aspectual distinctions (imperfective vs. perfective) are realised on the lexical level. The imperfective form in Polish is usually morphologically simpler, and the perfective form is often derived from it by means of different prefixes and/or suffixes, e.g. *pisać* ‘write’ (imperfective) *na-pisać* ‘write’ (perfective) *pchać* ‘push’ (imperfective) *pch-n-qć* ‘push’ (perfective). Some aspectual pairs do not differ in morphological complexity, with both forms taking a suffix, the aspectual opposition being indicated by a different kind of suffix, as in *uderz-a-ć* ‘hit’ (imperfective) *uderz-y-ć* ‘hit’ (perfective). Some verbs take both prefixation and suffixation, e.g. *stać-a-ć* ‘put’ (imperfective), *postać-a-ć* ‘put’ (perfective). In some cases, two different words can make an aspectual pair e.g. *brać* ‘take’ (imperfective) and *wziąć* ‘take’ (perfective).

Polish also has the iterative/habitual aspect, e.g. *pis-yw-ać* (derived from the imperfective form *pisać*), *ch-a-dzać* (derived from the imperfective form *chodzić*), conveying the meaning ‘write often’ and ‘go often’, respectively. Formal exponents of iterative meanings are not numerous and are by some scholars, e.g. Czochralski (1976:16), treated as cases of imperfective aspect. In cases where separate markers of iterative/habitual meanings are not available, the imperfective forms, often (but not always) accompanied by adverbs of frequency, are used. Being beyond the scope of this work, the above description of the morphology of aspect given above is greatly simplified.

Many prefixes convey a double meaning. Apart from changing the aspectual meaning, they also convey some additional meanings, often corresponding to the meanings carried by verbal particles in Swedish e.g. *pisać* ‘write’ (imperfective) *prze-pisać* (Sw. *skriva om*) ‘copy’ (perfective), *pod-pisać* (Sw. *skriva under*) ‘sign’ (perfective). There is no unanimity among Slavic scholars as to whether aspect is a grammatical or lexical category. Majewicz (1981:36) does not regard prefixes conveying additional meanings as aspectual markers but as elements pertaining to word formation. A useful criterion to distinguish purely grammatical elements of aspect from elements referring to word formation is, according to Majewicz (1981:36), the criterion of homolexemity. This criterion says that only those forms of the same lexeme which in combination with different perfectivizing prefixes retain exactly the same lexical meaning may be considered as members
of an aspectual pair. When the criterion of homolexemity is applied, only one of the perfective forms of the imperfective word *pisać* ‘write’, presented above, namely, *napisać* (skriva färdigt) ‘finish writing’ can be regarded as its aspectual counterpart, the only difference in meaning being the change of aspectual value. Some other prefixes which in some cases may have purely aspectual function are according to Laskowski (1998): *za-, s-, po-* etc.

Another argument for this view of aspectual function of prefixes as offered by Majewicz (1981) is the fact that the so-called secondary imperfectives can be derived from the forms with the prefixes changing the meaning of the lexeme, e.g. *przepisać* ‘copy’ (perfective) *przepisywać* ‘copy’ (imperfective) but not from the forms derived from one of the purely aspectual markers, e.g. *napisywać*.

Certain other scholars, e.g. Czochralski (1975:15), claim that only suffixes are markers of aspect, prefixes being markers of aktionsart. According to Laskowski (1998:161) only telic verbs build purely aspectual pairs (see 2.2.3).

Not only the formal markers of aspect, but also the meaning conveyed by aspectual forms has been a controversial subject among Slavic aspectologists. A whole range of semantic definitions of aspect have been suggested. One group of definitions has the notion *totality* as the defining feature of the perfective. Maslov (1959) claims that the perfective presents a situation as a “single indivisible whole”. Similarly, Forsyth (1970:8) defines the perfective as “total event summed up with reference to a single specific juncture”. Another group of definitions has the notion *resultativeness* as the essential meaning of the perfective. Forsyth (1970:74) claims that perfective past forms often denote a state which has resulted from the action proper. Majewicz (1985:219) says that the perfective aspect is “the basic device for conveying the resultative meaning in Polish”.

Somewhat related notions offered as defining features of the perfective aspect are: reaching some inner limit or goal in the situation (Kolodovich, unavailable publication, quoted after

---

11 Traditional descriptions of different types of aktionsart in Slavic languages are not identical with those based on Vendler’s time schemata. See Forsyth (1970).
Majewicz (1985:195)), an evaluation of changes observed on something or in relation to something (Piernikarski 1969) or change of state resulting in a new situation (Laskowski 1998:162–163). Laskowski explains the notion of change in terms of a transition between two phases: the presupposed state of affairs obtaining before the action denoted by the verb took place and the state resulting from the action denoted by the verb. The perfective aspect asserts the semantic component CHANGE. The middle phase, i.e. the process leading to change, is a necessary condition without which establishment of END STATE would not be possible, but it is not asserted. This view of aspect allowed Laskowski (1998:160) to make the claim that perfective aspect is “inherently retrospective”. This means that the situation denoted by the perfective form is observed from the point of view which is situated on the time axis later than the situation denoted by the verb. Thus, past perfective forms, if the context does not bar this interpretation, e.g. with temporal specifications of the situation with adverbs of definite time, may convey the meaning that a past action is connected with the present moment through the ensuing results. This meaning of past perfective forms is reflected in compatibility of the past forms of many verbs with the temporal adverb teraz ‘now’ as in Laskowski’s (personal e-mail communication) example Był chory, ale teraz wyzdrowiał. (past tense form, perfective aspect) ‘He was ill, but now he has recovered.’

The meaning frequently associated with the imperfective aspect is opposite to that of the perfective meaning. Thus, the imperfective aspect is claimed to carry the meaning of incompleteness, continuation, duration, non-resultativeness or gradual development of the process towards the achievement of the result (Majewicz 1985). According to Laskowski (1998), the imperfective asserts the semantic component PROCESS leading CHANGE, implying that END STATE will be achieved unless the process is stopped by unforeseeable circumstances.

Gebert (1993:100) claims that the definition of aspect involving the semantic component CHANGE may account for some idiosyncratic uses of the imperfective aspect which have always puzzled Slavic scholars. Those are the cases in which the imperfective does not denote an on-going but a completed action and may be substituted by the perfective “without an appreciable consequence on meaning.” Such use of the imperfective, presented as (15) below,
a frequently quoted example, is called \textit{general factive} or \textit{simple denotation}.

(15) Czy pan już zamawiał (imp)/zamówił (perf)? ‘Have you already ordered?’

Gebert (1993:102) explains the fact that both the perfective form \textit{zamawiać} and the imperfective form \textit{zamówić} can express accomplished facts, the difference being in the placement of focus. The imperfective form is used when the activity that produces change is being asserted. The perfective form is used when the end state caused by a change is being asserted. Although the use of the imperfective aspect to express accomplished events is less common than the use implying a continuous action, it is far from being exceptional and must be taken into consideration in the description of the meaning of Polish aspect (Forsyth 1970:15).

2.2 \textbf{Aktionsart}

This section consists of four subsections. In the first subsection some general theories of aktionsart are reviewed. The second subsection contains a review of the description of aktionsart in Swedish. The third subsection contains a review of the description of aktionsart in Polish. Aktionsart seems to be of much more importance in the description of the temporal system of Swedish than in Polish, which has a strong tradition of work on aspect. Consequently, the section on aktionsart in Swedish contains more details than the section on aktionsart in Polish.

Since aktionsart is one of the most widely disputed categories in linguistics, the notions \textit{aktionsart} and \textit{aspect} being frequently confused, in the final subsection of this chapter some elements of the theories of aktionsart and aspect are compared and some weaknesses and contradictions in three descriptions of aktionsart, Smith (1991) and (1977) and Teleman (1999) are pointed out.

2.2.1 General theories of aktionsart

In the 1960’s a shift of focus in linguistic research from syntax to semantics and pragmatics brought about a new approach to the
study of verbs. Among others, the new approach has its origin in the classification of English verbs as made by Vendler (1957).¹²

Vendler’s classification is based on referential properties of verbs, i.e. internal time structures of situations in reality and time schemata of English verbs referring to those situations. Vendler (1967:99–103) distinguishes four semantic classes of English verbs: states, which can go on in time but do not indicate processes, activities, i.e. processes going on in time, consisting of successive phases following one another in time, but not having any terminal point, accomplishments, i.e. processes going on in time but, unlike activities, having a terminus which is logically necessary for their being what they are, and achievements, i.e. events occurring at a single moment. The criterion for the distinction of the four types of English verbs is the (in)correctness of their occurrences in the present continuous tense and their compatibility with temporal adverbs of duration or completion, such as for half an hour (states and activities) and in half an hour (accomplishments and achievements). Vendler (1967:107) notices also that many activities and some accomplishments and achievements have a derived meaning and that there is a group of verbs “with conceptual divergences of their own” about which it is difficult to say to which category they “originally belong”. Vendler (1967:107) does not claim completeness of his theory and makes a reservation that he is only making some remarks on a few verbs or groups of verbs.

This theory has been taken as a basis for further studies of verbal semantics and has been completed and adjusted to describe individual languages. It is known in slightly different versions and under many labels, e.g. lexical (inherent) aspect (as opposed to grammatical aspect), semantic aspect, aktionsart, situation aspect, situation types etc. Some of the terms mentioned above are not fully equivalent. This shows that there is no unanimity among scholars, either as to the terminology, or as to the defining features of this category.

¹² My summary is based on the 1967 version, which is said to include only minor changes. The first article appeared in The Philosophical Review LXVI 1957.
One group of definitions of aktionsart, summarised by Brinton (1988:3), has as its defining feature the inherent nature of situations, or indication of intrinsic temporal qualities of situations. This information is indicated by the lexical meaning of verbs and verbal derivational morphology. In terms of this definition, aktionsart is objective. In other definitions, Smith (1991:73–74), the information about situation aspect is indicated by the verb and its arguments, the overall information conveyed by the sentence being a composite of situation aspect (aktionsart) and viewpoint aspect (grammatical aspect). Aktionsart in this interpretation is to some degree subjective. The speaker may choose a particular perspective, some aspects of the situation being emphasised and others diminished in the process of associating an actual situation with its idealization, i.e. its description in terms of the defining properties.

Smith (1991:30) makes an attempt at presenting a universal theory of situation types, i.e. a theory that will hold across languages. She distinguishes five types of situations. Apart from the four defined by Vendler (1967), i.e. states, activities, accomplishments and achievements, she introduces a class called semelfactives. Since the latter group is not involved in the linguistic material of this study, it will not be discussed in this work. Each of the situation types is defined in terms of clusters of semantic features: dynamism, durativity and telicity. Telic events proceed towards an intrinsic goal, constituting the natural final point of the event. Atelic events have no set terminal points, the termination of atelic events being arbitrary. The distinction between telic and atelic sentences is made by means of the compatibility of sentences encoding respective situations with adverbs which have properties associated with their temporal schemata. Thus, telic sentences are compatible with adverbs of completion, e.g. in two hours and atelic sentences are compatible with adverbs of duration, e.g. for two hours.

Since most of the defining features of each of the situation types presented by Smith (1991) are almost identical with the defining features of aktionsarter presented for Swedish, they will not be discussed any further in this section. The distribution of the defining features across different types of aktionsart is described in detail and illustrated with examples in the section on aktionsarter in Swedish.
2.2.2 Aktionsart in Swedish

The issue of aktionsart has received much attention among Swedish scholars, e.g. Andersson (1977), Christensen (1995 and 1997), and it is also of importance in the latest and most comprehensive grammar, Teleman et al. (1999). Since there are many similarities in the descriptions of aktionsarter by Christensen (1995 and 1997) and Teleman et al. (1999:IV:323–358), only Teleman’s description of aktionsarter will be referred to in this section. Telman (1999 IV:323) defines aktionsarter in the following way:


Like in Smith (1991), aktionsart in Teleman et al. (1999:IV:324) is defined in terms of clusters of semantic features. The semantic features are: boundedness, processuality, durativity, dynamism and resultativity.13 The presence or absence of some of the temporal properties, i.e. various groupings of those properties, constitute criteria for distinguishing four main types of actions. They

---

13 Boundedness is defined by Teleman et al. (1999) in terms of having or not having a natural final point. Thus, the same, or very similar, meaning as that involved in the term telicity, used by many other aspectologists, e.g. Smith (1994:10) seems to be involved. The use of the term bounded is somewhat confusing. In schema I (Telman et al. 1999:IV:324) there seems to be a group of bounded processes which are unbounded.
are called *tillstånd* (states), *öavgränsade processer* (unbounded processes), *avgränsade processer* (bounded processes) and *punktuella händelser* (punctual events).

States are unbounded (do not have a natural terminal point), non-processual (do not consist of successive phases), durative (have extension in time), static (they do not denote that something “happens”) and non-resultative (do not involve change of state). The stative type of aktionsart is illustrated with an example taken from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:324) presented as (16) below:

(16) Lotta bodde hemma. ‘Lotta lived at home.’

Unbounded processes do not have natural terminal points and thus can be stopped at any arbitrary moment of time. They are dividable, which means that the term *unbounded process* can also be used about a fragment of the whole action. They are processual (consist of successive phases, thus are not homogeneous), durative (have extension in time), dynamic (denote that something “happens”) and most often non-resultative (do not involve a change of state). Only one sub-group of unbounded processes, namely those which involve a gradual change of some sort, without a clear final state, has resultative meaning.

Non-resultative and resultative unbounded processes are exemplified with respective clauses taken from Teleman et al. (1999: IV:324):

(17) Oscar ritade. ‘Oscar drew.’
(18) Temperaturen steg. ‘The temperature rose.’

Bounded processes have natural terminal points beyond which the process cannot continue. They are processual (consist of successive stages), durative (have extension in time) and dynamic (denote that something “happens”). Bounded processes are indivisible, i.e. the term *bounded process* may refer only to the action in its totality and not to any arbitrary part of the action.

---

14 The definition is: “En aktion som inte har en naturlig slutpunkt utan antingen är tidsligen oavgränsad eller också kan upphöra när som helst eller fortsätta ännu längre kallas oavgränsad. ‘An action which does not have a natural final point and is either temporally unlimited or can stop at any point or continue still longer is called unbounded.’ (Teleman et al. 1999:IV:327).
All bounded processes are resultative, which means that they involve a final result, i.e. a change which consists in a new state, different from the initial one (Teleman et al. 1999:IV:350). A bounded process is illustrated with an example taken from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:324) and presented as (19) below:

(19) Lotta skrev ett brev. ‘Lotta wrote a letter.’

Punctual actions are instantaneous. Being instantaneous, they are non-durative, but when the speaker wishes to emphasise that they are performed in a much slower way than usual, they can be perceived as durative.15 Punctual events are non-processual (do not consist of successive stages and dynamic (denote that something “happens”). There are two groups of punctual events: resultative (involving a change of state) and non-resultative (not involving a change of state). Punctual events (instantaneous resultative, and instantaneous non-resultative) are illustrated with sentences taken from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:324, 352) and presented respectively as (20) and (21) below:

(20) Lampan slocknade. ‘The lamp went off.’
(21) Gubben hostade. The old man coughed.

Aktionsart does not have any systematic formal markers in Swedish. Actional meanings may be marked or reflected at different linguistic levels. They may be gathered from the inherent meaning of single verbs, e.g. bo ‘live’ and slockna ‘go off’. They may manifest themselves at the level of a verb phrase or at the level of a sentence, i.e. in the meanings that verbs receive when combined with some obligatory and non-obligatory complements: the subject, the direct object and temporal or directional adverbial phrases. Many Swedish verbs, not only verbs without but also verbs with complements, e.g. the subject or the object, are, according to Teleman et al. (1999:IV:327), neutral with respect to

15 Teleman et al. (1999:IV:352) seem to oscillate between different modalities: situations in real life, the linguistic expressions of those situations and the speaker’s perception of those situations. Thus, it is not clear what aktionsart can be ascribed to punctual situations, when they are perceived as durative.
actional meaning. This means that one and the same verb may have different actional values in different linguistic contexts. For example, the presence or absence of an object, different types of objects, e.g. objects indefinite or definite in number, can transpose unbounded situations into bounded and bounded into unbounded as in (22) and (23) taken from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:328):

(22) Sedan sjöng man sorgsna visor. (unbounded) ‘Then they sang sad songs.’
(23) Sedan sjöng man nationalsången. (bounded) ‘Then they sang the national anthem.’

The group of verbs which have boundedness as their inherent feature of meaning is not particularly numerous in Swedish. Some of the examples of this class are tömma ‘empty’, förstöra ‘ruin’, växa upp ‘grow up’.

Adverbial expressions of duration such as i två timmar ‘for two hours’ and adverbial expressions of completion such as på två timmar ‘in two hours’, which reflect and at the same time also indicate different types of aktionsart, are used as a compatibility test in distinguishing different types of aktionsart. An indication of actional meaning by both of the two types of adverbial expressions is illustrated with examples (24) and (25), taken from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:329):

(24) Han läste tidningen i tre timmar. (unbounded) ‘He read the newspaper for three hours.’
(25) Han läste tidningen på tre timmar. (bounded) ‘He read the newspaper in three hours.’

2.2.3 Aktionsart in Polish

Polish scholars, with their strong tradition of the work on grammatical aspect, seem to have devoted considerably less attention to the issue of aktionsart in terms of Vendler’s (1967) system. Since the morphology of Polish verbs is very rich, the analysis of the meanings of Polish verbs typically involves many more classes than the four established by Vendler.

An attempt at classification of Polish verbs in terms of Vendlerian types of aktionsarter was made by Gebert (1993). A more systematic description of Polish verbs in in terms of Vendler’s classes was
given by Laskowski (1998:153–154). The categorization of the semantics of Polish verbs made with the point of departure in Vendler’s distinctions (1967) is similar to the categorization made by Smith (1991) and, for Swedish, by Teleman et al. (1999). The major difference is a further division of some of the Vendrian classes of verbs into two or more subgroups. Since this more refined classification of Polish verbs is beyond the scope of the present work, these subdivisions will not be discussed any further here.

Laskowski’s (1998) most important contribution to the issue of aktionsart is an attempt at the elucidation of the relationship between actional and aspectual meanings of Polish verbs. States and actions are imperfectiva tantum, i.e. they have only the imperfective meaning. Instantaneous events are perfectiva tantum, i.e. they have mainly the perfective meaning. Only telic verbs may appear in both aspectual forms: the perfective and the imperfective. And what is more, only different aspectual forms of telic verbs may be considered as members of purely aspectual pairs – each of the aspectual forms has the same lexical meaning, the only difference in the meaning being its aspectual value. Thus, only aspectual forms of telic verbs meet the criterion of homolexemity (see 2.1.4). Perfective and imperfective forms can be derived from imperfective tantum and perfective tantum respectively, but in those cases the change of the aspectual form involves a change of the lexical meaning. In those cases derived verbs do not belong to the same semantic class as the verbs from which they originate, i.e. chorować ‘be ill’, zachorować ‘fall ill’, spotykać ‘meet’, spotykać ‘meet often’. As can be seen from the above, Laskowski’s (1998) allegiance is to the group of scholars who, following Comrie (1976), maintain the difference between actional and aspectual meanings of verbs.

2.2.4 Aktionsart or aspect?

The problem of what is meant by the terms aktionsart and aspect is probably one of the most widely disputed issues in linguistics. As mentioned in 2.2.1., the dispute concerning the meaning of these two terms has its origin in nineteenth century research. One of the controversial and intensively debated research questions
was whether some counterparts of the forms and meanings referred to as aspect in the Slavic systems could be found in Germanic languages. Jespersen (1924:286) points out that the term aspect was taken from Slavic verbs, where it is “fundamental, comparatively clear and clean-cut”, since it has formal exponents. The origin of the controversies among different scholars as to the nature of aspect and the terminology are described by Jespersen (1924:286–9) in the following way:

When scholars began to look for something similar to the Slavic aspect in non-Slavic languages, each of them as a rule partially or wholly rejected the systems of his predecessors and set up a terminology of his own, so that nowadays it would be possible, had one the time and inclination, to give a very long list of terms, many of them with two or three or even more definitions, some of each are not easy to understand. Nor did these scholars always distinguish the four possible expressions for “aspect”: the ordinary meaning of the verb itself, the occasional meaning of the verb as occasioned by context or situation, the derivative suffix and a tense form. In consequence, different phenomena which from purely notional point of view could be kept apart were brought together under one class, or strictly speaking two classes: aspect and aktionsart.

Like Jespersen (1924), Mourelatos (1981:194) also pointed out that quite different factors are conflated in specifying the categories of aktionsart, e.g. the inherent meaning of the verb itself, the nature of the verb's arguments, adverbials and aspect. One of the most important objections raised by Mourelatos was that the role of aspect was greatly neglected in Vendler's categorizations of the meaning of the English verbs.

As mentioned in 2.2.1, an attempt at integrating aspect into situation types was made by Smith (1991). The overall aspectual meaning conveyed by a sentence is defined by her as “a composite of the information from two components”, the situation type (aktionsart) and the viewpoint aspect (grammatical aspect) (see 2.1.2). Smith (1991:5) claims that “the two types of information are independent, but they co-occur in sentences”. The patterns of co-occurrence of the two components, situation type and viewpoint aspect, are different in different languages. In French, all viewpoints may be used with all situation types. In Russian, one viewpoint (perfective) has limited distribution, while the
other (imperfective) may appear in every situation type (Smith 1991:10).

Smith’s (1991) attempt at integrating viewpoint aspect with situation types does not seem fully successful. There seems to be some contradiction in her discussion of the distribution of aspect across situation types in Russian.\textsuperscript{16} Smith’s claim (1991:302) that in Russian “the imperfective is formally available for all situation types”, thus also for accomplishments, e.g. My pisali (imperfective) pismo. ‘We were writing a letter’, and her claim that “accomplishments and achievements are incompatible with adverbials of simple duration” (Smith 1991:54) seem to be in contradiction.\textsuperscript{17} As pointed out by Grzegorczykowa (1997:36), imperfective forms of Polish (thus also Russian) verbs are generally compatible with adverbs of duration. And as pointed out by Laskowski (1998:167), only telic verbs may take the perfective and the imperfective form and only those verbs meet the criterium of homolexemity, i.e. retain the lexical meaning when the aspectual form is changed (see also 2.2.2).

A helpful contribution to the elucidation of the relationship between aktionsart and aspect was made by Comrie (1976). Although, in this now classical work he does not use the term aktionsart, he clearly maintains the difference between aspectual and actional meanings of verbs. According to him, the perfective form referring to a telic situation (defined as having a terminal point built into it) implies attainment of the terminal point of that situation. The imperfective form implies that the final point has not been reached at the time referred to.\textsuperscript{18}

Some helpful observations were also made by Declerck (1991). Declerck (1991:262–263) presents two positions taken by scholars

\textsuperscript{16}This remark applies also to Polish.
\textsuperscript{17}My observation concerning the two contradictory statements has been confirmed by C. Smith in e-mail communication and the erroneous statement was to be corrected in a new edition of her book.
\textsuperscript{18}In the publication \textit{Att använda SAG}, ‘Using SAG’, K. Aimer makes an erroneous statement, p.19, that Comrie (1976) is one of the scholars who do not make a distinction between aspect and aktionsart. Additionally Aimer claims that the well known Swedish grammarian, Thorell, also does not differentiate between aktionsart and aspect. Thorell (1973:117–120) uses the term aktionsätt for durative and terminative meanings of verbs and devotes a separate section to the imperfective and perfective aspect.
with respect to this issue. In terms of Vendler’s (1967) terminology, the use of the progressive turns accomplishments and achievements into activities, as in *John was drawing a circle*. Some scholars, e.g. Bennet (1981), accept this semantic transposition provided by the progressive. Other scholars, e.g. Dowty (1972), maintain that although the progressive indicates that a natural terminal point has not been reached, the most important feature of accomplishments – having the terminal point – is still present. This view is also adopted by Laskowski’s (1999).

A somewhat similar kind of distinction is also made by Depraetere (1994:706), even if her definition of boundedness is different from Teleman et al.’s (1999). In her study of the factors determining whether the situation belongs to the foreground or the background, she makes reference to two concepts: (un)boundedness and (a)telicity. The sentence is bounded if it describes a situation which has reached the temporal boundary. The sentence is telic if it describes a situation having an inherent endpoint. This view admits cases of bounded atelic situations and unbounded telic situations as in the examples below, taken from Depraetere (1994:706):

(26) She has lived in London before. *(bounded atelic)*
(27) She is knitting a sweater. *(unbounded telic)*

Teleman et al. (1999:IV:326–327) describe bounded aktionsart in the following way:

An action which has a natural final point is called bounded. When this point is reached, the event cannot any longer be taking place. The final point defines the action because the action cannot be said to have taken place as a whole or at all if the final point is not reached. Neither can the action go on after its final point has been reached. A bounded action is as a matter of principle
undividable, i.e. the name of the action as a whole cannot be used about an arbitrary section of the action; the phrase *to eat up the carrots* can only be used of the whole of the bounded process.

(translation mine)

When analysed in terms of the above discussion, Teleman et al.’s (1999:IV:326–327) definition of bounded aktionsart seems to be rather vague and strikingly inconsistent. Teleman et al. do not unambiguously state whether having a natural final point or reaching it is the defining feature of bounded aktionsart. The natural final point is mentioned as if in passing, but it seems to be an echo of Vendler’s (1957:101) way of accounting for the difference between the nature of activities and accomplishments, rather than the fundamental distinctive definitional feature of bounded aktionsart.¹⁹ In several other places, e.g. Teleman et al. (1999:IV:324), Teleman et al. (1999:IV:350), Teleman et al. (1999:II:504) and Teleman et al. (1999:I:152), the latter being the register of the grammatical terms used in their work, having a natural final point is given as the fundamental distinctive feature of bounded aktionsart and reaching this point is not given as a necessary condition for an action to be bounded. The distinction between having and reaching the natural final point is of great importance, since, as Dahl (1981:81) pointed out, having a natural final point does not entail reaching it, while reaching a natural final point entails having one.

Although Teleman et al. repeatedly give having a natural final point as the distinctive defining feature of bounded aktionsart, reaching rather than having a natural final point does seem to be involved. According to Teleman et al. (1999:IV:326–327), the term *bounded process* cannot refer to an arbitrary part of an action, but to the action as a whole. If the whole action having a natural final point is referred to, the natural final point must of necessity be

¹⁹ Vendler (1957:101) observes that unlike states and unbounded processes (where a part is of the same nature as the whole) a part of a bounded process is not of the same nature as the whole process. For example, *running for half an hour* (unbounded, not having a natural final point) means that the runner has been running for every period within that half hour, while *running a mile* (bounded, having a natural final point) does not mean that the runner has been running a mile for every period of time during which the action has been taking place.
reached. Similarly, the statement that adverbs of completion not only reflect but also assign a bounded situation type seems to imply \textbf{reaching} rather than \textbf{having} the natural final point.

If it is assumed that Teleman et al. (1999:IV) intend reaching the natural final point to be the fundamental defining feature of bounded aktionart, aspect rather than aktionsart is being discussed.\footnote{My assumption seems to be supported by Noreén’s (2000) statement that the defining feature of bounded aktionsart as presented in Teleman et al. (1999) is reaching the natural final point (see \textit{Att använda SAG}, p. 390).} According to some Slavic scholars, e.g. Laskowski (1998), reaching the final point is the fundamental defining feature of the perfective aspect. Furthermore, all the other commonly known definitions of the perfective aspect (\textit{completion} or \textit{making reference to the totality of the situation}) must, of necessity, be interpreted as \textbf{reaching} the natural final point if this point is present.

However, if it is assumed that Teleman et al (1999:IV) intend \textbf{reaching} the natural final point rather than \textbf{having} one to be the distinctive feature of bounded aktionsart, problems arise with the classification of a numerous group of sentences having a natural final point which is not reached. According to Teleman et al. (1999:IV:334), the verb with the progressive meaning \textit{hålla på} may sometimes govern even an inherently bounded verb.\footnote{Teleman et al. (1999:IV:335) give no further information about under what conditions and how often this may be the case. \textit{Hålla på} is generally regarded as one of the syntactic means to explicitly mark the imperfective meaning in Swedish.} Teleman et al. (1999:IV:335) explain that in this case, the part of the action preceding the result is placed in focus. This is the case in example (28), taken from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:335):

\begin{quote}
(28) Pella höll på (med) att tömma brunnen när vi kom. ‘Pella was emptying the well when we came.’
\end{quote}

Since, as stated by Teleman et al. (1999:IV:334), the above sentence highlights the part of the action preceding the result (the well being empty) the natural final point must, of necessity, be present in this action, even if this point has not been reached.

The part of the action preceding the result may also be highlighted in the numerous group of clauses in which the imperfective
aspectual meaning is not explicitly marked but is derived from context. This is the case in a clause taken from the linguistic material used in the present study (see 7.1.2), given here as (29):

(29) Han gick längs en stor väg. Han bar hem ett stort vedfång. ‘He was walking along a big road. He was carrying home a large armful of wood.’

Each of the clauses, (28) and (29), describes a situation having a clear, natural final point, one which has not been reached. If Teleman et al.’s (1999) definition of bounded aktionsart is meant to be understood as reaching the natural final point, those clauses cannot be classified as bounded. And in agreement with Teleman et al.’s repeatedly given definition of unbounded aktionsart as not having a natural terminal point, Teleman et al. (1999:IV:324), Teleman et al. (1999:IV 327), Teleman et al. (1999:I:202) – the latter being the register of the grammatical terms used in their work – these clauses cannot be classified as unbounded either. The difficulties in the classification of this type of clauses seem to be insurmountable. The above clauses could, perhaps, be seen as cases of semantic transposition, a bounded aktionsart turned into an unbounded one, similar to the cases discussed above. But if this shift of actional meaning is accepted, the definition of unbounded aktionsart as not having a natural final point, no acceptions admitted, is greatly misleading.22

If the transpositions of bounded actional meanings into unbounded are accepted, there seems to be a strong affinity between actional meanings as described by Teleman et al. (1999:IV:323 ff.) and aspectual meanings as described by Laskowski (1998) and other Slavic scholars. Many cases of overlap of Swedish sentences analysed in terms of actional meanings and the Polish counterparts of those sentences analysed in terms of aspectual meanings may be observed. Besides the cases of transposed meaning, involving bounded processes (perfective aspect) being transposed into unbounded processes (the imperfective aspect), states most often overlap with Polish imperfectiva tantum and punctual verbs with Polish perfectiva tantum. The counterparts of the punctual clauses

22 My observations concerning those striking inconsistencies in the presentation of aktionsart in Teleman et al. (1999) were conformed by Lisa Christensen during the symposium “Grammar in Focus”, Lund, 2005.
described by Teleman et al. (1999:IV:352) as being perceived as durative because the action is performed in a much slower way than usual have the imperfective aspect.

These overlaps of meanings also occur with the class of verbs and verb phrases which, according to Teleman et al. (1999:IV:332), are neutral with respect to actional meaning. These verbs may be combined with either type of adverbs, adverbs of duration and adverbs of completion, and consequently have either bounded or unbounded meaning, e.g. *horsta tänderna i två minuter/på två minuter* ‘to brush one's teeth for two minutes/in two minutes.’

The Polish counterparts of the bounded meanings of those verbs have the perfective aspect and are compatible with adverbs of completion, while the Polish counterparts of the unbounded meanings of those verbs have the imperfective aspect and are compatible with adverbs of duration.

The frequent overlaps of actional and aspectual meanings, where bounded = perfective, unbounded = imperfective, seem to justify Teleman et al.’s (1999:1:155) statement that the term aspect is just another cover term for aktionsart, especially the distinction bounded vs. unbounded. But if this statement were true, the definition of unbounded processes as not having a natural final point would have to be verified.

What is more, the overlaps of actional meanings of Swedish clauses as described by Teleman et al. (1999) and the aspectual meanings of the Polish counterparts of these clauses are not quite systematic, i.e. it is not always the case that unbounded aktionsart = imperfective and bounded aktionsart = perfective.

As mentioned in 2.1.3, the imperfective meaning does not have to be overtly marked in Swedish, but it may be derived from the context, e.g. when one narrated event is interpreted in relation to another narrated event. If the role of context is taken into consideration, the actional distinction between many verb phrases with definite, singular objects vs. indefinite, plural objects, as in *sjunga nationalsången* ‘sing the national anthem’ vs. *sjunga sorgsna visor* ‘sing sad songs’ (see 2.2.2) is not directly aspectual. Presented in this way, i.e. without any additional explanations, this distinction may be somewhat confusing since the former phrase may also have the imperfective meaning, i.e. the natural final point which is not reached. This is the case in (30), below.
Similarly, the phrase *ädta upp morötterna* does not seem to necessarily have to refer to the whole process, as claimed in Teleman et al. (1999:IV:327), but it may also be used about some part of the action preceding the result (the final point not being reached, i.e. the imperfective meaning), as in (31):

(31) Jag såg på när Kalle åt upp morötterna. ‘I watched Kalle eating up the carrots.’

Thus, Teleman et al.’s (1999:1:155) claim that the term *aspect* is just another cover term for aktionsart, which can be understood as meaning that the same semantic features are involved, does not seem to be fully correct. Aktionsart as presented by Teleman et al. (1999:IV:326 ff) involves some phenomena belonging to “different pigeon holes”. Apart from aspectual meanings, e.g. transpositions of bounded aktionsart (the perfective aspect) into unbounded (the imperfective aspect), it also involves the intrinsic (lexical) meanings of some verbs, boundedness obtained through certain verbal complements, e.g. definite or quantised objects and directional adverbs, as well as the meanings obtained through verbal particles, aspectual distinctions of many of those clauses being greatly neglected. According to Jespersen (1924:286–9), most of those meanings were unnecessarily brought together under two classes: aspect and aktionsart. Teleman et al (1999:IV:326 ff) put those meanings into a single class, aktionsart, the definitions of the most important classes of this category not being quite clear.

Some serious weaknesses in the classification of imperfective sentences in terms of aktionsart may also be noticed in the revised edition of Smith (1991), i.e. in Smith (1997). In her monumental monograph, Smith (1997:48) claims that the possible span of the viewpoint aspect may differ from that of the situation type, i.e. the imperfective of a telic situation remains telic (thus the semantic transpositions discussed above are not accepted) and that viewpoints, like adverbials, may trigger situation type shift (thus the semantic transpositions discussed above are accepted). The two claims are in sharp contradiction. This means that the erroneous contradictory claim in Smith (1991:54) that in Russian the imperfective may appear in every
situation type, thus including bounded processes, and that bounded processes are incompatible with adverbs of duration, a contradiction to which I previously drew her attention, has not been successfully amended.

Some of Smith’s (1991) and (1997) and Teleman et al.’s (1999:IV:326 ff) contradictory statements could have been avoided if the distinction between having (aktionsart) and reaching (aspect) a natural final point had been maintained. If the distinction between having and reaching the natural final point is maintained, the two categories aktionsart and aspect may, in many cases, be kept apart. Thus, (29), repeated here as (32), can be classified as bounded (having a natural final point) and imperfective (the final point not being reached).

(32) Han gick längs en stor väg. Han bar hem ett stort vedfång. ‘He was walking along a big road. He was carrying home a large armful of wood.’

In this way, the definitional paradox may be avoided and the long-lasting controversy surrounding the nature of the two categories may be at least partially solved (Zielonka 2004).

The above, quite superficial, analysis of the nature of aktionsart shows that the issue is far from being satisfactorily explained, not only as regards Swedish. From this it follows that this category should rather not be referred to in empirical studies. Classification of aktionsart based on different types of complements as proposed by Teleman et al. (1999:IV:328) may lead to the almost absurd assumption that the phrases sjunga nationalsången (bounded) ‘sing the national hymn’ and bära hem ‘carry home’ may enhance the correct use of the pluperfect and the phrases sjunga sorgsna visor (unbounded) ‘sing sad songs’ and bära på ryggen ‘carry on one’s back’ may inhibit the correct use of this tense by learners of native or second/foreign language. Thus, most of the results of earlier research on the influence of actional meanings of verbs upon the correct use of tenses should be considered with great caution.

Since the empirical part of this work involves Swedish verbs, the term aktionsart is used in agreement with language specific definitions, given in the recent most comprehensive grammar of Swedish, Teleman et al. (1999:IV:326 ff.). In my linguistic material there is a major overlap between the aspectual and the actional
meanings of the verbs. A remedy for the definitional vagueness of the category of aktionsart and the unclear relationship of this category to the category aspect is an analysis of the verbs in terms of resultative meaning (7.2.1). Some controversial cases, the cases difficult to classify on the basis of Teleman et al.’s (1999) work, do not seem to have fatally affected the results of this study, (see 7.1.2)

2.3 The source of difficulty

Erroneous uses of grammatical structures in the target language are traceable to many different sources. One source of errors may be negative transfer of mother tongue structures into the target language, i.e. interlingual errors. Another source of errors may be semantic or syntactic complexity of the target language structures, i.e. intralingual errors (Ellis 1994:301).

