Norm development in the UN Security Council

Codebook Final changes as of March 23rd 2023

Introduction

This dataset contains information on language and speech-acts by the UN Security Council (UNSC) and its member states. More specifically, the focus lies on how the UNSC as a whole, in its resolutions, and the individual member states "talk" about the norms and issues that are construed as threats against international peace and security.

An observation, that is, a row in the dataset, corresponds to a member state of the UNSC in a given meeting on a certain topic/issue.

General coding rules

Two different materials – resolutions (and presidential statements) by the UNSC and statements by member states – are coded, each on different analytical levels. The resolutions are coded for the UNSC as a collective whereas statements are coded for the individual member states. The data (information) on a specific resolution is, therefore, the same for all member states of the UNSC at the time it adopted the resolution.

The coding is carried out longitudinally, in other words over time. This means that coding begins with the first resolution on a matter/conflict. This is of particular importance in the (many) extensions of the mandate of a peacekeeping operation, for example in the Central African Republic. Here, we start with the chronologically earliest resolution on the conflict within our time frame and proceed from there. Thus, when no specific issue/violator is apparent in the resolution the information in previous resolutions is used to determine the relevant issues/violator (e.g. human security; genocide/ Al-Qaida). All previous resolutions mentioned in the resolution should be assessed, regardless of whether they form part of the selected material or not (i.e. even if the resolution is not in the present dataset).

Furthermore, it is crucial that no other information than that which is provided by the UNSC is used while coding. Previous personal knowledge about a situation should not guide the choice of code.

Information external to the UNSC, such as media reports and research, is not used in the coding.

Resolutions of any stage, including draft resolutions not adopted by the UNSC (e.g. because a permanent member used their veto), are included. Presidential statements are coded, as they constitute decisions within the meaning of Article 27 of the UN Charter. Other outcomes are not coded.

The statements coded include those made by all 15 member states of the UNSC, but not by temporarily invited states or by e.g. the UN Secretary General or Special Representatives of the UN Secretary General. These statements include those made in (specific or more general) debates and those that are explicit explanations of vote.

1. Meeting data

The following variables record characteristics of the meetings held in the UNSC, such as the date of a meeting.

1.1 Year

Name: year

Label: Year of meeting

Definition: Variable captures the year in which a meeting was held

Coding scheme: Assign a value to this numerical variable based on the year that the meeting

was held in the UNSC (in YYYY format, e.g. 2015).

1.2 *Date*

Name: date

Label: Date of meeting

Definition: Variable captures the date in which a meeting was held

Coding scheme: Assign a value to this numerical variable based on the date that the meeting

was held in the UNSC (in YYYY-MM-DD format, e.g. 2015-06-28).

1.3 Meeting number

Name: meetingno

Label: Meeting number

Definition: Variable captures the meeting number, as it has been designated by the UN

Coding scheme: Assign a value to this numerical variable according to the number assigned to

it by the UN.

1.4 Meeting record

Name: meetingrec Label: Meeting record

Definition: Variable captures a link to the record of a meeting

Coding scheme: Assign a value to this variable that is a URL (link) to the record of a meeting,

on the UN website

1.5 Press release

Name: pressrelease *Label*: Press release

Definition: Variable captures a link to the (eventual) press release from a meeting

Coding scheme: Assign a value to this variable that is a URL (link) to the (eventual) press

release from a meeting, on the UN website

1.6 Topic

Name: topic

Label: Topic of meeting

Definition: This variable captures the general topic of a meeting

Coding scheme:

1.7 Outcome

Name: outcome

Label: Outcome of meeting

Definition: Variable captures a link to the outcome of a meeting, e.g. a resolution *Coding scheme*: Assign a value to this variable that is a URL (link) to the outcome of a

meeting, e.g. a resolution or a communiqué.

2. Resolution-level variables

The variables under this heading has the resolution, draft resolution or Presidential Statement as unit of analysis. The UNSC is treated as a collective with on single voice. These variables are, thus, the same for all member states (i.e. 15 observations/rows of data) in a debate.

2.1 UNSC assertion of violator(s)

Name(*s*): V50_Violator1, V51_Violator2, V52_Violator3 *Label*: UNSC Violator 1, UNSC Violator 2, UNSC Violator 3

Definition: Variable captures if the UNSC asserted that a state/entity has violated a rule, and if so, whom the violator(s) was.

Coding scheme: Assign a value according to the scheme below, with each category corresponding to a specific situation (notably if the UNSC asserts that there has been a rule violation but does not name a violator) or a state/actor. Up to three violators can be included, one per variable. *If you come across a new violator/situation, not on the list below, you may add it (to the end of the list), but ensure implementation across coders*. Assign a value for a specific actor (i.e. when the UNSC names a specific state/entity as a rule violator, so any code except "0" or "1" in the list below), in the following situations:

- 1) The UNSC explicitly names the state or non-state actor and charged it with violating a rule; or
- 2) The UNSC makes an indirect reference ('one of the parties'; 'extremist elements'; 'leadership of one political party') and the context makes that reference obvious; or
- 3) The UNSC makes an indirect reference ('armed groups recruiting child soldiers') when imposing financial and travel sanctions, and the sanctions committee subsequently designates individuals connected to that state or non-state actor; or
- 4) The UNSC authorizes Chapter VII enforcement without explicitly naming a rule violator, but the UNSC had previously named the rule violator in earlier resolutions regarding that agenda item; or
- 5) The UNSC renews sanctions without explicitly naming the rule violator, but the original resolution establishing the sanctions had directly or indirectly named the rule violator; or

