Discussion on how to motive and retain employees in China by exploring the factors influencing employee enthusiasm at work
-- applying two-factory theory in P&G employees

Author: Yalan Zhang

Supervisor: Pao Kao

Abstract

This research discusses how to motive and retain employees in China based on analyzing factors influencing employee enthusiasm and strategies to motivate employees under the framework of Herzberg's two-factor theory. With the proposition that hygiene factors and motivators both influence the work enthusiasm, 15 interviews were arranged to collect the needed data for further analysis. According to the information obtained from the 15 interviewees from P&G, hygiene factors and motivators all exert influences over their work behaviors and the impact of the factors differs according to the different conditions of the employees. The findings of this research generally agree with the two-factor theory. Based on how the work enthusiasm of P&G's employees are influenced by each of the factors, strategies are correspondingly formulated to motivate employees at work. Generally speaking, this research is significant for being conducted from a microscopic perspective to the macroscopic perspective. In other words, a specific organization is studied to figure out the answers to the research questions and the findings can be used for future studies as well for practical purposes.

More specifically, when conducting this study, such factors as unsatisfying wages and benefits, heavy workload, task conflicts, ambiguous duties, interpersonal conflicts and ineffective management system, etc., all discourage the enthusiasm of employees. In response to that, a reasonable management system and sound motivational mechanism should be established to keep employees active at work or retain those who want to resign.

Key words: employee enthusiasm; hygiene factors; motivators; strategies

Contents

1. Introduction

1.1 Research background

Enterprises in China are facing a more complex environment and encountering stronger competition in attracting talent. Since 2014, the development speed of China's economic has been gradually adjusted from the original high speed to the medium high speed. In the past, we blindly pursued the speed of economic development, but now we have paid more attention to the quality and efficiency of development (Wei, Junjian and Junsen, 2016). The change brought about by the downward adjustment of economic development rate is particularly obvious in the intense competition for resources factors. Human resources, as the core and the most important resources, is particularly important when facing fierce market competition.

In some traditional enterprises, the brain drain crisis and the potential to loss talents is even severe. With the loss of talents, it brings the increase of enterprise operating cost, which will affect the profit and competitiveness of the enterprise. Particularly, the loss of talents is not conducive to internal stability and unity, and directly affects the morale and cohesion of other personnel in the enterprise (Zhatkanbaevaa, Zhatkanbaevab and Zhatkanbaev,2012). The problem has become a key factor to restrict the development of those enterprises. According to the relevant survey data, the high-level talent flow rate of China enterprises has been reached to 50%.

To address the concern to sustain competitiveness in human resource, enterprises need to motivate quality employee to stay and be loyal. Based on that, in this study, factors influencing employee enthusiasm and strategies to motivate employees will be elucidated. Moreover, this study will also purpose potential strategies to further stimulate the working enthusiasm of employees.

Motivation theories provide a theoretic foundation and serve as great references for the current research. The prevalence and wide application of motivation theories are insightful in terms of exploring into the depths of how employees can be motivated (Furnham, Eracleous, and Chamorro-Premuzic, 2009). Among the theories that are dedicated to elaborating on motivation in workplace, Herzberg's Two-Factor theory stand out and compared with the others, is relatively more frequently used for practical purposes (Ramlall, 2004). For the current study, this theory will serve as theoretical references to help conduct an analysis on examining P&G's HR policy.

1.2 Research problem

With the deepening of economic globalization, the problem of brain drain has attracted much attention in China. Brain drain, a popular term used to document and narrate the loss of skilled and educated individuals, is a movement driven by varieties of economic, political, and social push and pull factors (Crush and Hughes, 2009). As we all know, talent is the most valuable resource in the 21st century. The essence of enterprise competition has become talent competition. Thus, the phenomenon of brain drain is bound to bring a great impact on the development of companies.

Employee motivation has been placed at a strategical height by an increasing number of organizations as a fundamental element to profitability (Kompaso and Sridevi, 2010). The outflow of talents due to international competition, income gap, work environment has had some negative effects on the reform of our country, science and technology improvement, the modernization construction and other aspects.

Brain drain is divided into explicit loss and invisible loss. Explicit drain refers to internal talent leaving the enterprise for some reason, which affects the business development. The invisible brain drain refers to the lack of incentive within the organization affects their enthusiasm in work and they can't fullfil themselves, thus hindering the development of enterprises (Jean-Pascal and Elise, 2013).

The phenomenon of brain drain mainly focuses on industries with higher marketization level. Those talents aim to improve their own value through job-hopping and the self-stability is relatively poor.

Based on the above situations, figuring out what contributes to the loss of employees' enthusiasm at work using two-factor theory is necessary.

1.3 Research purpose

This study aims to explore how companies properly motivate and satisfy employees, and what it means for the company. Two-factory theory can be used to examine P&G's HR policy and collect data to reflect employees' opinions. In addition, exploring about the factors influencing employee behaviors is contributive to formulating retaining measures.

In some aspects, the study is contributive both theoretically and practically. When it comes to its theoretical significance, not only is it capable of furthering the applicability of this theory but also of enriching the relevant knowledge base as a guidance on how to make substantial differences to the motivational practices. Despite the fruitful exploration of previous researches on the factors affecting employees' job performance, some of the findings are too generalized such as "low salary is the primary reason for their being inactive at work and thus undesirable productivity" (Rynes, Gerhart and Minette, 2004). However, many other causes like heavy workload and overtime working should also be to blame for the phenomenon of slacking off and even be perceived as the dominant ones (Hackman, 1980). Therefore, it is of great necessity and significance to study about this theory to explore more causes and enhance the point that different causes exert varying influences under different business contexts.

The practical significance of the current research can be easily understandable because the fundamental purpose of academic attempts is to serve practices. This study aims at

figuring out what measures should companies take to motivate and retain employees. Therefore, the conclusions from examining P&G's HR policy based on two-factor theory can be applied to companies confront with similar problems, especially multinational enterprise. Thus, in this sense, this research is practically significant for guiding organizations on how to stimulate their staff and maintain a healthy relationship with them by referring to this theory.

1.4 Research questions

Overall question

How can companies in China properly motivate and keep employees: Applying two-factory theory in P&G employees

Sub-question 1

What factors influence the enthusiasm and satisfaction of P&G employees who work in China?

Sub-question 2

Did P&G's HR policy conform to what the two-factor theory suggests?

2. Theoretical background

2.1 An overview of two-factor theory

Based on a comprehensive understanding of employee motivation, the current research will be conducted under the framework of two-factor theory proposed by the famous psychologist, Frederick Herzberg. As indicated by this theory, it is both satisfiers and dissatisfiers that altogether shape the overall landscape of an individual employee's working state (Kelso and Hetter, 1967). Satisfiers refer to "the motivators that are closely associated with job satisfaction" (Maddox, 1981) while dissatisfiers are those related with maintenance or hygiene. In terms of the category of satisfiers, responsibility, achievement, recognition and advancement all belong to this type for being "intrinsic motivators which are directly related to rewards attainable from job performance" (King, 1970). Dissatisfiers, as extrinsic motivators, mainly result from the work environment of the employees. Such elements as the administration and policies of a company, peers, supervision, salary and working conditions are all extrinsic motivators (Lundberg, Gudmundson and Andersson, 2009). Herzberg believes fulfilling the maintenance and hygiene needs can enhance satisfaction and prevent discontent sentiment among employees. Apart from that, satisfiers hold the most potential to drive improvement in job performance (Lundberg, Gudmundson and Andersson, 2009).

To set an example, the programs intended to strike a balance between work and life are representative satisfiers as a consequence of recognizing the employees' life needs outside of workplace. The effectiveness of these programs is reflected in securing greater motivation of the employees when they temporarily withdraw from enjoying life and resume their role as a worker. In addition, the efforts to make improvements to the job so that it can be of greater interest are capable of reinforcing the overall satisfaction experienced by the employees who will then become more enthusiastic on their job (House and Wigdor, 1967). A dissatisfier, specifically speaking, might be how

the interrelationship forms among the network of colleagues (House and Wigdor, 1967). As is well known, one facet of the corporate complexity is the daily interaction with colleagues and high quality relationship with the peers within the same organization contributes a lot to extrinsically improving employee enthusiasm (Maidani, 1991). The following is a further elaboration on the two-factor theory.

2.1.1 Application of two-factor theory in the context of China

In recent years, Herzberg's two-factor theory has experienced an increase in the frequency of its being referred to as a guidance to both the scholars and practitioners who are engaged with employee motivation. To specify the application of this theory in academia, many Chinese scholars would use it as the theoretical frameworks under which their relevant research proceeds (Kaliprasad, 2006). In this case, the theory is explained and discussed in detail with regards to how both motivators and hygiene factors play their own role in the workplace or other contexts. In addition, this theory is frequently mentioned as evidence by the researchers who attempt to substantiate the influence of some factors under certain circumstances (Kaliprasad, 2006). For example, Yang Fan (2011) borrows from the insights provided by Herzberg about this theory to illustrate the importance of the job itself, recognition, growth possibilities, salary and working conditions in motivating new generations of employees. It also occurs that Herzberg's motivation theory and Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs are compared and simultaneously used by some Chinese scholars (Silverthorne, 1992). In terms of its application by the practitioners in China, this theory serves as a guide for entrepreneurs who seek to cultivate a more productive and innovative workforce (Chien, 2013). It is often the case that the management of those companies in China tries to strike a balance among the motivators and hygiene factors which they consider as means to motivate their staff (Chien, 2013). In general, the influence of Herzberg's two-factor theory prevails in China's business sphere.

It is noticeable that in certain cultures, the validity and applicability of Herzberg's two factor theory may vary. This phenomenon is largely attributable to the different cultural and social norms and the consequent distinctive values and preferences. The main issue of the theory is that most researches on this topic were conducted in North America and Europe, where the work environment differs from that of other cultures (Hines, 1973). In Hines' (1973) research on 12 job factors and overall job satisfaction in New Zealand, his finding demonstrated inconsistency with traditional pattern in the two-factor theory. In New Zealand, the significance of interpersonal relationships and supervision is evidently spotted. Judge et al. (2002) also documented the different notions for absence and other such behaviors in other cultures.

In comparison with Chinese managers who prefer domestic reasons for absence, Canadian managers are more likely to give reasons related to illness, stress and depression. Furthermore, the job satisfaction factors are not static. With the working position being increasingly filled with younger generations, the two-factor theory should be also revised according to the preference of younger generations. For instance, Brislin et al. (2005) conducted a study regarding the Japanese job satisfaction factors and HR styles. They argued that the old Japanese HR style is essentially replaced by the new one, including group orientation to individual orientation, activity orientation to accomplishment orientation, repressed individual development and needs to desired and expressed individual development and lifetime employment to lifetime employability. Such shifts drastically change the landscape of job satisfaction factors. These findings imply that multinational should be cautious about the particular cultural and social norms of China and revise their policies accordingly.

Despite the fact that cultural differences may be accountable for the different perceptions and results of Herzberg's two factor theory, there are some universally applicable traits upon which multinational corporates like P&G can establish a general policy to govern its global operations. For instance, Judge et al.'s work (2002) has identified much consistencies across various cultures regarding the model's central

proposition that intrinsic job characteristics, e.g. autonomy and variety promote job satisfaction, especially for those individuals with high growth and development orientations. This finding has exceptional implications for P&G, as it only acquires top talents from around the globe that are highly oriented by growth and development. This research also found that job satisfaction is highly related to life satisfaction. P&G should conduct global policies consistent to its goal of providing high-quality life to its employees.

2.2 Hygiene factors

2.2.1 Company Policy and Administration

According to Herzberg, company policy and administration constitute a key dimension which influences how an employee feels about an organization. Usually, a company implements a broad range of corporate policies which address issues in the aspects of personnel, human resource management and business operations, etc. (Herzberg, 2005). Company administration can be boiled down to the management of all the resources and procedures within that organization. Not only do these policies and demonstration play a critical role in its business performance, but are also taken into serious account by employees when conducting an overall evaluation about the organization they work for (Herzberg, 2005). The findings derived from that evaluation impact how enthusiastically they fulfill their job responsibilities. As is often the case, if an organization executes policies and administrative concepts in a too rigid and stressful manner or if the policies are far from clear and fair, employees will be unsatisfied and discouraged at work (House and Wigdor, 1967). In China, against the background of ever more intense market competition, increasingly greater importance is attached by companies to their policy and administration (Chien, 2013). In the past, the formulation of policies and administration was mainly profitability-oriented without much emphasis on the satisfaction of employees' needs. To form a stark contrast,

Chinese employees have become a significant power contributing to the decision-making process aimed at generating the most appropriate administrative policies for the companies including those overseas multinationals (Kaliprasad, 2006). As a consequence, the standards of working hours, dress code, breaks and vacation are set based on both the organization itself and their acceptability among the employees. Despite that trend, employees' dissatisfaction resulting from improper company policy and administration remains an issue to be better tackled.