In this section the temporal systems of Swedish and Polish are compared with a view to establishing which seeming similarities and which differences between the temporal systems of the two languages, as well as the complexity of which target language structures, may account for many of the difficulties in the acquisition of the Swedish tense system by Polish learners of Swedish. The difficulties in the acquisition of the present and the preterit are mentioned only in passing, focus being placed on the difficulties in the acquisition of the tenses relevant to my study, the perfect and the pluperfect.

2.3.1 Comparison of Swedish and Polish tense systems

As can be gathered from the review of the systems of tenses in both languages presented in 2.1.3 and 2.1.4, Swedish grammatically encodes a greater number of the universal (logical) possibilities of locating situations in time described by Reichenbach (1947) and Comrie (1983) than does Polish. Using Comrie’s (1983) terminology one can say that Swedish has absolute tenses: the present, the past and the future, absolute-relative tenses: the future perfect and the past perfect, and a tense in its own right, the perfect. Polish has only absolute tenses: the present, the future and the past, this latter form having more than one function (see below). The number
and the type of tense forms in each language in each of the two temporal domains, the present time domain and the past time domain are presented in Table 2. Since the future tense is beyond the scope of this work, it is not included in the table.

Table 2. Distribution of Swedish and Polish tenses across temporal domains

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Present time domain</th>
<th>Past time domain</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Swedish</td>
<td>Polish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1) present</td>
<td>1) present</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) perfect</td>
<td>–</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 shows that Swedish has two tense forms in each of the temporal domains whereas Polish has only one. Since Polish does not have perfectual tense forms, Polish learners of Swedish must acquire the ability to perceive the context for the perfectual tenses and to express the meanings with the respective forms: the perfect and the pluperfect.

The mere presence of perfectual tenses in the target language and the absence of those tenses in the mother tongue cannot be the only explanation of the great difficulties in the acquisition of those tenses as evidenced in the language production of Polish learners of Swedish. The difficulty must lie elsewhere, e.g. in the intricate relationships of the meanings expressed by different forms.

Brinton (1988:18), approvingly quoting Koschmeider (1962), argues that “while a language may not have fully grammaticalised markers of a category, it may still possess and express that grammatical category”. Thus, even if there are no explicit formal markers of the meanings expressed by the Swedish perfect and the pluperfect, those meanings must be also expressed in Polish. According to Lubensky (1985:85), languages lacking a formal perfect vs. non-perfect distinction use the past tense forms (perfective and imperfective aspect) to express the meaning of the perfect. This may mean that unlike Swedish, the Polish past tense form does not have inherent meaning, i.e. does not automatically indicate past time domain.

A similar observation, i.e. that in languages which do not have the perfect form some of the meanings expressed by the perfect may be conveyed by the past tense form, was made by Petterson (1994). His
observation concerns the Russian (and thus also the Polish) past tense 
form. In his description of tenses, carried out within the framework of 
cognitive theory of tense, time is anchored in the spatial notions in this 
room/at this place (for the present and the perfect) and in another 
room/another place (for the preterit and the pluperfect). According to 
Petersson (1994:189), the Swedish auxiliary verb hava 'have' indicates 
that the referent is in the possession of the property ascribed by the par-
ticiple to the referent as constant and irretrievable. The same meaning 
is, in his opinion, conveyed by the Russian past tense form, imperfective 
aspect in Ja vas ljubil 'I have loved you'. Petersson (1994:193) says:

I am no native speaker of Russian, but I have studied the pecul-
arities of Russian grammar more intensively than I have with re-
gard to any other language. Therefore it would be advisable to 
take my proposal seriously. I conjecture that the value of the 
Russian preterit participle is semantically identical to that of the 
Swedish supine form. Consequently, the very form [...] conveys 
the information that my affection [...] is an irretrievable fact char-
acterising me. [...] But there is, in opposition to Swedish (and possibly to English), nothing in the preterit form per se that indi-
cates that my love is located in this or another room.

Analysing the meaning of the Russian past tense forms, perfective 
and imperfective aspect, in terms of Reichenbach's (1947) time 
framework, Lubensky (1985:85) advanced the claim that with some 
verbs, namely verba percipiendi, the Russian (and thus also the 
Polish) past tense form may have two different interpretations. 
According to her, sentences with an explicitly expressed point of 
reference in the past, e.g. the adverb of definite time včera 'yester-
day', allow for only one interpretation, i.e. the past tense form has 
the meaning identical to the English preterit, the point of reference 
being before the point of speech (S). Lubensky (1985:85) presents 
this meaning graphically as in figure 6, where I have translated the 
Russian sentence used by Lubensky into Polish.

Figure 6. The position of E, R, and S for the Russian 
(and the Polish) past tense with an explicitly expressed 
past point of reference (adverb of definite time)
Sentences without an explicitly expressed point of reference allow, according to Lubensky (1985:85), for two different interpretations, having their counterparts in the English perfect or the preterit, as in (33):

(33) Widziałas go? 'Have you seen him?'/Did you see him?'

The interpretation of the meaning of the past tense form in (33) is left for the context to resolve. In some contexts, e.g. if we assume definite past time, the past tense form may have preterital meaning, the point of reference being simultaneous with the point of event and thus before the point of speech. This is shown in Figure 7, taken from Lubensky (1985:86), and again translated into Polish.

![Figure 7](image)

Widziałas go, gdy tam bylaś? 'Did you see him when you were there?'

Figure 7. The position of E, R, and S for the Russian (and the Polish) past tense on assumption of the definite past point of reference

In other contexts, i.e. in the contexts without an explicitly expressed past point of reference and with no assumption of a definite past time, the past tense form can have perfectual meaning. In this case, the point of reference R (topic time) may lie somewhere between the point of event E and the point of speech S, coming close to S. This is shown in Figure 8. The example is taken from Lubensky (1985:86), the Russian sentence again being translated into Polish.

![Figure 8](image)

Widziałas go? Jak on się czuje? 'Have you seen him? How is he feeling?'

Figure 8. The position of E, R, and S for the Russian (and the Polish) past tense without explicit or contextual specification of the definite past time

According to Lubensky (1985), the Russian (and thus, also the Polish) past form may also be used to express some subtle shades
of meaning ascribed to the perfect. In example (34), taken from Lubensky (1985:85), the past tense form expresses the meaning similar to the meaning of the perfect called by Comrie (1976:56) the perfect of result (my translation of the Russian clause):

(34) Ja (już) widziałam ten film, więc nie pójdę z tobą do kina. ‘I have already seen this film, so I am not going to the movies with you.’

In example (35), taken from Lubensky (1985:85) and translated into Polish, the past form expresses the meaning similar to the meaning of the perfect called by Comrie (1976:60) the perfect of recent past:

(35) Dopiero co widziałam ten film. ‘I have just now seen this film.’

Not only the perfective past forms but also the imperfective past forms of Russian and Polish may convey meanings similar to those ascribed to the perfect. This may be the case when the imperfective form is used to denote an accomplished action, the so-called simple denotation or general factive (see 2.1.4). As pointed out by Forsyth (1970:83), “the reference to the action in question may be very general – whether it was ever, at any time performed.” This meaning seems to be very similar to the meaning that Comrie calls (1985:58) the experiential perfect: “a given situation has held at least once during some time in the past leading up to the present.”

Some support for the view that the Polish past form, perfective aspect, may convey meanings very similar to the meanings conveyed by the perfect can also be found in Laskowski (1998). Laskowski (1998:160) says that the perfective aspect in Polish is “inherently retrospective”, i.e. an earlier situation is observed from a later point of time, and if the context does not exclude such a possibility, the situation is connected with the present moment through the ensuing results (see 2.1.4). This meaning is very often ascribed to the perfect (see 2.1.1.1 and 2.1.3)

Some similarity in the meanings conveyed by the perfect form and the Polish past perfective form can also be observed if the meanings ascribed to the perfective aspect by some Polish scholars (see 2.1.4), and to the perfect by some English and Swedish scholars (2.1.1.1) are compared. Each of these forms is described as having the meanings completion, resultativity or change of
state. Some similarity in the meanings conveyed by the perfect and the past perfective form has also been observed by Klein (1994:131). According to him, the perfect has a dual meaning, that of a tense, TU including TT, and that of an aspect, TT after TSit (see 2.1.1.1). The latter relation is also used in the description of the perfective. A subtle difference between the meanings of the two forms is accounted for by Klein (1994:109) in terms of the notion the posttime (the time after TSit). For the perfective, TT is partly included in the posttime. For the perfect, TT falls completely into the posttime.23

The observed affinity of the meanings conveyed by the Swedish and the English perfect form and the Polish past tense form may be explained in terms of the origin of the Polish past form. As mentioned before, the Polish past tense form is an amalgamation of the elements of the compound tense consisting of the auxiliary verb być ‘to be’ and the past participle, which was in use in 14th century Polish (see 2.1.4). This may mean that the Polish past tense form does not have an inherent meaning (does not automatically indicate the past time domain) and is not restricted to the use in the definite past contexts in the same way as is the case with the Swedish and the English forms. Some support for this claim may be found in the compatibility of the past tense forms of many verbs with the adverbs teraz ‘now’ or the adverbs już ‘already’ właśnie ‘just (now)’, which in English and Swedish most often collocate with the perfect.24

The meanings encoded by the Swedish perfect have their counterparts not only in the past tense, perfective and imperfective aspect, but also in the present tense. The Swedish perfect describing a situation that started in the past and continues into the present,

---

23 Klein has changed his view on the difference between the perfect and the perfective, admitting that this difference may be elusive (personal communication, at ESF conference, Colymbari 2002).

24 The linguistic phenomenon that one and the same form may, depending on the context, carry different meanings is not unusual. This is the case with the pluperfect, which may carry the meaning of the backshifted perfect or the backshifted preterit. Similarly, depending on the context, e.g. the presence of certain adverbial expressions, the (intrinsic) actional meanings of verbs may be changed, the change not being marked on the verbal form itself.
collocated with the temporal adverb of duration, or a temporal clause e.g. sedan 1950 'since 1950' or sedan han kom 'since he came', is rendered in Polish by the present tense.

(36) Jag har bott här sedan 1950. ‘Mieszkam (present) tu od 1950 roku.’ ‘I have lived here since 1950.’

As shown in (37), in Swedish, but not in English, the present tense may also be used in the contexts described above.

(37) Jag bor (present) här sedan 1950. ‘Mieszkam (present) tu od 1950 roku.’ ‘I have lived here since 1950.’

2.3.2 Some general observations on the acquisition of the Swedish tense system

As has often been observed in teaching situations and in contacts with speakers of Swedish as a foreign language with Polish as their mother-tongue, the use of the present and the preterit in obligatory contexts does not cause any serious acquisitional difficulties for Polish learners.

At the initial stage, the present and past suffixes may be omitted and infinitive forms may be used in the contexts in which the target language norm requires a temporal ending. With university learners of Swedish, those omissions are rather infrequent. At a later stage, the main difficulty consists in the correct choice of proper present and past temporal suffixes for the respective classes of verbs. The most common type of overgeneralisation of the present temporal morpheme is the use of the present temporal suffix -ar with the verbs which, in agreement with the target language norm, require another type of present temporal endings, e.g. -er. The most common type of overgeneralisation of the past temporal morpheme is the use of -(a)de with the classes of verbs that require some other type of past temporal ending, e.g. -te or -dde, and the uses of past temporal morphemes with irregular or strong verbs, which do not take past temporal endings. With advanced learners, those errors appear only with less frequent verbs. Replacements of present tense suffixes with past tense suffixes, or past suffixes with present tense suffixes, are extremely rare and may be explained in terms of slips of the
tongue or moments of inattention. Thus, possible difficulties in the acquisition of the present and the past tense do not seem to involve the meaning, i.e. recognizing the obligatory contexts for the use of those tenses, but only the verbal forms.\textsuperscript{25}

The tenses whose meanings are very difficult for Polish learners to acquire are the perfect and the pluperfect. Even those Polish speakers of Swedish who have acquired a near-native proficiency in Swedish often use the preterit in the contexts in which the Swedish norm requires the perfect, and the preterit or the perfect in the contexts in which the Swedish norm requires the pluperfect. Those difficulties may be caused by an intricate relationship between the meanings conveyed by the target language forms and between the meanings conveyed by the forms available in the two languages concerned.

2.3.3 The main source of difficulty

As can be seen from the comparison of the tense systems of Polish and Swedish, there are no formal counterparts of the Swedish perfect and the pluperfect in Polish.

The Swedish perfect is rendered in Polish with two tense forms: the present tense and the past tense, and two aspectual forms: the perfective and the imperfective aspect. The different ways of rendering the Swedish perfect in Polish are graphically presented in Figure 9.

![Figure 9. Ways of rendering the Swedish perfect in Polish](image)

The fact that two different tense forms and two different aspectual forms are used to convey the meanings denoted by the

\textsuperscript{25} Overgeneralisations of the present and the preterit, i.e. the use of those tenses in the contexts for the perfect and the pluperfect, are disregarded.
Swedish perfect may explain some of the difficulties in the acquisition of this tense. The diversity of the mother-tongue forms used as counterparts of the Swedish perfect may contribute, at least initially, to misunderstanding as to the meanings encoded by the perfect form. It also seems probable that, having noticed some correspondence between the meanings encoded by the Swedish preterit and the Polish past tense (when used with the meaning of the Swedish preterit, e.g. locating events in time prior to the present moment), Polish learners of Swedish may assume that, as in Polish, the Swedish preterit may, in some cases, also convey some of the meanings of the perfect (see 2.3.1).

This erroneous assumption that, as in Polish, the Swedish preterit, may, depending on the context, also convey more than one meaning, may also be “confirmed” by the target-language rule stating that in some cases, e.g. with adverbials denoting the recent past such as nyss, ‘just’, nyligen ‘recently’ etc., the perfect and the preterit may be used interchangeably without any appreciable change of meaning. This is the case in example (38), taken from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:238).

(38) Jag har nyligen läst/läste nyligen en bok av Hugo. ‘I have read/read a book written by Hugo recently.’

However, the main source of acquisitional difficulties seems to lie elsewhere. Most of the difficulties in the acquisition of this tense may be caused by an overlap of some elements of the meanings conveyed by the two target language forms, the preterit and the perfect. Comrie (1985:78) claims that in terms of location in time there is no difference between the perfect and the preterit. Both tenses locate events prior to the present moment, and thus share the semantic feature anteriority. In addition, both can be used to refer to a state of affairs that has existed for some time. As pointed out by Smith (1981, unavailable publication, quoted in Bardovi-Harlig 1997), the preterit and the perfect are truth-functionally identical, i.e. it is not possible to assert a sentence in one of these tenses and deny it in the other. The difference involves the semantic feature current relevance – only the perfect has this semantic feature as part of its meaning.26 Although

26 These claims were made for English but they are also true for Swedish.
the Swedish preterit does not have the feature *current relevance* as part of its meaning, actions encoded by this tense may also have current relevance at the time of speech. This is the case in (39), below, taken from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:237):

(39) Eva reste till Rom igårdå (så du kan inte få träffa henne). ‘Eva went to Rome yesterday (so you cannot meet her).’

According to Teleman et al. (1999:IV:234), when speakers use the preterit, they leave to the listener the judgement as to relevance of an event at the time of speech. When speakers use the perfect, they themselves make the judgements as to the current relevance of an event. This function of the perfect, i.e. explicit marking of current relevance of a past event, may be difficult for the Polish learners of Swedish to grasp. Since Swedish has a special formal marker for current relevance (the perfect), the native speakers of Swedish must find leaving the judgement as to the current relevance of a given situation to the listener, i.e. the use of the preterit instead of the perfect, rather confusing.

Since part of the meaning of the pluperfect is that of the back-shifted perfect, the explanation as to the nature of the difficulties in the acquisition of the perfect may also be valid for the pluperfect when the form is used to encode current relevance of an event at a point of reference which is situated in the past.

As mentioned earlier, Polish does not have any special tense form to encode the meanings expressed by the Swedish pluperfect. Those meanings are rendered in Polish with the past tense (perfective or imperfective aspect). Ways of rendering of the Swedish pluperfect in Polish are presented in Figure 10 below:

![Figure 10. Ways of rendering the Swedish pluperfect in Polish](image_url)

According to Laskowski (1998:175), Polish past tense forms may be used in the secondary function, i.e. as a relative tense indicating precedence. The typical contexts in which Polish past...
tense forms are used as the relative tense are the sentences “with an implied dependent clause as an argument”, i.e. in clauses that are obligatory complements to the matrix clauses involving the verbs: *wiedzieć, że, ‘know that’ słyszeć, że ‘hear that’, mówić, że ‘say that’* etc. as in (14) repeated here as (40):

(40) Ala wiedziała, że Olek odbył studia. ‘Ala knew that Olek had studied.’

Thus, the source of difficulties seems to be similar to that suggested in the acquisition of the perfect, i.e. an erroneous assumption that the past tense form in Swedish may, as in Polish, express the meanings conveyed by the Swedish pluperfect, at least in some contexts. This assumption may be “confirmed” by the possibility of marking the time of action of the following clause which is earlier than the topic time (overlapping with the time of action) in the preceding clause with the pluperfect or/and adverbs of time. This is shown in (41), taken from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:225):

(41) Karl bodde i Kenya. Några år tidigare arbetade Anna/hade Anna arbetat i Tanzania. ‘Carl lived in Kenya. Some years before Anna worked/had worked in Tanzania’.

The difference in the use of the two tenses pointed out by Teleman et al. (1999:IV:225) involves choosing a new topic time (the preterit) as against maintaining the topic time of the previous clause (the pluperfect). The latter is a textual rather than temporal function of the pluperfect, a fact which may easily go unnoticed, particularly if the pluperfect tense is presented and practiced in separate sentences and not in a somewhat longer coherent text.

The above considerations seem to suggest that the difficulty in the acquisition of the Swedish system of tenses by Polish learners may not be caused by the mere difference in the number of temporal forms employed by the two languages, but rather by the intricate form-function relationships within and between the two languages.
3 Review of previous research on acquisition of temporality in L1 and L2

In this chapter previous research on the acquisition of temporality is reviewed. Since there is some agreement among language acquisition researchers that the acquisitional processes in L1 (the first language) and in L2 (the second/foreign language) are to some extent similar, this review encompasses some elements of both. To restrict this vast and methodologically diverse field of research, it is primarily those studies which had some bearing upon my investigation of acquisition of the pluperfect which are reviewed. As with the review of the theories of tense, aspect and aktionsart, this selective review has been a source of inspiration in the forming of the hypotheses and in the interpretation of the results of this study.

3.1 Acquisition of temporality in L1

At a very early stage of L1 acquisition, children produce short utterances using mainly content words, omitting grammatical morphemes and function words. Meaningful use of grammatical morphemes is a later development (Brown 1973).

Grammatical morphemes are claimed to be acquired in a particular order. Possible explanations for a particular order of acquisition given in the literature on L1 acquisition are: the level of the child's cognitive development, the frequency of parental input and various phonological, syntactic, semantic and discourse features of the linguistic context.

According to Brown (1973) and de Villiers and de Villiers (1973), the temporal morphemes appear in children's English in the following order: the progressive -ing is the first temporal morpheme to be acquired, past irregular precedes past regular, which is, in turn, followed by the third person -s.
The emergence of the perfect or the pluperfect is not ranked by Brown (1973) and de Villiers and de Villiers (1973) since no uses of the perfect or the pluperfect were observed. Johnson (1985:336) claims that full mastery of the present perfect in English is a late development – children seem to acquire the perfect at the age of 4 to 6 years.

A slightly different acquisitional order of temporal morphemes was established for Swedish by Linell (1978), Christensen (1994), and for Swedish and Danish by Plunkett and Strömqvist (1990). In their study the first verb inflection to emerge, i.e. the present tense, was followed by the supine without the auxiliary verb. The use of the preterit was found to be a later development. Plunkett and Strömqvist (1990:89) explain this acquisitional order in terms of the meaning of the perfect – marking resultative aspect, the perfect seems to be more relevant to the current state of the child’s world than the preterit.

As pointed out by Christensen (1994), the conflicting results of the different studies on the acquisitional order of the verbal morpheme in L1 (English and Swedish) may be reconciled in the following way: since the preterit and the past participle of regular verbs have the same form in English, it may be impossible to say which temporal form the child actually employs when the auxiliary verb is omitted. It may also be difficult to separate the form/function relationship in child language. Christensen (1994) says that early uses of the preterit express mainly those past actions which refer to objects present ‘here and now’. Thus, there seems to be an element of meaning usually ascribed to the perfect, i.e. relating past events to the present moment in the early use of the preterit.

Some important observations referring to the acquisition of the perfect in L1 English were supplied by Johnson (1985). Analysing the results of an imitation test, Johnson (1985) found that in spite of the fact that the perfect progressive is morphologically more complicated than the perfect, it was more frequently correctly imitated by the children than the perfect. Further, she found that the perfect clauses with the semantic sense single event that occurred in the recent past were much more often correctly imitated than the perfect clauses with other semantic meanings. Yet another finding was that perfect clauses with punctual verbs were
much more often correctly imitated than perfect clauses with durative verbs. This result, i.e. the selective correct imitation of the perfect clauses, seems to indicate that some uses of the perfect may be easier to acquire than others.

Studies on the acquisition of the pluperfect by children seem to be rather scarce and difficult to find. The results of three available studies involving three different languages, (Finnish [Lyytinen 1983], French [Fayol 1985] and English, [Sutter and Johnson 1995]) are less conflicting than the results of the studies on the acquisition of the perfect — all three studies clearly indicate that the pluperfect is acquired rather late.

Lyytinen (1983) reports that first occurrences of the pluperfect emerges in 3-year-old children but at this age the pluperfect is frequently overgeneralised and sometimes erroneously replaces passive forms of the present and the past tense. The use of the pluperfect stabilises as late as around the age of seven, but even 7-year-old children were found not to be able to use the pluperfect correctly in conditional clauses.

Fayol's (1985) study, a comparison of the use of pluperfect tenses by adults and children in a written narrative, shows that her informants, 7–8-year-old children, were not able to use the pluperfect as freely as adults. Fayol (1985) claims that the child must be 9–10 years old to fully understand the meaning of the pluperfect.

Sutter and Johnson’s (1995) study, involving borrowing of complex verb forms used as stimuli during a story re-telling task by 6–8 year old children, shows that the pluperfect is difficult to recall — simple and progressive pluperfect forms occurring in the story were borrowed less frequently than past and past progressive forms.

The finding that the pluperfect is acquired rather late is not surprising. To be able to use this tense form successfully, the child must first learn to understand the underlying concept — anteriority of one past event in relation to another, also situated in the past. Some evidence that the underlying concept may be difficult was supplied by Coker (1978) and Ferreiro and Sinclair (1971). Coker (1978) observed that the words before and after were first acquired by their informants, English children, as prepositions. As subordinate conjunctions, the words before and
after were found to present considerable difficulties as late as at the age of six. Ferreiro and Sinclair (1971) found that 4- and 5-year-old children were not able to use a past event as a temporal reference when the temporal relationship between two past events was to be established but referred both events to the present moment.

A very important part of research on acquisition of temporality in L1 is based on the semantic theory called the defective tense hypothesis. This theory states that lexical aspect is of vital importance in the development of verbal morphology. When children start to use past tense morphology, grammatical tense morphemes are used to redundantly mark the lexical aspects of the verb rather than tense. Or in other words, temporal morphemes do not encode temporal deictic relations, but aspectual temporal features inherent in the lexical meaning of the verb.

Bronckart and Sinclair (1973) were among the first researchers to make a claim about the relationship between the use of past tense and lexical meanings of verbs. Using toys, they presented two types of actions to French-speaking children aged from 1.9 to 2.5. The actions varied with respect to their semantic character – some actions had a clear end result, e.g. a horse jumping over a fence, and some did not have any end result, e.g. a fish swimming in a basin. Actions with a clear end result were mostly described by the children in passé composé. Actions which did not have any end result were frequently described in the present tense. With the point of departure in those results, Bronckart and Sinclair (1973) made a claim that until the age of six past endings encode lexical aspect rather than tense.

Similar results, i.e. that the past ‘tense’ may have more of aspectual than of temporal value, were obtained by Antinucci and Miller (1976) in their longitudinal study of past tense inflections in the speech of seven Italian children and one American child, aged from 1.6 to 2.6.

Bloom, Lifter and Hafitz (1980) extended the object of study to another inflection, namely, the present progressive. They found

---

27 In the early studies concerning child language the term lexical aspect referred mostly to the inherent meaning of the verb itself: durative, punctual, resultative.
that English-speaking children around the age of two began to use the progressive -ing and the irregular past at the same time, but with different categories of verbs. The present continuous tense inflections were used mainly with activity verbs, i.e. the verbs which do not have any clear end result, e.g. the verb play. The past tense inflections were used with completive events – the events which have a clear end result, e.g. the verb break.

Some studies offered a counter-example to the defective tense hypothesis. Using both longitudinal and cross-sectional data from Polish children aged 2–2.5, Weist, Wysocka, Witkowska-Stadnik, Buczowska and Konieczna (1984) found many occurrences of activity verbs in the past tense. These results allowed the researchers to make the claim that the earliest instances of past tense inflections were used deictically and were not dependent on lexical or grammatical aspect. Grammatical aspect\(^{28}\) and tense were found to be learned simultaneously.

3.2 Acquisition of temporality in L2

Many studies on the acquisition of temporality, the most important being Bailey, Madden and Krashen (1974), Noyau (1990), Dietrich, Klein and Noyau (1995), Kotsinas (1985), found that the developmental pattern in the acquisition of temporality by adult L2 learners acquiring the language in a partly or fully naturalistic way is to some degree similar to that found in child language. At the initial stage of L2 acquisition, naturalistic learners produce simple utterances using some content words, mainly nouns, and omitting grammatical morphemes. When verbs begin to emerge, they appear mainly in uninflected forms. Past temporal reference is initially made through pragmatic devices such as situational context, or chronological order of events – the order of mentioning being the same as the order of events in the real world. At a later stage, temporal reference is established by means of temporal adverbials of different types, among others, calendrical expressions.

\(^{28}\) Those contradictory results may be due to the lack of clarity as to which category is involved, lexical aspect or grammatical aspect.
Some similarities between naturalistic learners and L1 learners were also found in the development of temporal morphology. As for L1 learners, naturalistic learners were found to employ irregular past forms before regular and the perfect was found to emerge late. In the Swedish samples (Noyau 1995), the perfect was found to be used only with a number of very frequent verbs, äta ‘eat’, vara ‘be’, ta, ‘take’, studera ‘study’ and was found to be overgeneralised, i.e. used in the preterit or the pluperfect contexts. The pluperfect was almost non-existent in the interlanguage of naturalistic learners in the two Swedish studies. Noyau (1995:251) found only two occurrences of this tense, both modelled on the interviewer’s utterance, i.e. the pluperfect was not produced spontaneously.

As in research on L1, many studies on the acquisition of temporal morphology in L2 were carried out within the framework of what has come to be known as the aspect hypothesis.29 The most important contribution to the research within this framework was made by Andersen (1991), with Spanish as the target language. Andersen (1991:314–315) outlined a complete developmental sequence for encoding two types of Spanish past inflections, the preterit and the imperfect, with reference to Vendler’s four types of lexical verbs: states, activities, accomplishments and achievements (see 2.2.1). The developmental sequence was outlined on the basis of the data from two English-speaking learners at two different periods of time: time 1, when one child was 8 years old and the other child was 12 years old, and time 2, two years later. Four of the developmental stages (stage 2 and stage 4 for one of the learners and stage 6 and stage 8 for the other learner) were identified on the basis of direct evidence from language samples. The remaining stages were constructed for each of the learners as stages through which they should have passed, i.e. those stages were described without direct evidence.

Andersen (1991) suggests the following pattern of development: At stage 1, verbs are not inflected for past tense – only present

29 Different studies use different labels for this theory. Apart from the term defective tense hypothesis, such terms as relative defective tense hypothesis (Andersen 1989) and primacy of aspect hypothesis (Robison 1990) have been used.
forms of verbs are used. At stage 2, punctual events are marked for the preterit. At stage 3, states are marked for the imperfect. Activities and achievements continue to be uninflected. Thus, at stage 3, the preterit is a ‘prototypical punctual marker’ and is reserved for ‘prototypical punctual events’ and the imperfect is a ‘prototypical durative marker’ and is reserved for ‘prototypical states’. At stage 4, the imperfect spreads to activity verbs and the preterit spreads to telic events. In this way, all verbs expressing past time receive past temporal markers, but temporal markers are used selectively: punctual and telic verbs receive one type of past endings, namely, the preterit endings, while states and activities receive another type of endings, namely, the imperfect endings.

The change from the tendency to use verbal morphology selectively takes place at stage 5 and stage 6, when imperfect marking spreads to telic events and the preterit marking spreads to activity verbs. At stage 7, inherently punctual verbs are used with imperfect inflections. A near-native competence in the use of verbal morphology is achieved at stage 8, when the preterit spreads to states and thus, the learners are able to mark all types of verbs with all types of endings, with some infrequent and minor deviations from the target rule. The developmental pattern described above is illustrated with Table 3, taken from Andersen (1991:317).

Table 3. Developmental sequences for encoding past tense

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage</th>
<th>State</th>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Telic</th>
<th>Punctual</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>- p</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>i</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>- p</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>i</td>
<td>i</td>
<td>- p</td>
<td>- p</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>i</td>
<td>i</td>
<td>i p</td>
<td>- p</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>i</td>
<td>i p</td>
<td>i p</td>
<td>- p</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>i</td>
<td>i p</td>
<td>i p</td>
<td>i p</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>i p</td>
<td>i p</td>
<td>i p</td>
<td>i p</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

i = imperfective, p = perfective

The aspect hypothesis was also confirmed by the results of the studies of English and French interlanguages, e.g. Kumpf (1982),
Rothstein (1985), Andersen (1986), and Bergström (1995) (unavailable papers, quoted in Andersen and Shirai 1994). The use of the temporal morphology by L2 learners, both naturalistic and instructed learners and irrespective of the type of task to be performed, was found to be guided by the lexical aspect of verbs.

My own study on the use of the past tense by Polish 11-year-old low-level learners of English also showed learner sensitivity to lexical or/and grammatical aspect in their use of past temporal morphology. In the written and oral translation of the Polish text with the title ‘How I spent last Sunday’ the learners correctly (and incorrectly, i.e. with the overgeneralised regular ending -ed, e.g. *comed) marked the past tense (regular and irregular forms) mainly on punctual and telic verbs (in the Polish version, the perfective aspect), e.g. wake up, get up, come back, go to school. Most of the atelic verbs (in the Polish text, the imperfective aspect), e.g. listen to music, play with a friend, watch television, were not marked for the preterit. The learners erroneously marked those verbs with the ending -ing (without the auxiliary verb), most probably making attempts at the past continuous tense. Thus, Polish learners of L2 English were also found to initially express past events with morphological endings congruent with the lexical meanings of verbs (Zielonka 1994).

Some researchers disputed the aspect hypothesis. Meisel (1987:220) argued that the use of tense morphemes whose meaning is congruent with the actional meaning of the verb “occurs only occasionally and is rather a marginal phenomenon”.

In some later studies carried out within the framework of the aspect hypothesis, the above theory was slightly reformulated. Robison (1990:316) found that only a weak version of the aspect hypothesis holds, i.e. that verbal morphology correlates with lexical aspect only at the earliest stages in the development of an interlanguage. Andersen and Shirai’s study (1994) confirmed that only the weak version of aspect theory, i.e. that “early morphology is predominantly guided by aspectual characteristics of the verbs”, is tenable. Furthermore, Andersen and Shirai (1994:137) observed that not only second language learners’ speech, but also native speech displays some distributional bias – stative verbs were found to occur much more often with the imperfective past marking than with the perfective past marking in the linguistic production of a native speaker, as well.
There are obviously other linguistic factors than semantic ones that may account for the variation in the use of past inflections. Some language acquisition researchers advocate a discourse framework. One of the proponents of the discourse approach is Godfrey (1980). Godfrey (1980:109) claims that studies of learners’ use of tense in single sentences may give different results than studies of learners’ use of tense in narrative texts, i.e. some of the errors may go unnoticed if they are not viewed from a textual perspective. This statement seems to be particularly important in the research on the use of tense. Learners may only be said to have acquired the temporal system of the target language when they are able to mark tense in agreement with textual norms.

One of the studies carried out within the framework of discourse, Wolfram (1985), investigated the effect of episode boundary as a determinant of past tense (the preterit) marking in Vietnamese learners of English. A preliminary observation was that tense-unmarked verbs occurred close to episode boundaries (the end of episode). However, a re-analysis of the tense marking with a separate tabulation of regular and irregular past verbs did not confirm this observation. On the basis of these results, Wolfram (1985) made a claim that tense marking may be more constrained by phonological or morphological factors than by discourse factors.

The great majority of the studies on acquisition of tense in L2 done within the framework of discourse investigate the relationship between the use of tense and the narrative structure of texts. Texts are usually described as composed of two parts, the foreground and the background, and this distinction is claimed to be a universal of narrative discourse (Hopper 1979). The foreground is defined as relating events belonging to the skeletal structure of the text, and moving the narrative time forward. The background is defined as providing supportive material and thus not moving the narrative time forward (Bardovi-Harlig 1995).

Early studies on the acquisition of tense carried out from the perspective of narrative discourse, i.e. investigating the use of tense across grounding, produced conflicting results. Kumpf (1984, unavailable report, quoted in Bardovi-Harlig 1995) found the background to be a more favourable context for the use of the past tense (the preterit) than the foreground. Flashner’s (1989)
finding was the reverse. Further studies, Veronique (1987) and Bardovi-Harlig (1995), confirmed Flashner’s result – the foreground was found to be a more favourable context for the past tense than the background. In addition, Veronique (1987) and Bardovi-Harlig (1995) found that distribution of tense across the background and the foreground was affected by the learners’ proficiency level and that individual learners may exhibit slightly different developmental patterns.

As far as the effect of the level of proficiency is concerned, Bardovi-Harlig (1995) found that the simple past was the dominant form in the foreground at the time when learners exhibited 40 per cent correct marking of the simple past in obligatory contexts, and a strongly dominant form when the learners exhibited 50 per cent correct marking of the simple past in obligatory contexts. The simple past tense was found to become the dominant tense in the background much later than in the foreground, i.e. when the learners exhibited 90 per cent correct past marking in obligatory contexts. Those results, with the foreground showing a greater rate of correct use of the past than the background in both oral and written production and across levels, indicate that the distribution of interlanguage past tense morphology may be determined by the narrative structure, but the effect of grounding may be different at different levels of proficiency.

The two research frameworks, i.e. the lexical aspect hypothesis and the discourse hypothesis, were combined by Bardovi-Harlig (1998). Bardovi-Harlig (1998:477) pointed out that the two hypotheses rest on shared features of temporal semantics – the defining features of the foreground, i.e. punctuality and completeness are at the same time the defining features of actional meanings, i.e. that aktionsart and grounding are most often coincident and the two hypotheses overlap. The hypotheses can be distinguished when telic verbs occur in the background and atelic verbs in the foreground.30

30 The notions foreground and background are cluster concepts involving a number of properties, not all of which always need to be present. Thus, there may be some exceptions from the general tendency that telic situations are sequential (the foreground) and atelic situations are non-sequential (the background).
Testing both hypotheses on the same linguistic material, Bardovi-Harlig (1998) found that temporal systems in learners' interlanguage were determined by both factors, the semantics of verbs and the narrative structure. Achievements were found most likely to be inflected for simple past, regardless of grounding. Accomplishments were found next most likely to be inflected for the past tense, foreground achievements showing higher rates of accuracy than background achievements. Activities were found least likely to be inflected for the past tense, foreground activities showing higher rates of accuracy than background activities. Those results show that the dependencies between the correct use of tense and the linguistic context may be more complex than expected and that more than one hypothesis will be necessary in accounting for the distribution of past tense morphemes.

Very few studies on the acquisition of the perfect and the pluperfect by instructed learners of L2 are generally available. The most important ones are those carried out by Bardovi-Harlig (1997) on the acquisition of the perfect and Bardovi-Harlig (1994) on the acquisition of the pluperfect. Since those studies are particularly relevant for my research, they are reviewed in more detail than other studies.