- 6) The UNSC renews a peacekeeping operation without explicitly naming a rule violator, but the original resolution establishing the peacekeeping operation included Chapter VII enforcement and named a rule violator.
 - \circ **0** No rule violation
 - 1 No one specifically named as rule violator: The UNSC asserts a rule violation without explicitly naming a violator; or asserts that all parties must follow a particular rule.
 - \circ 2 Israel
 - o 3 United States
 - 4 − Iraq
 - o 5 Libya
 - o 6 Yugoslavia / Serbia
 - o 7 South Africa
 - o 8 Zaire / Democratic Republic of the Congo
 - o **9** UNITA (Angola)
 - o 10 Bosnian Serbs/ Bosnian Serb Party/ Croatian Serbs
 - o **11** Haiti
 - 12 Rwandan Hutus (Rwanda government prior to August 1994 and DRC militias after August 1994, including Democratic forces for the liberation of Rwanda FDLR)
 - o 13 Rwandan Tutsis (Rwandan Patriotic Front prior to August 1994 and the Rwandan government after August 1994)
 - o **14** United Somali Congress
 - o **15** Burundi militias
 - o **16** FMLN (El Salvador)
 - o 17 Khmer Rouge (Cambodia)
 - o **18** North Korea
 - o **19** Abkhazia (Georgia)
 - o 20 Armenian forces in Nagorny Karabakh
 - o **21** Bosnian Croats
 - o 22 Croatia
 - o 23 Bosnia
 - 24 National Patriotic Front (Liberian rebel group prior to July 1997; Liberian government from July 1997-2003; Charles Taylor and associates from 2004 onward)
 - o 25 Liberians United for Reconciliation and Democracy
 - o 26 Angola
 - o **27** Burundi military
 - o 28 Revolutionary United Front (RUF) (Sierra Leone)
 - o **29** Sudan
 - o 30 Alliance of Democratic Forces (DRC rebel group in Ituri region)
 - o **31** Eritrea
 - o 32 Ethiopia
 - o **33** Cuba
 - o **34** Tajik opposition forces
 - o **35** Taliban
 - o 36 Kosovo Liberation Army / Kosovo
 - o **37** India
 - o 38 Pakistan

- 39 Uganda
- o 40 Rally for Congolese Democracy (DRC group / Tutsi)
- o **41** East Timor militias
- 42 Al Qaeda (includes associated organizations: al Qaeda in Islamic Maghreb, AQAP, al Nusra, ISIS)
- o 43 Central African Republic rebel groups
- o 44 Georgia
- o **45** Somalia
- o 46 Union of Islamic Courts (Somalia)
- o 47 Lord's Resistance Army (Uganda)
- o 48 Great Lakes states Rwanda, Uganda, Burundi, DRC
- o **49** − DRC armed groups (blanket category for all groups − 12, 30, 40, 47, 89, Allied Democratic forces, National Liberation forces (FNL)
- 50 Ivory Coast (individuals from Laurent Gbagbo government after March 2011)
- o 51 Ivory Coast armed groups
- o 52 Janjaweed militias (Darfur, Sudan)
- o 53 Darfur rebel groups
- o 54 Sudan People's Liberation Movement
- o 55 Myanmar
- o 56 Hezbollah
- o 57 Fatah al-Islam, radical Sunni group in Lebanon
- o **58** − Syria
- o 59 ETA (Basques, Spain)
- o **60** Iran
- o 61 Liberia 2004-onward, post-Charles Taylor government
- o **62** Guinea Bissau military
- o 63 Guinea military
- o 64 Zimbabwe
- o **65** Mauritania
- o **66** Kenya
- o 67 Al Shabaab (Somalia)
- o 68 South Sudan
- o **69** Yemen
- o **70** Mali rebel groups
- o **71** Central African Republic
- o **72** Mali military
- o 73 Syria opposition groups
- 74 Boko Haram
- o 75 Russian-backed militias in Ukraine
- o **76** Libya armed groups
- o 77 Houthis (Yemen)
- o **78** Haqqani network
- o **79** Crimea
- o **80** Palestine PLO, post 1994 Palestine National Authority
- **81** Palestine Hamas
- 82 Palestine PFLP
- o 83 Palestine other groups, including Islamic Jihad
- o 84 Republic of Azerbaijan
- o 85 Republic of Armenia

- o **86** Afghan Factions
- o 87 The movement for unity and jihad in west Africa (MUJAO)
- **88** Ansar eddine
- o **89** M23 movement
- 90 Elements of the Armed forces of the Democratic Republic of the Congo (FARDC), Ex- members of the National Congress for the defence of the people (Ex-CDNP) and/or Congolese national police (PNC) (combined category)
- o **91** Lebanese Factions
- o 92 Ethnic Albanian extremist
- o 93 South Yemen/Democratic Republic of Yemen
- o **94** Tajikistan
- o 95 NATO
- o **96** Russia
- o **97** The Republic of Indonesia
- 98 Venezuelan Security Forces

2.2 Norms (violated)

Name(s): V100_Viol1_norm1, V101_Viol1_norm2, V102_Viol1_norm3, V103_Viol1_norm4, V104_Viol1_norm5, V105_Viol1_norm6, V106_Viol1_norm7, V107_Viol1_norm8
 V110_Viol2_norm1, V111_Viol2_norm2, V112_Viol2_norm3, V113_Viol2_norm4, V114_Viol2_norm5, V115_Viol2_norm6, V116_Viol2_norm7, V117_Viol2_norm8
 V120_Viol3_norm1, V121_Viol3_norm2, V122_Viol3_norm3, V123_Viol3_norm4, V124_Viol3_norm5, V125_Viol3_norm6, V126_Viol3_norm7, V127_Viol3_norm8

Label: Violator 1/2/3 Norm 1/2/3/4/5/6/7/8

Definition: The categorical variables capture the norms (/issues) that the UNSC, as a collective, alleges that the specific violator(s) has violated when it comes to the use of force. *Coding scheme*: Please assign a value from the list below according to the issues, norms, and/or threats that the UNSC, as a collective, asserts have been violated. The values are grouped in different themes, e.g. human security and self-defence. Coding, however, is done per specific norm (e.g. genocide – in international crimes), and not the general theme (human security).

Primary norms are coded, but norms that are violated as a result of the primary norm is only coded when they are considered to constitute a threat or in another way related to the use of force and peace and security. E.g. if the UNSC "expresses grave concern" over the fact that a conflict resulted in humanitarian crisis, but it is not the primary norm, it is not coded as a norm violation.

Threats against international security other than self-defence (chapter 6 and 7) Threats to peace

1) Frontier incident¹

Use this code when:

¹ Frederking V45-V48, code 1(1) partially

• The UNSC charges a state with invading another state, engaging in hostilities, not recognizing a border,

This code differs from "21" (armed attack, see below). Two examples: Frontier incident: resolution 189(1964) Vietnamese incursion into territory of Cambodia. The UNSC uses the words "desire ... in restoring ... a peaceful and normal state", "incident" and penetration", it does not use words such as "armed attack" or self-defence". (Code "1").