2.2.2 Supervision

Supervision is a hygiene factor that might give rise to dissatisfaction among employees. In business context, supervision refers to overseeing the work of staff with the management acting as the supervisor. To ensure working efficiency and the development of the whole organization, the supervisor lays down some rules to be conformed to by the employees (Herzberg, 2005). For example, an employee should report to his superior about his work on a regular basis so that the superior can be informed about and evaluate this employee's job performance. In this way, whether this employee is committed to his job responsibilities is known and relevant suggestions can be made for improvements (Burke, 1966). Without supervision, misconducts such as slacking off or working far from satisfactorily would get common in the workplace. In this sense, supervision is necessary and significant for an organization to ensure adequate workforce investment and to achieve its business objectives. However, too close supervision is merely counter-productive for it means heavy pressure over employees (Herzberg, 2017). Typical of today's workplace, people want respect, freedom and a relaxing working environment which contribute to their proactiveness. If they feel suppressed by their superiors, their enthusiasm at work would be radically reduced (Alshmemri, Shahwan-Akl and Maude, 2017). In the context of Chinese business sphere, people's awareness of liberty has been awakened and they tend to seek the organizations where they are treated as a self-dominative individual. For them, too

strict supervision is provocative and discourages them from working enthusiastically (Alshmemri, Shahwan-Akl and Maude, 2017).

2.2.3 Interpersonal Relations

It is very important for a company to build harmonious interpersonal relations which have become essential for organizational success. In general, the workplace benefits from a good relationship between workers (Maddox, 1981). Specifically speaking, well established interpersonal relations are not only conducive to developing a desirable and pleasant working atmosphere but also good for both the physical and mental well-being of employees (Maddox, 1981). If that relationship is unrelaxing with mutual suspicion or other factors damaging the harmonious development of the organization, the employees could not fully concentrate on work, with their attention often distracted by the matters concerning handling their peers, superiors, or subordinates (Locke, 1969). Therefore, it is advisable to form appropriate and acceptable interpersonal relations not only for the sake of the employees themselves but also of the organization as a whole. In other words, that type of relations can stimulate the enthusiasm of employees as the major contributors to organizational development (Herzberg, 1968). In the case of the organizations in China, they are becoming more and more conscious of how important the joint efforts made by their staff are in an attempt to achieve their corporate goals. Based on that, they are striving to eradicate the causes of conflict and humiliation among their staff (Lam, Baum and Pine, 2001). For example, they try to establish and optimize their equitable reward systems which make it possible for employees to be equally rewarded according to their performance rather than demographic characteristics, educational background or other factors irrelevant to work (Chien, 2013). Nevertheless, such issues as conflicts among employees as well as disputes between organization and its staff still exist, often dampening the employees' enthusiasm and interfering with their normal work.

13

2.2.4 Salary

Salary, as what people are paid for their job, is important in the most basic sense. For particular work, fair salary is required. Without being paid with the salary perceived matching their performance, it is difficult for employees to get satisfied at work (Herzberg, 2005). To what extent salary influences motivation is frequently subjected to debate with most experts agreeing that "a reasonable salary for a given job is needed to attract and retain employees" (Alshmemri, Shahwan-Akl and Maude, 2017). To explain about the debates, they usually center on whether salary is useful in motivating top employees or it only plays the role of a tool to retain employees. As a common practice among many companies, plays are paid like straight commission, salary-plus-commission which serve as motivational techniques in lieu of a traditional straight-salary format (Bassett-Jones and Lloyd, 2005).

According to Herzberg, because of the protection it provides against employee dissatisfaction, basic salary is of great importance as a survival need. Of particular note, salary alone cannot generate strongly motivated employees. Instead, the combination of pay structure with promotional opportunities, recognition and self-worth have high likelihood of pushing for stronger performance. In light of that, it has become common for companies in China to increase the basic salary paid to their staff (Chang and Hsieh, 2006). In addition, to motivate better performance, the companies also provide promotional opportunities for them and recognize their contribution made to the development of the company so that they can feel their self-worth.

2.2.5 Status

Status in an organization refers to how one is considered, respected and treated by others in a working environment including his superiors, peers and subordinates. Despite the advocacy of equality, there exists a hierarchy of status within an organization mainly based on the position held by the participants in the development

14

process of that organization (Herzberg, 2017). To specify that, the chief executive officer usually enjoys the highest status for its role of managing the whole organization. This CEO is most respectable by its subordinates for the biggest responsibility he undertakes for the organization. Nowadays, ordinary employees aspire for the equality of respect and treatment. If they are always ordered to work like a "slave" rebellious emotions would be developed in them, largely weakening their enthusiasm at work and reducing their working efficiency and productivity (Dartey-Baah and Amoako, 2011).

On the contrary, if feeling valued and having enjoyable status in their company, they will be undoubtedly motivated and more committed to fulfilling their job duties. Therefore, it is significant to guarantee the due status of employees for the purpose of maintaining or increasing their productivity (Dartey-Baah and Amoako, 2011). In China, ordinary workers which were treated as inferior to the occupants of some other "more important" professions have experienced an increase in their status. The major reason behind that change is the realization on the part of the management of the companies that without being fairly treated and receiving their due respect, employees would barely be fully devoted to their work, a big hindrance on the road toward higher profits (Yusoff, Kian and Idris, M. 2013).

2.2.6 Job Security

Job security is the probability that an individual can keep his job. Usually, a job considered with a high level of security means an individual has a small chance of getting unemployed (Herzberg, 2005). As indicated by basic economic theory, when economy expands and businesses experience an increase of demands, higher investment in labor and capital would be necessitated (Herzberg, 2005). Besides, during the period of business growth, employees' job confidence and security would also be enhanced. During an economic downturn, the opposite holds true (Sachau, 2007). With the overall trend of reduced demand for products or services, businesses have to

downsize their workforces within a short time. In this case, the level of job security is low.

In light of that, the ultimate approach to make employees feel secure about their job is rigorous business development itself (Alshmemri, Shahwan-Akl and Maude, 2017). With reinforced job security, employees would not bother to worry about being unemployed and more attention would be paid to the work at hand, their efficiency increased and overall job performance improved. In brief, real job security is motivational at the workplace. Chinese companies are striving to increase the job security of employees by strictly adhering to the policy of "social insurance and housing fund" and setting fair dismissal system. Besides, constant guidance and encouragement are given to the employees to better their performance at work to reduce the risk of being fired.

2.2.7 Personal Life

Personal life in the business context is the course of an individual live his life as an employee outside an organization and the activities related to work. Simply speaking, employee's life can be divided into the categories of work and private plans and a balance between them two is very important to maintain the state of an individual being motivated at work (Ewen, Smith and Hulin, 1966). With too heavy workload and no sufficient time to implement private plans such as taking care of family and entertaining himself, an employee would not concentrate on accomplishing the job goals (Ewen, Smith and Hulin, 1966). That is explanatory about the phenomenon that more and more companies tend to set the working hours within an appropriate and acceptable range, taking into consideration the need of employees to live a satisfactory personal life.

In simpler terms, with the failure to fulfill the plans typical of an employee's personal life, it is hard for him to devotedly engage with work life, entailing the necessity for

organizations to leave enough space for employees' personal life (Locke, 1969). The trend of cutting working hours to a proper level has become irreversible in China where the companies attempt to stimulate the enthusiasm of employees by helping them get satisfied with their life irrelevant to work (Chien, 2013). In spite of that, complaints resulting from working overtime or working an extra shift are still commonly heard in today's Chinese workplace. Therefore, further efforts are needed to make improvements in this aspect so that higher motivation and thus greater productivity can be expected from employees.

2.2.8 Working conditions

Working conditions refer to the environment where one regularly works and the conditions which can either positively or negatively influence one's work. According to some scholars (Alshmemri, Shahwan-Akl and Maude, 2017), working conditions are at the core of paid work and employment relationships. In general terms, the working conditions cover a broad range of issues and topics from physical conditions to mental demands, remuneration and working time (e.g. work schedules, hours of work and rest periods) (Sachau, 2007). As indicated by another researcher (Maidani, 1991), working conditions include but are not limited to physical environment, amenities, degree of danger or safety, noise and stress levels, and the like. It is widely agreed that too harsh working conditions cannot generate satisfactory outcomes. For example, high degree of danger would fail to make employees work free from worrying about their life (Maidani, 1991). Too much noise at the workplace easily distracts staff from their work, making it hard to concentrate (Maidani, 1991).

Apart from that, stress beyond the bearable limit is likely to give rise to the idea of quitting job. Therefore, desirable working conditions are of utmost importance for retaining employees and based on it for further motivating them to perform more satisfactorily. As a global tendency, working conditions have been experiencing rapid

17

improvements (Lam, Baum and Pine, 2001). To exemplify that, in the past, many Chinese staff were crowded into a small office with no presence of a computer or other technologically advanced devices to make the fulfillment of their job easier. To strike a contrast, nowadays, merely several employees, even those doing ordinary paper work, can share a comfortable office, not having to endure the crowdedness (Yusoff, Kian and Idris, 2013). In the future, the comfort level of workers in China would only undergo further enhancement.

2.3 Motivational factors

2.3.1 Achievement

Achievement is an intrinsic motivator that an individual gets internally. People with strong desire for achievement are eager to make things more perfect, improve work efficiency, and achieve greater success (Gawel, 1997). As commonly seen in the workplace, while pursuing success, they work hard to overcome difficulties and solve problems. Attaching more importance to personal sense of accomplishment, they do not value too much the material rewards of success (Gawel, 1997). Individuals' achievement needs are related to economic, cultural, social, and governmental development, and the social atmosphere also restricts people's achievement needs (Gawel, 1997). In light of that, to satisfy employees' need for sense of accomplishment is a direction of efforts intended to motivate them at work. Hence, many companies tend to assign tasks to their staff based on their competence and career pursuit (Dartey-Baah and Amoako, 2011). For instance, an important project might be assigned to an employee who is capable and wants to challenge himself for the sense of achievement. Besides, constant encouragement from the management is in place for the employees to generate better results at work, which is also a source of achievement. Of particular note, to satisfy those pursuing mental fulfillment instead of material rewards, the organizations are inclined to maintain frequent communication with them for their ideas

and insights on certain matters to make them feel important and self-worth (Kaliprasad, 2006). A significant number of Chinese employees whose living standards have been greatly improved start to shift their focus from how much they can earn from a job to how successful they can be in a career (Lam, Baum and Pine, 2001). This trend will get more prevalent with strikingly fast development of this country and people's income.

2.3.2 Recognition

As one of its definitions indicates, recognition is the acknowledgement of achievement, service and merit, etc (Herzberg, 2005). Recognition from the upper level of an organization means a lot to an employee. In many contexts including business sphere, providing employee recognition will "encourage a positive, productive, and innovative organizational climate" (Herzberg, 2005). As the nature of humans, people who feel appreciated often end up with self-recognition and will more rigorously invest both wisdom and energy into what they engaging with (Sachau, 2007). As a consequence, they become happier and more productive employees. Furthermore, there are many situations where recognition can be given. For example, employees who stay after work to contribute ideas for departmental improvement should be recognized. Besides, even minor behaviors deserve recognition such as an employee serving customers well or answering the phone which sets the sales in motion (Herzberg, 2017). To motivate employees at work, it is necessary to be specific about why the individual is receiving the recognition. As feedback is also a form of recognition, one can say "the report had great influence on the decision-making of the committee", or "you have done an excellent job of providing the needed information and key points". Besides, such compliment as "your work has cut 5% our operating budget" also works (Bassett-Jones and Lloyd, 2005). All these specific expressions of recognition not only mentally satisfy the employees but also provide a direction for their future work. Hence, it is fair to say that recognition is important for its motivational power. The Chinese employees, just like those from other cultures, like timely recognition. Some companies tend to provide

recognition immediately when an employee performs satisfactorily. In this case, as the employee is already feeling good about his performance, the immediate recognition would enhance that feeling of satisfaction (Kaliprasad, 2006). In return, that would strengthen the employee's confidence and enthusiasm in his position.