Investigating the acquisition of the perfect by 16 adult learners of English as a second language with four different mother tongues (Arabic, Japanese, Korean and Spanish) Bardovi-Harlig (1997) found that 86.9 per cent of the uses of the perfect were appropriate. The appropriate uses of the perfect occurred in both present tense texts and past tense texts. 15 per cent of the uses of the perfect were overgeneralizations, i.e. the uses of the perfect in contexts in which, according to the target language norm, other tenses, the present or the preterit, should have been used. An analysis of the overgeneralizations of the perfect revealed that the learners associated the perfect with both the past and the present time. Of the overgeneralizations 63 per cent involved uses of the perfect in the environment for the simple past, while 10 per cent of the overgeneralizations involved uses of the perfect in the environment for the present tense. This result indicates that some of the uses of the perfect encoded only one part of its meaning, either the semantic feature anterior or the semantic feature current relevance, the feature shared with the simple past being
more apparent for the learners than the feature shared with the present tense. A period of instruction increased the use of the perfect for those learners who had many uses of the perfect before instruction. Those learners who had only a few uses before instruction (1–3 occurrences of the perfect), did not show an immediate increase in the use of the perfect, i.e. the correct use of the perfect does not seem to be easily affected by instruction.

Investigating the acquisition of the pluperfect, Bardovi-Harlig (1994) focused on the relationship between the ability to use the rhetorical device reverse-order report and the acquisition of the pluperfect. Reverse-order reports are deviations from the past time chronological narrative order – an earlier event is presented after a later event. To mark deviations from the chronological order, English employs the pluperfect. Chronological narrative order and a reverse-order report are exemplified with sentences (42) and (43), respectively, taken from Bardovi-Harlig (1994:244):

(42) John graduated from high school in 1975. He went to college five years later.
(43) John entered college in 1980. He had graduated from high school five years earlier.

Bardovi-Harlig (1994) found the following developmental pattern in the expressions of reverse-order reports: those of the informants who were not able to express reverse-order reports in agreement with the target language rule, i.e. by means of the contrast of the preterit and the pluperfect, made use of other devices, lexical or structural. As far as the lexical devices were concerned, reverse-order reports were found to be expressed by means of temporal adverbials, e.g. after and before, or by such lexical items as lunch, dinner, understood as having lunch being an earlier activity than having dinner. As far as the structural means were concerned, the learners relied on three constructions. One was the causal construction signalled by because, in which the temporal order of events can be inferred from the causal relation (cause preceding effect). The remaining two constructions were relative clauses and complement clauses, i.e. typical environments for background information. Apart from those means, the learners also employed contrast of tense forms, i.e. a non-native-like combination of tenses other than that employed in the target language:
the preterit and the pluperfect. The pluperfect was found to emerge rather late and to be used rather inconsistently.

Another important finding reported by Bardovi-Harlig (1994) is that spontaneous use of the pluperfect is not easily affected by instruction. The learners who did not use the pluperfect prior to instruction did not use the pluperfect after some amount of form-focused instruction. Bardovi-Harlig (1994) explains her findings in the following way: those learners who were not able to learn the pluperfect had not reached the required developmental stage. The necessary (but not sufficient) condition for the emergence of the pluperfect is 80 per cent rate of appropriate use of the preterit and the ability to express reverse-order reports by some means other than the pluperfect, i.e. the pluperfect moves into an established semantic environment.

My own small-scale study of the acquisition of the pluperfect in Swedish by Polish university students (Zielonka 1995) also confirmed the claim that the acquisition of the pluperfect is a lengthy process, one not easily influenced by instruction. Many advanced learners of Swedish (also those with an excellent command of English, i.e. learners who had received extensive formal instruction in both languages), failed to use this tense in obligatory contexts. Some learners used the preterit instead of the pluperfect. Other learners, those who probably had reached a higher developmental stage, employed tense contrast, the preterit contrasting with the perfect, thus erroneously using the present perfect to express an event prior to another past event.

Another finding of my study (Zielonka 1995) concerns relatively easy and relatively difficult linguistic contexts for the pluperfect. Subordinate clauses were found to be more favourable contexts for the pluperfect than main clauses, relative clauses being the most favourable, and clauses reporting somebody’s utterance the least favourable.

The review of earlier studies on the acquisition of temporality presented above shows that learning the correct use of tenses in the target language is a lengthy process. The variable use of temporal morphemes on the way to acquiring native-like proficiency may be explained by many different factors: syntactic and semantic complexity of target language structures, the linguistic context in which temporal morphemes are to be used and the frequency
of input. Thus, an important implication from the above review is that an investigation of the effect of linguistic context upon interlanguage morphology may give a misleading picture if the effect of only a single linguistic factor upon the correct marking of tense is taken into consideration. If a study on acquisition of temporality is to be reliable, the combined effect of several factors referring to different levels of the language should be taken into consideration.
4 The design of the study

The respective sections of Chapter 4 give the information about the design of this study. In section 1 the theoretical background of this study and the research questions which this study seeks to answer are presented. Section 2 contains a description of the informants. Section 3 contains detailed information about the linguistic material used in this study and the way in which the material was collected. Section 4 contains the description of the statistical methods used in this study: rank ordering and stepwise multiple regression. In the subsection describing stepwise multiple regression, the independent variables are presented, i.e. the non-linguistic factors that could possibly have affected the results of this study, and the linguistic factors hypothesised to affect the correct use of the pluperfect.

4.1 General theoretical background and research questions

Many of the studies on first-language (L1) acquisition as well as second-language (L2) acquisition reviewed in the section on acquisition of temporality found that grammatical categories of the target language are acquired in a systematic fashion. Some grammatical categories are claimed to be acquired before others, e.g. the preterit was found to be acquired before the pluperfect in both L1 and L2. Also, particular uses of a given grammatical category are claimed to be acquired in a systematic order, e.g. the preterit with punctual and telic verbs appears earlier in the learners’ interlanguage than the preterit with activities and states (see 3.1 and 3.2). In linguistic literature, these phenomena are called the order of acquisition and the sequence of acquisition respectively, and are often subsumed under the cover term the developmental
The order and the sequence of acquisition are claimed to be partially similar for all types of learners of a given target language, L1 and L2 learners as well as naturalistic and instructed L2 learners, irrespective of their native tongue (Larsen-Freeman and Long 1991, Ellis 1994).

On their way to the acquisition of the target language, learners pass through a series of developmental stages. Those stages can be described either in terms of an absence of a certain grammatical structure in the learners’ interlanguage, or in terms of a gradual shift in the frequency of the correct use of the structure being acquired. Some researchers claim that formal instruction, usually understood as grammar teaching, is not able to significantly change the developmental route. Instructed learners do not seem to acquire “what is taught when it is taught” but rather make use of instruction-independent learning strategies, following the natural developmental patterns. Instruction seems to be effective only if “sufficient processing prerequisites are developed” (Pienemann 1985:37).

Some acquisitional studies, e.g. Ellis (1994), revealed that although the developmental pattern displayed by learners with different language backgrounds is not rigidly invariant, it is remarkably similar. The various ways in which particular grammatical categories are expressed in L1 constitute, at least at initial stages of L2 acquisition, the “equipment” of the learner. The learner’s L1 acts as a filter accounting for a certain selectivity in processing of the L2 input. According to Zobl (1980), the development of a particular grammatical feature may be inhibited when a universal transitional structure corresponds to L1 structure. And vice versa, the development may be accelerated when an early transitional structure is not reinforced by a corresponding L1 structure.

One of many possible explanations as to why a given grammatical category may be acquired in a particular order is the effect of linguistic context. Research concerning the sequence of acquisition of grammatical morphemes provides some evidence that grammatical morphemes are acquired piecemeal – acquisition proceeds from one linguistic context to another. For example, Ellis (1988) found that both full and contracted copula were used more consistently (acquired earlier) with the pronoun subject than with the noun subject. For more examples of gradual acquisition of grammatical morphemes (see 3.1 and 3.2).
These findings may be taken as an indication that some particular linguistic contexts may be easier for the application of a particular grammatical rule than others.

The present study addresses the following three research questions:

1. Is the correct use of the pluperfect affected by linguistic context? In other words: are some linguistic contexts for the pluperfect relatively easy and others relatively difficult for Polish learners of Swedish as a foreign language?

2. Which linguistic factors may account for the variable use of the pluperfect?

3. Why may particular linguistic factors account for different degrees of difficulty in the application of the pluperfect rule?

The answer to the first research question is supplied by the results of the two statistical analyses of the variable use of the pluperfect, i.e. the rank order list and the stepwise multiple regression. My linguistically-grounded discussions as to which features of the linguistic context may account for different degrees of difficulty, i.e. grounding of the hypotheses in theoretical linguistic literature, constitute an attempt to answer the second and the third, which is the most difficult research question. Thus, this study is not a mere register of relatively easy and relatively difficult linguistic contexts for the pluperfect, but it offers some suggestions as to probable reasons behind the variable use of the pluperfect.

4.2 Informants

The informants in this study were 64–69 Polish university students ranging in age from 19–26. All of them studied Swedish as their main subject at one of the Polish universities that had Scandinavian departments in the academic year 1995/96. Poznań, Kraków or Gdańsk.

The level of proficiency in Swedish represented by the informants varied greatly. The informants involved in testing were second, third, fourth and fifth year students. This means that the amount of exposure to Swedish assessed in terms of formal clas-
room instruction (number of hours in the syllabus) which the informants had received prior to the test was different for the respective groups of learners. The number of hours of formal instruction as specified in the syllabus is presented in Table 4.

Table 4. Hours of formal instruction in Swedish per year of study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year of study</th>
<th>Nr of hours</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1400</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Those figures are, however, only approximations and have been presented here to give a very general orientation about the informants’ level of language proficiency. Actually, it is not possible to establish the exact number of hours of formal instruction which individual students had received prior to the test. One source of difficulty in establishing the exact amount of exposure to Swedish is the fact that 10–20 per cent of classes are usually cancelled at Polish universities. Another source of difficulty is the fact that attendance at lectures is half-obligatory. Thus, the amount of exposure which particular learners may have had prior to the test may vary greatly.

Apart from formal instruction in Swedish as a language, the informants attended classes on grammar, literature, linguistics and some other subjects run wholly or partly in Swedish. The amount and the type of instruction carried out in Swedish may have been different at different universities.

In addition, the amount of exposure to Swedish outside the classroom may have been quite different for individual students. Apart from the differences in the quantity of individual preparation for classes, there may be differences in the amount of voluntary reading, participation in non-obligatory educational arrangements held in Swedish and differences in the amount of private contacts with Swedes. Thus, it is not possible to establish how much exposure to Swedish particular groups of students or individual students had had prior to the test.
Not only the quantity but also the quality of instruction may vary significantly among the universities and among the students of different years of study at the same university. Instruction at each university is usually carried by both Polish teachers of Swedish and teachers who are native speakers of Swedish. The quality of instruction is greatly dependent on the competence and the commitment of individual teachers. Both Polish and Swedish teachers are free as regards the choice of teaching materials.

Last but not least, individual differences in language learning aptitude and different degrees of motivation for language learning must be mentioned as an explanation for the differences in the level of proficiency in Swedish within the group defined by the year of study.

Each of the informants had a good command of English. To be admitted to the Scandinavian Department, a candidate must pass an entrance examination in English at the intermediate or higher-intermediate level of proficiency. Some of the informants may have had some knowledge of other languages such as German, French or Spanish.

4.3 Linguistic material

The task of collecting language samples involving the pluperfect is not easy. As had been observed in language classrooms and confirmed by a number of my pilot studies, the pluperfect occurs very infrequently, if ever, in spontaneous oral and written language production of Polish learners. This fact explains why, contrary to the recommendations found in the literature on current methods in language acquisition research, I had to choose a traditional mode of data collection – a written language test involving texts with obligatory contexts for the pluperfect. The original idea was that the written material to be analysed would be complemented with the oral material, i.e. elicitation of oral samples was also planned. Due to some technical problems – limited access to tape-recorders at Polish universities at the time of material collection and poor recording conditions – this idea had to be abandoned.

Since the use of the pluperfect is in many cases accounted for by a broader context, and since according to some researchers
learners may only be said to have acquired the temporal system of the target language when they are able to mark tense in agreement with textual norms (see 3.2), the task of collecting language samples involving the pluperfect requires a coherent text. This requirement makes the task still more difficult – authentic texts with numerous occurrences of the pluperfect which are evenly distributed across different types of linguistic contexts are not easily found.

A solution to most of those problems was provided by the use of a test battery involving two types of gap-filling tasks, type A and type B (see Appendix 2) and a translation task (see Appendix 3). Altogether there were five tasks: three gap-filling tasks of type A, with the instruction *Fill in the missing words*, one gap-filling task of type B, with the instruction *Fill in the gaps with the words in brackets. Make all necessary changes* and one translation task. The gap-filling tasks were based on authentic texts, but the texts had been slightly expanded, i.e. some extra clauses, most of which constituted contexts for the pluperfect, had been added. Three of the texts were based on three fables by Aesop, while the fourth text was based on a short narrative found in a collection of texts prepared as language teaching materials. The Polish text to be translated into Swedish was constructed by me.

Language tests in the form of gap-filling tasks are generally recommended as being an effective device for measuring the proficiency in a foreign language and having a great deal of potential for language research (Bachman 1990:67–69). The translation test was chosen to compensate for the lack of spontaneous language samples. Decoding the stimulus in one’s native language and encoding it in a foreign language approximates spontaneous speech production – in translation the learners’ attention is focused on the message rather than on the form (Larsen-Freeman and Long 1991:29). Since the use of the pluperfect by my informants could, to some degree, have been task-induced, the possible effect of each of these two types of tasks, *gap-filling* and *translation*, upon the accurate use of the pluperfect is one of the non-linguistic variables in this study.

The tests were administered during two classes planned for scheduled instruction in Swedish. Each of the nine student groups participating in the experiment was tested separately. To
disturb the study routine as little as possible the design of the test chosen for the investigation was very much in agreement with the usual teaching practice – the use of properly introduced, enjoyable texts with some educational value and a range of different activities: listening comprehension, filling in gaps with verbs in proper tenses, arranging the lexical items in brackets in a proper order and translation from Polish into Swedish.

For most of the groups, testing was divided into two sessions. The first session started in each case with a short presentation of the researcher and some information about the test and its purpose. The results of the test were said to have a practical application in language pedagogy. The particular concern of this investigation, i.e. the use of the pluperfect, was not mentioned to the informants. This short introduction was followed by a brief informal conversation about the literary genre of the fable and about Aesop and his followers – Krasicki, Lafontaine and Krylow. The aim of this part of the session was to help the informants feel at ease and forget the testing situation.

The main bulk of the first session consisted of three gap-filling tasks of type A, administered in the same order for each of the groups. The first task was based on the fable called Vännerna och björnen ‘The Friends and the Bear’, (see Appendix 1, Text 1 and Appendix 2, Test 1). The informants were instructed to listen carefully to the text read aloud twice by the researcher, and to try to remember as much of the content of the fable as possible without taking notes. The informants knew that the presentation of the fable would be followed by a language task based on the presented text, but they had not been informed what kind of task it would be, and what grammatical categories the task would involve. Listening comprehension tasks are routine practice in language classes, and can be followed by a whole range of different activities. Test sheets with a text very similar to the presented text, with some gaps to be filled in with verbs in a proper tense form (see Appendix 2, Test 1), were distributed after the presentation of the fable. In this way the learners’ attention was not directed to the verbal forms in the text presented orally, and the gaps involving the pluperfect clauses occurring in the original text (see Appendix 1, Text 1) were not filled in automatically, i.e. while listening to the text. There was no time limit for the completion of
the task. The informants were encouraged to read through the text on the test sheets more than once and check the correctness of their responses. The difference in time taken by each student to complete the task was negligible, two to three minutes. The same procedure was used with the remaining tasks. The second task was based on the fable *Räven som åt för mycket* ‘A Fox Who Ate Too Much’ and the third task based on the fable *Den gamle mannen och döden* ‘The Old Man and Death’ (see Appendix 1, Text 2 and Text 3 and Appendix 2, Test 2 and Test 3).

The oral presentation of the respective fables prior to the three gap-filling tasks had a double function. First, this procedure was supposed to give the informants some necessary clues about the vocabulary to be used in the gaps. Second, this procedure was to supply the material for a mini-investigation of perception/recall of pluperfect clauses. Each original fable read to the informants contained some clauses in the pluperfect (see Appendix 1, Text 1, Text 2 and Text 3). Those clauses appeared in the text on the test sheets with gaps for the verbal form (see Appendix 2, Test 1, Test 2 and Test 3). The use of the pluperfect in those clauses constitutes one of the non-linguistic variables, namely *type of response: perceived/recalled contexts* (see 6.2). This task was very much in agreement with the techniques of language practice frequently used in language classes. It was not inspired by any previous study known to me.

The original texts presented orally to the informants prior to testing and the texts on the test sheets were very similar but not identical. As mentioned before, the texts on the test sheets had been expanded, i.e. they contained more clauses of different types than the original texts. This measure was taken to increase the number and the type of contexts for the pluperfect and, in cases when other tenses than the pluperfect were involved, to distract the learners’ attention from the pluperfect, i.e. to avoid the effect of test consciousness at an early stage of testing.

The remaining parts of the tests: gap-filling test of type B, based on the picture story *Tjuven* (The Thief), (see Appendix 2, Test 4) and the translation test (see Appendix 3), were generally administered during the second session, taking place on the following
day or some days later. The only exception from this routine was
the group of second year students at the University of Kraków.
For practical reasons beyond my control, this group of inform-
ants was tested on one single occasion, with a short break after
the first part of the test.

Gap-filling test of type B involved a slightly different presenta-
tion technique. The events in the story were to be gathered from
a series of pictures. To avoid misunderstandings regarding the
content, the story was introduced with a number of questions re-
ferring to the pictures. All the questions were in the present
tense, e.g. Whom do you see in the picture?, What is the thief try-
ing to do? What is the man at the window doing? and so on. In
this way, the skeleton of the story as well as some new vocabu-
lary items had been introduced before the informants were asked
to perform the task of filling in the gaps.

As mentioned before, the gap-filling task type B had the in-
struction Fill in the gaps with the words in brackets. Make all the
necessary changes. Among the words given in brackets there
were not only verbs in the infinitive form, but also other kinds of
words: nouns, pronouns, adverbs etc. Those words appeared in
brackets in random order and the students' task, apart from
changing the infinitives into the correct tense forms, was to
arrange the words in the proper order. This type of gap-filling
task was to prevent concentration solely on the tense of the verb.
Since this task was administered as number four, at this point in
the testing procedure the learners might have become test-wise,
i.e. sensitive to the contexts for the pluperfect. Having the words
to be supplied in the gaps arranged in random order, the learners
had to pay attention to more than one grammatical rule, i.e. not
only to the rules involving the use of tenses, but also to the rules
involving word order.

This measure was also intended to compensate for a possible
facilitative effect of frequent occurrences of pluperfect clauses
in every test. Since the application of one rule may inhibit the
application of another, my assumption was that in the task in-
volving more than one grammatical rule, the pluperfect would
be mainly used in the most conspicuous (easiest) contexts for
the pluperfect. The difference between the two types of gap-fill-
ing tasks is not taken into consideration in the analysis of the
Gap-filling is a very popular type of exercise in language classrooms, which means that the informants were well acquainted with the technique, so this method of collecting language samples did not cause any serious problems resulting in unfilled gaps.

The translation task was introduced to every group with a short reminder about the entrance examination to the Scandinavian Department of their respective university. After this short introduction, the learners were given the Polish text, and were asked to translate this text into Swedish. The motivation for the use of translation as the final task was the same as in gap-filling task type B, i.e. preventing concentration on the use of tenses. Translation is a cognitively most demanding type of task, in which learners have to make use of many and varied grammatical rules at the same time, as well as suppling all the necessary vocabulary items.

The presentation of the researcher and the purpose of the research as well as all the explanations and all the instructions were given in Swedish. On the whole, the use of Polish in the testing situation was very infrequent. Utterances in Polish were never longer than a single sentence, most often a phrase or a single word. Most of the words to be supplied in the gaps or used in translation are frequently used in foreign language classes and thus were well known by all the informants, e.g. *leva ‘live’, studera ‘study’, läsa ‘read’, skriva ‘write*. A few unknown vocabulary items, or the items which the students knew, but could not recall at the time of the test, were at the learners’ request written on the blackboard, or provided orally to individual students. All those words were given in basic forms, with the necessary information about declension or conjugation types provided in the way consistent with the system used in vocabulary lists in course-books or in dictionaries. The students were discouraged from asking questions about correctness of grammatical forms and appropriateness of lexical items to be used.

---

32 The obtained result, no statistically significant difference in the rates of accuracy across the two radically different types of tasks: *gap-filling* and *translation*, seems to suggest that the decision to eliminate the analysis of the effect of some minor differences in the gap-filling tasks upon the use of the pluperfect was justified.
As mentioned before, each of the original fables, read aloud twice to the informants immediately prior to the respective gap-filling task, contained some pluperfect clauses. Those pluperfect clauses appeared on the test sheets with a gap for the verb form to be filled in. For example, the clause *Av den myckna maten hade han blivit tjockare* ‘Because of the large amount of food he had become fatter’ occurring in the original text, in the text on the test sheet appeared as *Av den myckna maten ..................tjockare* (see Appendix 1, Text 2 and Appendix 2, Test 2, Gap 4). Altogether, there are five pluperfect clauses of this type in the linguistic material. Four of the five clauses appeared in the same place as in the original text, the place of one of the clauses being changed. Those clauses are in this work called *perceived/recalled clauses*.

Perception/recall of pluperfect verb forms was not meant to be one of the main research questions in this study. Recalled clauses were employed to make some preliminary observations, observations which could be further tested on another occasion and with a more adequate battery of tests. In this study the analysis of the use of the pluperfect in perceived/recalled clauses was intended to show whether the use of the pluperfect in sentences heard prior to the test would be consistent. Preliminary observations made on the basis of this mini-study were intended to contribute to the general interpretation of the results of the study.

In some cases the expected pluperfect response clauses were transformations of the clauses with another tense form, the perfect or the preterit, which the informants could hear in the texts read to them prior to the task, and could also see in some other parts of the test-sheet. The informants’ task, in that case, was to change the tense in those clauses into the pluperfect. For example, the clause *Trädet har krympt* ‘The tree has shrunk’, which the informants heard immediately prior to the task, and could see in an earlier part of the text on the test sheet, was to be used as *Han trodde att trädet hade krympt*. ‘He believed that the tree had shrunk’ (see Appendix 1, Text 2 and Appendix 2, Test 2, Gap 5). The linguistic material for this study contains seven such clauses, i.e. clauses requiring a change of tense. In this study, they are called *transformed clauses*.

Transformation exercises are a very frequent type of grammatical tasks used in foreign language classrooms. Provided that the
techniques of formal instruction had some effect upon the use of the pluperfect, the assumption was that in transformed clauses the pluperfect would be supplied with a higher rate of accuracy than in elicited production. The reverse result might lend some support for the claims that learners make use of instruction-independent learning strategies and display a developmental order which cannot be “subverted” by instruction (Ellis 1994:627). As for the perceived/recalled clauses, the motivation for having the use of the pluperfect in transformed clauses as a variable in the investigation was to make some preliminary observations rather than to make any definite claims about the effect of particular instruction techniques.

The remaining pluperfect clauses are cases of elicited production. In my classification of the contexts, elicited production involves clauses in which the learners were supposed to supply the pluperfect as if “spontaneously”, i.e. neither to perceive/recall the pluperfect clauses, nor to transform preterit and perfect clauses into pluperfect clauses. The linguistic material contains 38 clauses of this type: 6 clauses with which the texts on the test sheets in gap-filling tasks of type A have been expanded, 11 clauses admitting the pluperfect in the gap-filling task of type B and 21 clauses admitting the pluperfect in the translation task.

Four pluperfect clauses were eliminated from scoring. The first one was the clause to be supplied in Gap 2 of the text Gamle mannen och döden (see Appendix 2, Test 3). Many students left this gap unfilled. A very low number of attempts to fill in this gap may have been caused by a change in the text. The original text says: En gammal man hade varit i skogen och huggit ved. ‘An old man had been in the forest and (had) cut wood.’ The text on the test sheet, when the gaps are filled in, reads: Han hade varit i skogen och med stor möda (hade) huggit vedfånget. ‘He had been in the forest and with great effort had cut down the large armful of wood’. The occurrence of the newly learned word vedfånget could have caused some confusion among the informants as to what verb should be filled in in the gap. Drawing conclusions about the effect of the linguistic context upon the use of the pluperfect in this particular case could have led to some unjustified claims about the acquisition of the pluperfect.

The remaining three clauses eliminated from scoring involved the use of the pluperfect in conditional clauses occurring in the
translation task. Since the number of factors hypothesised to affect the rate of accuracy was already high, much higher than initially planned, it seemed reasonable to limit the object of the study and eliminate the pluperfect clauses expressing counterfactuality. In this way, only the acquisition of purely temporal uses of the pluperfect, i.e. encodings of an event that was anterior or in relation to another past event, i.e. an event prior to the moment of speech, are taken into consideration.

Summing up, the language samples collected by means of three types of tests (the gap-filling tasks of type A, the gap-filling task of type B and the translation task) involve 50 clauses: 38 elicited production clauses, 5 perceived/recalled clauses and 7 transformed clauses. The information about the number of different types of tests and different types of responses is presented in Table 5.

Table 5. Types of tests and types of response

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of response</th>
<th>Gap filling</th>
<th>Translation</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Type A</td>
<td>Type B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Text 1</td>
<td>Text 2</td>
<td>Text 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elicited production</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived/recalled</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transformed</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Classification of three clauses with respect to the type of response was slightly problematic. Two of the problematic clauses, clause 3 and clause 14 on the rank-order list, are very similar to one of the clauses which was heard by the informants prior to the gap-filling test of type A, namely clause 2 on the rank-order list (see Appendix 4). Since those two clauses were not heard immediately prior to the respective gap-filling task, and since one of them occurred in the text used in the second session of testing, with one exception taking place on another occasion, those clauses were classified as new. The third of the problematic clauses, clause 22 in the rank-order list, is a re-occurrence in the same
The language samples collected by means of two different types of tests, four gap-filling tasks and a translation task were analysed by means of two statistical methods. A preliminary statistical
analysis involved scoring the correct uses of the pluperfect and making a rank order list based on the rates of accuracy. Since the assumption in this analysis was that the use of the pluperfect may be affected by a cross-cutting influence of many different linguistic factors, the multivariate method known as stepwise multiple regression was applied. Detailed information about the statistical analysis is presented in the respective subsections.

4.4.1 The method of scoring

The approach taken in this study is strongly reminiscent of the method called obligatory occasion analysis, a method frequently employed by both L1 and L2 researchers when describing developmental patterns. The learners’ responses were analysed with a view to establishing how many informants out of the total number of informants giving a response used the pluperfect in each of the 50 clauses (see Appendix 4).

The figures indicating the total number of informants/responses are not constant. There are several reasons for this. Some of the differences in the total number of responses result from the fact that some of the informants did not take part in every test. As mentioned earlier, the informants had not been informed that they would be taking part in a language test. The language samples were collected during ordinary classes, in two sessions taking place on two different occasions. Some of the informants who took part in the first session did not attend the second session. Some of the informants who did not take part in the first session turned up for the second session.

The differences in the number of total responses also result from the approach taken in establishing the rates of accuracy. One source of the differences was lack of response — some of the informants left some of the gaps unfilled. I assumed that difficulties in filling the gaps involved supplying the content (not knowing what to say) rather than difficulties in supplying the correct tense form. Consequently, the gaps which had not been filled in were not counted as errors, but as lack of response, reflected in the figure indicating the overall number of informants giving response.

Another source of the differences in the number of total responses in some particular clauses was the use of one of two alternative
ways of expression with different semantic values, unbound-ed/bounded, as in *lyssna på många föreläsningar/höra många föreläsningar* ‘listen to many lectures/hear many lectures’. To avoid complications connected with the analysis of the effect of the semantic value of the target verb, only one verb, the one used by the majority of the learners, was taken into consideration (see Appendix 4, clause 10 and clause 11). This measure was not applied in those cases where alternative verbs represented the same semantic class, e.g. two bounded verbs *glömma/lämna sin yxa* ‘forget/leave one’s axe’.

Some of the differences in the number of total responses have their origin in the method of scoring the clauses in which instead of the expected verb, some other verb was used, a change thus admitting tenses other than the pluperfect. For example, instead of the expected verb *höra* ‘hear’ (demanding the pluperfect form *Han hade hört att*... ‘He had heard that...’) some of the informants used the verb *veta* ‘know’ (*Han visste att* ‘He knew that...’). This kind of change in the text may, perhaps, be seen as an attempt to avoid the use of a difficult structure, but cannot be judged as a case of incorrect use of tense.33 In agreement with this assumption, the figure indicating the number of informants using the alternative form was subtracted from the figure indicating the total number of the informants giving a response (see Appendix 4, clause 49). Thus, the use of the alternative form counted as lack of response. Apart from the case discussed above, changes of this kind were very infrequent and were made by some individual learners only.

In some cases, the learners filled in a gap with the preterit or the perfect and then corrected the initial response to the pluperfect. Those visible corrections to the pluperfect are not counted as

---

33 As stated in Ellis (1994:305), identification of avoidance is a difficult task. One of the conditions allowing for the claim that avoidance has taken place is evidence that native speakers would use the form avoided by the L2 learners in the particular context in question. Since the results of the same test carried out with a group of native speakers, (my students at the University of Stockholm in the academic year 1998) revealed that also some of the native informants supplied the alternative form *Han visste att*, the use of this form by the Polish learners of Swedish cannot be taken as an evidence for avoidance in the strict sense of this word.
correct uses of the pluperfect. This approach – scoring only those occurrences of the pluperfect which were given as the first, as it were, spontaneous response – was taken in order to eliminate cases of possible adjustments of the responses to the responses of some other participants in the test. A rough estimation of the number of the self-corrected markings of the pluperfect showed that the overall results would not to any major degree be affected by a different method of scoring.

As mentioned before, all the contexts admitting the use of the pluperfect were in this study treated as obligatory. The judgements referring to correctness in the use of the pluperfect in the gap-filling tasks, a highly controlled test, did not present any serious difficulties. The judgements referring to correctness in the use of the pluperfect in the translation task were made by a linguistically competent native speaker of Swedish. This measure seemed necessary because translation as a way of collecting language samples has some drawbacks – any subtle change in the text brought about by alternative ways of expression may create an obligatory context for some other tense.

Overgeneralizations of the pluperfect were almost non-existent in the analysed material. Only two informants used the pluperfect in the context for the preterit and only once each.

4.4.2 Rank order list

As mentioned above, the first step in the preliminary statistical analysis was establishing the degree of correctness of the use of the pluperfect in obligatory contexts. Each of the contexts for the pluperfect was scored on a two point scale: the use of the pluperfect was coded as 1, the use of other tenses, if incorrect, was coded as 0. The figures were summed up and the rates of correct responses (the appropriate uses of the pluperfect) were calculated for each clause.

The next step in this statistical analysis was arranging the clauses in a sequence in decreasing order: from the clauses in which the pluperfect was used most often to the clauses in which the pluperfect was used least often. In this way, a rank order list based on accuracy rates was obtained (see Appendix 4). The rates of accuracy displayed a wide spread, with the highest value at 88 per cent
of correct responses and the lowest value at 9 per cent of correct responses, all the other values being fairly evenly distributed through the total range.

The result obtained in this statistical analysis, i.e. the wide and evenly distributed spread, was taken as an indication that a more advanced statistical analysis, namely, stepwise multiple regression, may also be worth performing on the figures obtained. The rank order list also turned out to be helpful in the final choice of the linguistic factors presumed to affect the use of the pluperfect. It was hypothesised that the syntactic, semantic and textual features characterising the clauses appearing at the top of the rank order list, i.e. in the first quarter, may, but do not necessarily have to, enhance the use of the pluperfect, i.e. constitute easy contexts. And conversely, it was hypothesised that some of the linguistic features characterising the clauses appearing at the bottom of the rank order list, i.e. in the fourth quarter, may, but do not necessarily have to, inhibit the use of the pluperfect, i.e. constitute difficult contexts for the pluperfect.

4.4.3 Stepwise multiple regression

Most of the acquisitional studies reviewed in the first chapter of this part of the thesis were limited in their methodology to analysing the influence of a single factor upon the variable use of a particular grammatical category.34 This method does not seem to be particularly revealing in an investigation of such a complex phenomenon as learners’ interlanguage. This method is particularly inadequate when the linguistic data to be analysed are collected with the help of a coherent text, where a great number of linguistic factors are at work at the same time.

The assumption taken in this analysis was that variation in the use of the pluperfect is subject to multiple and cross-cutting influences from the linguistic context. The term linguistic context is used in the present study with a broader meaning than in some

---

34 Bardovi-Harlig’s (1998) study of the combined effect of two factors, lexical aspectual class (actional meaning of verbs) and narrative structure, foreground vs. background, upon the distribution of temporal morphology was not published until after the present study was under way.
other studies, in which it was applied to the immediately preceding or the immediately following linguistic environment (Ellis 1994:135). Here, the term linguistic context covers a whole range of factors referring to different linguistic levels: the word level, the sentence level and the level of the text. It is assumed that different types of linguistic contexts may affect the accuracy in the use of the pluperfect in different ways – some particular linguistic features or combinations of features may enhance and some may inhibit the correct use of the pluperfect.

The inspiration for the choice of the linguistic factors which may account for different degrees of saliency in the contexts for the pluperfect came from three sources. One source of inspiration was previous research on the acquisition of temporality in L1 and L2, as reviewed in sections 3.1 and 3.2, respectively. Since very few of the studies reviewed addressed the acquisition of the pluperfect, the inspiration from this source was not sufficient.

The second source of inspiration consisted of observations made in foreign language classes. It is common knowledge among teachers of foreign languages that language learners may have more difficulties with some particular uses of a given structure than with other uses of the same structure, e.g. negation in subordinate clauses in Swedish is commonly known to be more difficult than the negation in main clauses. As far as the pluperfect is concerned, one of my observations was that the use of the pluperfect in subordinate clauses may be easier than the use of the pluperfect in main clauses. This seems to be true both for English and Swedish as a foreign language. For Swedish, this observation was confirmed experimentally by my pilot study (Zielonka 1995)

The third and most important source of inspiration for the choice of linguistic factors that may account for different degrees of difficulty in various contexts for the pluperfect was theoretical literature – general and language-specific descriptions of tense/aktionsart/aspect, the function of those grammatical categories in narrative texts, and, last but not least, the comparison of the temporal systems of Swedish and Polish.

An analysis of the effect of more than one factor upon the rate of accuracy requires the use of multivariate methods of data analysis. In agreement with the recommendations found in the literature on the application of statistics in linguistic research, the
method for this study, stepwise multiple regression analysis, was chosen on the advice of a statistician. Multiple regression analysis allows for an investigation of the relationship of the dependent variable with several independent variables and for an estimation of the amount of impact that each independent variable may have upon the dependent variable.

The dependent variable in this analysis is the proportion of correct responses to the total number of responses to each clause. The information about the number of total responses, V1, and about the number of correct responses, V2, for each clause is given in Appendix 4. The figure in cell 1 indicates the total number of responses for a particular clause, the figure in cell 2 indicates the number of correct responses for that particular clause.35

The independent variables hypothesised to affect the rate of accuracy in the use of the pluperfect are two non-linguistic factors and twelve linguistic factors, listed below and described in detail in their respective parts of this work (see Appendix 4, cells 3–18). The two non-linguistic factors are not the main objectives in this investigation. This analysis was necessitated by the claims of some language-acquisition researchers that rates of accuracy in learners’ linguistic output may be task-induced (Larsen-Freeman and Long 1991, Ellis 1994). The analysis of the effect of the two non-linguistic factors upon the use of the pluperfect was intended to show whether the factors connected with the design of the test may, to some degree, have affected the results.

The main objective of this study is the simultaneous effect of twelve linguistic factors upon the use of the pluperfect. The linguistic factors (the independent variables) are divided into three groups: group A, factors connected with the type of verbal indication of topic time, group B, factors referring to the semantics of the target verb, group C, miscellaneous factors.

The following non-linguistic and linguistic factors were chosen as the independent variables in the present study. (The labels in parentheses indicate the symbols used to indicate the variables in the remaining part of this work and in Appendix 4.)

35 The percentage values are in terms of proportions expressed as decimal values, e.g. 87 per cent is expressed as 0.87.
The non-linguistic factors

1. Type of task: gap-filling vs. translation (V3).
2. Type of response: perceived/recalled pluperfect clauses (V4) vs. elicited production of the pluperfect (V5) vs. transformations of other tenses into the pluperfect (V6).