Armed attack: Resolution 660(1990) – Iraq Kuwait, UNSC uses words such as "invasion", "breach of international peace and security" and resolution 661(1990) "affirms the inherent right of individual and collective self-defence" (code "21")

2) Weapons of mass destruction (WMDs)²

Use this code when:

- The UNSC charges a state or non-state actor with building nuclear, chemical, or biological weapons; or
- The UNSC charges a state or non-state actor with using nuclear, chemical, or biological weapons; or
- The UNSC charges a state or non-state actor with selling WMD related materials; or
- The UNSC charges a state with violating norms regarding mandatory weapons inspections.

3) Arms trade³

Use this code when:

- The UNSC charges a state or non-state actor with criminal activities, including weapons proliferation, small arms sales, violating an arms embargo.
- 4) Rebel groups, insurgency, civil war⁴

Use this code when:

- The UNSC charges a state with interfering in domestic affairs, exploiting others' natural resources, or sending arms to rebel groups; or
- The UNSC charges a non-state entity with illegal secession or rebellion; 'illegitimate' elections; or illegal control of territory.

5) Refugee flows, destabilizing

Use this code when:

• The UNSC charges state with creating refugee flows.

Example:

Resolution 1034 (1995) "Deeply concerned by the plight of hundreds of thousands of refugees and displaced persons as a result of hostilities"

² Frederking V45-V48, code 4

³ Frederking V45-V48, code 9 and 10 partially, see 106.1, 106.2, 106.4, 106.5 and 109 below

⁴ Frederking V45-V48, code 1 partially

Human security

6) Human rights⁵

Use this code when:

- The UNSC charges a state or a non-state actor with violating human rights; or
- The UNSC demands that a state do more to protect its citizens.
- 7) International crimes (genocide, war crimes, crimes against humanity)⁶ Use this code when:
 - The UNSC charges a state or non-state actor with violating humanitarian international law regarding the treatment of combatants, rights of refugees, or the protection of civilians/UN peacekeepers; or
 - The UNSC charges a state or non-state actor with war crimes, genocide, crimes against humanity, or ethnic cleansing; or
 - The UNSC demands that a state to do more to comply with its obligations under humanitarian international law.

8) Violence against women

Use this code when:

• The UNSC charges a state or non-state actor with targeting women, infringing on their rights, for example relating to education, health care, reproductive rights, physical integrity (sexual crimes).

<u>Resolution 1868 (2009)</u>: "strongly condemns continuing forms of discrimination and violence against women and girls, in particular violence aimed at preventing girls from attending schools"

9) Epidemics

Use this code when:

• The UNSC describes a widespread occurrence of an infectious disease in a community at a particular time as a threat. The threat may, but does not need to, be generated by a state or non-state actor (i.e. a human agent)

Example:

Resolution 2439 (2018): "Expressing grave concern about the most recent outbreak of the Ebola virus ... Recognizing the recurring threat of the Ebola virus ... Recalling the International Health Regulations (2005), which are contributing to global public health security by improving the capacity of all countries to detect, assess, notify and respond to public health threats, underscoring the importance of abiding by these commitments and urging Member States to follow the advice of the WHO Director General regarding the current Ebola outbreak"

10) Threat against democracy⁷

Use this code when:

⁵ Frederking V45-V48, code 7

⁶ Frederking V45-V48, code 3

⁷ Frederking V45-V48, code 6

- The UNSC charges a state with refusing to hold free and transparent elections; or
- The UNSC charges a state or non-state actor with illegally usurping the power of a democratically elected leader.
- The UNSC charges a state or non-state actor with forcibly resisting the legitimacy of a democratically elected leader.

11) Responsibility to Protect (R2P)

Use this code when:

• The UNSC charges that a regime is failing to protect its own population, such that the situation explicitly falls under the norm of Responsibility to Protect (as adopted by the UN General Assembly in 2005).

12) Self-determination (assistance to people striving for), independence

Use this code when:

• The UNSC, or a UNSC member, explicitly mentions self-determination with phrases such as "people's right to self-determination" or "people's right to freedom and independence". It is primarily relevant when a state deprives/threatens a people's right to self-determination in another state, not when a non-state actor attacks government institutions.

Resolution 264 (1969) on Namibia (previously referred to as South West Africa). Common in the resolution that the UNSC refers to UN General Assembly resolutions 1514(1960) and 2625(1970).

Transnational crimes

28) Transnational crimes

13) Trafficking of humans⁸

Use this code when:

• The UNSC charges a state or non-state actor with criminal activities, including human trafficking

14) Drugs⁹

Use this code when:

 The UNSC charges a state or non-state actor with criminal activities, including drug trafficking

15) Terrorism¹⁰

Use this code when:

- The UNSC charges a state or non-state actor with committing terrorist acts; or
- The UNSC charges a state or non-state actor with financing, harboring, providing weapons to, or trading with terrorist groups.

_

⁸ Frederking V45-V48, code 10 partially, see 106.2, 106.4 and 106.5

⁹ Frederking V45-V48, code 10 partially, see 106.1, 106.4 and 106.5

¹⁰ Frederking V45-V48, code 4

Differs from code "24" (below). Three examples:

<u>Resolution 731(1992)</u> – Pan am flight 103 Lockerbie – the UNSC makes a reference to international peace and security, nothing about self-defence. (Code "15").

<u>Resolution 1530(2004)</u> – Madrid train bombings, where the UNSC, describes it as a threat to international peace and security, has a reference to <u>resolution 1373(2001)</u> but does not mention self-defence. (Code "15").

<u>Resolution 1368(2001)</u> and <u>resolution 1373(2001)</u> – 9/11 attack - the UNSC makes a reference to international peace and security, explicitly recognises the right to self-defence. (Code "24").

16) Piracy¹¹

Use this code when:

 The UNSC charges a state or non-state actor with criminal activities, including piracy

17) Natural resources 12

Use this code when:

• The UNSC charges a state or non-state actor with criminal activities, including the exploitation of natural resources.