2.3.3 Growth Possibilities

Growth possibilities mean the possible chances for one to grow in various aspects such as work capability, personality, interpersonal relations, economic ability and anti-pressure ability, etc. (Herzberg, 2017). These possibilities form a great attractive power in recruitment process. To be specific, while applying for a position, the applicant usually makes a comprehensive evaluation about the company in terms of its history of business performance, current competitiveness, working environment, future prospects as well as the growth possibilities it can provide for its employees (Sachau, 2007). Not only do growth possibilities matter in the talent market featuring fierce competition for the most competent professionals but also play a crucial role in motivating and retaining employees. Once a person has been recruited into an organization, he would try to persuade himself to settle down for whatever reasons. However, After the end of the fresh time in this organization, he would try to seek the signs of the opportunities for him to grow in various aspects as mentioned above (Kaliprasad, 2006). The failure to identify them or even just some of them would likely result in his declining confidence in this organization and eventually having the idea of quitting the job for those promising greater prospects (Kaliprasad, 2006). With these mental activities, they demonstrate negativity and lack of motivation in their actual work performance, which wastes the resources of the organization and influences his own development (Yang, 2011). Therefore, it is highly necessary for companies to hold the potential for growth possibilities for employees. To motivate and retain Chinese employees, many companies design various training programs and provide other opportunities with similar purposes for their staff to experience growth.

2.3.4 Career Advancement

Career advancement is defined as the life-long process of continuously managing one's professional work. During this process, people set their career goals or ambitions and endeavor to achieve them (Sachau, 2007). Commonly, many people consider the working experience in a competitively reputed organization as a valuable step to advance their career. Career advancement should normally integrate the goal of higher efficiency or higher productivity at work (Herzberg, 2017). Besides, some also see being promoted to a certain position as a significant advancement of their career. Given intense competition in the workplace which makes it important to get advantageous over others, employees attach greater importance to the chance of their career being advanced (Herzberg, 2017). Therefore, in their job application form, they expressly state that they hope their company can be a big help on their path of career development. In light of that, those organizations with great prospects for employees' career advancement are much more popular than those providing little space for their staff's personal development (Dartey-Baah and Amoako, 2011). However, it is often common that some employees see no hope of stepping further with their career or even accept the reality that their career would stay unmoved. In that case, they only work to earn a living with no pursuit of bigger goals. Therefore, it is unlikely for them to do more than finishing what they are asked in that organization. As a consequence, their performance largely fall short of the requirements (Maddox, 1981). Chinese employees value career advancement much more than ever before when their former generations were satisfied with being paid to afford an ordinary life. Nowadays, they are more satisfied with career achievements than merely money (Yang, 2011).

2.3.5 Level of Responsibility

The level of responsibility of an employee encompasses not only the work he should finish but also the goals his work is expected to achieve. Only an appropriate level of job responsibility can best motivate him to perform even better (Burke, 1966). Too high or too low level of responsibility enables him to seek more favorable work results. On the one hand, when an employee is assigned a task beyond his capacity, he would be too pressed to undertake well the work. As a consequence, not only do the work results fall short of the expectation but the employee himself would doubt himself in terms of his capability due to the disappointment and discouragement from that failure experience (Chang and Hsieh, 2006). On the other hand, if a task that is too easy and forms no challenge to an employee is assigned, he would consider it no matter and take it not as seriously. As a result, he might fail to accomplish this task due to complacency or carelessness or even if it is satisfactorily done, no sense of achievement is felt by him (Burke, 1966). Therefore, neither too high level or too low level of responsibility is appropriate to motivate employees. In China, employees also suffer from the mismatch between their own job competence and the responsibility they should fulfill within an organization (Liu, Guo and Lee, 2011). Nevertheless, things are changing for the better with the efforts made to improve the talent assessment mechanism.

2.3.6 The Job Itself

Job itself is a key motivator in the workplace. The nature and the potential held by a specific job exert enormous influence over how an individual performs at work (Herzberg, 2017). For those who like their position within an organization and dedicates their whole heart to it, the job itself is the biggest source of satisfaction. He would be whole-heartedly committed to the tasks covered by the job responsibility and stay motivated whenever difficulties strike him (Alshmemri, Shahwan-Akl and Maude, 2017). On the contrary, if an employee feels unenthusiastic about the job he is daily engaged with, his work would be no more than a part of his everyday routine and only serves as a tool for him to make a living (Alshmemri, Shahwan-Akl and Maude, 2017).

Needless to say, it is hard for him to proactively perform on his job and whenever any adversities are involved to hinder the smooth flow of his tasks, he would be susceptible to not trying his best or even giving up (Dartey-Baah and Amoako, 2011). Therefore, the fundamental element contributing to keeping an employee motivated at work lies with the attraction of the job itself (Herzberg, 2005). Otherwise, quitting would be a frequent undesired consequence. That also explains why a growing number of companies in China emphasize the importance of the underlying principle in corporate world-------"to do what you like and like what you do" (Yusoff, Kian and Idris, 2013). That indicates that people should choose the job they truly favor so that they can stick to it in the long run. That indirectly reflects the motivational power of the job itself in the workplace.

3. Methodology

To answer the research questions concerning the factors influencing the enthusiasm of P&G's employees and to propose corresponding strategies to stimulate employee motivation, this chapter is devoted to discussing the research design, methods, operationalization (sampling and data collection) and data analysis of the current research.

3.1 Research design: Qualitative Case Study

The present paper applied a qualitative case study to address the research questions. Qualitative case study typically refers to the approach of research that facilitates exploration of a phenomenon within its context from various data sources (Baxter & Jack, 2008). This method ensures that the issue is not addressed through only one lens and thus enabling multiple approaches to interpret the phenomenon. The rationale for choosing this method firstly concerns with the options between the two most frequently applied research method, i.e. the quantitative and qualitative methods, in studying the research question. While quantitative method is defined as the systematic empirical research on observable data via mathematical techniques and aims at developing and employing mathematical theories for certain phenomena (Newman & Benz, 1998), it does not seem to be able to yield much conclusive findings for the research questions for this research. On the other hand, qualitative research, which emphasizes concepts, notions, opinions and understandings of the phenomena, suits this research more since the research questions can only be answered in a humanistic nature (Stake, 2008). It necessarily involves in-depth factors influencing employee enthusiasm at work, contributing to correctly answering the first question and proposing proper strategies to effectively motive employees.

Within the scope of qualitative research, this paper selected the qualitative case study approach among other options, e.g. longitudinal design, cross-sectional or social survey design and experimental design. This approach is frequently applied in management

and business studies and is often described as a research design entailing intensively analyzing a single case (Crowe et al, 2011). Apart from that, this design is particularly useful in answering the "what" and "how" questions as well as investigating a certain phenomenon. Given a specific context, case study serves to explore about ordinary activities, events or organizations so as to connect practices with theories (Yin, 2003). It is emphasized that case study is able to provide practical evidence for various objectives such as to construct a new theory, to test the feasibility of the existing theories or to describe a business phenomenon in a precise manner, etc.

The advantages of applying qualitative case study in social and business researches are its intensity, unlimited sample size, and innovative perspectives (Bennett, 2004). The qualitative case study method is, before anything, an intensive study of a specific phenomenon. It provides a thorough and in-depth examination of the representative unit and thus have a higher probability to approach the essence of the phenomena. It enables minor details to surface which otherwise would not be spotted by alternative methods of research. The data collected from a qualitative case study is typically richer and more in-depth than that from experimental methods. Case studies are also particularly favored in researches where a large sample of similar participants are difficult to acquire. It can also facilitate later researches as to validate its claims (Yin, 2017).

Despite the advantages of the qualitative case study design, its demerits should also be taken into consideration when applying it to social researches. The most signifying disadvantage of the qualitative case study design is that it cannot be simply generalized to the wider population (Zainal, 2007). It merely focuses on a single one subject of study, or at best a cluster of a few ones, in a board environment. The qualitative case study method is also in lack of external validity. In a case study, the research could not have the same level of control over certain variables and events as they would in an experiment method. The data in a case study may not always be relevant or important to other scenarios. Another controversial disadvantage of the case study method is the researcher's bias (Darke et al., 1998). In a qualitative case study research, the

interpretation of the data is largely subjective to the researcher's own biases. The bias can range from bias towards the subject, the process of data collection or the data analysis. Without cautious mechanism to prevent such biases from influencing the research conclusions, it could severely hinder the ultimate validity of the research (Darke et al., 1998). Additionally, the inability to replicate is another disadvantage of the case study approach (Darke et al., 1998). This essentially forbids the case study research to be corroborated, which occasionally compromise the value of the research findings.

With a thorough consideration with both advantages and disadvantage of the case study method taken into account, the researcher of the present paper determines that the case study approach is the optimal choice of research design for its suitability with the research question. However, this paper should also be aware of the potential limitations of the case study method and establish necessary mechanisms to prevent the result from being biased and unrepresentative. For this purpose, the research consulted fellow scholars regarding the question design in the interview to guarantee that they can be responded with constructive and fruitful answers. The transcripts of the recorded interviews were reviewed with the interviewees to ensure that their intended messages are correctly reflected. The coding process was facilitated with computer software in comparison with hand-written versions to identify any significant disparities. The data categorization also involved external help to alleviate personal biases.

3.2 Focal firm: P&G in China

In the present research, P&G is decided as the subject of the specific case study. Two reasons constitute the rationale behind this decision. To begin with, its popularity and representativeness in daily chemical market help it qualify as the case with respect to answering the research questions. Next, P&G is well suitable in terms of applying the theoretical framework given that fact it has occupied a significant portion of the daily chemical market share. Besides, it occurred that some of its employees felt discouraged

at work without the due motivation. After effortful attempts to secure its employees through establishing a motivational system, in general terms, its employees stay enthusiastic about their job. Therefore, it is reasonable to choose this company for a case study.

The objective of this research is to achieve a further comprehensive understanding of what factors exert influence over the enthusiasm of employees at work and how to correspondingly motivate employees so that higher productivity and profitability can be achieved. Based on that, research model and propositions will be further developed. From this perspective, case study is applicable to this research. As suggested by Stake (1995), considerable attention should be paid to the selection of cases to maximize the opportunities to best examine a certain issue or phenomenon.

3.3 Data Collection

A typical qualitative case study will involve primary data from interview as a crucial source for the research. In addition, existing archival data also facilitate the research findings.

3.3.1 Data Collection 1: Employee Interviews

The present paper applied the snowball sampling technique, i.e. the chain referral sampling method, for data collection from interviews. This method was selected primarily for its exceptional utility in circumstance when characteristics possessed by samples are difficult to find (Biernacki & Waldorf, 1981). Considering the tremendous difficulty in finding sufficient primary data without those referred to by some interviewees, this is the optimal and the most available sampling technique within the given resources of the researcher. Hence, the research firstly interviewed 5 current/former employees of P&G that are acquainted by the researcher or the researcher's friends.

After acquiring their referral, the present research continued to interview 10 other current/former P&G employees to enrich the sample and thus instill various valuable perspectives and alleviate biases from a limited sample size. The detailed information of the interviewees are documented in the following table:

Table 1 Details of interviewees

No.	Name	Gender	Age	Former or current employee	Working years in P&G
Employee (E1)	Zhi Lin	Male	26	Current employee	2 years
Employee (E2)	Fang Guo	Female	24	Current employee	1 year
Employee (E3)	Qiming Zhang	Male	35	Former employee	7 years
Employee (E4)	Yuan Lu	Male	34	Current employee	5 years
Employee (E5)	Xiao Lin	Female	28	Current employee	4 years
Employee (E6)	Rong Huang	Female	27	Current employee	3 years
Employee (E7)	Rui Zhong	Male	40	Current employee	10 years
Employee (E8)	Xin Liu	Female	37	Current employee	8 years
Employee (E9)	Yuan Feng	Female	33	Former employee	4 years
Employee (E10)	Yong Xiong	Male	46	Current employee	15 years

Employee (E11)	Yuanxian Chen	Female	23	Current employee	1 year
Employee (E12)	Bin Liu	Male	49	Former employee	13 years
Employee (E13)	Ting Wei	Female	25	Current employee	1 year
Employee (E14)	Tao Huang	Male	38	Former employee	6 years
Employee (E15)	Fang Qian	Female	30	Current employee	3years

Considering the nationalities and native tongues of the interviewees, all of the 15 interviews were conducted in China to ensure the accuracy of the conveyed information. Each interview was mandated to have a minimum duration of 30 minutes to secure the abundancy of acquired information. A list of guide questions (see appendix 1 and 2) on certain topics were designed for this semi-structured interview, allowing for enough leeway in the participants' responses (Polkinghorne, 2005). During the entire process of this interview, complaints and suggestions of the interviewees were noted down as a reference for the proposition of measures to take for higher work motivation and thus increased productivity. All interviews were recorded under the consents from the interviewers, carefully documented and transcribed, and revised with the interviewee to avoid any form of interviewer bias in the transcription (Pannucci & Wilkins, 2010).