The linguistic factors

Group A: Factors connected with the type of verbal indication of topic time
1. Location of the verb indicating topic time with reference to the target verb:
   a) intrasentential vs. intersentential indication of topic time (V8).
   b) indication of the topic time in the same and the adjacent clause vs. indication of topic time further away than in the same or the adjacent clause (V15).
2. Bounded vs. unbounded meaning of the verb indicating topic time (V13).
3. Multiple vs. single indications of topic time (V11).
4. Non-reported speech vs. reported speech (indication of topic time by verbs of speaking) (V7).

Group B: Factors referring to the semantics of the target verb
1. Bounded vs. unbounded meaning of the target verb (V12).
2. Resultative vs. non-resultative meaning of the target verb (V18).
3. Agentive vs. non-agentive meaning of the target verb (V16).

Group C: Miscellaneous factors
1. Function of the subordinate clauses in the text: specifying vs. constituting (V9).
2. Location of the time of action of the pluperfect clauses: outside vs. within the temporal frame of the narrative plot (V10).
3. Type of semantic relation between the clause containing the target verb and the clause containing the verb indicating topic time (or some other clause): causal vs. non-causal (V14).
4. Type of pluperfect: actional vs. statal (V17).
Each of the factors (variables) is defined and illustrated with examples in the respective sections in Chapter 6 (the non-linguistic factors) or Chapter 7 (the linguistic factors).

The classification of the linguistic material in terms of the factors constituting the independent variables in the multiple regression analysis is presented in Appendix 4. Almost all the variables in this analysis are binary, i.e. they have two values. For example, the variable *type of test* is split into two subgroups: *gap-filling* and translation. The respective subgroups are in the classification system coded as either number 1 or number 2. The adopted system of coding is in agreement with the assumed positive or negative effect of the respective factor upon the rate of accuracy in the use of the pluperfect. Number 1 indicates that the given variable was assumed to have a facilitative effect, i.e. constitute a favourable context for the pluperfect. Number 2 indicates that the given variable was assumed to have an inhibitive effect, i.e. constitute an unfavourable (or less favourable) context for the pluperfect.

There is one exception from the adopted system of coding. Two variables, V12 (actional meaning of the target verb) and V13 (actional meaning of the verb indicating topic time), involve the same grammatical category, *aktionsart*, i.e. bounded and unbounded verbs. In one case, boundedness is supposed to facilitate, and in the other to inhibit the use of the pluperfect. The coding for V12 was done in agreement with the assumptions about facilitative effect of the particular subgroup upon the use of the pluperfect: bounded verbs were coded as number 1 (facilitative effect) and unbounded as number 2 (inhibitive effect). For the sake of consistency in the coding of the same category, the coding for V13 was not done in agreement with the prediction for the effect of actional meaning of the verb indicating topic time upon the use of the pluperfect. Thus, number 2 in this particular case codes facilitative effect, and number 1 codes inhibitive effect. In this way bounded verbs are in both cases coded as 1 and unbounded verbs are in both cases coded as 2.

A somewhat different system of coding was also used with the variable *type of response*. This variable is not binary, i.e. it has not two but three values: perceived/recalled contexts, new contexts and transformations of other tenses into the pluperfect. The clauses occurring in the respective types of response are coded as
number 1 in the respective cells of the table, (the variables V4, V5, V6), while the remaining clauses, i.e. clauses not eligible for marking in the respective cell, are coded as 0. For example, in cell 4, perceived/recalled clauses, i.e. the clauses heard prior to the respective tasks, constituting V4 in this study, are coded as 1, whereas the remaining clauses are coded as 0. Similarly, other clauses not eligible for particular classifications, e.g. main clauses in the analysis of a possible effect of the type of subordinate clause upon the use of the pluperfect, V9, are marked with 0.
5 Results of stepwise multiple regression

In this chapter the general results of stepwise multiple regression are presented. This is done with the point of departure in the table showing the results of the stepwise multiple regression, i.e. the results are presented together with the explanations of the content of each of the columns of the table.

As mentioned previously, the statistical model in this study was a multiple linear regression model showing the simultaneous effect of the independent variables (each of the non-linguistic and linguistic factors) upon the dependent variable (the proportion of informants correctly supplying the pluperfect tense).

As far as the non-linguistic factors are concerned, the multiple regression procedure has shown that the results of the test may not have been affected by non-linguistic factors type of test and type of response. Neither of these two non-linguistic variables were found to have a statistically significant impact upon the use of the pluperfect in this model of stepwise multiple regression.

Table 6. Results of the stepwise multiple regression analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step</th>
<th>Variable entered</th>
<th>Variable removed</th>
<th>The sign of parameter estimate</th>
<th>Number in</th>
<th>Partial R^2</th>
<th>Model R^2</th>
<th>Prob&gt;F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>V8</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.4329</td>
<td>0.4329</td>
<td>0.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>V7</td>
<td>–</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.0640</td>
<td>0.4970</td>
<td>0.0182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>V16</td>
<td>–</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.0482</td>
<td>0.5451</td>
<td>0.0323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>V13</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.0466</td>
<td>0.5917</td>
<td>0.0283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>V9</td>
<td>–</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.0319</td>
<td>0.6236</td>
<td>0.0598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>V10</td>
<td>–</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0.0301</td>
<td>0.6537</td>
<td>0.0599</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>V7</td>
<td>–</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.0054</td>
<td>0.6433</td>
<td>0.4182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>V17</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0.0240</td>
<td>0.6723</td>
<td>0.0829</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
regression. The detailed discussion of these results is presented in Chapter 6.

As far as the linguistic factors are concerned, the procedure identified six out of the twelve linguistic factors as having a statistically significant impact upon the variable use of the pluperfect. The impact of the statistically significant variables upon the use of the pluperfect is presented in Table 6.

Columns 1, 2, 3 and 5 in the above table show which variable is included (entered) in the model or excluded (removed) from the model in each step. Consecutive steps are shown in column 1. The variables entered are shown in column 2. The first variable was chosen on the basis of the results of another statistical test (see below). The criterion for entering of the remaining variables is that the size of the increase of the explained variation of the dependent variable is statistically significant, given that previously included variable(s) is/are already in the model. Information about the removal of the variables from the model is shown in column 3 and column 5. A previously included variable may be removed from the model when its impact upon the explained variance becomes non-significant at a certain step.

Column 4 shows the kind of impact which the respective subgroups of the variables may have had upon the rate of correct answers. As mentioned in 4.4.3, each of the independent variables may have two values, coded as 1 and 2. The coding is done in agreement with the assumption about the respective effect of a given variable, facilitative (subgroup 1) or inhibitive (subgroup 2), with the exception for V13, where the order is reversed. If the linguistic feature is not eligible, the coding 0 is used. If the parameter estimate shown in column 4 for a specific variable has the negative sign, subgroup 1 has the positive impact upon the rate of correct answers. If the parameter estimate for a specific variable has the positive sign, subgroup 2 has the positive impact upon the rate of correct answers.

Column 6 shows the amount of partial effect attributable to each of the independent variables. Column 7 shows the level of explained variation in the correct use of the pluperfect for each step and for the whole model. The total variation explained in this model is a sum of the partial $R^2$ values in column 6. When a variable is removed this value is decreased. Column 8 gives the significance
level for the partial effect of each of the variables. In this type of
analysis the level of statistical significance may be 0.15.

In the first step of the analysis the most important variable is
chosen. This variable is V8, location of the verb indicating topic
time with reference to the target verb: intrasentential and inter-
sentential indication of topic time, and it explains 43.29 per cent
of the variation in the dependent variable. This order of entry was
justified by the result of an earlier statistical analysis, NPAIR1WAY
PROCEDURE, Wilcoxon Scores (Rank Sums) for the Variable ANDEL, in
which the effect of linguistic context was measured separately for
each factor. In this analysis variable V8 displayed the highest level
of statistical significance, Prob>0.0001. The parameter estimate for
V8 is negative. This means that the first subgroup intrasentential in-
dication of topic time has the positive effect upon the correct use of
the pluperfect. Presented in the order of inclusion in the multiple re-
gression model, and the decreasing level of statistically significant
partial effects, the remaining variables are: V16 – agentive vs. non-
agentive meaning of the target verb, V13 – bounded vs. unbounded
meaning of the target verb, V9 – function of the subordinate clause-
es in the text: specifying vs. constituting, V10 – location of the time
of action of pluperfect clauses outside vs. within the temporal frame
of the narrative plot and V17 – type of pluperfect: actional vs. statal.
V7 – non-reported speech vs. reported speech (indication of topic
time by verbs of speaking) was included in step 2 but rejected in
step 7. This means that the influence of V7 on the dependent vari-
able is lost in this step due to the fact that V7 and V10 (the variable
entered as step 6) are positively associated.

The sign of the parameter estimate is negative for V16, V9 and
V10 respectively. This means that the first subgroup of each of
those variables was found to have a positive effect upon the use of
the pluperfect tense. These results confirm the respective hy-
potheses. For V13 and V17 the sign of the parameter estimate is
positive. This means that the second subgroup of each of those
factors was found to have a positive effect upon the use of the plu-
perfect. As mentioned in 4.4.3, in the case of V13, the subgroups
were not coded in agreement with the assumption as to the effect
upon the rate of correct answers, but with a view to being consis-
tently marked in each of the two analyses involving this factor.
Thus, the positive sign of V13 means that indication of topic time
by an unbounded verb (coded as number 2) was found to facilitate the correct use of the pluperfect. This result confirms the hypothesis. In the case of V17 the positive sign indicates that the statal pluperfect has facilitative effect upon the correct use of the pluperfect. This result is contrary to expectations. The subgroup assumed to inhibit the use of the pluperfect (encoded as 2) was found to have a facilitative effect upon the correct use of the pluperfect.

The remaining linguistic variables tested in the model, V11 – multiple vs. single indication of topic time, V12 – actional meaning of the target verb: bounded vs. unbounded, V14 – type of semantic relation between the clause containing the target verb and the clause containing the verb indicating topic time (or some other clause): causal vs. non-causal, V18 – resultative vs. non-resultative meaning of the target verb, failed to display statistical significance. This means that no statistical relationship between the correct use of the pluperfect and the remaining linguistic factors was found in this model of statistical analysis.

The results of the stepwise multiple regression should, perhaps, be treated with a certain degree of caution. Application of advanced multivariate computer methods to language acquisition studies is a relatively new area of research methodology. This means that very few previous studies on which the design of this investigation could have been modelled were available. Some of the pioneer studies have phonology as the objective and thus are not directly applicable to my investigation. None of the very few advanced multivariate studies which have acquisition of morphology as their objective, e.g. Young (1988), present complete methodological information. Thus, the method chosen for my investigation was a kind of virgin soil.

The problems connected with the use of this statistical method are discussed in the final chapter of this work. The main value of this study seems to lie in suggesting a whole range of linguistic factors not considered by other second language acquisition researchers as plausible explanations for the variable use of the pluperfect and, what is more important, in grounding the hypotheses and the obtained empirical results in theoretical descriptions of language, i.e. my linguistically-grounded discussions about which linguistic factors and why may have affected (inhibited or facilitated) the correct use of the pluperfect.
6 Analysis of the effect of non-linguistic factors

Although the main issue of this study is an analysis of the effect of linguistic factors upon rates of accuracy in the use of the pluperfect, some attention has been devoted to possible effect of two non-linguistic factors upon accuracy rates. The two non-linguistic factors taken into consideration in this study, both referring to the design of the test, are, firstly, type of task: gap-filling vs. translation V3; and secondly, type of response: perception/recall of the pluperfect V4, transformations of tenses V6, and elicited production of the pluperfect V5.

Each of the two non-linguistic factors is discussed in a separate section. Each section contains a description of the respective non-linguistic variable, hypotheses as to which of the sub-groups may have affected the use of the pluperfect and why, the results of the stepwise multiple regression and a discussion. In the final section, the results of the two analyses of the effect of the non-linguistic factors upon the correct use of the pluperfect are summarised and general conclusions are presented.

6.1 The factor type of task: (V3)

As mentioned before and described in detail in 4.3, two types of gap-filling tasks (gap-filling tasks type A and gap-filling task type B) and a translation task were used to collect the linguistic material for this study. Gap-filling tasks type A involved inserting the missing verbs in the proper verb form into the gaps in the text (see Appendix 2, Test 1, Test 2 and Test 3). Gap-filling task type B was slightly more difficult. It involved filling in gaps in the text with the words given in brackets and at the same time arranging the words in brackets in the correct order (see Appendix 2, Test 4). The translation task involved translation of a Polish text into Swedish (see Appendix 3).
6.1.1 Hypothesis

Some second- and foreign-language researchers, e.g. Larsen-Freeman (1991) and Ellis (1994), claim that the accuracy in the application of grammatical rules may depend on the type of task. The analysis of the effect of the non-linguistic factor type of task: gap-filling vs. translation, V3, was to show whether, and to what degree, the use of the pluperfect in this study may have been task-induced, i.e. more accurate (or less accurate) in one type of task than the other.

The prediction in this analysis was that the use of the pluperfect in the translation task may be less accurate (more difficult) than in the gap-filling tasks. The gap-filling tasks involved mainly filling in gaps in the text with verbs in the proper tense form. In those tasks the learners' conscious attention was focused solely on the correct use of tenses or, as was the case in gap filling test number four, on the correct use of tenses and the correct word order (see Appendix 2, Test 4). In the translation test the learners were required to display their overall knowledge of Swedish. They were to supply all the vocabulary items, each of them in a correct grammatical form, and to put the vocabulary items into sentences. Since they are more focused on conveying the message than gap-filling tasks, translation tasks are more reminiscent of spontaneous use of language. Thus, it seemed plausible to assume that the translation task would be more difficult than the gap-filling tasks, i.e. that the use of the pluperfect in a translation task would be less accurate.

Another basis for the prediction that the use of the pluperfect in the translation task might be less accurate than the use of the pluperfect in the gap-filling tasks was my earlier observation that translation tasks usually show a higher number of mistakes traceable to transfer from the learners’ native language than other types of tasks. Since Polish practically does not have the pluperfect, and the form called the past tense is used in clauses describing situations that are anterior in relation to other past situations (see 2.1.4), it was expected that in the translation task the learners might fall back on their native language, and more often erroneously use the preterit in the pluperfect contexts than in the gap-filling tasks.
6.1.2 Results and discussion

The assumption that the use of the pluperfect in the translation task would be less correct than the use of the pluperfect in the gap-filling tasks was not confirmed by the results of the statistical analysis. The variable *type of task: gap-filling vs. translation* (39 pluperfect clauses occurring in the gap-filling tasks and 21 pluperfect clauses occurring in the translation) failed to display a statistically significant partial effect in this model of stepwise multiple regression. This result suggests that the use of the pluperfect in this study may have not been affected by the factor connected with the design of the test: the type of task to be performed, *gap filling* or *translation*. Thus, some other factors, factors working across the type of task to be performed, seem to account for the variable use of the pluperfect.

6.2 The factor *type of response*: (V4), (V5), (V6)

As mentioned before and described in detail in 4.3, the way of eliciting language samples involved three different types of response: perception/recall of pluperfect forms, transformations of preterit and perfect clauses into pluperfect clauses and elicited production of the pluperfect. The analysis of the effect of the non-linguistic factor *type of response* involves the effect of each of the three different types of response upon the correct use of the pluperfect in this study.

The first type of response, V4, involves perception/recall of verbs in the pluperfect. The pluperfect clauses eligible for this type of analysis appeared in the original texts that were read twice to the informants, i.e. the informants could hear them just before they started to perform gap-filling tasks. The same clauses, with a gap for the tense form, also appeared in the texts on the test sheets, and the task of the informants was to supply the missing verbs in the pluperfect in the gaps. The purpose of this part of the study was to make some preliminary observations as to whether the informants would perceive the pluperfect forms in the texts presented to them, and recall these forms when filling in the gaps for the verbal form in the sentences on the test sheets.
Four of the clauses, two main and two subordinate clauses, occurred at exactly the same place in the texts on the test sheets as in the original texts read twice to the informants prior to the respective gap-filling tasks. The position of the fifth clause in the text (a main clause) was changed. The pluperfect clause opening the fable *Gamle mannen och döden* ‘The old man and Death’ in the original text was placed as the second clause in the text on the test sheet (see Appendix 2 Test 3). This measure was taken to prevent possible confusion caused by the fact that the learners may not have been acquainted with the rule allowing for the use of the pluperfect in sentences opening narrative texts.

The second type of response, V5, involves elicited production of the pluperfect. V5 involves the clauses admitting the pluperfect in which the informants were to recognise the contexts for the pluperfect by themselves, i.e. without such facilitative measures as hearing the pluperfect clause. There are 38 clauses of this type. Those clauses occur in some of the gap-filling tasks and in the translation. Those clauses were to constitute the main bulk of the linguistic material in this study.

The third type of response, V6, involves transformations of some perfect and preterit clauses into pluperfect clauses. The perfect and the preterit clauses to be transformed into the pluperfect appeared in the original texts presented orally to the informants prior to the test, and/or in the texts on the test sheets. Similar clauses with gaps for verbal forms appeared in the texts on the test sheets, this time in the contexts demanding the use of the pluperfect, i.e. some changes had been made in the text, thereby necessitating the use of the pluperfect. The analysed linguistic material contained seven clauses of this type, all of them occurring in the gap-filling tasks. Four of the clauses, apart from being heard, also appeared in the texts on the test sheets, i.e. the informants could see those clauses while performing the task.

6.2.1 Hypothesis

The clauses involving perception/recall of the pluperfect and transformations of the preterit and perfect clauses into the pluperfect clauses are somewhat unevenly distributed in the analysed linguistic material. As mentioned before, this is due to the fact that
those clauses were not planned to constitute the main bulk of the
analysis, but only to allow for some preliminary observations re-
ferring to the effect of different types of response upon the accu-
rracy in the use of the pluperfect.

Clark and Stafford (1969) found that native speakers’ recall of
tenses in single clauses, i.e. clauses not forming part of a coher-
ent text, was somehow defective – temporal values of the verbs
were simplified in recall. Memory loss involved the use of se-
mantically simpler (unmarked) forms instead of more complex
(marked) ones. Thus, the present continuous was in many cases
recalled as the simple present and the perfect tenses as non-perfect
tenses, i.e. the pluperfect was frequently recalled as the simple past.
Harris and Brewer (1973) carried out a similar experiment with the
same clauses, half of them having temporal adverbs. They found
that the loss of memory for tense in Clark and Stafford's (1969)
experiment was caused by lack of temporal deictic context. Or in
other words, Harris and Brewer’s (1973) finding was that with-
out a temporal frame tenses were relatively meaningless for their
informants.

Since all the pluperfect clauses in my study occurred in a coher-
ent text, i.e. had a temporal deictic context, and since recall of short
parts of texts involving particular grammatical structures is a com-
mon practice in foreign language classes, the prediction in this
analysis was that the pluperfect forms would be perceived/rec-
called with a relatively high and relatively consistent level of ac-
curacy. Substantial differences in the rates of accuracy in the use
of the pluperfect in the perceived/recalled clauses could suggest
that some contexts for the pluperfect may be easier to
perceive/recall than others.

The analysis of the rates of accuracy in the use of the pluper-
fect in clauses that are transformations of preterit and perfect
clauses into pluperfect clauses was designed to allow for some
preliminary observations concerning the effect of formal instruc-
tion upon language learning. Transformations of preterit and
perfect clauses into pluperfect clauses, as necessitated by some
changes in the context, are popular types of exercises when prac-
ticing the pluperfect in foreign language classrooms (form-focused
practice). These types of tasks are often performed in English class-
es, the first foreign language of the informants, and in Swedish
classes, the second foreign language of the informants. The prediction for this type of response was that the use of the pluperfect in the sentences strongly reminiscent of the popular form-focused grammar practice might be more accurate than in the sentences involving more spontaneous production of the pluperfect, i.e. the elicited production.

The results of research into the effect of formal instruction (grammar teaching) upon the accuracy with which learners use specific linguistic structures are not unequivocal. Some researchers cited by Ellis (1994:617–636) claim that the effects of formal instruction may be limited, i.e. that learners do not learn what they are taught, but acquire particular grammatical structures gradually (pass through various developmental stages) and in a definite natural order. The result contrary to the expected (no statistically significant difference in the accuracy rates between the transformed clauses and the rest of the material) would confirm Bardovi-Harlig’s (1994) observation that the accurate use of the pluperfect may not be easily affected by formal instruction (see 3.2).

The remaining clauses involved elicited production of the pluperfect. The prediction for this type of response (elicted production without any facilitative measures) was that the accuracy in the use of the pluperfect would be generally lower, and the use of the pluperfect will be more variable than in the remaining two types of responses perception/recall and transformation. The analysis of the use of the pluperfect in those clauses was to constitute the main part of the study, i.e. was to supply an answer to the research question as to whether some contexts for the pluperfect are relatively easy and others relatively difficult and establish some contexts as relatively easy and some as relatively difficult for the Polish learners of Swedish as a foreign language.

6.2.2 Results and discussion

Just as for the effect of the first non-linguistic variable, type of task, the second non-linguistic variable, type of response, with 5 perceived/recalled clauses, 7 elicited clauses and 38 new clauses, did not display a partial effect in this model of stepwise multiple regression – no statistically significant difference in the use of the
pluperfect across different types of responses: perception/recall, elicited production and transformations of the preterit and the perfect into the pluperfect was found. This result seems to suggest that the use of the pluperfect in this study may not have been dependent on the type of response.

Although statistically non-significant, the results of the mini-test involving perception/recall of the pluperfect seem to be interesting and are worth further comment. The assumption that the rate of accuracy in the use of the pluperfect in the perceived/recalled contexts may be generally higher and more consistent than in new contexts was not confirmed. The pluperfect was recalled with highly variable degrees of accuracy. Differences in the rates of accuracy for particular pluperfect clauses can be seen in Table 7. The clauses involved in this task can be seen in Appendix 4, V4, clauses marked with the number 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Rank order</th>
<th>Correct answers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>87%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The substantial differences in the use of the pluperfect in the perceived/recalled clauses shown in the above table may be taken as a suggestion that some contexts for the pluperfect may be much easier to perceive/recall than others.

Studying language production of a natural learner, Schmidt and Frota (1986) found some evidence for a close connection between noticing grammatical forms in the input and their emergence in production. They made the observation that the informant in their study produced only those forms which he had noticed (consciously attended to) in the interactional input, i.e. that only the noticed input may be turned into intake. Applied to my research,
this observation may, perhaps, allow for the suggestion that the contexts for the pluperfect which are difficult to perceive/recall may also be difficult in elicited and spontaneous production, i.e. the pluperfect will emerge rather late in those contexts. Similarly, the contexts for the pluperfect which are relatively easy to perceive/recall may also be relatively easy in elicited and spontaneous production, i.e. the pluperfect will emerge quite early in those contexts.

6.3 The effect of non-linguistic factors: summary of results

General conclusions that can be drawn from the analyses of the effect of the two non-linguistic factors, type of task and type of response, upon the use of the pluperfect are that in this study the use of the pluperfect may not have been affected by the factors connected with the design of the test and not directly linked to popular teaching techniques.

As far as the transformations of the preterit and the perfect into the pluperfect are concerned, the result of the analysis seems to suggest that the effect of form-focused instruction may be limited. The learners seem to be able to make the necessary transformations of tenses in controlled language production (form-focused grammar practice on individual clauses), but they do not follow transformation rules in less controlled language production involving clauses in a longer text. This result seems to be in agreement with Bardovi-Harlig’s (1994) claims about the limited effect of instruction upon the use of the pluperfect if the requisite developmental stages have not been reached.

The results of both analyses, the analysis of the effect of the type of task and the analysis of the effect of the type of response upon the use of the pluperfect, seem to suggest that in their use of the pluperfect the informants may have been guided by some factors which worked across the design of the test. In agreement with the claim made by Ellis (1994:143), i.e. that variability which arises as the result of linguistic context does not appear to be strongly task-induced, it seems possible to assume that the factors affecting the use of the pluperfect in all types of sentences may have involved some features of linguistic context.
Analysis of the effect of linguistic factors upon variable use of the pluperfect

Earlier research on the acquisition of tenses, as reviewed in 3.1 and 3.2, shows that a whole range of linguistic factors referring to different levels of the language (word level, sentence level, text level) may affect the correct use of tenses. In this study, the results of earlier research on the acquisition of tenses other than the pluperfect were extended to the acquisition of the pluperfect. In addition, a whole range of new factors never discussed by other researchers were taken into consideration. Altogether, twelve linguistic factors (independent variables) were hypothesised to affect the correct use of the pluperfect. Each of the independent variables is binary, i.e. it has two values.

As outlined earlier (see 4.4.3), the linguistic factors hypothesised to affect the use of the pluperfect are divided into three groups: group A (factors connected with the type of verbal indication of topic time); group B (factors referring to the semantics of the target verb) and group C (miscellaneous factors). Each group of factors is discussed in a separate section.

Each section contains the following information: presentation and exemplification of the respective factor, the hypothesis as to which of the two subgroups of the given factor, and why, may have had facilitative or inhibitive effect upon the correct use of the pluperfect, information about classification problems if any, the result of the respective analysis, and in some cases, i.e. when the results demanded it, comments on the results obtained.

Almost all of these hypotheses are grounded in theoretical linguistic literature, i.e. the hypotheses are presented in the form of my linguistically-grounded discussions as to which of the two values of the factors assumed to affect the use of the pluperfect may have facilitative or inhibitive effect upon the accurate use of the pluperfect, and why. Those linguistically-grounded discussions constitute the most important part of this study, an attempt
at answering two of the research questions raised in this thesis:
which linguistic factors may account for different degrees of dif-
ficulty in the application of the pluperfect rule, and why.

7.1 Factors connected with the type of verbal indication of topic time

This section contains an analysis of the effect that different types of verbal indication of topic time may have upon the accurate use of the pluperfect, i.e. the linguistic factors of Group A. The following types of verbal indication (the independent variables in the statistical analysis) are taken into consideration: location of the verb indicating topic time, i.e. the distance between the verb indicating topic time and the target verb, measured in two different ways: intersential vs. intrasentential location of the verb indicating topic time, V8, and location of the verb indicating topic time in the same or in the adjacent clause vs. location of the verb indicating topic time further away than in the adjacent clause, V15; bounded vs. bounded meaning (aktionsart) of the verb indicating topic time, V13; multiple vs. single indication of topic time, V11; and non-reported speech vs. reported speech (indication of topic time by verbs of speaking), V7. Altogether there are four different factors (but five variables) in this group. The inspiration for the choice of the factors came from the linguistic literature reviewed in the theoretical part of my work, from the study on the acquisition of tense, Bardovi-Harlig (1994), and from my pilot study, Zielonka (1995).

7.1.1 Location of the verb indicating topic time with reference to the target verb: (V8) and (V15)

In the review of the theoretical descriptions of tense in Chapter 2, reference was made to the third temporal parameter labelled differently in different theories: the point of reference (PR) in Reichenbach (1944), the topic time (TT) in Klein (1994) and Teleman et al. (1999), and the mediating element (FIX) in Christensen (1997). This parameter seems to be of great importance in accounting for differences in the meaning of the preterit, the perfect and the pluperfect.
As far as the pluperfect is concerned, the point of reference or the topic time (in the remaining part of this work the term topic time will be used) is neither simultaneous with the moment of speech (as is the case with the perfect), nor simultaneous with the time of action denoted by the verb (as is the case with the preterit), but is located in the past, i.e. before the moment of speech and, with some exceptions, after the time of action. It may be indicated either by means of an explicit specification of past time, i.e. a temporal adverb, or by a verb in the preterit. In the present study only verbal indication of topic time is taken into consideration.

The general principle in this study, which is in agreement with the view presented by Teleman et al. (1999:IV:225), is that the preterit verb immediately preceding a pluperfect clause indicates topic time in narrative texts, i.e. that topic time is established anaphorically.

Verbs indicating topic time to which pluperfect clauses are related may be located either intrasententially or intersententially. In the first case, verbs indicating topic time are located in the same sentence as the target verb, and irrespective of the number of words separating the target verb from the verb indicating topic time, the distance between the verb indicating topic time and the target verb is regarded as short. Intrasentential position of the verb indicating topic time, marked with italics, is illustrated in example (44).

(44) Jag klarade inträdesprovet eftersom jag hade studerat engelska i många år. ‘I passed the entrance exam because I had studied English for many years.’

In the second case, the verb indicating topic time is located either in the adjacent sentence or further away than in the adjacent sentence. Irrespective of the number of words separating the verb indicating topic time and the target verb, the distance between the verb indicating topic time and the target verb is regarded as long. In the latter case, the verb indicating topic time may be separated from the target verb by sentences in tense forms other than the preterit. In the texts used to collect language samples in this study, the verb indicating topic time was in some cases separated from the target verb by one or several pluperfect sentences, by a present tense sentence and, in one case, by a preterit clause.
which did not indicate topic time for the following pluperfect clause. The first type of intersentential indication of topic time, indication of topic time located in the adjacent sentence, is illustrated in example (45). The verb indicating topic time is marked in italics.

(45) Han var hungrig. Han hade inte ätit någon mat på tre dagar. 'He was hungry. He had not eaten any food for three days'.

The second type of intersentential indication of topic time, the verb indicating topic time being located further away than in the adjacent sentence, is illustrated in example (46). As above, the verb indicating topic time is marked in italics.

(46) Men vem var mannen som satt i fönstret? Han såg ut precis som ägaren. Nu vet jag! De hade satt en skyltdocka i fönstret. 'But who was the man in the window? He looked exactly like the owner. Now I know! They had put a mannequin in the window.'

The possible effect of location of the preterit verb indicating topic time in relation to the target verb was measured in two different ways. The first way, V8, involved grouping the clauses with intrasentential indication of topic time (the verb indicating topic time in the same sentence as the target verb) as against the clauses with intersentential indication of topic time (the verb indicating topic time in the adjacent sentence or further away than the adjacent sentence). In my material the intrasentential and intersentential location of topic time coincides with the distinction between the subordinate and the main clauses. This means that in the case of the preposed causal subordinate clause, topic time is assumed to be indicated by the verb in the following clause, and not by the preceding verb (see Appendix 3, clause 17).36

36 There seems to be some disagreement as to which verb, the preceding or the following, indicates the topic time (the time of orientation). Prof. Hellberg (personal communication) claims that topic time is always indicated by the preceding preterit verb. Some British scholars, such as Thomson and Martinet (1985), Declerck (1991), Jackson (1990) and Aitken (1992), admit the possibility of the indication of the time of orientation (topic time) for some types of subordinate pluperfect clauses (e.g. preposed causal clauses) by the verb in the preterit following the pluperfect clause.
The second way of measuring the effect of location of the verb indicating topic time in relation to the target verb, V15, involved the clauses with the verb indicating topic time located in the same or in the adjacent sentence as opposed to the clauses with the verb indicating topic time located further away than in the same or in the adjacent sentence. It was left open which of the two ways of measuring the distance between the indication of topic time and the target verb may best confirm the hypothesis that the distance between the verb indicating topic time and the target verb may be a factor affecting the correct use of the pluperfect.  

7.1.1 Hypothesis

Polish does not have the pluperfect, so Polish learners of Swedish must learn to recognise the contexts for the pluperfect and to mark those meanings with the respective verbal morphology (the past auxiliary verb and the supine). Verbal indication of topic time may be of great importance in the recognition of the contexts for the pluperfect, i.e. in the process of learning. It seems possible that some types of verbal indication of topic time may facilitate, and some may inhibit the recognition of the contexts for the pluperfect.

The assumption that the location of the verb indicating topic time in relation to the target verb, i.e. the distance between the verb indicating topic time and the target verb, may be of importance in the process of the acquisition of the pluperfect was not only based on linguistically-grounded discussions and classroom observations, but also on my own empirical study, Zielonka (1995), carried out with a separate group of Polish informants. The results of that study provided some evidence that the subordinate clauses may enhance and the main clauses may inhibit the correct use of the pluperfect. Since in the subordinate clauses topic time is

37 In this case, Prof. Hellberg’s view as to which verb, the preceding or the following, indicates topic time for a preposed causal clause is accepted. In consequence, one of the clauses has a different indication of topic time in each of the analyses (see Appendix 4, clause 1). A re-analysis with the classification of this sentence in agreement with the claims of the British scholars did not change the results in this model of the stepwise multiple regression.
most often indicated by a verb located in the same sentence (i.e. the distance between the verb indicating topic time and the target verb is short), but in main clauses topic time is most often indicated by a verb located in the adjacent sentence (i.e. the distance between the verb indicating topic time and the target verb is long), the results of the study were interpreted as suggesting that the location of the verb indicating topic time (i.e. the distance between the indication of topic time and the target verb) may be a factor affecting the correct use of the pluperfect.

As mentioned earlier, the distance between the verb indicating topic time and the target verb was measured in the present study in two different ways. The prediction in this analysis was that the contexts for the pluperfect in which the distance between the verb indicating topic time and the target verb is short, i.e. in which the verb indicating topic time is located either intrasententially or in the adjacent sentence (vs. further away than the same or the adjacent sentence), may be easier than the contexts in which the distance between the indication of topic time and the target verb is long, i.e. the verb indicating topic time is located intersententially, either in the adjacent sentence (vs. the same sentence), or further away than the adjacent sentence (vs. the adjacent sentence). A plausible explanation of this phenomenon may be that the ability to establish temporal relations among events develops only gradually. At the initial stages the learners can establish temporal relations among only those events which are encoded in a single sentence, or possibly in two adjacent sentences. The ability to establish temporal relations in longer parts of the text, or the whole text, develops later.

Since the intrasentential/intersentential indication of topic time overlaps with the subordinate and the main clauses, an alternative explanation for the statistically significant partial effect of V8 may also be offered. The latter explanation involves semantico-syntactic features of the subordinate clauses.

Subordinate clauses are generally regarded as being useful devices for expressing temporal relations. Reinhart (1984:781) claims that subordination of clauses allows us to avoid the overlap between the order of events in the depicted world and the order of presentation of those events in the text, a lengthy and very monotonous presentation of events in narratives.
A similar claim concerning three types of the subordinate clauses – relative clauses, causal clauses (with overt marking of the causal relation by means of the adverb because) and nominal subordinate clauses – was made by Bardovi-Harlig (1994). According to Bardovi-Harlig (1994), those three types of clauses are devices expressing reverse-order reports, i.e. marking that a past event mentioned later preceded the past event mentioned earlier. Bardovi-Harlig’s (1994) claim was made on the basis of two studies. The first study involved assessments of the degree of communicative success displayed by the three types of subordinate clauses as expressions of anteriority, made by a group of native-speakers of English consisting of 17 experienced teachers of English as a foreign language. The second study was a concept-oriented study of the way in which reverse-order reports were expressed by learners of English as a foreign language in their spontaneous language production.

As far as the native speakers were concerned, Bardovi-Harlig (1994) found that the syntactico-semantic ways of expressing reverse-order reports used in the learners’ interlanguage, i.e. causal, relative and complement subordinate clauses without the target-like tense contrast (the preterit contrasted with the pluperfect), are communicatively successful ways of expressing temporal subordination, i.e. the anteriority of one event in relation to another. Each of the three types of clauses was to be evaluated by the informants as Yes (good), OK (I prefer something else but I would not correct it) or No (unacceptable). Causal clauses signalled by the adverb “because” showed the highest total acceptability rating, 91 per cent. The total acceptability rating for relative clauses was 67 per cent, and for complement clauses 58 per cent. These results suggest that the actual syntactico-semantic structure of the three types of clauses gives some clues about the temporal order of events.

A similar observation involving one type of the clauses analysed by Bardovi-Harlig (1994), namely, complement clauses, was made about Polish by Laskowski (1998:175), on purely theoretical...
grounds. According to Laskowski, precedence is typically expressed in Polish by past temporal morphemes in the secondary function (relative tense) of the past tense, i.e. in clauses that are obligatory complements to matrix clauses of the type wiedzieć, 'know' słyszeć, 'hear', mówić, 'say' etc. (see 2.1.4).

As regards learners of English as a foreign language, Bardovi-Harlig (1994) found that before the learners were able to use morphological means as expressions of reverse-order reports (native-like or non-native-like tense contrast), they relied on the meaning of the syntactico-semantic structures of subordinate causal, relative and nominal clauses as expressions of reverse-order reports (see 3.2).