18) Environmental threat, including climate change

Use this code when:

 The UNSC describes changes to the environment as a threat, including climate change, ecological changes, natural disasters. The threat may, but does not need to, be generated by a state or non-state actor (i.e. a human agent)

Resolution 2461 (2019): "Recognising the adverse effects of climate change, ecological changes, natural disasters among other factors on the stability of Somalia, including through drought, desertification, land degradation and food insecurity"

19) Diplomatic immunity¹³

Use this code when:

• The UNSC charges a state or a non-state actor with violating Vienna Convention norms regarding diplomatic immunity and consular protections.

20) Noncompliance 14

Use this code when:

• The UNSC charges a state or non-state actor with violating a binding obligation passed in a Chapter VII resolution not included in the other categories (e.g., not complying with economic sanctions)

1

¹¹ Frederking V45-V48, code 10 partially, see 106.1, 106.2 and 106.5

¹² Frederking V45-V48, code 10 partially, see 106.2, 106.2 and 106.5

¹³ Frederking V45-V48, code 8

¹⁴ Frederking V45-V48, code 9 partially, see 101.3 above

29) Violating a ceasefire agreement, a peace agreement, or a UNSC resolution demanding a ceasefire

Use this code when:

• The UNSC charges a state or non-state actor with military offenses violating a ceasefire agreement, a peace agreement, or a UNSC resolution demanding a ceasefire

Self-defence (article 51)

21) Aggression

Use this code when:

• The UNSC charges that the violence from a state constitutes aggression. State to state, not in relation to non-state actors. See definition of aggression; United Nations General Assembly Resolution 3314

22) Armed attack

Use this code when:

- The UNSC charges that the violence from a state actor reaches the threshold of armed attack and triggers right to self-defence under article 51. This makes this code different from "1" (frontier incident) which does not trigger the right to self-defence.
- Two examples:

Frontier incident: <u>resolution 189(1964)</u> Vietnamese incursion into territory of Cambodia. The UNSC uses the words "desire ... in restoring ... a peaceful and normal state", "incident" and penetration", it does not use words such as "armed attack" or self-defence". (Code "1")

Armed attack: Resolution 660(1990) – Iraq Kuwait, UNSC uses words such as "invasion", "breach of international peace and security" and resolution 661(1990) "affirms the inherent right of individual and collective self-defence". (Code "21").

23) Non-state actors (terrorism)

Use this code when:

• The UNSC charges that the violence from the non-state actor reaches the threshold of armed attack and triggers right to self-defence under article 51. Differs from codes "4" and "14" which does not trigger this right.

Examples: <u>Resolution 731(1992)</u> – Pan am flight 103 Lockerbie – the UNSC makes a reference to international peace and security, nothing about self-defence

Resolution 1368(2001) and resolution 1373(2001) – 9/11 attack - the UNSC makes a reference to international peace and security, explicitly recognises the right to self-defence.

<u>Resolution 1530(2004</u>) – Madrid train bombings, where the UNSC, describes it as a threat to international peace and security, has a

reference to <u>resolution 1373(2001)</u> but does not mention self-defence. Is the law the same, but different facts, i.e. the level of violence lower?

24) Ideological subversion

Use this code when:

• The UNSC charges that a state or a non-state actor uses ideologogical propaganda or message that may constitute a threat

Example:

Explanation of vote in debate S/PV.7271: "Finally, there is an urgent need to counter the poisonous propaganda and gross distortion of Islam that ISIL is spreading far and wide. It is time to put an end to a group that is so extreme in its rejection of modernity that it bans math and social studies for children. It is time to put an end to the sermons of extremists that brainwash young men to join these terrorist groups and commit mass atrocities in the name of God."

25) Attacks against/protection of nationals

Use this code when:

 The UNSC charges that a state actor or non-state actors endangers the nationals of another country in a manner that may trigger the right to self-defence/use of military force.

3. State-level variables

The variables under this heading has the state (in a meeting) as unit of analysis. Focus lies on what the individual member states says (if anything) in their statements and/or explanations of vote. Each state (in one specific meeting) corresponds to one row in the dataset.

3.1 Member state

Name: member *Label*: Member state

Definition: Variable records each member state of the UNSC at the time of a specific meeting. *Coding scheme*: Assign a value to this string (text) variable based on the member states of the UNSC at the time when the specific meeting being coded was held. (E.g. China; France).

3.2 UNSC member assertion of violator

Name(s): V60_Violator1, V61_Violator2, V62_Violator3 Label: MS Violator 1, MS Violator 2, MS Violator 3

Definition: Variable records what party (violator) (if any) that a member states asserts is guilty of violating some norm.

Coding scheme: Follows the scheme under variables 50, 51, and 52, for the UNSC as a collective, but here for the respective states in the UNSC. Assign a value according to the scheme below, with each category corresponding to a specific situation (notably if the UNSC asserts that there has been a rule violation but does not name a violator) or a state/actor. If necessary, add a value (from the highest number counting), but ensure implementation

across coders. Assign a value for a specific actor (i.e. when the UNSC names a specific state/entity as a rule violator, so any code except "0" or "1" in the list below), in the following situations:

- 1) The Member State explicitly names the state or non-state actor and charged it with violating a rule; or
- 2) The Member State makes an indirect reference ('one of the parties'; 'extremist elements'; 'leadership of one political party') and the context makes that reference obvious; or
- 3) The Member State makes an indirect reference ('armed groups recruiting child soldiers') when imposing financial and travel sanctions, and the sanctions committee subsequently designates individuals connected to that state or non-state actor; or
 - \circ **0** No rule violation
 - o 1 − No one specifically named as rule violator: The UNSC asserts a rule violation without explicitly naming a violator; or asserts that all parties must follow a particular rule.
 - \circ 2 Israel
 - o 3 United States
 - o 4 Iraq (members of the Baathist Party post-2003)
 - o 5 Libya (members of the Qadaffi regime post-2011)
 - o 6 Yugoslavia / Serbia
 - o 7 South Africa
 - o 8 Zaire / Democratic Republic of the Congo
 - o **9** UNITA (Angola)
 - o 10 Bosnian Serbs /Bosnian Serb Party/ Croatian Serbs
 - o **11** Haiti
 - 12 Rwandan Hutus (Rwanda government prior to August 1994 and DRC militias after August 1994, including Democratic forces for the liberation of Rwanda FDLR))
 - o 13 Rwandan Tutsis (Rwandan Patriotic Front prior to August 1994 and the Rwandan government after August 1994)
 - o 14 United Somali Congress
 - o **15** Burundi militias
 - o **16** FMLN (El Salvador)
 - o 17 Khmer Rouge (Cambodia)
 - o 18 North Korea
 - o **19** Abkhazia (Georgia)
 - o 20 Armenian forces in Nagorny Karabakh
 - o **21** Bosnian Croats
 - o **22** Croatia
 - o 23 Bosnia
 - 24 National Patriotic Front (Liberian rebel group prior to July 1997; Liberian government from July 1997-2003; Charles Taylor and associates from 2004 onward)
 - o 25 Liberians United for Reconciliation and Democracy
 - o **26** Angola
 - o **27** Burundi military
 - o 28 Revolutionary United Front (RUF) (Sierra Leone)
 - 29 Sudan
 - o 30 Alliance of Democratic Forces (DRC rebel group in Ituri region)
 - o **31** Eritrea