3.3.2 Data Collection 2: Archival Data for P&G's HR Policy

This research relies on both primary and archival data. The policies in primarily data are merely interpretation of the official policy by the participants. For this particular concern, there must be a presentation of the original official policy in comparison.

Hence, this research explored archival data regarding the official HR policy of P&G from its official website. Additionally, other websites, media reports and news articles were searched for relevant information. The most important archival data is two documents containing certain HR policies retrieved from the official website of P&G. The advantage of using archival data is the validity of the data. Documents retrieved from official sources tend to be more reliable than data acquired from alternative methods. The potential disadvantage of the archival data is its recency. The retrieved documents of HR policies may be outdated and inconsistent with current policies that are only familiarized by employees. Data from other sources tend to be vulnerable to inaccuracy as they lack of authority in this issue. The following table demonstrate the researcher's intended data retrieval and the final outcome.

Data Type	Retrieved
Official Source: Related Documents on HR Policies	2
External Source: Related Documents on HR Policies	2

3.3.3 Operationalization

The interviews conducted with the subjects comprises of a total of 20 questions. These questions were categorized into four groups. Questions in the first group explored the background and daily activities of the interviewees in P&G. These questions were primarily intended to clearly identify the interviewee's work status (e.g. work/worked actively/inactively, work/worked with high/low efficiency and generate/generated high/moderate/low profits, etc.) as the basis for identifying the causes of their job performance.

In the second group, questions aimed at finding the factors influencing their attitudes and behavior in the workplace followed, each of them offering a perspective from which the employees are discouraged/ encouraged to work enthusiastically. These perspectives fall into the categories of both hygiene factors and motivational factors. Hygiene factors cover the eight ones discussed in Section 2.2, involving company policy and administration, supervision, salary and other welfare, interpersonal relations, status, job security, personal life and working conditions and ways of treatment (e.g. being respected, being treated equally/ unequally and so forth). Motivational factors involve the sense of accomplishment, recognition, growth possibilities, career advancement, level of responsibility and the job itself. The third group of questions aims to compensate the second group and explore whether the employees are satisfied with the current motivational system of P&G as a response to the performance of the staff.

The fourth set of questions attempts to encourage some suggestions from the interviewees on the improvement in motivational strategies to stimulate the enthusiasm of employees at work. These questions are of great significance in terms of developing new findings based on the results of the previous researches. In short, these questions were designed for the following purposes: (1) to identify the extent of the employees' satisfaction toward their work experience in P&G; (2) to explore the factors influencing their attitude and behavior toward their work; (3) to propose proper strategies to further motivate employees. Each group containing three to five questions share high relevance with empirical research and the two-factor theory to answer the research questions.

Two types of factors	Single factor	Questions

Hygiene factors	Company policy and administration	1. What are the characteristics of the policy and administration of P&G?
		2. What do you think of the policy and administration of P&G?
		3. Is/was your work performance influenced by the policy and administration?
		4. What suggestions do you want to make about this company's policy and administration?
	Supervision	1. How strictly is/was your work supervised by your seniors in P&G?
		2. Is the type of supervision proper or not?
		3. How does/did the supervision influence your job performance?
		4. How can the supervision of this company be improved?
	Interpersonal relations	1 Do/did you get along well with your colleagues while working for P&G?
		2 Do/did all the employees interact adequately with each other? Is/was there a gap between different groups of staff?
		3 How do/did interpersonal relations in that company influence your motivation at work?
		4 Is there any space to improve the interpersonal relations within P&G so that employee enthusiasm can be enhanced?

		1. Are you satisfied with the salary you are/were paid by P&G? If not, why?
		2. Do you think you deserve more than you are/were paid?
	Salary	3. Is/was salary a factor impacting your enthusiasm for work?
		4. Should your salary be raised? If yes, how much?
		1 How do you think about your status in P&G?
		2 Do/did you receive the due respect while working in P&G?
	Status	3 Do you think your status in that company influence/influenced your work enthusiasm?
		4 Will an increased status under a working context motivate you at work?
		1 Do/ did you feel secure while working at P&G?
	Job security	2 How does/did job security in that company influence your work enthusiasm?
		3 How can job security be reinforced in that company?
		1 Are/were you satisfied with your personal life in P&G? If not, why?
	Personal life	2 How does/did personal life in P&G influence your work enthusiasm?
		3 What suggestions can you make for the company to improve your life so that you become more enthusiastic on working for this company?

	Working conditions	1. How are the working conditions of P&G? 2. Are/were you satisfied with the working conditions of P&G? 3. Do/did the working conditions influence your job enthusiasm? 4. How can P&G improve its working conditions?
Motivators	Achievement	1. Do/did feel sense of accomplishment while working for P&G? 2. Are/were you satisfied with your job performance in that company? 3. What do/did you achieve from that job? 4. Can stronger sense of achievement make you more devoted to work?
	Recognition	1. Is/was your job performance recognized by your seniors? 2. Is being recognized at work important to you? 3. Does/did your job performance being recognized motivate you to work harder? 4. Should seniors often recognize their staff's performance at work?

	Growth possibilities	1. Are/were there many growth possibilities for you in P&G?
		2. Are/were the growth possibilities accessible to you?
		3. Do/did you aspire for the growth possibilities in P&G?
		4. Should P&G provide more growth possibilities for its employees?
	Career advancement	1. Are/were you satisfied with the chances for career advancement in P&G?
		2. Is career advancement influential to your enthusiasm at work? If so, to what extent?
		3. How should P&G further motivate its employees through giving more attractive opportunities for career advancement?
	Level of responsibility	1. Does/did the level of responsibility influence your work motivation in P&G?
		2. What are the key responsibilities that make you adhere to a job?
		3. What level of responsibility is the most appropriate for you to stay enthusiastic at work in P&G?
	The job itself	1. How important is a job itself to you?
		2. Is/was your job in P&G attractive enough to motivate you at work?
		3. Should adjustments be made to the job you are engaged with to better motivate you at work?

3.4 Data Analysis

Based on the study of Golafshani (2003) on qualitative study, the analysis process of the transcribed data and archival data consists of five steps.

(1) The raw data from the interview was carefully read twice in order to acquire an accurate and comprehensive understanding. It was then transferred into a table containing the interviewee's response to the questions concerning their enthusiasm at work and their wishes how to be treated as an employee in P&G. The archival data was also read, coded and summarized in a table, in relation to different hygiene factors and motivation factors.

(2) The information in the table were cautiously and precisely classified into different types base on their relevance to the proposed constructs (see Figure 1). For those responses that are difficult to directly categorize into the proposed constructs, their essential ideas and core contents were generalized, separated and then categorized accordingly.

(3) The categorized information was revised and the relatively more important responses were systematically coded. This step aims to re-construct the interviewee's responses to their innermost intent.

(4) The coded information was revised, and those responses that could not be coded were discarded.

(5) The codes were cross-compared with the archival data retrieved from P&G and other sources by searching the key codes in the documents. Then the researcher captured the quotes that involved the codes and extracted them from the sources. These quotes were compared with the interviewee's response to identify any signifying inconsistencies.

3.5 Reliability and validity

The selected subjects in the sample can effectively reflect the internal realities regarding employee satisfaction/dissatisfaction in P&G, primarily for their direct involvement in

the company culture. They have first-hand experience about the motivational system of the company, thus being able to contribute representative and reliable responses in the interview. Furthermore, to enhance the reliability of the data from the sample, the researcher intentionally pursued diversity in the sample with regards to age, gender, marriage status, current status in P&G, working years in P&G and position. The ages of the interviewees range from 20 to 50 years old to avoid the universal preferences shared by a certain generation (Gibson & Klein, 1970; Saunders et.al., 2016). The present paper also paid particular attention to the response from female married employees with children to identify any significant pattern, as various studies suggest that domestic responsibilities of female employees often intensify their sensitivity to work-related dissatisfaction (Altman & Brothers, 1995; Anand et.al, 2015; Frone et al, 1992).

In the interview process, an interview guide was prepared to ensure the response from both open questions and structured questions could be generated in a free and adaptable manner. In addition, the conversations during the face-to-face interviews occurred in privacy, offering the interviewees an environment comfortable and relaxing enough to eliminate distraction and open their mind. Online interviews were performed in the circumstances that participants were at their own selected location for similar effects. Each interview was attended by two interviewers (my classmate and I) and an interviewee with one of the interviewers serving as a skillful guide to encourage the employee to frankly and effectively express him or herself. Besides, the other interviewer observed the reactions of the interviewee and recorded how he or she responded to the questions. After the researcher transcribed the recorded interviews, the interviewees were further consulted on whether the transcription accurately reflected their intended messages. With the permission of the interviewees, those interviews are presented in this paper along with their names indicated.

4. Empirics and analysis

This chapter is devoted to presenting the empirical results and analysis. As has been discussed in the part of methodology, this chapter is to elaborate on the relationship between the hygiene factors and employee enthusiasm as well as between motivators and employee performance at work through the lens of the theoretical framework----Herzberg's two-factor theory.

4.1 Employee enthusiasm and hygiene factors

4.1.1 Company policy and administration and employee enthusiasm

P&G Company Policy and Administration
Interview Responses
• General opinions – most the interviewees (13 out of 15 people) showed satisfaction toward company's policy and management.   • The positive thoughts are – shows respect toward individuals (E1, E2, etc…), it is diverse (E1..), …   • The negative thoughts are – lack of environmental conscious (E8, E9)
P&G policies
• We will show respect for all individuals (Principles) (P&G, 2009, Our Values and Policies, p.4)   • Expense accounts should be submitted within 7 days from the return from a trip (Flows from the Company's Policy Statement Accuracy of Company's Records) (P&G, 2009, Our Values and Policies, p.4)   • To create inclusive environment for work, and to achieve balance in male and female employee numbers (P&G, 2017, Corporate Citizen Report (Chinese edition), p.15)

Summary: P&G has clearly defined policies in maintain the function of the work environment. Its policies also focusing on being inclusiveness, and respectful on individuals.

Among the 15 interviewees, merely about one thirds of them express that there is still much space for P&G to improve its corporate policy and administration with the rest satisfied with the administrative aspect of the multifaceted organization. According to the three interviewees who do not have much confidence in the corporate policies, P&G is less environment conscious compared with some of its local rivals. Based on its policy about the production of its goods, some environmentally unfriendly ingredients are still used such as the bottle of its shampoo brands, which, if not recycled timely, poses threat to the sustainability of environment. Besides the policy concerning the production of its household chemicals, its administration is also perceived undesirable by one interviewee because some frictions between the colleagues were not resolved satisfactorily from the viewpoint of the people concerned. As was the case, both parties involved in the contradiction thought their own interests were violated. Seen from the response of the three interviewees, the company's policy concerning the production of some of its products implies inadequate environment consciousness. Besides, the administration style needs improvements to better address the conflicts among its employees. As a result, the employees affected fail to work as proactively as expected.

4.1.2 Supervision and employee enthusiasm

P&G Supervision
Interview Responses
• General opinions – most the interviewees (9 out of 15 people) thought supervision was necessary，but different styles of leadership can lead to different incentives.   • The positive thoughts are – The personalized award has improved my work enthusiasm (E10), it is humanized (E13).