The results of both studies seem to indicate that relative, causal and nominal subordinate clauses may be regarded as the contexts in which the use of the pluperfect is “redundant”, i.e. the temporal order of events in those three types of subordinate clauses can actually be inferred from the syntactico-semantic structure of those clauses. By stating that high acceptability of other linguistic devices than the pluperfect as expressions of reverse-order reports may explain the late acquisition of this tense, Bardovi-Harlig (1994) seems to be a proponent of the functional hypothesis. The functional hypothesis, advanced with reference to plural marking by Kiparsky (1972) and Poplack (1980b), states that communicative “redundancy” – the possibility of retrieving the necessary information from some other part of a structure than grammatical morphemes – inhibits the morphological marking of plurality. Young (1988) reversed the claim. He assumed that “redundancy” of plural markers does not inhibit but rather may enhance their correct use.

Extended to the use of the pluperfect, the claim that “redundancy” of a grammatical morpheme may enhance its correct use seems to allow for the suggestion that by giving some clues about the order of events, relative, causal and complement clauses may enhance rather than inhibit the use of the pluperfect. Bardovi-Harlig’s (1994:274) claims that the ability to express reverse order reports “precedes the acquisition of the pluperfect” and that the pluperfect “moves into an established semantic environment”, seem to support my assumption that “redundancy” of contexts may enhance the correct use of the pluperfect.
7.1.1.2 Results and discussion

Statistical analysis of the material (21 clauses with intrasentential and 29 clauses with intersentential indication of topic time) clearly confirmed the hypothesis that the linguistic factor location of the verb indicating topic time, i.e. the distance between the verb indicating topic time and the target verb, may facilitate the correct use of the pluperfect.

Of the two ways of measuring the distance between the indication of topic time and the target verb, the one distinguishing between the intrasentential and the intersentential position of the indication of topic time (the subordinate and the main clause) turned out to yield statistically significant result in this model of stepwise multiple regression. The variable intrasentential/intersentential indication of topic time was selected by the multiple regression procedure as the topmost variable, displaying the strongest partial effect: 0.4329 with p = 0.0001. This result means that 43 per cent of the total variation in the dependent variable (the proportion of students giving correct answers) can be explained by the variable intrasentential/intersentential indication of topic time. The negative sign of the parameter estimate indicates that the clauses having intersentential location of topic time (the main clauses) turned out to be less favourable contexts for the pluperfect than the clauses having intrasentential indication of topic time (the subordinate clauses).

When interpreted in terms of the functional hypothesis, the result of the statistical analysis of the effect that the intrasentential/intersentential indication of topic time may have upon the use of the pluperfect seems to suggest that “redundancy” of the pluperfect form, i.e. the possibility of retrieving information about the temporal order of events from the syntactico-semantic structure of relative, causal and complement clauses, may facilitate the use of the pluperfect. It also seems reasonable to assume that the two features of the linguistic context, i.e. short distance between the verb indicating topic time and the target verb and communicative “redundancy” of the pluperfect in the subordinate clauses, may work in an additive way, i.e. both features may facilitate the use of this tense. The assumed collaboration of the two linguistic factors may, perhaps, explain the particularly strong partial effect of V8 in this analysis.
7.1.2 Bounded vs. unbounded meaning of the verb indicating topic time: (V13)

The four types of actional meanings of verbs (aktionsart) usually referred to in linguistic literature, as well as some controversies surrounding the definitions and the classifications of actional meanings, have already been presented in the theoretical part of my work (see 2.2). In this section, reference is only made to two types, which, according to Teleman et al. (1999:IV:326) are the most important ones, bounded and unbounded. The distinctions between states and unbounded processes, and between bounded processes and punctual events are not considered here.

The approach to actional meanings of verbs taken in the present study is in agreement with the definition formulated by Teleman et al. (1999:IV:326) (see 2.2.2). The distinction between bounded and unbounded aktionsart is determined by means of a compatibility test: a bounded aktionsart is compatible with the adverbial expression of completion på en timme ‘in an hour’, while an unbounded aktionsart is compatible with the adverbial expression of duration i en timme ‘for an hour’. A sentence with a bounded verb indicating topic time (the verb in italics) is given as example (47), below:

(47) Jag klarade inträdesprovet ganska bra eftersom jag hade läst engelska i många år. ‘I managed to pass the entrance exam because I had studied English for many years.’

A sentence with an unbounded verb indicating topic time (the verb in italics) is given as example (48):
7.1 Factors connected with the type of verbal indication...

(48) [...] och inne i hålet stod en säck fylld med kött, ost och bröd som några herdar hade gömt där. ‘[…] and in the hole there was a bag filled with meat, cheese and bread, which some shepherds had hidden there.’

7.1.2.1 Hypothesis

The hypothesis in this analysis was that unbounded verbs indicating topic time may constitute more favourable contexts for the pluperfect than bounded verbs. This hypothesis was not based on earlier research carried out by other researchers, nor by my own research, but it was thoroughly motivated by linguistic literature on the structure of narrative discourse in terms of background/foreground and in the linguistic literature on tense and aspect in Russian and Polish (see 2.1.4).

As mentioned earlier (see 3.2), narrative discourse is traditionally described as composed of two parts: the foreground and the background. The foreground is defined as relating main narrative events (the narrative skeleton), and as consisting of clauses which move the narrative time forward, i.e. events often belonging to the main temporal axis of the plot. The background is defined as supplying supportive material necessary for the interpretation of the main events, and as consisting of clauses which do not move the narrative time forward (Reinhart 1984). In cases where background clauses are temporally ordered, e.g. flashbacks or subplots, they are located on a different time axis than the foreground. Foreground and background events are illustrated in (49) below, with an excerpt taken from one of the texts used to collect the linguistic material for this study. Foreground events are marked with the letter F, background events are marked with the letter B.

(49) Två vänner vandrade i skogen när en björn kom lufsande mot dem. En av männen klättrade blixtsnabbt upp i första bästa träd. Den

39 Since Telemen et al. (1999:1:155) claim that aspect is merely another term for aktionsart, it may just as well be claimed that the correct use of the pluperfect may be affected by the aspectual meaning of the target verb.
Two friends were walking in the forest when a bear lumbered toward them. One of the men swiftly climbed up the nearest tree. The other man threw himself to the ground. He lay motionless, pretending to be dead.

Many researchers claim that the foreground/background contrast is a universal, having its origin in cognitive properties of the human mind. Reinhart (1984:787–788) claims that the distinction between the foreground and the background is the linguistic counterpart of a similar distinction between figure and ground proposed in the gestalt theory of perception. Spatial organisation of the visual field involves figure-ground relation. In case of, e.g. a book lying on the table, the figure (a book) is perceived as lying on the ground (the table). We do not see the part of the table under the book, but yet we “interpret the background as continuing ‘under’ the figure”. According to Reinhart (1984:787–788), a similar description may, to some extent, hold for the foreground and the background in narrative texts – background events may be perceived as continuing to exist while foreground events take place.

Many researchers of narrative discourse – Hopper (1979a, 1979b), Wallace (1982), Reinhart (1984), and for Russian, Forsyth (1970) and Chvany (1990), to name only a few – claim that the foreground/background distinction has special linguistic markers. One such marker is the aspectual meaning of verbs: the perfective (most often bounded) and the imperfective (most often unbounded). The bounded/perfective verbs (clauses) tend to

---

40 There seems to be some disagreement as to what kind of meaning is taken as the linguistic marker of the background and foreground. Some authors use the term aspectual meaning. Teleman et al. (1999) use the terms bounded and unbounded aktionsarter when discussing movement of the narrative time. Since, with one exception, aspectual and actional meanings of the verbs in my material overlap, terminological issues are here of minor importance.
form the foreground, the unbounded/imperfective verbs (clauses) tend to form the background in narrative texts.\textsuperscript{41}

According to Reinhart (1984:804), the relationship between grounding and actional meaning of verbs may be explained by the size principle, which states that "other things being equal, it is easier to identify the smaller areas as figures (foreground) and the larger as background". This principle is, according to Reinhart (1984:804), reflected in the punctuality of events: "the punctual event ‘occupies’ a smaller amount of time than the durative event". I have extended this principle from punctual verbs to bounded processes (perfective clauses).

The pluperfect is described by Teleman et al. (1999:IV:225) as retaining the topic time of the preceding clause. It seems possible to assume that the contexts in which the pluperfect retains the topic time indicated by unbounded verbs may enhance, while the contexts in which the pluperfect retains the topic time of bounded verbs may inhibit its correct use. The former type of context may facilitate the use of the pluperfect, because some information about the temporal relation of events may be retrieved from the temporal structure of the text. Verbal indications of the topic time by unbounded verbs most often belong to the narrative background, i.e. the event encoded by an unbounded verb indicating topic time is on a different temporal axis than the main narrative events. Background events continue to exist and occupy larger amounts of the narrative time than foreground events. The latter type of contexts, i.e. the contexts in which the pluperfect clause retains the topic time indicated by a bounded or punctual verb, may inhibit the use of the pluperfect, because in this case the event usually is on the same temporal axis as other main events, it does not last (it is presented as finished), and it takes a smaller amount of the narrative time.

The hypothesis that the contexts in which the pluperfect retains the topic time indicated by unbounded verbs may be more favourable than the contexts in which the pluperfect retains the

\textsuperscript{41} There may be some exceptions to this rule. In some types of texts states and activities may also be presented as sequential, e.g. First he stood and looked at the sea for a long time. Then he sat on a bench and smoked cigarettes.
topic time indicated by bounded verb derives from the linguistic literature on the Slavic aspect. Forsyth (1970:65) claims that the contrast of imperfective and perfective preterit verbs may, in some cases, mark the temporal order of events.\footnote{This statement is made about Russian but it is also true about Polish.} The contrast of verbs with different aspectual meanings often implies that the action denoted by the perfective verb was already over, while the action denoted by the imperfective verb was still going on. According to Forsyth (1970:65), the perfective aspect in such collocations may be equivalent in meaning to the pluperfect in English. This may mean that the information about the temporal order of events may in some cases be retrieved from the contrast of the meaning of the verbs. A similar observation as to the way in which temporal order of events is in some cases marked in Polish was made by Laskowski (1998). Laskowski (1998:175–176) claims that in dependent clauses introduced with a certain type of verbs, past temporal morphemes may function as indicators of relative tenses, with past tense forms of verbs indicating anterior events. Some of the dependent clauses exemplifying Laskowski’s claim involve matrix clauses with unbounded (imperfective) verbs such as: widzieć ‘see’, wiedzieć ‘know’, czuć ‘feel’.

It seems possible to assume that the temporal implications of the contrast of aspectual and/or actional meaning are to some degree universal, i.e. that information about the temporal order of events can, to some degree, be retrieved from the contrast of aspectual/actional meanings of two (or more) verbs and thus in those contexts the use of the pluperfect is as it were “redundant”.\footnote{The results of the test (described in 7.1.1.1) involving assessments of the degree of communicative success displayed by the contrast of the imperfective (most often unbounded) and the perfective (most often bounded) aspect by native speakers of Swedish, similar to the test carried out by Bardovi-Harlig (1994) could well shed further light upon these phenomena.} This contrast may also account for the phenomena at the higher level of language, the level of the text, i.e. the foreground/background distinction. Thus, both kinds of explanation as to why unbounded verbs indicating topic time may constitute more favourable contexts for the pluperfect than bounded verbs seem to be plausible since they seem to refer to the same features.
As Bardovi-Harlig (1998) rightly pointed out, (see 3.2), the category of *aktionsart* (aspect) and the *foreground/background* distinction often rest on shared features.

### 7.1.2.2 Classification problems

Providing an analysis of actional meanings of Swedish verbs is not an easy task. As mentioned in the theoretical part of this work (see 2.2.2), many Swedish verbs, even many verbs with particular types of complements, e.g. a definite object, are, according to Teleman et al. (1999:IV:327), neutral with respect to actional meaning. The actional meaning of such verbs is determined by the context, i.e. on the level of the whole proposition.

Classification of the verbs in this study in terms of boundedness was performed by means of an operational test established by Andersson (1977), Christensen (1995) and Teleman et al. (1999:IV:351). The test is based on the compatibility of verbs or verb phrases with particular types of adverbial expressions. Bounded verbs are compatible with adverbs of completion, such as *på en timme* ‘in an hour’. Unbounded verbs are compatible with adverbs of duration, such as *i en timme* ‘for an hour’ (see 2.2.2). The final judgements about the compatibility of the verbs with the respective types of adverbs were made and unclear cases settled by a linguistically competent native speaker.44

Apart from some problems connected with the position of the verb indicating topic time mentioned in 7.1.1, footnote 35, i.e. whether the verbs following the pluperfect clause may, in some cases, be taken as an indication of topic time, there were also some problems with the classification of two verbs in terms of actional meaning: *läsa (en bok)* in the sentence *Det satt en man och läste en book* ‘A man was sitting and reading a book’ and *bära (hem)* in the sentence *En gammal man gick längs en stor väg. Han bar hem ...* ‘An old man was going along a big road. He was carrying home...’ (see Appendix 2, Test 4 and Test 3). In agreement with the principles of the compatibility test, which is widely used in Swedish research, the former clause was classified as unbounded.

---

44 Swedish is not my native language so I left the final decision about the actional value of some of the verbs to a highly qualified native speaker.
(compatible with the adverbial expression of duration *i en timme* ‘for an hour’) and the latter as bounded (not compatible with the adverbial expression of duration, compatible solely with the adverbial expression of completion *på en timme* ‘in an hour’).

The former clause involves an actionally neutral verb phrase *läsa en bok* ‘read a book’. This means that, depending on the type of adverb (adverb of duration or adverb of completion), the verb assumes unbounded or bounded meaning. In my material, this phrase co-occurs with the unbounded verb *sitta* ‘sit’ (see Appendix 2, Test 4) and is consequently compatible with the adverb of duration *i en timme* ‘for an hour’. The sentence is unbounded and has imperfective meaning. The latter clause, taken from the linguistic material used in this study, involves the verb phrase *bära hem* ‘carry home’, which has been classified as bounded (compatible with the adverb of completion)\(^45\). This verb co-occurs in my material with the unbounded verb *gå* ‘go’ located in the preceding sentence, so it has imperfective meaning (see Appendix 2, Test 3). Thus, the sentence has been classified as bounded but has imperfective meaning.\(^46\)

Although quite widely used, the compatibility test does not seem to be fully reliable. It does not account systematically for the difference between actional and aspectual meanings of sentences. As pointed out above, it assigns unbounded actional meaning to some imperfective clauses, but not to others (see also the discussion in 2.2.4).

The distinction between the aspectual and the actional meanings of verbs seems to be of great importance in the classification of narrative texts in terms of background/foreground. In the case of the divergence of the two, e.g. bounded and imperfective, it is difficult to decide which meaning of the verb, the actional or the aspectual, should be taken into consideration when its function in a narrative text is to be established. Since there was only one controversial clause in my linguistic material, and since the rate of

\(^45\) The classification was made by a linguistically trained native speaker of Swedish. It seems to indicate that the category of aspect is not the same as aktionsart, as claimed by Teleman et al. (1999:1:155).

\(^46\) Having a Slavic (aspectual) language as my mother tongue, I am inclined to believe that in the case of the divergence of the two meanings, the aspectual and not the actional meaning accounts for the textual function in terms of grounding.
accuracy with which the pluperfect was supplied in this clause did not display an extreme value (43 per cent of the responses were correct) the general result of stepwise multiple regression analysis does not seem to have been seriously affected by the way the verb phrase bära hem ‘carry home’ is classified (see also the discussion in 2.2.4 and the discussion of the difficulties in the classification of the target verbs in terms of aktionsart in 7.2.1.2).

7.1.2.3 Results

Statistical analysis of the material (28 bounded and 22 unbounded verbs), confirmed the hypothesis that indication of topic time by an unbounded verb may be a factor facilitating the correct use of the pluperfect. The variable aktionsart of the verb indicating topic time displayed a statistically significant (p=0.0283) partial effect of 0.0466. This means that the increase of the explained variation of the dependent variable, given that V8, V7 and V16 are already in the model, will be 4–5 per cent, when V13 is included. The positive sign of the parameter estimate indicates that the second subgroup, unbounded verbs indicating topic time, were found to be more favourable contexts for the use of the pluperfect than the bounded verbs in this model of stepwise multiple regression.

7.1.3 Multiple vs. single indication of topic time: (V11)

As mentioned in 7.1.1, Teleman et al. (1999:IV:224) claim that in a stretch of narrative preterit clauses the topic time of the subsequent clause is established anaphorically, i.e. in relation to the preceding clause. The subsequent clause may introduce a new topic time, located “just after” the time of the preceding preterit clause, or it may share the topic time with the preceding preterit clause. The respective type of temporal relation is to a high degree dependent on the type of actional meanings of verbs: bounded/unbounded.47 If both the preceding and the subsequent preterit

---

47 Since Teleman et al. (1999:1:155) claim that aspect is just another term for aktionsart, it may also be claimed that the correct use of the pluperfect may be affected by the aspectual meaning of the verb indicating topic time.
verbs (clauses) in a narrative text are bounded, the subsequent clause usually introduces a new topic time. In this way, each of the clauses is contained in its own topic time and the narrative time is moved forward.

According to Teleman et al. (1999:IV:225), the pluperfect retains the topic time indicated by the verb in the preterit of the preceding clause. If the verb indicating topic time is bounded, a new topic time is introduced. Thus the indication of topic time is single, i.e. the pluperfect clause retains the topic time indicated by one verb. This type of temporal relation is illustrated by example (50), below. TT indicates topic time, the shift of topic time is marked with the change of numbers, TT1, TT2. The letter B indicates bounded aktionsart.

TT1

(50) Ännu darrande klättrade (B) den första mannen ner från trädet och frågade (B) den andra mannen om björnen hade berättat några hemligheter. ‘Still trembling, the first man came down out of the tree and asked the other man whether the bear had told him any secrets.’

If both the preceding and the subsequent preterit verbs (clauses) in a narrative are unbounded, the subsequent clause most often does not move the narrative time forward, but shares the topic time with the preceding clause (which often shares the topic time with an earlier clause). In this case, the indication of topic time is multiple, the pluperfect clause retaining the topic time of more than one preceding clause. This type of temporal relation is illustrated by example (51), below. TT1 for both clauses shows that the narrative time is not moved forward, i.e. the topic time is shared. The letter U indicates unbounded type of actional meaning.

TT1

(51) Det fanns (U) ett stort hål i trädet och inne i hålet stod (U) det en säck fylld med kött, ost och bröd som några herdar hade gömt där. ‘There was a big hole in the tree and inside the hole there was a bag filled with meat, cheese and bread, which some shepherds had hidden there.’

The topic time of the preceding clause may also be shared if only one of the clauses, either the preceding or the subsequent clause,
is unbounded. The former type of temporal relation is illustrated by example (52), the latter type of temporal relation by example (53), below. As above, TT1 for both verbs indicates the same topic time – the narrative time is not moved forward. The letters U and B indicate unbounded and bounded type of action, respectively. The indication of topic time is in both cases multiple and the pluperfect clause retains the topic time of both preterit clauses.

TT1
(52) I det samma stod (U) döden framför honom och frågade varför (B) han hade ropat på honom. 'Suddenly, Death stood in front of him and asked why he had called him.'

TT1
(53) "Snart klämmer det ihjäl mig" skrek (B) han. Han trodde (U) alltså att trädet hade krympt. "Soon it will squeeze me to death," he cried out. He thought that the tree had shrunk.'

According to Teleman et al. (1999:IV:255), not only the main clauses, but also the subordinate clauses may (but do not necessarily have to) share the topic time with some other past clause. This is most often the case with temporal subordinate clauses. This type of temporal relation is illustrated in clause (54). The method of indication is the same as above, where TT1 for both verbs indicates the same topic time. The letters U and B indicate unbounded and bounded type of action, respectively. The indication of topic time is in both cases multiple, the pluperfect clause retaining the topic time of both preterit clauses.

TT1
(54) Men när han försökte klämma sig ut igen (B), satt han ohjälpligt fast (U). Av den myckna maten hade han blivit tjockare. 'But when he tried to squeeze out, he was helplessly stuck. Due to all this food he had become fatter.'

Additional types of subordinate clauses other than temporal ones may also share the topic time with the matrix main clause. This type of temporal relation is illustrated in clause (55). The method of indication is the same as before: TT1 for both verbs indicates the same topic time. The letter U indicates unbounded and the letter B bounded action type.
Although verbs usually share the topic time by virtue of their actional meaning, there may be some exceptions to this rule. In my material, there is a case of two bounded verbs which share the topic time, and thus do not move the narrative time forward. The second bounded verb retains the topic time of the first verb and, as it were, presents the previous narrative event from a different perspective, supplying more information. This is the case in example (56), below. As above, TT1 for both verbs indicates the same topic time, the narrative time being not moved forward. The letter B indicates a bounded type of action:

(56) En stor Mercedes stannade (B) vid ytterdörren. Ägaren kom tillbaka (B). Familjen hade avbrutit sin semester. ‘A big Mercedes stopped at the front door. The owner came back. The family had cancelled their holiday.’

7.1.3.1 Hypothesis

The assumption in this analysis was that pluperfect clauses retaining the topic time shared by two (or more verbs) may be more favourable contexts for the correct use of the pluperfect than pluperfect clauses retaining the topic time indicated by a single verb. Since the indication of topic time is usually multiple when one of the verbs is unbounded, the basis for the assumption in this analysis is very similar to the analysis of the effect of actional meaning of verbs indicating topic time, i.e. the foreground/background structure of the narrative, the gestalt theory of perception drawn in analogy to spatial organization of the visual field and the size principle, i.e. text linguistic factors. In the cases where the target verb is bounded and the nearest verb indicating topic time is unbounded, i.e. when there is a contrast of actional/aspektual meanings, the fact that the order of events may be retrieved from the contrast in the semantics of the verbs involved may also be taken as an explanation why multiple indication of topic time may constitute more favourable contexts for the pluperfect. The
The main difference between this analysis and the analysis of the effect of bounded vs. unbounded meaning of the verb indicating topic time, V13, is that not only the effect of the nearest verb indicating the topic time, but also the effect of the preceding verb(s), is taken into consideration.

7.1.3.2 Results and discussion

The statistical analysis of the material (14 clauses having a single indication of topic time, bounded or in some cases, e.g., the initial clauses in the text, a single unbounded verb, and 36 clauses having a multiple indication of topic time) has not revealed any relationship between the correct use of the pluperfect and the type of indication of topic time. The variable *multiple vs. single indication of topic time* has not displayed any partial effect in this model of stepwise multiple regression. This result seems to suggest that in the context for the pluperfect (the sentences requiring the pluperfect) learners most often pay attention to only one verb, i.e., to the most recent preterit verb, rather than to longer stretches of the text. Thus, this result seems to be in agreement with the results of the analysis measuring the distance between the target verb and the verb indicating topic time, V8.

7.1.4 Non-reported speech vs. reported speech: (V7)

Coulmas (1986:6–7) notes that reported speech is an object of study for researchers from several fields: linguistics, poetics, logic, philosophy of language and literature. This statement shows that reported speech is a complex phenomenon that can be described from different points of departure and with a view to a large number of different aspects. Most of those studies of reported speech are irrelevant for my research. The field of my interest is reported speech as an object in the study of grammar.

The term *reported speech* refers to the situation where one speaker’s utterance, whether statement, question or order, is reported by another speaker. According to Coulmas (1986:2), reported speech is an utterance that is “made the subject of another utterance.”
Traditionally, two basic kinds of reported speech are distinguished, namely, direct and indirect speech. Coulmas (1986:2) says that both types of reported speech are introduced with a matrix clause, the subject of the clause being the quoted speaker, and the predicate being a verb denoting reporting, i.e., a verb of speech. In direct speech the reporting speaker uses the exact words of the reported speaker and adopts his point of view, i.e. “lends his voice to the original speaker”. This is exemplified in example (57).

(57) Den andra mannen frågade: ”Berättade björnen några hemligheter?”. ’The other man asked: “Did the bear tell you any secrets?”’

Indirect speech is described by Coulmas (1986:2) as adapting the reported utterance to the speech situation. This means that the reporter relates a speech event from his own point of view. An indirect quotation is traditionally seen as a subordinate clause which is the direct object of the verb of saying. The reported speech is exemplified in example (58).

(58) Den andra mannen frågade om björnen hade berättat några hemligheter. ‘The other man asked if the bear had told him any secrets.’

Grammatical devices for integrating another speaker’s utterance into one’s own differ from one language to the next. The differences in the ways in which Swedish and Polish integrate another speaker’s utterance that may account for the acquisitional difficulties are discussed below.

7.1.4.1 Hypothesis

The hypothesis in this study was that the use of the pluperfect in reported speech may be a relatively difficult context for the acquisition of the pluperfect. This hypothesis was based on the observation made in foreign language classes, on the results of my pilot study (Zielonka 1995) and on both cross-linguistic and language-specific descriptions of reported speech in linguistic literature, Coulmas (1986) and Teleman et al. (1999:IV:266–268).

It is common knowledge among foreign language teachers that the rules concerning the use of tenses in reported speech are difficult for Polish learners to acquire. Although the use of tenses in
reported speech is intensively practised in language classes, Polish learners of Swedish make many errors when confronted with the task of reporting somebody’s speech and making the necessary adjustments of tenses.

My pilot study on the acquisition of the pluperfect, carried out with Polish learners of Swedish at the Scandinavian Department of the University of Gdańsk (Zielonka 1995), supplied some empirical evidence for reported speech being a context that may inhibit the use of the pluperfect. The informants (not the same persons as in the present study) marked the pluperfect in reported speech clauses with a considerably lower rate of accuracy than in the other types of subordinate clauses. Since each of my informants had also received extensive grammatical instruction in English and thus, had, as it were, a double amount of practice in the use of the pluperfect in reported speech, this result was rather surprising.

An explanation as to why reported speech may be a difficult context for the pluperfect can be gathered from the descriptions of reported speech in theoretical literature. Coulmas (1986) claims that the deictic temporal pivot in reported speech can be placed either in the reported situation, or in the reporting situation. In the former case, the tense of the reported situation is independent of the tense of the verb of speaking, i.e. it is used in agreement with the deictic centre of the reported speaker. In the latter case, however, the tense of the original utterance is usually adjusted to the tense of the verb of speaking. The adjustment involves backshifting of the tense of the original utterance, e.g. the future tense is changed into the future in the past, the present tense is changed into the preterit, the preterit and the perfect are changed into the pluperfect. In addition, certain other elements of the contexts, e.g. demonstrative pronouns and some adverbs of time, must be adjusted.

Swedish and Polish differ with respect to the position of temporal deixis in reported speech. In Swedish, the temporal deixis is in the reporting situation and tenses are used in accordance with the deictic centre of the reporter, i.e. tenses are normally backshifted, (Teleman et al. 1999:IV:850). In Polish, the temporal deixis is in the

---

48 Swedish and Polish differ only in terms of the temporal deixis. The shift of the deictic center for person reference is identical or very similar.
reported situation and tenses are used in accordance with the deictic centre of the reported speaker, i.e. tenses are not backshifted. The main differences in the use of tenses are illustrated with examples adapted from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:850) and translated into Polish. The present tense of direct speech, as in example (59), is in Swedish and English backshifted and the preterit must be used, while in Polish the tense remains unchanged, as shown in (60).

(59) Luisa sa: “Jag tänker inte betala.” Luisa powiedziała: (Ja) nie mam zamiaru (za)placić. ‘Luisa said: “I am not going to pay”.

(60) Luisa sa att hon inte tänkte (preterit) betala. Luisa powiedziała, że ona nie ma (present) zamiaru (za)placić. ‘Luisa said that she was (preterit) not going to pay’.

Similarly, the past tense of the reported speech as in example (61) is in Swedish and in English backshifted, and the pluperfect must be used, while in Polish the tense remains unchanged, as shown in example (62).

(61) Luisa sa: “Min bror glömde sitt pass”. Luisa powiedziała: “Mój brat zapominał (past) paszport”. Luisa said: “My brother forgot his passport”.

(62) Luisa sa att hennes bror hade glömt sitt pass. Luisa powiedziała, że jej brat zapominał (past) paszport”. ‘Luisa said that her brother had forgotten his passport’.

Since Polish and Swedish are so different in this respect, it seems understandable that Polish learners of Swedish have difficulties with the use of the pluperfect in reported speech. To be able to use the pluperfect in the reported speech in agreement with the target language norm, the learners have to learn to make a temporal deictic re-orientation – to shift the temporal deictic centre indicated by the time of speech from the reported situation to the deictic centre indicated by the time of speech of the reporting situation and to relate the time of speech of the original utterance to the time of speech of the reporting situation. According to Laskowski (1998:157), the past tense form indicates in some cases (the secondary use of the past tense form) an event anterior in relation to the time of the matrix clause (see 2.1.4). Provided that the use of the preterit instead of the pluperfect in the contexts requiring a temporal deictic re-orientation, reported or indirect speech, is a uni-
versal transitional structure, the L1 of the Polish learners corresponds to it, and thus, the acquisition of the pluperfect in those contexts is delayed, i.e. more difficult than in some other contexts (see 4.1).

7.1.4.2 Results and discussion

The assumed inhibitive effect of the reported speech (indication of topic time by verbs of speaking) as a context for the pluperfect could not be confirmed in this model of statistical analysis. As stated before, the variable: non-reported vs. reported speech was first selected as having a statistically significant partial effect and, at a later stage, rejected by the stepwise procedure. The variable could have displayed a statistically significant partial effect only at the cost of regarding as non-significant the effects of other variables – function of subordinate clauses: specifying vs. constituting, V9, location of the time of action of the pluperfect clause: outside vs. within the temporal frame of the narrative plot, V10, and, type of pluperfect, V17. Since one of the research questions in this study is to find an answer to the question as to whether some linguistic contexts are more favourable than others, it seemed reasonable to examine the effect of a broader range of linguistic factors that may account for the variable use of the pluperfect rather than to limit their number. In this type of statistical analysis, the level of probability indicating that the result is statistically significant may be higher than in ordinary statistical analyses, the highest accepted value being 0.15.

The variable non-reported vs. reported speech, indication of topic time by verbs of speaking studied on a larger and more rigorously elicited corpora, seems to be a promising objective for further research.

7.2 Factors referring to the semantics of the target verb

This section presents the results of the analysis of an effect of the factors referring to the semantics of the target verb, factors of group B. The factors (independent variables in the statistical analysis) are: bounded vs. unbounded meaning (aktionsart) of
the target verb, V12; resultative vs. non-resultative meaning of the
target verb; V18; and agentive vs. non-agentive meaning of the
target verb, V16.

The choice of the first two factors was inspired by earlier re-
search within the framework of the Aspect Hypothesis. The notions
of aktionsart and resultativity are strongly related but, according to
some scholars, e.g. Teleman et al. (1999), not quite similar (see 7.2.1).
Having two separate analyses, i.e. two separate variables, makes
this analysis more reliable, i.e. independent of a particular theo-
retical school.

The third analysis, the effect of agentive vs. non-agentive mean-
ing of the verbs, was not inspired by any earlier research. The as-
sumption that agentive meaning of target verbs may affect the use
of the pluperfect was made on the basis of the results of the pre-
liminary statistical analysis, the rank order list (the pluperfect in
non-agentive clauses exhibited a relatively low rate of accuracy).

7.2.1 Bounded vs. unbounded and resultative
vs. non-resultative meaning of the target
verb: (V12), (V18)

The four types of actional meaning of verbs (aktionsart) and some
of the controversies surrounding them are presented in the theo-
retical part of my work (2.2) and in section 7.1.2. The approach tak-
en in this analysis is the same as the approach taken in the analy-
sis of an effect that the actional value of the verbs indicating topic
time has upon the rate of accuracy in the use of the pluperfect. Only
the most important distinction, namely the distinction between
unbounded (not having a natural final point) and bounded (having
a natural final point) types of situations, is taken into consideration.
The bounded target verb (B) is illustrated in example (63). The un-
bounded target verb (U) is illustrated in example (64).

(63) Det fanns ett stort hål i trädet och inne i hålet stod det en säck
fylld med kött, ost och bröd som några herdar hade gömt (B).
‘There was a big hole in the tree and inside the hole there was a
bag filled with meat, cheese and bread, which some shepherds
had hidden there.’

(64) Jag hade varit (U) i England och hade bott (U) hos en engelsk familj.
‘I had been to England and had lived with an English family.’
Actional meanings have a strong affinity with resultative meaning of verbs. According to Teleman et al. (1999:IV:344), the majority of bounded types of action, i.e. all bounded processes and many punctual events, are resultative. The majority of unbounded types of action, all states and many unbounded processes, are non-resultative.

Resultative aktionsart is defined by Teleman et al. (1999:IV:344) as a type of action which brings about a new state of affairs, different from the one which was in existence before the beginning of the action. The new state obtains as a result of a change which one of the actants, either the subject or the object, has undergone.

According to Teleman et al. (1999:IV:344), there are two types of resultative actions. One type involves bounded processes, processes which lead to the attainment of the final result, e.g. gömma, 'hide', bli sjuk 'fall ill', tända ljuset 'turn on the light'. The other type involves unbounded processes, processes which do not lead to the attainment of a final result, but which consist of a number of new states continuously following one another (cumulative change), e.g. krympa 'shrink' or bli tjockare 'become fatter'. Non-resultative aktionsart is defined by Teleman et al. (1999:IV:344) as a type of action which indicates that the original state is not changed, e.g. bo 'live' or that the original state is returned to, e.g. nysa 'sneeze'.

7.2.1.1 Hypothesis

The results of a number of studies on the acquisition of temporal morphology in L1 and L2, carried out within the framework of the Defective Tense Hypothesis/Aspect Hypothesis provided some evidence that in their use of verbal morphology, learners may be influenced by the semantics of the target verb, i.e. the actional (in Vendler’s terms, see 3.2) or resultative meaning of verbs. Most of those studies had as their objective the acquisition of preterital

---

49 The term resultative aktionsart comes from Teleman et al. (1999:IV:344), where the meanings of the defining features of the four main types of aktionsart are also called aktionsart, e.g. resultative aktionsart, processual aktionsart etc.
tenses. In this study, the hypothesis about the effect of the semantics of the target verb upon the correct use of tense is extended to the acquisition of the pluperfect.

Since there were no non-resultative punctual verbs in the analysed language samples, the only exceptions from a complete overlap between bounded/resultative and unbounded/non-resultative meanings of the target verbs were two verbs denoting a cumulative change, i.e. a gradual increase of property: *bli tjockare* ‘become fatter’ and a gradual decrease of property: *krympa* ‘shrink’, each occurring twice in the analysed linguistic material.

The decision to have two different analyses of strongly related meanings was motivated by somewhat different approaches in the classification of the resultative verbs indicating a gradual increase or decrease of a certain property. According to Vendler (1967), the verbs indicating a gradual change of a certain quality, e.g. the verb *to harden*, can be assigned either to the class of *activities* (unbounded processes), or to the class of *accomplishments* (bounded processes). Swedish scholars, Teleman et al. (1999:IV: 344), call those verbs *cumulative processes* and ascribe them to the semantic class of *unbounded processes*. The Polish scholar Laskowski (1998:155) calls those verbs *parametric verbs* and ascribes them to the semantic class of *bounded processes*.

Having two separate analyses of the effect of the semantics of target verbs, one in terms of the actional meaning and one in terms of the resultative meaning, makes this study independent of particular theoretical schools. The empirical results of my study could have been greatly distorted if the classification of verbs had been made in accordance with the approach of only one of the schools.

The decision to have a separate analysis of a possible effect that resultative meaning of the verbs might have upon the use of the pluperfect was also motivated by the controversy around semantic features involved in the actional and the aspeсtual meanings of verbs. Since, according to Majewicz (1985:219), resultativity is a defining feature of the perfective aspect, the classification of the verbs in terms of resultativity was expected to overlap with the perfective meaning of these verbs and their Polish equivalents. Thus, the results of this analysis may also shed some light upon the effect of the aspeсtual value of the verbs or/and the Polish equivalents of those verbs upon the correct use of the pluperfect.
The hypothesis in the present analysis was that bounded and/or resultative verbs may constitute more favourable contexts for the use of the pluperfect than unbounded verbs. As in the research on language acquisition carried out within the framework of the Defective Tense/Aspect Hypothesis (see 3.1. and 3.2), this assumption was based on two principles: the congruence principle and the frequency principle.

The former principle implies that grammatical morphemes are used in accordance with the meanings of the lexical items to which they are attached. This means that the meanings denoted by the past tense and the perfective morphology are more congruent with the semantics of bounded verbs (bounded processes and punctual verbs). And conversely, the meanings denoted by the present and the imperfective morphology are more congruent with the semantics of unbounded verbs (states and activities).