- o 32 Ethiopia
- o **33** Cuba
- o 34 Tajik opposition forces
- o **35** Taliban
- o 36 Kosovo Liberation Army / Kosovo
- o **37** India
- o 38 Pakistan
- 39 Uganda
- o 40 Rally for Congolese Democracy (DRC group / Tutsi)
- **41** East Timor militias
- 42 Al Qaeda (includes associated organizations: al Qaeda in Islamic Maghreb, AQAP, al Nusra, ISIS)
- o 43 Central African Republic rebel groups
- o 44 Georgia
- o 45 Somalia
- 46 Union of Islamic Courts (Somalia)
- o 47 Lord's Resistance Army (Uganda)
- o 48 Great Lakes states Rwanda, Uganda, Burundi, DRC
- o **49** − DRC armed groups (blanket category for all groups − 12, 30, 40, 47, 89, Allied Democratic forces, National Liberation forces (FNL)
- 50 Ivory Coast (individuals from Laurent Gbagbo government after March 2011)
- o **51** Ivory Coast armed groups
- o 52 Janjaweed militias (Darfur, Sudan)
- o 53 Darfur rebel groups
- 54 Sudan People's Liberation Movement
- 55 Myanmar
- o 56 Hezbollah
- o 57 Fatah al-Islam, radical Sunni group in Lebanon
- 58 Syria
- o **59** ETA (Basques, Spain)
- o **60** Iran
- o 61 Liberia 2004-onward, post-Charles Taylor government
- o 62 Guinea Bissau military
- o 63 Guinea military
- o **64** Zimbabwe
- o 65 Mauritania
- o **66** Kenya
- o 67 Al Shabaab (Somalia)
- o **68** South Sudan
- o **69** Yemen
- o **70** Mali rebel groups
- o 71 Central African Republic
- o **72** Mali military
- o **73** Syria opposition groups
- o **74** Boko Haram
- 75 Russian-backed militias in Ukraine
- o **76** Libya armed groups
- o 77 Houthis (Yemen)
- o **78** Haqqani network

- o **79** Crimea
- o 80 Palestine PLO, post 1994 Palestine National Authority
- **81** Palestine Hamas
- o **82** Palestine PFLP
- 83 Palestine other groups, including Islamic Jihad
- o 84- Republic of Azerbaijan
- o 85 Republic of Armenia
- o **86** Afghan Factions
- o 87 The movement for unity and jihad in west Africa (MUJAO)
- o **88** Ansar eddine
- o **89** M23 movement
- 90 Elements of the Armed forces of the democratic republic of the Congo (FARDC), Ex- members of the National Congress for the defence of the people (Ex-CDNP) and/or Congolese national police (PNC) (combined category)
- o **91** Lebanese Factions
- o **92** Ethnic Albanian extremist
- o 93 South Yemen/Democratic Republic of Yemen
- o **94** Tajikistan
- o **95** NATO
- o 96 Russia
- o 97 The Republic of Indonesia
- o 98 Venezuelan Security Forces

0

3.3 UNSC member assertion of norms violated

Name: V200_Viol1_norm1, V201_Viol1_norm2, V202_Viol1_norm3, V203_Viol1_norm4, V204_Viol1_norm5, V205_Viol1_norm6, V206_Viol1_norm7, V207_Viol1_norm8 V210_Viol2_norm1, V211_Viol2_norm2, V212_Viol2_norm3, V213_Viol2_norm4, V214_Viol2_norm5, V215_Viol2_norm6, V216_Viol2_norm7, V217_Viol2_norm8 V220_Viol3_norm1, V221_Viol3_norm2, V222_Viol3_norm3, V223_Viol3_norm4, V224_Viol3_norm5, V225_Viol3_norm6, V226_Viol3_norm7, V227_Viol3_norm8

Label:

Definition: The categorical variables capture the norms (/issues) that a member state alleges that the specific violator(s) has violated when it comes to the use of force.

Coding scheme: Please assign a value from the list below according to the issues, norms, and/or threats that the UNSC, as a collective, asserts have been violated. The values are grouped in different themes, e.g. human security and self-defence. Coding, however, is done per specific norm (e.g. genocide – in international crimes), and not the general theme (human security). *Definition*:

Coding scheme: Violation of norm 1, as discussed by a member state, must relate to the same norm as violator1norm1 as violator2norm1 etcetera, as stated by the UNSC as a collective. Follows the scheme under variables 100-103, 110-113, and 120-123, for the UNSC as a collective, but here for the respective states in the UNSC.

Primary norms are coded, but norms that are violated as a result of the primary norm is only coded when they are considered to constitute a threat or in another way related to the use of force and peace and security. E.g. if a member state "expresses grave concern" over the fact

that a conflict resulted in humanitarian crisis, but it is not the primary norm, it is not coded as a norm violation.

Threats against international security other than self-defence (chapter 6 and 7) Threats to peace

1) Frontier incident¹⁵

Use this code when:

• The UNSC charges a state with invading another state, engaging in hostilities, not recognizing a border,

This code differs from "21" (armed attack, see below). Two examples: Frontier incident: resolution 189(1964) Vietnamese incursion into territory of Cambodia. The UNSC uses the words "desire ... in restoring ... a peaceful and normal state", "incident" and penetration", it does not use words such as "armed attack" or self-defence". (Code "1").