• The negative thoughts are – Too much supervision puts pressure on them（E1,E6,E7,E14）, public criticism dampens motivation（E2,E3,E4）
P&G policies
• P&G's fundamental policy is that we will treat all of our P&G colleagues with respect (P&G, 2009, Our Values and Policies, pp.11) • Every employee is expected to perform his or her work in a safe manner, free of the influence of alcohol or drugs (P&G, 2009, Our Values and Policies, pp.11)
Summary: There is insufficient secondary data regarding detailed supervision policy in P&G's official reports. From the response of the interviewees, it could be inferred that P&G has delegated the choice of supervision style to the superior officers instead of establishing a clearly defined supervision policy, since the interviewees claimed that the style of supervision are largely dependent on the personal characteristic.

Supervision from the seniors is one of the key hygiene factors that impact how employees perform on their job. Two of the interviewees indicate that the supervision over their work puts great pressure on them. To exemplify that, one of the two interviewees recalled her personal experience of getting late 10 minutes for work, for which she had 250 RMB deducted from her wages for that month. She admitted it was punishable for her to be late for work but the fine was too much since no substantial loss was caused by her being late for as short as 10 minutes. For the whole day, she felt unmotivated to finish her work due to the too strict supervision. The following italicized words were from the interviewee: *"That 250 RMB equals to the daily pay for my work and its being deducted means I have to work 8 hours, but paid nothing. Indeed, how we employees and our work are supervised within this organization is a little discouraging".*

In the case of the other interviewee, he was often criticized by his superiors for some inadequacies and minor mistakes committed at work. Whenever his problems were pointed out in front of many other colleagues, he would feel overwhelmingly embarrassed and have decreased faith in himself. He admitted the need for him to make

improvements in job performance but "it *was inappropriate for the management to criticize employees in public*". Judging from that, unreasonable supervision is a factor exerting adverse impact on the work motivation of P&G's staff.

4.1.3 Interpersonal relations and employee enthusiasm

P&G Interpersonal Relations
Interview Responses • General opinions – most the interviewees (11 out of 15 people) thought that there was a hierarchy among the employees of P&G, especially in China. • The positive thoughts are –Conflicts of interest are normal（E14） • The negative thoughts are – Pay more attention to employees returning from overseas（E7, E10, E11）, collaboration between teams is poor(E8, E9).
P&G policies
• We at P&G recognize the power that comes from people of diverse backgrounds and experiences coming together around a common goal. (P&G, 2009, Our Values and Policies, p.11) • All employees are obligated to act at all times solely in the best interests of the company. ((P&G, 2009, Our Values and Policies, p. 14) • Integrity, leadership, sense of ownership, competitiveness and trust. These reflect how P&G employees should work together with colleagues and partners. (P&G, 2017, Corporate Citizen Report (Chinese edition), p. 5)
Summary: P&G emphasizes five basic principles in interactions between co-workers as guidance of inter-employee relationships.

As is common to all organizations, interpersonal relations form a non-negligible aspect of the corporate complexity. In P&G, interpersonal relations are sources of employee dissatisfaction and frustration. According to one interviewee, there exists a hierarchy among the staff of this company mainly based on the differences in educational

background and working competence. In recent years, the human resources department of P&G attaches increasing importance to the overseas returnees who are considered more decently educated and thus more capable in handling most work than those receiving lower-quality education in the infamous domestic universities. As a consequence, a gap has naturally formed between the overseas returnees who regard themselves as competent and those from a relatively plain educational background. Typical of this gap, the interaction between the two groups is inadequate so as to develop the cooperative and collaborative spirit for the sake of the company as a whole. That hinders the establishment of harmonious relations between the different classes of the employees. Worse off, those who feel looked down on and underappreciated become increasingly less enthusiastic about their position in the company and gradually lose their motivation to work progressively and satisfactorily.

Based on the above analysis, interpersonal relations are also accountable for giving rise to the decreased employee enthusiasm to contribute to the overall development of P&G.

4.1.4 Salary and employee enthusiasm

P&G Salary
Interview Responses   • General opinions – most the interviewees (11 out of 15 people) were not so satisfied with salary and hoped to get more.   • The positive thoughts are – Relatively competitive in the same industry(E6), felt satisfied as a new graduate（E2）   • The negative thoughts are – Salary is underrated and expect to get a raise. (E1,3,4,5,8,9,10,11,12,13,15).
P&G policies

- P&G pays employees a competitive wage, as benchmarked with other leading companies.   (P&G, 2009, Our Values and Policies, p.12)
- Consistent with our principle of valuing personal mastery, we reward employees for improving their skills and capabilities. (P&G, 2009, Our Values and Policies, p. 12)
- We are dedicated in providing employees with intriguing and challenging work with competitive salaries and benefits, in order to obtain and sustain excellent talents that will become future business leaders. (P&G, 2017, Corporate Citizen Report (Chinese edition), p. 24)

Summary: P&G aims at providing competitive salaries and benefits to attract top talents in its positions.

Salary has been the center of heated debate in almost all industries. What many companies share in common is their attempt to trigger the interest of staff in working by giving them what they perceive as enough reward for the work done. Despite that, dissatisfaction is developed in the employees who believe they deserve more than the amount of salary they are rewarded on a monthly basis. Among the 15 interviewees, 85% verbally express their discontent sentiment at the mention of salary, hinting that the level of basic wage should be lifted. Further, some of them frankly suggest their being underpaid with the disproportion between their contribution to the company and what they get as reward. Apart from that, the disparity in how the employees are paid within this organization is also source of inactiveness of some employees at work. Specifically speaking, the staff with a better educational background receive higher salary on average regardless of their short working years and lack of experience, thus provoking the dissatisfaction in those employees who have adhered to a job for years and accumulated much knowledge and experience about the work itself. Faced with the reality, the latter group of employees grow unmotivated at fulfilling their job responsibilities and even have the idea of leaving for better stages to more fully exploit their potential. In light of that, it is safe to conclude that salary has been and might

continue to be a concern confronting both individual employees and the organization at large.

4.1.5 Status and employee enthusiasm

P&G Status
Interview Responses • General opinions – All interviewees wanted to have a good status. It directly affects work motivation. • The positive thoughts are – As a middle level leader, have certain status.(E6,E13) • The negative thoughts are – Some thought they are ordinary and have no status（E1,2,4,8,9）,some thought as or ordinary employees, their opinions are belittled.(E5,E10,E11,E14)
P&G policies
• P&G's fundamental policy is that we will treat all of our P&G colleagues with respect.   (P&G, 2009, Our Values and Policies, p.11) • Equal opportunity for employees at all levels. (P&G, 2009, Our Values and Policies, p. 22) • In P&G, we long for stabling a better world both inside and outside our company, one in which everyone is equal. (P&G, 2017, Corporate Citizen Report (Chinese edition), p. 15)
Summary: P&G advocates equal positions for all its employees in its official policies.

Among the 15 interviewees, half of them give positive answers to the questions asking if their status within an organization is a key factor influencing their enthusiasm at work. When it comes to their status in P&G, seven express their dissatisfaction at how they are being treated in this company. To be specific, they are regarded as ordinary employees who work and get paid without their seniors considering them as indispensable contributors to the development of this company. On some occasions

involving decision-making process, their voices, despite being useful and worth adoption, suffer from being neglected and instead only the directors and managers' suggestions get fully respected. The minor incidents like that reflect that little importance is attached to these employees. As a result, they feel discouraged at work now and then, the major reason for them to continue working for this company being the income. In accordance with a former employee of P&G, he left the company for years of failing to be promoted to a senior position. He had devoted 8 years to this organization and applied several times for the position of manager based on the experience accumulated over the long period of time and contributions to the development of this company. However, his applications were always refused, which strengthened his determination to resign from his job in P&G and seek the opportunities somewhere else to better exploit his potential. from the response of the eight interviewees, ones' status within an organization also exert great influence over their work performance.

4.1.6 Job security and employee enthusiasm

P&G Job Security
Interview Responses • General opinions – most the interviewees (13 out of 15) felt secure about their jobs and had no fear of losing them. • The positive thoughts are – Big companies don't lay people off easily and the management is very standard • The negative thoughts are – Worried about being fired because of youth and lack of competence(E2,E13).
P&G policies

- P&G expects each employee to support the company's commitment and continuing efforts toward equal employment opportunity for all. (P&G, 2009, Our Values and Policies, p.11)
- Assessment of performances are graded as 1,2 and 3, 1 being the best. Only employees grade 2 or above are allowed to be promoted or rotated. (http://www.hr.com.cn/p/1423416415)

Summary: Official reports do not contain information explicitly stating the terms of terminating the employment relationship. However, P&G lists many strict regulations that employees should obey. It could be inferred that upon the violation of these regulations there will be severe consequences.

Job security refers to the probability of an employee keep his job. Usually, a job with high level of security means the likelihood of their becoming unemployed. Except for the several young employees who have worked for P&G for merely a year, the others feel secure about their job, worrying nothing about losing their job. Fang Guo(E2), a current employee who was employed by P&G a year ago, has a weak sense of job security. As described by her, the ultimate cause of her frequently feeling unsecure about her job within this company is her inadequate work competence compared with other colleagues who have similar working age to her. To exemplify that, she noted that it took longer time for her to finish the same work than some other employees, frustrating her and leading her to self-doubt whether the job is beyond her capacity. Therefore, she is often worried about being fired by superiors due to a possible serious mistake committed at work. What's worse, she even starts to think of job hopping and working for another company where she might be better at the assigned work. Consequently, she is increasingly absent-minded at work and even during a meeting held by the directors. She admitted job security is the major factor adversely impacting her work enthusiasm. When asked the similar questions, another employee, Ting Wei(E13), 25 years old and with one year's working experience in P&G, make similar reactions. Judging from the case of these young employees of P&G, job security is a

factor deserving considerable attention when formulating strategies to motivate employees.

4.1.7 Personal life and employee enthusiasm

P&G Personal Life
Interview Responses • General opinions – most the interviewees said OK about their personal life in P&G. They worked hard and enjoyed life in the meanwhile. Some even thought of work as part of their personal life. (E8, E14).
P&G policies
• At a minimum, we comply with all applicable wage and hour laws rules and regulations including minimum wage, overtime and maximum hours. (P&G, 2009, Our Values and Policies, p.13) • We are dedicated in providing employees with relaxing and healthy working environment. (P&G, 2017, Corporate Citizen Report (Chinese edition), p. 24)
Summary: P&G claims that it complies with regulations of maximum hours. The employees are expected to have time for personal life.

Every individual employee has his personal life despite the need and frequency of communicating with others in the same company. To answer the question whether they are satisfied with their personal life in P&G, most of the employees responded with a neutral attitude. One interviewee Yuan Feng(E9) indicated that his personal life was mainly shaped by office and cafeteria. In other words, while working in P&G, his routine is made up of work and eating at lunchtime, without extra time spent on developing relationship with his colleagues, not to mention his superiors. In addition, he has get accustomed to this style of work life within P&G and it almost has no impact over his work attitude. What seems more important to him is his being paid for the work he has done and the impact of his personal life in that company is negligible.

Another interviewee, the 23-year-old Yuanxian Chen(E11) values the quality of personal life within the organization partly due to her characteristics. Typical of her response to the question how personal life influences her motivation for work, the desire to establish close relations with colleagues and collaborate with them to accomplish certain assignments is strong. According to her, life is not only about work and money but also about living it in a real sense. Therefore, personal life constitutes a big influence over her work status. Based on the above analysis, compared with other hygiene factors, personal life is less influential to employees' work enthusiasm.

4.1.8 Working conditions and employee enthusiasm

P&G Working Conditions
Interview Responses • General opinions – Almost all the interviewees showed satisfaction toward working conditions. • The positive thoughts are – It is relaxing(E13), comfortable(E2,etc.), Give them a lot learning opportunities（E4,E7,E11）.
P&G policies
• A safe and healthy workplace protecting human health and the environment. (P&G, 2009, Our Values and Policies, p.22) • We are dedicated in providing employees with relaxing and healthy working environment. (P&G, 2017, Corporate Citizen Report (Chinese edition), p. 24) • Let the employees be more free, active, happy and warmed. (http://www.pg.com.cn/csr/training.aspx)
Summary: The working conditions in P&G is expected to be healthy, relaxing and safe.

Working conditions form one aspect which is often used by employers to attract and retain employees. In response to the interviews questions concerning working

conditions of P&G, almost all of the interviewees expressed their satisfaction with environment provided by P&G for its employees to work comfortably. In accordance with Yuan LU(E4), a 34-year-old employee who has worked for 5 years in P&G, felt great gratitude for chance to experience her work life in this company. The following paragraph precisely her feelings:

"Procter & Gamble can provide us with a good learning atmosphere. There are a variety of trainings here, not only about our work, but also about our personal skills. Besides, one aspect that I feel most marvelous is that constant study programs are designed and provided for us to broaden our horizons. By attending such programs, we receive a lot of information and develop a useful way of thinking."