Since the action expressed by the perfect when not specified by durative temporal adverbs is most often conceived of as completed, and since the meaning of the pluperfect can be described as that of the backshifted preterit and the backshifted perfect (see 2.1), I assumed that the meaning of the pluperfect may also be more congruent with the semantics of bounded than with the semantics of unbounded verbs.

The latter, or the frequency principle implies that occurrences of bounded verbs with the perfect (and thus the backshifted perfect, the pluperfect) may be generally more frequent than occurrences of the unbounded verbs, i.e. also in the language of native speakers. This principle is also presented in the typological study of the perfect by Chung and Timberlake (1985:220). Chung and Timberlake (1985:220) claim that “the perfect is formed more readily for telic than atelic processes, presumably because telic processes are more likely to result in a stative interval.” A similar tendency, i.e. a distributional bias of actional meanings of verbs and tense forms in Spanish, was noted by Andersen and Shirai (1994). These claims, if also true about Swedish, may mean that bounded verbs enhance the correct use of the perfect, and thus the backshifted perfect, the pluperfect, not only because their meaning may be more congruent with the meaning of those tenses, but also because they may be more frequent in the linguistic input to which the learners are exposed.
7.2.1.2 Classification problems

In agreement with the purpose of my investigation, an attempt to discover whether bounded target verbs may be more favourable contexts for the pluperfect than unbounded target verbs, the object of classification was the actional meaning of the infinitive form of the verb or the verb phrase. In cases where the infinitive form of the verb was neutral with respect to actional meaning, the contextual meaning of the verb was assessed, i.e. the meaning of the verbs with their arguments. The possible effect of the meaning of tense (the pluperfect) upon the actional value of particular verbs was not taken into consideration.

Classification of the target verbs in terms of actional meanings was performed in the same way as the classification in the analysis of the possible effect that actional meaning of the verb indicating topic time may have upon the accurate use of the pluperfect, V13, i.e. by means of the same compatibility test (see 7.1.2). This test was found to be not quite water-tight, leaving some phrases with ambiguous actional meanings, e.g. *läsa många böcker* ‘read many books’. Those phrases were assigned their actional classes on the basis of their meaning in the text as a whole. In this analysis as well, the results of the compatibility test were checked and unclear cases resolved by a linguistically competent native speaker of Swedish.

One of the main difficulties in the classification of the target verbs in terms of actional meaning was the use of two different words *lyssna på* ‘listen to’ and *höra* ‘hear’ as the counterpart of the Polish word *(wy)shuchać* in the translation test. Since the words belong to two different actional groups, *unbounded* and *bounded* respectively, only one verb could be taken into consideration in one and the same clause. The verb used by the majority of the informants was *lyssna på* ‘listen to’, so only this verb was taken into consideration. This means that 10 correct responses for clause nr 10 and 8 correct responses for clause nr 11 were not taken into consideration. This is reflected in the number of the overall responses for those sentences (see Appendix 4). This measure may have, to some degree, affected the results of this analysis, and the general results of stepwise multiple regression (see 8.3.2).

The assumption, based on theoretical linguistic literature, that the Polish counterparts of the Swedish resultative verbs will have
perfective meaning was also tested empirically. Six bilingual speakers of Swedish and Polish, students at the Department of Slavic Languages at the University of Stockholm, were asked to translate the Swedish texts used to collect language samples for this study and the Swedish version of the translation test into Polish. The analysis of the aspectual forms used by those informants in the Polish translation confirmed the assumption about a close overlap between resultative meaning of the Swedish verbs and the Polish perfective aspect.

However, the initial idea of interpreting the results of the analysis of the effect that resultative verbs may have upon the correct use of the pluperfect in terms of the perfective meaning of the Polish equivalents of the Swedish verbs had to be abandoned. The translation test contained some cases of the idiosyncratic use of the imperfective aspect, the so-called general factual or simple denotation, e.g. czytałem 'I have read', having almost identical meaning as the perfective aspect przeczytałem 'I have read' and other idiosyncratic uses of the imperfective, i.e. with verbs of perception, e.g. słyszę, że 'hear that' in which the imperfective form also has resultative meaning. Those forms were included because one of the initial objectives, which was abandoned, was the possible influence that the perfective and the imperfective form of Polish equivalents of Swedish verbs may have upon the correct use of the pluperfect.

7.2.1.3 Results and discussion

The results of the statistical analysis of the material (28 bounded and 22 unbounded verbs and 32 resultative and 18 non-resultative verbs) has not confirmed the hypothesis that the use of the pluperfect in this study may have been affected by the semantics of the target verbs. Neither of the two variables bounded vs. unbounded meaning of the target verb and resultative vs. non-resultative meaning of the target verb displayed a statistically significant partial effect in this model of stepwise multiple regression.

This result seems to indicate that the Aspect Hypothesis should perhaps not be generalised as holding for advanced learners. In the revised version of this theory (Andersen and Shirai 1994:145), the claim that the temporal morphology is guided by the actional features of verbs was restricted to early stages of language learning (see 3.2). The informants in the present study were at an intermediate
proficiency level or higher, so it is possible to assume that at the time of the test most of the learners had already reached the stage at which their use of temporal morphology is no longer governed by the semantics of target verbs. The results might have been different with learners at a lower level of proficiency in Swedish.

This result also seems to indicate that the Aspect Hypothesis should not, perhaps, be generalised as holding for the pluperfect. The pluperfect is conceptually different from the tenses that were the object of the previous research done within an aspectual framework. For the preterit, the topic time (the time of reference) overlaps with the time of action and both are related to the moment of speech. For the perfect, the topic time overlaps with the present moment. For the pluperfect, the topic time is indicated by another past verb or a temporal adverb to which the time of action is related. Thus, it is possible to assume that the use of the pluperfect may be more constrained by the factors referring to the indication of the topic time than by the semantics of the target verb. The results of the analyses referring to the effect of the verb indicating topic time upon the correct use of the pluperfect, a statistically significant partial effect, seem to supply some evidence for this assumption.

And last but not least, there seems to be some confusion about the object of the studies carried out within the framework of the Aspect Hypothesis. In the early studies carried out within this framework, the lexical aspect (inherent meanings of verbs, e.g. durative, punctual, resultative) was the object of analysis. In the later studies, situation types, e.g. the meaning that verbs or sentences obtain through their complements (subjects, different types of objects or different types of adverbs) were analysed. In both cases the term *aspectual meaning* was often used.

It seems most improbable that the use of temporal morphology may be affected by the situation types as described by Teleman et al. (1999), involving the meaning that the verbs may acquire through different types of complements. Thus, the category of aktionsart should be more precisely defined and its relationship to the somewhat related category of aspect should be clarified if it is to be an object of empirical research. Otherwise one might make an absurd assumption such as that the phrase *bära hem* ‘carry home’ (bounded) enhances and the phrase *bära på ryggen* ‘carry on one’s back’ (unbounded) inhibits the correct use of the pluperfect (see 2.2.4).
7.2.2 Agentive vs. non-agentive meaning of the target verb: (V16)

Teleman et al. (1999:IV:506) note that verbs have a set of semantic roles encoded in their lexical meaning, their so-called *valency*. The number and type of semantic roles may be different for different verbs. The roles encoded in the lexical meaning of verbs are carried by different actants, which are the obligatory (the subject, the object or obligatory adverbials) and non-obligatory complements of verbs. In terms of the semantic roles encoded in their lexical meaning, verbs may be divided into two main groups: *agentive* and *non-agentive*. Agentive verbs involve an agent acting purposefully and being in control of the action. One such agentive verb is illustrated with a sentence taken from the linguistic material used in this study, presented as (65):

(65) Jag hade läst många böcker. ‘I had read a lot of books.’

Non-agentive verbs involve different types of partially related semantic roles (which in some cases may be difficult to differentiate), roles that can be grouped under the cover term *receiver*, e.g. the experiencer, the benefactor, etc. The non-agentive verbs may be illustrated with a sentence taken from the linguistic material used in this study, presented as (66):

(66) Han hade blivit tjockare. ‘He had become fatter.’

7.2.2.1 Hypothesis

The hypothesis in this analysis was that clauses with agentive target verbs may be more favourable contexts for the pluperfect than clauses with non-agentive target verbs. The situations encoded in agentive clauses are described by Hopper and Thompson (1980:286) as involving perceptible events with perceptible consequences. Non-agentive clauses are described as indicating an internal state.\(^{50}\)

---

\(^{50}\) Those features are actually the defining features of volitionality. Although Hopper and Thompson (1980:252) present agency and volitionality as two separate notions, they admit the possibility of including volitionality in the meaning of agency.
On the basis of this statement, I assumed that agentive verbs, i.e. perceptible events with perceptible consequences, may be semantically less complex, and thus more easily related temporally to the verb indicating topic time, and vice versa, that non-agentive verbs, i.e. verbs involving internal states, may be semantically more complex, and thus more difficult to relate temporally to the verb indicating topic time. Four of the ten non-agentive sentences in the linguistic material for this study contain the verb bli ‘become’, indicating a transition, e.g. bli tjockare, ‘get fatter’ bli sjuk, ‘fall ill’, and thus seem to be not only semantically, but also syntactically more complex. It is also possible that agentive clauses are generally more frequent in Swedish, or at least more frequent in the modified input to which the informants are exposed in their linguistic interaction with teachers, other learners or even native speakers of Swedish (foreigner talk).

7.2.2.2 Results

Statistical analysis of the material (40 agentive and 10 non-agentive clauses) confirmed the hypothesis that agentive meaning of verbs may be a factor affecting the use of the pluperfect. The variable agentive vs. non-agentive meaning of target verbs displayed a statistically significant (p=0.0323) partial effect of 0.0482. This means that the increase in the explained variation of the dependent variable, given that V8 and V7 are already in the model, will be 4–5 per cent when V16 is included. The positive sign of the parameter estimate indicates that agentive verbs were found to be more favourable contexts for the use of the pluperfect than non-agentive verbs.

7.3 Miscellaneous factors

Miscellaneous factors, factors of Group C, generally refer to a higher linguistic level than the word, namely, to the level of the sentence and/or the level of the text. Group C includes the following factors: function of the subordinate clauses in the text: specifying vs. constituting; location of the time of action of the pluperfect clause: outside vs. within the temporal frame of the narrative plot; type of semantic relation between the clause containing
the target verb and the clause containing the verb indicating topic
time or (some other clause in the preterit): causal vs. non-causal;
and type of the pluperfect: actional vs. statal.

The assumption that the factors presented above may affect the
use of the pluperfect is mainly based on theoretical linguistic lit-
erature on temporality, e.g. Morrisey (1973), Maslov (1988),
Thieroff (1994), Christensen (1997) and Teleman et al. (1999), as
reviewed in the theoretical part of the present work.

7.3.1 Function of the subordinate clauses in the text:
Specifying vs. constituting: (V9)

Propositions expressed by the subordinate clauses may have dif-
ferent semantic relations with the remaining parts of the propo-
sition in the clause, i.e. the proposition of the matrix (principal)
clause. Teleman et al. (1999:IV:480) distinguish two semantic re-
lations between the propositions: specifying and constituting, i.e.
specifying and constituting subordinate clauses. The former type
of subordinate clauses specifies non-propositional actants in the
matrix clause, e.g. a person, a thing, a place, a degree, an identi-
ty (comparative clauses). The specified actant constitutes part
of the proposition of the specifying clause. A typical specifying
clause, i.e. a relative attributive clause, is presented in (67):

(67) Det fanns ett stort hål i trädet och inne i hålet stod det en säck fylld
med kött, ost och bröd som några herdar hade gömt. 'There was
a big hole in the tree and inside the hole there was a bag filled with
meat, cheese and bread, which some shepherds had hidden there.'

The other type of subordinate clauses constitutes propositional
actants of the matrix (main) clause. A typical constituting clause
is a nominal clause combined with its matrix clause with the sub-
junction att ‘that’. Other types of subordinate constituting claus-
es may give some particular circumstances of their matrix claus-
es such as cause, consequence, reason, condition etc. A causal
constituting clause is presented in (68):

(68) Jag klarade inträdesprovet eftersom jag hade studerat engelska i
många år. 'I passed the entrance exam because I had studied
English for many years.'
7.3.1.1 Hypothesis

In section 7.1.1.1 a suggestion was made that some types of subordinate clauses, namely, relative (specifying), causal and complement clauses, may constitute more favourable contexts for the pluperfect than the main clauses, or at least than those main clauses which do not give any other clues about the temporal order of narrative events, e.g. lexical clues. This suggestion was based on Bardovi-Harlig’s (1994) findings that the temporal order of events in these three types of subordinate clauses may be retrieved from the semantico-syntactic structure itself in such clauses. It was also based on Young’s (1988) assumption about the facilitative effect of the contexts in which the use of the grammatical markers of plurality may be “redundant”, because the information is encoded by the use of numerals, and this observation was thus extended to the use of the pluperfect tense.

The hypothesis in this analysis was that a particular type of subordinate clauses, namely, specifying clauses (relative clauses), may be more favourable contexts for the pluperfect than constituting clauses, i.e. subordinate causal and complement clauses and main clauses. This assumption was grounded in the observation made in my pilot study on the acquisition of the pluperfect by Polish learners of Swedish as a foreign language, carried out with a different group of Polish learners of Swedish (Zielonka 1995). In the present study this observation is tested once again. Apart from attributive relative clauses and comparative clauses, one further type of specifying clauses, namely, relative clefts of the type It is X that has done Y, is taken into consideration. Moreover, an attempt is made at offering an explanation (based on linguistic literature) as to why specifying clauses may constitute particularly favourable contexts for the pluperfect. The hypothesis that specifying subordinate clauses may be more favourable contexts for the correct use of the pluperfect than constituting clauses is grounded in the work of Givón (1990) and Depraetere (1996).

Although causal clauses and not relative clauses showed the highest acceptability rating as expressions of reverse-order reports in Bardovi-Harlig’s (1994) study, I presumed that in a narrative text the information about the temporal order of events (events anterior to the events denoted by the verb in the main
When specifying non-propositional actants, relative clauses are closely associated with the domain of referential coherence – relative clauses usually report information which is intended to establish referential identification. Givón (1990) says that referent identification is often established by invoking a past situation in which the referent participated. This view is shared by Depraetere (1996:723). According to her, the principles of co-operation demand that the information provided by the speaker in order to help the listener establish reference be as easily accessible as possible to the hearer. The most easily accessible information often involves the events which are anterior to the main-clause situation. Thus, relative clauses in narrative texts relating past information may generally more often contain anterior information. If this is the case, not only the redundancy principle, but also the frequency principle may be at work in making relative clause contexts particularly favourable for the use of the pluperfect. Depraetere (1996:721) supports this view with the results of an empirical test in which the informants were 63 native speakers of English. The informants were to indicate whether the situation presented in the preterit relative non-restrictive clause \textit{John fell in love with the girl who won a beauty contest} followed or preceded the information in the first clause. Only 6 per cent of the informants unambiguously classified the situation in the second clause as posterior and as many as 64 per cent of the informants unambiguously classified the situation as anterior.

Another explanation as to why specifying clauses may be a more favourable context for the pluperfect than constituting clauses has to do with the learners’ native language. As stated in the theoretical part of my thesis, one of the linguistic devices (a special grammatical form) frequently used for marking anteriority of one past situation in relation to another past situation is the use of a preposed or postposed past participle modifying the noun phrase, \textit{stal ukryty worek} ‘stood a hidden sack’ or \textit{stal worek ukryty przez} ‘stood a sack hidden by’. Thus, Polish learners of Swedish may, perhaps, more easily perceive events embedded in noun phrases, i.e. in clauses specifying non-propositional actants,
as anterior in relation to the event encoded by the main verb than they do with the events encoded in clauses embedded in matrix clauses, i.e. in constituting subordinate and main clauses. This tendency may also be universal.

### 7.3.1.2 Results

A statistical analysis of the material (6 specifying and 15 constituting subordinate clauses, 8 causal, 7 nominal) confirmed the hypothesis that specifying subordinate clauses may be more favourable contexts for the use of the pluperfect than constituting subordinate clauses.

The variable *specifying subordinate clause* displayed a statistically significant \((p=0.0598)\) partial effect of \(0.0319\) in the multiple regression model. This means that the increase in the explained variation of the dependent variable, given that \(V8, V7, V16\) and \(V13\) are already in the model, will be 3 per cent when \(V9\) is included. The negative sign of the parameter estimate indicates that one type of subordinate clauses, namely, specifying clauses, may constitute more favourable contexts for the pluperfect than constituting clauses.

### 7.3.2 Location of the time of action of pluperfect clauses: outside vs. within the temporal frame of the narrative plot: (V10)

Narrative texts have temporal frames, i.e. the initial temporal point and the final temporal point. The initial temporal point of the frame is usually marked via an adverb of past time, definite or indefinite, e.g. *last week* or *once* and/or the tense form (the preterit) of the first verb or both. The final point of the temporal frame is marked with the tense form of the last verb (the preterit), in some cases in combination with an adverb of past time.

As described in the theoretical part of this work, the meaning ascribed to the pluperfect is that the time of action is located before the point of reference (indication of topic time), which is situated prior to the present moment. In a narrative text, the topic time for pluperfect clauses is indicated by past time adverbs and/or the past tense verbs encoding events which are contained within the temporal frame of the text. The time of action for pluperfect clauses may be located either within the temporal narrative
frame of the plot (within the temporal sphere as delimited by the first and last indication of the topic time), or outside the temporal narrative frame of the plot (in a different temporal sphere).

Location of the time of action for pluperfect clauses in two different temporal spheres is illustrated with an excerpt from one of the texts on the test sheets, and presented here as (69). The time of action for the first pluperfect clause in the text is located outside the temporal frame marked with the first verb in the preterit – the event encoded by the first pluperfect clause occurred before the event marking the initial point of the temporal frame of the text. The time of action for the second pluperfect clause is located within the temporal narrative frame – the event encoded in the second pluperfect clause occurred within the time span delimited by the frame of the text, i.e. was mentioned in earlier parts of the text and is anaphorically referred to.

(69) Två vänner vandrade i skogen när en björn kom lufsande mot dem. En av männen klättrade blixtnabt upp i första bästa träd. Han dolde sig bland grenarna utan en tanke på sin vän.

Den andre, [...] kastade sig raklång på marken och låtsades vara död. 1) Han hade hört att björnar aldrig angriper döda människor, därför låg han stilla och hoppades att björnen inte skulle höra hur hans hjärta slog. Björnen snörvlade och nosade på hans näsa och mun, fläsade in i hans öra och bökte i hans ryggsäck. Han trodde tydligen att mannen var död, för han lufsade bort samma väg som 2) han hade kommit.

'Two friends were walking in the forest when a bear lumbered toward them. One of the men swiftly climbed up the nearest tree. He hid himself among the branches of the tree without thinking about his friend.

The other man [...] threw himself to the ground and pretended to be dead. He had heard that bears do not attack dead people so he lay motionless and was hoping that the bear would not hear his heart pounding. The bear sniffed and sniffed at his nose and his mouth, panted in his ear and rooted in his rucksack. He obviously believed that the man was dead because he lumbered away the same way as he had come.'

7.3.2.1. Hypothesis

The hypothesis in this study was that the uses of the pluperfect in the clauses encoding situations where the time of action is located outside the temporal frame of the narrative text may constitute
more favourable contexts than the pluperfect in the clauses encoding situations whose time of action is contained within the temporal frame of the narrative plot. This hypothesis was based on the assumption that situations located outside the temporal frame of the narrative plot may be perceived as being located more remotely in the past than the situations located within the temporal frame of the narrative plot, an assumption that finds support in the theoretical literature on the meaning of the pluperfect.

Comrie (1985:25–26) claims that tenses have meanings and implicatures. The meaning of a particular tense form cannot be cancelled without an apparent contradiction, whereas the implicature can be cancelled. Since the pluperfect marks the temporal relation of anteriority, a past situation earlier than another past situation, the implicature deriving from its meaning is more remote in the past than the preterit. Remoteness in the past seems to be of importance in human perception of the world, and consequently, in human languages. In some languages, e.g. Bantu languages, remoteness in time is marked by grammatical means. In other languages, e.g. Eastern Armenian, the implicature of remoteness has been reinterpreted as (part of) the meaning of the pluperfect, i.e. the pluperfect has been reinterpreted as the remote past tense (Comrie 1985:83).

A similar reinterpretation of meaning may take place in the non-native use of target languages. Analysing tense and aspect variation in the news discourse of Nepali English, Hartford (1993) found such a non-native-like reinterpretation of the primary semantics of the English pluperfect (anteriority). In Nepali English news texts the pluperfect more often emphasizes remoteness of past events than their anteriority in relation to some other past events. The use of the pluperfect for events remote in time has also been observed in foreign language classes.

With a point of departure in the above findings, it is possible to assume that situations with the time of action located outside the narrative temporal frame may be perceived as more remote in time, and thus easier to notice as anterior, than situations located within the temporal frame of the narrative text.
7.3.2.2 Results

A statistical analysis of the linguistic material (38 clauses denoting events taking place outside and 12 clauses denoting events taking place within the temporal narrative frame) confirmed the hypothesis that the narrative events taking place outside the narrative frame may be more favourable contexts for the pluperfect than the events taking place within the narrative frame.

The variable time of action of pluperfect clauses: outside vs. within the temporal frame of the narrative plot displayed a statistically significant (p=0.0599) partial effect of 0.0301 in the multiple regression analysis. This result indicates that the increase of the explained variation of the dependent variable, given that V8, V7, V16 and V13 are already in the model, will be 3 per cent when V9 is included. The negative sign of the parameter estimate indicates that clauses in which the time of action of the main verb is located outside the temporal frame of the narrative plot were found to be more favourable contexts for the pluperfect than clauses in which the time of action of the main verb was situated inside the temporal frame of the plot.

7.3.3 Type of semantic relation between the clause containing the target verb and the clause containing the verb indicating topic time (or some other clause): causal vs. non-causal: (V14)

Causal relation (cause/reason) among narrative events is a well-known narrative device that lends coherence to texts. The basic meaning of causal relation is that one event (cause) brings about another event, or provides a sufficient condition for the appearance of another event (effect). Causal relation may be expressed at sentence level and at discourse level. At the sentence level, causal relation is usually embodied in subordinate causal clauses in which the relation of events is explicitly marked with causal adverbs such as därför att ‘because’, eftersom ‘since’ etc. Causal relation on the sentence level is illustrated in (70).

(70) Jag klarade inträdesprovet eftersom jag hade studerat engelska i många år. 'I passed the entrance exam successfully because I had studied English for many years.'
On the discourse level, causal relation may be explicitly marked with causal discourse markers e.g. *därför* ‘for this reason’ or may be inferred from a mere juxtaposition of two (or more) clauses. A causal relation which is not explicitly marked but can be inferred from a mere juxtaposition of two clauses is illustrated in example (71):

(71) Villan var tom. Ägaren hade åkt på semester. ‘The house was empty. The owner had gone for holiday.’

7.3.3.1 Hypothesis

The hypothesis in this analysis was that the use of the pluperfect in the clauses which are causally related to the clause containing the verb indicating topic time (or some other clause) may enhance the use of the pluperfect, and clauses which are not causally related to the clause containing the verb indicating topic time (or to some other clause) may inhibit the use of the pluperfect. This prediction was based on the findings of Bardovi-Harlig’s (1994) research on acquisition of the pluperfect, and on the research of Poplack (1981) and Young (1988) (see 7.1.1.1).

As mentioned earlier, Bardovi-Harlig’s (1994) research empirically confirmed that the temporal order of events in explicitly marked causal constructions may be inferred from the semantics of the causal relation itself, the cause preceding the effect, i.e. with the use of the pluperfect in causal subordinate clauses being “redundant”. Out of the three types of subordinate clauses involved in the communicative acceptability test, causal subordinate clauses as expressions of reverse-order reports without tense contrast received the highest acceptability rating (91 per cent). Poplack (1981) and Young (1988) assumed that the contexts involving “redundant” marking of plural on the noun, i.e. the noun phrases containing numerals or demonstrative pronouns, were easier than the contexts in which the plural ending was the only marker of plurality.

With my point of departure in research by Bardovi-Harlig (1994) and Poplack (1981) and Young (1988), I assumed that clauses which are causally related to the clause containing the indication of topic time (or some other clause in the text), i.e. clauses in which the pluperfect is “redundant”, may be more favourable contexts for the pluperfect than clauses which are not causally related to the
clause containing the indication of topic time. The analysed linguistic material in my study involves not only clauses with explicitly marked causal relation (subordinate causal clauses), but also clauses without explicit marking of causal relation (main clauses), i.e. clauses for which the causal relation must be inferred. Thus, this study is not a simple replication of Bardovi-Harlig’s (1994) study.

7.3.3.2 Results and discussion

The hypothesis that a causal relation between the clause containing the target verb and the clause containing the verb indicating topic time (or some other clause in the texts) may be a factor facilitating the use of the pluperfect was not confirmed. The statistical analysis of the material (28 pluperfect clauses causally related to the past clause indicating topic time or some other clause in the texts and 22 pluperfect clauses not related causally to the past clause indicating topic time or some other clause in the texts) failed to display a statistically significant partial effect in the multiple regression model. This means that no relationship between the rate of accuracy in the use of the pluperfect and the causal relation of the pluperfect clause to the clause indicating topic time was found in this analysis.

Provided that we may extend to the use of the pluperfect the hypothesis which states that in marking of the plural learners favour “redundant” contexts, this result seems to indicate that the hypothesis of “redundant” use of the pluperfect, perhaps, should not be generalised as holding for the clauses in which there is no explicit marking of the causal relation of pluperfect clauses to clauses containing the indication of topic time (or some other clauses on the text). Neither should this theory, perhaps, hold for the clauses which do not express an objective causal connection in the real world, as in (72), but in which causal relation is established by the narrator, as in (73).

(72) Han var hungrig. Han hade inte ätit någon mat på tre dagar. ‘He was hungry. He had not eaten any food for three days.’

(73) Den andra kastade sig på marken och låtsades vara död. Han hade hört att björnar inte angriper döda människor. ‘The other man threw himself to the ground and pretended to be dead. He had heard that bears do not attack dead people.’
The temporal order of events in the latter type of causal connection may be more difficult to notice than in the former type, i.e. an objective causal connection in the real world, and thus not be marked in agreement with the target language norm.

7.3.4 Type of pluperfect: actional vs. statal: (V17)

The idea of distinguishing two types of the pluperfect is not quite new. Two types of perfect and pluperfect are mentioned in the grammars of contemporary Danish (Diderichsen 1971), Norwegian (Beito 1970), Icelandic (Kress 1982) and Faroese (Lockwood 1977). In those languages, both variants of the perfect tenses are overtly marked with the temporal form corresponding to the English auxiliary verbs have and be, respectively. The factors suggested as determining the syntactic variation have to do with the syntactic and semantic type of verbs occurring in the perfect structures, e.g. transitive vs. intransitive or durative vs. punctual. Two types of perfectual tenses are also mentioned in the historical studies of Swedish (Johannisson 1958).

The distinction between two types of the pluperfect suggested in the present study is not based on the syntactic or semantic character of the main verb. My point of departure is in general theories of tense: the deictic theory of tense proposed by Reichenbach (1947), Comrie (1985) and Klein (1994), a typological description of the perfect proposed by Maslov (1988), the study of the pluperfect in German carried out by Thieroff (1994), and the latest descriptions of the pluperfect in Swedish by Christensen (1997) and Teleman et al. (1999), reviewed in the theoretical part of this work, together with the results of my own linguistic test carried out with native speakers of Swedish (Zielonka 2000).

In many of the theories reviewed in the theoretical part of the thesis (see 2.1), three points of time or time intervals are taken into consideration in the descriptions of tenses: the time of speech, S, the topic time (or the point of reference), TT, and the time of action, TA. The meaning ascribed to the pluperfect is that of locating the time of action, TA, before the topic time, TT, which is placed prior to the present moment, S. This relation is symbolically presented in the following way:

TA before TT before S
The fact that two different temporal components, TA and TT, both placed before the time of speech, are involved in the meaning of the pluperfect may give rise to a certain ambiguity in pluperfect clauses. This ambiguity may be best illustrated with the help of the following example, being an adaptation of Vennemann’s (1987:247) example:

(74) Den 1 september 1939 hade Hitler anfallit Polen. ‘On September 1st 1939 Hitler had invaded Poland.’

(75) Den 2 september 1939 hade Hitler anfallit Polen. ‘On September 2nd 1939 Hitler had invaded Poland.’

The ambiguity as to when Hitler actually invaded Poland is caused by the fact that the adverbs of time occurring with the pluperfect clauses may either refer to TT or to TA. The difference between the two clauses may be symbolically illustrated in the following way:

(74’) TA adv – TT – S
(75’) TA – TT adv – S

The two clauses presented above are examples of two types of the pluperfect. In agreement with Maslov’s (1988) terminology, one type of the pluperfect is called *actional* and the other is called *statal*. On the basis of the literature quoted above, the actional pluperfect is defined as emphasising the temporal plane *precedence* i.e. the time of action, TA, or, in other words, the time of the main verb (the supine). In this case, the central role is played by the action, with some resultant consequences. The action is semantically more important, and the consequences are “bleached”, or wholly annulled. Actional pluperfect clauses are compatible with the adverbs referring to the time of action such as: *tidigare* ‘earlier’, *förut* ‘before’, *just* ‘just’, *strax innan* ‘just before’, *på sistone* ‘recently’ etc. The actional pluperfect is illustrated in clause (76), below.

(76) Han lufsade bort samma väg som han (tidigare) hade kommit. ‘He lumbered away the same way as he had come (before).’

The statal pluperfect is defined as emphasising the temporal plane *sequence* i.e. the topic time, TT, or, in other words, the time of the auxiliary verb. Thus, the meaning carried by this type of the
pluperfect is that of some state being the result of an action. The state is semantically more important, while the action is “bleached”. Statal pluperfect clauses are compatible with the adverb referring to the topic time *vid det laget* ‘by then’. The statal pluperfect is illustrated in clause (77), below:

\[(77) \quad \ldots \text{han satt fast. Av den myckna maten hade han (vid det laget) blivit tjockare. ‘}\ldots \text{he was stuck. Due to all this food he had become fatter (by then).’}\]

According to Teleman et al. (1999:IV:243), the interpretation of the pluperfect is highly dependent on the linguistic context. This means that one and the same clause may in one context be classified as actional and in another context as statal. Even a slight change of the context may change the emphasis. The respective meanings of the pluperfect can be brought about by (non-)occurrence of particular temporal adverbs, or they may be the effect of the information available from the general perception of the linguistic situation and/or world knowledge and possibly also some other factors. This issue is far from being fully investigated.

The theoretical assumptions described above were tested in a linguistic experiment involving compatibility judgements, carried out in 1997 and described and interpreted in Zielonka (2000). Twelve linguistically trained native speakers of Swedish were asked to classify the occurrences of the pluperfect in the short story “Bortbytingen” by Selma Lagerlöf into the respective types of the pluperfect. The classification was to be made on the basis of the compatibility of the pluperfect clauses either with the adverbs referring to the time of action or with the adverbs referring to the topic time. No theoretical explanations had been given to the informants prior to the test – the informants were supposed to make intuitive judgements.

The results of this experiment indicated that the two types of perfect are a psychological reality for native speakers of Swedish. In many cases, the informants were able to unambiguously distinguish the two types of the pluperfect. In some cases, the informants’ intuitions were not in agreement – some informants classified certain clauses as compatible with the adverbs referring to the time of action while other informants classified the same clauses as compatible with the adverbs referring to the topic time.
In some cases, the informants judged the clauses as compatible with both types of adverbs. This means that the two types of the pluperfect are not always separable.

The occurrences of the pluperfect classified by the native speakers with a high degree of consensus as statal or actional were also preliminarily analysed with respect to grounding (Zielonka 2000). In linguistic literature, the pluperfect is generally described as a typically backgrounding device which only exceptionally, e.g. in literary texts, may be sequential (Hopper 1979a, Reinhart 1984, Declerck 1991). The results of my analysis suggest that the textual function of the pluperfect may be more diversified than that – each type of the pluperfect may have a slightly different textual role. One way to account for this difference in meaning is to analyse the narrative events in the above fragments in terms of their position on the temporal axis of the plot.

With the focus on the time of action, the situation expressed by the pluperfect seems to belong to the background “proper”. It seems to be disconnected from the temporal axis of the plot, i.e. placed out of the sequence of other past events and to give an impression of temporal remoteness. This intuition is graphically presented as Figure 11 below. The full line represents the main temporal axis of the narrative plot. The broken line represents the background. Foreground and background events are marked with O on the respective line.

Han lufsade bort samma väg som han hade kommit.
‘He lumbered away the same way as he had come.’

---O---

Figure 11. Textual function of the actional pluperfect

The textual function of the statal pluperfect seems to be slightly different. With the focus placed on the topic time and thus emphasising not the action, but its consequences at the time of the verb indicating the topic time in the past (point of reference), an ensuing resulting state, the statal pluperfect seems to affect the main narrative line of the plot in some way. This intuition is graphically
presented in Figure 12. As above, the full line represents the main temporal axis of the narrative plot and the broken line represents the background. Foreground and background events are marked with O on the respective line. The arrow indicates that the resulting state affects the main line of the plot.

Jag klarade inträdesprovet ganska bra eftersom jag hade studerat engelska i många år. ‘I managed to pass the entrance exam because I had studied English for many years.

---

Figure 12. Textual function of the statal pluperfect

The statement that the statal pluperfect seems to affect the main line of the plot is not to be understood as a claim that the statal pluperfect belongs to the narrative foreground. Encoding anterior narrative events, the pluperfect usually does not move the narrative time forward and thus it does not meet the defining criterion of the foreground. The statal pluperfect seems to belong to a layer somewhere in between the background and the foreground, being a less remote background or a subsidiary foreground. The textual role of these two types of pluperfect seems to be a promising area for future research.

Another issue studied in Zielonka (2000) which may be of some importance to the present study was the relationship between the two types of the pluperfect and the pluperfect as the backshifted preterit and as the backshifted perfect. A group of native speakers of Swedish were asked to change the tense in some parts of the same short story involving pluperfect clauses, i.e. to replace the preterite with the historical present and make appropriate resultant changes in the pluperfect clauses. The results of this linguistic test revealed an interesting tendency. The pluperfect clauses which on the basis of the first experiment were assumed to be cases of actional pluperfect were in the second experiment rendered either with the perfect or with the preterit. The pluperfect clauses which on the basis of the first experiment were assumed to be cases of statal pluperfect were in the second experiment rendered with the perfect or with the present tense and not with the preterit.
This finding was taken as suggesting a slight modification to Jespersen’s (1931:81) observation that the pluperfect “primarily serves to denote before-past time or a retrospective past, two things which stand in the same relation to each other as the preterit and the perfect but cannot easily be kept apart”. What cannot be kept apart is actional pluperfect (backshifted preterit or backshifted actional perfect). Statal pluperfect seems to be backshifted statal perfect. This suggestion is based on an assumption that, in some cases, although not as clearly and not as frequently as in the case of pluperfect clauses, perfect clauses may also have a different distribution of focus. Statal perfect would thus be compatible with temporal adverbs referring to the topic time (the present moment) e.g. nu '(by) now’. Actional perfect would be compatible with temporal adverbs referring to the time of action, e.g. förut ‘before’, nyss ‘just before’, or exceptionally even with adverbs of definite time. Cases of occurrence of the perfect with adverbs of definite time (actional perfect), noted in Teleman et al. (1999:IV:238) and discussed in the theoretical part of this work (see 2.1.3), seem to support this assumption.

7.3.4.1 Hypothesis

On the basis of the theoretical considerations and the results of the empirical test showing that the two types of the pluperfect are a psychological reality for native speakers of Swedish, an assumption was made that one of the two types of the pluperfect may be easier for foreign language learners to acquire than the other. The preliminary hypothesis was that being clearly distinct from the events on the main line of the plot, the events encoded by the actional pluperfect may be more easily perceived as taking place prior to past events belonging to the main line of the plot. And conversely, having focus on the state resulting from an action and thus affecting the main line of the plot in some way, the events or situations encoded by the statal pluperfect may be more difficult to be perceived as prior to past events belonging to the main line of the plot.

The assumption that the actional pluperfect may be a more favourable context than the statal also rests on foreign language teaching pedagogy, i.e. the way in which the pluperfect rule is often
introduced to the learners. Presented in a simplified way, the pluperfect is often described as a tense encoding events taking place before other past events or before a time point in the past. This rule seems to emphasise the actional, rather than the statal meaning of the pluperfect.