Armed attack: Resolution 660(1990) – Iraq Kuwait, UNSC uses words such as "invasion", "breach of international peace and security" and resolution 661(1990) "affirms the inherent right of individual and collective self-defence" (code "21")

2) Weapons of mass destruction (WMDs)¹⁶

Use this code when:

- A UNSC member state charges a state or non-state actor with building nuclear, chemical, or biological weapons; or
- A UNSC member state charges a state or non-state actor with selling WMD related materials; or
- A UNSC member state charges a state with violating norms regarding mandatory weapons inspections.
- 3) Arms trade¹⁷

Use this code when:

- A UNSC member state charges a state or non-state actor with criminal activities, including weapons proliferation, small arms sales, violating an arms embargo.
- 4) Rebel groups, insurgency, civil war¹⁸

Use this code when:

- A UNSC member state charges a state with interfering in domestic affairs, exploiting others' natural resources, or sending arms to rebel groups; or
- A UNSC member state charges a non-state entity with illegal secession or rebellion; 'illegitimate' elections; or illegal control of territory.
- 5) Refugee flows, destabilizing

Use this code when:

¹⁵ Frederking V45-V48, code 1(1) partially

¹⁶ Frederking V45-V48, code 4

¹⁷ Frederking V45-V48, code 9 and 10 partially, see 106.1, 106.2, 106.4, 106.5 and 109 below

¹⁸ Frederking V45-V48, code 1 partially

• A UNSC member state charges state with creating refugee flows.

Example:

Resolution 1034 (1995) "Deeply concerned by the plight of hundreds of thousands of refugees and displaced persons as a result of hostilities"

Human security

6) Human rights ¹⁹

Use this code when:

- A UNSC member state charges a state or a non-state actor with violating human rights; or
- A UNSC member state demands that a state do more to protect its citizens.
- 7) International crimes (genocide, war crimes, crimes against humanity)²⁰ Use this code when:
 - A UNSC member state charges a state or non-state actor with violating humanitarian international law regarding the treatment of combatants, rights of refugees, or the protection of civilians/UN peacekeepers; or
 - A UNSC member state charges a state or non-state actor with war crimes, genocide, crimes against humanity, or ethnic cleansing; or
 - A UNSC member state demands that a state to do more to comply with its obligations under humanitarian international law.
- 8) Violence against women

Use this code when:

• A UNSC member state charges a state or non-state actor with targeting women, infringing on their rights, for example relating to education, health care, reproductive rights, physical integrity (sexual crimes).

Resolution 1868 (2009): "strongly condemns continuing forms of discrimination and violence against women and girls, in particular violence aimed at preventing girls from attending schools"

9) Epidemics

Use this code when:

 A UNSC member state describes a widespread occurrence of an infectious disease in a community at a particular time as a threat. The threat may, but does not need to, be generated by a state or non-state actor (i.e. a human agent)

Example:

Resolution 2439 (2018): "Expressing grave concern about the most recent outbreak of the Ebola virus ... Recognizing the recurring threat of the Ebola

¹⁹ Frederking V45-V48, code 7

²⁰ Frederking V45-V48, code 3

virus ... Recalling the International Health Regulations (2005), which are contributing to global public health security by improving the capacity of all countries to detect, assess, notify and respond to public health threats, underscoring the importance of abiding by these commitments and urging Member States to follow the advice of the WHO Director General regarding the current Ebola outbreak"

10) Threat against democracy²¹

Use this code when:

- A UNSC member state charges a state with refusing to hold free and transparent elections; or
- A UNSC member state charges a state or non-state actor with illegally usurping the power of a democratically elected leader.
- A UNSC member state charges a state or non-state actor with forcibly resisting the legitimacy of a democratically elected leader.

11) Responsibility to Protect (R2P)

Use this code when:

- A UNSC member state charges that a regime is failing to protect its own population, such that the situation explicitly falls under the norm of Responsibility to Protect (as adopted by the UN General Assembly in 2005).
- **12**) Self-determination (assistance to people striving for), independence Use this code when:
 - A UNSC member state explicitly mentions self-determination with phrases such as "people's right to self-determination" or "people's right to freedom and independence". It is primarily relevant when a state deprives/threatens a people's right to self-determination in another state, not when a non-state actor attacks government institutions.

Resolution 264 (1969) on Namibia (previously referred to as South West Africa). Common in the resolution that the UNSC refers to UN General Assembly resolutions 1514(1960) and 2625(1970).

Transnational crimes

- 28) Transnational crimes
- 13) Trafficking of humans²²

Use this code when:

• A UNSC member state charges a state or non-state actor with criminal activities, including human trafficking

14) Drugs²³

Use this code when:

²² Frederking V45-V48, code 10 partially, see 106.2, 106.4 and 106.5

²¹ Frederking V45-V48, code 6

²³ Frederking V45-V48, code 10 partially, see 106.1, 106.4 and 106.5

 A UNSC member state charges a state or non-state actor with criminal activities, including drug trafficking

15) Terrorism²⁴

Use this code when:

- A UNSC member state charges a state or non-state actor with committing terrorist acts; or
- A UNSC member state charges a state or non-state actor with financing, harboring, providing weapons to, or trading with terrorist groups.

Differs from code "24" (below). Three examples:

Resolution 731(1992) – Pan am flight 103 Lockerbie – the UNSC makes a reference to international peace and security, nothing about self-defence. (Code "15").

<u>Resolution 1530(2004)</u> – Madrid train bombings, where the UNSC, describes it as a threat to international peace and security, has a reference to <u>resolution 1373(2001)</u> but does not mention self-defence. (Code "15").

Resolution 1368(2001) and resolution 1373(2001) – 9/11 attack - the UNSC makes a reference to international peace and security, explicitly recognises the right to self-defence. (Code "24").

16) Piracy²⁵

Use this code when:

• A UNSC member state charges a state or non-state actor with criminal activities, including piracy

17) Natural resources²⁶

Use this code when:

• A UNSC member state charges a state or non-state actor with criminal activities, including the exploitation of natural resources.

18) Environmental threat, including climate change

Use this code when:

• A UNSC member state describes changes to the environment as a threat, including climate change, ecological changes, natural disasters. The threat may, but does not need to, be generated by a state or non-state actor (i.e. a human agent)

Resolution 2461 (2019): "Recognising the adverse effects of climate change, ecological changes, natural disasters among other factors on the stability of Somalia, including through drought, desertification, land degradation and food insecurity"

19) Diplomatic immunity²⁷

Use this code when:

²⁴ Frederking V45-V48, code 4

²⁵ Frederking V45-V48, code 10 partially, see 106.1, 106.2 and 106.5

²⁶ Frederking V45-V48, code 10 partially, see 106.2, 106.2 and 106.5

²⁷ Frederking V45-V48, code 8

 A UNSC member state charges a state or a non-state actor with violating Vienna Convention norms regarding diplomatic immunity and consular protections.