Seen from that description, not only does P&G establish the necessary environment for its employees to work as effectively as possible but also chances for them to study and make progress by providing them with relevant resources. Working under such circumstances, almost all of the 15 employees are satisfied and willing to take the due responsibility for their job. Bin Liu(E12), a former employee of P&G and once serving as a purchaser manager, indicated he did not have many opportunities to study due to the nature of his work. Nevertheless, he learned much both regarding his work skills and ways of dealing with different people. in general terms, the working conditions of P&G are encouraging and motivational to employees.

4.2 Employee enthusiasm and motivators

According to the two-factor theory of Herzberg, achievement, recognition, growth possibilities, career advancement, level of responsibility and the job itself are the most powerful motivators to employees. The following is an analysis on the information obtained from the interviewees with respect to the influence of these factors over their enthusiasm at work.

4.2.1 Achievement and employee enthusiasm

P&G Achievement
Interview Responses • General opinions – most the interviewees were satisfied with the chance of being employed by P&G, which motivated them to do better. • The positive thoughts are – Working with great people(E12), Strong sense of belonging and identity(E8). • The negative thoughts are – feel increasingly frustrated and thus unconfident about themselves because of the high requirements of this company.(E1,5,6,15)
P&G policies
• Assessment of performances are graded as 1,2 and 3, 1 being the best. (http://www.hr.com.cn/p/1423416415)
Summary: P&G motivates its employees by grading their performances as their achievement.

Most of the interviewees are satisfied with the chance of being employed by P&G since this company is an internationally famous, occupying a significant market share globewide. Naturally, many people want to be a member of this company partly for its rewards to the staff and the opportunities to cultivate themselves into more competent workers. Therefore, only being recruited by the HR of this company gives them a sense of achievement, marking a good starting point for their career. However, as suggested by four of the interviewees (Rong Huang(E6), Xiao Lin(E5), Zhi Lin(E1) and Fang Qian(E15)), after a period of stay in this company, they feel increasingly frustrated and thus unconfident about themselves because of the high requirements of this company. "As is known, such a successful transnational company has its own ways for to make great achievements and realize sustained competitiveness in the daily chemical market. One reason accountable for that is its strict requirement on the staff. As freshmen in the workplace, we are faced with many challenges at work and to overcome them takes painful, dedicated efforts."

Based on the above response, simply being employed into a company across the high threshold is an honorable thing. Apart from that, when asked what is/was achieved from their job in P&G, all the interviewees indicate not only does working for P&G help consolidate their professional skills but also provides them the chance to experience the complexity of the society, enabling to become more mature and more skilled at facing the world. As a consequence, they work/worked aggressively for further and achievement. From this perspective, achievement is a crucial aspect shaping how the employees behave at work.

4.2.2 Recognition and employee enthusiasm

P&G Recognition
Interview Responses
• General opinions – most the interviewees were eager to be recognized, recognition makes me do the job better.   • The positive thoughts are – Recognition make me to be loyal(E3,10)   • The negative thoughts are – Criticism will make me lose value(E12),and hard to persist(E8).
P&G policies
• Direct manager regularly talks with employees regarding their performance, work methods, ability development and career development. (http://www.hr.com.cn/p/1423416415)
Summary: Recognizing subordinate's achievement is compulsory for managers.

Recognition is what most people aspire for in workplace and without their attitudes and behaviors being recognized, it is hard to motivate them to further devote themselves to their job. the 15 interviews received the same reaction from the employees: recognition is irreplaceable despite the due payment for work done, reflecting the overwhelming importance of management recognizing the performance of their subordinates so that

stronger enthusiasm can be triggered among the staff. Yong Xiong(E10), a current employee of P&G who has worked for this company for 15 years is very loyal to both his superiors and the company at large. According to him, "it is the recognition from our manager that makes me adhere to my job responsibility for as long as 15 years". To put it in more details, he suggests that due to the recognition from his superiors, he has always felt motivated at work and got promoted from an ordinary employee to a sales manager. "Without the constant encouragement and recognition, it would not have been possible for me to stick to my post and remain in an endeavor to play a bigger role in driving the growth of this company. Apart from him, the other employees share the same viewpoints on recognition as him. As noted by Qiming Zhang(E3), "besides from the workplace itself, the recognition from all people surrounding us such as our parents, friends, and peers enjoys the equality of importance in terms of encouraging us to work harder". In light of the results of the interviews, recognition is indispensable to sustaining enthusiasm at work.

4.2.3 Growth possibilities and employee enthusiasm

P&G Growth Possibilities
Interview Responses • General opinions – All the interviewees believed P&G offers them great growth opportunities. • The positive thoughts are – Many training courses(E8,15), Good platform.(E1,6,11, etc.) • The negative thoughts are – Resources are limited and some welfare policies are available to only a few people.(E14)
P&G policies
• From entrance to the firm to retirement, P&G promotes the whole career development plan. (http://www.hr.com.cn/p/1423416415)
Summary: P&G provides tremendous development opportunity for its employees.

As has been discussed in the part of achievement, P&G not only provides an environment for work but also for personal growth. Such growth possibilities as progress in professional skills, maturity in character, and improvements in the techniques of life are all agreed upon by the 15 interviewees. For most of them, work is not only about finding a source of money to make a living but also a part of one's being, helping one to more fully exploit his potential. It is suggested by Xin Liu (E8) "during the process of working in P&G, one's being becomes more complete". However, Tao Huang(E14), a former employee of this company reveals that in spite of the opportunities for the growth of employees within this organization, resources are limited and only certain positions can enjoy them. furthermore, he admitted one of the reasons for his resigning from P&G to seek for better chances was that he could not enjoy the preferential policies for being involved with the learning programs despite his having stuck to the same post for ages and contributed a lot to the company. Disappointed at being presented with few growth possibilities, he became increasingly less enthusiastic about his work and finally decided to leave this company. From the case of Tao Huang(E14), the possibilities for employees to grow deserve considerable attention and should be taken seriously.

4.2.4 Career advancement and employee enthusiasm

P&G Career Advancement
Interview Responses • General opinions – most the interviewees (10 out of 15 people) Career advancement is good, but competition is fierce. • The positive thoughts are – Career advancement starts high.(E1, E4..etc.) • The negative thoughts are –New mechanisms are needed to select talents(E7) , Competition is too fierce, and employees will be lost.(E9,E10…etc.)
P&G policies

• In P&G, almost all managerial positions are promoted internally. (http://www.hr.com.cn/p/1423416415)
Summary: This policy provides employees with abundant opportunities to promote upon their excellent performance.

Based on the information obtained from the interviews, being employed by P&G means a good starting point for one's path of career. Nevertheless, given that P&G stands out among the list of Fortune 500 companies around the world, each year thousands of people compete for a post offered by this company and to advance one's career under a context characterized by various talents is equal to triumphing lots of capable employees. In accordance with Zhi Lin (E1), it is to one's great surprise that a significant portion of P&G's staff is made of graduates from the famous universities both at home and abroad. In other words, "within this organization, there exists an intense competition for promotion, resources and development opportunities". Therefore, to get their career advanced with regards to being promoted to a superior position is hard to achieve. To some extent, this exerts adverse impact over their work enthusiasm. However, career does get advanced in intangible form along with the increase of years spent in this company. To exemplify that, Yuan Lu (E4), a current employee with a working age of 5 years in P&G, said the following:

"As a matter of fact, although my position within this company has remained unchanged and it seems that my career is not advanced a little bit, I feel comprehensive improvements have happened to my career because I have learned so much in recent years and achieved a clearer recognition about myself and my work."

As indicated by the interview responses, the employees have conflicting ideas on their prospects of career advancement and thus behave differently at work.

4.2.5 Level of responsibility and employee enthusiasm

P&G Level of Responsibility
Interview Responses
• General opinions – most the interviewees thought responsibility should be controlled at an appropriate level.
• The positive thoughts are – willing to have a little challenge(E10)
• The negative thoughts are – Too much pressure leads to anxiety(E1,E13..etc.).

In the retrieved archival data, neither official documents nor external reports contained descriptions on level of responsibility. This implicate that such factor is largely perceived than articulated in P&G. When asked the question on the key responsibilities that make them adhere to a job, 3 interviewees reflect that the responsibility to accomplish an individual task as well as responsibility to fulfill the requirements of a post are both accountable for their devotion to work. Of particular note, only when the responsibility is controlled at an appropriate level, can it lead to the most motivation in employees at work. Almost all of the interviewees agree that too heavy responsibility is prone to causing pressure on them, giving rise to lower enthusiasm for work. "If a task is so important that no possibility of failing to coping with it satisfactorily is allowed, for fear of bad results, I may feel too anxious to handle it". This is a case demonstrating the negative impact of heavy responsibility. In addition, if their sense of responsibility is too weak, it is also hard for them to work in the most desirable manner. Therefore, to reach a conclusion, neither too low nor too high level of responsibility are conducive to motivating the employees.

4.2.6 The job itself and employee enthusiasm

P&G The Job Itself
Interview Responses
General opinions – most the interviewees believed that the job itself needed to be meaningful and attractive.

• The positive thoughts are – I need to like the job itself first. When I feel tired, I need to adjust myself. (E6,E8,E12…etc.)
• The negative thoughts are – If a job doesn't give me any sense of accomplishment, I want to change my job.(E3)
P&G policies
• We are dedicated in providing employees with intriguing and challenging work. (P&G, 2017, Corporate Citizen Report (Chinese edition), p. 21)
Summary: P&G provides challenging and fruitful work for its employees.

For many people, the attractiveness of a job itself is the fundamental reason for their sticking to a job and their source of keeping motivated at work. In terms of the importance of the nature of a job, 9 interviewees responded with their priority given to how a work is attractive and suitable to them. To be specific, the job itself should be first worth doing and able to realize the value of what an employee equips him or herself with such as knowledge, skills and comprehensive qualities. As replied by Qiming Zhang(E3), a former employee of P&G who worked in this company for 7 years, "at the beginning as an employee of P&G, once certain tasks were finished, I felt a sense of accomplishment given that tasks were a little difficult and my work competence could be proved by them". Nevertheless, in accordance with him, after 7 years, the job could no longer well match his capability and he hoped to be challenged by more difficult work. With things staying unchanged, he chose to leave for bigger stages where the job can better satisfy him. Another interviewee who has experienced several promotions by this company expressed her satisfaction with her job itself in P&G. "The job can help me take full advantage of what I have learned in school and fulfill my mental needs". "Naturally, I can always keep myself motivated at work. In brief, the nature of the job itself is a decisive factor influencing the performance of P&G's employees and if the job itself is too unattractive and fails to motivate the employees, it is impossible to maintain their enthusiasm by other means such as salary, welfare, working conditions, and company policy and administration.

4.3 Summary of analysis

Based on a comparison with the existing literature and an empirical analysis about the results of the interviews, each proposition is analyzed through the case study of P&G, and the answer to the first question is illustrated as follows.

For hygiene factors: the eight factors commonly categorized into the hygiene type all exert influence over the employees' enthusiasm at work. Basically speaking, the analysis results agrees with the viewpoints of the previous studies (Roos and Van Eeden, 2008). A comparison among them finds that supervision, salary, status, and working conditions are more influential than the others in this category. This is slightly different from the results of many similar researches (Sirota and Klein, 2013) focused on investigating the factors influencing employee motivation. when it comes to the reasons behind that difference, the most likely one might be that the previous studies were conducted to explore how people's enthusiasm at work is impacted from a general perspective without centering around a specific organization, event or activity. Instead, the current research is a case study revolving around P&G and with the unique conditions of this company, findings typical of this organization are generated.

For motivators: in accordance with the responses from the interviewees and the detailed analysis on them, achievement, recognition, growth possibilities, career advancement, level of responsibility and the job itself are all aspects valued by the employees of P&G. Strong sense of achievement, recognition from the superiors, multiple growth possibilities, great prospects from career advancement, appropriate level of responsibility and the job itself can encourage the employees to work aggressively and proactively. These findings accord with the results of the previous studies (Nohria, Groysberg and Lee, 2008). Of particular note, the current research discovers that controlling job responsibility at a proper level is very important, which is ignored by many works of existing literature.