7.3.4.2 The method of classification and classification problems

The respective semantic value for the occurrences of the pluperfect in the analysed language samples was determined by means of the same compatibility test as the one used in the experiment referring to the perception of the pluperfect in the literary text. Two native speakers of Swedish, doctoral students at the Department of Scandinavian Languages at the University of Stockholm who did not take part in the previous tests, were asked to assess the acceptability of pluperfect clauses with inserted adverbs of one or the other type – those referring to the time of action and those referring to the topic time. The judgements were made spontaneously, with very little time allowed for thinking. The terms actional and statal perfect had not been mentioned to the informants.

Compatibility judgements were made with a high degree of consensus. In the majority of cases both informants assessed the acceptability of the pluperfect clauses with the respective types of adverbs in the same way. In some cases one of the informants judged particular occurrences of the pluperfect as compatible with an adverb referring to the time of action, while the other informant judged the same occurrences as compatible with an adverb referring to the topic time. Some clauses were judged as compatible with both types of adverbs by both informants.

The discrepancies in the classification of the language samples are not discussed in detail because they are of minor importance in this analysis. The linguistic material in this study was classified in the following way: the pluperfect clauses which were assessed by both informants as compatible solely with the adverbs referring to the time of action were assumed to be cases of the actional pluperfect. All the other pluperfect clauses, i.e. those classified by both informants as compatible solely with the adverbs referring to the topic time, those classified by both informants as compatible
with both types of adverbs, and those classified by one of the informants as compatible with adverbs referring to the topic time, were assumed to be cases of the statal pluperfect.

7.3.4.3 Results and discussion

The statistical analysis of the material (33 actional and 17 statal pluperfect clauses) disconfirmed the hypothesis that actional pluperfect clauses may be more favourable contexts for the pluperfect than statal pluperfect clauses. Contrary to my expectations, the results of the stepwise multiple regression supplied some evidence that statal pluperfect clauses may be more favourable contexts for the pluperfect than actional pluperfect clauses. The statal pluperfect displayed a statistically significant (p=0.0829) partial effect of 0.0240. This means that the increase of the explained variation in the dependent variable, given that V8, V7, V16, V13, V9 and V10 are already in the model, will be 2.4 per cent when V17 is included. The positive sign of the parameter estimate for this variable indicates that the statal pluperfect clauses may have been more favourable contexts for the use of the pluperfect than actional pluperfect clauses.

Although a reference to the background/foreground was made in the description of the variable type of the pluperfect, the results of this study are not directly comparable with the results of the effect of grounding upon the acquisition of the preterit, as reviewed in an earlier part of my thesis (see 3.2). In the earlier studies, the foreground was defined as moving the narrative time forward. The pluperfect, irrespective of being statal or actional, does not move the narrative time forward and is regarded as a typical backgrounding device. Thus, the results of the analysis of the linguistic material in terms of the type of the pluperfect cannot be interpreted with respect to the claims of earlier research on the effect of grounding upon the acquisition of the preterit.

The explanation that I would like to offer as to why the statal pluperfect may be a more favourable context in the acquisition of the pluperfect than the actional pluperfect is based on three assumptions. The first assumption, already discussed above, is that perfect clauses, although perhaps not as clearly as pluperfect clauses, may also focus either on the time of action or on the topic time,
i.e. it may be possible to distinguish two types of perfect: actional and statal. The other two assumptions are that the acquisition of the perfect is a necessary (but not sufficient) condition for the emergence of the pluperfect, and the third assumption is that the acquisition of the pluperfect goes via the perfect. With our point of departure in these assumptions, four main stages in the acquisition of the pluperfect by Polish learners of Swedish may be outlined.

At an early stage of acquisition (stage 1), the learners fail to mark anteriority of one past event in relation to another past event with tense contrast, i.e. they erroneously use the preterit instead of the pluperfect and rely heavily on some other markers of anteriority, whether lexical (e.g. adverbs indicating the temporal order) or structural (e.g. causal clauses).

At the next stage of development (stage 2), the anteriority of one past event in relation to another past event is marked with non-native-like tense contrast, a past event prior to another past event being often erroneously marked with the perfect. Some empirical evidence for the perfect as a transitional construction en route to the acquisition of the pluperfect can be found in the analysed material – almost 600 of about 1750 erroneous uses of other tenses in the contexts demanding the pluperfect involved the perfect, the remaining erroneous uses involving the preterit. The perfect was used more often than the preterit in some (not all) statal pluperfect contexts, e.g. clause nr 4, clause nr 6, clause nr 7 and clause nr 12 (see Appendix 4) but no consistent preference was noticed for the perfect in the remaining contexts for the statal pluperfect. Thus, no unambiguous empirical evidence to support my speculation was found in this study. This observation is not surprising. Since the correct use of the pluperfect seems to be affected by many different linguistic factors, the assumed positive effect of the factor type of perfect: statal can in some contexts be overridden by the effect of some other factors.

At stage 3, the perfect is backshifted. In her report on the results of her experimental study on the acquisition of the pluperfect, Bardovi-Harlig (1997) makes a claim about the meaning of the perfect which is similar to that made by Maslov (1998) (see 3.2 and 2.1.1.1). According to her, the meaning of the perfect involves two semantic features, namely, ANTERIOR and CURRENT RELEVANCE. The feature ANTERIOR is shared by both the perfect and the preterit.
These two tenses, the perfect and the preterit, are truth-functionally identical. A pair of clauses differing solely in terms of tense has the same truth value, i.e. it is not possible to assert one of them and deny the other or vice versa (Smith 1981, unavailable publication, quoted in Bardovi-Harlig 1997). The difference between the two tenses involves the semantic feature CURRENT RELEVANCE – only the perfect has this semantic feature as part of its meaning. Thus, this feature seems to be the prototypical feature of the meaning denoted by this tense. The use of the perfect, highlighting the prototypical feature CURRENT RELEVANCE, may be easier to acquire and to backshift than the uses of the perfect highlighting the feature ANTERIOR, which is encoded by more than one temporal form. Or to put it differently, once the perfect is to some degree acquired, the type of perfect involving its prototypical feature may be easier to backshift and thus may constitute a more favourable context for the pluperfect than the type of perfect highlighting the semantic feature shared with the preterit.

At stage 4, both types of the perfect are backshifted. At stage 5, the preterit is also backshifted and thus the temporal use of the pluperfect is finally acquired.

Stages in the acquisition of the pluperfect are to be understood as gradual shifts in the frequency of the use of a given form ascribed to a particular stage. This means that the forms ascribed to an earlier or later stage may sometimes appear at a given stage.

The process of learning to backshift the preterit may be impeded by previous linguistic knowledge, i.e. the learners’ L1. Polish does not have the perfect or the pluperfect (see 2.1.4) and consequently does not backshift the preterit. Once the perfect is to some degree acquired, and the formal similarity between the perfect and the pluperfect is noticed, the form that does not occur in Polish, the perfect, may be easier to backshift than the form which has its counterpart in the learners’ L1, but is not backshifted, the preterit. Since in Polish the preterit in its secondary function (as a relative tense) is used in some types of clauses to indicate an anterior action, i.e. since the transitional form, possibly the universal transitional form, corresponds to the L1 form, reaching the final developmental stage may be greatly delayed (see 4.1)

Some additional evidence for the assumption that the acquisition of the pluperfect may go via the perfect was supplied by the
results of a translation test with a group of 30 advanced learners of English, students at the Teacher Training College at the University of Gdansk. The statal pluperfect (backshifted perfect), was supplied with 100 per cent accuracy, whereas about 20 per cent of the informants failed to supply the actional pluperfect, i.e. the backshifted preterit (Zielonka 2002).

This issue is far from being conclusively investigated. Further research, also about the acquisition of the perfect, must be carried out before any firm statements about the acquisition of the two types of the pluperfect, actional vs. statal, can be made.

7.3.4 The effect of linguistic factors upon the correct use of the pluperfect: summary of results

Of the twelve linguistic factors hypothesised to affect the use of the pluperfect by Polish learners of Swedish as a foreign language, as many as six were found to have a statistically significant partial effect in this model of stepwise multiple regression.

In the group of factors connected with the type of verbal indication of topic time, Group A, two of the five linguistic factors (independent variables), V8 and V13, were found to have a statistically significant partial effect. Variable V8, *intrasentential vs. intersentential indication of the topic time*, displayed a particularly strong partial effect (0.4329). The negative sign of the parameter estimate indicates that the first subgroup, *intrasentential position of the verb indicating topic time*, which in my material overlaps with the subordinate clauses, may have facilitated the correct use of the pluperfect. And conversely, the second subgroup, *intersentential position of the verb indicating topic time*, i.e. the indication of the topic time in the adjacent clause, which in my material overlaps with the main clauses, may have inhibited the correct use of the pluperfect in this study. This result confirms the initial hypothesis. Only this result of the stepwise multiple regression is unassailable.

V13, the second of the variables connected with the type of verbal indication of topic time which displayed a statistically significant partial effect, is *bounded vs. unbounded meaning of the verb indicating topic time*. The positive sign of the parameter estimate indicates that the second subgroup, *indication of topic time by unbounded...*
verbs, may have been a factor facilitating the correct use of the pluperfect, and the first subgroup, indication of topic time by bounded verbs, may have been a factor inhibiting the correct use of the pluperfect in this study. This result confirms the initial hypothesis.

One of the variables, namely V7, *non-reported speech vs. reported speech* (indication of topic time by verbs of speaking), which was initially selected as having a statistically significant partial effect upon the dependent variable, was at a later stage rejected by the stepwise procedure. This factor could have displayed a statistically significant partial effect at the cost of some other variables. This means that this factor may be of importance in the acquisition of the pluperfect, and that it is worth a further study on a larger and more rigourously elicited corpus.

The two remaining linguistic factors referring to the indication of topic time, namely V15, *the distance between the verb indicating topic time and the target verb*, measured in terms of the location of the indication of the topic time in the same or in the adjacent sentence vs. indication of topic time further away than in the adjacent clause, and V11, *multiple vs. single indication of topic time*, did not display a partial effect in this model of stepwise multiple regression. This means that the hypothesis as to the influence of these linguistic factors upon the accurate use of the pluperfect has not been confirmed. The negative result concerning V15 seems to support the finding referring to V8, suggesting that location of the verb indicating topic time in the same clause may enhance the correct use of the pluperfect.

Of the three linguistic factors referring to the semantics of the target verb, Group B, only one, namely V16, *agentive vs. non-agentive meaning of the target verb*, was found to have a statistically significant partial effect in this model of stepwise multiple regression. The negative sign of the parameter estimate indicates that the first subgroup, *agentive meaning of the target verb*, may have enhanced, and the second subgroup, *non-agentive meaning of the target verb*, may have inhibited the correct use of the pluperfect in this study. This result confirms the initial hypothesis. The remaining factors referring to the semantics of the target verb, V12, *bounded vs. unbounded meaning of the target verb*, and V18, *resultative vs. non-resultative meaning of the target verb*, were not found to have a statistically significant partial effect in this model of stepwise multiple regression. Thus, the
hypothesis that bounded or resultative meaning of the target verb may facilitate the use of the pluperfect has not been confirmed.

In the group of miscellaneous factors, Group C, those directly or indirectly referring to the level of the text, three out of the four linguistic factors displayed a statistically significant partial effect. Those factors are: $V_9$, function of the subordinate clauses: specifying vs. constituting, $V_{10}$, location of the time of action of pluperfect clauses outside vs. within the temporal frame of the narrative plot, and $V_{17}$, type of pluperfect: actional vs. statal. The negative sign of the parameter estimate for $V_9$ and $V_{10}$ indicates that the subgroups specifying subordinate clauses and the location of the time of action of pluperfect clauses outside the narrative framework may have facilitated the correct use of the pluperfect. Conversely, the subgroups constituting subordinate clauses and the location of the time of action of pluperfect clauses within the temporal frame of the narrative plot may have inhibited the correct use of the pluperfect. This result confirms the initial hypothesis.

The positive sign of the parameter estimate for the variable $V_{17}$, type of pluperfect: actional vs. statal, indicates that the second subgroup, statal pluperfect, may have had a positive effect upon the correct use of the pluperfect. And conversely, the first subgroup, actional pluperfect, may have had a negative effect upon the correct use of the pluperfect in this study. This result is contrary to my expectations. My assumption was that actional pluperfect clauses would constitute a favourable context for the pluperfect.

One of the variables belonging to the group of miscellaneous factors, namely $V_{14}$, type of semantic relation between the clause containing the target verb and the clause containing the verb indicating topic time (or some other clause): causal vs. non-causal, did not display a statistically significant partial effect in this model of stepwise multiple regression. Thus, the hypothesis that the use of the pluperfect may be affected by causal relation (explicitly marked or inferred from the context) of the pluperfect clause to some other clause was not confirmed in this model of stepwise multiple regression.

The general conclusion which can be drawn from the study is that the correct use of the pluperfect in this study may have been influenced by linguistic context, some features of linguistic contexts facilitating and some inhibiting the accurate use of this tense.
8 Final discussion

This chapter contains final discussion: an attempt to answer the research questions presented in 4.1, a general interpretation of the obtained results, an assessment of the methodological framework of the study and some guidelines for future research.

8.1 Answers to the research questions

Although the analysed language samples have not been quite suitable for statistical analysis, some interesting acquisitional trends have emerged. They are discussed below in terms of the answers to the three research questions posed in 4.1.

8.1.1 Is the correct use of the pluperfect affected by the linguistic context?

The results of the statistical analysis of the material, particularly the spread in accuracy rates with which the Polish learners of Swedish as a foreign language used the pluperfect in the contexts admitting the pluperfect, clearly showed that the use of the pluperfect by Polish learners of Swedish as a foreign language was greatly variable. Having an explicit knowledge of the pluperfect rule, the informants nevertheless failed to use the pluperfect in a consistent way. In some contexts the pluperfect was supplied with a very high rate of accuracy: as many as 88 per cent of the informants giving a response to a particular clause correctly used the pluperfect. In other contexts the pluperfect was supplied with a very low rate of accuracy: as few as 9 per cent of the informants giving a response to a particular clause correctly used the pluperfect. All the other values were evenly distributed through the whole range (see Appendix 4).
Since some of the non-linguistic factors which, according to Ellis (1994:134), may be a source of systematic variability, e.g. the situational context (the scene and the participants) and, to a high degree, the psycholinguistic context (all tasks were written tasks), were kept constant, and since the results of this model of stepwise multiple regression indicated that the use of the pluperfect may not have been affected by the type of the written task or by the type of response, it is assumed that the variable use of the pluperfect may be related to the linguistic context. Thus, the answer to the first research question seems to be positive: the use of the pluperfect may be affected by the linguistic context. Some linguistic contexts may have facilitative effect, as evidenced in a high rate of correct use of the pluperfect, and some contexts may have an inhibitive effect, as evidenced in a low rate of correct use of the pluperfect.

8.1.2 Which linguistic factors may account for variable application of the pluperfect?

As described in Chapter 5, the effect of six of the twelve linguistic factors hypothesised to affect the correct use of the pluperfect has been confirmed by the stepwise multiple regression procedure. Some factors from each of the main groups of factors – Group A (linguistic factors connected with the type of verbal indication of topic time), Group B (linguistic factors referring to the semantics of the target verb), and Group C (miscellaneous linguistic factors), most of which directly or indirectly involve textual features – yielded statistical significance. This means that these factors may be of importance in the acquisition of the pluperfect. The factors which yielded statistically significant partial effects are:

Group A: Factors connected with the type of verbal indication of topic time
1. Location of the verb indicating topic time with reference to the target verb: intrasentential vs. intersentential indication of the topic time, (V8).
2. Bounded vs. unbounded meaning of the verb indicating topic time, (V13).

Group B: Factors referring to the semantics of the target verbs
1. Agentive vs. non-agentive meaning of the target verb, (V16).
Group C: Miscellaneous factors
1. Function of the subordinate clauses: specifying vs. constituting, (V9).
2. Location of the time of action of the pluperfect clauses outside vs. within the temporal frame of the narrative plot, (V10).
3. Type of pluperfect: actional vs. statal, (V17).

As mentioned earlier (see 4.4.3), each of the linguistic factors (independent variables in stepwise multiple regression) hypothesised to affect the use of the pluperfect was binary, i.e. it consisted of two sub-groups. One of the sub-groups was assumed to have facilitative and the other was assumed to have inhibitive effect. The following subgroups of the linguistic factors which yielded statistically significant partial effects were found to facilitate the accurate use of the pluperfect:

Group A: Factors connected with the features of the verb indicating topic time
1. Intrasentential indication of the topic time (subordinate clause), (V8).
2. Unbounded verb indicating topic time, (V13).

Group B: Factors referring to the semantics of the target verb
1. Agentive meaning of the target verb, (V16).

Group C: Miscellaneous factors
1. Specifying subordinate clauses, (V9).
2. Location of the time of action of pluperfect clauses outside the temporal frame of the narrative plot, (V10).

The relative impact of the factors favouring the use of the pluperfect varies sharply. The strongest impact, 0.4329, accounting for 43 per cent of the total variation in the use of the pluperfect, was displayed by the factor *intrasentential vs. intersentential indication of the topic time* (subordinate clause vs. main clause), V8. The effect of the remaining linguistic factors having statistically significant partial effects upon the use of the pluperfect by Polish learners of Swedish is considerably weaker. Measured in terms of
numerical values, the linguistic factor agentive vs. non-agentive meaning of the target verb, V16, and the linguistic factor bounded vs. unbounded meaning of the verb indicating topic time, V13, each account for an almost 5 per cent increase in the explained variation, given that V8 is already in the model. The linguistic factors function of the subordinate clause: specifying vs. constituting, V9, and location of the time of action encoded by the pluperfect verb: outside vs. inside the temporal frame of the narrative plot, V10, each account for more than a 3 per cent increase of the explained variation, given that V8, V16 and V13 already are in the model. The linguistic factor type of pluperfect: actional vs. statal, V17, accounts for more than a 2 per cent increase of the explained variation, given that all the remaining variables yielding statistically significant partial effect already are in the model.

Actually, the effect of the linguistic factors V9, V10, V13, V16, and V17 upon the use of the pluperfect may have been somewhat stronger than indicated by the numerical values presented above. Some of the effects of these variables upon the use of the pluperfect is already reflected in the variable intrasentential vs. intersentential indication of topic time, which was entered as the first, most important variable. This order of entry was justified by the result of a separate statistical analysis, NP AIR1WAY PROCEDURE, Wilcoxon Scores (Rank Sums) for the Variable ANDEL, in which the effect of linguistic context was measured separately for each factor. In this analysis, variable V8 displayed the highest level of statistical significance (Prob > 0.0001). Since the difference in the level of partial effect among the remaining variables is not big, the issue of the amount of partial effect for each of the remaining statistically significant variables will not be discussed any further in this work.

One factor, namely, non-reported speech vs. reported speech (indication of topic time by verbs of speaking), V7, could have displayed a statistically significant partial effect in this model of stepwise multiple regression only at the cost of some other variables. Thus, although not confirmed by the results obtained in this model of stepwise multiple regression, this factor may also be taken as affecting the use of the pluperfect, reported speech (indication of the topic time by verbs of speaking) being a less favourable linguistic factor than non-reported speech.
The overall variance explained by this model of stepwise multiple regression is 67 per cent. This means that 33 per cent of the variation remains unaccounted for, e.g. may have been an effect of some linguistic factors not taken into consideration in this study, or cases of non-systematic variation, e.g. moments of inattention.

The results of the stepwise multiple regression seem to suggest that the most favourable context for the pluperfect may be the subordinate, specifying, agentive clause. The topic time for the most favourable clause is indicated by an unbounded verb and it is in focus, i.e. the clause is a case of statal pluperfect, with the time of action located outside the temporal frame of the narrative plot. And vice versa, the least favourable context for the pluperfect seems to be the main, non-agentive clause. The topic time for the least favourable clause is indicated by a bounded verb and it is not in focus. The time of action is located within the temporal frame of the narrative plot and it is in focus, i.e. the clause is a case of actional pluperfect.

Obviously, it is not often the case that all the linguistic features found to favour the use of the pluperfect, or all the linguistic features found to inhibit the use of the pluperfect, are combined in a single clause. Usually, those features occur in different combinations in which a facilitative effect of one or some factors may to some degree be overridden or neutralised by the presence of one or some factors inhibiting the use of the pluperfect. And vice versa, an inhibitive effect of one or some factors may be to some degree overridden or neutralised by one or some factors favouring the use of the pluperfect. Thus, different combinations in a single clause of the factors favouring or inhibiting the use of the pluperfect and the relative weight of those factors may account for different degrees of difficulty of the contexts for the pluperfect.

Some of the linguistic factors which on the basis of earlier research or on the basis of earlier literature were hypothesised as affecting the correct use of the pluperfect did not yield statistically significant partial effects. Those factors are: V11, multiple vs. single indication of topic time, V12, bounded vs. unbounded meaning of the target verb, V18, resultative vs. non-resultative meaning of the target verb, V14, type of semantic relation between the clause containing the target verb and the clause containing the verb indicating topic time (or some other verb): causal vs. non-causal, and V15, indication of the topic time in the same
or the adjacent clause vs. indication of the topic time further away
than in the same or the adjacent clause.

However, the results of this model of stepwise multiple regres-
sion cannot be taken as unambiguously disconfirming the effect
of these factors upon the correct use of the pluperfect. In a dif-
ferent model of step-wise multiple regression, i.e. in a model in
which one (or some) of the current variables had been removed,
some of the linguistic factors which did not yield statistically sig-
nificant partial effect could, perhaps, have done so.

The results of this model of stepwise multiple regression could
also, perhaps, have been slightly different, if all the correct re-
sponses had been taken into account. As mentioned in 4.4.1,
eighteen correct responses, ten correct responses in clause nr 10
and eight in clause nr 11 (see Appendix 4), were eliminated from
scoring due to some complications in the classification of the target
verbs in terms of actional meaning. A cursory analysis of the lin-
guistic features present in the clauses eliminated from scoring
shows that some of the factors which did not yield statistically sig-
nificant partial effects could, perhaps, have done so. Possible candi-
dates are the subgroups of V11, multiple indication of topic time,
V14, causal relation between the clause containing the target verb
and the clause containing the verb indicating the topic time (or
some other verb) and V18, resultative meaning of the target verb.

As mentioned before, the main value of this work does not lie in
the results of the stepwise multiple regression, but in grounding
the hypothesis in theoretical descriptions of language, i.e. my lin-
guistically-grounded discussions as to which linguistic factors,
and why, may have affected the correct use of the pluperfect and
in suggesting a whole range of linguistic factors not taken into
consideration in earlier research on the subject.

8.1.3 Why may particular linguistic factors
account for different degrees of difficulty
in the application of the pluperfect rule?

An answer to the third research question, i.e. the question as to
why particular linguistic factors may account for the variable
use of the pluperfect is very difficult, and in most cases simply
impossible. As stated in the introductory part of this work, my linguistically-grounded discussions constitute an attempt at answering this question. Those discussions, i.e. my justifications of the hypotheses and my interpretations of the obtained results, are presented in the respective parts of this work and will not be repeated in this section. Instead, an attempt will be made to point out some underlying principles emerging from my linguistically-grounded discussions.

As mentioned earlier, the results of the investigation show that the pluperfect was used with a greatly variable level of accuracy. In some linguistic contexts, the degree of accuracy was relatively high, the highest value being 88 per cent correct responses. In other contexts, the degree of accuracy was very low, the lowest value being 5 per cent correct responses. A very general answer to the third research question – why some contexts for the pluperfect may be more favourable than others – is seemingly obvious: some contexts for the pluperfect may be easier than others because some particular linguistic features present in those contexts may make the temporal relations of events (anteriority of one event in relation to another) more conspicuous for the learners, i.e. learners are, as it were, reminded of the application of the pluperfect rule.

Three different kinds of conspicuous contexts have been noticed in this study. They are:

1. clauses with intrasentential location of topic time
2. clauses in which the temporal order of events may be retrieved from some structural and semantic features
3. clauses with the time of action located outside the temporal frame of the narrative plot

As far as the intrasentential location of topic time is concerned, it seems plausible to assume that it is easier to discern contexts for the pluperfect in cases when the topic time is indicated by a verb (or an adverb) situated in the same clause than in the cases when the topic time is situated in the adjacent clause, or further away than in the adjacent clause. In other words, it may be easier to relate temporally events contained in a single sentence than to relate events contained in longer parts of the text. Learners whose mother tongue does not have the pluperfect seem only gradually
to develop the ability to think in terms of the indication of topic time. The earliest developmental stages seem to involve the ability to have recourse only to the matrix clause. The ability to relate the target verb to the indication of topic time located in the adjacent clause, or further away than in the adjacent clause, seems to be developed somewhat later, and, possibly, irrespective of the way the pluperfect is introduced and practiced in foreign language classes.

As far as the contexts in which it is possible to retrieve the information about the temporal order of events from linguistic elements of the clause, i.e. the contexts in which the use of the pluperfect is “redundant”, it is possible to assume that the learners notice these “signals” and are thus reminded of the pluperfect rule. In the present study the contexts in which the pluperfect is communicatively “redundant” are: relative, nominal and causal subordinate clauses and the clauses for which the topic time is indicated by an unbounded verb, particularly in the cases in which the target verb is bounded.

Since V14, a causal relation between the clause containing the target verb and the clause containing the verb indicating the topic time (or some other verb), did not display a statistically significant partial effect in this study, the assumption that causal clauses favour the correct use of the pluperfect may seem questionable. This assumption may, perhaps, be justified in the following way: firstly, some of the clauses did not involve a natural causal relation, the cause preceding the result, but were rather the narrator’s inference of causal relationship of events, as in example (73), repeated here as (78):

(78) Den andra kastade sig på marken och låtsades vara död. Han hade hört att björnar aldrig angriper döda människor. ‘The other man threw himself to the ground and pretended to be dead. He had heard that bears do not attack dead people.’

Secondly, the result of the stepwise multiple regression would quite possibly have been different, if all the correct responses for the pluperfect had been taken into consideration (see 8.1.2).

Some additional evidence for the assumption that the pluperfect is used more often in the contexts in which it is “redundant” seems to be supplied by clause nr 1 in the rank order list (see Appendix 4). In this clause the temporal order of events, an event
anterior to another past event, is clearly and unambiguously marked by the temporal adverb _aldrig tidigare_ 'never before'. Since this clause does not differ considerably from many other clauses as far as the presence of the linguistic factors hypothesised to enhance the use of the pluperfect is concerned, the explanation that the presence of the temporal adverb signalling the temporal order of events may have facilitated the correct use of this tense seems plausible.

The third kind of conspicuous context for the pluperfect is the contexts involving clauses in which the time of action is situated outside the temporal frame of the narrative plot, i.e. clauses containing the linguistic feature _remoteness in time_. As described in 7.3.2.1, remoteness in time is, according to Comrie (1985:25–26), of importance in human perception of temporal relations. Remoteness in time is an implicature of the pluperfect which in some languages, e.g. Armenian or in the non-native use of some languages, such as Nepali English, has been reinterpreted as part of the meaning of the pluperfect. Thus, it seems plausible to assume that the contexts for the pluperfect involving temporally more remote events, i.e. in this study the events situated outside the temporal frame of the narrative plot, may be easier to discern.

Beside the conspicuousness principle, another general principle which can be referred to when interpreting the results of this study may be the frequency principle. It is conceivable to assume that the pluperfect may generally occur more often in some particular contexts than in others, and that particularly frequent contexts for the pluperfect will be more easily noticed. Particularly frequent contexts for the pluperfect seem to be specifying subordinate clauses (relative clauses and relative clefts). Those clauses usually express information which is intended to identify a referent and/or establish coherence relations. According to Givón (1990) and Depraetere (1996:723), this is commonly done by invoking past situations in which the referents participated, i.e. the situations earlier than the situations on the main line of the plot. It seems plausible to assume that it is easier to notice the use of the pluperfect in particularly frequent contexts and thus develop the ability to apply the pluperfect rule in those contexts much earlier than in less frequent contexts. My assumption as to relative clauses as particularly frequent contexts for the pluperfect has
been confirmed by Carter et al. (2000). Among commonly known rules, Carter gives the rule stating that the pluperfect is often used in relative clauses since they give some information (often past events) about the noun. This rule is, as it were, new, i.e. not commonly referred to in the pedagogical grammars of English or Swedish.

The same principle, the frequency of use, may, perhaps, involve the factor of agency. Agentive pluperfect clauses may be more frequent than non-agentive clauses. This may be true generally for Swedish (and many other languages) or only for the linguistic input directed to the learners in an interaction with teachers, other learners or even native speakers, simplifying their language when talking with foreigners (foreigner talk).

The frequency principle could, perhaps, also involve the semantics of the target verb. A distributional bias – unbounded verbs occurring more often with the imperfective past marking than bounded verbs – was noticed by Andersen and Shirai (1994). It seems possible to assume that bounded, or rather resultative verbs, may generally occur more often with the perfect and the pluperfect than unbounded or non-resultative verbs. This assumption seems to be confirmed by a number of attempts at defining the meaning of the perfect (and thus the pluperfect) made by different scholars: the current relevance of the effects of an earlier situation, the highlighting of the semantic component of result, attention being directed towards the result rather than to the act itself etc. (see 2.1.1.1). Since neither V12 (bounded vs unbounded meaning of the target verb) nor V18 (resultative vs. non-resultative meaning of the target verb) has displayed a statistically significant partial effect in this model of stepwise multiple regression, this assumption cannot be confirmed by the results of the present study.

8.2 Interpretation of the results in terms of theories of language acquisition

The results of my investigation seem to provide some support for the theory of the order and sequence of acquisition. As far as the order of acquisition is concerned, an important observation that is in agreement with the findings of some studies on the acquisition
of this tense in L1 and L2, the most important being Bardovi-Harlig (1994), is that the pluperfect is acquired rather late. In terms of Brown's (1973) criterion of acquisition, i.e. that a given grammatical feature is acquired if it is performed at 90 per cent accuracy levels on three consecutive data collection occasions, the pluperfect was not fully acquired by most of the informants. Only five informants were able to supply the pluperfect in all the admitting the pluperfect contexts, so not many of my informants met Brown's criterion of acquisition.

As far as the sequence of acquisition is concerned, an important observation is that the acquisition of the pluperfect may be gradual, and may have to do with facilitative or inhibitive influence of linguistic context. This may be seen in the spread in the accuracy rates, ranging from 9 per cent to 88 per cent. High rates of accuracy in some particular clauses seem to indicate that many learners, including the least advanced learners, were able to discern the context for the pluperfect and apply the pluperfect rule. And conversely, low rates of accuracy in some particular clauses seem to indicate that few learners, in many cases only the most advanced learners, were able to discern the context for the pluperfect and supply the pluperfect rule. This observation is made in accordance with Dulay and Burt's (1973) method, rates of accuracy taken as corresponding to the order of acquisition. Thus, the clauses with high numbers of correct responses may be taken as initial stages of acquisition. And conversely, the clauses with low numbers of correct responses may be taken as later stages of acquisition. More detailed and more reliable conclusions as to the pattern of emergence of the pluperfect and different stages of acquisition may only be drawn on the basis of individual data, i.e. cannot be drawn from the results of this study.

Another observation of some importance is that the correct use of the pluperfect seems to be related to the ability to perceive/recall pluperfect clauses. This observation confirms the findings of Schmidt and Frotta (1986) concerning the noticing of grammatical forms in the input and their emergence in production (see 6.2.2). The types of clauses which were relatively easy to perceive/recall, e.g. agentive, specifying (relative) clauses with intrasentential indication of topic time by an unbounded verb (see Appendix 4, clause nr 2 and nr 5) were found to also be relatively
easy in elicited production (see Appendix 4, clause nr 3 and nr 8). The types of clauses which were relatively difficult to perceive/re-call, e.g. non-agentive main clauses with intersentential indication of topic time (see Appendix 4, clause nr 50 and nr 49), were found to be relatively difficult in elicited production (see Appendix 4, clause nr 48 and nr 43).

The present study has not supplied unambiguous evidence for the facilitative effect of the mother tongue upon the correct use of the pluperfect. Some suggestions about the facilitative or inhibitive effect of certain structures of the native language upon the correct use of the pluperfect have been made for V13, i.e. the contrast between actional (aspectual) meanings of the verb indicating topic time and the target verb (see 7.1.2), and for V9, involving facilitative effect of embedding events in the noun phrase (see 7.3.1). However, it is not quite clear whether the effect of those features may unreservedly be attributed to the native language, or whether the effect of those features upon the correct use of the pluperfect is a universal tendency. Given our lack of in-depth studies involving the acquisition of the pluperfect in L1, and the acquisition of the pluperfect by the learners whose native language has the pluperfect, making any firm claims about the effect of the mother tongue upon the correct use of the pluperfect does not seem justified.

As far as the inhibitive effect of the mother tongue upon the acquisition of the pluperfect is concerned, the obtained results seem to be in agreement with the findings of Zobl (1980), who claims that the development of a particular grammatical feature may be inhibited when a universal transitional structure corresponds to L1 structure (see 4.1). Polish does not have the pluperfect form. Since the past tense form seems to be one of universal transitional structures in the acquisition of the pluperfect, the delayed acquisition of the pluperfect may, perhaps, be explained by the correspondence of the universal transitional structure to L1 structure. Since the Polish past tense form in its secondary function, i.e. as a relative tense, may in some cases indicate anteriority of one event in relation to another (see 2.1.4), the tendency to use the past tense form in the contexts for the pluperfect may be particularly strong.
8.3 Assessment of the study

In this section some aspects of my study are critically assessed. As mentioned in several places of the present work, the study has some weaknesses. Some of those weaknesses have been caused by a change from the initial design of the study. The initially planned analyses were intended to reveal the effect of only two linguistic factors, type of clause: subordinate vs. main and actional meaning of the target verb: bounded vs. unbounded. Apart from this, a number of separate analyses performed on some particular parts of the material were planned, e.g. the use of the pluperfect in the second or third clause retaining the same topic time. The initial idea had to be changed, when, on closer analysis, it turned out that the semantic categories bounded and unbounded aktionsart as presented by Teleman et al. (1999) are not adequately defined and the distinction between aktionsart and aspect is not maintained (see 2.2.4). Since it was not clear as regards the effect of which semantic category, aktionsart or aspect, was being investigated, having this factor as one of the two main linguistic factors affecting the correct use of the pluperfect would considerably diminish the value of this study. Another reason for a change in the preliminary design stems from a preliminary statistical analysis of the language samples (rank order list). The results of this analysis suggested that a different research method – a step-wise multiple regression (the method measuring a simultaneous effect of many various linguistic factors upon the use of the pluperfect) – might be more interesting. However, this means that the linguistic material was not initially planned for a statistical analysis and is not fully suitable for this purpose. Thus, both the material and the statistical analyses may contain some weaknesses, as discussed in the sections below.

8.3.1 Linguistic material

The linguistic material used in this study has some imperfections. One critical point as regards the design of the test may be that in the texts used to collect language samples the number of gaps in which the pluperfect was to be supplied was too high (54) while the number of gaps involving other tense forms (distractors) was
rather low (13). This weakness was caused by limited access to the informants. As mentioned in 4.3, language samples for this study were collected during regular language classes. Taking more than two classes for my linguistic tests would have severely impinged upon the curriculum. On the other hand, the samples had to be relatively numerous if reliable observations about the effect of linguistic context were to be made. This weakness may, to some degree, have been compensated for by the diversity of the tasks used to collect the material: recall of the verb phrases heard during the oral presentations, two different types of tasks involving filling in gaps and translation task (see 4.3). This diversity of the tasks may have, to some degree, prevented the informants from becoming test-wise.

Another critical point may be that some clauses and some verbs occur in the tasks more than once. This weakness is one of the traces of the initial design of the study. One of the initial objectives of the study was making some preliminary observations on whether the correct use of the pluperfect may be linked to particular verbs frequently used in language classes, e.g. studera, ‘study’ läsa ‘read’, lyssna ‘listen’, skriva ‘write’.

Yet another point of criticism may involve some occurrences of parallel pluperfect clauses combined by a conjunction/subjunction or asyndetically. This imperfection, too, is one of the traces of the preliminary design of the test, the research questions being whether the pluperfect will also be supplied in the second (or third) parallel pluperfect clause. The final result of the study, suggesting that the variability in the use of the pluperfect is systematic, seems to show that this imperfection was not fatal either.