20) Noncompliance²⁸

Use this code when:

- A UNSC member state charges a state or non-state actor with violating a binding obligation passed in a Chapter VII resolution not included in the other categories (e.g., not complying with economic sanctions)
- **29**) Violating a ceasefire agreement, a peace agreement, or a UNSC resolution demanding a ceasefire

Use this code when:

 A UNSC member state charges a state or non-state actor with military offenses violating a ceasefire agreement, a peace agreement, or a UNSC resolution demanding a ceasefire

Self-defence (article 51)

21) Aggression

Use this code when:

 A UNSC member state charges that the violence from a state constitutes aggression. State to state, not in relation to non-state actors. See definition of aggression; <u>United Nations General Assembly Resolution 3314</u>

22) Armed attack

Use this code when:

- A UNSC member state charges that the violence from a state actor reaches the threshold of armed attack and triggers right to self-defence under article 51. This makes this code different from "1" (frontier incident) which does not trigger the right to self-defence.
- Two examples:

Frontier incident: <u>resolution 189(1964)</u> Vietnamese incursion into territory of Cambodia. The UNSC uses the words "desire ... in restoring ... a peaceful and normal state", "incident" and penetration", it does not use words such as "armed attack" or self-defence". (Code "1")

Armed attack: Resolution 660(1990) – Iraq Kuwait, UNSC uses words such as "invasion", "breach of international peace and security" and resolution 661(1990) "affirms the inherent right of individual and collective self-defence". (Code "21").

23) Non-state actors (terrorism)

Use this code when:

• A UNSC member state charges that the violence from the non-state actor reaches the threshold of armed attack and triggers right to self-defence under article 51. Differs from codes "4" and "14" which does not trigger this right.

²⁸ Frederking V45-V48, code 9 partially, see 101.3 above

Examples: Resolution 731(1992) – Pan am flight 103 Lockerbie – the UNSC makes a reference to international peace and security, nothing about self-defence

<u>Resolution 1368(2001)</u> and <u>resolution 1373(2001)</u> – 9/11 attack - the UNSC makes a reference to international peace and security, explicitly recognises the right to self-defence.

Resolution 1530(2004) – Madrid train bombings, where the UNSC, describes it as a threat to international peace and security, has a reference to resolution 1373(2001) but does not mention self-defence. Is the law the same, but different facts, i.e. the level of violence lower?

24) Ideological subversion

Use this code when:

• A UNSC member state charges that a state or a non-state actor uses ideologogical propaganda or message that may constitute a threat

Example:

Explanation of vote in debate S/PV.7271: "Finally, there is an urgent need to counter the poisonous propaganda and gross distortion of Islam that ISIL is spreading far and wide. It is time to put an end to a group that is so extreme in its rejection of modernity that it bans math and social studies for children. It is time to put an end to the sermons of extremists that brainwash young men to join these terrorist groups and commit mass atrocities in the name of God."

25) Attacks against/protection of nationals

Use this code when:

• A UNSC member state charges that a state actor or non-state actors endangers the nationals of another country in a manner that may trigger the right to self-defence/use of military force.

3.4 Voice

These variables – consisting of arguments of facts, law, and policy – are coded in relation to each threat/norm. This means, for example, that "voice norm 1" (i.e. support/facts/law/policy) must relate to the same norm as violator1norm1 as violator2norm1, and so on.

Voice is coded in relation to norm, and not violator. When a state charges two different violators with the same norm violation, and the arguments in relation to the norm differs depending on the violator, facts/law/policy is coded in relation to Violator1. A comment is made in the cell (in English) if the argumentation differs in relation to Violator2.

The different variables should be seen as separate and are not mutually exclusive. A member state can make statements with regards to each variable, which then should be coded accordingly. Example: a member state could find that there are no legal grounds for action, but still support the action to promote consensus, as it has a value in itself. This would then be coded as law-action 0, policy 1.

3.4.1 Facts

Name: V501/V511/V521/V531/V541/V551/V561/V571

Label: Facts norm 1/2/3/4/5/6/7/8

Definition: Variable records arguments relying on statements of facts as advanced by a member state in a given meeting for a specific norm/threat, corresponding to the (first) norm for the UNSC as a whole (recorded in variables 100-103, 110-113, and 120-123). Coding scheme: Assign a value on the scale below based on a reading of each member states' statements in the UNSC in a given meeting. The values correspond to different ways that states may use arguments of facts in a debate, for example contesting what has been presented as fact. The argument can be expressed both implicit and explicit. Each variable corresponds to the norm indicated by the UNSC as a collective (norm 1/2/3/4/5/6/7/8).

- 1 Facts are at hand Assign this value when:
- o **0** Contestation of facts Assign this value when:
- 9 No statement
 Assign this value when: the state does not make any statements regarding the facts a norm/issue, or when a resolution is adopted without any statement from the state.

3.4.2 Law - norm

Name: V502/V512/V522/V532/V542/V552/V562/V572

Label: law norm 1/2/3/4/5/6/7/8

Definition: Variable records the member states use of arguments of a legal nature for a particular issue/norm (recorded in variables *100-103*, *110-113*, *and 120-123*) *Coding scheme*: Assign a value on the scale below based on a reading of each member states' statements in the UNSC in a given meeting. The values correspond to different ways that states may use arguments of law/legal arguments in a debate in relation to a specific norm which concerns international peace and security. The argument needs to be expressed explicitly. Each variable corresponds to the norm indicated by the UNSC as a collective (norm 1/2/3/4/5/6/7/8).

o 1: Legal support for norm.

Assign this value in cases such as: observing arguments such as, the proposed issue interpretation/resolution confirms existing norm, and, the proposed issue interpretation/resolution develops and modifies norm. Also assigned when states uses words such as "obligation", "principle", "law" in relation to norm, refers to conventions, and when certain phrases that are derived from the UN Charter or other conventions are used (e.g. "occupation", "aggression", "armed attack", "threat against the territorial integrity or political independence", "genocide" etc.)