5. Discussion

According to the above empirics and analysis, both hygiene factors and motivators exert big influence over the work enthusiasm of the employees and the two-factor theory poses some inspirations for us. Therefore, there are many measures for companies to overcome the brain-drain problem in China. The following is a detailed discussion.

The data collected in the research seems to reveal a pattern consistent to that of the theory discussed in chapter 2. All the eight hygiene factors appear to be closely related to employee's enthusiasm towards their jobs. It has been identified that salary, status, supervision and working conditions are more influential factors than other ones in the case of P&G. An intriguing finding of the research is that despite in multiple official documents, P&G promised to offer competitive salaries to their employees, which they do, most employees are still feel underrated with their current income level and hope to get a raise. This finding indicates that even though P&G benchmarks other companies on salary, the salary level does not match the employee's self-perceived performance. Such effect of deterrence is consistent with the theories discussed in chapter 2, that employees can only be satisfied if receiving a salary in line with his/her perceived performance and effort, regardless of the average salary level in the whole industry. When P&G faces the brain-drain crisis in China, in order to satisfy and retain talents, it is important for them to provide satisfactory compensation to employees. At the same time, other motivation should be taken to overcome the dissatisfaction of the salary. For instance, reasonable salary system could be combined with effective competition mechanism and promotion channel, or clear career planning etc. Another issue of P&G is that despite its claim of treating every employee with respect, most employees do not consider themselves to have a status in the company. This could lead to two potential conclusions. If P&G, in practice, does not fulfill their promise of respecting every employee, it would be its own responsibility to eliminate this problem. However, if the executives perceive themselves to have respected the staff, it would be

an interesting case for future studies to discover the reasons for the gap in perceptions of respect among the organization.

The result of the motivators' impact analysis on the employees are identical to the theories introduced in chapter 2. All six motivational factors are considered crucial in stimulating employee enthusiasm at work. In particular, multiple respondents of the research claimed that the job itself at P&G is the pivotal reason for them to work. This finding is consistent with the theory in chapter 2 that the nature and potential of a particular job will significantly determine employee's enthusiasm towards the work. However, it is often difficult to distinguish whether employees perceive 'the job itself' as 'do this job' or 'do this job for P&G'. The self-reports of loving the work itself could be intertwined with other factors of the organization, rather than isolated. It would be reasonable to assume that if this research was conducted in a less renowned and successful company, the answer for this factor would be more pessimistic.

Thirdly, a comparison among eight hygiene factors finds that supervision, salary, status, and working conditions are more influential than the others in this category. This is slightly different from the results of many similar researches. For motivators, they are all valued by the employees of P&G. In accordance with the responses from the interviewees and the detailed analysis on them, achievement, recognition, growth possibilities, career advancement, level of responsibility and the job itself are all aspects valued by the employees of P&G. Thus, strong sense of achievement, recognition from the superiors, multiple growth possibilities, great prospects from career advancement, appropriate level of responsibility and the job itself can encourage the employees to work aggressively and proactively.

However, there are still many measures to take for companies under the brain-drain crisis in China. For example, perfect performance assessment mechanism and build pre-warning brain-drain mechanism to motivate and keep employees. What's more, update staff career planning such as refine position hierarchy and dredge promotion channel

can weaken the dissatisfaction of the salary. Of particular note, the current research discovers that controlling job responsibility at a proper level is quite essential, which is ignored by many works of previous literature.

To sum up, based on data collected from the interviewees, and the empirics and analysis in chapter 4 indicate that the eight factors as encompassed by the two-factor theory all have impact over how employees behave at work. The results of this study are similar to what the theory suggests in chapter 2. More specifically, for the organization like P&G which is foreign-owned but operated in China, it is quite important to controlling job responsibility at a proper level. Moreover, companies in China can not ignore efforts to overcome the brain-drain problem.

6. Conclusion

In order to figure out how to motive and retain employees in China, this research discusses factors influencing employees' enthusiasm and strategies to motivate them with a case study of P&G, while conducted under the framework of Herzberg's two-factor theory. With the proposition that hygiene factors and motivators both influence the work enthusiasm, 15 interviews were arranged to collect the needed data for further analysis. According to the information obtained from the 15 interviewees, hygiene factors and motivators all exert influences over their work behaviors and the impact of the factors differs according to the different conditions of the employees. The findings of this research generally agree with the two-factor theory. Based on how the work enthusiasm of P&G's employees are influenced by each of the factors, strategies are correspondingly formulated to motivate and retain employees at work. Generally speaking, this research is significant for being conducted from a microscopic perspective to the macroscopic perspective, especially when China meet with brain-drain problem under rapid industrialization. In other words, a specific organization is studied to figure out the answers to the research questions and the findings can be used for future studies as well for practical purposes.

6.1 Limitations and Future Studies

The limitation of this research is mainly the restricted size and scope. Only one case of one company is discussed in this research. This may hinder the application of research findings to other companies. Sample size is another issue of the research. It merely interviewed 15 (former) employees of P&G. Due to this limitation in sample size, it may be unable to reflect the whole organization's perceptions on the issue.

Future studies ought to include more corporates to extend the scope of this type of study. Furthermore, later research can involve a large and more diversified sample to enhance the validity of the research.

6.2 Managerial Application

The findings of this research and purposed strategies are largely for executives of organizations. Based on existing findings, the following suggestions are made.

In response to the information obtained from the interviewee, the company policy pf P&G should be more environment conscious by using the environmentally friendly materials to produce its products. Besides, the administration of this company should take the feelings and interests of its employees into consideration to establish a harmonious working atmosphere within this organization. As for supervision, the measures intended to punish the employees for their mistakes should be further weighed and adjusted to avoid leading to too much discomfort in the employees. To improve Interpersonal relations, the management should take the initiatives to bridge the gap between the different classes of employees in this company. Based on that, further efforts should be made to enhance the relations and facilitate the collaboration among the employees. In addition, the salary standards should be adjusted and mainly based on the job performance of the employees. Educational background can be referred to but should not be the only standard to set the salary for the employees. The employees without a good educational background deserve to be valued and attention. Besides, they should be equally treated so that their enthusiasm would not be discouraged due to low status. Furthermore, employees' confidence in securing their job should be enhanced through constant encouragement. Besides, timely help can be given to them on how to well accomplish their work. Space should be left for the employees to well balance their life and work so that their personal life is not adversely impacted by work. In terms of working conditions, the satisfactory side of the working conditions should be maintained while continuous efforts should be invested into the aspects that need improvements.

Apart from that, adjustments to the job of the employees should be made so that the sense of achievement can be gained by them after accomplishing tasks requiring the full application of their knowledge and skills. In addition, the management should often recognize the excellent work of employees to make them feel their value within this organization so that they can be further motivated. To increase growth possibilities for

employees, more proper training programs and other forms of chances to study should be provided to the employees. What is more, to drive the career advancement of employees, opportunities for job promotion should be offered to the employees so that they would work harder to achieve the goals of career advancement. As has been discussed above, job responsibility should be controlled at a proper level to avoid put too much pressure on the employees or their decreased interest in work. Lastly, jobs assigned to employees should match their work competence, personality and other skills. In other words, the nature of a job itself should be attractive enough for the employees to adhere to it.

References

A. Zhatkanbaevaa, J. Zhatkanbaeva, E. Zhatkanbae. (2012). The impact of globalization on "brain drain" in developing countries, Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences, pp.1490-1494

Alshmemri, M., Shahwan-Akl, L. and Maude, P. (2017). Herzberg's two-factor theory. *Life Science Journal*, vol. 14, no. 5, pp. 12-16.

Altman, L. A., & Brothers, L. R. (1995). Career longevity of hospitality graduates. Hospitality Review, 13(2), 9.

Anand, S., Vidyarthi, P., Singh, S., & Ryu, S. (2015). Family interference and employee dissatisfaction: Do agreeable employees better cope with stress? human relations, 68(5), 691-708.

Bassett-Jones, N. and Lloyd, G. C. (2005). Does Herzberg's motivation theory have staying power? *Journal of management development*, vol. 24, no. 10, pp. 929-943.

Baxter, P., & Jack, S. (2008). Qualitative case study methodology: Study design and implementation for novice researchers. The qualitative report, 13(4), 544-559.

Bennett, A. (2004). Case study methods: Design, use, and comparative advantages. Models, numbers, and cases: Methods for studying international relations, 19-55.

Biernacki, P., & Waldorf, D. (1981). Snowball sampling: Problems and techniques of chain referral sampling. Sociological methods & research, 10(2), 141-163.

Brislin, R. W., MacNab, B., Worthley, R., Kabigting Jr, F., & Zukis, B. (2005). Evolving perceptions of Japanese workplace motivation: an employee-manager comparison. International Journal of Cross Cultural Management, 5(1), 87-104.

Burke, R. J. (1966). Are Herzberg's motivators and hygienes unidimensional? *Journal of Applied Psychology*, vol. 50, no. 4, pp. 317-322.

Chang, J. and Hsieh, A. T. (2006). Leisure motives of eating out in night markets. Journal of Business Research, vol. 59, no. 12, pp. 1276-1278.

Chien, J. (2013). Examining Herzberg's two factor theory in a large Chinese chemical fiber company. *International Science Index*, vol. 7, no. 6, pp. 1433-1438.

Crowe, S., Cresswell, K., Robertson, A., Huby, G., Avery, A., & Sheikh, A. (2011). The case study approach. BMC medical research methodology, 11(1), 100.

Darke, P., Shanks, G., & Broadbent, M. (1998). Successfully completing case study research: combining rigour, relevance and pragmatism. Information systems journal, 8(4), 273-289.

Dartey-Baah, K. and Amoako, G. K. (2011). Application of Frederick Herzberg's Two-Factor theory in assessing and understanding employee motivation at work: a Ghanaian Perspective. *European Journal of Business and Management*, vol. 3, no. 9, pp. 1-8.

Ewen, R. B., Smith, P. C. and Hulin, C. L. (1966). An empirical test of the Herzberg two-factor theory. Journal of applied psychology, vol. 50, no. 6, pp. 544-561.

Frone, M. R., Russell, M., & Cooper, M. L. (1992). Prevalence of work‐family conflict: Are work and family boundaries asymmetrically permeable?. Journal of organizational behavior, 13(7), 723-729.

Furnham, A., Eracleous, A., and Chamorro-Premuzic, T. (2009) Personality, motivation and job satisfaction: Hertzberg meets the Big Five, Journal of managerial psychology, vol. 24, no. 8, pp. 765-779.

Gawel, J. E. (1997). Herzberg's theory of motivation and Maslow's hierarchy of needs. Practical Assessment, Research & Evaluation, vol. 5, no. 11, pp. 3-10.

Gibson, J. L., & Klein, S. M. (1970). Employee attitudes as a function of age and length of service: A reconceptualization. Academy of Management Journal, 13(4), 411-425.

Golafshani, N. (2003) "Understanding reliability and validity in qualitative research".

Hackman, J. R. (1980) Work redesign and motivation, Professional Psychology, vol. 11, no. 3, pp. 445-449.

Herzberg, F. (1968). One more time: How do you motivate employees.

Herzberg, F. (2005). Motivation-hygiene theory. Organizational behavior one: Essential theories of motivation and leadership, eds JB Miner, ME Sharpe Inc, New York, pp. 61-74.

Herzberg, F. (2017). Motivation to work. Routledge.

Hines, G. H. (1973). Cross-cultural differences in two-factor motivation theory. Journal of Applied Psychology, 58(3), 375.

House, R. J. and Wigdor, L. A. (1967). Herzberg's dual- factor theory of job satisfaction and motivation: A review of the evidence and a criticism. Personnel psychology, vol. 20, no. 4, pp. 369-390.

J. Crush, C. Hughes. (2009). Brain Drain, International Encyclopedia of Human Geography, pp. 342-347.

Jean-Pascal Bénassy, Elise S. Brezis. (2013). Brain drain and development traps, Journal of Development Economics, pp.15-22.

Judge, T.A., Parker, S., Colbert, A.E., Heller, D. and Ilies, R. (2002). Job satisfaction: A cross-cultural review. Handbook of industrial, work and organizational psychology, 2, pp. 25-52.