As mentioned before, the use of the pluperfect is, in many cases, accounted for by a broader context. Thus, the proper way of collecting language samples involving the pluperfect is the use of a coherent text rather than the use of single clauses. This way of collecting language samples has, however, some serious drawbacks. It is very difficult to find or to construct a text with an even distribution of the features that are the object of investigation and in which all the features not being investigated are absent. Neither is it easy to find a coherent text whose elements would not pose some difficulties in the classification, especially when many different linguistic factors are involved. Translation
tests, even if they have many advantages, may be particularly difficult in this respect. The informants may give equivalents of native-language sentences not easily foreseen by the researcher and this may pose a lot of classification questions. Although some of the weaknesses in the language samples used in this study stem from the use of a coherent text, the results seem to be more reliable than the results of a study made on the basis of the language production in the form of single sentences would have been.

8.3.2 Method of scoring

The answer to the second research question which linguistic factors may account for the variable use of the pluperfect may, to some degree, have been affected by some complications in the scoring of the responses, which, consequently, could have affected the results of the stepwise multiple regression. One imperfection of this study involves a changing number of overall responses for some particular clauses on which the percentual values or proportions of correct responses are calculated. This stems from the fact that not all the informants were available for all the tests. Some informants took part only in the first session, some took part only in the second session. Thus, the number of responses for some particular clauses is in some cases different and, in some cases, some of the responses may come from different informants (see 4.3). Since group results and not individual results are analysed, the differences resulting from this source do not seem to be fatal. Another reason for the changing number of overall responses is the method of scoring. Some of the informants left some of the gaps unfilled or supplied some other verb, producing changes admitting the preterit. Those cases were not counted as errors, but as lack of response, and this is reflected in the figure indicating the overall number of informants giving response (see 4.4.1).

Another imperfection involves the elimination of some of the correct responses from scoring because of problems with the classification of the target verbs in terms of actional meaning. In the translation task some informants used the verb höra ‘hear’ and some the verb lyssna på ‘listen to’ as the counterpart of the Polish verb wysłuchać. These verbs have different actional values.
To solve this problem only the responses with one actional value of the verb, the one used by the majority of the informants, were taken into consideration. Thus, 10 correct responses for clause nr 10 and 8 correct responses for clause nr 11 were not taken into consideration (see Appendix 4). However, this imperfection has, most probably, not affected the results of the stepwise multiple regression in a drastic way. Most of the linguistic features present in clause nr 10 and clause nr 11: indication of topic time by an unbounded verb, V13, agentive meaning of the target verb, V16, location of time of action outside the narrative plot, V10, and statal pluperfect, V17, yielded statistically significant partial effects, so this result seems to be unaffected. Each of these two clauses had a different type of indication of topic time (clause nr 10 single and clause nr 11 multiple), so the result of V11, multiple vs. single indication of topic time, would also, most probably, remain the same. Since the difference in the mean values of the correct responses between the subordinate and the main clauses, V8, and between specifying and constituting clauses, V9, was rather high, this result would not have been drastically affected either. Thus, the only possible negative consequence of this approach may be that the values of partial effect of some of the factors could have been slightly different and that some of the factors which did not yield statistically significant partial effect could perhaps have done so.

The obtained results, the wide spread in the correct responses ranging from 88 per cent to 9 per cent, and a statistically significant partial effect of six out of the twelve variables, i.e. confirmed regularities in the correct use of the pluperfect, seem to show that in spite of those imperfections the results of this study are worth taking into consideration in further research on the acquisition of the pluperfect.

8.4 Guidelines for future research

An analysis of the rank order list seems to suggest that some linguistic factors not taken into consideration in the present study may be of importance in the acquisition of the pluperfect.

One such factor may be the occurrence of lexical markers for the temporal order of events, e.g. the adverbs before and after.
The results of such a study could give some evidence for the facilitative effect of the contexts in which the temporal order of events can be retrieved from some elements of the sentence, i.e. the contexts in which the pluperfect is communicatively “redundant”.

Another such factor may be the effect of the different types of the pluperfect, i.e. the pluperfect as backshifted preterit and the pluperfect as backshifted perfect, upon the correct use of this tense. The results of such a study could, perhaps, shed some light upon the effect of the native tongue (Polish) upon the acquisition of the pluperfect.

Yet another linguistic factor not taken into consideration in this study, but which seems to be a promising area of future research, may be the relationship between word order and the correct use of the pluperfect. In the present study the pluperfect clauses with inverted word order, VS, appeared at the lower part of the rank order list. It seems plausible to assume that clauses with inverted word order may be more difficult contexts for the pluperfect than clauses with simple word order, i.e. that the pluperfect first emerges in the clauses with the word order SV.

Another promising area of research may be location of the matrix clause in relation to the target verb. The clause with the highest level of correct responses in this study was a preposed subordinate causal clause, i.e. a subordinate clause followed by a matrix clause (see clause nr 1 in Appendix 4). The order of presentation of the events in preposed subordinate clauses reflects the chronological order of events in real life, i.e. an earlier action is mentioned first. It seems plausible to assume that these types of contexts may facilitate the use of the pluperfect. And conversely, deviations from the chronological order of events in the real world may inhibit the use of the pluperfect. This may be particularly difficult in case of the main clauses in which an earlier event is presented after a later event, as in example (73), repeated here as (79):

(79) Den andra kastade sig på marken och låtsades vara död. Han hade hört att björnar aldrig angriper döda människor. ‘The other man threw himself to the ground and pretended to be dead. He had heard that bears do not attack dead people.’

As far as the statistical method is concerned, a data base involving individual results could perhaps be more informative than
the analysis of group results. A register of the use of the pluperfect by individual informants who are at different levels of language proficiency would, perhaps, allow for some more reliable claims about the developmental patterns in the acquisition of the pluperfect as well as for pointing out possible individual differences.

It may also be advisable to collect language samples from a greater number of informants and from different types of informants. A comparison of the results from the studies involving learners with different mother-tongues (some of those mother tongues having, and some not having the perfectual tenses) with the results from the studies on the acquisition of the pluperfect in L1 may also be very informative.

And last but not least, subsequent studies should be based on a linguistic material chosen with a more rigorous scientific selectiveness so that it is fully suitable for statistical analysis.

As mentioned before, my study is one of very few studies on acquisition of the pluperfect. The issue of the influence of the linguistic context upon the correct use of the pluperfect involves an enormous number of various aspects and requires a great deal of further research before any definite claims may be made.
Bibliography


Bibliography


Appendix 1.
Texts read to the informants before each of the tasks

1 Vännerna och björnen

Två vänner vandrade i skogen när en björn kom luftsande mot dem. En av männen klättrade blixtsnabbt upp i första bästa träd. Han dolde sig bland grenarna utan en tanke på sin vän.

Den andre, som insåg att han inte kunde bekämpa björnen ensam, kastade sig raklång på marken och lätsades vara död. Han hade hört att björnar aldrig angriper döda människor, därför låg han stilla och hoppades att björnen inte skulle höra hur hans hjärta slog. Björnen snörvlade och nosade på hans näsa och mun, fläskade in i hans öra och bökade i hans ryggsäck. Han trodde tydligen att mannen var död, för han luftsade bort samma väg som han hade kommit.

Mannen låg orörlig en bra stund utan att våga titta upp. Sedan lyfte han försiktigt på huvudet och reste sig upp.

– Nu kan du komma ner, ropade han till sin vän.

– Ännu darrande klättrade vännens från trädet.

– Björnen nosade en bra stund i ditt öra, sa han. Berättade han några hemligheter?

– Inte precis, svarade den andre. Han bara sa att man bör akta sig för vänner som lämnar en i stycket vid första tecken på fara.

I nöden prövas vännern.

English translation: The Friends and the Bear

Two friends were walking in the forest when a bear lumbered toward them. One of the men quickly climbed up the nearest tree. He hid himself among the branches of the tree without thinking about his friend.

The other man, who understood that he was not able to fight the bear on his own, threw himself to the ground pretending to be dead. He had heard that bears do not attack dead people, so he
lay motionless and was hoping that the bear would not hear his heart pounding. The bear snuffled and sniffed at his nose and his mouth, panted in his ear and rooted in his rucksack. He obviously believed that the man was dead because he lumbered away the same way as he had come.

The man lay motionless for a while without daring to look up. Then he raised his head carefully and got to his feet.

Now you can come down, he shouted to his friend.

Still trembling, his friend climbed down the tree.

– The bear sniffed into your rear for a while, he said. Did he tell you any secrets?

– Not exactly, answered the other man. He only said that one should be on one’s guard against friends who at the very first sign of danger abandon one in need.

A friend in need is a friend indeed.

2 Räven som åt för mycket

En räv var ute i skogen efter mat. Han var mycket hungrig. Då såg han ett hål i en ek och inne i hålet stod det en säck fylld med kött, ost och bröd som några herdar hade gömt där. Räven var mycket tunn och mycket hungrig så han klämde sig in genom den trånga öppningen och glufsade i sig alltihop.

– Nu känns det bättre, suckade han belåtet och torkade de sista brödsmulorna med tassen. Bara jag nu hade lite vatten, vore jag den lyckligaste räven på jorden.


Just då råkade en annan räv komma förbi.


Och det är just jämt vad den stackars räven måste göra.

Som man bäddar får man ligga.
English translation : The Fox who Ate too Much

A fox was out in the forest looking for food. He saw a hole in an oak and in the hole there was a sack filled with meat, cheese and bread which some shepherds had hidden there. The fox was very thin and very hungry so he squeezed himself through the small opening and ate everything.

— Now it feels much better, he sighed gladly and wiped off the last crumbs with his paw. If I only had some fresh water, I would be the luckiest fox on earth.

But when he tried to squeeze himself out he was stuck. Due to all this food he had become fatter. Only one paw and his head were out in the fresh air. The rest of the fox was in the tree.

— The tree has shrunk, he thought. Help! Help! he cried out. The tree has become smaller. It will soon squeeze me dead.

Just then another fox was passing by.

— Nonsense, he said. The tree is as big as ever. It is you who have eaten too much. It is no use my trying to get you out. Remain where you are and wait until you become thinner.

And this is just what the poor fox must still be doing.

3 Den gamle mannen och döden

En gammal man hade varit i skuggen och huggit ved. Han bar hem ett stort vedfång på sina axlar. Bördan var tung och vägen lång. Till sist blev gubben så trött att han kastade ner bördan på vägen och satte sig vid sidan av.

— Ack, jag eländiga människa! suckade han. Om ändå döden snart ville komma och befria mig.


English translation: The Old Man and Death

An old man had been in the forest and had chopped wood. He was carrying home a large armful of wood on his back. At last the
old man became so tired that he threw the burden on the road and sat down by it.

– Oh, how miserable I am, he sighed. If only Death would come and free me.

Suddenly, Death stood in front of him and asked what he wanted.

– I just wanted, answered the old man quietly, you to help me to get the burden upon my back. Life is precious, even when it seems bitter.
Appendix 2.
Gap filling tests

1 Vännerna och björnen

Två vänner vandrade i skogen när en björn kom lufsande mot dem. En av männen klättrade blixtsnabbt upp i första bästa träd. Han dolde sig bland grenarna utan en tanke på sin vän.

Den andre, som insåg att han inte kunde bekämpa björnen ensam, kastade sig raklång på marken och låtsades vara död. Han 1) ……………att björnar aldrig angriper döda människor, därför låg han stilla och hoppades att björnen inte ……………… hur hans hjärta slog. Björnen snörvlade och nosade på hans näsa och mun, fläsade in i hans öra och bökade i hans ryggsäck. Han trodde tydligen att mannen var död, för han lufsade bort samma väg som han 2) ……………


– Nu kan du komma ner, ropade han till sin vän.

– Ännu darrande klättrade vännen från trädet och frågade den andra mannen om björnen 3) ………………. några hemligheter.


English translation: The Friends and the Bear

Two friends were walking in the forest when a bear lumbered toward them. One of the men quickly climbed up the nearest tree. He hid himself among the branches of the tree without thinking about his friend.

The other man, who understood that he was not able to fight the bear on his own, threw himself to the ground pretending to be dead. He 1) …………….…that bears do not attack dead people, so he lay motionless and was hoping that the bear would not hear his heart pounding. The bear sniffled and sniffed at his nose and his
mouth, panted in his ear and rooted in his rucksack. He obviously believed that the man was dead because he lumbered away the same way as he 2) 

The man lay motionless for a while without daring to look up. Then he raised his head carefully and got to his feet.
– Now you can come down, he shouted to his friend.

Still trembling, his friend climbed down out of the tree and asked the other man if the bear 3) any secrets.
– The bear sniffed into you rear for a while, he said. Did he tell you any secrets? – he asked.

The other man answered that the bear 4) A friend in need is a friend indeed.

2 Räven som ät för mycket

En räv var ute i skogen efter mat. Han var mycket hungrig. Han 1) någon mat på tre dagar. Han var också mycket törstig. Han 2) något vatten på två dagar. Han var mycket mycket smal.

Plötsligt såg han ett träd. Det fanns ett stort hål i trädets och inne i hålet stod det en säck fylld med kött, ost och bröd som några herdar 3) där. Räven klämde sig in genom den trånga öppningen och allt.

– Nu känns det bättre, suckade han belåtet och torkade de sista bröds mulorna med tassen. Bara jag nu hade lite vore jag den lyckligaste räven på jorden.

Men när han försökte klämma sig ut igen satt han ohjälpligt fast. Av all den myckna maten 4) tjockare. Det var bara en tass och huvudet som var ute i friska luften. Resten av räven kvar i trädets.

– Hjälp! hjälp! Trädet har krympt! Snart klämmer det igen mig! Han trodde alltså att trädet 5) . Han förstod inte att det var han som 6) för mycket och att han av den myckna maten 7) tjockare.

Just då råkade en annan räv komma förbi.

– Dumheter, sa han. Han förklarade för räven som satt fast att det inte var trädets som 8) utan att orsaken till att han satt fast i hålet var att han 9) för mycket.

Som man bäddar får man ligga.

English translation: The Fox who Ate too Much

A fox was out in the forest looking for food. He was very hungry. He 1) .................... any food for three days. He was also very thirsty. He 2) .................... any water for two days. He was very very thin. Suddenly he saw tree. There was a big hole in the tree and in the hole there was a sack filled with meat, cheese and bread which some shepherds 3) ) ....................there. The fox squeezed himself through the small opening and ate everything.

– Now it feels much better, he sighed gladly and wiped off the last crumbs with his paw. If I only .................... some fresh water, I would be the luckiest fox on earth.

But when he tried to squeeze himself out, he was stuck. Due to all this food he 4) .................... fatter. Only one paw and his head were out in the fresh air. The rest of the fox ........................ still in the tree.

– Help! Help! The tree has shrunk! It will soon squeeze me dead, he ....................

The fox believed that 5) the tree .................... He did not understand that it was him who 6) .................... too much, and that due to all this food 7).................... tjockare.

Just then another fox was passing by.

– Nonsense, he said. He explained to the fox who was stuck in the hole that it was not the tree which 8) ...................., but that the reason for his getting stuck was that he 9) ....................

– I.................... to get you out, the other fox said. You must remain in the whole and wait until you become thinner.

As you’ve made your bed, so you must lie in it.

3 Den gamle mannen och döden

En gammal man gick längs en stor väg. Han bar hem ett stort vedfång på sina axlar. Han 1).................... och med stor möda ........................ ned vedfånget. Bördan .................... tung och vägen
lång. Till sist kastade han bördan på marken och satte sig vid väggkanten. Han 2)............... på två timmar så han var verkligen trött.
Och plötsligt gick det uppför honom att han 3) .................... sin yxa i skogen. Han .................... sig och började gå lika långsamt och tungt som han 4) .................... till villostället.
– Ack, jag eländiga människa! ropade han. Om ändå döden snart ville komma och befria mig.
I det samma stod döden framför honom och frågade varför han 5) .................... på henne. Mannen ..................... mycket rädd.
– Ha, ha, skrattade döden. Jag vet att livet är människan kärt även när det förefaller bittert.

English translation: The Old Man and Death

An old man was walking along a big road. He was carrying home a large armful of wood on his back. He 1)............... with a great effort he............... The load ................ heavy and the way long. At last he threw the burden on the ground and sat down. He 2)............... for two hours so he was really tired. And suddenly he realised that he 3)............... his ax in the forest. He .................... and began to walk as slowly and heavily as he 4) .................... to the resting place.
– Oh, how miserable I am, he sighed. If only Death would come and free me.
Suddenly, Death stood in front of him and asked why he 5) ...... ............. her. The man ..................... frightened.
– I just wanted, stammered the old man, you .................... me to get the burden upon my back.
– Ha, ha, Death laughed. I know that life is precious, even when it seems bitter.

4 Tjuven

En kväll smög jag mig med kofoten i högsta hugg fram mot en villa i miljonklassen. Jag(veta) ............... att jag kunde sätta igång. Någon (mig, till, säga) 1) ................. att villan var tom.
Ägaren (på semester, åka) 2) .......................... Chansen att bli rik var stor.
När jag kom närmare fick jag se att det lyste i ett av rummen och att det satt en man och läste en bok där. För att kunna se bättre (ljuset, tända, han) 3) .......................... och (glasögonen, på sig, sätta) 4) ......................... . På bordet stod en kopp och en tom tallrik. Han (måste, färdigt, för en stund sedan, kvällsmatベン, äta) .......................... Jag kunde inget annat göra än att dra mig tillbaka lika försiktigt som jag (komma) 5) .......................... .

English translation: The Thief

One evening I sneaked up, with my crowbar ready to strike, on a house worth millions. I (know) .......................... I could get to work. Somebody (me, to, say) 1) .......................... that there were no people in the house. The owner (on holiday, go) 2) .......................... ..........................

I had a good chance to become rich.

When I came closer I could notice that the light was on in one of the rooms and that a man was sitting and reading a book there. To be able to see better (the light, turn on, he) 3) .......................... and (*glasses, on himself, put on) 4) .......................... On the table there was a cup and an empty plate. He (*must, ready, a moment ago, supper, eat) .......................... I could not do anything else, but retreat as cautiously as I (come) 5) .......................... .

Suddenly I heard the sound of the engine. A big Mercedes stopped at the front door. The owner came back. The family (their, break off, holiday) 6) .......................... Perhaps somebody (*become ill) 7) ..........................? Perhaps someone (his, lose, pass) 8) ..........................? Perhaps they (*become
robb) 9) .........................? But who was the man sitting at the window then? He looked like the owner. Now I know! They (mannequin, in the window, put) 10 ) ............................... and (put, a plate, a cup, on the table, and) 11) ............................... to scare away the thieves.
Appendix 3.
Translation task

Polish version


Z angielskim/niemieckim poradziłam sobie nieźle, bo uczyłam się tego języka przez wiele lat. Nauczyłam się sporo, więc egzamin nie był dla mnie trudny.


Doskonale rozumiałam egzaminatorów, choć mówili bardzo szybko. Obejrzałam wiele angielskich filmów i wysłuchałam wielu ciekawych programów telewizyjnych. W ten sposób nauczyłam się rozumieć różne odmiany języka angielskiego. Na egzaminie ustnym, jak już wspomniałam, otrzymałam wysoką ocenę.

Egzamin pisemny składał się z kilku części. Z gramatyką po- radziłam sobie bez problemów, bo brałam prywatne lekcje u dobrego nauczyciela, a także wiele uczyłam się sama. Ponieważ grahamatykę angielską znałam dobrze, wszystkie moje odpowiedzi na pytania w części gramatycznej egzaminu pisemnego były poprawne.

Z wypracowaniem miałam niestety trochę trudności. Znałam wiele słów z różnych dziedzin, bo przeczytałam wiele książek i wysłuchałam wielu wykładów, ale ponieważ byłam zdenerwowana, nie mogłam sobie wielu ze słów które znalazłam przypomnieć.


Ogólny wynik egzaminu wstępnego był dobry, więc mimo wysokiej konkurencji zostałam przyjęta i już od ..................lat jestem studentką Universytetu............... .

Swedish version

Jag gjorde inträdesprovet till skandinaviska institutionen i juli 199...... . Inträdesprovet omfattade engelska och polska samt en del grundläggande kunskaper i historia.

Jag klarade inträdesprovet ganska bra eftersom 1) jag hade studerat engelska i många år. 2) Jag hade lärt mig mycket så inträdesprovet var inte särskilt svårt för mig.

Den muntliga delen klarade jag bra eftersom 3) jag vid många tillfällen hade deltagit i internatkurser i engelska. Alla deltagare var tvungna att hela tiden prata engelska. 4) På det sättet hade jag lärt mig att tala engelska. 5) En stor hjälp med att lära mig tala hade varit samtal med engelsmän. 6) Jag hade varit i England och 7) hade bott hos en engelsk familj. 8) Också i Polen hade jag talat med många engelsmän. Tack vare detta kände jag mig ganska säker under den skriftliga delen av provet.

Jag förstod lärarna bra trots att de pratade mycket fort. 9) Jag hade sett många engelska filmer och 10) hade lyssnat på många intressanta TV-program. 11) På det sättet hade jag lärt mig att förstå olika varieteter av engelskan. Som jag redan har sagt, fick jag ett högt betyg på den muntliga delen av provet.

Det skriftliga provet bestod av flera delar. Grammatiken klarade jag utan problem eftersom 12) jag hade tagit privata lektioner hos
en bra lärare och 13) hade studerat mycket på egen hand. Eftersom jag kunde grammatiken ganska bra, var alla mina svar på frågorna om grammatik korrekta.


Det samlade resultatet var bra så trots att konkurrensen var hård klarade jag av provet och blev antagen. Nu har jag studerat svenska vid .................................. i ............... år.

English version

I took the entrance exam for the Deparment of Scandinavian Languages in July 199...... . The entrance exam consisted of English and Polish, together with some questions on history.

I managed to pass the examination quite well because 1) I had studied English for many years. 2) I had learned quite a lot so the entrance examination was not difficult for me.

I managed to pass the oral examination quite well because 3) I had taken part in residential courses many times. All the participants were obliged to speak English all the time. 4) In this way I had learnt to speak English. 5) I had also got some help with learning to speak thanks to frequent conversations with native speakers. 6) I had been to England and 7) had lived with an English family. 8) Even in Poland I had talked to many Englishmen. Due to this I could feel quite sure of myself during the written exam.
I could understand the teachers very well in spite of the fact that they were speaking very quickly. 9) I had seen a lot of films and 10) I had heard/listened to many interesting TV programmes. 11) In this way I had learned to understand different varieties of English. As I already said, I received a good mark at the oral entrance exam.

The written exam consisted of many parts. I managed to pass the grammar test without any problems because 12) I had taken private lessons with a good teacher, and 13) I had also studied a lot on my own. Since I knew grammar quite well, all my answers to the grammar questions were correct.

Unfortunately, I had some difficulties with the composition. I knew a lot of words from various fields because 14) I had read a lot of books and 15) I had listened to many lectures. But, because I was nervous, it was difficult for me to recall some of the words. To write a good composition one must practice a lot. 16) I had only written short letters. 17) Because I had never written a long composition, I had some difficulties with the arrangement of the ideas. My composition was somewhat chaotic. If I had practiced composition writing, I would have been able to write a coherent logical text and would have got a very good mark. As matters stood, I got a good mark in the written part of the examination.

I had managed to pass Polish and history because 18) I had studied intensively. 19) I had mainly studied on my own, but 20) I had also got some help from a friend of mine. 21) I had also revised the whole material with a private teacher. I got a very good mark at the exam.

The overall result of the entrance examination was good so although the examination was highly competitive, I passed it and was accepted. Now I have been studying Swedish at the ............ for ................. years.
Appendix 4.
Rank order list

Symbols and markings

1. Number of students.
2. Number of correct answers.
3. Type of test: gap filling (marked 1) vs. translation (marked 2).
4. Type of response: recalled (marked 1, the remaining clauses marked 0).
5. Type of response: new (marked 1, the remaining clauses marked 0).
6. Type of response: transformed (marked 1, the remaining clauses marked 0).
7. Non-reported speech (marked 1) vs. reported speech (marked 2).
8. Location of the verb indicating topic time with reference to the target verb: intrasentential (marked 1) vs. intersentential (marked 2).
9. Function of the subordinate clauses in the text: specifying (marked 1) vs. constituting (marked 2).
10. Location of the time of action of pluperfect clauses: outside (marked 1) vs. within (marked 2) the temporal frame of the narrative plot.
11. Multiple (marked 1) vs. single (marked 2) indication of topic time.
12. Bounded (marked 1) vs. unbounded (marked 2) meaning of the target verb.
13. Bounded (marked 1) vs. unbounded (marked 2) meaning of the verb indicating topic time.
14. Type of semantic relation between the clause containing the target verb and the clause containing the verb indicating the topic time (or some other clause): causal (marked 1) vs. non-causal (marked 2).
15. Indication of topic time in the same or in the adjacent sentence (marked 1) vs. indication of topic time further away than in the same or the adjacent sentence (marked 2).
16. Agentive (marked 1) vs. non-agentive meaning of the target verb (marked 2).
17. Type of perfect: actional (marked 1) vs. statal (marked 2).
18. Resultative (marked 1) vs. non-resultative (marked 2) meaning of the target verb.

T – translation task
GF – gap-filling task, respective numbers indicate the number of gap-filling task
Context – respective numbers indicate the number of pluperfect clause in the respective type of task
Percentual values indicate the percent of correct responses

1. Jag kunde många ord på olika områden... Eftersom jag aldrig tidigare hade skrivit någon längre uppsats hade jag svårt med dispositionen. T, context 17, 88%.

2. Han trodde tydligen att mannen var död, för han lufsade bort samma väg som han hade kommit. GF 1, context 2, 87%.

3. Jag kunde inget annat göra än att dra mig tillbaka lika försiktigt som jag hade kommit. GF 4, context 5, 81%.

4. Jag kunde många ord på olika områden eftersom jag hade läst många böcker... T, context 14, 77%.

5. Det fanns ett stort hål i trädet och inne i hålet stod en säck fylld med kött, ost och bröd som några herdar hade gömt där. GF 2, context 3, 73%.
6. Polska och historia klarade jag också bra eftersom jag hade läst mycket. T, context 18, 71%

| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 |
| 69| 49| 2 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 |

7. Jag förstod lärarna bra trots att de pratade mycket fort. Jag hade sett många engelska filmer och ... T, context 9, 68%

| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 |
| 67| 46| 2 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 |

8. Han förklarade för räven som satt fast att det inte var trädet som hade krympt utan ... GF 2, context 8, 67%

| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 |
| 52| 35| 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 |

9. Han förklarade för räven som satt fast [...] utan att orsaken till att han satt fast i hålet var att han hade ätit för mycket. GF 2, context 9, 64%

| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 |
| 38| 37| 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |

10. Jag förstod lärarna bra trots att de pratade mycket fort [...] och hade lyssnat på många intressanta TV-program. T, context 10, 63%

| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 |
| 35| 22| 2 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2 |

11. Jag kunde många ord på olika områden [...] och jag hade lyssnat på många föreläsningar. T, context 15, 62%

| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 |
| 39| 24| 2 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2 |

12. Jag klarade inträdesprovet ganska bra eftersom jag hade studerat engelska i många år. T, context 1, 59%

| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 |
| 68| 40| 2 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2 |
13. Han förstod inte att det var han som hade ätit för mycket och... GF 2, context 6, 59%.

14. Han reste sig och började gå lika långsamt och tungt som han hade kommit till vilostället. GF 3, context 4, 57%.

15. Plötsligt gick det upp för honom att han hade glömt/lämnat sin yxa i skogen. GF 3, context 3, 56%.

16. Han trodde alltså att trädet hade krympt. GF 2, context 5, 56%.

17. Jag klarade inträdesprovet ganska bra... Jag hade lärt mig mycket så inträdesprovet var inte särskilt svårt för mig. T, context 2, 54%.

18. Grammatiken klarade jag utan problem eftersom jag hade tagit privata lektioner hos en bra lärare och... T, context 12, 52%.

19. Jag visste att jag kunde sätta igång. Någon hade sagt till mig att villan var tom. GF 4, context 1, 51%.

20. Den muntliga delen klarade jag bra eftersom jag vid många tillfällen hade deltagit i internatkurser i engelska.T, context 3, 48%.
21. Grammatiken klarade jag utan problem eftersom [...] och jag hade studerat mycket på egen hand. T, context 13, 46%.

22. Han förstod inte att [...] och att han av den myckna maten hade blivit tjockare. GF 2, context 7, 43%.

23. En gammal man gick längs en stor väg. Han hade varit i skogen och... GF 3, context 1, 43%.

24. Polska och historia klarade jag också bra eftersom... Jag hade huvudsakligen studerat på egen hand. T, context 19, 42%.

25. Jag visste att jag kunde sätta igång. Ägaren hade åkt på semester. GF 4, context 2, 39%.

26. Jag kunde många ord på olika områden... Jag hade bara skrivit korta brev. T, context 16, 38%.

27. [...] satte sig vid vägkanten. Han hade inte vilat på två timmar så han var verklig trött. GF 3, context 2, 36%.
28. [...] frågade den andra mannen om björnen hade berättat några hemligheter. GF1, context 3, 36%.

29. En räv var ute i skogen efter mat. Han hade inte druckit något vatten på tre dagar. GF 2, context 2, 36%.

30. I det samma stod döden framför honom och frågade varför han hade ropat på honom. GF 3, context 5, 35%.

31. En räv var ute i skogen efter mat. Han hade inte ätit någon mat på tre dagar. GF 2, context 1, 35%.

32. Polska och historia klarade jag också bra eftersom [...] men en kollega hade också hjälpt mig. T, context 20, 35%.

33. Polska och historia klarade jag också bra eftersom... Jag hade också repeterat hela materialet med en privatlärare. T, context 21, 34%.

34. Han såg ut precis som ägaren. [...] och hade ställt en tallrik på bordet för att skrämma bort tjuvar. GF 4, context 11, 33%.
35. Ägaren kom tillbaka. Kanske någon hade tappat sitt pass? GF 4, context 8, 30%.

|   | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|
|64 | 19|1|0|1|0|1|2|0|1|1|1|1|1|2|2|1|1|

36. Ägaren kom tillbaka. Kanské de hade blivit rånade? GF 4, context 9, 30%.

|   | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|
|64 | 19|1|0|1|0|1|2|0|1|1|1|1|1|2|2|1|1|

37. På det sättet hade jag lärt mig att förstå olika typer av fackspråk. T, context 11, 29%.

|   | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|
|68 | 20|2|0|1|0|1|2|0|1|1|1|2|2|2|1|1|1|

38. […] satt en man och läste en bok där. För att se bättre […] och hade satt glasögonen på sig. GF 4, context 4, 28%.

|   | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|
|64 | 18|1|0|1|0|1|2|0|1|1|1|2|2|1|1|1|

39. Alla deltagare var hela tiden tvungna att prata engelska. […] och hade bott hos en engelsk familj. T, context 7, 27%.

|   | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|
|64 | 19|2|0|1|0|1|2|0|1|1|2|1|1|2|1|1|

40. Alla deltagare var hela tiden tvungna att prata engelska. Jag hade varit i England och… T, context 6, 27%.

|   | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|
|66 | 18|2|0|1|0|1|2|0|1|1|2|1|1|2|1|1|

41. Han såg ut precis som ägaren. De hade satt en skyltdocka i fönstret och […] för att skrämma bort tjuvar. GF 4, context 10, 26%.

|   | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|
|64 | 17|1|0|1|0|1|2|0|1|1|1|2|2|2|1|1|

42. […] satt en man och läste en bok där. För att se bättre hade han tänt ljuset och… GF 4, context 3, 25%.

|   | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|
|64 | 16|1|0|1|0|1|2|0|1|1|1|2|2|1|1|1|1|
43. Ägaren kom tillbaka. Kanske någon hade blivit sjuk? GF 4, context 7, 23%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>13</th>
<th>14</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>17</th>
<th>18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>64</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

44. Den andra mannen svarade att björnen hade sagt: "I nöden prövas vänner". GFI, context 4, 23%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>13</th>
<th>14</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>17</th>
<th>18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

45. Alla deltagare var hela tiden tvungna att prata engelska. På det sättet hade jag lärt mig att tala engelska. T, context 4, 22%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>13</th>
<th>14</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>17</th>
<th>18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>67</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

46. Ägaren kom tillbaka. Familjen hade avbrutit sin sommersed. GF 4, context 6, 20%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>13</th>
<th>14</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>17</th>
<th>18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>64</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

47. Alla deltagare var hela tiden tvungna att prata engelska. Också i Polen hade jag talat med många engelsmän. T, context 8, 20%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>13</th>
<th>14</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>17</th>
<th>18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>65</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

48. Alla deltagare var hela tiden tvungna att prata engelska. En stor hjälp med att lära mig tala hade varit samtal med engelsmännen. T, context 5, 19%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>13</th>
<th>14</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>17</th>
<th>18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

49. Han hade hört att björnar aldrig angriper döda människor. GF 1 context 1, 15%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>13</th>
<th>14</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>17</th>
<th>18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

50. Av all den myckna maten hade han blivit tjockare. GF 2, context 4, 9%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>13</th>
<th>14</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>17</th>
<th>18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Rola kontekstu językowego w akwizycji czasu pluperfekt

(Streszczenie)

Niniejsza praca składa się z dwóch części: teoretycznej i eksperymentalnej. Część teoretyczna zawiera przegląd teorii dotyczących czasów gramatycznych, aspektu i kategorii semantycznej czasownika aktionsart oraz porównanie systemów temporalnych w języku szwedzkim i polskim. Porównanie opisów teoretycznych tych kategorii dla różnych języków (uwzględniam także język angielski) pozwoliło mi na dokonanie kilku istotnych obserwacji na temat różnicy między kategoriami semantycznymi aspekt i aktionsart będącej przedmiotem wieloletnich sporów oraz na wykazanie nieścisłości definicji w opisie kategorii aktionsart w języku szwedzkim (Teleman et al. 1999:IV).

Część eksperymentalna jest analizą stosowania czasu pluperfekt w języku szwedzkim przez polskich studentów, dla których język ten jest głównym przedmiotem studiów (skandynawistyka). Celem analizy jest wyjaśnienie trudności w przyswojaniu tego czasu. Niesystematyczność w stosowaniu czasu pluperfekt została przypisana wpływowi kontekstu językowego. W badaniu uwzględniam wpływ dwunastu czynników językowych. Każdy z czynników jest podzielony na dwie podgrupy, przy założeniu, że jedna z grup ułatwia, a druga utrudnia poprawne stosowanie tego czasu. Część z proponowanych przez mnie czynników językowych jest nowatorska, nie uwzględniona we wcześniejszych badaniach na temat akwizycji czasów w językach obcych.

Wpływ sześciu z zaproponowanych przez mnie dwunastu czynników językowych został potwierdzony przez wynik analizy statystycznej regresja wielokrotna. Są to:
1. Pozycja czasownika wyznaczającego czas orientacji w relacji do czasownika głównego – wewnątrzdziaiana.
2. Semantyka czasownika wyznaczającego czas orientacji – czasownik nieteliczny
3. Semantyka czasownika głównego – rola agens
4. Funkcja zdania podrzędnego – specyfikacja
5. Typ czasu pluperfekt – stanowy
Content of Figures and Tables

Figures

Figure 1. Representation of time ........................................ 18
Figure 2. The position of S, E and R for the simple past, the simple present and the simple future ......................... 19
Figure 3. The position of E, R and S for the pluperfect ........... 20
Figure 4. The position of E, R and S for the future perfect .......... 20
Figure 5. The position of E, R and S for the perfect ................ 21
Figure 6. The position of E, R, and S for the Russian (and the Polish) past tense with an explicitly expressed past point of reference (adverb of definite time) ..................... 63
Figure 7. The position of E, R, and S for the Russian (and the Polish) past tense on assumption of the definite past point of reference ....................................................... 64
Figure 8. The position of E, R, and S for the Russian (and the Polish) past tense without explicit or contextual specification of the definite past time .............................................. 64
Figure 9. Ways of rendering the Swedish perfect in Polish .......... 68
Figure 10. Ways of rendering the Swedish pluperfect in Polish ..... 70
Figure 11. Textual function of the actional pluperfect .............. 167
Figure 12. Textual function of the statal pluperfect ............... 168

Tables

Table 1. The system of Polish tenses and the distribution of aspektual forms across tenses ............................................. 40
Table 2. Distribution of Swedish and Polish tenses across temporal domains ................................................................. 62
Table 3. Developmental sequences for encoding past tense .......... 78
Table 4. Hours of formal instruction in Swedish per year of study .................................................................................. 89
Table 5. Types of tests and types of response .......................... 98
Table 6. Results of the stepwise multiple regression analysis ...... 109
Table 7. Distribution of accuracy rates in recalled contexts .......... 119
Bronisława Zielonka

The Role of Linguistic Context in the Acquisition of the Pluperfect

Polish Learners of Swedish as a Foreign Language

Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Gdańskiego
Bronisława Zielonka
• The Role of Linguistic Context...