Example: USA statement in /S/PV.4251

"The Taliban violates international humanitarian law and human rights, particularly by discriminating against women and girls"

It is not enough that the member state mentions the norm. An explicit reference in accordance with the above mentioned criteria is needed.

0: No legal support for norm.
 Assign this value in cases such as: observing arguments containing statements that something, even if it occurs, does not constitute a threat against international peace and security.

o 9: No statement

Assign this value when the state does not make any statements regarding the legal nature of a norm/issue, or when a resolution is adopted without any statement from the state.

3.4.3 Law - action

Name: V503/V513/V523/V533/V543/V553/V563/V573

Label: law norm 1/2/3/4/5/6/7/8

Definition: Variable records the member states use of arguments whether the proposed action

is legal (recorded in variables 100-103, 110-113, and 120-123)

Coding scheme: Assign a value on the scale below based on a reading of each member states' statements in the UNSC in a given meeting. The values correspond to different ways that states may use arguments of law/legal arguments in a debate, for example arguing that the proposed action is illegal. A distinction between arguments referring to the action as something that is *unsuitable* for the current situation and arguments referring to the action as something that *cannot* be taken is warranted, e.g the action could be considered inappropriate/unsuitable (policy) but legal, which differs from when the action is considered illegal. The argument needs to be expressed explicitly by the state and be connected to an action (e.g. a sanction, mission or condemnation). Each variable corresponds to the norm indicated by the UNSC as a collective (norm 1/2/3/4/5/6/7/8).

- 1: Legal ground for action.
 Assign this value in cases such as: observing arguments that the proposed action is legal.
- 0: No legal ground for action.
 Assign this value in cases such as: observing arguments containing statements that the proposed action is illegal.

Example: Costa Ricas statement S/PV.5928

"However, we regret that the Council did not send a stronger message in paragraph 28 with regard to the need to improve the current procedures for the listing and delisting of individuals on the sanctions List. Those procedures should be amended to be in line with the requirements of due process."

China, <u>S/PV.3106</u>: "With regard to <u>resolution 771 (1992)</u>, the Chinese delegation voted in favour solely out of humanitarian considerations. However, we deem it inappropriate to invoke Chapter VII of the Charter in this resolution. The Chinese delegation hereby wishes to place its reservation on record. Chapter VII of the Charter can be invoked only under situations that seriously threaten international peace and security and it cannot be invoked under other circumstances. It is our

view that the invoking of Chapter VII of the Charter in this resolution should not constitute a precedent."

o 9: No statement

Assign this value when the state does not make any statements regarding the legality of the proposed action, or when a resolution is adopted without any statement from the state.

3.4.4 Policy

Name: V504/V514/V524/V534/V544/V554/V564/V574

Label: policy norm 1/2/3/4/5/6/7/8

Definition: Variable records the member states use of arguments of a policy nature (practical considerations) for a particular issue/norm (recorded in variables 100-103, 110-113, and 120-123).

Coding scheme: Assign a value on the scale below based on a reading of each member states' statements in the UNSC in a given meeting. The values correspond to different ways that states may use arguments of policy in a debate, for example arguing that there are policy grounds for action, e.g. that they do not want to stop action by using a veto. Each variable corresponds to the norm indicated by the UNSC as a collective (norm 1/2/3/4/5/6/7/8). Coding in relation to policy is made restrictively; a clear argument for/against action is needed.

o 1: Policy grounds for action

Assign this value in cases when the state argues that there are policy reasons (practical considerations) for why they take a certain position, for example: Extraordinary situation, Promote consensus, as it has a value in itself, Don't want to use veto because would stop action

Example: Malaysias statement in /S/PV.4251

"My delegation is also concerned at the negative impact of such measures on the peace process [...] My delegation also has reservations on the imposition of measures against the Taliban that, in effect, interfere with the country's civil war."

China statement in <u>S/PV.3106</u> "With regard to <u>resolution 771 (1992)</u>, the Chinese delegation voted in favour solely out of humanitarian considerations. However, we deem it inappropriate to invoke Chapter VII of the Charter in this resolution. The Chinese delegation hereby wishes to place its reservation on record. Chapter VII of the Charter can be invoked only under situations that seriously threaten international peace and security and it cannot be invoked under other circumstances. It is our view that the invoking of Chapter VII of the Charter in this resolution should not constitute a precedent."

o **0**: Policy grounds against action

Assign this value when the state argues that there are policy reasons for why it takes a certain position against action, for example: the resolution is vague, unbalanced, or that the action is not the appropriate way to handle the situation.

Exampel: Chinese statement in <u>S/PV.6627</u>: "At the moment, the Security Council has before it two draft resolutions. One, which China supports, advocates respect for the sovereignty of Syria and resolving the crisis there through political dialogue. With regard to the other draft resolution, which the Council considered today, like quite a few other Council members, China states that: China believes that, under the current circumstances, sanctions or the threat thereof does not help to resolve the question of Syria and, instead, may further complicate the situation. Regrettably and disappointingly, this major and legitimate concern did not receive due attention from the sponsors. As it now stands, the draft resolution focuses solely on exerting pressure on Syria, even threatening to impose sanctions. It does not help to facilitate the easing of the situation in Syria. China therefore voted against it."

o 9: No statement

Assign this value when the state does not make any statements regarding the legal nature of a norm/issue, or when a resolution is adopted without any statement from the state.

3.4.5 Vote

Name: V410 Label: vote

Definition: Variable captures how a member state voted on a specific resolution.

Coding scheme: Assign a value based on how a specific member state voted on the resolution

in a meeting.

• **Y**: Yes

• N: No

• A: Abstain

4. Coder identification

Variable(s) relate to the person coding the specific line of data.

4.1 Coder

Name: coder *Label*: Coder

Definition: Variable records the initials of the person coding the line of data.

Coding scheme: Assign a value to the variable that corresponds to the initials of the coder.

5. Notes

Throughout the coding brief notes regarding different considerations made in relation to a resolution and variable is done by each coder. The notes are entered in the coding sheet under "Notes" (in case the current codesheet lacks the tab, add it).

Example, if code 15. Terrorism is used instead of code 25. Armed attack from non-state actor (terrorism).

Why was the choice made?

What aspects affected the choice?