Kaliprasad, M. (2006). The human factor I: Attracting, retaining, and motivating capable people. Cost Engineering, vol. 48, no. 6, pp. 20-32.

Kelso, L. O., and Hetter, P. (1967) Two-factor theory. Vintage Books.

King, N. (1970) Clarification and evaluation of the two-factor theory of job satisfaction, Psychological Bulletin, vol. 74, no. 1, pp.18-34.

Kompaso, S. M., and Sridevi, M. S. (2010) Employee engagement: The key to improving performance, International journal of business and management, vol. 5, no. 12, pp. 89-99.

Lam, T., Baum, T.and Pine, R. (2001). Study of managerial job satisfaction in Hong Kong's Chinese restaurants. International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management, vol. 13, no. 1, pp. 35-42.

Liu, C. T., Guo, Y. M., and Lee, C. H. (2011). The effects of relationship quality and switching barriers on customer loyalty. International Journal of Information Management, vol. 31, no. 1, pp. 71-79.

Locke, E. A. (1969). What is job satisfaction? Organizational behavior and human performance, vol. 4, no. 4, pp. 309-336.

Lundberg, C., Gudmundson, A., and Andersson, T. D. (2009) Herzberg's Two-Factor Theory of work motivation tested empirically on seasonal workers in hospitality and tourism, Tourism management, vol. 30, no. 6, pp. 890-899.

Maddox, R. N. (1981) Two-factor theory and consumer satisfaction: replication and extension, Journal of consumer research, vol. 8, no. 1, pp. 97-102.

Maidani, E. A. (1991) Comparative study of Herzberg's two-factor theory of job satisfaction among public and private sectors, Public personnel management, vol. 20, no. 4, pp. 441-448.

Newman, I., & Benz, C. R. (1998). Qualitative-quantitative research methodology: Exploring the interactive continuum. SIU Press.

Nohria, N., Groysberg, B., and Lee, L. (2008). Employee motivation: A powerful new model. Harvard business review, vol. 86, no. 7, pp.78-85.

Pannucci, C. J., & Wilkins, E. G. (2010). Identifying and avoiding bias in research. Plastic and reconstructive surgery, 126(2), 619.

Polkinghorne, D. E. (2005). Language and meaning: Data collection in qualitative research. Journal of counseling psychology, 52(2), 137.

Ramlall, S. (2004) A review of employee motivation theories and their implications for employee retention within organizations, Journal of American Academy of Business, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 52-63.

Roos, W., and Van Eeden, R. (2008) The relationship between employee motivation, job satisfaction and corporate culture, SA Journal of Industrial Psychology, vol. 34, no. 1, pp. 54-63.

Rynes, S. L., Gerhart, B., and Minette, K. A. (2004) The importance of pay in employee motivation: Discrepancies between what people say and what they do. Human Resource Management: Published in Cooperation with the School of Business Administration, The University of Michigan and in alliance with the Society of Human Resources Management, vol. 43, no. 4, pp. 381-394.

Sachau, D. A. (2007). Resurrecting the motivation-hygiene theory: Herzberg and the positive psychology movement. Human resource development review, vol. 6, no. 4, pp. 377-393.

Saunders, M., Lewis, P. & Thornhill, A. (2016) Research methods for business students, 7th edn, Harlow: Pearson Education.

Silverthorne, C. P. (1992). Work motivation in the United States, Russia, and the Republic of China (Taiwan): A comparison. Journal of Applied Social Psychology, vol. 22, no. 20, pp. 1631-1639.

Sirota, D., and Klein, D. (2013). The enthusiastic employee: How companies profit by giving workers what they want, FT Press.

Stake, R. E. (2008). Qualitative case studies.

Stake, R.E. (1995) The Art of Case Study Research. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Wei HA, Junjian YI, Junsen ZHANG. (2016). Brain drain, brain gain, and economic growth in China, China Economic Review, pp.322–337.

Yang, F. (2011). Work, motivation and personal characteristics: an in-depth study of six organizations in Ningbo. Chinese Management Studies, vol. 5, no. 3, pp. 272-297.

Yin, R. K. (2003). Case study research: Design and Methods. United States of America. Sage Publications.

Yin, R. K. (2017). Case study research and applications: Design and Methods. Sage publications.

Yusoff, W. F. W., Kian, T. S., and Idris, M. T. M. (2013). Herzberg's two factors theory on work motivation: does its work for today's environment. Global journal of commerce and Management, vol. 2, no. 5, pp. 18-22.

Zainal, Z. (2007). Case study as a research method. Jurnal Kemanusiaan, (9), 1-6.

Appendix 1: Interview guide for respondents (English)

Project title: Discussion on the factors influencing employee enthusiasm and strategies to motivate employees-----a study based on Procter & Gamble's employee motivational system

I am a student in Uppsala University and this project is required by my degree program. The purpose of this research is to conduct a case study on P&G's to explore the factors influencing employees' enthusiasm and propose corresponding strategies to motivate employees at work. Please answer all the questions if you are interested in or have any knowledge about. It is promised that all the information you provide will be only used for research purpose and strictly confidential. Every interview will take 30 minutes. Thank you for your participation!

Part A: Personal information of respondents
Name:
Age:
Gender:
Former/current employee of P&G:
Working years in P&G:

Part B: Interview questions

Two types of factors	Single factor	Questions
Hygiene factors	**Company policy and administration**	5. What are the characteristics of the policy and administration of P&G? 6. What do you think of the policy and administration of P&G? 7. Is/was your work performance influenced by the policy and administration? 8. What suggestions do you want to make about this company's policy and administration?
	Supervision	5. How strictly is/was your work supervised by your seniors in P&G? 6. Is the type of supervision proper or not? 7. How does/did the supervision influence your job performance? 8. How can the supervision of this company be improved?

	Interpersonal relations	5 Do/did you get along well with your colleagues while working for P&G? 6 Do/did all the employees interact adequately with each other? Is/was there a gap between different groups of staff? 7 How do/did interpersonal relations in that company influence your motivation at work? 8 Is there any space to improve the interpersonal relations within P&G so that employee enthusiasm can be enhanced?
	Salary	5. Are you satisfied with the salary you are/were paid by P&G? If not, why? 6. Do you think you deserve more than you are/were paid? 7. Is/was salary a factor impacting your enthusiasm for work? 8. Should your salary be raised? If yes, how much?
	Status	5 How do you think about your status in P&G? 6 Do/did you receive the due respect while working in P&G? 7 Do you think your status in that company influence/influenced your work enthusiasm? 8 Will an increased status under a working context motivate you at work?
	Job security	4 Do/ did you feel secure while working at P&G? 5 How does/did job security in that company influence your work enthusiasm? 6 How can job security be reinforced in that company?
	Personal life	4 Are/were you satisfied with your personal life in P&G? If not, why? 5 How does/did personal life in P&G influence your work enthusiasm? 6 What suggestions can you make for the company to improve your life so that you become more enthusiastic on working for this company?
	Working conditions	5. How are the working conditions of P&G? 6. Are/were you satisfied with the working conditions of P&G? 7. Do/did the working conditions influence your job enthusiasm? 8. How can P&G improve its working conditions?

Motivators	**Achievement**	5. Do/did feel sense of accomplishment while working for P&G? 6. Are/were you satisfied with your job performance in that company? 7. What do/did you achieve from that job? 8. Can stronger sense of achievement make you more devoted to work?
	Recognition	5. Is/was your job performance recognized by your seniors? 6. Is being recognized at work important to you? 7. Does/did your job performance being recognized motivate you to work harder? 8. Should seniors often recognize their staff's performance at work?
	Growth possibilities	5. Are/were there many growth possibilities for you in P&G? 6. Are/were the growth possibilities accessible to you? 7. Do/did you aspire for the growth possibilities in P&G? 8. Should P&G provide more growth possibilities for its employees?
	Career advancement	4. Are/were you satisfied with the chances for career advancement in P&G? 5. Is career advancement influential to your enthusiasm at work? If so, to what extent? 6. How should P&G further motivate its employees through giving more attractive opportunities for career advancement?
	Level of responsibility	4. Does/did the level of responsibility influence your work motivation in P&G? 5. What are the key responsibilities that make you adhere to a job? 6. What level of responsibility is the most appropriate for you to stay enthusiastic at work in P&G?
	The job itself	7. How important is a job itself to you? 8. Is/was your job in P&G attractive enough to motivate you at work? 9. Should adjustments be made to the job you are engaged with to better motivate you at work?

Appendix 2: Interview guide for respondents (Chinese)

采访问题

论文题目：探讨影响员工积极性的因素和激励员工的策略——基于宝洁公司员工激励机制的研究。

我是乌普萨拉大学的一名学生，这个项目是我的学位课程要求的。本研究以宝洁公司为例，探讨影响员工工作积极性的因素，并提出相应的激励策略。如果你有兴趣或有任何相关知识，请回答所有的问题。我们承诺，您提供的所有信息将仅用于研究目的，并严格保密。每次面试都需要 30 分钟。感谢您的参与!

第一部分:受访者的个人信息
姓名:
年龄:
性别:
宝洁前任或现任员工:
在宝洁工作年限:

第二部分：采访问题

两种类型因素	单个因素	问题
保健因素	公司的政策和管理	1. 宝洁公司的政策和管理有什么特点? 2. 你认为宝洁公司的政策和管理如何? 3. 你的工作表现是否受到政策和管理的影响? 4. 你对该家公司的政策和管理有什么建议吗?
	上级监管	1. 在宝洁，你的上级主管对你的工作有多严格? 2. 上级的监管的方式是否恰当? 3. 上级的监管对你的工作表现有何影响? 4. 如何加强该家公司的上级监管效用?
	人际关系	1. 在宝洁公司工作期间，你和同事相处得好吗? 2. 所有的员工都充分地相互交流吗?不同的员工群体之间有差距吗? 3. 宝洁公司的人际关系如何影响你工作的积极性? 4. 宝洁内部是否存在改善人际关系的空间，以提高员工的积极性?

	薪资	1. 你对你的薪水满意吗?如果不是,为什么? 2. 你认为你应得的比你应得的多吗? 3. 薪水是影响你工作热情的因素吗? 4. 你应该加薪吗?如果有,多少钱?
	地位	1. 你认为你在宝洁的地位如何? 2. 你在宝洁公司工作时受到了应有的尊重吗? 3. 你认为你在该家公司的地位会影响你的工作热情吗? 4. 在工作环境中地位的提高会激励你工作吗?
	工作安全感	1. 你在宝洁公司工作时感到安全吗? 2. 该家公司的工作保障如何影响你的工作热情? 3. 在该家公司，怎样才能加强工作保障?
	个人生活	1. 你对自己在宝洁时的个人生活满意吗?如果不是,为什么? 2. 在宝洁公司时的个人生活会如何影响你的工作热情? 3. 你对公司有什么建议可以改善你的生活，让你对在该家公司工作更有热情?
	工作环境	1. 宝洁公司的工作环境如何? 2. 你对宝洁公司的工作环境满意吗? 3. 工作环境是否影响了你的工作热情? 4. 宝洁公司如何改善工作环境／条件?
激励因素	成就	1. 在宝洁公司工作时是否有成就感? 2. 你对你在该家公司的工作表现满意吗? 3. 你从那份工作中取得了什么成就? 4. 更强烈的成就感能让你更专注于工作?
	认同	1. 你的工作表现得到你的上级认可了吗? 2. 在工作中被认可对你来说重要吗? 3. 你的工作表现被认可是否激励你更努力地工作? 4. 年长者是否应该经常表扬他们的员工在工作中的表现?
	成长机会	1. 在宝洁公司有很多成长的机会吗? 2. 你有能获得成长的可能性吗? 3. 你渴望宝洁公司给你成长机会吗? 4. 宝洁公司是否应该为员工提供更多的成长机会?

	职业发展	1. 你对宝洁公司的晋升机会满意吗? 2. 职业发展对你的工作热情有影响吗?如果是，在什么程度上? 3. 宝洁公司应该如何通过提供更有吸引力的职业发展机会来激励员工?
	责任等级	1. 你在宝洁的工作动机是否受到责任程度的影响? 2. 让你坚持工作的关键职责是什么? 3. 在宝洁公司，你最适合的工作职责是什么?
	工作本身	1. 工作本身对你有多重要? 2. 你在宝洁的工作本身是否足够吸引你去工作? 3. 是否应该对你所从事的工作进行调整，以便在工作中更好地激励你?